



**SUMMARIZED MINUTES
CITY OF SCOTTSDALE TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
THURSDAY, JULY 16, 2009
KIVA - CITY HALL
ONE CIVIC CENTER
3939 DRINKWATER BOULEVARD
SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA 85251**

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Howard called the regular meeting of the Scottsdale Transportation Commission to order at 6:16 p.m.

1. **ROLL CALL**

PRESENT: William Howard, Chair
Josh Weiss, Vice Chair
Carleton Cole, Commissioner
Terry Gruver, Commissioner
Howard Sukenic, Commissioner
Paul Ward, Commissioner

ABSENT: Donald Maxwell, Commissioner

STAFF: Dave Meinhart, Transportation Director
Annie DeChance, Public Participation & Outreach Manager
Teresa Huish, Principal Transportation Planner
Rose Arballo, Transportation Commission Coordinator
Phil Kercher, Principal Traffic Engineer
Luis Santaella, Assistant City Attorney
Jennifer Bohac, Senior Traffic Engineer

GUESTS: Mary O'Connor

SPEAKERS DURING PUBLIC COMMENT (IN ALPHABETICAL ORDER):

Suzan Curtin

Paul Coykendal

Dave MacDonald

2. **Introduction of New Transportation Commissioner**

Chair Howard introduced Carleton Cole as the newest Transportation Commissioner.

3. **Recognition of Mary O'Connor**

Chair Howard recognized the contributions of retired Transportation General Manager Mary O'Connor and presented her with a gift. Ms. O'Connor thanked the Commission and staff for their efforts. She thanked the citizens and media who participated in the meetings during her tenure.

VICE CHAIR WEISS PROPOSED A RESOLUTION THANKING MARY O'CONNOR FOR MANY YEARS OF PROFESSIONALISM AND TALENT AS TRANSPORTATION GENERAL MANAGER FOR THE CITY OF SCOTTSDALE. HER EFFORTS HAVE MADE SCOTTSDALE AN EVEN GREATER COMMUNITY. COMMISSIONER GRUVER SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0). COMMISSIONER MAXWELL WAS ABSENT.

4. **Election of Transportation Commission Officers**

Chair Howard opened the floor for nominations to the positions of Chair and Vice Chair of the Transportation Commission. Commissioner Ward said the current leadership has ensured that everyone gets heard, that discussions are thoughtful and considerate, and that decisions are made in a timely and respectful manner.

COMMISSIONER WARD NOMINATED WILLIAM HOWARD AS CHAIR, AND JOSH WEISS AS VICE CHAIR OF THE TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. COMMISSIONER SUKENIC SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A VOTE OF FOUR (4) TO ZERO (0) WITH COMMISSIONERS HOWARD AND WEISS ABSTAINING. COMMISSIONER MAXWELL WAS ABSENT.

5. **Approval of Meeting Minutes**

- Study Session of the Transportation Commission - June 18, 2009
- Regular Meeting of the Transportation Commission - June 18, 2009

COMMISSIONER GRUVER MOVED TO APPROVE THE STUDY SESSION AND REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF JUNE 18, 2009, AS PRESENTED. COMMISSIONER WARD SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY BY A VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0). COMMISSIONER MAXWELL WAS ABSENT.

6. **Public Comment**

Dave MacDonald conveyed a message from former Commissioner Kelly McCall who expressed her gratitude to Mary O'Connor for her patience, grace and eloquence. She has been an invaluable resource to the Commission and an outstanding asset to the City. Mr. MacDonald said he concurred with these remarks.

Suzan Curtin reported that the Sands East II neighborhood's temporary right-of-entry agreement with the City has gone smoothly and the residents have responded positively to the work being done.

7. Neighborhood Traffic Management Project (NTMP) Request

Ms. Bohac presented the NTMP request for the Roosevelt Street project from Scottsdale Road to Miller Road. Roosevelt Street serves as a minor collector for the area, which is near SkySong and Vista Del Camino Park. The residents submitted a request in December of 2006. Speed and volume data was gathered in April of 2007, and the project met all the program criteria to move forward. Average traffic is over 3,500 vehicles per day. The data shows that 65% of vehicles travel over 30 m.p.h., while 22% travel over 35 m.p.h. Residents decided to use the petition route, gathering support from 76% of the residents. Signs were posted and notices distributed, and the plan was presented at a public meeting in June of 2009. Drainage issues prevent traffic calming devices from being installed east of 74th Street.

The plan proposes a raised median island east of Scottsdale Road, and a pair of side islands further east. At 74th Street and Roosevelt a roundabout would be installed. The devices would include landscaping to break up the straight visual. Stamped-asphalt paving would be employed along with striping to visually narrow the roadway without impeding drainage or water flows. This theme would be carried through to the crosswalks at the roundabout and at 72nd Place. The residents indicated a preference for the landscaped features, and proposed the roundabout. They expressed concern about rolling stops and the noise created by accelerating vehicles at the current four-way stop. Ms. Bohac noted that the neighborhood trolley also runs on Roosevelt Street.

The cost to construct the raised median and side islands is estimated at \$30,000. The stamped asphalt paving would cost \$20,000, and the roundabout \$45,000. The total project cost is estimated at \$95,000.

Chair Howard invited public commentary.

Paul Coykendal said it would seem reasonable to find a more economic way to control traffic on this road, considering the current economic times. He noted that a similar device nearby has not worked well, and the City is removing it.

Chair Howard noted the comments of a non-speaker, David Francis, who wrote there is no need for the extra expense for the Roosevelt project. Average speeds of 30 to 35 m.p.h. are better than those on 72nd Place being double that speed.

In response to an inquiry from Commissioner Ward, Ms. Bohac said the Water Department has confirmed that the roundabout would allow water to flow without compromise. Commissioner Ward inquired whether funding this project would jeopardize future projects. Mr. Meinhart responded that the NTMP program has \$1.4 million in funds available until June of 2010.

Commissioner Cole noted that other than the public speakers, there does not appear to be opposition to the project from the residents and the data indicates it would be a prudent project. Vice Chair Weiss noted that Mr. Porell defended the use of older statistics in the study, which was done to ensure that older project requests continued through the transition process. As the backlog of older projects thins out, the data presented will reflect current road conditions.

COMMISSIONER WARD MOVED TO APPROVE THE CONSTRUCTION FUNDING FOR THE NTMP PROJECT ON ROOSEVELT STREET FROM SCOTTSDALE ROAD TO MILLER ROAD. COMMISSIONER COLE SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY BY A VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0). COMMISSIONER MAXWELL WAS ABSENT.

8. **Noise Abatement Policy**

Ms. Huish presented the latest draft of the Roadway Noise Abatement Policy. The roadway policy recommends working with residents to study and mitigate noise issues when they result from direct City actions. It relies on published, adopted plans for awareness of what the future roadway system will be. The City will undertake a noise study to examine noise levels and impacts, and will recommend best levels of mitigation per the criteria in the noise policy. The threshold for roadway noise abatement is 64 decibels. The City will use noise mitigation technologies on all major and minor arterials when they are widened or resurfaced. The policy will include options for vegetation, berms and sound walls. Mitigation efforts should reduce noise levels by at least 5 decibels, and be below the threshold. This roadway policy does not address mobile sources of noise. She noted the revisions proposed during the study session.

Chair Howard invited public commentary.

Suzan Curtin expressed concern with the first paragraph of the policy, which implies that the City is willing to allow creeping noise levels as growth occurs, while not doing anything about noise in older neighborhoods. The policy needs to specify when noise mitigation can occur in situations where a road is not being widened. It is asking a lot of home buyers to investigate transportation plans to determine whether they would be responsible for mitigating the increased noise. The policy suggests the City does not care about the concerns of property owners, particularly those in older neighborhoods. She proposed scrapping the first paragraph and starting over.

Ms. Huish responded that the policy was crafted to ensure the City was aware of its responsibilities, but also to identify that home buyers also have a level of responsibility. It should not always fall to the City to mitigate any issues that come up. Commissioner Sukenic added that the City could only be reasonably responsible for noise that it created. Commissioner Ward agreed that home buyers not only have the responsibility of knowing what exists today, but what is planned to be there within the reasonable planning time frame. Commissioner Ward suggested a modification to avoid confusing two different issues in the same bullet point.

COMMISSIONER GRUVER MOVED TO ADOPT THE ROADWAY NOISE MITIGATION POLICY, AS AMENDED. COMMISSIONER WARD SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY BY A VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0). COMMISSIONER MAXWELL WAS ABSENT.

9. **Commission Ordinance Revision**

Mr. Meinhart noted that the Commission is in the final stages of revising the ordinance. Chair Howard noted the amendments that were suggested during the study session. The ordinance now clarifies how all four members of the Trails Subcommittee are appointed in subsection 8.

There was discussion on whether the Design Standards and Policy Manual (DS&PM) should be explicitly called out in the wording. The prevailing question is whether or not it is a controlling document and if so, where should it be inserted in the ordinance. Commissioner Gruver clarified that Commissioner Ward requested a more formal recognition of the Commission's ability to review virtually all elements of the DS&PM, and whether the Commission's actions were, by ordinance, to be consistent with that document.

Commissioner Ward explained his concern that as the functions of the Transportation Department are dispersed throughout various departments, there will no longer be a clear link between the Commission and one single point of contact. Up to now, the Commission has worked with the General Manager on various issues. In the future, the Commission might be asked to deal with several different people. The Commission's charge has to be clarified. Chair Howard noted two possibilities, one to add a reference to the DS&PM in Section A, on Purpose, Powers, and Duties, and the other to insert it in Item 6, on Mobility and Safety.

Mr. Meinhart suggested that rather than referencing the DS&PM in Item 6, the revision could be made in paragraph four of the first page. Commissioner Ward agreed. Mr. Santaella suggested that Subsection 4 could call for a periodic review of the DS&PM as it relates to transportation and the Community Mobility element of the General Plan.

In response to an inquiry from Commissioner Ward on a sentence in Section A, Mr. Santaella said this was included to prevent any potential conflicts with the City Charter. It was compromise language to allow the Commission to make input and review the budget and advise the Council, and ensure there would be no issues. Commissioner Ward said he would like to see the Commission be included on a clear path before the budget gets to Council for approval, instead of simply being informed as an afterthought. Mr. Santaella responded that the language is meant to remove any possibility that there is conflict with the Charter.

Mr. Meinhart noted that the review of the operating budget by any Commission has been handled in different ways over the years. Previous administrations did not ask commissions to provide input on the operating budget, because it was the City Manager's responsibility to make that determination. Over time, that procedure has been modified as Council has become more interested in getting broader input. Transportation has recently sought Commission input on the CIP as well as reviewing the Department's draft budget and the majority of the costs associated with transit. Chair Howard explained that the Commission sought to have insight into the operating budget in order to understand not only the CIP budget, but also the CIP's impact on the operating budget.

Commissioner Ward proposed modifying the first sentence of Section A to read "The Commission shall advise the City Council in a timely manner on matters related to the safe and efficient movement of motor vehicles." Vice Chair Weiss said the language of the draft appears to preclude the Commission from being part of the process, and this could potentially become problematic over time. He proposed a revision that would recognize that while there is no legal requirement to do so, an attempt should be made to bring the issues before the Commission.

Mr. Santaella recommended inserting a sentence that would say, "Whenever possible, items to be considered by the Commission shall be brought in a timely manner to the Commission." Mr. Meinhart suggested simply saying that the Commission shall advise City Council in a timely manner, as this would avoid heading into a level of direction that is beyond what would be sensible for this type of an ordinance. The focus of the ordinance should be more on the

Commission's role rather than the role of Staff. Commissioner Sukenic proposed tabling the issue to allow for further refinement outside the constraints of a meeting.

COMMISSIONER SUKENIC MOVED TO TABLE THIS ITEM UNTIL THE NEXT MEETING. COMMISSIONER GRUVER SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY BY A VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0). COMMISSIONER MAXWELL WAS ABSENT.

10. **Other Transportation Projects**

Mr. Meinhart noted that a public open house on the first phase of the Scottsdale Road streetscape improvement project would be held on August 6. The Maricopa Association of Governments recently authorized an additional \$4.8 million in Federal grant money for that project. He said two path projects would soon go out to bid, one on the Cross-Cut Canal and the other at Indian Bend Wash. The project on Scottsdale Road from Frank Lloyd Wright to the Loop 101 is moving into the final rubberized asphalt paving stage, and should be completed within three weeks.

11. **Public Comment**

There were no public comments on non-agendized items.

12. **Identification of Future Agenda Items**

Chair Howard requested a return to the ITS issue and a review of Council's response to the noise abatement ordinance. He said the Commission should focus on intersection issues as requested by the Mayor. Mr. Meinhart added there would also be an agenda item to update the Commission on conceptual design work on key Airpark area improvements.

13. **ADJOURNMENT**

With no further business to conduct, Chair Howard adjourned the regular meeting at 7:48 p.m.

SUBMITTED BY:

A/V Tronics, Inc. DBA AVTranz.

NOTE: VIDEO AND/OR AUDIO RECORDINGS OF SCOTTSDALE TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION MEETINGS ARE AVAILABLE FROM THE SCOTTSDALE TRANSPORTATION DEPARTMENT FOR UP TO SIX MONTHS FOLLOWING THE MEETING DATE.