



**SCOTTSDALE AIRPORT ADVISORY COMMISSION  
PUBLIC MEETING  
Scottsdale Airport Aviation Business Center  
15000 N. Airport Drive, Stearman/Thunderbird Meeting Room  
Scottsdale, AZ  
Wednesday, January 16, 2019**

**MINUTES**

**PRESENT:** John Celigoy, Chair  
Cory Little, Vice Chair  
Brad Berry  
John Berry (telephonic)  
Larry Bernosky (telephonic)  
Liz Kaplan (telephonic)  
Kevin Maxwell

**STAFF:** Carmen Williams, Management Analyst, Sr.  
Sarah Ferrara, Aviation Planning and Outreach Coordinator  
Chris Read, Airport Operations Manager  
Gary Mascaro, Aviation Director

**GUESTS:** Robert Stone  
Susan McGary  
Sebastian Moore, Learjet, Inc.  
Eric Rovey, Fly Denali Inc., DBA AlaskaZona Adventures  
William Sims, Magnolia Culinaire, LLC DBA JetFare Catering  
Steve Ziomek

**CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Celigoy called the meeting to order at 5:00 p.m.

**ROLL CALL**

A formal roll call confirmed the presence of Commissioners as noted above.

## **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

Chair Celigoy led the meeting in the pledge of allegiance.

## **AVIATION DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Gary Mascaro, Aviation Director, stated that the Airport is beginning to get busy with corporate aviation for upcoming events, including Barrett-Jackson and the Phoenix Open.

## **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

1. Regular Meeting: October 17, 2018  
Special Meeting: November 26, 2018

Commissioner Brad Berry called for comments on the minutes.

VICE CHAIR LITTLE MOVED TO APPROVE THE REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF THE AIRPORT ADVISORY COMMISSION ON OCTOBER 17, 2018 AND THE SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 26, 2018 AS PRESENTED. COMMISSIONER MAXWELL SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 7-0 WITH CHAIR CELIGOY, VICE CHAIR LITTLE, COMMISSIONERS BRAD BERRY, JOHN BERRY, BERNOSKY, KAPLAN AND MAXWELL VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

## **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

Steve Ziomek provided a brief status on the Thunderbird Field 2 Veteran's Memorial. He thanked staff and all those involved with getting the plane hung. The Thunderbirds are funding refurbishment of the service plaques and podium. The kiosks are in operation. The next phase of the project is commencement and award of scholarships for students interested in aviation. This year, the Veterans Foundation will provide a minimum of ten \$2,000 scholarships. He presented a plaque to Vice Chair Little, who has served on the Thunderbird Field 2 Veterans Memorial Board of Directors for the past two years.

## **REGULAR AGENDA            ITEMS 1 - 8**

1. Election of Officers

Mr. Mascaro thanked the Chair and Vice-Chair for their service over 2018.

CHAIR CELIGOY MOVED TO NOMINATE VICE CHAIR CORY LITTLE AS CHAIR AND COMMISSIONER KEVIN MAXWELL AS VICE CHAIR. COMMISSIONER BRAD BERRY SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 7-0 WITH CHAIR CELIGOY, VICE CHAIR LITTLE, COMMISSIONERS BRAD BERRY, JOHN BERRY, BERNOSKY, KAPLAN AND MAXWELL VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

Upon completion of the election, Commissioner Celigoy turned the meeting over to newly elected Chair Little. Chair Little thanked Commissioner Celigoy for his service.

2. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Airport Advisory Commission By-Laws

Mr. Mascaro stated that this item is on the agenda yearly to do an evaluation of the current bylaws and make any changes necessary. No changes were recommended.

3. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Application for Airport Aeronautical Business Permit for Learjet, Inc., to conduct Aircraft Maintenance and Repair Services

Carmen Williams, Senior Management Analyst, stated that the applicant is subleasing office space at Signature Flight Support's main facility. Learjet has a large service center in Tucson and wanted to provide support to Scottsdale Airport as a satellite location. They have met all the requirements of the aeronautical business permit and submitted the proper documentation. Western Regional Project Manager Sebastian Moore was present to answer questions.

Mr. Moore stated that the company provides warranty and AOG to new customers or anyone that owns their product. This site covers Albuquerque, Aspen, Las Vegas and other small airports. There are two functional teams with trucks. In response to a question from Chair Little, Mr. Moore stated that they do not do engine changes; the focus is on AOG. Chair Little asked why they chose the Airport. Mr. Moore stated that it is a beautiful city and airport and many of their clients are located in Scottsdale or come through, particularly for Barrett-Jackson. Other western sites include Seattle, San Francisco and Los Angeles.

CHAIR LITTLE MOVED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION FOR AIRPORT AERONAUTICAL BUSINESS PERMIT FOR LEARJET, INC. COMMISSIONER CELIGOY SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 7-0 WITH CHAIR LITTLE, VICE CHAIR MAXWELL, COMMISSIONERS BRAD BERRY, JOHN BERRY, BERNOSKY, CELIGOY AND KAPLAN VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

4. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Application for Airport Aeronautical Business Permit for Fly Denali Inc. DBA AlaskaZona Adventures to conduct Aircraft Charter Services

Ms. Williams stated the applicant has an office at the Ross Aviation main facility. They will be providing charter tours in Arizona. They have met the requirements of the aeronautical business permit and submitted the required documentation. Chief pilot and manager for the local office, Eric Rovey, was present to answer questions. Mr. Rovey stated that he developed the AlaskaZona idea two years ago, because their airplanes are parked five months of the year in Alaska.

COMMISSIONER CELIGOY MOVED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION FOR AIRPORT AERONAUTICAL BUSINESS PERMIT FOR FLY DENALI, INC. DBA ALASKAZONA. CHAIR LITTLE SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 7-0 WITH CHAIR LITTLE, VICE CHAIR MAXWELL, COMMISSIONERS BRAD BERRY, JOHN BERRY, BERNOSKY, CELIGOY AND KAPLAN VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

5. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Application for Airport Aeronautical Business Permit for Magnolia Culinaire LLC DBA JetFare Catering to conduct Off-Airport Catering Services

Ms. Williams stated that the applicant is a full service catering company located out of Phoenix and has met the requirements of the aeronautical business permit and submitted the documentation. William Sims, chef and owner, was present to answer questions. Mr. Sims stated that the company is a portfolio of catering services. The company supports C-CAP, a national nonprofit that works with at-risk high school students that want to get into the culinary arts.

COMMISSIONER CELIGOY MOVED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION FOR MAGNOLIA CULINAIRE, LLC DBA JETFARE CATERING. COMMISSIONER BRAD BERRY SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 7-0 WITH CHAIR LITTLE, VICE CHAIR MAXWELL, COMMISSIONERS BRAD BERRY, JOHN BERRY, BERNOSKY, CELIGOY AND KAPLAN VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

6. Discussion and Possible Action to Approve the Five-Year Airport Capital Improvement Program for Fiscal Years 19/20 through FY 23/24

Ms. Williams stated that the Airport undergoes two separate capital planning processes each spring. It meets with the Federal Aviation Administration and the State Aeronautics Group to discuss the five-year lookahead of projects eligible for grant funding. When they go through the City's capital process in the summer, they look into non-grant funded projects as well as identifying new projects for the next five years. Grant funding is very important, as the FAA and the State pay for the majority of the project costs. For federally funded projects, the FAA pays 91.06 percent of costs, the State pays 4.47 percent and Scottsdale pays 4.47 percent. On a State funded grant project, the split is 90/10 with the State paying 90 percent. The City holds a series of vetting meetings as part of the annual budget process to narrow down the proposed CIP list. By spring, the final budget is available to the public for comment. Adoption by City Council occurs in June. The Airport has requested eight new projects over the five-year period. Other changes involved moving a project from one year to the next.

Requested projects include:

- Design/construct electrical systems runway
- Kilo Ramp pavement
- Delta Apron with Phase II inclusive of perimeter road and drainage improvements
- Taxiway Charlie Rehab
- North General Aviation box hangars
- Rehab perimeter service road
- Full runway rehab design
- Improvements to existing fence line
- Airport monument sign
- Exterior ceiling improvements at Airport Operations Center

Projects for 20/21 include:

- Rehab/reconstruction of Runway 3/21
  - Estimated cost of \$10.6 million
  - Will involve a runway closure
  - Duration and phase will not be known until design begins
- Environmental assessment for a four acre parcel
  - Located to the north of the Greenway Hangars
  - Eligible for grant funding at a cost of \$200,000
  - Project may take a year and a half to complete
  - The parcel, if purchased, would provide additional development on the west side near Greenway and allow for new entryway for tenants access the northern portion of the Airport

Projects for 20/22 include:

- Construction of three new Taxiway Bravo exits
  - Estimated cost of \$1 million
  - Includes angled, high speed exits

Projects for 22/23 include:

- Acquisition of 4 acres
  - Estimated cost of \$1 million
- Installation of runway guard lights
  - Estimated cost of \$2 million

Projects for 23/24 include:

- Airport Master Plan Update
  - Estimated cost of \$350,000
  - Grant eligible
  - Provides a 20 year blueprint for the Airport
  - Will recommend new projects
- Wildlife Hazard Management Plan
  - Estimated cost of \$100,000
  - Grant eligible
  - 18 month study identifying wildlife conditions near the airport
  - Develop mitigation actions to prevent the risk of wildlife strikes

Commissioner Celigoy asked if any of the capital projects are associated with the Scottsdale Jet Center Lease modification project reviewed during the special Commission meeting a month ago with regard to T-shades, shade hangars or parking areas. Ms. Williams said the closest project would be the Delta Apron Rehab, which is adjacent to the Air Commerce Center and parking areas on the south ramp. Phase I will begin shortly. Phase II will be just directly to the south.

Commissioner Celigoy asked about the flexibility to access federal funding for projects outside of this plan. Ms. Williams stated that each year, there are three contingency pots for unforeseen grant matches.

Commissioner Brad Berry asked if there is a sales agreement in place for the four acre parcel. Ms. Williams said they do not yet have an agreement and the number is an estimate from the Airport Master Plan.

Commissioner Bernosky asked how much funding is planned to be expended from the Tourism Development Fund. Ms. Williams stated that the TDC funds are part of the Terminal Redevelopment Project. The total budget was \$412,000 towards the Veterans Memorial, which has been fully expensed.

Chair Little asked whether all the projects with the federal grant matches have been approved. Ms. Williams said not all of the projects included in the plan are necessarily approved. During the annual meeting with the FAA, the Airport will have an idea of the main projects to be funded.

Commissioner Celigoy inquired as to tying in the Memorial as a City historical marker. Mr. Mascaro said there are no plans for this at this point. The Thunderbird 2 Veterans Memorial Group is looking at options to advertise the area.

In response to a question from Vice Chair Maxell, Ms. Williams stated that the total amount expended for the Master Plan Update is \$350,000 in 23/24. It is a year-long study which looks at an inventory of everything at the Airport, forecasts for operations, the capital plan and provides a blueprint for the Airport.

Commissioner Celigoy asked if the federal level noise studies would come out of capital funds or operating funds. Mr. Mascaro stated that a noise study is not included in the Five-Year plan at this time. The current noise study runs to 2025. Funding would come from capital funds. Any such plan would have to include buy-in from the FAA, as they provide funding.

Chair Little asked whether the FAA provides guidance for triggers to move up the date for studies to be performed. Mr. Mascaro confirmed that there are triggers based on significant community concerns, change in procedures and runway additions. These triggers are not present at this time, as operations are now lower than they were at the time of the last noise study, procedures have not changed and there are no new runways.

Vice Chair Maxwell noted the change in flight pattern did constitute a change. Mr. Mascaro clarified that those changes refer to Phoenix Sky Harbor, not directly impacting Scottsdale operations.

VICE CHAIR MAXWELL MOVED TO APPROVE THE FIVE-YEAR AIRPORT CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM FOR FISCAL YEARS 19/20 THROUGH 23/24. COMMISSIONER CELIGOY SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 7-0 WITH CHAIR LITTLE, VICE CHAIR MAXWELL COMMISSIONERS BRAD BERRY, JOHN BERRY, BERNOSKY, CELIGOY AND KAPLAN VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

7. Discussion and Possible Action to Approve Airport Advisory Commission Annual Report

Mr. Mascaro stated that every year in January, staff presents a draft Airport Advisory Commission Annual report. The City Council requests that all boards and commissions submit such reports in

February to provide an update of the work performed over the year, anticipated projects and other items the Commission may share. Commissioners are invited to include additional comments and recommendations.

COMMISSIONER CELIGOY MOVED TO APPROVE THE AIRPORT ADVISORY COMMISSION ANNUAL REPORT AS PRESENTED. COMMISSIONER MAXWELL SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 7-0 WITH CHAIR LITTLE, VICE CHAIR MAXWELL, COMMISSIONERS BRAD BERRY, JOHN BERRY, BERNOSKY, CELIGOY AND KAPLAN VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

#### 8. Discussion and Input Regarding Quarterly Noise Complaint Summary Report

Sarah Ferrara, Aviation Planning and Outreach Coordinator, stated that the report covers the fourth quarter from October, 2018 to December, 2018. There were 41 callbacks and one email for the period. There were 64 repeat complainants and 42 new complainants for the quarter. In 2017 during the same period, there were 1,668 compared with 715 complainants for the fourth quarter. It is notable that in one of the top complaint areas, four complainants logged 346 complaints for the period, with the majority submitted by one individual. The configuration of complaint originations have dispersed into different areas over the quarter. Some recent complaints focused on helicopter operations, military activity and flight training.

Commissioner Celigoy stated that the commercial aircraft airline industry is experiencing the highest pilot retirement and turnover since World War II. This creates a massive training requirement at the private and commercial pilot level. The Valley is home to some of the largest, most popular and efficient flight schools. It is important to note that just because an aircraft flies by Scottsdale does not mean it is associated with Scottsdale Airport. Although the Airport discourages planes from landing in the middle of the night, they cannot prevent such landings. Vice Chair Maxwell surmised that much of the activity are helicopters using the National Guard facility at 52nd Street and McDowell.

Chair Little invited members of the public to provide comments.

Robert Stone acknowledged the regulations, however he requests cooperation and understanding, specifically asking that the activity be shifted over the highway, desert and mountains as opposed to following Michelle Drive, where he lives. Residents are no longer able to keep their windows open, due to noise.

Susan McGary spoke for herself and fellow residents, Sherry Switzenberg and Betty Cisneros. Ms. McGary lives in the same neighborhood as Mr. Stone and the noise issues have become much worse over the past eight months. The noise is constant, repetitive, loud and disturbing. It disturbs their sleep and makes people nervous. Residents have isolated the problem to flight schools, and believe the schools have the ability to fly more friendly, showing goodwill to their neighbors. She provided photos to illustrate the experiences of the neighborhood. With a flight training app, she is able to identify planes, their registration numbers and owners. On a day with particularly intense activity, she phoned the flight school owner to express her concerns. The owner informed her that she was wasting her time and that the flight schools can pretty much do whatever they want and that the problem was only going to get worse. He explained that because they make money for the Airport and the Airport makes money for the City, she might as well just stop complaining. At the very least, the Airport should reach out to the flight schools to better educate them to fly in a manner that does not necessarily impact residential neighborhoods. She

requested that the Commission direct Airport management to take steps to address the flight school activity and that the Commission consider a noise study, as the last has not been done for 15 years.

Vice Chair Maxell apologized for the comments received from the flight school operator. The Commission welcomes public comments on this very complex problem. Noise issues are an ongoing point of the discussion with the Commission and the comments provide a good starting point.

In response to a question from Commissioner Celigoy, Mr. Mascaro stated that the last noise study was done in 2004. The study is a 20-year outlook based on noise contours and evaluation through the FAA process. Generally speaking, most airport contours shrink over time. The Airport's 2025 noise contours are smaller than its 2004 noise contours.

Commissioner Celigoy stated that the comments presented at this meeting refer to the downwind pattern to the runway. It is the landing pattern for the aircraft staying at Scottsdale to do touch and go landings. Two of the largest flight schools in the state are at Deer Valley in the City of Phoenix. Mr. Mascaro concurred, adding that there are several smaller flight schools in Scottsdale which have ramped up activity. The comments this evening in regard to the Stonebrook area are accurate in terms of increased activity. The FAA meets with the flight schools regularly in regards to operating safely in the air space. The next such meeting is due, but has been on hold because of the government shutdown. The City of Scottsdale does not control the airspace of the Airport, however during the busiest local traffic times the Airport does request that flights go to another location. Scottsdale has had noise abatement procedures in effect since 1985, having one of the earliest noise programs in the Valley. They continuously educate pilots to fly friendly and have instituted voluntary curfews. Scottsdale has two prohibitions, including no touch and goes after 9:30 at night to 6:30 in the morning and no maintenance runups. The City has had challenges with flight schools out of a different airport doing touch and goes at night, which continued despite multiple contacts until the operator was banned from the Airport for six months through a legal process.

9. Discussion and Input Regarding Airport and Airpark Aeronautical Business Permit Additions, cancellations and Revocations

Ms. Williams noted that the three new aeronautical business permits on tonight's agenda are shown in green. There were four cancellations and one permit revocation. On the Airpark side, there were two permit cancellations.

Chair Little asked why the business permit for Orange Olive Catering was revoked. Ms. Williams stated it was due to nonpayment.

10. Discussion and Input Regarding Monthly Construction Report

Chris Read, Airport Operations Manager, reported that the reconstruction of the Delta Parking Apron will begin on January 21, 2019. The runway lighting and signage project is in design phase.



11. Discussion and Input Regarding Monthly Operations Report for October, November and December of 2018

Mr. Read stated that there were 166,184 operations for calendar year 2018, down slightly from 2017. IFR operations were up slightly compared to last year. The alerts include one Alert 3, which consisted of a Beech Bonanza landing in a runway safety area. There was no damage and no injuries. There were no unusual incidents to report. For U.S. Customs fiscal year-to-day total is \$247,705. Uses for the month are picking up, with 108 total in December. Total uses fiscal year-to-date are 456. There were 26 U.S. visits for December. The calendar year finished with 54 PPRs for operations between 75,000 and 100,000 pounds.

Commissioner Celigoy referred to City owned parking spaces and/or shade hangars and asked how the public obtains this information. Mr. Read said that the typical occurrence is that an individual comes into the office and inquires about open tie-downs or hangars. Commissioner Celigoy asked whether steps should be taken to insure transparency. Mr. Mascaro said he is not familiar with any airport that typically advertises available space.

12. Discussion and Input Regarding Financial Report for September, October and November of 2019

Ms. Williams addressed the most current report for November. Year-to-date revenues are at \$1.8 million, which is just short of the budget by \$57,000. Year-to-date-expenses are \$839,000, which is under budget by \$190,000. November, 2018 expenses were slightly higher than last year by \$41,000, likely due to additional expenses with the opening of the new Aviation Business Center. The quarterly invoice for U.S. Customs was also off one month. As of November, 2018, the balance for the Aviation Fund cash balance is \$10.5 million.

In November, 2018, Airport jet fuel was 63.8 percent of total fuel flowage. AVGAS accounted for 2.6 percent and Airpark fuel flowage was 33.6 percent. Compared to November of last year, fuel flowage is up 3.3 percent. Overall for the year, it is up 4.2 percent over last fiscal year.

Commissioner Celigoy asked for confirmation that the business center costs were forecast close with no additional significant cash or expense impacts. Ms. Williams stated said that there are only minor line items, including maintenance, mowing, electrical and utility expenses. For the next fiscal year, they have reduced some account lines. She confirmed that adjustments are made on a monthly basis in terms of impacts of runway closures and other impacts.

13. Discussion and Input Regarding Public Outreach and Planning Projects

Ms. Ferrara stated that the FAA has postponed the previously scheduled Step Two public workshops in April due to the government shutdown.

The Stonebrook HOA has requested a noise outreach meeting and staff is in the process of scheduling.

The next pilots briefing scheduled for mid-February may be on hold due to the government shutdown.

Five voluntary curfew letters were sent in October, four in November and four in December.

Staff continues to monitor property development in the Airport Influence Area. The Planning and Zoning reports listed two projects in October, three in November and three in December.

Staff continues to post on media, social media and listservs, including information on the new online payment system and box hangar proposal.

Now that the construction is complete, brochures are being updated, including the Airport general brochure. Staff is working on a final video of the redevelopment project. Other video segments of the project are available on the website.

Community outreach and presentations continue. Ms. Ferrara provided a presentation to Scottsdale Leadership showcasing the new facility and plaza area. They also presented at the Scottsdale Chamber's Economic Development Advisory Council to show the economic benefits the Airport provides. Both grand opening events were successful.

Chair Little cited the NBAA Schedulers and Dispatchers event and noted that staff had discussed implementing processes to measure the impact of the Airport's participation. He asked if there has been an assessment of impacts. Ms. Ferrara stated that they have tried different strategies, including offering a fuel card discount for first-time visitors. Unfortunately, the cards were used by only a few visitors. It is seen as a success, however, to bring one or two new customers to the Airport. Staff also tracks lead retrievals in terms of contacts made. They will attend the next Schedulers and Dispatchers show in San Antonio in a couple of weeks.

14. Administrative Report from the Aviation Director or Designee Regarding the Status of Aviation-Related Items

Gary Mascaro, Aviation Director, noted that Council approved the long-term lease agreement with Scottsdale Jet Center Real Estate for two Airport parcels. In terms of aviation-related items to the Planning Commission, Design Review Board or City Council, the Manor Scottsdale project located in the City of Phoenix is a new case. Ms. Ferrara stated that the project is in its initial phases, located in the LA Fitness building south of Joan De Arc off of Scottsdale Road. It falls within the contours of the Scottsdale Airport. It comes up in the noise study as a discouraging, noise sensitive use development when occurring in this contour. The proposed development is a multifamily luxury community. It will consist of five-story and two-story buildings. A public meeting was held, however Airport staff is unaware of the responses from the community. The Airport did receive phone calls from City of Phoenix residents concerned about the development project. Scottsdale's mayor will be sending out a letter to the City of Phoenix Councilmember presiding over the district in order to express concerns and remind them of Phoenix' partnership with Scottsdale in the noise study to discourage this type of development so close to the Airport. The Aviation Department will be sending a letter to the City of Phoenix Planning Department and the City of Phoenix Aviation Department to discourage the project from moving forward. Scottsdale will request some stipulations if the project should move forward, including disclosures, height analysis and noise attenuation.

15. Discussion and Possible Action to Modify the Airport Advisory Commission Meeting schedule and Commission Item Calendar

There were no requests to modify the calendar.

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

There were no public comments

**FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

No action taken.

**ADJOURNMENT**

Chair Little called for a motion to adjourn.

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved by Commissioner Celigoy and seconded by Vice Chair Maxwell, the meeting adjourned at 6:35 p.m.

AYES: Chair Little, Vice Chair Maxwell, Commissioners Brad Berry, John Berry, Celigoy, Bernosky and Kaplan.

NAYS: None

SUBMITTED BY:

eScribers, LLC