



**Approved 7/21/2021 (sb)**

**\*SUMMARIZED MEETING MINUTES\***

City of Scottsdale  
Environmental Advisory Commission  
Regular Meeting

**5:30 p.m.; Wednesday, June 16, 2021**

**Meeting Held Remotely**

Until further notice, Scottsdale Environmental Advisory Commission (**SEAC**) meetings are being held electronically. While physical facilities are not open to the public, SEAC meetings are available on Scottsdale's YouTube channel to allow the public to virtually attend and listen/view the meeting in progress.

1. Go to ScottsdaleAZ.gov, search "live stream"
2. Click on "Scottsdale YouTube Channel"
3. Scroll to "Upcoming live streams"
4. Select the applicable meeting

Call to Order **5:34 p.m.**

**PRESENT:** Chair Natalie Chrisman Lazarr, Vice Chair Anthony Coletta; Commission Members: David Abranovic (arrived 5:45 p.m.), Tammy Bosse, Walter Cuculic, Ryan Johnson, Steven Schlosser

**ABSENT:** None

**STAFF PRESENT:** Tim Conner, Manager, Anthony Floyd, and Sam Brown - the Office of Environmental Initiatives; Bronte Ibsen and Amanda Willis, IT/Video Support; Brent Stockwell, Assistant City Manager; Erin Perreault, Planning & Development Area Director; Gretchen Baumgardner, Water Policy Manager; Brian Biesemeyer, Water Resources Executive Director

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** Meeting was live streamed on Scottsdale You Tube channel to the public. There was one written public comment received from Ms. Alisa McMahon concerning agenda item #5 (attached).

**1. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes for May 19, 2021**

Commissioner Bosse made a motion to approve the Summarized Meeting Minutes from May 19, 2021; Commissioner Schlosser provided a Second for the motion, which carried 6-0, with Chair Chrisman Lazarr, Vice Chair Coletta and Commissioners Bosse, Cuculic, Johnson and Schlosser voting for APPROVAL.

- 2. Update, discussion, and possible Commission recommendations to staff on the Urban Heat Island Study:** Dr. David Hondula, Senior Sustainability Scientist at ASU's Rob and Melani Walton Sustainability Solutions Services, presented the latest update for the study on urban heat island mitigation within Scottsdale. Commissioners Cuculic and Abranovic stressed the importance of the economic impact that heat mitigation serves for tourism and business attraction. Chair Chrisman Lazarr asked when the study's data and recommendations would be posted for the public to view. Staff Liaison Conner stated that this information will be posted on the Sustainable Scottsdale web site after the City Council reviews the final draft, and ASU makes the recommended adjustments (if required). Mr. Conner provided the Commission with a conceptual schedule for bringing this project to a successful close.

**No Action Taken**

- 3. Presentation and discussion regarding regional Colorado River shortage / drought status and conservation efforts. Possible Commission recommendations to staff on the shortage messaging and communication campaign that is being developed in response to the pending shortage:** Ms. Gretchen Baumgardner, Water Resources Water Policy Manager, provided the Commission with an update on the Colorado River conditions, current conservation programs and new initiatives. She also acknowledged the need to implement a more urgent messaging and outreach campaign that re-enforces the severe drought conditions and looming water restrictions if conservation measures are not fully embraced. Mr. Brian Biesemeyer, Water Resources Executive Director, stated that Water Resources' new public information officer, Valerie Schneider, is currently putting a more robust messaging campaign together and will reach out to the Commission for feedback and support. Ms. Baumgardner discussed the significant conservation initiatives and incentives that target the greatest use of residential water - outdoor landscaping. Commissioners questioned Ms. Baumgardner on many of the technical details concerning the CAP (Lake Mead) Water Shortage Tier structure. Commissioner Schlosser asked about the concept of raising water usage rates (costs) to get the public's attention and to encourage conservation through monetary penalties. Commissioners voiced positive support for monetary incentives (rebates) that promote turf removal. Chair Chrisman Lazarr recommended that Ms. Baumgardner's Water Policy team introduce the concept of "lost water" (i.e., water usage that is not beneficially reclaimed or reused) to discussions regarding water conservation and outdoor landscaping. Unlike Scottsdale's reclaimed wastewaters, all waters used for routine landscaping purposes are "lost" for future use or aquifer recharge. Chair Chrisman Lazarr also welcomed Ms. Baumgardner back to the Commission for an update following her team's annual review of water conservation strategies, costs, and results.

**No Action Taken**

- 4. Presentation, discussion, and possible Commission recommendations to staff regarding the job description and responsibilities for a new Sustainability Program Manager.** Brent Stockwell, Assistant City Manager, presented the process by which his office developed the job description and responsibilities for a new Environmental Sustainability Program Manager position. Mr. Stockwell stated that the criteria for the qualifications and experience were derived from a wide search of comparably sized cities - regionally and nationally - with robust sustainability goals. Commissioners Cuculic and Bosse expressed their concern that the organizational level of the position might be too low to effectively influence decision makers in other departments. Mr. Stockwell stated the position's focus is high-level sustainability project management. The position will also be the leader of the Sustainable Scottsdale Steering Team, which is composed of staff from the major City departments. Commissioner Johnson recommended that the education requirement be changed to "undergraduate degree in sustainability", and that the position title drop the word "Environmental" to capture the other two tenets of sustainability - social and economic considerations. Chair Chrisman Lazarr strongly recommended that "grant writing experience" be added to the list qualifications.

**No Action Taken**

- 5. Discussion and possible Commission recommendations for the letter of support to City Council regarding the 2021 International Green Construction Code (IgCC) and the International Energy Conservation Code (IECC).** Anthony Floyd presented the draft letter to City Council recommending the adoption of the 2021 IgCC, IECC, International Plumbing Code and International Residential Code with associated amendments. He explained the various water flow rate options and standards using information supplied in public comment by Ms. Alisa McMahon (attached). Mr. Floyd recommended retaining the ASHRAE Std 189.1 flow rates for lavatory faucets and shower heads as well as a 50% IgCC water bottle filling installation requirement. The Commission chose to recommend that Scottsdale adopt an IgCC amendment to increase the percentage of indoor drinking fountains equipped with water bottle filling stations from 50% to 100%.

**Commissioner Bosse made a motion to approve the memorandum to City Council (dated 6/16/2021) once the recommendation for water-bottle filling stations was changed from 50% to 100%; Commissioner Schlosser provided a Second for the motion, which carried 6-1, with Chair Chrisman Lazarr, and Commissioners Abranovic, Bosse, Cuculic, Johnson and Schlosser voting for APPROVAL. Vice Chair Coletta voted in opposition, stating he preferred to also have the more restrictive lavatory faucet/shower head flow rates included in the Commission's recommendation letter.**

- 6. Presentation, discussion, and possible Commission recommendation letter to City Council regarding City support of, and education about, the protection of plant pollinators (e.g., bees, birds, beneficial insects).** Chair Chrisman Lazarr acknowledged the efforts of Commissioners Schlosser and Johnson in providing contact information for local subject matter experts. She identified this subject as a great example of the Commission's role in public outreach - by providing progress on the subject, and by seeking effective means to educate the public on the conservation of pollinators. The Chair suggested that the Commission could help educate the public with articles on *Sustainable Scottsdale* and in the *Scottsdale Independent*, as well as utility bill inserts, webinars and possibly public-school events. Commissioner Schlosser suggested that the effort to promote a "no kill" response to bee swarms should focus on (1) internal messaging with Parks, SPD & SFD personnel, and (2) external messaging for citizens confronted with bee swarms on their properties. Staff Coordinator Sam Brown agreed to consult with Scottsdale Parks, SPD & SFD personnel on recommendations for policies and contacts concerning the "no kill" option for removing the threat of public bee swarms (i.e., relocating to a non-public location). Commissioner Bosse re-enforced the Chair's stated goal to educate the public on the manifold benefits of protecting and conserving pollinators and their habitats. Chair Chrisman Lazarr will coordinate with the Public Affairs group on a specific outreach strategy.

**No Action Taken**

**7. Staff Updates:**

- General updates – Tim Conner
- Green Building updates - Anthony Floyd
- Sustainable Scottsdale Steering Team updates – Brent Stockwell

**8. Review of anticipated items for the August 2021 Commission agenda, including requests by Commission Members for items to be included on future agendas.**

- **Pollinator Protection and Bee Swarm Strategies**
- **ASU Urban Heat Island Study - Draft Review**
- **Public Outreach Strategies for Communicating Sustainability Policies**

**Adjournment: 7:54 p.m.**

# **Public Comment**

**rec'd 6/16/2021  
from  
Alisa McMahon**

## **PUBLIC COMMENT RE: PLUMBING FIXTURE AMENDMENTS – 2021 CODE ADOPTION**

There are three opportunities to conserve more water than provided for in the proposed 2021 Scottsdale amendments. Please see attached table.

### **Why More?**

The proposed code adoption, including the proposed amendments and the application of IgCC to all construction, is a positive move. Why should we do even more? In August, the first Tier 1 shortage likely will be declared and Colorado River 2022 deliveries will be cut. ADWR and CAP have announced "an increasing risk of Tier 2 conditions in the near future." Last week, the U.S. Bureau of Reclamation confirmed that Lake Mead's water level hit a historic low elevation of 1,071.53, the lowest level since the reservoir was filled in 1937. Last month, the Kyl Center for Water Policy at the ASU Morrison Institute for Public Policy published a report entitled "The Myth of Safe Yield: Pursuing the Goal of Safe Yield Isn't Saving Our Groundwater." In the Preface, Kathleen Ferris writes:

The iconic images of the bathtub ring around Lake Mead caused by falling water levels have been viewed by millions around the country and the world. ... If we could see the groundwater aquifers that serve as our underground reservoirs, many of them would be showing similar signs of stress as groundwater levels fall, the aquifers collapse, land subsides, and minerals and pollutants concentrate in the diminished supply that is left. If we could see that with our own eyes, perhaps we would understand, as we do with Lake Mead, the need to manage better the use of these finite water supplies. For Arizona's Active Management Areas, we might realize the time has come to move beyond the goal of safe-yield.

Building codes are updated in three-year cycles. Scottsdale typically adopts and amends codes in three-year cycles (although the last update was in 2015). What we build in the next three years will be with us for decades to come. Do we wait to do more?

### **1. Water bottle filling stations**

ASHRAE Standard 189.1 and IgCC provide for water bottle filling stations integral with or adjacent to 50% of drinking fountains. For a myriad of environmental and public health reasons, that number should be higher.

- IgCC is a *national* code, born of compromise to satisfy a variety of climates and stakeholders. State and local jurisdictions adopt local amendments to customize building codes as needed. While 50% may be a reasonable *national* standard, in a climate where water availability is paramount and people generally carry water with them, we need a higher percentage of bottle filling stations.
- We are all well aware of the environmental ramifications of single-use water bottles, from production through transportation to end-of-life. The more widespread availability of water bottle filling stations will support the use of refillable water bottles and reduce the use of single use plastic water bottles. Enough said.
- The provision of widespread water bottle refilling stations throughout the community implements several strategies in Scottsdale's "Community Solid Waste Reuse and Recycling Strategic Plan." For example, several strategies under Policy 5 "Encourage public and private establishments to minimize waste generation, and establish effective programs for waste reduction" address single-use plastic water bottles, refillable water bottles and bottle filling stations.

- Public health consideration #1 – Throughout Scottsdale and the country, water fountains were closed in response to the COVID pandemic – and many still are. **Water bottle filling stations were a notable exception.** Schools across the country have used CARES Act funds, grants, and PTO donations to purchase bottle filling stations.



- Public health consideration #2 – Water is a healthy alternative to high-sugar drinks and bottled beverages for adults and children. As one school administrator noted: "We were really trying to push water being the best beverage of choice for kids. Installing bottle filling stations was part of that push, but it was accelerated by the coronavirus pandemic."
- Use of bottle filling stations eliminates the water waste that occurs when attempting to refill water bottles in water fountains (where as much comes back out of the bottle as goes in).

## 2. Private lavatory faucets and showerheads

Scottsdale could join California, Hawaii and Washington in the following reduced flow rates:

private lavatory faucets	from 1.5 gpm	to 1.2 gpm
showerheads	from 2.0 gpm	to 1.8 gpm

Scottsdale Code Amendments 2021

	maximum flow in gallons per minute (gpm)						
Plumbing Fixture	Scottsdale proposed amendment	Water Sense	IAPMO WE-Stand <sup>2</sup>	ASHRAE Standard 189.1	International Green Construction Code (IgCC)	California Hawaii Washington <sup>3</sup>	California New York <sup>3</sup>
water bottle filling stations	50% <sup>1</sup>	-	?	50% <sup>1</sup>	50% <sup>1</sup>		100%
private lavatory faucet	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.2	
showerhead	2.0	2.0	2.0	2.0	2.0	1.8 <sup>4</sup>	

green highlights = opportunities to advance conservation

notes:

1. Water bottle filling stations shall be an integral part of, or shall be installed adjacent to, not less than 50% of all drinking fountains.
2. International Association of Plumbing and Mechanical Officials (IAPMO) Water Efficiency and Sanitation Standard (WE-Stand) - 2017
3. And other jurisdictions? This was not an exhaustive search.
4. 1.8 gpm manufactured on or after 7/1/18. (2.0 gpm manufactured on or after 7/1/16 and prior to 7/1/18.)

prepared by A. McMahon