We are a What Works City!
SCOTTSDALE, AZ
@scottsdaleazgov
“One of the dirty secrets of government is actually that we don’t know whether what we’re doing works a lot of the time.”

Rory Gallagher, Behavioral Insights Team
What is the Behavioral Insights approach?

1. Use what we already know about human behavior to make local government programs and services better.
EASY

ATTRACTIVE

TIMELY

SOCIAL
This is what $120 looks like.

If you don’t submit your Health Risk Assessment by Aug. 15, you’ll miss out on $120.

That’s the incentive each employee receives for completing it. If you have a spouse or partner on the city’s health plan, you earn another $120 if they do it, too.
Still need a better reason? This is what a $100 Visa gift card looks like.

As an added incentive, 300 gift cards just like this one have been raffled-off to employees who completed their HRA. Wouldn’t you like to get one?

We’re giving 10 more $100 gift cards away. If you don’t complete your HRA, you won’t be eligible for the final drawing.

More than 700 employees have already completed their HRA. If you aren’t among them, it’s not too late.
AND

2. Test these approaches using randomized control trials to find out what really works
Annex 1: Yes and No buttons email
From: Greg Bestgen, City of Scottsdale
Subject: Scottsdale Cares!

Dear neighbor,

Scottsdale Cares is an easy way for you to give back to your community. 100% of donations go to local non-profits that help Scottsdale residents in need.

Local charities needed more than $400,000 in funding to support Scottsdale residents, but Scottsdale Cares was only able to fund one-fourth of the need. This year, thousands of your neighbors have stepped up. But there's more work to be done.

Would you like to join your neighbors and donate to Scottsdale Cares?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Funded</th>
<th>Unable to fund</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$0</td>
<td>$100,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$200,000</td>
<td>$300,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$400,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NO, I do not want to donate $1/month to Scottsdale Cares.

YES, I want to donate $1/month to Scottsdale Cares!
Annex 2: Just yes button email

From: Greg Bestgen, City of Scottsdale
Subject: Scottsdale Cares!

Dear neighbor,

Scottsdale Cares is an easy way for you to give back to your community. 100% of donations go to local non-profits that help Scottsdale residents in need.

Local charities needed more than $400,000 in funding to support Scottsdale residents, but Scottsdale Cares was only able to fund one-fourth of the need. This year, thousands of your neighbors have stepped up. But there’s more work to be done.

Funded | Unable to fund

| 0     | 100,000 | 200,000 | 300,000 | 400,000 |

Would you like to join your neighbors and donate to Scottsdale Cares?

YES,
I want to donate $1/month to Scottsdale Cares!
Proportion of people donating

No email: 0.4%
Yes button: 1.3%
Yes and no button: 1.5%

N=15,771

** p≤0.01, * p≤0.05, + p≤0.1
From: info@governmentjobs.com
Sent: Friday, March 24, 2017 1:27 AM
Subject: City of Scottsdale Job Interest Card Notification

PLEASE DO NOT REPLY TO THIS E-MAIL
If you reply to this email, your reply will *NOT* be read.
Instead, please contact City of Scottsdale if you have questions.

City of Scottsdale is now accepting applications for the following position(s):

Police Officer - Recruits, Laterals & Waivers

To view the full job posting for any opening at City of Scottsdale, click here:

https://www.governmentjobs.com/careers/scottsdaleaz

Click on a job title to view the complete job posting of any position listed. After you have reviewed the job posting, you can apply for the position by clicking on the "Apply" button and completing the online application.

You are receiving this email because you completed a job interest card with City of Scottsdale. Job interest cards are active for one year from the date of submission. Until that date, you will be notified when any position for the job category or job classifications that you have selected becomes available. We'll also send you a reminder email one month before your interest card is due to expire to give you an opportunity at that time to extend your notifications for another year.

If at any time you wish to cancel notifications for this interest card, please visit the following web address:

https://www.governmentjobs.com/careers/scottsdaleaz/jobInterestCards/manage/6135389

Thank you and good luck in your job search!
GovernmentJobs.com
Hi [NAME],

Are you up for a challenge?

I love being a police officer because no two days are the same. It’s challenging, but I feel like I’m my best self every day.

Scottsdale Police has changed its recruitment process, and we are looking for new officers to join our department. I hope you consider applying. If you thrive in a challenging environment, you’re just the kind of person we’re looking for.


Good luck!

Marcos Garcia
Police Officer, Scottsdale Police Department
Hi [NAME],

You belong with the Scottsdale police department.

I love being a police officer because from day one, I felt like I belonged to a team - no matter where you come from, you feel like you belong here.

Scottsdale Police has changed its recruitment process, and we are looking for new officers to join our department. I hope you consider applying. If you work well with a team, you’re just the kind of person we’re looking for.


Good luck!

Marcos Garcia
Police Officer, City of Scottsdale Police Department
Percentage submitting an application

Control: 0.9%

Belonging: 2.4%

Challenge: 2.5%

N=17,055

*** p≤0.001, ** p≤0.01, * p≤0.05, + p≤0.1
**Percentage submitting an application**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Control</strong></td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td>2.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Belonging</strong></td>
<td>4.5%</td>
<td>4.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Challenge</strong></td>
<td>4.2%</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*N=7,787*

*** p≤0.001, ** p≤0.01, * p≤0.05, + p≤0.1
The diagram illustrates the percentage of applicants submitting applications across different conditions for White and POC (People of Color) groups. The conditions are Control, Belonging, and Challenge.

For White applicants:
- Control: 1.6%
- Belonging: 4.0%
- Challenge: 4.1%

For POC applicants:
- Control: 1.2%
- Belonging: 4.7%
- Challenge: 4.9%

The significance levels are indicated as follows:

- *** p≤0.001
- ** p≤0.01
- * p≤0.05
- + p≤0.1

The sample size (N) is 7,787.
Residents were next asked how they received their City utility bill. About half of residents received a paper bill and the other half received their bill electronically.

Figure 7: Method of Receiving Utility Bill
*Which method does your household currently use to receive its City of Scottsdale utility bill?*

- Paper bill, utility bill is mailed to my home: 51%
- Paperless billing, utility bill is received and paid electronically: 49%

The final special-interest question asked residents who did not currently utilize paperless billing for their utility bill about their level of agreement with a series of related statements. Almost all residents who received a paper bill did so because they preferred it; about half indicated that they needed a paper bill for other reasons. A majority of residents who received a paper bill strongly disagreed that they didn’t trust electronic payments, had tried to establish electronic payment but found the process too complicated, didn’t have computer access or didn’t know how to establish electronic payment.
Figure 8: Utility Billing Preferences

If you do not currently use paperless billing for your City utility bill, please indicate how much you agree or disagree with each of the following statements:

- **I prefer a paper bill**
  - Strongly agree: 71%
  - Somewhat agree: 18%
  - Somewhat disagree: 5%
  - Strongly disagree: 6%

- **I need a paper utility bill for other reasons, i.e. to show proof of residency or utilize the landfill services**
  - Strongly agree: 30%
  - Somewhat agree: 28%
  - Somewhat disagree: 7%
  - Strongly disagree: 35%

- **I don’t trust electronic payments**
  - Strongly agree: 15%
  - Somewhat agree: 14%
  - Somewhat disagree: 13%
  - Strongly disagree: 58%

- **I’ve tried to establish electronic payment on my account but the website/process was too complicated**
  - Strongly agree: 3%
  - Somewhat agree: 13%
  - Somewhat disagree: 9%
  - Strongly disagree: 74%

- **I don’t have access to a computer**
  - Strongly agree: 7%
  - Somewhat agree: 7%
  - Somewhat disagree: 7%
  - Strongly disagree: 80%

- **I don’t know how to establish electronic payment on my account**
  - Strongly agree: 5%
  - Somewhat agree: 5%
  - Somewhat disagree: 11%
  - Strongly disagree: 79%
Join thousands of Scottsdale residents who have gone paperless.

Sign-up to receive your utility bill electronically at this link: bit.do/scottsdale

- Go to the above link
- Click on the enroll tab
- Enter your account #
- Never receive a paper bill again!

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
Percentage signing up for paperless billing

- **Regular customers**
  - Control: 0.60%
  - Treatment: 0.59%

- **No return envelope customers**
  - Control: 0.22%
  - Treatment: 0.61%

N=56,106

*** p≤0.001, ** p≤0.01, * p≤0.05, + p≤0.1
You need a tangible and impactful goal, with a clear, short-term outcome.
You need access to relevant data and a substantial sample size
It’s not just about communicating better (although that does help)
It’s not a cure all, you’re likely to find processes need improvement
It helps to have a BI Ninja Warrior (or two...) someone passionate about using behavioral insights & testing what works
What are the key ingredients to an impactful behavioral insights team?

A - Administrative support
P - Political support
P - People
L - Location
E - Experimentation
S - Scholarship

Inside the Nudge Unit, David Halpern, 2015