
This document was created from the closed caption transcript of the May 12, 2015 City Council Special Meeting and **has not been checked for completeness or accuracy of content.**

A copy of the agenda for this meeting, including a summary of the action taken on each agenda item, is available online at:

<http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/Assets/Public+Website/Council/Council+Documents/2015+Agendas/051215SpecialAgenda.pdf>

An unedited digital video recording of the meeting, which can be used in conjunction with the transcript, is available online at: <http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/citycable11/channels/Council15> . For ease of reference, included throughout the transcript are bracketed "time stamps" [Time: 00:00:00] that correspond to digital video recording time.

For more information about this transcript, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 480-312-2411.

CALL TO ORDER

[Time: 00:00:01]

Mayor Lane: Good afternoon, everyone. Nice to have you here with us. This is our 4:00 p.m. special meeting. And I would like to call it to order. We'll start with a roll call, please.

ROLL CALL

[Time: 00:00:12]

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Mayor Jim Lane.

Mayor Lane: Present.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Vice Mayor Linda Milhaven.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Councilmembers Suzanne Klapp.

Councilwoman Klapp: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Virginia Korte.

Councilmember Korte: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Kathy Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Guy Phillips.

Councilman Phillips: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: David Smith.

Councilman Smith: Present.

Carolyn Jagger: City Manager Fritz Behring.

Fritz Behring: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: City Attorney Bruce Washburn.

City Attorney Bruce Washburn: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: City Treasurer Jeff Nichols.

City Treasurer Jeff Nichols: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: And the Clerk is present.

Mayor Lane: It is May 12th. The board and commission review and appointment process. For that process, I'll turn over now to our vice mayor, Linda Milhaven.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Thank you, mayor. This afternoon, we're interviewing Scottsdale residents interested in serving on 13 citizen advisory boards and commissions. I want to thank these individuals for their willing to volunteer their time in service of this community. Following each set of interviews, we'll vote on that the appointments for that board of commission. As I call your name, please come to the podium. We ask that you briefly cover the following material. Please share your name, address and how long you have lived in Scottsdale. Why do you want to serve on this board or commission? How do your experiences qualify you to serve on the commission? And what do you think is the top priority facing the commission? Please limit your comments to three minutes or less. We have a timer by the screen so you can manage your time. Following each nominee's response, I'll ask council members if very this any questions.

BOARD OF ADJUSTMENT

[Time: 00:01:46]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: We'll begin with Board of Adjustment. They have the power to hear

and decide on administrative decision and variances from the provisions of the zoning requirements. There is one vacancy and one nominee. Mr. Metz.

Matt Metz: Mayor Lane, Vice Mayor Milhaven and council members, good afternoon. Thank you for this opportunity to apply for a second term on the Board of Adjustment. I'm applying for second term because I believe in Scottsdale. I believe in giving back to Scottsdale. And I believe and have a passion for the quasi-judicial process that the Board of Adjustment uses. I really enjoy participating in it. In terms of qualifications, you have seen my resume which has my work experience and my life experience. I won't go through that again. More importantly, I think is my prior three years of service. One of those as vice chair and I demonstrated willingness and ability to commit my time. I have visited every site of the Board of Adjustment rules on and I'm one of the few board members who has perfect attendance including flying in from out of town to make those board meetings. Most importantly, I believe I have a positive and professional relationship with the hard working staff that supports us and with the city attorney's office. The two issues are attendance where the only thing I can effect for that is my own attendance. The other one is ensuring all of our rulings are based on the four statutory criteria. For that, as chair, I'm able to ask questions of my fellow board members to ensure that if there's a denial in their vote, this that they base that on the four criteria. That's it. I hope you give me an opportunity to serve another three years. I'm open to any questions.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Thank you, Mr. Metz. Each council member may vote once. We'll begin with Council Member Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Mr. Metz.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Mr. Metz.

Councilwoman Klapp: Mr. Metz and I want to give you a gold star for attendance.

Mayor Lane: Mr. Metz.

Councilmember Korte: Mr. Metz

Councilman Smith: Mr. Metz

Councilman Phillips: And Mr. Metz

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Congratulations, Mr. Metz. You're reappointed. Thank you for your service.

BUILD ADVISORY BOARD OF APPEALS

[Time: 00:04:26]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Moving on to Building Advisory Board of Appeals. They have the jurisdiction to recommend minor variances in the electrical and mechanical application of the

building code be granted and alternative construction or materials to be allowed. There are no special qualifications required for city code but members appointed shall be qualified by experience and training to decide on matters pertaining to building construction. There are two vacancies and one nominee. The nominee is Mr. Texeira. Mr. Texeira wasn't able to attend today but submitted his answers in writing. He's also been nominated for the Loss Trust Fund Board. So I guess we will proceed with a vote. Beginning with myself, I will not cast a vote.

Councilwoman Klapp: Raymond Texeira.

Mayor Lane: Raymond Texeira.

Councilmember Korte: Mr. Texeira.

Councilman Smith: No vote.

Councilman Phillips: Mr. Texeira.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Mr. Texeira.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Mr. Texeira is appointed to the Building Advisory Board of Appeals.

ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ADVISORY BOARD

[Time: 00:05:32]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: The Environmental Quality Advisory Board has one opening. The board provides guidance on the prioritization of future environmental activities and recommends environmental policies to the city council. Special qualifications as specified in city code are membership of the board shall reflect scientific and professional background in engineering, planning, or Earth science and nonscientific interest, representatives from the community at-large. Candice Gimble is eligible for reappointment and represents a scientific interest and has been nominated. Aliza Sabin did not respond to the invitation to interview. There is one vacancy and three nominees so we'll begin with Ms. Gimble.

Candice Gimble: Thank you for having me. My name is Candice Gimble at 13258 North 79th Street for six years coming this July. Public service is an honor and a privilege. I want to thank you for nominating me to a second term. I have really felt honored to be a part of EQAB. Our common goal for a unique economic system. I know staying modern means being efficient and sustainable. The precious systems that bring people to Scottsdale either to live or to visit. I want us to continue being proud of our programs and our practices. I hope my time and enthusiasm and policy experience will promote the city's goals and objectives. I want to continue my work as an EQAB member so I can help represent it to outreach to local school districts. We're trying to improve the transportation process and efficiencies there. And I hope to continue assisting staff and developing materials, strategies and relationships that improve the safety, the energy and efficiency of Scottsdale's young

families to and from school.

I briefed council members in the past on case studies and fact findings that helped understand code generation operates elsewhere in Arizona and how waste of energy has been investigated by other experts in the field. I also tracked our local residential solar industry over the last two years. There have been a lot of changes both at the utility level and with the corporate commission. Likewise, I collaborated with other council members and the staff and interested parties on the general plan by often needs a lot of support from experts and volunteers.

I have a bachelor's of science in economic environmental biology from Michigan. I have a masters in economics for public policy implementation from Columbia. I spent 15 years after that in both private and public sectors specializing in energy environmental issues. My experience has been useful to the city council in so far as I understand research, forecast, regulatory analysis and the interdisciplinary nature of our objectives here at the city. To be sustainable. Every one of the city's boards aims to support the short-term issues and the long-term objectives of Scottsdale. I hope to do my part to keep Scottsdale on course toward a robust, modern and sustainable future. I hope to put my efforts toward answering council's questions on issues like water management, drought prevention, energy independence, transportation efficiencies, and heat map strategies. I think there are many topics that I highlight as important but I just want you to know I'm very committed to helping in some way.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Thank you, Ms. Gimble. Councilmember Korte?

Councilmember Korte: Thank you Vice Mayor Milhaven. Candice, can you talk more about how you're assisting our Scottsdale schools with ingress and egress issues? There are two in particular. Anasazi which is one tonight but also mountainside middle school has experienced some real issues for many years. How are you working with that in the transportation department?

Candice Gimble: Initially, I tried to lend a hand to citizens. Letters happen every year when new people are in shock of the way that our schools have -- are coping with open enrollment and the myriad of transportation paths that differ from the way we grew up. I would not have necessarily worked with the two schools you mentioned except to say I've done some research on different best practices and how a school district in Vegas has created a different kind of bus stop that's a community bus stop. I've looked at blackboard which is a large company in the area. I happen to have found out that their software developers are putting out certain software to help people know when to come and go so that it is less disrupt to you class time for pickup. I tried to put all of the options into a memo as a background research after which point it seemed that this topic was, you know, relevant, I tried to be available to staff and to the school districts insofar as making liaisonships and helping promote a resolution and/Or, you know, a next step. It's really not my -- the best thing about being on the board is it is not my baby. I just try to help.

Councilwoman Korte: Thank you.

[Time: 00:11:40]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Thank you, Ms. Gimble. Mr. Steven Schlosser? Did Ms. Sabin decide to come? Okay. We'll vote and begin with Councilmember Klapp.

Councilwoman Klapp: Candice Gimble.

Mayor Lane: Vote to reappoint Candice Gimble.

Councilmember Korte: Candice Gimble.

Councilman Smith: Candice Gimble.

Councilman Phillips: Ms. Gimble

Councilwoman Littlefield: Candice Gimble.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Congratulations, Ms. Gimble, you have been reappointed and thank you for your service.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

[Time: 00:12:11]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Moving on to historic preservation, we have two openings. One for an archaeologist and one for a historian. Historic Preservation Commission oversees the development and management of Scottsdale's historic preservation program. In order to increase funding opportunities from the heritage funds and other grants, the state recommends one opening be filled with a member of each of the following professions, registered architect, real estate professional, archaeologist and historian. So we'll begin with -- we have two vacancies and two nominees. We'll begin with Ellen Kirchman.

Ellen Kirchman: My name is Ellen Kirchman. I've currently serve on the historic preservation commission. I live at 8707 East Bell Drive in Scottsdale and I've been a resident for ten years. During the three years I've been serving on this commission, we've made wonderful accomplishments. I feel proud to be a part of that. I believe we still have important work to do. I believe very strongly in giving back to my community and being involved in the growth of our city. I'm here today because it would be my privilege to continue to be involved in this commission and broaden the achievements I know are possible from this group. I would like to see this group engage the community in a more impactful way. And to bring topics that have not demanded our attention back to the discussion which is archaeology.

I have a master's degree in rare book preservation and conservation from Columbia University as does our other member and I've worked with arts and antiques for 20 years. I feel

privileged to have had the opportunity to protect cultural heritage in libraries, museums and special collections. It is my goal to share my passion and excitement for history by participating in the work of the historic preservation commission and the delicate balance with the demand. I believe we are stewards of our cultural heritage. It is our duty to share that knowledge as best we can by protecting the historic gems of our city for future generations while rejoicing toward the future. I look forward to the coming challenges and achievements of the preservation commission and I thank you for considering me for the post.

[Time: 00:14:30]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Thank you, Ms. Kirchman. Next is Taraneh Moosavi.

Taraneh Moosavi: Good afternoon, mayor, vice mayor and council. My name is Taraneh Moosavi. I'm vice chair for the Historic Preservation Commission. I live in 90th and Cactus. And I am a resident of Scottsdale for the past 23 years. I'm an architect. I have my own practice. It is an architectural office. I have been always interested into the history report of my kind of education. I have worked on many of historical buildings back when I was in college and I'm still very interested to follow this up. Past three years, I have worked -- we have helped with the preservation committee and the city of Scottsdale. We have worked on many projects coming using city budget for either helping people to upgrade their houses, helping them to acknowledge the historical value of their property. Helping them, coming forward to make it as a historical value property. And I think we are -- we are on the right track and we have to achieve this and I love to help more in this committee to continue with bringing more properties, more areas into this subject. Giving more knowledge to people about history of the city that they live in. And what we can do to keep the buildings that they already consider historic and to keep them the way that it is. Or if they are need for some repair or some changes to help them direct to the way it is not of the chart and doesn't go out of their value. So we have a lot of plans for the next coming year. And I'm quite sure it has been discussed with the mayor and to help more with the issues.

[Time: 00:17:21]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Thank you. Mr. Bamberl has withdrawn his nomination. Each council members can vote twice. We'll begin with the mayor.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, vice mayor. I vote for Ellen Kirchman and Taraneh Moosavi.

Councilwoman Korte: I vote for Ms. Kirchman and Ms. Moosavi.

Councilman Smith: I'll also vote for Ms. Kirchman and Ms. Moosavi.

Councilman Phillips: Kirchman and Moosavi.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Kirchman and Moosavi.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Ms. Kirchman and Ms. Moosavi.

Councilwoman Klapp: Ellen Kirchman and Taraneh Moosavi.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Congratulations, ladies. You have been reappointed. Thank you for your service.

JUDICIAL APPOINTMENTS ADVISORY BOARD

[Time: 00:18:03]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: We'll move on to Judicial Appointments Advisory Board. We have one opening. This advisory board makes advisory recommendations to the city council regarding the appointment and reappointment of full-time city judges. Per City ordinance number 3254, the council must appoint, reappoint a member who is recommended from the Scottsdale Bar Association. Both applicants were recommended by the Scottsdale Bar. Mr. Padish is eligible for reappointment and has been nominated. There is one vacancy and two nominees. We'll begin with Mr. Padish.

James Padish: Good afternoon, mayor lane and council members. My family and I have lived in Scottsdale for 27 years. The most recent 20 years have been at 8607 North Woodland Court. I wish to contribute to my community, providing whatever services and talents that I have that are unique to the judicial appointments board. I have, as you I'm sure are aware from my resume have been appointed by the governor as a superior court judge of Maricopa County. I left the judge ten years ago because I had too many children and not enough money. I've been in practice now for ten years. My offices are at Gainey Financial Center. I have a partner who practices exclusively family law and two retired judges who are of counsel as well.

Prior to being appointed by governor Hull, I was executive director of the public defender's office where I was able to gain a firsthand understanding of the relationship between all of the parties in criminal justice system. Municipal courts are unique. They're a high-volume court. For most people, it is the only experience that they have with the criminal justice system. Most of them don't have lawyers. It requires a special kind of judge, one who is patient, one who is efficient and one who even if she is not totally in tune with what the person is saying, gives an appearance of listening and caring because most people need to be heard. And it they feel like they've been heard, then justice has been served. Trying to attract and nominate to this council the sort of persons who would make a good municipal court judge is quite a process.

You've had occasion to appoint during my tenure on the judicial appointments board, I believe two judges. Statia Hendrix was the most recent one. Scottsdale attracts a lot of good candidates. Good candidates for many reasons but primarily because Scottsdale is viewed as a very good judicial system. And that's a reflection of the trust that the council gives to the city court and also to the management to the city court under the stewardship of Judge Olcavege. I would like to remain on the committee for another term.

[Time: 00:21:24]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Thank you. We'll move on to John Penner.

John Penner: Good afternoon. My name is John Penner. I live at 8325 East Rancho Vista Drive in Scottsdale. I've lived there for the past 12 years. I've lived in Scottsdale I believe 16 years overall. I've also had a law office in Scottsdale located about half a mile from here for the past 12 years.

The main reason that I would like to serve on this board is that I care very much about Scottsdale. I was asked to apply by the Scottsdale bar association, and I was excited about it. I'll tell you parenthetically I'm the second member of my family to appear in front of the council. My daughter said the pledge of allegiance here along with the rest of Brownie Troop 4 earlier this year. And I'm glad they're not here today because they're a tough act to follow. I believe that the city courts really are the portal where the judicial system interacts with the public. And I think the judges need to have good legal skills and good reasoning and equally important good temperament. I'm a lawyer who's been in the trenches. I've appeared regularly in Scottsdale city court, Phoenix, Tempe, superior court. All of the justice courts. And for litigants, even city court litigants, their case is the most important thing in the world to them. I've had -- some clients are residents, some are visitors, some are snowbirds. I've had clients tell me they're leaving the state because of the way they felt they were treated, not in Scottsdale but in courts. And it is hard to emphasize how important it is to the folks who are going through the process.

I have been practicing law in Arizona since 1992. I moved here in 1989 to go to law school and I stayed. I have taught courses, paralegal schools, other legal courses. I've given classes to other lawyers on various issues. I've had articles published on various issues. In fact, this is the current copy of the Advocate which is the Arizona Trial Lawyers Association newsletter. This came out two days ago. There is an article in the front of that that I wrote. I believe that I'm uniquely qualified to assist in the selection of judges based upon my work in court and my work as a lawyer.

In terms of the top issues facing the court and I'll finish very quickly because I see I'm out of time -- judicial selection is interesting right now. Phoenix is currently going through a selection and they've got some bad publicity or some publicity in the newspaper despite having very good candidates. They have two former presiding superior court judges of candidates and their process is stalled. Obviously the most important thing the judicial committee does is pick judges and I want to help the committee pick the very best judges possible. In addition, there's an opportunity to influence judicial policy going forward such as what's Scottsdale going to do? Are we going to have veterans courts or things of that nature? For all of those reasons, I would like to serve on the judicial committee.

[Time: 00:25:40]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Thank you, Mr. Penner. We have one opening. Each member will vote once and we'll begin with Councilmember Korte.

Councilwoman Korte: Mr. Padish.

Councilman Smith: Reappoint Mr. Padish.

Councilman Phillips: Padish.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Mr. Padish.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Mr. Padish.

Councilwoman Klapp: James Padish.

Mayor Lane: Reappoint Mr. Padish.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Congratulations, Mr. Padish. You've been reappointed. Thank you for your service.

LIBRARY BOARD

[Time: 00:26:05]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Library Board advises the city council on policy relating to program services and future development of the Scottsdale public library. There is one vacancy and two nominees. We'll begin with Mr. Thomas O'Shea.

Thomas O'Shea: Good afternoon. My name is Tom O'Shea. I have lived in Scottsdale since 1970. Proud graduate of Scottsdale High. Many of you are familiar with that entity that no longer is -- has its doors open. Some my teachers actually sat in your council seats. I fondly remember. I live at 9550 East Thunderbird Road in Scottsdale. And I'm applying for the library board.

One of the reasons I want to contribute and serve at the board is I love our city. I feel that it is a very exciting time for library and information science. I do have a masters in library and information science. I also have a Ph.D. in education. I've been a teacher for 25 years in the community. And I've done some volunteering at different places mostly that have to do with children. So the youth is, you know, an emphasis for me. But you know, also some of the issues that we really need to address for the library includes reaching out to the elderly and the winter visitors. The library is a special place. It is a special place that, you know, has -- we have ideas and ideals in the library and that's something that will continue on and the library is at a juncture. We need to be flexible in our thinking about how we proceed with the library's main purposes. And with budget constraints that goes along with that. Thank you very much for your time.

[Time: 00:28:41]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Thank you, Mr. O'Shea. Next is Laraine Rodgers.

Laraine Rodgers: Good afternoon, mayor, vice mayor. I live at 1970 79th Street in Scottsdale. When I stood before you three years ago, I said the reason I wanted to serve was to give back to the community that has given me so much. In terms of education, fabulous programs and experiences and mostly tremendous opportunities. As a board member for the last three years, I've applied my passion, experience and commitment to help our library achieve its mission and its goals. There's more I believe I can do and I would like to be reappointed so I may continue to contribute in an advisory role. In addition to participating in all board meetings, I did miss one over three years, but contributing to the discussions, asking pretty tough questions and attending library and other city events as best I could, I embrace the practice of outreach in several ways. I personally shared the value of our 21st century library in Scottsdale, programs and services to several community groups across the city including homeowner's associations, including senior groups, schools and church groups. Prior to each outreach event, I believed it was important to apply what I've learned in business and I researched who I was speaking with and tried to put together a presentation that would engage the specific people with whom I was speaking. Right now, I don't know if you know but if you need a library speaker at any event, you can ask via our website. You can take a look at the website.

I was selected by Maricopa County Library Council as the 2014 citizen advocate to participate in the national library legislative day in Washington, D.C. early last May. As a member of the Arizona contingent, meeting with our Arizona elected officials, I shared stories I've heard firsthand from our community members, stories of what our library has made possible for them. These were things including leadership skills, digital literacy skills, regular literacy skills, job skills, entrepreneurs and helping people who just moved to the area and some underserved people as well realize there is a way they can learn more. The top issue facing our 21st century library is the need to be relevant providing for digital and information literacy as well as quality of life through our programs and services. Thank you very much.

[Time: 00:31:32]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Thank you, Ms. Rodgers. Each member may vote once and we'll begin with Councilman Smith.

Councilman Smith: I would like to reward Laraine Rodgers' perfect attendance by appointing her again.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: She said she missed one meeting.

Councilman Phillips: Ms. Rodgers.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Laraine Rodgers.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Ms. Rodgers.

Councilwoman Klapp: Laraine Rodgers.

Mayor Lane: Vote to reappoint Laraine Rodgers.

Councilmember Korte: Laraine Rodgers.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Congratulations, Ms. Rodgers. You've been reappointed. Thank you for your service.

LOSS TRUST FUND BOARD

[Time: 00:32:08]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Moving on to the Loss Trust Fund Board, we have two openings. The Loss Trust Fund Board is responsible for recommendations to the city council regarding the administration of the loss trust fund. Mr. Texeira was nominated and appointed earlier to another board so that leaves us with two vacancies and one nominee and we'll hear from Mr. Paul McKee.

Paul McKee: Thank you. Good evening and thanks for having me, mayor and council. My name is Paul McKee. I live at 5502 North Granite Reef Road. I've been a resident of Scottsdale for 23 years. I love the city. And it is part of the reason I want to serve on the Loss Trust Fund Board to give back and also to help me grow professionally as well.

As far as my experience, I started my career right here at the city of Scottsdale. I'm a CPA. I keep my license current even though I don't practice anymore but I was an auditor for seven and a half years here at the city prior to getting into risk management. I served as the risk services manager for almost 16 years here at the city. And during that time, my major responsibility was overseeing the safety program. So I think I have a unique perspective that I sat on the other side of the board. I would actually report to them and was involved with the risk management annual report. I'm not sure if you still don't that. We did a report and we would trend and do different things and report to the board. I actually served on the other side of that so I have a unique perspective.

As far as what I think the biggest issue facing the board is just looking through the minutes in the last year, there's a lot of conversation about raising the insurance retention from two to three and maybe even \$5 million. I would not be a proponent of that. I know the market is hardening and it is tougher to get insurance but whether you select me or not, do everything you can to keep that retention at \$2 million. Once you raise it, it is going to be really difficult to lower that again. I think the other thing -- I know you only asked for one but I'm going to give two. The other is just from looking forward, when I was serving here at the city of Scottsdale, we spent a lot of time talking about action plans. What we were doing going forward in terms of mitigating losses. I highly encourage you to bring the claims manager, have the safety manager and the claims manager come to the meetings and give they're perspective. Because they're out there every day and they know what's going on and can give a unique perspective aside of the insurance part of it. So I would highly encourage you to do that and I can really contribute in that fashion because I spent the lion's share my career doing that here at the city and also now at SRP. So I thank you for your time and

consideration.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Thank you, Mr. McKee. We have two openings and one nominee. We'll begin the voting with Councilman Phillips.

Councilman Phillips: Mr. McKee.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Mr. McKee.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Mr. McKee

Councilwoman Klapp: Paul McKee.

Mayor Lane: Mr. McKee.

Councilmember Korte: Mr. McKee

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Paul McKee.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Mr. McKee, congratulations. Thank you.

MCDOWELL SONORAN PRESERVE COMMISSION

[Time: 00:35:31]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: McDowell Sonoran Preserve Commission is next. The commission with the assistance of city staff makes recommendations to the city council on such items as preservation strategy, funding, land acquisition, educational, promotional programs, master planning and other preserve-related issues. There are two vacancies and two nominees. We'll begin with Mr. Dodd.

Steve Dodd: Good afternoon. I'm Steve Dodd. I've been a resident of Scottsdale since 1994. I live at 13462 North 92nd Place. I believe the McDowell Sonoran Preserve is an amenity that no other city in the valley can match. Not in terms of the amount of land nor especially the uniqueness of the land that we've got. It is something truly special. I've started hiking the area when we moved here in '94. And since then, the Preserve has been my primary outlet to connect with nature for recreation and for solitude. As a result from what the Preserve has given me, I feel a need to give back to the Preserve. Plus I'm just a chronic volunteer.

As far as experience, I've been a McDowell Sonoran conservancy steward since 2003. I've been through just about every position there is in the organization from leading hikes, teaching classes, serving on countless committees. I've been chair of the core leadership team plus a member of the board of directors as well. I am a master steward in the organization and also a citizen scientist. Based on MSC's records, I've logged about 4,000 hours working for the Preserve. As probably a little bit short because in the early days, we had pretty sketchy

records. But I'm not sure I want to know what the real number is anyway.

As far as the top issue facing the board, as you know, the board is moving -- the Preserve is moving from an acquisition mode into a sustainability mode. It is very important that we manage it properly in the coming years. And keep it sustainable. As a member of the MSC citizen science program, I've worked on the ecological resource plan that's being developed for the preserve as part of the city's overall resource management plan. And have been to many public meetings and heard firsthand what the people are looking for in the Preserve. And I think the commission -- Preserve commission -- can be instrumental in helping the council realize the scientific management principles to protect the Preserve in the future. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Thank you, Mr. Dodd. Mr. Milillo wasn't able to attend today but has submitted his answers in writing. So we have two openings and two nominees. Each council member may vote twice. We'll begin with Councilwoman Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Steve Dodd, Michael Milillo.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Mr. Dodd and Mr. Milillo.

Councilwoman Klapp: Steve Dodd and Michael Milillo.

Mayor Lane: Mr. Dodd and Mr. Milillo.

Councilmember Korte: Mr. Dodd and Mr. Milillo.

Councilman Smith: Mr. Dodd and Mr. Milillo.

Councilman Phillips: Mr. Dodd, incredible resume you have. Mr. Dodd and Mr. Milillo.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Gentlemen, congratulations on your appointment. Thank you for your service.

NEIGHBORHOOD ADVISORY COMMISSION

[Time: 00:40:00]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Next, Neighborhood Advisory Commission has one opening and advises and makes recommendations to the city council on policies, plans, strategies and programs for the preservation, improvement and revitalization of Scottsdale's housing and neighborhoods. There is one vacancy and one nominee. We'll begin with Mr. Gonzalez.

Mike Gonzalez: Mayor Lane, council members, my name is Mike Gonzalez. I've lived in McDowell Mountain Ranch for the last 20 years. I was encouraged to apply for a second term on the Neighborhood Advisory Commission. I currently chair that committee and we have a great time helping neighborhoods get more eye appeal in the city of Scottsdale. We generally work in the middle and southern part of the city. Projects in the last years have been redoing

walls and neighborhoods that where people actually have to work in order to be rewarded with reimbursements from the city. We've currently been working this year on a new project which is the spirit awards. We just provided the winners of those awards -- there's three or four different awards to city council for the June 2nd meeting. We also love to work with neighborhoods and make them eye-popping as far as their eye appeal goes.

One of the things we do is we visit every applicant or nominee for a grant or for an award. And we even talk with the neighbors and make sure that they know what's going on in the city. One of the issues that we have with the neighborhoods is a lot of folks aren't aware of these two different programs and so when we ask for nominees, we struggle to find new nominees. We got a whole group of nominees that just love to come back. But what we're striving for is new nominees to come. It is like leading a horse to water. You can lead it there but you can't make it drink. A lot of times, the neighborhoods want to do something but the leadership isn't quite there. To get things rolling. So the big issue, the commission's working on is how do we get the neighborhood involved and the city's got a few programs they're starting that may help with that in the coming months. But I certainly have loved being on this board and doing things with the city. And I would appreciate your vote for reappointment. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Thank you, Mr. Gonzalez. We have one vacancy and one nominee. I'll begin with Mr. Gonzalez.

Councilwoman Klapp: Mike Gonzalez.

Mayor Lane: Michael Gonzalez.

Councilwoman Korte: Mr. Gonzalez.

Councilman Smith: Mr. Gonzalez.

Councilman Phillips: Mr. Gonzalez.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Michael Gonzalez.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Congratulations on your reappointment and thank you for your service.

PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION

[Time: 00:43:17]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Parks and Rec. is next. We have one opening. This commission is a citizen advisory committee that advises the city council on the acquisition of lands and facilities for the use of parks and recreation centers. The Parks and Recreation Commission advise on the operation, use, care and maintenance of these parks and recreation areas. Mr. Adli and Mr. Gagen have withdrawn their nominees. So we have one vacancy and two

nominees. We'll begin with Ron Chambless.

Ron Chambless: Good afternoon. I'm Ron Chambless. I live at 3060 North Pima Road. My wife and I have been a resident of Scottsdale for a little over five years now. We moved here from Cincinnati, Ohio. Love every minute of it. The reason I wanted to volunteer to serve the community -- she and I are both volunteering. She's volunteering tonight for special handicapped kids and horseback riding. She's starting her volunteering tonight. I'm here applying to volunteer.

The primary reason I want to serve the Parks and Recreation Commission is because all of my education and all of my career has been in that area for four decades. I have both an undergraduate degree and a graduate degree in health, physical education and recreation. I spent the first 28 years running YMCAs across the country. The last 11 years are served as a senior vice president, chief operating officer for all of the YMCAs in greater Cincinnati, northern Kentucky and southeastern Indiana. 21 YMCAs and 3,000 employees. \$32 million operating budget. I spent 12 years in consulting across the country mostly with YMCAs, JCCs, medical centers and sports organizations.

And I think one of the greater challenges that I've seen in the last decade, especially in the parks and recreation field is that we seem to be asset-rich and operation-poor. One of the strengths I have been able to bring clients across the country is innovative funding models, operation optimization plans, better recoveries, strategic community partnerships, strength and collaborations and just bringing greater assets for the senior leadership and staff to expand and sustain the recreation field I would consider it a privilege and an honor to serve the city and work through the Parks and Recreation Commission. I understand the roles and boards and commissions because I've been on both ends. I would love to serve the city of Scottsdale. Thank you so much.

[Time: 00:46:01]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Thank you, Mr. Chambless. Mr. Jasa.

Paul Jasa: Hi. My name is Paul Jasa, a Scottsdale resident now for five years and a Phoenix resident for almost ten. Arizona resident for about 20 years. I lived in Tucson and Flagstaff. I would like to serve in the commission because I think I've got a lot to contribute. I've got a lot of free time. A lot of energy. I participate in some of the Scottsdale parks programs and other cities. I've also coached AYSO, kids and I've participated in government in Flagstaff, the city of Flagstaff before so I'm familiar with how some of the -- how to make friends and how to work with other people and I would really like to do that. I think that some of the areas I would really like to focus on is the preservation of parks and the reduction of costs. I think I'm an out of the box creative thinker and solution-finder. Not a problem-causer. And I would like to be able to provide those services to the city of Scottsdale and to my colleagues. Thank you.

[Time: 00:47:27]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Thank you, Mr. Jasa. We have one opening and we will be -- each council member will vote once.

Councilwoman Klapp: Ron Chambless.

Mayor Lane: Paul Jasa.

Councilmember Korte: Ron Chambless.

Councilman Smith: Ron Chambless.

Councilman Phillips: Chambless.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Ron Chambless.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Mr. Chambless, congratulations, Mr. Chambless, you have your appointment.

PLANNING COMMISSION

[Time: 00:47:53]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Planning Commission. We have one opening. The Planning Commission reviews, evaluates and approves the rezoning requests, general plan amendments, use permits, abandonments, municipal use master site plans and maintaining the applicable standards and policies of the city of Scottsdale. Linda whitehead has withdrawn her nomination. There is one vacancy and three nominees. We'll begin with Mr. Alessio.

Paul Alessio: Good afternoon, mayor. Vice mayor Milhaven, members of the council, my name is Paul Alessio at East Tailspin Lane in Scottsdale. My family and I moved here from San Diego in 1983. Our first apartment was at McDowell just west of Pima. Soon after that, we moved north and I attended horizon high school where I met my wife and also attended Arizona State University. We currently live in Gray Hawk, a community of over 3800 homes near 10,000 residents and almost 2400 acres total. I would like to serve on the Planning Commission as an opportunity to get back to the city of Scottsdale which has given me so much.

I currently serve on the city of Scottsdale review board and have served since December of 2014. I serve as principal and partner with a commercial builder. We currently have over \$40 million worth of construction within the city of Scottsdale. Chaparral Suites and Scottsdale Healthcare also known as Honor Healthcare. I've worked on over 100 projects which I feel is a unique perspective to understand the importance of planning. Additionally, I have served on multiple homeowner association boards, architectural review committees. I currently serve on both of those with gray hawk as well. My experience working with community organizations has taught me the importance of listening to individual residents as

well as the community as a whole to strive to balance the competing interests of both the resident as well as the community before rendering any recommendations. My personal experience over the past 31 years of living and working as well as playing in Scottsdale as well as my 16 years as a Scottsdale-based commercial builder give me the great base to understand where the Scottsdale brand has been and where Scottsdale is going in the future. A quick story, I was driving with my 14-year-old daughter in north Phoenix. We were driving through an area. She said dad, it doesn't feel right. It doesn't feel like it has been developed. I kind of smiled. I said a 14-year-old gets it. That's one of the reasons why we live in Scottsdale. That's why dad feels strongly about serving on the Development Review Board and possibly on the Planning Commission.

I believe the top issue facing the Planning Commission is to work together with principles of development and redevelopment in Scottsdale while listening to the Scottsdale citizens and the community as a whole as well as respecting the Scottsdale general plan and the character area plans. To work to balance the sometimes competing interests and make the best possible recommendations to the city council that are consistent with the Scottsdale brand while preserving the enjoyable quality of life we all enjoy. The Planning Commission is an important role. One that I would be honored to serve on. Thank you.

[Time: 00:51:12]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Thank you, Mr. Alessio. Next we'll have Robert Cappel.

Robert Cappel: Robert Cappel, 33600 North 79th Way in Scottsdale. Vice Mayor Milhaven, Mayor Lane, members of the council, thank you once again for nominating me for the Planning Commission. I've lived in Scottsdale -- with a we actually built our first home in '93 way up north just on the north side of Bell Road. In 2001, we decided we wanted to live further up in the unique, beautiful upper Sonoran desert so we built our home there in Winfield which is just south of the Boulders Resort there in Scottsdale.

You've seen me over the years. I know maybe more times than you would like. Here as an advocate for residents and businesses on new development plans, trying to be an advocate for them and express their concerns. And to try to get those concerns resolved. I think the Planning Commission really could use a person on the commission that was a strong advocate for residences and for businesses that are currently here. Residents bought into a certain way of life and many businesses are struggling to survive. I think a strong advocate for these people on the Planning Commission would be a plus and would help bring forth the concerns that these people have and the businesses have and help try to resolve those issues. I've had a unique opportunity to be involved with a large number of these folks over the years. As ten years on the board of directors for Winfield HOA, as president for eight of those years. As president of the Greater Pinnacle Peak Association. As a member of the Scottsdale council of homeowner associations. And as a person who's also worked with the Coalition of Greater Scottsdale over the years. I've worked with the city staff on the general plan and the general plan update. And right now, working with the staff on rezoning the state land. Along Pima and Scottsdale roads. So I think I could be a plus on the Planning Commission. I've also worked with developers to try to resolve issues that residents have around new development.

And even John Barry has made me a partner in his firm. With that, that's all I have to say. Thank you very much for nominating me again.

[Time: 00:54:26]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Thank you, Mr. Cappel. Ross Cromarty.

Ross Cromarty: Mayor Lane, thank you for this opportunity. Council members, thank you for this opportunity. My name is Ross Cromarty. I've lived in the city of Scottsdale for 20 years. Ten as an employee for the city of Scottsdale. My address is 8109 East Delta Run Drive.

The first question I've been asked to respond to is why the Planning Commission? And my response is I've always been interested in planning. Going way back when I was a kid. I was interested in how housing was going up back on Long Island this those days where I lived was the fastest growing county in the United States. And I think you're all familiar with that and the growth that's gone on in Arizona in the last 20 years. A lot of things I witnessed as a young person are currently going on in our valley. So I have a great interest in that. Also, I recognized early on that planning directly impacts the quality of life of our citizens. And their children. And what they want to do with their lives and the city. So that's my interest in serving on the board.

So experiences. I don't know if I should just give you bullets or just ramble on but education, I have a bachelor's in geography. I have a masters in planning. I have a Ph.D. in planning. I taught planning on the graduate and undergraduate level for ten years at ASU. I owned my own business for over 11 years back east so I know what it's like to meet a payroll, get a right location, get the taxes in and to get those quarterly reports. In addition to that, I have worked as a long-range planner for the city of Scottsdale and back in New York for Suffolk county planning. Those ten years have brought a lot of understanding of working with the community. I personally specialized in citizen participation so I've been out and about in the community and recognize the importance of listening to what's going on and trying to incorporate that in our plans. I've written character area plans and I've also written general plans.

So what do I think is the top issue? The top issue in Scottsdale as I see it right now is a transition. A change from those days when we were building McCormick ranch where there was all that green, open space that was being used for horses and other natural resources. Those days are now gone. What we have to look at and the challenge for the city is to see how do we do sensitive redevelopment and revitalization, keeping our character, supporting our businesses and also keeping our folks and their quality of life up to the standards they expect. Finally and I know I'm a little bit over time, I hope you agree it might be kind of refreshing to have a planner on the Planning Commission. Thank you very much for your time.

[Time: 00:57:53]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Thank you, Mr. Cromarty. All righty. We have one opening and we'll begin the voting with the mayor.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, vice mayor. I would vote for Paul Alessio.

Councilmember Korte: Ross Cromarty.

Councilman Smith: Bob Cappel.

Councilman Phillips: Mr. Cappel.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Bob Cappel.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Paul Alessio.

Councilwoman Klapp: Paul Alessio.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: So we'll vote again between Mr. Alessio and Mr. Cappel. We'll begin with Councilmember Korte.

Councilwoman Korte: Mr. Alessio.

Councilman Smith: Bob Cappel.

Councilman Phillips: Mr. Cappel.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Bob Cappel.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Mr. Alessio.

Councilwoman Klapp: Paul Alessio.

Mayor Lane: Mr. Alessio.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Congratulations, Mr. Alessio, you've been appointed to the Planning Commission.

TOURISM DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION

[Time: 00:58:50]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Tourism Development Commission advises the city council on tourism in Scottsdale as well as the expenditure of revenues from the transaction privilege tax on lodging, tax designated for tourism development. This should reflect a representative of the tourism industry including restaurants, travel agencies, transportation companies, et cetera. Dee Ellsworth has withdrawn. There is one vacancy and two nominees. Beginning with

Linda Dillenbeck.

Linda Dillenbeck: Mayor Lane, Vice Mayor Milhaven and council members, my name is Linda Dillenbeck. I've been a resident of Scottsdale since 1976 and I reside at 9720 North 80th Way. I've applied for the TDC vacancy because I believe my 20 years of experience in the tourism and golf industries will benefit the organization. Tourism is critical to Scottsdale's economy. As is making sure that every dollar spent to promote it brings a return on investment. I know from my work with others competing for the same visitors Scottsdale can't outspend these people. We need to outsmart them. I'll help the TDC make informed decisions in today's highly-competitive marketplace.

For eight years, I worked at Resort Suites of Scottsdale where I created and managed a golf cooperative program with 13 partners and a \$1 million budget. Collaboration was the linchpin of the success of that program that brought golfers to Scottsdale. That same cooperative spirit will work and benefit the city and the TDC as we work together to increase tourism revenue. For the past 12 years, I worked at "Golf Digest" as a regional sales rep. This experience has provided broad exposure to the strategies and programs our competitors consider and employ. I'm certain this knowledge can benefit the TDC. My time at "Golf Digest" has also reinforced the importance of evolving and remaining relevant to today's consumers. Ten years ago, no one thought magazines would do anything but grow. But then the Internet came along. Our company quickly realized if we didn't adapt and change the experience, we were going to be dead. This is no different than the challenge that faces Scottsdale. Consumer's habits for travel continue to change. Millennials, Boomers and GEN-Xers want different experiences. I'll be proactive in supporting recommendations that adapt to these changing times while remaining focused on experiences, highlighting the authenticity of Scottsdale and our lifestyle. I've been an active member of the SCVB for 15 years. They're an amazing organization.

I look forward to working with them and the TDC to overcome the biggest challenge I see facing Scottsdale tourism. That's remaining relevant to tomorrow's consumer. To be successful will require creative thinking, collaboration and a focus on smart investments. Areas of considerable expertise for me. I've studied the strategic plan. I've read the minutes of the TDC and the task force. I'm impressed by the thoughtful business-like approach being taken to ensure the future of Scottsdale tourism is in line with the quality of life we citizens expect. If you grant me the honor of serving on the TDC, I'll hit the ground running and put my 20 years of knowledge and experience to ensure visitors are from the globe and can't wait to come to Scottsdale. Thank you for your consideration.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Thank you, Ms. Dillenbeck. Tatum Luoma was unable to attend but was submitted her answers in writing. We have one opening. Each member will vote once. We'll begin with Councilman Smith.

Councilman Smith: Linda Dillenbeck.

Councilman Phillips: Ms. Dillenbeck.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Linda Dillenbeck.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Ms. Dillenbeck.

Councilwoman Klapp: Tatum Luoma.

Mayor Lane: Ms. Dillenbeck.

Councilmember Korte: Tatum Luoma.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Congratulations, Ms. Dillenbeck, you have been appointed.

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

[Time: 01:03:09]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Last but not least, the Transportation Commission has one opening. The Transportation Commission advises the city council on matters relating to the safe and efficient movement of vehicles, pedestrians and bicycles. There's one vacancy and two nominees. We'll begin with Gary Bretz.

Gary Bretz: Thank you, Mayor Lane and city council. I appreciate your nomination. My name is Gary Bretz. I live at 7820 East Roosevelt. I've been a resident of Scottsdale for over 40 years. I have a history of serving in many different areas including probably about 25 years ago, I served on Scottsdale Pride Commission or Committee. I've enjoyed the almost three years that I've served on the Transportation Commission. It has been an honor to work with the city staff. It is amazing the information and the expertise that they share with us. I would like to continue to serve.

I've learned many different things and I believe I've contributed especially in terms of transit questions because of my 17 years working for Valley Metro in a number of capacities. I also enjoy biking and so I think I contribute in that area in terms of the different paths. Since my retirement about four years ago, it has allowed me to actually attend many of the different public meetings and it is amazing how you can really hear so much more than the reports that the staff provide by listening to how the citizens talk about it. I've enjoyed continuing to serve on several different committees with MAG and recently with the friendly Scottsdale. My wife and I adopted a couple of children from China and so we're still involved in the schools and have been very active with Coronado including trying to link them to the community. Recently, Coronado choir sang at an event recently over with M.A.G. and we're hoping in the fall to have some of the leaders from Coronado high school work with seniors during another M.A.G. event. I ask you to continue to allow me to serve another three years. Thank you.

[Time: 01:05:59]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Thank you, Mr. Bretz. David Vaughn?

David Vaughn: Mayor Lane and Vice Mayor Milhaven, council, I'm honored to be here. As a matter of fact, I had to buy a hat two sizes larger today just to come here. I know from experience it is very difficult to beat the reigning champion. You don't win on points. You have to knock him out. And I have nothing but respect for Mr. Bretz. I'm also known for giving two minutes of information and cramming it into two hours so I'm glad -- is the clock working? Sure.

I lived in Scottsdale for 27 years. My name is David Vaughn. I live at 7960 East Camelback. Number 508. 85251. I'm interested in transportation. I've spent most of my life in it in one form or another. Nine of my ten lives have been in moving people from point A to B. Mostly by air in my case. I've used probably transportation to some of the major cities in the world depended on it. I've known about it from experience. I think the Transportation Commission is a key and paramount to the future plans for the city, as I understand them. And that's one of the reasons I put my hat in the ring for this. I know one thing. You have to move people. And you've got to move them efficiently, effectively. And we have a pretty good system on the ground here. The buses aren't bad. The frequency has improved. The routes are pretty good.

But my purpose, if I get on the commission is to concentrate on elevating the ground transportation from what I call acceptable but a little bit user unfriendly to a user unfriendly method. And I would propose such things as information. I think we need to protect the people standing out here in the hot sun waiting for a bus with no protection. And occasional rains we get from time to time. No information at the bus stop to say when, where and how it's going. So in this area, I think is one of the critical ones to be addressed. And let's see. What else do we have on the menu here? Oh, yeah.

I did -- I graduated with a B.A. degree in psychology and sociology and things like that. Did some graduate work at the University of Colorado in education. I spent about as much time in aviation and education equally and aviation education combined. Done a lot of volunteer work over the years here in the city one way or another. Some of it involving transportation. And Arizona State University, Coronado high school, places like that. Did I mention too, we've lived here 27 years? I know a little bit about it. So that's about it. I think I'm out of time. I think the whole program is sort of out of time. So I don't know what goes with closing it up. Anyone want to entertain a motion that the meeting be adjourned?

[Time: 01:10:16]

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Still have a little while before we get there. Thank you, Mr. Vaughn. We have one vacancy and two nominees. I believe we start with Councilman Phillips this time.

Councilman Phillips: Mr. Vaughn.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Mr. Vaughn.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Mr. Bretz.

Councilwoman Klapp: Gary Bretz.

Mayor Lane: Vote to reappoint Gary Bretz.

Councilmember Korte: Mr. Bretz.

Councilman Smith: Gary Bretz.

Vice Mayor Milhaven: Mr. Bretz, you've been reappointed. Thank you for your service. This concludes our interview and appointment process this afternoon. Thank you to everyone who interviewed and I'll turn the meeting back to the mayor.

ADJOURN SPECIAL MEETING

[Time: 01:10:57]

Mayor Lane: Thank you very much, vice mayor. Good meeting. A lot of ground covered. Reasonable time. That completes our business for this special meeting so I would entertain a motion to adjourn this meeting.

Councilmembers: So moved.

Mayor Lane: Moved and seconded. All in favor of adjourning, aye. We are adjourned. Thank you very much.