



APPROVED SUMMARIZED MINUTES

**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
SPECIAL MEETING**

THURSDAY, APRIL 7, 2016

**KIVA – CITY HALL
3939 N. DRINKWATER BOULEVARD
SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA 85251**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Olmsted called the special meeting of the Scottsdale Transportation Commission to order at 6:02 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Steven Olmsted, Chair
Gary Bretz, Commissioner
Barry Graham, Commissioner
Robert Stickles, Commissioner

ABSENT: Paul Holley, Vice Chair
Jyme Sue McLaren, Commissioner
Steven Rosenberg, Commissioner

STAFF: Paul Basha, Director of Transportation
Madeline Clemann, Transit Manager
Frances Cookson, Staff Representative
Ratna Koropella, Principal Transit Planner

GUESTS: Rachel Pearson, CSVB

3. PUBLIC COMMENT

No members of the public wished to address the Commission.

4. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

- Study Session of the Transportation Commission – February 18, 2016
- Regular Meeting of the Transportation Commission – February 18, 2016

COMMISSIONER GRAHAM MOVED TO APPROVE THE STUDY SESSION MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 18, 2016 AND THE REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 18, 2016 AS PRESENTED. COMMISSIONER BRETZ SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A VOTE OF FOUR (4) TO ZERO (0). VICE CHAIR HOLLEY, COMMISSIONER MCLAREN AND COMMISSIONER ROSENBERG WERE ABSENT.

5. 2016 SMART/CONNECTED/COMPLETE TRANSPORTATION SPEAKER SERIES

Rachel Pearson gave the presentation on SCVB/Technology perspectives on Transportation in Scottsdale. Highlights included:

- SCVB brings in approximately nine million visitors per year to Scottsdale, including overnight and day visitors, resulting in approximately \$4 billion in economic impact.
- Tourism sales tax dollars go into the General Fund to support fire, police, the Transportation Fund and the Preserve Fund.
- SCVB Board of Directors developed a vision for Scottsdale, which included three pillars, one of which was transportation and regional connectivity.
 - Scottsdale lacks regional connectivity and a variety of transportation options.
 - A bike share program, improved pedestrian experience and additional parking will provide greater ease in exploring downtown's restaurants, businesses and attractions.
 - High capacity transit connecting downtown to Tempe or Phoenix will provide greater access to the region.
- For the largest hotels and resorts with meeting space, meetings may account for 50 percent of revenues. Recent studies indicate that 45 percent of meeting planners say that local transportation is critical when choosing a meeting destination. This reflects an increase from two years ago, when 30 percent of planners ranked it as critical.
- Out of the top 40 meeting markets, Scottsdale local transportation system is ranked as 36th overall, reflecting a drop from two years ago, when the ranking was 32.
- Scottsdale often loses business to competitor cities, including Las Vegas, Orlando, Phoenix and San Diego.
- SCVB has been conducting research in terms of a new brand that will be launching at the end of the year to address leisure visitors. Leisure visitors generally view Scottsdale's public transportation and walkability less positively than local residents. The competitive city set includes Palm Springs, Austin, San Diego, Las Vegas, Miami, Santa Fe, San Antonio and Phoenix and all had a better reputation than Scottsdale in terms of public transportation and walkability.
- A recent report by the U.S. Travel Association indicated that in the summer of 2015, 58 percent of Americans planned to use public transportation during their trips.
 - Core Scottsdale travelers are 35 to 55 years old and it is important to familiarize younger generations with the City and its appeal.
 - Older Millennials are on the cusp of being included in the core customer category.

- Millennials are drawn to communities that offer a variety of public transportation options.
- The luxury traveler is another important segment of the visiting population.
 - Wellness trends have continued to grow, leading to more active travel.
 - Biking and walking tours are of greater interest to luxury travelers than average travelers.

A Commissioner addressed walkability and questioned why those surveyed preferred other cities over Scottsdale. Ms. Pearson stated that the study did not provide that specific feedback, but did include travelers from around the U.S. in all major markets. Paul Basha, Director of Transportation, stated that as part of his work in the Civic Center Mall area, he frequently interacts with travelers in Downtown Scottsdale. Travelers often complain about the state of the sidewalks, stairs, ramps and columns in the Downtown area.

A Commissioner asked what SCVB will be doing to attract the next generation of core customers. Ms. Pearson replied that SCVB is in the midst of an 18 month process to rebrand the destination. The process includes review of the various traveler segments, understanding what each category of travelers is seeking and adjusting the approach for each group. For Millennial customers, the majority of the communication will be through digital online venues.

Chair Olmsted commented that the Master Plan attempts to define the different modes of transportation, how they relate to the City, where they are in their current state and where they might be developed further. The work of SCVB will enable the Commission to better understand and define the categories of system users.

6. TRANSIT OPERATING BUDGET

Madeline Clemann said that while the summary is concise, unknown changes over the next five years may alter the schedule for implementation of some improvements. Funding for the purchase of additional vehicles is not absolute, however, given the current focus by the federal government for funding replacement, especially for electric vehicles, it seems very like that federal funding will be available.

Transit Manager Ratna Koropella gave the presentation. Highlights included:

- Operating Budget overview:
 - Currently, the transit system includes the fixed rail system, bus system and trolley routes. Other services include paratransit, East Valley Dial-a-Ride and cab connection vouchers.
 - Funding revenues are received via:
 - Regional sales tax funds through Prop 400
 - City sales tax dollars
 - Federal funding
 - Hotel bed taxes, which specifically funds the Downtown Trolley
 - The City of Phoenix is the designated recipient of federal funding for the entire region.
 - Prop 400 funds go through Valley Metro, which distributes them to jurisdictions.
 - IGAs for Prop 400 and grant funded projects go through an approval process via the City Council on an annual basis.

- MAG does not receive transit funding, however, they facilitate the grant application and evaluation process and determine the recipients of grant funding.
- It is forecasted that federal grant money will decline slightly in coming years.
- Bed tax dollars total approximately \$300,000 and this number is assumed to remain constant for the next five years.
- In terms of regional sales funds for the next fiscal year, Transportation will be receiving an additional \$1 million, which will be used to fund Route 81, which will in turn free up City sales tax funds.
- Proposed bus and trolley improvements for the next five years:
 - October, 2016:
 - Add peak hour trips from Camelback to Thunderbird Park and Ride, to be funded with Prop 400 funds.
 - Expand the frequency of service on Route 50 with connectivity to the Trolley.
 - Run service from 5:00 a.m. to midnight on weekdays and 5:00 a.m. to 10:00 p.m.
 - Current ridership of the Camelback Trolley on weekends is at low levels. Ridership will be monitored for the next nine months and if it continues to underperform, it is proposed that the bus can be used to improve the frequency on Miller Road on weekends
 - The total cost for proposed changes for October, 2016 is \$322,000.
 - October, 2017:
 - Increase frequency on Thomas Road. Phoenix is increasing frequencies as well, and this will provide an opportunity to tag onto these efforts by increasing the off-peak frequency to 30 minutes and the peak frequency to 15 minutes. The estimated cost is \$183,000.
 - Tag onto Phoenix' improvements on McDowell Road by increasing both on peak and off peak frequencies.
 - October, 2018:
 - Implementation of the Airpark Trolley, which was developed as a result of the Master Plan improvements.

Chair Olmsted asked about the reasoning of having routes run until midnight on weekdays and 10:00 p.m. on weekends. Ms. Koropella stated that weekend ridership is much lower than weekday.

- October, 2019:
 - Increase frequencies on Indian School Road.
 - Implement the Scottsdale Road Limited from Thunderbird Park and Ride to Fashion Square Mall at 10 to 15 minute frequencies.
 - The cost is estimated to be \$3 million with Valley Metro running the service.

A Commissioner asked whether the \$3 million budget includes fare collection offsets. Ms. Koropella replied that fare offsets have not been issued, however the impact would be very minimal. Ms. Clemann added that the fare ratio has been dropping and is currently at less than 24 percent. A fare increase is being contemplated. The current rate is \$2.00 each way and \$5 for an all day pass.

A Commissioner asked about the demand to extend east/west routes until midnight. Ms. Koropella stated that the data does not reflect a need for this at this time. Ms. Clemann

commented that there have been several complaints from community members that routes stop too early. Recently, these comments have been in reference to the rail.

A Commissioner commented that the Priest bus provides a good connection with light rail. He also suggested altering the Route 50 to SCC on Fridays, when ridership is minimal. Ms. Clemann replied that a split weekly approach is difficult from a user standpoint. She added that the ridership may change, as SCC likely has classes occurring on Friday nights.

A Commissioner asked about communication with the Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community regarding extending the Route 17 McDowell bus to the casino. Ms. Clemann stated that numerous contacts have been made through Valley Metro with no response. However, Ms. Koropella will be initiating meetings with the Tribal Council to determine ridership needs.

In response to a question from Chair Olmsted, Ms. Koropella agreed that the development of apartment complexes on McDowell Road coincides with the 2018 time frame for the proposed changes. She added that a VMS data collection system is being implemented to determine ridership volume.

- October, 2020:
 - Add trips on Shea Boulevard between 11:00 a.m. and 3:00 p.m. with an off peak frequency of 30 minutes and on peak frequency of 15 minutes, which will be consistent with Phoenix' frequencies.
 - Total cost estimate is approximately \$200,000.
- October, 2021:
 - Improve frequencies on Bell Road.
 - Implement Pinnacle Extension.
 - Increase weekday service on Miller Road to 20 minutes.
 - Total cost for all improvements for October, 2021 is approximately \$1 million.
- Federal grant monies are projected to be low over the five year period.
- No significant increases are expected from regional sales tax.
- For all proposed capital improvements, 11 buses are needed at a cost of approximately \$9.3 million.
 - Most buses are purchased via federal grant money with the historical split being 80 percent federal funds and 20 percent City funds. However, for the last trolleys purchased, federal funding was at 95 percent.
 - The local funds match has previously been drawn from regional and City sales tax funds. The City's portion of the estimated cost is \$1.87 million, assuming federal funds are available.
 - For 2016/2017, approximately \$370,000 is required to complete the improvements.
 - In 2018/2019, during the Scottsdale Limited and Airpark Trolley implementation, cost increase substantially.

A Commissioner asked about the extension of Prop 400. Ms. Clemann stated that there has been conversation at the regional level to get ahead of what will be required to pass an extension and an increase.

In response to a question from a Commissioner, Ms. Clemann stated that the location of the Perimeter Trolley is north of Pinnacle. Mr. Basha clarified that the Perimeter Trolley is not

included in the 2016 Master Plan and is located close to the Pima Freeway interchange with Pima Road and Princess Drive.

Chair Olmsted referred to operating expenses, noting that the Valley Metro contract is in the \$300,000 range through 2018/2019 and asked for an explanation on the jump to \$3.2 million in 2019/2020. Ms. Clemann stated that this reflects the implementation of the Scottsdale Limited. She clarified that the cost could drop \$1.5 million to \$2 million, if implemented with the trolley. Mr. Basha added that while the operating costs drop, there is the added factor of the cost of purchase of the trolleys at approximately \$600,000 each. Using City of Phoenix or Valley Metro's services, means that the City does not have to purchase trolleys.

7. ACCESSING PHOENIX SKY HARBOR

Mr. Basha provided the report. Highlights included:

- The agenda item addresses the question of whether there are better transportation service options between Sky Harbor Airport and the City of Scottsdale.
 - There are approximately four million annual visitors to Scottsdale with approximately half traveling by air.
 - Four airports are available in the area.
 - Personal vehicle use by travelers is much lower in Scottsdale than in other parts of the country and the percentage of rental vehicles is much higher.
 - The travel time from Sky Harbor to Scottsdale was determined and compared to three similar types of destinations from metropolitan airports.
 - Two modes are available for travel to Scottsdale from Sky Harbor, including automobiles, with several choices available, and transit, with only two choices currently available.
 - The most common route is from the 202 to the 101, followed by 44th Street connecting to four east/west streets, Priest and 64 Street, and then the remaining street networks.
 - To utilize a rental vehicle, travelers must first travel west from the terminals to the rental center, then back east in order to get to Scottsdale.
 - The expense of renting a vehicle at Sky Harbor is significant.
 - A direct shuttle from Sky Harbor to a car rental location in Scottsdale would ease that financial burden.
 - Taxi fees are quite high from Sky Harbor into Scottsdale.
 - Transit Routes include the light rail. Route 56 and Route 72 are operated by Valley Metro, as is the Hayden Road Route. Routes 56 and 72 connect to the Priest Washington Light Rail Station. Another possibility would be to use Bus Route 44 operated by the City of Phoenix, which connects to three east/west routes, including McDowell, Thomas and Indian School.
 - The Sky Train Station is located north of the Airport at the light rail station.
 - The Sky Train operates as a driverless service.
 - Service began in December of 2014, currently serving Terminals 3 and 4.
 - Within the next four years, it is hoped that the station will also serve the rental car center.
 - Communications with Sky Harbor indicate that a Scottsdale shuttle would be welcome. Sky Harbor would want the shuttle to utilize the Sky Train parking area and not operate in terminal areas.

- There are at least four possibilities for shuttles to connect Sky Harbor to Scottsdale.
 - Trolley route similar to the four currently in service.
 - Completely private operation not funded publicly.
 - Rental car companies could collaborate and operate a shuttle directly from Sky Harbor to the City of Scottsdale.
 - Hotels could operate such a service.

In response to a question from a Commissioner, Mr. Basha stated that in his experience as a rider, he felt safe using the Sky Train, that the track is completely access controlled and shares no intersections with other modes of travel.

A Commissioner noted that in southern Scottsdale, Enterprise has expanded their facility and that Hertz was expanding on McDowell.

In response to a question from Chair Olmsted, Mr. Basha stated that the Tourism Advisory Task Force has been invited to attend a Transportation Commission meeting and this is being considered for the fall.

A Commissioner suggested discussion on the possibility of driverless trains or fixed rail lines. Mr. Basha replied that the technology exists for driverless rail vehicles. However, the intellectual comfort does not yet exist for operating driverless rail vehicles that might interact with private vehicles.

A Commissioner suggested investigating the possibility of rail that does not utilize overhead wires. Mr. Basha stated that advances in battery recharging technology will make overhead electrical lines obsolete in the next five to ten years.

8. OTHER TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS AND PROGRAM STATUS

Mr. Basha provided the report. Highlights included:

- The Department has recently restriped Dixileta Road from 66th Street to Scottsdale Road. Commensurate with pavement resurfacing, the center two-way left-turn lane was narrowed, and motor vehicle lanes were narrowed in each direction. A four-foot shoulder was provided in each direction. It is not being called a bicycle lane and is not signed or marked as such, as the lane is narrower than four feet in some areas.
- The American Planning Association sponsored a bicycle tour of public art on April 2nd. The seven mile route featured eight art pieces in Downtown Scottsdale along the Arizona Canal and within the Indian Bend Wash Path System.
- A bicycle rack was dedicated at the bike stop on Thomas Road and the Indian Bend Wash earlier this month and was donated in memory of a physician from the Scottsdale Osborn Medical Center.
- April is Valley Bicycle Month. On Sunday, April 17th, there will be a Scottsdale Cycle the Art Event, consisting of an eight mile guided tour beginning at the Scottsdale Museum of the West.
- Wednesday, April 20th is Bike to Work Day.
- Starting the last week in April, there will be new changes to the bus system, the most substantive of which is ten minute service on Scottsdale Road Bus Route 72 from

- Scottsdale Fashion Square into Tempe to the Tempe Transit Center. This is the first bus route that operates at ten minute frequency for a scheduled period of the day.
- The Downtown Trolley is operating at ten minute frequency as of October of last year.
 - Route 81, the Hayden Road Bus will be better serving the Pavilions beginning in late April.

Chair Olmsted commented that in February, the Transportation Commission looked at the Capital Improvement Program and identified recommended projects to staff and to the City Council. He asked for an update on one or more of these projects. Mr. Basha stated that Capital Improvement planning has been expeditious in the last couple of months. The Transportation Commission discussed the Capital Improvement Plan, especially relative to a couple of bond projects. At the meeting in February, the Transportation Commission voted to recommend to the City Council that the Happy Valley Road Project that was included in the failed bond election last November be excluded and those funds be used in some other manner.

At its study session of March 1st, City Council took these recommendations well under advisement and voted to eliminate the Happy Valley Road Project from the Capital Improvement Plan. Following the Transportation Commission's discussions at the February meeting, they directed that the \$4 million in funds intended for Happy Valley Road be instead used for Downtown pedestrian improvements. Staff intends to present at the April 19th City Council study session a recommendation to spend \$2 million of these funds in the next fiscal year, with the next \$2 million to be spent in the following fiscal year. This will allow time to develop the plans necessary.

- During staff's presentation to the City Council at its upcoming study session, the presentation given by Ms. Koropella will be provided in a condensed format.
 - This discussion, however, will only include the next fiscal year expenditures.
 - In the fall or next year, City Council will be presented with the other aspects of the five year transit operating budget.
- Next Tuesday the City Council will discuss in study session the Transportation Master Plan as recommended by the Transportation Commission and the Transportation Department.
 - The study session will be televised.
 - It will include a brief presentation by the Transportation Department followed by a discussion among Council Members.
 - Public comments will be limited to items from the floor. Only five members of the public will be permitted to speak.
 - When the City Council has a public hearing and vote on the Transportation Master Plan, public comments will be encouraged and not constrained.

In response to a question from a Commissioner, Mr. Basha confirmed that the City Council has the authority to revise language in the Transportation Master Plan via vote. The vote is not binding, but would direct staff to make changes. After public hearing, a final vote on approval of Transportation Master Plan will take place.

- Traffic calming on Cattletrack Road from McDonald Road to Lincoln Road has long been discussed and construction commenced last week. Completion is anticipated by the end of May.

- Paving construction on State Route 101 Pima Freeway is being completed approximately six to nine months early. Final paving began last week and will continue for several weeks.

Chair Olmsted cited a Transportation Commission public comment that was received concerning pedestrian access to cross 90th or 92nd Street between Shea and Mountain View and asked for an update. Mr. Basha stated that this will be incorporated in the construction of the Mustang Transit Center. Design is slated for completion in the next three to six months, with construction to begin in early 2017 and ending in late 2018.

9. PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no public comments.

10. COMMISSION IDENTIFICATION OF FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

A Commissioner stated that Valley Metro has instituted the use of smart cards for their subsidized cab program and requested a report on this. Use of the card program allows tracking of usage and times.

11. ADJOURNMENT

With no further business to conduct, Chair Olmsted adjourned the regular meeting at 7:59 p.m.

SUBMITTED BY:

A/V Tronics, Inc. DBA AVTranz.

***Note: These are summary action meeting minutes only. A complete copy of the audio/video recording is available at <http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/transp.asp>**