



APPROVED
SUMMARIZED MINUTES

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING

THURSDAY, OCTOBER 15, 2015

KIVA – CITY HALL
3939 N. DRINKWATER BOULEVARD
SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA 85251

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Olmsted called the regular meeting of the Scottsdale Transportation Commission to order at 6:05 p.m.

1. **ROLL CALL**

PRESENT: Steven Olmsted, Chair
Paul Holley, Vice Chair
Gary Bretz, Commissioner
Barry Graham, Commissioner
Steven Rosenberg, Commissioner (Telephonic)
Robert Stickles, Commissioner

ABSENT: Jayme Sue McLaren, Commissioner

STAFF: Paul Basha, Director of Transportation
Frances Cookson, Staff Representative
Madeline Clemann, Transit Manager
Ratna Koropella, Principal Transit Planner

2. **PUBLIC COMMENT**

No members of the public wished to address the Commission.

3. **APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES**

- Study Session of the Transportation Commission - September 3, 2015
- Study Session of the Transportation Commission - September 17, 2015
- Regular Meeting of the Transportation Commission - September 17, 2015

VICE CHAIR HOLLEY MOVED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE STUDY SESSION MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 3, 2015 WITH CORRECTION AND THE STUDY SESSION MEETING AND REGULAR MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 17, 2015. COMMISSIONER BRETZ SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0). COMMISSIONER MCLAREN WAS ABSENT.

4. **TITLE VI**

Ms. Ratna Koropella, Principal Transit Planner, provided the report. Highlights of the presentation included:

- An overview of the history of the Title VI Program and how the funding is currently structured. The City of Phoenix is the designated recipient for the region and disburses funds to the City of Scottsdale for transit services, purchasing buses and building transit stops.
- Update requirements
 - As the designated recipient, the City of Phoenix is obligated to submit updates to the Title VI Program to the FTA every three years. In turn, Scottsdale must submit updates to Phoenix every three years.
 - The last update took place in 2012 and the City of Phoenix has required that the City of Scottsdale submit their updated plan by November 30th.
 - A new regulation passed by the FTA this year requires that all Title VI plans pass Council approval. Staff has scheduled submission to the Council in November.
- Elements of the Title VI Program includes: Notice to public, complaint form, complaint procedures, public participation plan, LEP (Limited English Proficiency) Plan, equity analysis and fix route transit provider analysis.
 - Notices to the public will be posted in English and Spanish at locations such as City Hall, libraries and the Commission's website. Individuals may file complaints of discrimination in regards to race, color or national origin. People who need assistance in other languages can be helped through the call center.
 - The complaint form requires the individual to provide their contact information, incident details, identify the basis of discrimination and state whether the complaint has been filed with the City of Scottsdale, City of Phoenix or the FDA.
 - Individuals have 180 days from the date of the incident to file a complaint. All complaints are logged into the Valley Metro Customer Assistance System. A closure letter will be sent to the complainant at the end of the investigation. If no violation is identified, the letter will indicate that the case is closed. If a violation has occurred, the findings and corrective actions will be explained. If the complainant is not satisfied with the results, they may appeal the complaint within 60 days. The FTA may audit complaint related files and some cases where additional investigation is required, it may take two to three years for a case to reach resolution.

- In Scottsdale, the City of Phoenix and Valley Metro provide service on local and express bus routes. Whoever provides the service normally handles the Title VI complaints for those services. The City of Scottsdale deals only with complaints related to trolley service. The City received no Title VI complaints regarding the trolley system during the last three years.
- The public participation plan requires public outreach prior to any changes in fee or service changes. Public outreach must include focus on low income and minority populations and limited English proficiency individuals. Valley Metro performs public outreach for the entire region. City of Scottsdale brings items before the Transportation Commission, particularly in reference to service and trolley changes. The public is invited to comment at Commission meetings. In addition, staff conducts other public outreach.
- The LEP Plan requires improved access to those with limited English proficiency. Valley Metro has performed extensive LEP analysis for the entire region and staff will be endorsing most of the plan. The four factors of the analysis are:
 - Identifying where LEP individuals live.
 - Identifying how often these individuals come in contact with the system.
 - Analyzing must address the importance of services to LEP individuals and what the City is doing to assist them.
 - Analyzing the resources available to reach out to these individuals and the level of funding used for this purpose on an annual basis.
- Valley Metro has determined that 81 percent of the LEP population in the region is Spanish speaking. In Scottsdale specifically, the LEP population consists of a significant number of Spanish speaking individuals, followed by Chinese. The majority of the LEP population resides in southern Scottsdale.
- Outreach methods to the City of Scottsdale LEP population includes printing trolley brochures into French, Chinese, Russian and Spanish. Valley Metro prints all brochures in Spanish and English. Many bus staff members are bilingual and announcements on buses are made in English and Spanish. Staff interacts with community organizations and performs outreach to assist the LEP population in accessing the transit system.
- The City of Scottsdale prints brochures in different languages at a cost of \$3,000 annually. Valley Metro spends approximately \$20,000 to \$25,000 for document translations and interpreter service at public meetings.
- The planning stage of construction of storage or maintenance facilities must include equity analysis, including identification of low income and minority populations and steps to address health and human concerns. There were no such construction projects by the City of Scottsdale during the previous three years.
- A fixed route transit provider analysis is required only if the population exceeds 200,000 with operation of more than 50 vehicles. The City of Scottsdale meets the population threshold of 200,000, but does not operate more than 50 vehicles, therefore an analysis is not required at this time. Scottsdale operates just 21 trolleys.

Highlights of the ensuing discussion included:

- A Commissioner inquired as to complaints in the region as a whole. Ms. Koropella confirmed the receipt of complaints by Valley Metro and the City of Phoenix. All complaints were resolved without lawsuits or other legal filings and no issues required

- action by the City of Scottsdale. Ms. Madeline Clemann, Transit Manager recalled that the most recent complaint affecting the City of Scottsdale was filed in 2012 in regards to the functionality of wheelchair lifts on older vehicles. This complaint was forwarded directly to the U.S. Justice Department, taking two to three years to reach final resolution.
- In response to a question from a Commissioner, Ms. Koropella indicated that the old complaint form is on the City's website, however, staff will be endorsing Valley Metro's more user-friendly form and will be updating it online in the near future.
 - A Commissioner asked about the level of service available for out of country non-English speaking visitors. Ms. Clemann replied that Scottsdale is the only Valley jurisdiction to print brochures in five languages. Cards are also given to visitors which provide contact information for translation assistance through the City's main phone number.
 - A Commissioner commented on the importance of outreach via social media.

COMMISSIONER STICKLES MOVED TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF THE UPDATED TITLE VI IMPLEMENTATION PLAN FOR TRANSIT SERVICES TO THE SCOTTSDALE CITY COUNCIL. VICE CHAIR HOLLEY SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0). COMMISSIONER MCLAREN WAS ABSENT.

5. **TRANSPORTATION BOND UPDATE**

Paul Basha, Director of Transportation provided an update in response to the Commission's request for detailed information regarding the transportation issue on the November 3rd bond election. Highlights of the presentation included:

- Five projects are included: Hayden/Chaparral intersection, Happy Valley Road segment from Pima to Alma School, Highland Avenue two block segment, sidewalk projects throughout downtown Scottsdale and two miles of bicycle lanes on McDowell Road.
 - Hayden and Chaparral Road includes two components with a total cost of \$2.5 million. The existing northbound right turn lane would be extended and a multi-use path would be constructed under Chaparral Road immediately east of Hayden Road.

A Commissioner voiced agreement with the plan, noting that the Villa Monterey golf course has been converted to trails and parks and is underutilized, due to inaccessibility.

A Commissioner agreed that the right-turn lane requires improvements and asked about a timeline for completion. Mr. Basha replied that the none of the five projects have yet reached the design phase. If the bond is approved, the sale of bonds could commence this calendar year with work beginning early 2016.

- The Happy Valley Road project is a two-mile segment from Pima Road to Alma School Parkway.
 - Currently, most of the roadway segment is one lane per direction. The project would provide two motor vehicle lanes and one bicycle lane per direction.

- The estimated cost of the bond to the City is approximately \$4.8 million. Regional funding for the project totals approximately \$11.3 million, for a total project cost of \$16.1 million.
- Several years ago the intersection of Pima and Happy Valley Roads were reconfigured to a reverse curve. There are currently two through motor vehicle lanes in each direction and two left-turn lanes for westbound to southbound traffic. After the reverse curve, the roadway narrows to one motor vehicle lane per direction with no bicycle lanes. This project would provide left turn lanes and medians between Pima Road and Alma School Parkway.
- The intersection of Alma School Parkway and Happy Valley Road currently operates as a four-way stop controlled intersection with two motor vehicle lanes per direction. This intersection is being considered for a roundabout. Roundabouts generate substantially less delay than conventional traffic signals, have a much lower collision frequency and when collisions occur, resulting injuries are much less severe than typical traffic signal locations.

In response to a question from Vice Chair Holley, Mr. Basha stated he believed the roadway would have shoulders and not curbs, although he was not certain of this.

- The Highland Avenue project is a two block segment which runs from Goldwater Boulevard to Scottsdale Road and includes both intersection and pedestrian improvements at a cost of \$2.1 million.
 - Highland Avenue is immediately north of Scottsdale Fashion Square and south of the Optima Condominiums. Improvements are planned at the Scottsdale and Highland intersection and the Goldwater and Highland intersection.
 - At Scottsdale and Highland, eastbound to northbound left-turn movement is very heavy. One option for consideration is the implementation of three left-turn lanes. This project is in the early planning stages.
 - The Highland intersection is very skewed. Vehicles coming westbound to merge and travel southbound on Goldwater have a difficult angle. A roundabout is being considered for this intersection.
 - A crosswalk located in the two block segment is currently controlled by flashing yellow lights, however drivers are not currently obligated to stop or slow down. The location is being considered for a pedestrian hybrid beacon, or HAWK.
 - Residents living north of Chaparral Road have contacted staff requesting a multi-use path from their homes to Fashion Square. An underpass running beneath Goldwater boulevard is being considered.
 - A nearly completed construction project on Chaparral Road west of Scottsdale Road will dramatically improve the operation of the Scottsdale Chaparral intersection and provide traffic calming on Chaparral Road.

A Commissioner inquired as to the effects of tightening downtown Scottsdale to one lane each way on the traffic needs of the Goldwater express route. Mr. Basha replied that this has been considered and remains a dilemma. A roundabout would be less disruptive than a traffic signal. The Commissioner suggested the possibility of elimination of the road. Mr. Basha acknowledged that this had not yet been considered. He added that this portion of Highland Avenue was the only access to the left for Optima residents. Other possibilities include a merging approach.

A Commissioner stated that prior to the Highland intersection on Goldwater, there are three lanes of traffic with two lanes of feeding traffic from Scottsdale Road. He suggested that there be two lanes with a merge-in lanes bringing it to three lanes after the intersection. Mr. Basha shared that staff's observations indicate a need for Goldwater to remain at three lanes in this segment, as it accommodates heavy traffic flows.

The Commissioner suggested that residents in the area of the potential HAWK be asked to contribute ten percent towards construction costs. Staff intends to have this discussion with residential and commercial developments in this area.

- Downtown Scottsdale sidewalk project
 - This is generally bounded by Goldwater to the west, Drinkwater to the east, Camelback to the north and Osborn to the south at a maximum expenditure of bonds at \$4 million.
 - Project goals include widening sidewalks, removing obstacles, eliminating hills in sidewalks and inserting ramps at intersections.

In response to a question from a Commissioner, Mr. Basha stated that a former traffic engineer designed Scottsdale's downtown sidewalks. He confirmed that brick will only be removed where there is a lack of vehicular traffic as well as much pedestrian traffic. Concepts will be presented to the Commission prior to final design.

A Commissioner suggested the location of the Sugar Bowl ice cream shop for the construction of a HAWK specifically for pedestrian safety. He suggested using a more heat-resistant material.

A Commissioner stated that the suggested sidewalk improvements are critically needed whether or not bond funding is available. Mr. Basha replied that if the bond initiative fails, improvements would be made on a piecemeal basis. It was included in the bond initiative in order that it be accomplished comprehensively. In response to a question from Vice Chair Holley, Mr. Basha stated that an improvement district for the downtown area would be a reasonable option, should the bond fail. However, such discussions have taken place for 30 years without fruition.

- McDowell Road bicycle lanes
 - The plan includes the addition of bicycle roads along McDowell Road at a maximum \$1.3 million bond expenditure.
 - McDowell Road from 64th Street to Pima Road is three miles long, with only one mile of bicycle lanes.
 - The median and motor vehicle lanes will be narrowed to accommodate the bike lanes. McDowell Road would remain three vehicle lanes per direction.
 - A circulating email falsely suggests that the Commission has planned to reduce McDowell Road to two lanes in order to accommodate the construction of a light rail system.

Chairman Olmsted commented that the Commission has discussed high capacity transit at length over the last six months, which may account for some of the speculation being generated.

- Mr. Basha reviewed that voters are being asked to approve approximately \$96 million in bonds.
- Approval of the bond would result in an increased tax rate of approximately 11 cents per year per \$100 of assessed valuation.
- The average assessed value for house in the City of Scottsdale is \$371,000. Therefore, the increase in property tax would be approximately \$43 a year.

Highlights of the ensuing discussion included:

- Vice Chair Holley commented that other portions of the property tax are slated for reduction in the future. Mr. Basha agreed, adding that the proposed increase would have a life of 20 to 30 years.
- A Commissioner pointed out that there is a difference between the average value of a house and its assessed value. Mr. Basha agreed, noting that the assessed valuation is provided by the State government. In response to another question from the Commissioner, Mr. Basha confirmed that \$96 million is the maximum requested amount, however, the approved total could be lower.
- Chair Olmsted commented on the Commission's historical success in identifying funding sources and he commended the resource structure and operations, considering all the factors involved in accomplishing goals with the capital improvement program. The five proposed projects unfortunately do not fall within the funding parameters of the Commission and that is why the bond approach was undertaken.

6. **TRANSPORTATION MASTER PLAN UPDATE**

Mr. Basha provided the presentation. Highlights of the presentation included:

- Bus and Trolley Operations
 - Airpark Trolley
 - On the east side of the Airpark, the proposed route ended before Northsight Boulevard. Staff suggests that it be extended further east to serve Northsight Boulevard and a portion of Hayden Road. This would serve employees of retail businesses between Northsight Boulevard and Pima Road. One disadvantage is that Hayden Road is a high speed, high volume street not necessarily conducive to trolley routes.
 - The route on the west side of the Airport has not changed.
 - Staff suggests a ten-hour service day from 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. with 15-minute frequency. This would require four new vehicles at a cost per vehicle of \$700,000. Federal and regional funds would cover a significant portion.
 - The operating expense is estimated to be \$700,000.
 - Scottsdale Limited
 - The original proposal consisted of three stops: including Scottsdale Road/Thunderbird Park and Ride, Scottsdale Fashion Square and the University and Rural Road light rail station.
 - In April 2016 the frequency of Route 72 will increase from 20 minutes to ten minutes from Scottsdale Fashion Square to south of the light rail station. This provides a rationale to have the Scottsdale Limited run from the Thunderbird

Park and Ride to Scottsdale Fashion Square, where riders could transfer to the Route 72.

- The cost for the three stop service at ten-minute frequency for 13 hours of operation would require seven new vehicles at a cost of approximately \$700,000 per vehicle. If using the current Scottsdale trolley service, the cost would be approximately \$1.5 million per year in operations. If using Valley Metro, the cost would be approximately \$4.1 million per year. The Scottsdale trolley system is free to riders, whereas Valley Metro and City of Phoenix service requires fare collection. Although counterintuitive, providing free service costs substantially less, in part because it does not require a fare box and all that is required to maintain the fare system.
- A two-stop operation for 13 hours of operation at ten-minute frequency would require five new vehicles at a cost of approximately \$700,000 per vehicle. Operating costs would total approximately \$1 million for Scottsdale Trolley and \$2.9 million for Valley Metro.
- Hayden Road bus route
 - The route will be changed slightly later this month. The route currently operates on Hayden Road to Via de Ventura and then to Pima Road. The route will be changed to Indian Bend Road, rather than Via de Ventura.
 - The Commission previously directed staff to deviate the route slightly to the Honor Hospital at Pima Road and Shea Boulevard, then returning the route to Hayden Road to continue its connection to Northsight Boulevard. The change requires no increase in cost.
 - The change would require implementation of the Cactus trolley, which would replace Hayden Road on 94th Street. Staff suggests that the Cactus route continue east on Via Linda to Desert Mountain High School. Staff also suggests that the route travel on Frank Lloyd Wright Boulevard from 90th Street to 100th Street.
 - Staff assume 12 hours of operation with 15-minute frequency requiring six new vehicles at a cost of \$700,000 each. The vast majority of the expenditure would come from federal and regional funds. Annual operating costs would be \$1.4 million.

Vice Chair Holley referred to the Cactus Trolley dashed line options and suggested that the solid line options would suffice. Mr. Basha pointed out that without the dashed line options, there is not service to homes and business in the area. He added that one of the two dashed line options would consist of a circular route with the trolley operating both clockwise and counterclockwise.

Vice Chair Holley commented that the areas of 94th Street and Villa Linda consist of several multi-family developments, where the area of Cactus, 96th Street and Frank Lloyd Wright are not densely populated. Mr. Basha commented that implementation is three years out and that routes will be refined prior to that time. The benefit of including it in the Transportation Master Plan now is that if adopted, the Commission can begin financial planning.

Vice Chair Holley inquired as to the level of assistance from the federal government on operating costs. Mr. Basha replied that levels vary year to year from 80 to 95 percent funding. Ms. Clemann added that federal operating revenues account for a very small portion of the budget at less than \$1 million of the total \$10 million budget. Total federal capital funds received are much higher when additional vehicles are needed. This amount varies and is

slated for reduction. Preventative maintenance funding is received through the contract; this year approximately \$359,000 has been received.

A Commissioner commented that he did not see the need for either the Cactus or Airpark trolleys, seeing the areas as islands that do not sufficiently connect to larger networks. He added that the Airpark consists of vehicular commuters. A Commissioner commented that some of the routes do connect and suggested providing a single map to illustrate all proposed and existing routes. Ms. Clemann agreed, noting that all suggested routes connect into the regional system. Mr. Basha added that there are several interconnections of routes as well.

In response to a comment from Vice Chair Holley, Mr. Basha stressed that this is a master plan with no completion years attached to any of the routes. All are subject to change and development over time. Chair Olmsted reminded attendees that the placeholder routes and stops had been presented to the Commission by staff months ago and today's presentation provided a wider view of the future design concepts.

A Commissioner commented on the Age Friendly Scottsdale Group, which endeavors to assist seniors in remaining in their homes as they age. This and other groups may like to see additional routes in northern Scottsdale.

Chair Olmsted discussed the process that led the Commission to adopt a plan to utilize hybrid biodiesel electric busses. This included the needs for extensive facility upgrades and training. He suggested a future update to review operations.

A Commissioner stated that he would like to see the graphics presented today incorporated in the Master Plan perhaps with the addition of potential transfer points.

- Chaparral Road from Miller Road to 78th Street
 - There has been consideration to widen a two block portion of Chaparral Road from one lane to two lanes per direction.
 - Traffic volumes remained consistent from 1996 through the most recent analysis in 2014.
 - In 2000, when the Pima Freeway served Chaparral Road, there were slightly less than 19,000 vehicles per day in the two block segment. In 2014, there were slightly more than 17,000.
 - Approximately 50 homes front Chaparral Road between Miller and 78th Street. Over 40 have been purchased in the last ten years. A suggestion has been made to purchase these homes and widen the street to two lanes per direction.
 - At the Commission's September 3rd meeting, an audience member addressed this topic in reference to traffic volume increase in this area and potential improvement, were Camelback Road to be an interchange at the freeway, rather than Chaparral Road.
 - Chaparral Road serves Scottsdale Community College, a very important destination for travel on the freeway as well as from within Scottsdale.
 - At the time the freeway was planned and constructed 25 years ago, the closest interchange spacing was one mile, at Indian School Road, which must remain an interchange.
 - Camelback Road would be a one-half mile separation from Indian School Road and Chaparral Road.

- It would be contrary to ADOT and federal policy to have interchanges at one-half mile separation. The federal policy requires two miles between interchanges.
- Camelback Road does not connect with the existing Pima Road or a potential freeway.
- Sixty homes front Camelback Road from 82nd Street to Pima Road. This means that one group of direct frontage homeowners would be traded for another group if the interchange is at Pima and Camelback, rather than the freeway and Chaparral. In addition, an elementary school fronts Camelback Road.
- 2035 traffic volume projections
 - Between 2014 and 2035, the model predicts a 15 percent increase in daily traffic volumes.
 - In the past 20 years, there has been a 20 percent increase in traffic volumes.
 - From 2004 to 2014, economic conditions led to a five percent decrease in traffic volumes.
 - Between 1994 to 2004, there was a 27 percent increase in traffic volumes.
 - On a per person basis, travelers move 15 to 16 miles per day city wide, relatively low compared to national averages. This is not predicted to change through 2035.
 - The total 2014 population traveling per day was approximately 217,000 and the predicted 2035 total is approximately 390,000 per day.
 - Prior to construction of the freeway, the daily vehicle miles traveled totalled 21.

In response to a question from Vice Chair Holley, Mr. Basha stated that the population increases at an approximate rate of one percent per year.

A Commissioner commented that the one lane each way configuration on Chaparral Road is a result of unfortunate history.

A Commissioner referred to the unique level of volume in the Chaparral Road segment and asked if the proposal was to purchase the homes on both the north and south side of the street, which Mr. Basha confirmed. In response to question from the Commissioner, Mr. Basha opined that if the proposal were enacted, there would be an increase in traffic flows on Chaparral Road, particularly because Indian School Road is currently at 125 percent of capacity.

7. **OTHER TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS AND PROGRAMS STATUS**

Mr. Basha provided the update. Highlights of the presentation included:

- The downtown trolley route had been revised and a new Camelback Road trolley has been added.
 - Service begins in two weeks. Effective October 26th, the downtown trolley route will be at ten-minute frequency, increased from previous 15 to 20 minute frequencies.
 - The Camelback Road trolley will replace Camelback Road Bus Route 50 between Fashion Square and Scottsdale Community College. The route will begin at 6:00 a.m. and end at 10:00 p.m. with ten-minute frequency.

- The hotel bed tax is funding the service, rather than the transportation tax.
- The transportation tax is funding the new Camelback Road trolley.
- The City of Phoenix Route 50 in Camelback Road will terminate at Fashion Square with transfer opportunities to Scottsdale Community College.
- Transportation Department representatives will be available at Fashion Square to assist travelers in using the trolley.
- The Anasazi multi-use path is located on Cactus Road between 124th Street and 128th Street.
 - The first one-third of the half-mile path has been constructed.
 - Discussions continue with the neighborhood for the other two-third portion.
 - The student drop-off area at 124th Street and the driveway into Anasazi School was funded by the school district.
- On October 27th, George Williams will provide a presentation during Council work study session on roundabouts, specifically the success of the Hayden Northside roundabout over the past 18 months.
- On November 10th, the Council will consider awarding the construction contract for the Arizona Canal multi-use path from Chaparral Road to Indian Bend Road. Collaboration was conducted with neighborhoods east and west of the canal to locate the multi-use path.
 - The two mile concrete path construction will provide a continuous concrete multi-use path from the western border with Phoenix to the eastern border with the Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community, with a connection to the south border with Tempe.
 - There has been renewed opposition to the project and there may be individuals at the Council meeting to speak against the construction award.
 - The planning process occurred over a five year time frame.

Vice Chair Holley inquired about an update to the multi-use path between Camelback and Chaparral. Mr. Basha replied that a portion of the missing segment has been paved recently and is open for use. This portion is immediately south of Chaparral Road. A missing segment remains farther to the south, closer to Camelback Road. The adjacent developer has been stipulated to construct the path. It is hoped that the development will occur, however there is potential that it will not. If it is not developed, there is contemplation that it will be constructed with City funds with reimbursement to be made by the developer.

Chairman Olmsted commended staff on the progress of the Anasazi project and inquired as to any resident concerns. Mr. Basha confirmed that multiple conversations have occurred with representatives of the neighborhood. Staff provided the community with two development options and residents are in the process of discussing these options.

Multiple conversations have also taken place with the Preserve Director as well as the Fire Chief, which has allowed for a design which minimizes the width of the concrete path. One identified path segment will be 12 feet of concrete width with four feet of stabilized soil shoulder on each side. Another portion will be eight feet wide with stabilized shoulders being six feet. The Preserve Director has accepted an alignment that encroaches upon the Preserve; the City will have to acquire the portion of the current Preserve that will be included in the multi-use path. The neighborhood collaboration efforts include allowing residents to select vegetation.

A Commissioner identified an elevation concern in the area of the pathway located at Anasazi School, to which Mr. Basha replied that the area was a loading and unloading area for the school and that the sidewalk location adjacent to the curb was common throughout the country and does not violate accessibility requirements. He added that painting of the curb has been contemplated.

8. **PUBLIC COMMENT**

There were no public comments.

9. **COMMISSION IDENTIFICATION AND FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

There were no items to report.

10. **ADJOURNMENT**

With no further business to conduct, Chair Olmsted adjourned the regular meeting at 9:00 p.m.

SUBMITTED BY:

A/V Tronics, Inc. DBA AVTranz.

***Note: These are summary action meeting minutes only. A complete copy of the audio/video recording is available at <http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/transp.asp>**