



SUMMARIZED MINUTES

**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
SPECIAL MEETING**

THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 3, 2015

**KIVA – CITY HALL
3939 N. DRINKWATER BOULEVARD
SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA 85251**

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Olmsted called the regular meeting of the Scottsdale Transportation Commission to order at 6:02 p.m.

1. **ROLL CALL**

PRESENT: Steven Olmsted, Chair
Paul Holley, Vice Chair
Gary Bretz, Commissioner
Barry Graham, Commissioner
Steven Rosenberg, Commissioner
Robert Stickles, Commissioner

STAFF: Rose Arballo, Coordinator
Paul Basha, Director of Transportation
Walter Brodzinski, Right of Way Supervisor
Madeline Clemann, Transit Manager
Susan Conklu, Senior Transportation Planner
Holly Walter, Public Information Officer

2. **PUBLIC COMMENT**

No public comment was received.

3. **DRAFT GENERAL PLAN 2035**

Transportation Director Mr. Paul Basha addressed the draft General Plan 2035.

Highlights of the presentation included:

- General Plan Circulation Element
 - The Commission received a presentation of the General Plan in June 2015 and recommended several changes to the Circulation Element.
 - The Transportation Department and the Planning and Development Department request that Commissioners vote on a recommendation to City Council regarding the policies as presented. The policies will then be incorporated into the General Plan document that will go before the Scottsdale City Council for deliberations in late September. It is anticipated that Scottsdale voters will be provided with a recommended General Plan for their vote in 2016.

Chair Olmsted explained that the purpose for this discussion is to begin conversation concerning the next Transportation Master Plan. In order for the document to be complete and of utmost quality, there is a need for connectivity to the General Plan.

Chair Olmsted stated that the Transportation Commission had two main areas of focus when looking at the transportation portion of the General Plan. First, the City's excellent history with regard to urban development and sustainable neighborhoods and secondly, being protective of the relationship between the natural and built environments. With this in mind, the Commission felt it is important to honor much of what was contained in the 2008 Transportation Master Plan.

The main factors focused upon were sustainability in urban planning and how the transportation system impacts planning, how it ages, and what it is costing the City. It is important that the Transportation Commission focus on a re-definition of sustainability in today's terms. Resulting questions include whether the General Plan reasonably reflects concerns on sustainability, urban development, the relationship between the natural and built environment and whether it addresses all modes, including equestrian, pedestrian, automobile, trolley, modern street car, or other modalities.

Chair Olmsted opened the floor for public comment.

Mr. Ross Smith, a resident of Scottsdale for 47 years has spent 18 years working on City planning and later as a Planning Commissioner. His comments focused on the southern Scottsdale area from downtown to Tempe. He suggested that the plan include an element addressing fixed route transit. Specifically, he recommended a designation of the area of Scottsdale Road from downtown Scottsdale south to Tempe to connect to the light rail system. A fixed route approach is necessary for investors, property owners, and developers to understand that the City is firmly committed to a fixed route permanent system. He cited the Sun Link modern street car system in Tucson as an example.

Highlights of ensuing discussion included:

- A Commissioner asked whether Mr. Smith had ridden the street car in Tucson or the light rail in Phoenix, and asked about his personal experience. Mr. Smith had ridden only the light rail. He found it was extremely efficient and that it serviced a large number of residents.
- A Commissioner questioned the reasoning behind connecting downtown Scottsdale straight from Scottsdale Road to Tempe, as opposed to connecting to the light rail at

Galvin Parkway. Mr. Smith replied that one major benefit of a fixed route system is that it stimulates revitalization.

- Chair Olmsted suggested that for anyone seeking a more in-depth explanation as to the evolution of these discussions, it might be helpful to review the video of the October Transportation Commission meeting. This video is available on the City's website (<http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/transportation-commission>). He reiterated the importance of the Commission to be receptive to all opinions for and against the various options. He noted that one particular polarizing topic was discussion of what type of individuals ride the light rail and what types of development are attributable along light rail routes. He reminded attendees that this was an all modes exploration. The consensus of Commissioners was that the conversation on high capacity transit was the one mode that had not been formalized. For this reason, the item was brought forward in the last six months. Two relevant areas of exploration were to address the needs of residents with limited transportation options and to provide a gateway for residents, conventioners, and visitors.

VICE CHAIR HOLLEY MOVED TO APPROVE THE PROPOSED REVISION TO THE DRAFT GENERAL PLAN 2035 AS PRESENTED BY STAFF. COMMISSIONER STICKLES SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0).

4. TRANSPORTATION MASTER PLAN UPDATE

Mr. Basha provided a presentation on the Transportation Master Plan. He asked for direction from the Commission as to which trolley and bus options they would like included in the Transportation Master Plan.

Highlights of the presentation included:

- Scottsdale is a net importer of jobs. This is important because long-range planners make their determinations based on the number of jobs compared with the number of households. Scottsdale has nearly twice as many jobs as households; therefore, workers must commute back and forth into the city.
 - Approximately 55 percent of those who work in Scottsdale live elsewhere.
 - Approximately 28 percent of people live in Scottsdale and work elsewhere.
 - Approximately 17 percent both live and work in Scottsdale.
- Focusing on the downtown area, there are approximately 40,000 employees.
 - Approximately 38 percent of these employees travel less than ten miles from home to work. These individuals are likely to use a good transit system.
 - Approximately 46 percent of these employees travel between 10 and 24 miles to work. These people are also likely to use an excellent bus or trolley system.
- The largest numbers of employees come from the southeast Valley, including Mesa, Gilbert, Chandler, and Tempe. The second highest number come from the west, from the City of Phoenix. Commuters from northwest Phoenix, Glendale, and Peoria are the third largest group, followed by commuters from Tempe, other parts of Scottsdale, and Fountain Hills.

- In the Airpark area, there are also approximately 40,000 employees.
 - Approximately one-third travel less than 10 miles.
 - Approximately half travel 10 to 24 miles. Individuals in these groups are likely to use a good transit system, as they use relatively short routes.
 - Approximately 20 percent travel more than 25 miles.
 - Most commuters come from Phoenix, Glendale, and Peoria. The second largest group comes from the south, including Scottsdale and Tempe, followed by commuters from Mesa, Gilbert and Chandler.

- Mr. Basha discussed how changing demographics in Scottsdale affect the need for increased transportation options. The percentage of residents over the age of 74 is increasing in Scottsdale, but declining in Phoenix. Many in this group should not be driving and should have access to more transportation options.
 - While those over 74 years of age represent 9 percent of the population, approximately 12 percent of the collisions in Scottsdale involve this age group.
 - The percentage of the population from ages 65 to 74 is also increasing. In 2000, these individuals represented 9 percent of the total. In 2010, they represented 11 percent. Many people in this age group still work and actively volunteer.
 - People over 65 tend to have more visits with doctors and hospitals, and need alternative travel options.
 - For the individuals in the age group from 45 to 64 years old, Scottsdale's percentage is increasing, whereas in Phoenix, this age group is decreasing. Within 10 to 20 years, they will likely be retired or working part-time.

- Mr. Basha discussed the land use composition of the City and the street system, with reference to the capacity at which streets are operating.
- Approximately 25 percent of the City's arterial streets are over or near capacity. Approximately 45 percent are between 50 percent and 80 percent capacity. Thirty percent are at less than 50 percent capacity. This excess capacity means that too many resources are devoted to cars.
- The collector street system is functioning well with little need for change at this time.
- Six segments in the City are over capacity. Fourteen segments are at 90 percent, 33 at 80 percent, 29 at 70 percent, and 44 at 60 percent.
 - The areas of over-capacity are at Indian School Road between downtown and Pima Roads, as well as a segment of Chaparral Road. This portion of the City runs from the Tempe border to Indian Bend Road.
 - Within 80 percent of capacity are parts of Scottsdale Road, 68th Street, Camelback Road, Chaparral, Indian School Road, and Miller Road.
 - Most streets south of Indian Bend are within 50 to 80 percent capacity, or are at less than 50 percent capacity.
- The portion of the City between Indian Bend Road and Pinnacle Peak Road shows over capacity at portions of Scottsdale Road, Cactus Road, and Shea Boulevard.
- Other portions of Scottsdale Road, Cactus Road, Shea Boulevard and portions of Frank Lloyd Wright Boulevard are within 80 percent capacity.
- For the northern part of the City, most streets are operating well with some congestion on Scottsdale Road and a short segment of Pima Road.
- A suggestion for possible inclusion in the Transportation Master Plan addresses Scottsdale Road between Drinkwater and Goldwater. The street is currently two lanes

- per direction. This couplet system was constructed in the 80s to early 90s in response to a one-time idea in the 70s to widen Scottsdale Road to three lanes per direction, which never happened. The couplet was intended to bypass the downtown area to accommodate thru traffic.
- A review of 2014 traffic volumes shows that couplet roadways are underutilized in comparison to Scottsdale Road and downtown.
 - Staff suggests consideration for narrowing a portion of Scottsdale Road from two lanes per direction to one lane per direction, as there is plenty of capacity for these vehicles on Goldwater and Drinkwater.
 - At Scottsdale Road south of Main Street, currently with two lanes per direction, there is angle parking on the east side with insufficient angle parking on the west side. If narrowed to one lane per direction, there would be space for angle parking in front of all businesses on Scottsdale Road from Camelback Road to north of Osborn Road. It would also allow for bicycle lanes and provide safer passage for pedestrians crossing the road.
 - Mr. Basha displayed a rendering prepared ten years ago, when the City of Scottsdale was contemplating its last General Plan. It includes one travel lane and one parallel parking lane. The plan includes a wide sidewalk and/or outdoor patio dining for restaurants.
 - The next street for consideration is Chaparral Road between Miller Road and 78th Street. This two block segment of the street is one lane per direction. The remainder of Chaparral is two lanes per direction. High traffic volumes cause congestion on this segment between Miller Road and 78th Street. In addition, there is high volume and congestion on Indian School Road from downtown Scottsdale to Pima Road.
 - 2014 statistics show volumes of 40,000 vehicles per day at Indian School Road. Part of Camelback Road shows volumes of 20,000. The streets up to two miles north and south are in the vicinity of 20,000 vehicles per day. Indian Bend, McDonald, most of Chaparral, Indian School, and Thomas Roads are two lanes per direction with McDowell Road being three lanes per direction. Camelback Road ends prior to reaching Pima Road. There are very low traffic volumes on Camelback Road between Hayden and Granite Reef. Volumes on Camelback Road west of Hayden are relatively high.
 - Chaparral Road is at 50 to 80 percent capacity, except for the designated two block area, where it exceeds 100 percent. Indian School Road exceeds 100 percent from 116 to 123 percent capacity.
 - Indian School Road was reconstructed approximately five years ago at two lanes per direction, even though the Transportation Master Plan at the time indicated a need for three lanes. The decision to construct at two lanes per direction has directly resulted in high capacities on Chaparral Road within the two designated blocks.
 - For the past few years, there have been ongoing complaints by residents fronting Chaparral Road, especially as it relates to speeding traffic exceeding the 30 miles per hour speed limit.
 - Another complaint is that the traffic lights on Miller Road and Hayden Road are red too long. This is intended to discourage traffic on this portion of Chaparral Road.
 - McDonald Drive is one mile north of Chaparral. Prior to the construction of the Pima Freeway, residents whose homes faced McDonald drive approached the

City and requested that their homes be purchased, because they did not want to live on a street that had an interchange with the Pima Freeway. The City granted the request. A linear park was constructed in the area where the homes were removed. Mr. Basha suggested that the Transportation Commission consider the same approach for Chaparral Road between Miller Road and 78th Street. The same approach has also been undertaken on Indian School Road west of 68th Street.

Highlights of ensuing discussion included:

- Vice Chair Holley asked about assurances for proper public review and comment prior to inclusion in the Master Plan. Mr. Basha indicated that all slides included in his presentation have been available on the website and have been viewed by approximately 300 people. In addition, there will be an electronic public forum to gather input, including Transportation Tuesday events during which comments and suggestions are discussed. Comments will continue to be received over the next two to three months prior to the Commission making a final recommendation.
- Vice Chair Holley noted the absence of any funding proposals. Mr. Basha replied that funding options would not be explored until staff is directed to do so by the Transportation Commission and City Council. Once the Transportation Master Plan is adopted, staff can prepare capital improvement programs to begin the final planning design process and eventual construction.
- A Commissioner noted that this agenda item was designated as an action item; however, was presented for information only. Mr. Basha confirmed that his review of the slides was informational only. The second half of his presentation focused on bus and trolley lines and a request for recommendation.
- A Commissioner commented on the importance of receiving input from residents between Miller Road and 78th Street, the location of the proposed housing removal area. Mr. Basha replied that prior to any request for a draft recommendation to City Council, staff will provide all comments received from the public.
- A Commissioner asked for justification on the narrowing of Scottsdale Road to one lane per direction compared to the possibilities of light rail. Mr. Basha noted that per the Commission's direction, staff has offered ideas for light rail or modern streetcar, but that these proposals are projected for the year 2040. Downtown Scottsdale Road is not included as a possibility. The suggested light rail corridor would be on Goldwater Boulevard to the west of Scottsdale Road or potentially 68th Street to the west.
- A Commissioner pointed out the importance of receiving input from downtown businesses on Scottsdale Road that would be impacted by the reduction in traffic lanes. Mr. Basha noted that staff has made this presentation to the Convention and Visitors Bureau. Attendees, many of them owners of businesses on Scottsdale Road, were overwhelmingly supportive of narrowing downtown Scottsdale Road to one lane.
- Chairman Olmsted commented that members of the Commission take this issue very seriously and that the items contained in this presentation have been continuously presented to the Commission over the last year. The Commission has endeavored to concurrently attempt to improve methods by which it looks at the capital improvement program. He acknowledged the many challenges of completing life cycle analyses in regarding costs to build, maintain and operate infrastructure, and what to do when a project reaches the end of its life cycle.

Mr. Basha addressed bus and trolley routes.

Highlights of the presentation included:

- The seasonal monthly variation of bus and trolley ridership reflects a low level ridership in June, July and December. The rest of the year is relatively high. Scottsdale Road is the highest boarding route, followed by trolley routes.
- On a per mile basis, the neighborhood trolley has approximately 72 riders per mile and Thomas and Indian School Roads have approximately 65 to 70 riders per mile. Scottsdale Road has approximately 60 riders per mile.
- The four southern east/west bus routes are McDowell, Thomas, Indian School and Camelback Roads. On a per mile basis, there are approximately 1.6 boardings per mile compared to 3.5 boardings per mile in the Phoenix portion. The Phoenix portion of the routes has double the frequency of the Scottsdale portion.
- The three northern routes are Shea, Union Hills, and Bell Road. The two north/south routes are Scottsdale Road and Hayden Road. Scottsdale has the same frequency as Tempe, but Tempe has much greater ridership.
- The neighborhood trolley serves downtown Scottsdale to the south. The Miller trolley serves Scottsdale Community College and the southern portion of the city. The Downtown trolley serves the downtown. The Camelback Road trolley, which will connect Scottsdale Fashion Square to Scottsdale Community College, is to start operation within the next two months. The routes are owned by the City, which controls hours of operation and frequency, and is contracted with Dunn Transportation to provide the operation.
- There are two providers for the bus systems which includes Valley Metro and the City of Phoenix.
 - Route 56 connects the Priest Washington light rail station to SkySong. In addition, there are the Scottsdale Road and Hayden Road routes.
 - The City of Phoenix operates four routes, including McDowell, Thomas, Indian School and Camelback Roads. The Camelback route will terminate at Scottsdale Fashion Square with riders able to transfer to the Scottsdale Camelback Road trolley. The frequency will be much greater and more regular for both the trolley route and the Camelback Road bus route.
 - Bus routes in the northern portion of the City are from Shea Boulevard to the freeway. Scottsdale Road continues to Thompson Peak Parkway. Bus routes include Hayden Road, Shea, Greenway, Bell Road, and Union Hills connecting to Scottsdale Road.
 - Staff is asking the Commission to direct staff to choose between different possible trolley routes.
 - One route has been called the Cactus trolley. It would service the Honor Health facility at Scottsdale and Shea, Via Linda, the medical complexes in the vicinity, Scottsdale Ranch Park, Via Linda Senior Center, run north on Via Linda and serve the businesses in the vicinity of the Frank Lloyd Wright and Via Linda intersection, service the residents adjacent to Cactus Road and 96th Street, as well as businesses in the vicinity of Frank Lloyd Wright Boulevard and Thompson Peak Parkway.
 - A second option is the addition of two trolleys, one is the 94th Street trolley and the other a Via Linda trolley.
 - The 94th Street trolley would serve the residential neighborhoods north of Cactus Road up to Raintree Drive. It also would serve 94th Street,

92nd Street and 90th Street. The trolley would serve businesses in the vicinity of the Frank Lloyd Wright/Pima freeway interchange as well as Horizon Park, businesses in the vicinity of Thompson Peak Parkway and Frank Lloyd Wright Boulevard, and the McDowell Mountain Aquatic Center campus. It would also come close to serving the McDowell Mountain Ranch Community Center.

- The Via Linda Trolley would service the Scottsdale Honor Health Campus at Scottsdale and Shea, the Via Linda Senior Center, Scottsdale Ranch Park, and businesses on Cactus Road. Per a suggestion from the Transportation Commission, staff has indicated the route would continue on to serve the Mayo Clinic, Desert Mountain High School, Mountainside Middle School, and residents in the area.
- Staff requests direction to either continue exploring the Cactus Trolley or continue exploring the 94th Street Trolley and the Via Linda Trolley.
- Another trolley has been contemplated, which has been termed the Perimeter trolley. This would serve a large number of businesses in the area as well as mixed use properties and single family homes east of the freeway. This route would connect to the existing termination of the Hayden Road route. Staff is not seeking direction on this trolley, except for direction on whether to consider exploration or to remove it from consideration.
- Staff seeks direction on the consideration of another trolley option termed the Long Airpark Trolley. It removes the Hayden Road route and connects Honor Health and Scottsdale Road and Shea Boulevard up 94th Street. It would then go across onto Raintree into the airpark area, where it would connect with the Hayden Road route and continue on to the Airpark area west of the runway.
- Another possibility would be a trolley that only serves the Airpark. Staff suggests consideration for a route on the east side of the runway and a route on the west side of the runway. Both would begin and end at the existing park and ride facility at Scottsdale Road and Thunderbird Road.
- Staff requests direction from the Commission on its desire to consider the first option, the Long Airpark Trolley, or the second option, the Airpark Trolley.
- Details for a potential Scottsdale Road express bus route were presented. The intent would be to directly connect the Scottsdale Thunderbird Park and Ride lot to Scottsdale Fashion Square and continue to the Rural/University light rail station. The express route would include only three stops. Staff is not seeking direction at this time, but will follow the Commission's instructions on whether they wish staff to continue to consider this possibility.
- The current Hayden bus route begins in south Chandler and crosses Tempe into Scottsdale. Midway through McCormick Ranch, it uses Via de Ventura and then Pima Road and 90th Street to serve Honor Health before continuing north on 92nd Street and 94th Street to Thunderbird. It then travels to the far east side of the Airpark east of Hayden Road.
 - One suggestion for consideration is that the bus remain on its existing route to the Honor Health facility and medical office, then turn west on Shea Boulevard, resuming service on Hayden Road.

- A second alternative is for the bus to stay on Hayden Road for its entire length in order to serve all of McCormick Ranch and the residential areas between Shea Boulevard and the greater airpark area. This route would only make sense if used in combination with the Cactus Trolley or the Via Linda Trolley and 94th Street Trolley combination. Currently this portion of the city has no bus routes for approximately two and three-quarter miles.
- Staff seeks direction from the Commission on the three possibilities, including the current route, the alternative that serves Honor Health or the alternative that remains on Hayden Road for its entire length.
- High capacity transit examples include the light rail in Phoenix, and the modern streetcar in Tucson. Other examples that may or may not include rail are high frequency, where busses operate every five to six minutes. Another example is simply large capacity transportation methods that carry large numbers of travelers.
 - A potential rail route for Scottsdale is along 68th Street that would connect to the Tempe streetcar. A second possibility would be along Scottsdale Road that might terminate at SkySong or use Goldwater to serve Scottsdale Fashion Square. Another possibility is along McDowell Road and then to Galvin Parkway to the Priest/Washington light rail station. A fifth possibility would be along McDowell Road that would curve south to connect to the 44th Street/Washington Sky Train station. This would provide a direct transit connection from Scottsdale to Sky Harbor.

Chair Olmsted opened the floor for public comment:

- Mr. Bob Littlefield commented that discussions tend to focus on what the citizens should want as opposed to what they actually want. For example, the residents in the area of the proposed widening on Chaparral Road have made it clear that they do not want the road widened. He added that in the past 12 years, the Council majority attempted to widen Chaparral Road. Each time, the citizens of Villa Monterey provided opinions, but the measure never moved forward.
- Councilmember Guy Phillips commented that residents of Villa Monterey worked to become a historic district for the specific purpose of preventing a street widening. He suggested a thoroughfare to Hayden Road to Camelback. Additionally, widening Camelback would be a better option as it enters directly into Fashion Square. Narrowing Camelback Road would result in bumper to bumper traffic. He suggested that if light rail is approved, the project could be fast-tracked for implementation far sooner than 2040.
- Ms. Nancy Cantor, Scottsdale Citizen Liaison for the Maricopa Association of Governments Age Friendly Cities Aging In Place Project, commented that there are pockets of isolation throughout Scottsdale for senior citizens. One example is the area north of Shea Boulevard where the city's highest concentration of senior residents live. Many of them have not been able to access the senior center, shopping, hospital, or medical facilities. The Aging in Place Project has made an in-depth study of this question, gathering information from non-profit agencies (Duet and Foothills Caring Corps). These agencies are providing services arising from the absence of public transit. She addressed the critical need for connections in the north and south parts of the City by utilizing the trolley system. She was opposed to light rail on Scottsdale Road and that any final recommendations would go to the public for a vote.

- Mr. Basha clarified that two areas of Scottsdale are being considered for trolley routes. It was explained that at this time, a draft recommendation for a Transportation Master Plan has not been prepared. One possibility is the Cactus Trolley. The other is a 94th Street Trolley and Via Linda Trolley. Staff is seeking direction as to which alternatives the Commission would like to consider.
- Vice Chair Holley suggested that the Via Linda Trolley should be the number one priority as it accommodates travel to a number of critical areas. A long Airpark route would eliminate the need for some of the other proposed routes. He expressed concern that the 94th Street Trolley did not have a good anchor and suggested the possibility of an extension south to the hospital and shopping areas. Mr. Basha commented that the purpose of the 94th Street and Via Linda Trolley options is to provide the opportunity for transfers at the intersection of 94th and Cactus.
- A Commissioner commented that travelers do not want to have to transfer if they can avoid it. Transfers discourage ridership. Several other Commissioners concurred.
- A Commissioner expressed concern for the route that goes to Mayo Clinic, noting that in the past, a bus route to Mayo Clinic was eliminated due to low ridership. Ms. Madeline Clemann clarified that Route 80 continues to service Mayo Clinic during certain hours.
- A Commissioner suggested a third option, which was simply to not make a recommendation at this time. Mr. Basha stated that staff's goal is to have the Transportation Master Plan final draft recommendation to City Council this year.
- A Commissioner expressed reservations regarding the cogency of inter-commuting within the airpark. Mr. Basha clarified that the trolley option of Cactus versus 94th Street and Via Linda is a separate option from the airpark option. The current presentation slide illustrates the four east/west routes that come into Scottsdale in the vicinity of the airpark. Discussion at the May Commission meeting regarding the transit operation resulted in a suggestion to dramatically increase frequency of the routes, thereby providing access to the airpark from the highest residency of airpark employees to the west.

Highlights of ensuing discussion included:

- A Commissioner voiced support for the Cactus Trolley with a suggestion to utilize 94th Street versus 96th Street, as it might solve some of the issues presented in the area of 94th Street and Villa Linda since 94th Street is included in the current bus route. Mr. Basha indicated that any such change would be made at the Commission's direction and that staff will continue to refine the trolley routes throughout the development of the draft Transportation Master Plan.
- A Commissioner commented that the Cactus Trolley does not provide access to the McDowell Mountain Aquatic Center. Mr. Basha confirmed that the route could continue to the center at the Commission's direction. Staff did not propose extending the route because it was already quite long. If the route were extended they would need additional trolleys, otherwise it might be less desirable.
- A Commissioner asked whether it was being considered as a one-way, circular route or two-way on each of the streets. Mr. Basha clarified that two routes are contemplated on the same path, one clockwise and one counterclockwise.

- Vice Chair Holley commented that whatever appears in the document will serve as a placeholder, assuming that there may be other ideas suggested that may be variations on the same approach. Mr. Basha agreed and added that this is the document that will provide direction on how the Commission wishes staff to refine the routes.

CHAIR OLMSTED MOVED TO RECOMMEND THAT STAFF FURTHER INVESTIGATE THE POTENTIAL CACTUS TROLLEY ROUTE SUGGESTING THAT AN ALTERNATIVE BE REVIEWED TO USE 96TH STREET VERSUS 94TH STREET. COMMISSIONER BRETZ SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0).

Mr. Basha presented the Long Airpark trolley route option and asked for direction from the Commission on whether they wished to pursue the option of a Long Airpark trolley route that would use the existing Hayden Road route to connect to the Airport, or whether they preferred a smaller Airpark trolley route that connects the existing park and ride facility to the eastern portion of the Airpark and a second trolley for the western portion.

Highlights of ensuing discussion included:

- A Commissioner suggested a third alternative, which was to make it one route. He also suggested reviewing the results of the previous Airpark circulator and what improvements were necessary for greater success. He also suggested that in conjunction with this, the Scottsdale Road Express bus would be helpful to connect with the light rail station in Tempe. He was opposed to the long route, because many travelers are using the Hayden Road bus, which would be eliminated with the long route. Mr. Basha said the Airpark circulator had connected homes from the east to the airpark; however, it was discovered were people who live and work in the area. The proposed trolley system would serve people from the west on the four existing bus routes.
- Vice Chair Holley commented that the Airpark trolley route in conjunction with Hayden Road would provide adequate coverage without the length that goes from the Airpark down to Honor Health. Mr. Basha agreed. Ms. Clemann clarified that the Hayden Road route would end at 90th Street and Shea. The proposed route could be more frequent, providing better service at less cost than route 81.
- A Commissioner referred to the Cactus Trolley route using the alternative of 94th Street instead of 96th Street, and asked whether this would be satisfactory coverage so that the long portion of the Long Airport trolley may not be needed. Mr. Basha agreed that the Cactus trolley and the Long Airpark trolley are alternatives and that both options would not be used. The Commissioner voiced preference for the shorter Airpark trolley due to the frequency of trips.
- A Commissioner voiced that he was not prepared to vote for neither of the Airpark trolley options at this time.

CHAIR OLMSTED MOVED TO RECOMMEND THAT STAFF FURTHER EXAMINE THE OPTION OF THE SHORTER CONCENTRATED AIRPARK TROLLEY. COMMISSIONER STICKLES SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A VOTE OF FIVE (5) TO ONE (1). COMMISSIONER GRAHAM ABSTAINED.

Mr. Basha asked whether the Commission wished staff to continue exploring the Scottsdale Road express route.

CHAIR GRAHAM MOVED TO RECOMMEND THAT STAFF FURTHER EXAMINE THE OPTION OF THE SCOTTSDALE ROAD EXPRESS ROUTE. COMMISSIONER BRETZ SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0).

Mr. Basha asked which of the four options for the Hayden bus route the Commission wished staff to continue to explore.

VICE CHAIR HOLLEY MOVED THAT THE POTENTIAL HAYDEN ROAD ROUTE CONTINUE TO BE EXPLORED. COMMISSIONER STICKLES SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0).

Chair Olmsted confirmed that the Commission agreed to explore the option of the route staying on Hayden Road up to the Airpark and would not terminate at the hospital.

Mr. Basha invited the Commission to provide direction on whether they would like staff to continue exploration of the five potential light rail routes.

CHAIR OLMSTED MOVED TO RECOMMEND THAT STAFF CONTINUE ITS INVESTIGATIONS WITH REGARDS TO ALL FIVE POTENTIAL 2040 LIGHT RAIL ROUTES. COMMISSIONER STICKLES SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A VOTE OF FIVE (5) TO ONE (1). COMMISSIONER ROSENBERG DISSENTED.

Highlights of ensuing discussion included:

- A Commissioner suggested eliminating the red and blue routes presented by staff.
- A Commissioner clarified that the motion was to explore all options; however, he agreed on eliminating the red option. The blue route runs to Galvin Parkway and merits further investigation.
- A Commissioner commented that his least favorite was the purple route, which included a connection on 68th Street to the streetcar, noting that all the construction necessary would make more sense if it was connected to the light rail. He suggested that the blue route should take Scottsdale Road, instead of continuing on McDowell.
- Vice Chair Holley questioned the red and blue routes proceeding so far east of Scottsdale Road. Mr. Basha replied that there is a large apartment complex east of Scottsdale Road and the General Dynamics building at Granite Reef Road is anticipated to be fully occupied sometime in the future.
- Chair Olmsted suggested that Commissioners review past presentations and notes for additional information and discussion of these options.
- A Commissioner commented on the area of Chaparral Road noting that in the past, the Commission has looked at ways to reduce traffic on Chaparral. These approaches have not worked. His understanding was that the residents in the area had not been approached to discuss the possibility of the City purchasing their homes in order to widen the road. Mr. Basha commented that the most recent discussion for purchasing the homes was 25 years ago. He added that residents on Chaparral Road could sell their home to the City and potentially purchase another home in Villa Monterey. In addition, when a governmental agency purchases a home, there are no realtor fees, effectively providing the seller with an automatic seven percent increase in the purchase price. Approximately half of the homes between 78th Street and Miller Road have been purchased within the last five to ten years.

5. **PUBLIC COMMENT**

A written comment from Nancy Cantor was read as follows:

"Just to let the Commission know. Many residents asked me to speak to the issue of seating and shade. The Miller Road route needs shade and seating. They have seen shaded seating areas that have been abandoned at stops for trolleys and the seniors are reluctant to brave the elements by trolley, because of the heat. If a specific spot needs to be examined, she requests that."

6. **ADJOURNMENT**

With no further business to conduct, Chair Olmsted adjourned the regular meeting at 8:55 p.m.

SUBMITTED BY:

A/V Tronics, Inc. DBA AVTranz.

***Note: These are summary action meeting minutes only. A complete copy of the audio/video recording is available at <http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/transp.asp>**