



**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
NEIGHBORHOOD ADVISORY COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
APPROVED MINUTES**

WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 22, 2020

**COMMUNITY DESIGN STUDIO
7506 E. INDIAN SCHOOL ROAD
SCOTTSDALE, AZ 85251**

PRESENT: Jennifer Fabiano, Chair
Carol Miraldi, Vice Chair
Ross Cromarty, Commissioner
William James, Commissioner
Amanda Nash, Commissioner
Michael Wills, Commissioner

ABSENT: Rachel Putman, Commissioner

STAFF: Adam Yaron, Project Coordination Liaison
Taylor Reynolds, Project Coordination Liaison
Tim Conner, Office of Environmental Initiatives Manager
Andrew Chi, Planner
Holly Walter, Public Affairs Supervisor
Bill Murphy, Assistant City Manager

Call to Order/Roll Call

The meeting of the Neighborhood Advisory Commission was called to order at 5:02 p.m. A formal roll call was conducted, confirming members present as stated above.

Public Comment

There were no public comments.

1. Approve Draft Summary Meeting Minutes November 25, 2019

Chair Fabiano called for revisions. She made a correction to the adjournment section, which had her listed as present, although she was not.

VICE CHAIR MIRALDI MOVED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE NOVEMBER 25, 2019 MEETING AS AMENDED. COMMISSIONER JAMES SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 6-0 WITH CHAIR FABIANO, VICE CHAIR MIRALDI, AND COMMISSIONERS CROMARTY, JAMES, NASH AND WILLS VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

2. Neighborhood Advisory Commission 2019 Annual Report

Adam Yaron, Commission Liaison, said that pursuant to the City charter, code and ordinances, boards and commissions produce annual reports for the City Manager to compile and present to City Council in February. Staff recommends approval of the 2019 Annual Report. He acknowledged that there is a correction to the spelling of Commissioner Wills' name. He thanked Chair Fabiano for her comments added at the end of the report.

COMMISSIONER JAMES MOVED TO APPROVE THE 2019 NEIGHBORHOOD ADVISORY COMMISSION ANNUAL REPORT. COMMISSIONER CROMARTY SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 6-0 WITH CHAIR FABIANO, VICE CHAIR MIRALDI, AND COMMISSIONERS CROMARTY, JAMES, NASH AND WILLS VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

3. Neighborhood Advisory Commission Annual Bylaw Review

Mr. Yaron stated that NAC Bylaws were last revised in February 2016. They are reviewed annually to ensure they are meeting the needs of the Commission. Staff requests that the Commission take action either to reaffirm the Bylaws or recommend any updates.

COMMISSIONER JAMES MOVED TO APPROVE THE NEIGHBORHOOD ADVISORY BYLAWS. COMMISSIONER CROMARTY SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 6-0 WITH CHAIR FABIANO, VICE CHAIR MIRALDI, AND COMMISSIONERS CROMARTY, JAMES, NASH AND WILLS VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

4. Election of Officers

Mr. Yaron thanked Chair Fabiano and Vice Chair Miraldi for their time and service. Based on the bylaws, Commissioners may serve in the same capacity for no more than two consecutive terms. Both members have maximized their time in these positions.

CHAIR FABIANO NOMINATED RACHEL PUTMAN AS CHAIR. VICE CHAIR MIRALDI SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 6-0 WITH CHAIR FABIANO, VICE CHAIR MIRALDI, AND COMMISSIONERS CROMARTY, JAMES, NASH AND WILLS VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

Jennifer Fabiano Immediately relinquished her position as Chair.

VICE CHAIR MIRALDI NOMINATED ROSS CROMARTY AS VICE CHAIR. COMMISSIONER FABIANO SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 6-0 WITH CHAIR FABIANO, VICE CHAIR MIRALDI, AND COMMISSIONERS CROMARTY, JAMES, NASH AND WILLS VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

Vice Chair Cromarty chaired the remainder of the meeting.

5. Scottsdale's Census 2020 Education and Awareness Campaign

Holly Walter, Public Affairs Supervisor, stated that Census day is April 1, 2020. Staff is working to prepare messaging to ensure that every resident of the City is counted. The census is key in establishing local eligibility for government programs, determining federal and state legislative redistricting and reappointment and to provide programs and capital facilities for planning and budgeting. Staff recently distributed an article in the City utility bill regarding the census and specific impacts to Scottsdale. The City will receive approximately \$3,000 annually for each person counted.

Late last year, the City formed the Complete Count Committee, comprised of local influencers, religious groups, neighborhoods, schools and business community members. The Committee will help promote the census through locally based, targeted outreach efforts. It promotes cooperative efforts between the City and the Census Bureau. There will be a variety of census events, rallies and promotions. Outreach began this month and will continue through the end of March. A social media campaign has been initiated, but will ramp up March. For the first time, people will be able to complete the census online. Residents will receive a mailing with an invitation to do so. Other options will be to complete the census on the phone or via paper form. April 1st is census day, however residents have until July 31st to be counted. Census information will be available on the City's website. The Commission is being asked to approve \$5,000 for a trailer advertising wrap and vehicle magnets to promote the census.

Outreach events include the recent Martin Luther King dinner, Unity Walk and Scottsdale Interfaith Breakfast. Downtown event ambassadors distribute census information at the Old Town Farmers Market every Saturday. The City will have a presence at the Waste Management Phoenix Open. Informal ads are provided at Barrett-Jackson, Scottsdale Arts Festival, upcoming Indian Festival, Senior Expo and spring training.

Vice Chair Cromarty suggested having additional outreach be conducted outside of local grocery stores, distributing information and answering questions.

Commissioner James commented that he was uncertain as to how the \$5,000 request relates to the NAC. In the past, when they have been asked for money for projects, the focus has been on community-centered issues, such as park renovations. Ms. Walter stated that from the committee's perspective, NAC is relevant as a community-focused commission that understands the importance of having everyone counted, especially in terms of funding. Mr. Yaron added that in line with the purpose, powers and duties of this Commission with respect to supporting policies, plans and strategies that preserve, improve and revitalize

Scottsdale's neighborhoods, the census is clearly in line with the intent of ensuring an accurate account in terms of receipt of both state and federal dollars. The funds received through an accurate census count will ensure the City receives its share of funding for road improvements and other vital human services. The NAC receives an annual City Council approved budget. This amount has not been used to its full capacity over time. This is an opportunity that would otherwise come out of budget for other departments of the City.

Commissioner James commented that the NAC should perhaps focus more on fully utilizing its annual funding budget. Mr. Yaron stated that this a priority that was listed in the NAC's annual report as a focus. Vice Chair Cromarty acknowledged that Commissioner James has a good point, however it is important for the NAC to be involved in the census, as it is one of the most important activities of the government.

Commissioner Nash asked about other sources for funding. Ms. Walter stated that the City is working as a region and has contributed funds to MAG for the regional communication campaign. The request this evening will be specific to Scottsdale residents. Commissioner Miraldi commented that supporting the census is a perfect fit for the NAC, as the funding from positive results helps in many areas.

COMMISSIONER MIRALDI MOVE TO APPROVE \$5,000 FUNDING FOR THE CITY'S CENSUS 2020 EDUCATION AND AWARENESS CAMPAIGN. COMMISSIONER FABIANO SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 6-0 WITH VICE CHAIR CROMARTY, COMMISSIONERS FABIANO, JAMES, NASH, MIRALDI AND WILLS VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

6. Scottsdale's Participation in the 50th Anniversary of Earth Day in April, 2020

Tim Conner, Office of Environmental Initiatives Manager, stated that three members of the Environmental Advisory Commission are working as Steering Committee members to guide a multi-departmental staff team to plan events for the celebration as well as throughout the year. Earth Day is April 22nd and Arbor Day is April 24th. This year the celebrations will be combined.

Planned activities include:

- April 22: Mayor and Council Breakfast at Horizon Park, to include tree planting, Mayor's proclamations, instructional videos, environmentally themed booths, tree giveaway.
- Tours and tree planting demonstrations, one to take place at the Chaparral Xeriscape Demonstration Garden
- Tree-related videos to be shown on Cable 11 at the end of February or early March.
- Library to hold tree-themed events.
- Planting of 100 trees through ASU's Urban Forestry Department, through contractor Urban Offsets. ASU intends to become carbon neutral by 2035.
- Mayor's Office and Scottsdale Environmental Advisory Commission are developing a youth tree-themed art competition

A flyer will be included in the City's February water bill, which will include details on workshops as well as information on Earth Day. Social medial platforms will also be utilized. Funding is needed to provide approximately 250 small trees for a giveaway at the Mayor's breakfast. Another 100 trees will be given away at the Scottsdale Old Town Farmer's marketing. The remainder of the funds will be used to plant additional trees in various neighborhood parks throughout the City. Today's request from the NAC is for \$5,000 toward these goals.

In response to a question from Commissioner Miraldi, Mr. Conner stated that the cost of a tree depends on its size. Labor is also factored into planting cost. For one gallon trees, the cost is approximately \$3 to \$4 per tree.

Vice Chair Cromarty stated that over the past couple years, the NAC has chosen parks to provide funding for improvements. He is concerned that they just gave out \$5,000 and are being asked for an additional \$5,000. The concern arises over what other items may require funding for the rest of the fiscal year. Mr. Yaron stated that in terms of expenditures made during this fiscal year, which began July 1st, of the \$30,000 budget approved by Council, approximately \$12,900 has been utilized. With the two requests for funding this evening, they would be left with approximately \$7,000 available to work with through the end of June, which has historically been sufficient. An inventory of the planted trees and locations will be provided in the coming months, with assurance that they are planted in neighborhood-sized parks, which would fall in line with the purpose, powers and duties of the Commission.

Vice Chair Cromarty asked where the trees will be planted along Scottsdale Road and Indian School, noting that in the past, some shop owners have chopped trees down. Mr. Conner clarified that 100 trees are being funded by the Urban Offset Group out of North Carolina at a cost of \$125 per tree. A very heavy storm wiped out a number of trees along Scottsdale road in 2014. They have a good idea of where to place the new trees, based on experience in planting along Scottsdale Road in the past. The ultimate goal is to reestablish the streetscape.

In response to a question from Commissioner James, Mr. Conner stated that the intent for the trees given away at the Mayor's breakfast is that the people would take the trees home and plant them. Instructions will be provided via URL link.

In response to a question from Commissioner Nash, Mr. Conner confirmed that funding for the planting on Scottsdale Road and Indian School is coming from a different source. There is a process for maintenance that is required in order to receive full funding from Urban Offsets.

COMMISSIONER NASH MOVED TO APPROVE \$5,000 FUNDING FOR TREE PLANTING TO CELEBRATE EARTH DAY AND ARBOR DAY. COMMISSIONER MIRALDI SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 6-0 WITH VICE CHAIR CROMARTY, COMMISSIONERS FABIANO, JAMES, NASH, MIRALDI AND WILLS VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

COMMISSIONER FABIANO MOVED TO SEND A STATEMENT OF SUPPORT TO CITY COUNCIL FOR SCOTTSDALE'S EARTH DAY 2020. COMMISSIONER NASH SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 6-0 WITH VICE CHAIR

CROMARTY, COMMISSIONERS FABIANO, JAMES, NASH, MIRALDI AND WILLS VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

7. 4-TA-2019: Freeway, Permanent & Temporary Signs Text Amendment

Andrew Chi, Planner, stated that in May of 2017, City Council passed Ordinance 4300, which updated the temporary sign regulations of the sign ordinance in response to a Supreme Court decision in 2015. The Supreme Court found that cities and towns across the country cannot regulate signs based on the content of the sign. Regulations of signs need to be done by time, manner and place, such as zoning, location, size and illumination. In July, 2017, City Council passed a code change to update the permanent sign regulations. The changes reduced the 70 page document to a more user-friendly ordinance and removed provisions that regulated signs based on content. It has been two years since the last code update. Over this time, there has been an increase in planned developments along 101 Freeway between Scottsdale Road and Pima.

The City has been asked by the business community (specifically Nationwide, which currently has a building under construction on the north side of 101 and Hayden) to update the sign ordinance to allow what are now called freeway signs. The current ordinance allows freestanding tower signs to a maximum height of 25 feet and 120 square feet in size. This ordinance was written when Scottsdale had no freeways. The ordinance has never addressed larger developments along the freeway. The proposal is to initiate a text amendment to the zoning ordinance to amend and update the building, freestanding and temporary sign regulations to address freeway signage for developments along the 101 freeway. The role NAC today is to provide information, discussion and feedback to be used to draft an ordinance. The process is currently in the midst of a public comment period. There will be two open houses in February.

Goals include:

- Continue to establish a contemporary and user-friendly sign code
- Introduce taller, larger signs, but not go overboard mimicking other municipalities in the Valley
- Complete minor modifications to other parts of the sign code to address formatting errors.

The proposal includes the introduction of three new sign types: Freeway pylon sign, freeway gateway sign and freeway building sign. A development must adhere to a number of qualifications in order to request these types of freeway signs. The development must form a community sign district and develop a comprehensive sign program. Development Review Board Review, consideration and approval is required, including public hearings. The only zoning districts that would be allowed freeway zone signs would be the Planned Regional Center Zoning District and the Planned Commerce Park Zoning Districts. All must be greater than 25 acres. Only when the freeway is at or above grade may freeway zone signs be utilized. The portions along 101 that are below grade are prohibited from using these sign types. They will only be allowed within a 600 foot buffer from the Loop 101 right of way. Other community design districts, such as Scottsdale

Fashion Square or Silverstone would not be allowed to use freeway zone signs. The areas of Scottsdale affected by the text amendment are of very limited scope. Conceptual examples of sign types were reviewed.

Pylon signs are typically tall signs on columns with architectural integration to the development. They incorporate design features, natural materials, high-end quality and are from 50 to 60 feet high. The code update will require that the height will be measured from the travel lane of the freeway, not from the adjacent grade, 35 to 45 feet from the freeway travel lane. The idea is that as the freeway rises and falls, the heights of the signs are consistent. The proposed square footage is 600 square feet per side, accommodating approximately six tenant names.

Freeway pylon signs can only be placed within 100 feet of the freeway right-of-way. The proposal is to require a 200-foot setback from any scenic corridor or scenic corridor roadway. Freeway pylon signs must also be set back 150 feet from public streets. The separation requirement between other freeway pylon signs is 500 feet. There will be a limit of one sign for every 500 feet of lot width, maximum of two signs per lot. In response to the potential for developers to propose subpar designs, very stringent guidelines will be written into the proposed text amendment. This will ensure that submissions to the Design Review Board will be of high quality.

A freeway gateway sign is shorter than a freeway pylon sign at approximately 20 to 25 feet tall. The purpose is to be located at entrances into a development from the frontage road. They will not be allowed on arterial streets. The size will be 300 square feet per side and would also include up to six tenant names, architecturally integrated with the development, of a high quality and design, only to be allowed within 200 feet of the Loop 101 right-of-way, must be set back from a scenic corridor by 200 feet. It must be separated from another freeway gateway sign by 150 feet. They must also be 500 feet away from a freeway pylon sign.

Freeway building signs are mounted on the tops of buildings to be seen from the freeway. In response to a question from Commissioner James regarding the Silicon Valley Bank sign, Mr. Chi stated that existing regulations currently allow the sign to be on the façade of the building, but cannot project above the roofline. The ordinance defines the roofline as the top of the building parapet. Signs are prohibited to be installed on any rooftop mechanical screening.

In response to a question from Commissioner Nash regarding the signs located on Raintree and the 101, Mr. Chi stated that the existing signs are legal, having been constructed before the code was amended in 2017. At that time, signs were allowed to be at the top of the third story and there was no 36-foot limit. These signs are essentially grandfathered in. Commissioner Nash inquired as to whether they would be permitted to modify the sign in the event of a tenant change. Mr. Chi said they could make changes if they have an approved sign program in place.

Mr. Chi stated that the size limitation for freeway building signs is one square foot for each linear foot of building front, not to exceed 300 square feet. If the building is facing within 600 feet of a residential zoning district, the signs will be limited from the top of the building to be placed at 24 feet.

Depending on comments received, there may be other minor modifications to the Sign Code, which may or may not be related to freeway development. These include minor spelling and formatting errors. In addition, there is a loophole which allows a care home, for example, to propose a large sign, because the ordinance limitation is not clearly stated. The business owner may currently cite the provision, which currently allows up to 60 square feet of sign space, as justification to place a 40-foot sign on the frontage of a residential home serving as an adult care facility.

Commissioner Wills asked whether such signs are allowed for short-term rentals. Mr. Chi stated that because they are an individual dwelling, the Sign Code contains a provision allowing for a 1 square-foot sign.

Mr. Chi identified another provision of the code not addressed in 2017, in that there is no provision in the Sign Code currently, which limits the size of a monument sign in the Service Residential (SR) Zoning District. These are one-story businesses designed to look like homes along Thomas and Camelback. These uses are allowed up to 18 square feet of sign total. The intent is to bring back a provision once included in the sign code, which states that monument signs for SR would be limited to 12 square feet.

Another possible modification defines the two permanent window sign types including a window sign illuminated with a logo as well as an open for business sign (hours of operation signage). Many business also propose suspended canopy signs. The current code requires such signs to include a metal backer panel to hide support beams. The intent is to remove that requirement and allow support beams and tubes to support the sign, as long as the design is good. Post and panel signs are those for lease, rent, coming soon and new development. They are constructed with paneling and two posts. The old sign could use to allow signs up to ten feet. This was eventually reduced to five feet and after two years of practice was determined to be unfeasible. The proposed revisions may include a revised height allowance for these temporary signs based on street classification.

Commissioner James stated that the document suggests that the freeway sign provisions only apply to the area of 101 between Scottsdale and Hayden and inquired as to the reason for the limitation. Mr. Chi said that because the signs are so tall and large, they did not want to open the entire stretch of the freeway to allow the signs. This would raise concerns in terms of proliferation. Commissioner James said that such signs already exist on the 101 near the Salt River area. It was noted that these signs are located on Reservation land. Mr. Chi added that the identified area was chosen because there are two mixed used zoning districts proposed and/or allowed in the stretch of the 101. No digital signs are proposed.

Commissioner James asked about public comments. Mr. Chi stated that feedback is currently being collected from the NAC. The public comment period will included upcoming open houses. The ordinance will be written at the end of the comment period.

Commissioner Nash inquired as to limitations on illumination of the signs. Mr. Chi said the type of illuminations include individual pan channel letters, which are lit from the front via LED. These are allowed. The preferred type is pan channel halo

illumination, where the letters at night only glow from the sides and back. A third type uses an aluminum panel and translucent vinyl. These three sign types are present currently throughout Scottsdale, except in the ESL area.

Vice Chair Cromarty discussed the lengthy and difficult process of Scottsdale first establishing its sign ordinance. At the time, the goal was to eliminate billboards and visual clutter. The heights of some of the proposed height structures harken back to the size of billboards and their visual impacts. He offered a word of caution, having recognized resistance to similar proposals during Downtown planning, southern Scottsdale planning and the General Plan updates. Vice Chair Cromarty made some suggestions to increase the effectiveness of the presentation.

In response to a question from Commissioner Nash, Mr. Chi noted that billboards are outside signs, which advertise something not even on site. All the signs in these portions of the Ordinance are on-site signs only, which may include the building name and/or tenants' names.

8. 2019/20 Spirit of Scottsdale Awards Program Status Update

Taylor Reynolds, Project Coordination Liaison, provided a brief overview of the program for Commissioner Wills. In November, Commissioner members discussed extending the nomination period, as a result of few submissions. The Commission also directed staff to conduct additional outreach. Postcards are created and distributed and the Citizen Services Department conducted outreach. Ten nominations were received in January. In response to a question from Commissioner James, Mr. Taylor stated that there have been 23 unique nominations received. The nomination period will continue through February. Nomination results will be presented to the Commission in March.

9. Staff Updates

Mr. Yaron stated that the new city gateway entry markers are in the works. The City is working with Scottsdale Public Art to update and provide a contemporary look to the markers. Five artists' designs are being considered. The new markers will reflect Scottsdale's unique character. The designs are on display through January at Scottsdale libraries.

Parada del Sol is coming up on February 8th and Commissioners are invited to participate.

The Census point in time account will take place on January 28th, 2020. This is an annual homeless street and shelter count to determine the number of people experiencing homelessness in Maricopa County.

The next NAC meeting will be Wednesday, February 26th.

Mr. Yaron welcome Commissioner Wills.

Vice Chair Cromarty recognized Commissioners Miraldi and Fabiano for their service.

10. Adjournment

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved by Commissioner Miraldi and seconded by Commissioner Nash, the meeting adjourned at 7:03 p.m.

AYES: Vice-Chair Cromarty, Commissioners Fabiano, James, Nash, Miraldi, and Wills

NAYS: None

eScribers, LLC