



SUMMARIZED MINUTES

**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING**

THURSDAY, AUGUST 20, 2015

**KIVA – CITY HALL
3939 N. DRINKWATER BOULEVARD
SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA 85251**

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Olmsted called the regular meeting of the Scottsdale Transportation Commission to order at 6:06 p.m.

1. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Steven Olmsted, Chair
Paul Holley, Vice Chair
Gary Bretz, Commissioner
Barry Graham, Commissioner
Steven Rosenberg, Commissioner (left at 7:10 p.m.)

ABSENT: Robert Stickles, Commissioner

STAFF: Rose Arballo, Transportation Commission Coordinator
Christian Bailey, Police Officer-Bike Unit
Paul Basha, Transportation Director
Walter Brodzinski, Right-of-Way Manager
Madeline Clemann, Transportation Planning and Transit Operations
Manager
Susan Conklu, Senior Transportation Planner

2. PUBLIC COMMENT

Ms. Lynne Sullivan spoke of behalf of Sandflower. She displayed slides of the intersection of 84th Street and Black Mountain Road, noting this is extremely dangerous because the granite outcroppings obscure the sight lines for southbound and eastbound vehicles. Making this a four-way stop would not solve the problem. She asked staff to examine this new intersection to find a solution.

Chair Olmsted thanked Ms. Sullivan and encouraged members of the public to provide public input to the Commission on any neighborhood traffic concerns.

3. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

- Study Session of the Transportation Commission – July 16, 2015
- Regular Meeting of the Transportation Commission – July 16, 2015

VICE CHAIR HOLLEY MOVED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING AND STUDY SESSION OF JULY 16, 2015. COMMISSIONER BRETZ SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A VOTE OF FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0). COMMISSIONER STICKLES WAS ABSENT.

4. MODERN STREETCARS IN ARIZONA: TEMPE PLANS AND TUCSON OPERATION

Chair Olmsted noted he had requested this agenda item so that the Commission could gain a deeper understanding of modern streetcar systems.

Transportation Director Mr. Paul Basha made a presentation on the modern streetcars in Tempe and Tucson.

Highlights of the presentation included:

- High capacity transit encompasses light rail, modern streetcar and bus rapid transit (BRT) and implies a travel way separate from a motor vehicle lane. A second definition of high capacity transit is vehicles traveling on rails. Modern streetcar is a rail system operating within a shared motor vehicle lane, while BRT is often a separate dedicated lane on a road. The term high capacity transit is also used to refer to a bus that can carry a large number of passengers.
- In the Commission's May discussion of the Transit Element of the Transportation Master Plan, staff had not intended to include discussion of light rail, modern streetcar, or bus rapid transit in the Transportation Master Plan; however, the Commission unanimously directed staff to include rail systems in the Transportation Master Plan.
- There are five potential rail routes in southern Scottsdale for 2040 from which to choose:
 - Scottsdale Road to SkySong at McDowell Road, most likely a light rail route connecting with the Sky Train.
 - Scottsdale Road to Goldwater Boulevard and Fashion Square.
 - 68th Street connecting with the Tempe modern streetcar running to Fashion Square.
 - Galvin Parkway/64th Street, serving Desert Botanical Garden, the Phoenix Zoo and connecting to the light rail station at Priest and Washington.
 - East/west route connecting Scottsdale to the Sky Train at Washington and 44th Street.

- The routes on Scottsdale Road would connect to the light rail station in Tempe at Rural and University.
- Staff's intention is not to have rail on Scottsdale Road in the downtown area.
- Light rail is intended for long-distance travel with stations approximately one mile apart. Travel speed between stations is 30 to 35 miles per hour. Modern streetcar is designed for trips under two miles, with more stations, and travel speed below 25 miles per hour.
- It is anticipated that the Tempe City Council will approve the environmental impact study for the proposed Tempe modern streetcar system next spring. Construction would begin late summer or fall of 2016 with operation beginning in late 2017. The route would connect downtown Tempe to the light rail station at Dorsey and Apache Boulevard.
- A Commissioner noted that there has been discussion of extending the modern streetcar system east to Tempe Marketplace, the Chicago Cubs spring training stadium, and Riverview in Mesa.
- Mr. Basha noted there has also been discussion of extending the system south into some residential neighborhoods in Tempe.
- Initial discussion of modern streetcar routes in Tempe began over 20 years ago. Planning is by far the slowest part of the process.
- A Commissioner asked whether the gauge of the light rail and modern streetcar are compatible. Mr. Basha confirmed that they are. Tempe's modern streetcar stations will be long enough to accommodate light rail trains in the more distant future.
- A Commissioner inquired why Scottsdale Road had been designated for light rail, but not for modern streetcar. Mr. Basha indicated the City is still in the early stages of having a conversation about light rail. The thinking is that Scottsdale Road would be more conducive to light rail because of limited stations and longer travel distances.
- The Tucson modern streetcar system opened this year, serving the University of Arizona campus and downtown Tucson. Ridership is high and riders are satisfied.

Highlights of ensuing discussion included:

- The Tucson system took 20 to 25 years to plan. Construction took longer than normal because of the need to relocate utilities. The Tempe system will be less complicated and construction should be much quicker.
- Staff is using 2040 as the potential opening year for Scottsdale because other Valley communities have already committed funds for extensions; therefore, available funding for the next 20 years is already committed.
- A Commissioner stated that since the Commission had unanimously voted to include rail transit in the Transportation Master Plan, residents have started thinking about this. He said that modern streetcars would be good for boomers and commuters. He suggested that bypassing ASU and connecting at 64th Street would provide the shortest route to downtown Phoenix and the airport, and thus might garner the most community support.
- Mr. Basha clarified that only one of the potential routes would be constructed. Construction would likely be phased.
- A Commissioner recommended a route from downtown Scottsdale along Galvin Parkway to the Sky Train. Mr. Basha indicated that the intention for that route is to be constructed as light rail and would connect with the existing light rail station at Priest

- and Washington, where riders could transfer and travel west or east. The McDowell Road route would connect directly to the Sky Train and offer east/west connections.
- A Commissioner suggested that light rail and modern streetcar could share rails on some routes, similar to the L in Chicago. This would enable travelers to reach Sky Harbor or downtown Phoenix without having to transfer.
 - A Commissioner inquired about building modern streetcar routes north of downtown Scottsdale. Mr. Basha said this is not financially conceivable in the next 25 years, since even short routes cost billions and other cities are competing for federal funding.
 - Chair Olmsted said this is a big topic for the Valley. The Commission recommended to staff that since the Transportation Master Plan is being revised, these issues should be considered. He noted that in the past, this has been a polarizing question in Scottsdale. The Commission could perhaps be an appropriate collection point for the discussion and provide a format for formalizing the conversation.
 - Chair Olmsted stated that people often feel that since transit usage is comparatively low, the expenditure on infrastructure is not justified; however, there are 6.1 million registered vehicles in Arizona. Annual new vehicle sales are 330,000. People are looking for options.
 - Chair Olmsted stated that he does not favor any transportation mode over another. The Commission simply wants to formalize the conversation around addressing all modes.
 - The transit conversation in Scottsdale is not necessarily about the percentage of users, right-of-way, or costs. Chair Olmsted stated that high capacity transit serves two greater purposes. One, high capacity transit is crucial for those with limited options, including those without vehicles, students, people with disabilities and seniors. Secondly, the purpose is to serve the tourism and convention industry.
 - Chair Olmsted summarized that he wanted this item on the agenda for the following reasons:
 - To address the all modes conversation relative to residents who need options.
 - To discuss connectivity to Sky Harbor.
 - To ensure that the Transportation Commission becomes a collection point for discussion among interested parties regarding high capacity transit sometime in the future.
 - A Commissioner agreed that given the time it takes to plan a high capacity transit system, it is important to start investigating and learning from the Tucson system.
 - Vice Chair Holley commended Chair Olmsted for his initiative.
 - A Commissioner agreed with Chair Olmsted that decisions should be taken thoughtfully. No one wants to impose high capacity transit without planning and consultation with the community.
 - Chair Olmsted commended staff for doing a great job of identifying potential fixed routes. It is felt that since Scottsdale is comparatively late in the game, the inability to sit at the table and discuss options is not fair to the citizens. There is plenty of culpability that could mire them down for the wrong reasons, but he is hopeful that this effort will change that. Finally, Chair Olmsted pointed out that by 2040, there could be new technology that makes today's modern streetcar irrelevant.

CHAIR OLMSTED MOVED THAT AN EXPLORATORY TRIP TO TUCSON BE ORGANIZED FOR THE TRANSPORTATION COMMISSIONERS AND INTERESTED PARTIES TO POTENTIALLY RIDE AND STUDY TUCSON'S MODERN STREETCAR SYSTEM. VICE

CHAIR HOLLEY SECONDED THE MOTION. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A VOTE OF FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0). COMMISSIONER STICKLES WAS ABSENT.

5. VALET PARKING

Right-of-Way Manager Mr. Walter Brodzinski provided an overview of the City's valet parking program. It was noted that Officer Christian Bailey was in attendance to answer questions.

Highlights of his presentation included:

- Public/public valet parking - cars are stored on public property. A license is required.
- Public/private valet parking - the operator and valet stand are in the public realm but vehicles are stored on private property. A license is required.
- Private/private valet parking - the entire operation takes place on private property. No license is required.
- The goal of the program for public/private valet parking: The City allows the operator to use an area of public space for drivers to leave their car. The operator makes arrangements with private property owners to rent spaces on private lots which are not available for self-parking.
- The valet parking ordinance was originally passed in 1996 and revised in 2014. Revisions include:
 - Regulation of the minimum number of attendants.
 - The stand must be adjacent to the business it serves.
 - Special event valet parking is now allowed.
 - Operators cannot block spaces before the operation opens for the evening. Spaces are identified so daytime users are warned they need to vacate the space by a specified time.
- Valet parking allows parking in spaces which are not accessible to the general public, adding to the supply of parking in the downtown area.
- There are now fewer valet operations using public property.

Highlights of ensuing discussion included:

- A Commissioner commented that he supports valet parking and noted there is a clear demand across the City. He asked what people should do if they feel an operator does not have a license, or is not operating according to the ordinance. Officer Bailey said the Bicycle Unit will visit the site to inspect and that operators are not allowed to conduct business until their license is approved. Also, full detailed plans have to be filed with the application, and the Police Department will investigate any complaints.
- Chair Olmsted asked how many public parking spaces are devoted to valet parking stands. Mr. Brodzinski said several dozen spaces are used late in the evening starting after 8:00 p.m.
- Chair Olmsted asked if the program is running well and whether business operators realize it is available. Police officers are aware of where licensed operations are being conducted, and notice any rogue operators. Enforcement is strict. Officer Bailey said the revised ordinance is now more streamlined and easier to enforce.
- A Commissioner inquired about special event parking when people allow parking on private property. Mr. Brodzinski said that public street parking spaces and garages are

free during spring training. Business parking lots can only charge for special event parking when the business is closed. Parking has been allowed to occur on vacant private lots. He opined that patrons have multiple options available to them, and that the system is functional.

6. TRANSPORTATION MASTER PLAN UPDATE

Mr. Basha noted that tonight's discussion of the pedestrian element is the final discussion on a specific topic of the Transportation Master Plan.

Highlights of his presentation included:

- Staff is contemplating combining the bicycle and pedestrian elements into the multi-use element, if the Commission agrees. This would cover pedestrians, bicycles, skateboards and wheelchairs. Motorized wheelchairs are included if it is the user's typical means of transportation.
- One of the bond election questions pertains to providing bicycle lanes for the entire length of McDowell Road in the city.
- Overview of multi-use path system.
- Trails within the Scottsdale Preserve are the responsibility of the Parks and Recreation Department and are not within the Transportation Master Plan.

Highlights of ensuing discussion included:

- A Commissioner asked whether this section of the Transportation Master Plan will be updated or replicated from the 2009 recommendations of the Ad Hoc Citizens Trails Task Force. Mr. Basha stated that staffs' intention is to use the efforts of the Trails Task Force and continue their recommendations and decisions in the new Transportation Master Plan.
- Senior Transportation Planner Ms. Susan Conklu said staff will review the Task Force recommendations in light of what has been built since 2009, and the inventory of the City's trail map conducted since 2009.
- A Commissioner asked how the 2008 Transportation Master Plan and Trails Task Force recommendations of 2009 align. Mr. Basha said the Transportation Master Plan was approved before the Task Force made its recommendations. In any event, staff will continue to refer to both documents going forward, even after the 2015 Transportation Master Plan is adopted.
- A Commissioner concurred that the term "multi-use" is more descriptive but would need to be defined to the public.
- Chair Olmsted asked about the list of bicycle and multi-use path projects in the 2008 Transportation Master Plan. Mr. Basha confirmed that it does contain a very long list of these projects. Chair Olmsted suggested that perhaps the Paths & Trails Subcommittee should review this list and prepare an updated list for reference, which would not be incorporated in the 2015 Transportation Master Plan. Ms. Madeline Clemann indicated it might make sense to prepare a matrix of all the projects for comparison and reference. Mr. Basha ensured Commissioners that a list of projects will be included in the 2015 Transportation Master Plan.

7. OTHER TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS AND PROGRAMS STATUS

Mr. Basha provided updates as follows:

- Neighborhood traffic management projects are in process at Cattletrack Road and Cholla Street. Now that design is complete, it is apparent they will both be more expensive than originally envisioned. The combined increase in funding for the two projects is approximately \$150,000. Mr. Basha asked whether the Commission wanted an agenda item at a future meeting to review the cost increases and take appropriate action.

Highlights of ensuing discussion included:

- A Commissioner inquired about the drainage concerns on Cholla. Mr. Basha confirmed that the Neighborhood Traffic Management Program does not include any drainage improvements. The design will accommodate drainage; however, drainage is not the reason for the cost increases. The Commissioner felt staff should proceed.
- The cost increase is about 15 percent of the total project budget.
- A Commissioner opined they should review the analysis, especially in light of the upcoming elections when voters will be asked to vote on increased property taxes. Cost overruns may erode voter confidence. Another Commissioner agreed.
- Chair Olmsted commented he is comfortable going forward.
- Mr. Basha said he would agendaize this item for the Transportation Commission meeting on September 17.
- Mr. Basha added that staff dramatically reduced funding for many of the line items in the Capital Improvement Program.
- A Commissioner suggested that staff advise Commissioners when projects come in under budget.

Mr. Basha discussed proposed changes to the General Plan, to be discussed in greater detail at the September 3 Special Meeting. He reminded Commissioners that there can be no joint discussion of this topic prior to that meeting. The proposed changes will be sent electronically to the Commissioners the next day. The deadline for changes to the General Plan is September 11.

8. PUBLIC COMMENT

Mr. Dean Miller of McCormick Ranch said he drives, cycles, walks, and hikes. He is aware of many pedestrians and cyclists who wear dark clothing at night. He urged the City to consider procuring promotional electronic flashers people could wear for increased safety. The cost is only about one dollar per unit for bulk orders.

9. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Chair Olmsted noted that Commissioner Wright resigned because of a significant career opportunity that involved relocation. Mr. Basha noted that applications for the vacant position

are open through August 28. City Council will accept nominations on September 8 and the appointment will be announced on September 21.

Chair Olmsted requested a city-wide street lighting update to consider maintenance, replacement and LED adoption. Mr. Basha announced that staff has hired a consultant to review these questions. A Commissioner was interested in cost and energy savings. Another Commissioner inquired about a dark skies policy. Mr. Basha stated that the consultant is looking at this.

10. ADJOURNMENT

With no further business to conduct, Chair Olmsted adjourned the regular meeting at 8:22 p.m.

SUBMITTED BY:

A/V Tronics, Inc. DBA AVTranz.

***Note: These are summary action meeting minutes only. A complete copy of the audio/video recording is available at <http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/transp.asp>**