SCOTTSDALE PLANNING COMMISSION
KIVA-CITY HALL
3939 DRINKWATER BOULEVARD
SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA

WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 11, 2019

*SUMMARIZED MEETING MINUTES*

PRESENT:
Paul Alessio, Chair
Ali Fakih, Commissioner
Renee Higgs, Commissioner
Prescott Smith, Vice Chair
Larry S. Kush, Commissioner
Kevin Bollinger, Commissioner
Christian Serena, Commissioner

ABSENT:
Prescott Smith, Vice Chair

STAFF:
Tim Curtis    Doris McClay
Margaret Wilson   Phil Kercher
Bryan Cluff    Jesus Murillo
Greg Bloemberg  Melissa Berry
Keith Niederer   Lorraine Castro

CALL TO ORDER
Chair Alessio called the regular session of the Scottsdale Planning Commission to order at 5:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL
A formal roll call was conducted confirming members present as stated above.

MINUTES REVIEW AND APPROVAL

1. Approval of the November 13, 2019 Regular Meeting Minutes including Study Session.
   Commissioner Kush moved to approve the November 13, 2019 Regular Meeting Minutes, including Study Session, seconded by Commissioner Serena.

   The motion carried unanimously with a vote of six (6) to zero (0); by Chair Alessio, Commissioner Fakih, Commissioner Bollinger, Commissioner Kush, Commissioner Higgs and Commissioner Serena.

* Note: These are summary action minutes only. A complete copy of the meeting audio is available on the Planning Commission page on ScottsdaleAZ.gov, search “Planning Commission”
Continuance

2. 9-ZN-2019 (2nd Street and Bishop)
Continued to the January 22, 2020 February 12, 2020 meeting.
Request approval of a Zoning District Map Amendment from Highway Commercial Downtown Overlay (C-3 DO) to Downtown/ Downtown Multiple Use Type-3 Planned Block Development Downtown Overlay (D/DMU-3 PBD DO) and approval of a Development Plan with Development Standards to allow for the development of an 8-story residential development with approximately 199 units on a +/- 1.54 gross acre site, located at 7125 E. 2nd St., and 3702, 3638 & 3632 N. Bishop Lane. Staff contact person is Bryan Cluff, 480-312-2258. Applicant contact person is George Pasquel III, (602) 230-0600.

Move to continue case 9-ZN-2019 to the February 12, 2020, by a vote of 6-0; Motion by Commissioner Kush, 2nd by Commissioner Higgs.

The motion carried unanimously with a vote of six (6) to zero (0); by Chair Alessio, Commissioner Fakih, Commissioner Bollinger, Commissioner Kush, Commissioner Higgs and Commissioner Serena.

Written comment card: Patrick Quayle

Consent Agenda

3. Approval of the Planning Commission 2020 Calendar.

Motion to approve the 2020 Planning Commission calendar, by a vote of 5-0; Motion by Commissioner Bollinger, 2nd by Commissioner Higgs, Commissioner Kush absent.

The motion carried unanimously with a vote of five (5) to zero (0); by Chair Alessio, Commissioner Fakih, Commissioner Bollinger, Commissioner Higgs and Commissioner Serena, Commissioner Kush absent.

4. 3-TA-2019 (Landscaping Text Amendment)
Request by City of Scottsdale to amend the City of Scottsdale Zoning Ordinance (Ordinance No. 455), for the purpose of amending Section Article X (Landscaping Requirements), and Section 5.1604.D.1.d of the General Commercial (C-4) District, to revise restrictions on synthetic landscape materials (artificial turf), address redundancies, eliminate obsolete regulations and text, and adjust formatting for ease of use. Staff contact person is Greg Bloemberg, 480-312-4306. Applicant contact person is Greg Bloemberg, 480-312-4306.

Move to make a recommendation to City Council for approval of 3-TA-2019 by a vote of 6-0; Motion by Commissioner Kush, after determining that the Text Amendment is consistent and conforms with the adopted General Plan 2nd by Commissioner Higgs.

The motion carried unanimously with a vote of six (6) to zero (0); by Chair Alessio, Commissioner Fakih, Commissioner Bollinger, Commissioner Kush, Commissioner Higgs and Commissioner Serena.

Speaker Card: Sonnie Kirtley

* Note: These are summary action minutes only. A complete copy of the meeting audio is available on the Planning Commission page on ScottsdaleAZ.gov, search “Planning Commission”
5. **2-AB-2019 (Paseo at Pinnacle Peak Abandonment)**
Request by owner to abandon +/-2,000 sq. ft. of public right-of-way located along the southeastern corner of parcel 212-04-641, with Single-family Residential, Planned Residential Development, Environmentally Sensitive Lands (R1-10 PRD ESL) zoning located at 7676 E. Pinnacle Peak Road. Staff contact person is Jesus Murillo, 480-312-7849. Applicant contact person is Chris Clonts, 480-273-3232.

Move to make a recommendation to City Council for approval of 2-AB-2019 by a vote of 5-0; Motion by Commissioner Kush, per the staff recommend stipulations, based upon the finding that the Abandonment is consistent and conforms with the adopted General Plan, 2nd by Commissioner Serena with Commissioner Fakih recusing himself.

The motion carried unanimously with a vote of five (5) to zero (0); by Chair Alessio, Commissioner Bollinger, Commissioner Kush, Commissioner Higgs and Commissioner Serena. Commissioner Fakih recused himself.

6. **6-AB-2019 (Phoenix Herpetological Sanctuary)**
Request by owner to abandon 5 feet of fee-simple right-of-way and 8 feet of GLOPE located along N. 78th Street (along the western boundary of parcel 212-21-020A), 5 feet of fee-simple right-of-way and 13 feet of GLOPE located along E. Antioch Way (along the southern boundary of parcel 212-21-020A), on a +/- 2.5 -acre site with Single-family Residential, Environmentally Sensitive Land, Foothills Overlay (R1-70 ESL FO) zoning, located at 28011 N. 78th Street. Staff contact person is Jesus Murillo, 480-312-7849. Applicant contact person is Kurt Jones, 602-452-2729.

Move to make a recommendation to City Council for approval of 6-AB-2019 by a vote of 6-0; Motion by Commissioner Bollinger, per the staff recommend stipulations, based upon the finding that the Abandonment is consistent and conforms with the adopted General Plan, 2nd by Commissioner Higgs.

The motion carried unanimously with a vote of six (6) to zero (0); by Chair Alessio, Commissioner Fakih, Commissioner Bollinger, Commissioner Kush, Commissioner Higgs and Commissioner Serena.

7. **8-UP-2014#2 (Verizon PHO Dynamic)**
Request by owner for a renewal of a Conditional Use Permit for an existing Type 4, Alternative Concealment, Wireless Communication Facility (WCF) located on a 55-foot-tall artificial palm tree, with associated ground-mounted equipment located at 1525 N. Hayden Road with Industrial Park (I-1) zoning. Staff contact person is Keith Niederer, 480-312-2953. Applicant contact person is Reg Destree, 602-349-6930.

Move to make a recommendation to City Council for approval of 8-UP-2014#2 by a vote of 6-0; Motion by Commissioner Bollinger, per the staff recommended stipulations, based upon the finding that the Conditional Use Permit criteria have been met, 2nd by Commissioner Higgs.

The motion carried unanimously with a vote of six (6) to zero (0); by Chair Alessio, Commissioner Fakih, Commissioner Bollinger, Commissioner Kush, Commissioner Higgs and Commissioner Serena.
8. **10-UP-2014#2 (Verizon PHO Macjack)**
Request by owner for renewal of a Conditional Use Permit for an existing Type 4, Alternative Concealment, Wireless Communication Facility (WCF) located on a 65 foot tall artificial palm tree, with associated ground-mounted equipment located at the southern end of Indian School Park at 4251 N. Hayden Road with Open Space (O-S) zoning. Staff contact person is Keith Niederer, 480-312-2953. Applicant contact person is Reg Destree, 602-349-6930.

*Move to make a recommendation to City Council for approval of 10-UP-2014#2 by a vote of 6-0; Motion by Commissioner Bollinger, per the staff recommended stipulations, based upon the finding that the Conditional Use Permit criteria have been met 2nd by Commissioner Higgs.*

The motion carried unanimously with a vote of six (6) to zero (0); by Chair Alessio, Commissioner Fakih, Commissioner Bollinger, Commissioner Kush, Commissioner Higgs and Commissioner Serena.

**REGULAR AGENDA**

9. **8-ZN-2019 (Senior Living at McDowell Mountain Ranch)**
Request by owner for a Zoning District Map Amendment from Single-family Residential, Planned Community District, Environmentally Sensitive Lands (R1-35 PCD ESL) to Commercial Office, Planned Community District, Environmentally Sensitive Lands (C-O PCD ESL) and Development Plan amendment on a +/-5-acre site located at 9875 & 9909 E. McDowell Mountain Ranch Rd (217-14-037A and 217-14-038A). Staff contact person is Doris McClay, 480-312-4214. Applicant contact person is Michael Leary/Paul Gilbert, 480-991-1111.

10. **5-AB-2019 (Senior Living at McDowell Mountain Ranch)**
Request to abandon the thirty-three (33) foot General Land Office Patent Easement (GLOPE) on the east side of parcel 217-14-037A, the thirty-three (33) foot General Land Office Patent Easement on the west side, the thirty-three (33) foot General Land Office Patent Easement on the south side and the western (8) feet of the thirty-three (33) foot General Land Office Patent Easement on the east side, located on parcel 217-14-038A located at 9875 & 9909 E. McDowell Mountain Ranch Road. Staff contact person is Doris McClay, 480-312-4214. Applicant contact person is Michael Leary/Paul Gilbert, 480-991-1111.

*Item No’s 9 & 10: Move to make a recommendation to City Council for approval of cases 8-ZN-2019 and 5-AB-2019 with revised stipulations failed by a vote of 3-2; Motion by Commissioner Bollinger, 2nd by Commissioner Fakih with Commissioner Kush recusing himself. Recommendation moves forward as a denial.*

The motion to approve failed with by a vote of three (3) to two (2); with Commissioner Bollinger and Commissioner Fakih to approve with Chair Alessio, Commissioner Serena and Commissioner Higgs opposing. Commissioner Kush recusing himself.

Speaker Cards: Matt Ohre, Court Rich, Jason Rose, Jason Alexander, Brendan Brown and Mary Turner

*Note: These are summary action minutes only. A complete copy of the meeting audio is available on the Planning Commission page on ScottsdaleAZ.gov, search “Planning Commission”*
Request by owner for a Zoning District Map Amendment from Downtown/Downtown Multiple Use – Type 2 Downtown Overlay (D/DMU-2 DO) zoning to Downtown/ Downtown Multiple Use – Type 2 Planned Block Development Downtown Overlay (D/DMU-2-PBD DO), and amending the development plan in case (21-ZN-2016) proposing an increase in dwelling units on the site from 53 to approximately 130 and Amending Development Standards, on a +/-2.60-acre site located at the southeast corner of North 69th Street and East Main Street, and approximately 95 feet east of the northeast corner North 69th Street and East 1st Street (6903, 6909, 6915, and 6939 E. Main Street and 6914, 6920, and 6930 E. 1st Street). Staff contact person is Bryan Cluff, 480-312-2258. Applicant contact person is John Berry, 480-385-2727.

Move to make a recommendation to City Council for approval of 21-ZN-2016#2 by a vote of 5-0; Motion by Commissioner Kush, per the staff recommended stipulations, after determining that the Zoning District Map Amendment, Development Plan and Development Standards are consistent and conform with the adopted General Plan, 2nd by Commissioner Higgs with Commissioner Fakih recusing himself.

The motion carried unanimously with a vote of five (5) to zero (0); by Chair Alessio, Commissioner Kush, Commissioner Bollinger, Commissioner Higgs and Commissioner Serena, Commissioner Fakih recusing himself.

Speaker Card: Skip Allen


Move to make a recommendation to City Council for approval of 6-ZN-2019 by a vote of 5-0; Motion by Commissioner Kush, per the staff recommended stipulations, after determining that the Zoning District Map Amendment, Development Plan and Development Standards are consistent and conform with the adopted General Plan, 2nd by Commissioner Serena with Commissioner Fakih recusing himself.

The motion carried unanimously with a vote of five (5) to zero (0); by Chair Alessio, Commissioner Kush, Commissioner Bollinger, Commissioner Higgs and Commissioner Serena, Commissioner Fakih recusing himself.

Written comment cards: Mel Cervantes, Ed Fabrittis, Nico Thirion, Dennis & Natalie Hartunian, Kiva Lindaman, Lisa Kelley, Edward Kelley, Laurie Lyon, Shaunda Ruckman Blinzler, Marilyn Fleek, Skip Allen and Carmela Lizzo

* Note: These are summary action minutes only. A complete copy of the meeting audio is available on the Planning Commission page on ScottsdaleAZ.gov, search “Planning Commission”
Speaker Cards: Karen Fabritiis, Danielle Racke, Robert O’Neill, Randy Goettsche, Lisa Goettsche, Greg Lesher, Susan Feder, Karen Nabity, Russell Barnes, Sharon Newbill, Linda Brown, Carmela Lizzo, Beth Taylor, Shaunda Ruckman, Marilyn Fleek, Erik Bevan, Tim Heinemann, Nico Thirion and Denis Hartunian

**ADJOURNMENT**

With no further business to discuss, the regular session of the Planning Commission adjourned at 8:15 p.m.