Call to Order/Roll Call

The meeting of the Neighborhood Advisory Commission was called to order at 5:00 p.m. A formal roll call was conducted, confirming members present as stated above.

Public Comment

There were no members of the public who wished to speak.
1. **Approve Draft Summary Meeting Minutes November 28, 2018**

   COMMISSIONER MELI MOVED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE NOVEMBER 28, 2018 MEETING AS PRESENTED. VICE CHAIR MIRALDI SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 6-0 WITH CHAIR FABIANO, VICE CHAIR MIRALDI, COMMISSIONERS CROMARTY, JAMES, MELI AND PUTMAN VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

2. **Draft Food Truck Ordinance**

   This item was tabled.

3. **Scottsdale Neighborhood Trolley Program Overview**

   Paul Basha, Transportation Director listed the three bus service providers in Scottsdale:
   - City of Scottsdale trollies
   - Bus routes operated by Phoenix (primarily east/west routes)
   - Valley Metro (north/south routes)

   Previous Trolley Routes included:
   - Neighborhood
   - Miller
   - Camelback
   - Downtown

   In terms of ridership changes from 2014 to 2017, the Downtown Trolley increased by 45 percent. Miller Road decreased by 20 percent and Neighborhood Trolley decreased by 35 percent. Camelback was only in operation for two years.

   Commissioner Putman asked how ridership is measured, if the ridership is a free service. Mr. Basha stated that the drivers count the number orders who board. Buses have automatic counting devices which the City is slowly implementing on the trolleys.

   Commissioner Meli asked about the increase in ridership and for details of the light rail route. Mr. Basha said the route begins in North Central Phoenix on 19th Avenue. Most ridership is in Downtown Phoenix and also between the ASU Tempe Campus and Downtown Phoenix Campus. Commissioner Meli asked whether light rail would satisfy transportation needs in Scottsdale. Mr. Basha provided his personal opinion, different than the City's position. Light rail would be an absolute benefit to Scottsdale, if it were a logically defined route, which would serve Old Town. In terms of the increased ridership, this is attributed to excellent service, a clean, comfortable, efficient and easy to use route.

   Overall, bus route ridership has decreased 13 percent overall in all of Metropolitan Phoenix, typical of the statistic throughout the country. Over four years, there was
an increase in ridership of 4 percent for all Scottsdale buses and trolleys. Some east/west buses also have service in Phoenix. The same bus routes in Phoenix had a 21 percent increase. Three bus routes serving Tempe saw an increase of 12 percent. The statistics were the dominant reason for the change in routes, especially on Miller and Neighborhood Trolley, juxtaposed with the large increase in the Downtown Trolley.

Commissioner Meli asked about the correlation between the development of high density apartment housing geographically with the Downtown increase and subsequent decrease with the Miller and Neighborhood routes. Mr. Basha stated that the Downtown route is a simple circular tourist route, used predominantly by local and out of town tourists. It generally does not take Downtown residents to locations they would be seeking, but rather serves hotels, restaurants and shops.

In investigating the trolley routes in Scottsdale, several discoveries were made:

- The trolley only serves Scottsdale south of McDonald
- There were several redundancies, where two different trolley routes were on the same street segment
- The Neighborhood Trolley had several turns, which makes the travel time and route long, discouraging travel
- The frequency of all four routes were different

In reviewing average costs per ride, the average cost for bus service in Phoenix/Valley Metro was $8.50. Trolley costs are less than half of the bus service, which is particularly significant, as the service is free. While bus services has a charge to the rider of $2, the trolleys, which are free to passengers, has a lower cost per ride. Scottsdale owns the trolleys, purchased through federal grants at no cost to Scottsdale residents. The City of Phoenix and Valley Metro charge Scottsdale for having their buses in Scottsdale. Another reason for the low per ride cost of the trolleys is efficiency. Routes have been modified. The Priest Route was eliminated. The Shea and Hayden routes were shortened. The Camelback route was essentially eliminated and another trolley was used to travel on Camelback. The Shea express route starts in Fountain Hills, comes into Scottsdale and continues on the 202 into Downtown Phoenix. It runs twice in the morning and twice in the evening. The Transportation Commission suggested eliminating the route, due to its high expense. However, a fairly large number of Scottsdale residents use the Shea Express bus to get to work in Downtown Phoenix. These residents appeared at the Transportation Commission and Valley Metro public hearings and pleaded that the service be continued. It was agreed with Valley Metro that the service continue for one more year while investigating cost-effective services. The initial intent is to eliminate the Fountain Hills portion, which is exorbitantly expensive.

In response to a question from Commissioner Putman, Mr. Basha stated that the Priest route started just east of SkySong and McDowell Road and continued west on McDowell to 64th Street (Galvan Parkway/Priest Drive). It served Desert Botanical Gardens and Phoenix Zoo as well as the Priest Washington Light Rail Station, south through Tempe and Chandler. Ridership was low from the onset and continued to decline. One of the challenges with ridership is the difficulty in
publicizing and informing the public of existing bus routes. Commissioner Meli inquired as to whether the purposefulness of the transportation opportunities is not being communicated. Mr. Basha said tourism is vital to Scottsdale and as such, the Downtown Trolley is vital to tourism. Some comments from tourists are that they love the charm of the trolleys, even though they do not ride them.

Commissioner Meli asked whether the bus and trolleys provide additional transportation for large events such as Barrett-Jackson and TPC. Mr. Basha said the City no longer provides trolley service to these events; it is provided by the private sector.

Chair Fabiano asked if there is an increase in travel usage during tourist season or whether it is higher in summer when people do not care to walk. Mr. Basha said ridership increases during the tourist and winter visitor season. He noted that Scottsdale has part-time residents from September through April or May and it is important to serve these members of the community well.

Commissioner Meli inquired as to whether the City is matching the needs of its residents and visitors to the service provided with these transportation modes. Mr. Basha said they are getting closer, especially with the route modifications implemented in October. Commissioner Meli stressed the need to positively incentivize the public transportation options. Mr. Basha noted that frequency relates directly to increasing uses. The fact that all three of the trolley routes other than Old Town have 20 minute frequencies is a help. Travel time is an issue. The closer that travel time can get to car travel time, the more likely people are to ride. They would like to introduce a limited stop service on Scottsdale Road to connect Fashion Square to the Scottsdale Thunderbird Park and Ride Lot, with the intent to have only these two stops. Upon presentation of the idea to the Tourism Development Commission, the first thing they suggested was adding a third stop, which defeats the short travel time with limited stops. The Department would like to implement the service in the next two to three years and it is included in the Transportation Master Plan. Traffic signals could be coordinated to make the route even faster than car travel times.

Commissioner Putman asked whether this talk of an express route to Downtown from Old Town or southern Scottsdale, noting that it costs more to ride light rail downtown than it does for most employees that work Downtown to park. Mr. Basha noted that some employees provide free bus passes to their employees.

Mr. Basha reviewed the routes:

**Old Town Trolley:** Similar to the previous Downtown Trolley route with a few differences. It no longer crosses the Marshall Way Bridge or the Arizona Canal. It uses Soleri Way to get to Goldwater Boulevard and travel south. There has been a decrease in travel by not being on the bridge, as it no longer serves the businesses and restaurants close to the bridge. Some turns have been eliminated. It is best that trolleys not use major streets, so it was taken off of Drinkwater Boulevard. There are segments on Scottsdale Road and Goldwater Boulevard. The Museum of the West must be served, as it is one of the most popular destinations of people using the trolley. In response to a question from
Commissioner Putman regarding connecting routes, Mr. Basha confirmed that the Camelback Road Trolley connects. Scottsdale Road (Route 72) has a connection. The 68th and Camelback Route also is on Goldwater Boulevard.

68th Street and Camelback: Close to the Old Neighborhood Trolley Route, but more dispersed. It connects to Miller/Hayden Route.

Blue Mustang Route: Entirely new along Via Linda. It primarily serves Scottsdale Ranch Park and Via Linda Senior Center before crossing Shea Boulevard and shopping center. Ridership is good between Mustang Library Transit Center and the Via Linda Senior Center.

In response to question from Commissioner Meli, Mr. Geist said that the trolley does not interface with the light rail to the south. There are two connections from Scottsdale to light rail, including Scottsdale Road Bus Route 72, which goes to a light rail station and the Hayden Bus Road 81, which connects to the McClintock Light Rail Station. The trolley system does connect to the Tempe Orbit system.

Commissioner James commented that navigating the Massachusetts Transit Authority MTA is not complicated and easy to use. Scottsdale’s system is complicated and difficult to understand. Mr. Basha agreed that it is difficult to know how to traverse the metropolitan area by transit. Commissioner Cromarty asked what is being done in regards to the future. The current reports all address current thinking, but not the future. The Downtown plan indicates much more development in that area. McDowell Road is being built out. There is also future development planned for the Airpark. He asked how the trolleys will become more of a transportation factor in the future.

Mr. Basha agreed that the modifications made in October will essentially serve conditions for 2019. Sooner or later there will be a need for a substantial increase in transportation options; incremental improvements are inadequate. It is important to be forward-thinking and patient. They would like to extend the Mustang Transit Route and increase the frequency to 10 to 15 minutes. The Scottsdale Road limited bus service would be very helpful as well.

Miller Hayden Route: The Miller Route serves McCormick Ranch, connects to the Mustang Trolley Route, the Shea Phoenix Route and also the Hayden Valley Metro Route. The largest proponents of the change are those who use either the Granite Reef Senior Center or the Via Linda Senior Center, as they can now use the Trolley to connect the two. A transfer is required at Mustang Library.

In terms of frequency and duration of each of the routes and their service areas, Miller Hayden serves four schools, a library and a number of parks. It has 20 minute frequency most of the day, and serves two of the three hospitals. The 68th and Camelback route serves middle schools as well as Scottsdale Community College, Granite Reef Senior Center, Paiute Neighborhood Center on Osborn between 64th and 68th Street, Vista Del Camino, several parks and the Tempe Orbit system. The route connects to Fashion Square. The Mustang Route has 20 minute frequency, long hours of service and connects several meaningful locations, including retail facilities.
Chair Fabiano noted that the Commission was asked for ideas on how to publicize the Trolley success and increase ridership. She asked how the Trolleys are currently being publicized. Mr. Basha stated that the memo includes the various methods, which they would like to expand. They are included on the Scottsdale website, however to find them, a keyword search is needed.

Commissioner Meli commented that from a business perspective one of the most strategically important routes is Old Town, as it allows personnel to advise patrons of restaurants and other businesses. This would be a great starting point for explaining the way the system works.

Commissioner Putman stated that Tempe holds citywide bike, walk and bus days to promote utilization of public transportation. Scottsdale could hold trolley events, such as bar crawl approaches that features restaurants or other businesses. Commissioner Meli agreed, noting the synergy of having the businesses promote the service. Mr. Basha concurred, suggesting a restaurant promotion offering a free dessert or appetizer for those who show proof of having ridden the trolley to reach the business. Commissioner Meli said the restaurant/bar would benefit from helping customers to use a safe, cost-effective mode of transportation. Chair Fabiano said there is currently an Old Town scavenger hunt available on Groupon and suggested the possibility of having to ride the trolley as a requirement of participating in the scavenger hunt.

Discussion ensued regarding the assumption that the Trolley is just for tourists. Perhaps the approach should be to promote it as a free transportation. Commissioner Meli suggested the possibility of creating a Spirit Award category (i.e. the Synergy award) for businesses or residents who promote utilization of the City’s services. Commissioner Cromarty stated that when working with businesses, it is important to be able to address the business owners in a collective fashion to lay out potential plans. The more education and engagement the better.

Commissioner James noted that the document provided includes a list of places served by the routes. He would like to see a sign at each of the locations that provides instruction on how to use the trolley to reach the destination. Commissioner Cromarty said that street furniture could be wrapped with the information. Currently, on the connection from 42nd Street to Grand Central, the City of Scottsdale has purchased the space for tourism advertising.

Commissioner Cromarty asked when the Transportation Master Plan is due for renewal. Mr. Basha said there is not a schedule for renewal. It was adopted in 2016 and the Department will be suggesting some fairly minor street-only modifications in the spring. A complete overhaul is likely five years away. The initial Transportation Master Plan was prepared by the Transportation Department and had no mention of light rail. The Transportation Commission demanded it be included and as such, three different routes were investigated for potential service in 2035. When it came before City Council, the business community publicly and privately told City Council that they did not want this “crime delivery system” and “those people” in Scottsdale near their businesses. City Council then ceased all conversation about light rail from the Master Plan. They inserted a phrase, “Explore all future transportation modes, except for light rail and modern streetcar.”

Mr. Yaron presented the annual report and invited comments, changes or approval.

COMMISSIONER JAMES MOVED TO APPROVE THE NEIGHBORHOOD ADVISORY COMMISSION 2018 ANNUAL REPORT AS PRESENTED. COMMISSIONER CROMARTY SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 6-0 WITH CHAIR FABIANO, VICE CHAIR MIRALDI, COMMISSIONERS CROMARTY, JAMES, MELI AND PUTMAN VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

5. Neighborhood Advisory Commission 2018 Annual Bylaw Review

Mr. Yaron stated that the Bylaws were last reviewed in 2016 and it is recommended that they be reviewed on an annual basis. He requested review and discussion to reaffirm or amend the bylaws.

COMMISSIONER MELI MOVED TO APPROVE THE NEIGHBORHOOD ADVISORY COMMISSION BYLAWS PRESENTED. VICE CHAIR MIRALDI SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 6-0 WITH CHAIR FABIANO, VICE CHAIR MIRALDI, COMMISSIONERS CROMARTY, JAMES, MELI AND PUTMAN VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

6. 2019 ELECTION OF OFFICERS

Mr. Yaron invited nominations for officers.

COMMISSIONER MELI MOVED TO NOMINATE JENNIFER FABIANO AS CHAIR. COMMISSIONER JAMES SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 6-0 WITH CHAIR FABIANO, VICE CHAIR MIRALDI, COMMISSIONERS CROMARTY, JAMES, MELI AND PUTMAN VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

COMMISSIONER JAMES MOVED TO NOMINATE CAROL MIRALDI AS VICE CHAIR. COMMISSIONER MELI SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 6-0 WITH CHAIR FABIANO, VICE CHAIR MIRALDI, COMMISSIONERS CROMARTY, JAMES, MELI AND PUTMAN VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

7. STAFF UPDATES

Mr. Yaron welcomed new Commissioner Cromarty.

He addressed correspondence received and responded to from a citizen and addressed the process for responding to such correspondence.
Staff will be presenting an overview of recent NAC work items to City Council on February 5th, 2019. The framework will highlight similar items contained in the annual report.

Future opportunities pending the City Council annual budget cycle is that working in conjunction with the NAC, staff will make a budget request to increase the Neighborhood Enhancement Grant fund with an additional $50,000 in order to be able to respond to citizen funding requests for small projects. Currently the maximum amount of funding is $30,000. If City Council approves the additional funding, the NAC will need to amend its Neighborhood Enhancement Grant Fund criteria to accommodate City Council and City Manager approved requests for funding.

In regards to the community awareness of short-term and vacation rentals, a message was delivered in Scottsdale’s update to thousands of residents (via utility bill and e-subscription services) mentioning the NAC’s initiative regarding short-term vacation rentals. A preliminary website has been developed.

NAC member packets include information Neighborhood College, short term rentals and HOAs.

The Office of Citizen Service will have a class on February 4th from 1:00 to 3:00 at the Mustang Library regarding short-term rentals and HOAs. The Neighborhood College Program provides residents, neighborhood groups and HOAs with information, resources and tools needed to be effective leaders.

Scottsdale City Government 101 Spring 2019 is recruiting for enrollment. Community leaders, prospective City Council Members, Board or Commission members and volunteers are invited to participated. The series of classes summarizes overall Scottsdale City government and how it works. The next NAC meeting is Wednesday, February 27th, 2019.

Discussion ensued regarding the Saturday meeting being coordinated by the City Manager’s Office regarding how to make boards and commissions more effective in terms of City Council’s work.

Mr. Yaron stated the NAC’s meetings will take place on a regular basis on the fourth Wednesday of the month.

8. ADJOURNMENT

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved by Commissioner Meli and seconded by Vice Chair Miraldi, the meeting adjourned at 6:54 p.m.

AYES: Chair Fabiano, Vice Chair Miraldi, Commissioners Cromarty, James, Nash, Putman
NAYS: None

eScribers, LLC