

## SCOTTSDALE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

# COMMUNITY DESIGN STUDIO 7506 E. INDIAN SCHOOL ROAD SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA Thursday, August 3, 2023

## **\*SUMMARIZED MEETING MINUTES \***

## PRESENT:

Linda Davis, Chair Peter Hosmer, Vice Chair Courtney Lage, Commissioner Jay Panzer, Commissioner Brin Sherrin, Commissioner Rose Smith, Commissioner

## **ABSENT:**

Ben Brosseau, Commissioner

#### STAFF:

Adam Yaron Jesús Murillo Ben Moriarity Jason McWilliams Joe Padilla

# **CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Davis called the meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission to order at 6:00 PM.

# **ROLL CALL**

A formal roll call was conducted confirming members present as stated above.

# **PUBLIC COMMENT**

HPC received zero (0) request to speak cards for non-agendized items:

<sup>\*</sup> Note: These are summary action minutes only. A complete copy of the meeting audio is available on the Historic Preservation Commission website at:

# **ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT**

- 1. Identify supplemental information, if any, related to the August 3, 2023, Historic Preservation Commission agenda items, and other correspondence.
  - ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT PROVIDED BY ADAM YARON:
  - MR. YARON WELCOMED COMMISSIONER PANZER TO HIS FIRST HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING.
  - INFORMED THE COMMISSION ABOUT THE POSSIBLE SEPTEMBER MEETING AND THE DECEMBER MEETING CORRECTION TO DECEMBER 7, 2023.

## **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES**

- 2. <u>Approval of the June 1, 2023, Historic Preservation Commission Retreat Agenda Meeting Minutes.</u>
  - VICE CHAIR HOSMER MOVED TO APPROVE THE JUNE 1, 2023, HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION RETREAT MEETING MINUTES, 2ND BY CHAIR DAVIS.
  - MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY IN FAVOR BY CHAIR DAVIS, VICE CHAIR HOSMER, COMMISSIONER SHERRIN, COMMISSIONER SMITH, AND COMMISSIONER LAGE WITH AN AYE VOTE OF FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0). COMMISSIONER PANZER ABSTAINED.
- 3. Approval of the June 1, 2023, Historic Preservation Commission Regular Agenda Meeting Minutes.
  - VICE CHAIR HOSMER MOVED TO APPROVE THE JUNE 1, 2023, HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING MINUTES, 2ND BY CHAIR DAVIS.
  - MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY IN FAVOR BY CHAIR DAVIS, VICE <u>CHAIR HOSMER, COMMISSIONER SHERRIN, COMMISSIONER</u>

     SMITH, AND COMMISSIONER LAGE WITH AN AYE VOTE OF FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0). COMMISSIONER PANZER ABSTAINED.

## **CONSENT AGENDA ITEM**

- 4. Scottsdale City Hall Historic Preservation (21-HP-2023)
  Request approval of the Historic Preservation Plan and Design Guidelines
  for Scottsdale City Hall, located at 3939 North Drinkwater Boulevard, with
  Downtown Civic Center, Type 2, Planned Block Development, Downtown
  Overlay, Historic Property district (D/DCC-2 PBD DO HP) zoning.
  - VICE CHAIR HOSMER MOVED TO APPROVE THE PRESERVATION PLAN AND DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR SCOTTSDALE CITY HALL, 2ND BY COMMISSIONER SMITH.
  - MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY IN FAVOR BY CHAIR DAVIS, VICE CHAIR HOSMER, COMMISSIONER SHERRIN, COMMISSIONER SMITH, COMMISSIONER PANZER AND COMMISSIONER LAGE WITH AN AYE VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0).

<sup>\*</sup> Note: These are summary action minutes only. A complete copy of the meeting audio is available on the Historic Preservation Commission website at:

# **REGULAR AGENDA ITEM**

- 5. Jacks Solar (39-HP-2023)
  - Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install solar photo-voltaic panels on the roof of an existing home located within the Village Grove 1-6 Historic District with Single Family Historic Property (R1-7 HP) zoning.
  - BEN MORIARITY PRESENTED IN FRONT OF THE COMMISSION, ON BEHALF OF STAFF, REGARDING THE LOCATION OF THE SOLAR PANELS, VILLAGE GROVE 1-6 GUIDELINES, SOLAR GUIDELINES, AND STAFF RECOMMENDATION.
  - THE APPLICANT PRESENTED, INFORMING THE COMMISSION OF THE PROPERTY, IDEAL PLACEMENT FOR SOLAR, AND COST TO BUILD ADDITIONAL STRUCTURE.
  - HPC PROVIDED COMMENT REGARDING THE ADDITIONAL INFORMATION PROVIDED BY THE APPLICANT AND THE REPORT STIPULATIONS TO PLACE THE SOLAR ON THE EAST AND WEST SLOPES OF THE ROOF,
  - VICE CHAIR HOSMER MOTIONED TO APPROVE CASE 39-HP-2023
    AS STIPULATED, 2ND BY COMMISSIONER LAGE.
  - MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY IN FAVOR BY CHAIR DAVIS, VICE CHAIR HOSMER, COMMISSIONER SHERRIN, COMMISSIONER SMITH, COMMISSIONER PANZER AND COMMISSIONER LAGE WITH AN AYE VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0).

#### REGULAR AGENDA ITEM

- 6. McCormick-Stillman Railroad Park "Bunkhouse"
  Staff will be providing the Commission with a Historic Significance
  Assessment Report from Logan Simpson Design to document McCormickStillman Railroad Park Bunkhouse use and significance over time. This item
  was requested by the Commission at their June 1, 2023, Retreat.
  - HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICER JESUS MURILLO GAVE A
     PRESENTATION CONCLUDING THAT THE "BUNKHOUSE"
     DOES NOT MEET THE CRITERIA ESTABLISHED BY THE CITY
     OF SCOTTSDALE'S CODE OF ORDINANCES ARTICLE VI
     SECTION 6.113.A.5 FOR LISTING AS A HISTORIC RESOURCE
     OR A HISTORIC LANDMARK IN THE CITY REGISTRY AS PER
     THE HISTORICAL SIGNIFICANCE REPORT BY PREPARED BY
     LOGAN SIMPSON DESIGN.
  - PUBLIC COMMENT BY ROSS SMITH REQUESTING THAT THE "BUNKHOUSE" BE RESTORED AND PRESERVED.
  - HPC PROVIDED COMMENT REGARDING:
    - THE SIGNIFICANCE OF THE BUNKHOUSE,
    - REQUESTING FROM STAFF HOW THE BUNKHOUSE MAY HAVE BEEN USED, AND
    - REQUESTING THAT STAFF CONFIRM NO FUNDING

<sup>\*</sup> Note: These are summary action minutes only. A complete copy of the meeting audio is available on the Historic Preservation Commission website at:

#### Page 4 of 4

# HAS BEEN COLLECTED TO PRESERVE THE BUILDING. **FUNDING RECEIVED.**

- **NICK MOLINARI. PARKS AND RECREATION DIRECTOR** SHARED THE TESTIMONY OF THE STILLMAN FAMILY THAT THE "BUNKHOUSE" WAS USED FOR VARIOUS USES INCLUDING STORAGE, BUT NEVER AS A BUNKHOUSE. MR. MOLINARI CONFIRMED NO FUNDING HAS EVER BEEN COLLECTED TO PRESERVE THE "BUNKHOUSE" BY THE CITY.
- MR. SOUTHARD, LOGAN SIMPSON DESIGN, EXPLAINED THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN AN HISTORIC AMERICAN BUILDING SURVEY AND THE HISTORICAL SIGNIFICANCE REPORT PROVIDED.
- 7. HP Outreach Update

Staff will be providing the Commission with a presentation on current efforts involving outreach and solicitation to potentially eligible properties with possible Historic Significance. This item was moved from the agenda of the June 1, 2023, Retreat.

- HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICER JESUS MURILLO INFORMED THE COMMISSION OF OUTREACH EFFORTS FOR PROPERTIES WITH POTENTIAL HISTORIC SIGNIFICANCE, CONTINUED OUTREACH TO THE VILLA MONTEREY HOAS AND WORKING WITH THE CITY'S COMMUNICATIONS AND PUBLIC AFFAIRS DEPARTMENT TO PRODUCE SHORT VIDEOS OF HISTORIC DISTRICT AND SITES.
- 8. Identification of Future Agenda Items

The Historic Preservation Commission may suggest items they wish to be placed on a future agenda. Per Arizona State law, the Commission shall not discuss, deliberate, or take action on any item suggested as a future agenda item, unless the specific item is properly noticed for Commission discussion and action.

- ADAM YARON INFORMED THE COMMISSION OF POSSIBLE **FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**
- VICE CHAIR HOSMER REQUESTING THE CITY PROACTIVELY **DOCUMENT AREAS OF "OLD TOWN" HISTORY AS A FUTURE** AGENDA ITEM.

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

With no further business to discuss, the regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission adjourned at 6:58 PM.