Sugar Bowl
Historic Preservation Plan: Design Guidelines

Approved March, 2005 by HPC
City of Scottsdale - Historic Preservation Program
INTRODUCTION

It is the goal of the Scottsdale Historic Preservation Ordinance to protect and preserve those properties recognized and listed on the Scottsdale Historic Register. One of the mechanisms used to accomplish this is the development of a Historic Preservation (HP) Plan for the properties once they are designated. This plan for Sugar Bowl sets forth the objectives for the preservation of this important historic resource and identifies the procedures and future support the City could utilize to achieve its goals.

The goal of the Sugar Bowl HP plan is to ensure the preservation of those character-defining features that distinguish the property and contribute to its significance. It is the further goal of this plan to assist this historic property in maintaining its economic viability and continued use as a commercial property. Through future incentives, the City of Scottsdale intends to demonstrate that the practical considerations associated with aging downtown properties can be addressed and both its preservation and potential redevelopment in suitable locations can be realized.

The Sugar Bowl building is located on a .13-acre parcel at the southeast corner of Scottsdale Road and First Avenue in the heart of Old Town Scottsdale in a busy area of retail shops, restaurants and offices. Originally constructed in 1950 for Western Motor Service, the building was adapted for reuse in 1958 by the Sugar Bowl Ice Cream Parlor and The Cancellation Shoe Center. The building is a single story, simple form with a flat roof obscured by a parapet, on the north and west facades, that gives the appearance of extra volume. The Sugar Bowl building is constructed in the themed “Old West” Architectural Style. The Sugar Bowl has operated continuously from this location for more than 45 years.

The Sugar Bowl building is both historically and architecturally significant. It is important for its association with Scottsdale’s Post World War II community planning and development patterns and for its association with the town’s social history. It is representative of a period when the town became a major tourist destination and helps to illustrate the evolutionary pattern of downtown retail development during this vital era. The architecture of the building is significant for its ability to convey the principals of mid-twentieth century storefront design in addition to the Western Style deliberately adopted by downtown businesses as part of their postwar marketing efforts. The blending of modern elements and Western Style architecture still convey the historic design intentions. Covered walkways, false front parapet walls, and rustic signage express the Old West Style.

Specific materials also articulate the historic significance of the Sugar Bowl. The use of concrete block for the building’s exterior walls was decidedly modern as were the large storefront windows. In addition, wood flush-board cladding and rustic wood lettering were used to reinforce the building’s Western styling. The presence of the Sugar Bowl’s largely intact physical features continues to convey a sense of the building’s historic character and its association with postwar development patterns, social history, and architectural styles in downtown Scottsdale.
DESIGN REVIEW

An important component of the HP plan is the design guidelines that have been prepared to guide the “Review Process on Applications Requiring a Certificate of No Effect or Certificate of Appropriateness” as set forth in Section 6.122 of the HP ordinance. Section 6.122 represents the public action to regulate development that is necessary to achieve the preservation objectives of this HP plan. This regulation is not intended to prohibit alterations to the existing building or new development or construction within the designated historic property. Instead it is intended to: (1) guide the work that is done so that it does not adversely affect the historic characteristics that distinguish the Sugar Bowl and (2) provide compatibility of the new with the old. The regulations are limited to exterior work only.

DESIGN REVIEW PROCESS

When a building permit is sought to do exterior work on the designated Sugar Bowl property, the Development Services Director will refer the request to the City’s HP Officer to determine if the work requires a Certificate of No Effect or a Certificate of Appropriateness (C of A). If the “C of A” is required, and when the Development Review Board approval is also necessary, the HP Officer and the Zoning Administrator will confer to determine whether the preservation of historic character or development aspects of the proposed project dominates. In making this determination the following factors will be considered: (1) Do the HP Design Guidelines for the property specifically address the work proposed; and/or (2) the additional amount of lot coverage resulting from the proposed project; and/or (3) the percentage of building square footage being added; and/or (4) the percentage of the existing building footprint that is affected by the proposed work.

For those cases reviewed by the Historic Preservation Commission, the decisions of appropriateness (C of A) will be made according to the following principles that have evolved over time and reflect the accepted standards for historic preservation work today. These principles should be used in planning and undertaking work on the Sugar Bowl:

Understand the Character-Defining Features
Historic properties have specific physical characteristics that enable them to convey their association with historic events and people, illustrate historic building types, periods or methods of constructions and give them distinctive visual character. These features should be retained as part of any planned work, so as to not diminish the property’s significance.

Preserve, Protect and Maintain
The identified character-defining features should be protected and maintained. Performing regular maintenance and upkeep is encouraged. This work will lessen the likelihood of the buildings needing major repairs or expensive replacement of features.

Repair
When character-defining features or materials become damaged or worn, repair should be done with the least degree of intervention possible. Repair should begin with patching and move to limited replacement in kind with matching materials and/or finishes.

Replacement
It is preferable to repair rather than replace but, when a feature is missing or the level of deterioration precludes repair, then replacement may be appropriate. Replacement should be with matching or compatible materials and repeat the original design. Features replaced or reconstructed should be reproduced according to physical evidence or archival documentation on its historic appearance.
Sugar Bowl Character-Defining Features

Site and Setting:

- Building located on a downtown corner at the street side setback
- Wide walkways adjacent to the building reinforce its pedestrian-oriented, urban character

Massing and Form:

- Simple, monolithic massing
- Pedestrian scale created by one-story building height along street frontage
- Rectangular form with horizontal emphasis

Walkway along Scottsdale Road

Long horizontal building along Scottsdale Road

Rear of building showing rectangular massing
Massing and Form Continued:

- Broadside orientation of primary façade on Scottsdale Road
- Street corner façade reinforced by 45 degree turn of the building at the northwest corner
- False front parapets on the street facades of the flat roof convey the Old West, boomtown character.

Detail of 45% window on the corner

North side of restaurant showing corner of building

False front parapets above storefronts
Exterior Walls:

- Exterior walls constructed with concrete block
- False front roof parapets clad with vertical wood flush-board
- Vertical wood flush-board cladding sheaths entire primary façade

Vertical wood cladding on storefronts

Concrete block wall visible from the alley on the south

Concrete block wall and columns on the rear of the building
Porch, Windows and Doors:

- Wooden porch canopy with shake roof and exposed rafter tails projecting over walkways from street façades
- Bands of prominent, rectilinear “open front” display windows reinforce retail character on the street façades
- Fixed wood windows sashes with wood frames, molding, and sills
- Double-leaf wood entry doors with panels
- “Old West” character reinforced with arched glazed door panels over vertical and horizontal wood panels

Canopy extends around corner

Bands of large display windows

Entry doors with arched panels
“Old West” Ornamentation and Detailing:

- Simple wood bands trim cornice and base of the false front roof parapets
- Metal guy wires attach porch canopy to the parapet cornice
- Decorative scalloped canvas with stripes on porch fascia reinforces old fashioned “parlor” image
- Signage constructed with rustic individual font wood letters in a traditional western typeface, applied to the parapet walls on the street facades
- Cantilevered industrial reflective metal lighting fixtures attached to parapet cornice

Canopy suspended from guy wires; decorative scalloped canvas

Two horizontal wood bands on parapet

Individual wood letters for signs
Sugar Bowl Design Guidelines:

1. Retain the historic scale and the simple massing and proportions of the building.

2. Additions or expansions to the building should occur at the rear and should be subordinate to the historic building and similar in scale, massing, and proportions.

3. Repair or replacement of the roof should retain the flat form and false front parapets.

4. Repairs to the exterior walls and/or the new construction of exterior walls should match the existing materials and patterns.

5. Retain the canopy structure along the primary facades. Repair or replacement of the canopy must be similar in form and use wooden materials.

6. The pattern and arrangement of the historic bands of display windows must be retained on the street façades. Repairs or replacement should use large glass panes and fixed, wood sashes with wooden surround materials.

7. Repairs or replacement to the ornamental trim and detailing should be similar to the original trim and detailing.

8. Repairs to the Sugar Bowl entry doors should maintain the double-leaf design and existing glazing and wood panel patterns. Replacement of other storefront doors should match original Sugar Bowl entry doors.

9. Retain the cut wood letters mounted directly on the façade as the building’s signage. New signage should use similar painted letters and typeface.

10. It is recommended that the building’s exterior wall continue to be painted pink.