



**APPROVED 05/18/2022**

**\*SUMMARIZED MEETING MINUTES\***

City of Scottsdale

Scottsdale Environmental Advisory Commission

**Regular Meeting**

5:30 p.m. Wednesday, April 20, 2022

**ONE CIVIC CENTER, Community Development Conference Rooms  
7447 E. Indian School Road, Scottsdale, 85251**

**Call to Order: 5:31 p.m.**

**PRESENT:** Chair Natalie Chrisman Lazarr, Vice Chair Anthony Coletta; Commission Members: Tammy Bosse, Ute Brady, Walter Cuculic (was physically absent from approximately 6:30 to 6:45 p.m.), Ryan Johnson, Andrew Scheck

**ABSENT:** None

**STAFF PRESENT:** Tim Conner, Manager, Anthony Floyd and Sam Brown - the Office of Environmental Initiatives; Brandon McMahon, IT/Video Support; Erin Perreault, Acting Planning, Economic Development & Tourism Executive Director; Cindi Eberhardt, Acting Planning & Dev. Area Director; Lisa McNeilly, Sustainability Director; Brent Stockwell, Assistant City Manager

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** No members of the public were present. No public comments were received.

**1. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes for March 23, 2022:**

**Commissioner Brady made a motion to approve the Summarized Meeting Minutes from March 23, 2022 with Commissioner Scheck providing a Second for the motion, which carried 7-0. Chair Natalie Chrisman Lazarr, Vice Chair Coletta and Commissioners Brady, Bosse, Cuculic and Johnson voted for APPROVAL**

- 2. Discussion and possible Commission recommendations to staff regarding the status of the Scottsdale vehicle fleet's use of alternative fuels and the physical and budgetary challenges currently posed for converting vehicles from liquid petroleum fuels to less polluting forms like compressed natural gas and electric powered.** Mel Galbraith, Fleet Maintenance Director, presented a synopsis of his department's efforts to reduce the carbon footprint of the city's motor vehicle fleet. He showed that past attempts with bio-diesel and ethanol (E85) were not successful from either an air emissions or from a cost of maintenance perspective. From an environmentally strategic standpoint, the conversion of heavy-duty vehicles (solid waste trucks, trolleys/busses) was significantly beneficial in reducing carbon dioxide emissions by 5.6 million kilograms over the last eleven

years. However, conversion to electric versions of heavy-duty trucks must be predicated on whether the electric versions of these vehicles can perform their function. Mr. Galbraith indicated that the fleet consists of eight passenger vehicles and a relatively large number of pick-up trucks so there are ongoing assessments of passenger vehicle and pick-truck conversion as these units reach their end of life. Mr. Galbraith explained that they are currently planning to replace four of the eight passenger vehicles but the life cost of an electric pick-up truck does not currently make conversion economical. At this point, a pickup truck (with the extended range of a full day's use) would be at least \$30,000 more than an equivalent gasoline model. Mr. Galbraith also pointed out that the infrastructure (i.e., high amperage charging stations) currently do not exist to support a large fleet. Commissioner Cuculic asked about the "cost of ownership" of electric vs. fuel vehicles, citing the Southwest Energy Efficiency Project (October, 2018) document previously provided to the Commission. Under this topic, Commissioner Cuculic also cited the long-term stability of electric energy prices vs. the volatility of petroleum fuel costs; asked why so many fleet vehicles were pickups instead of sedans; and whether the department considered monetizing the tax benefits of leasing electric vehicles vs. non-depreciable ownership. Mr. Galbraith indicated that many factors go into determining the cost of ownership, especially over the 10-year lifetime of ownership. In the Arizona heat, an electric vehicle will almost certainly have to have its battery replaced after eight years (2 years before end of life). The city requires pickup trucks for their functionality in carrying equipment, tools and material. Fleet analyzed lease versus ownership twice in the past for the ten-year cycle. Ownership was significantly cheaper over the lifespan. Mr. Galbraith stated that his department is actively researching the budgetary viability, environmental benefit (carbon footprint reduction) and strategic functionality of which categories of vehicles to replace first with electric units. He emphasized the benefits of prioritizing the replacement of heavy, diesel-burning solid waste trucks and buses/ trolleys first. Commissioner Bosse asked if anyone has looked at where Scottsdale stands with electric vehicle infrastructure compared to other Valley municipalities. That information was not available for the meeting but can be researched. Assistant City Manager recommended that the City Treasurer address the Commission on how environmental factors are considered when financial decisions are determined.

**No Action**

- 3. Discussion and possible Commission recommendations to staff regarding the schedule for the development of the *Scottsdale Sustainability Plan*.** Lisa McNeilly, Sustainability Director, provided an overview of the upcoming meetings with ASU for the development of the Plan: the May 05 SEAC Special Meeting, one with the Sustainability Steering Team, and several with community groups. In advance of the May 05 workshop, Ms. McNeilly will provide the Commission with a document that will assist commissioners with prioritizing their interests. The document also informs the Commission on the ICLEI (Local Governments for Sustainability) pathways.

**No Action**

- 4. Discussion and possible Commission recommendations to staff and/or City Council regarding the pilot tree inventory project launch for Earth Day & Arbor Day celebrations for greater Scottsdale:** Commissioner Brady presented the *Citizen Tree and Biodiversity Inventory* flyer and explained the process and mobile "app" links. She also reviewed the schedule of events (Mayor's Breakfast, Farmers Market, Arbor Day tree planting) and made it available for staff and commissioners to volunteer for each.

**No Action**

- 5. Discussion and possible Commission recommendations to staff on Public Outreach Strategies for sustainability topics currently under consideration by the Commission (Annual Work Plan) or matters of environmental concern submitted to the City or**

**Commission through public forums.** Chair Chrisman Lazarr opened the Annual Work Plan and proceeded down through each of the Section III. 2021 Priorities. She reached consensus on each line item, confirming or re-assigning commissioners as each volunteered.

**No Action**

**6. Staff Updates:**

- Sustainability updates – Lisa McNeilly
- General updates – Tim Conner
- Green Building timeline - Anthony Floyd

**No Action**

**7. Review of anticipated items for the May 05 (special meeting) and May 18, 2022 (regular) Commission agendas, including requests by Commission Members for items to be included on future agendas.**

**May 5, 2022 Special Meeting Agenda Items**

- General Plan 2035 overview
- ASU / Sustainability Plan workshop

**May 18, 2022 Regular Meeting Agenda Items**

- Sustainable purchasing / procurement presentation – ASU Prof. Nicole Darnall
- Energy and Green Construction Code amendment updates
- Scottsdale citizen scientist tree inventory project
- Annual Work Plan - sustainability topics and priorities

**Future Meeting Agenda Items**

**Scottsdale's drought response efforts**

**Adjournment: 7:35 p.m.**



Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation by contacting the Office of Environmental Initiatives at 480-312-7833 (if any)]. Requests should be made 24 hours in advance, or as early as possible, to allow time to arrange the accommodation. For TTY users, the Arizona Relay Service (1-800-367-8939) may contact the Office of Environmental Initiatives at 480-312-7833.