



SUMMARIZED MINUTES

**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING**

THURSDAY, DECEMBER 18, 2014

**KIVA – CITY HALL
3939 N. DRINKWATER BOULEVARD
SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA 85251**

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Olmsted called the regular meeting of the Scottsdale Transportation Commission to order at 6:07 p.m.

1. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Steven Olmsted, Chair
Paul Holley, Vice Chair
Gary Bretz, Commissioner
Barry Graham, Commissioner
Steven Rosenberg, Commissioner
Robert Stickles, Commissioner
Matthew Wright, Commissioner

STAFF: Paul Basha, Transportation Director
Walt Brodzinski, Right of Way Supervisor
Madeline Clemann, Transportation Planning and Transportation
Operations Manager
Susan Conklu, Senior Transportation Planner
Greg Davies, Senior Transportation Planner
Gary Meyer, Senior Project Manager

GUESTS: Jamie Cowgill, JRC Design
Rachel Pearson, Scottsdale Convention and Visitor's Bureau

2. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

- Study Session of the Transportation Commission – November 20, 2014
- Regular Meeting of the Transportation Commission – November 20, 2014

VICE CHAIR HOLLEY MOVED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING AND STUDY SESSION OF NOVEMBER 20, 2014 AS PRESENTED. COMMISSIONER STICKLES SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0).

3. PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no public comments.

4. SUPER BOWL 2015 UPDATE

Right of Way Supervisor Mr. Walt Brodzinski presented an update on event planning.

- The cutoff date for event applications is January 14, 2015.
- Events begin with the Pro Bowl on January 25th thru January 31st.
- Variable message signs around Fashion Square Mall will direct drivers to perimeter parking. Shuttles are a possibility.
- City staff will deploy additional variable message signs on an as-needed basis.
- Event and parking information will be available on the information line (480 312-CITY). Online information will also be available at www.experiencescottsdale.com/guides.
- The Downtown Trolley route will be modified during this period.

Highlights of the discussion following the presentation included:

- At this point, there is no estimate on the number of people expected downtown through the week of January 25th. Staff is relying on the experience in 2008 at which there were more large events sponsored by the NFL. This year, the Scottsdale ESPN Fan Fest is the anchor event, with smaller events alongside.
- The key to parking strategy will be communication. Staff will monitor parking lots and direct drivers away from any lots that are full.
- The City Council provided the Scottsdale Convention and Visitors Bureau (SCVB) with \$30,000 to market the Day Tripper. In working to increase ridership, the SCVB has been actively promoting the Day Tripper.
- A Commissioner commented that safe, comfortable parking for employees working at Fashion Square Mall is key and hopes this will be taken care of.
- A Commissioner inquired whether staff plans to gather traffic data during the Super Bowl events for future reference. Mr. Paul Basha responded that these events are always dynamic. Gathering highly specific data during one event does not help predict future events. The events planned for 2015 are very different than the events of 2008. Communication is key, and having staff spread throughout the city to observe and respond to events as they unfold is the best strategy. The Commissioner suggested agendaing a discussion later in 2015 about parking and traffic management when

downtown is at capacity during events. It was suggested that an inventory of elements that could contribute to a better understanding of how the downtown area reacts in these situations could be useful.

5. PATHS & TRAILS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

Commissioner Stickles reported on the November 19th meeting of the Paths & Trails Subcommittee.

Highlights of the discussion following the presentation included:

- A Commissioner asked whether the land north of the proposed path to Anasazi Elementary School is to be developed. Ms. Susan Conklu, Senior Transportation Planner, clarified that land is, in fact, part of the McDowell Sonoran Preserve.
- A Commissioner noted that this path is in the Transportation Master Plan and there is a public right of way available for the proposed path.
- Mr. Basha confirmed there are no plans to extend Cactus Road.

6. WAYFINDING PROGRAM UPDATE

Ms. Conklu provided an update on the wayfinding program and introduced Ms. Jamie Cowgill of JRC Design. Ms. Cowgill presented her wayfinding portfolio.

Highlights of the discussion following the presentation included:

- Ms. Conklu explained the difference between a path and trail in the City of Scottsdale. It was clarified that a path is paved and a trail is made up of unpaved decomposed granite. Ms. Conklu acknowledged that some cities use the terms interchangeably.
- The Commission thanked Ms. Cowgill for her presentation and for putting her experience at the service of the City.
- Ms. Cowgill explained that a timeline for the City's wayfinding program is being developed. Ms. Conklu elaborated that they hope to have the concepts ready by next summer and expect to conduct a pilot test from October to December 2015. Staff will report to the Commission as the project unfolds.
- Discussion on the purpose for the wayfinding program ensued. It was noted that some of the intentions of this program is to encourage people to use the paths and trails system, and to use it as a way to promote destinations within the city.
- Funding for this program will come from the two-tenths percent transportation sales tax. A Commissioner requested that, at a future meeting, staff present an estimate of the total project costs.

7. BIKE SHARE

Regarding bike share in the valley, Ms. Conklu reported the following:

- Phoenix had a soft launch of GRID Bike Share on November 25th. Currently, 30 stations have been installed with 150 bikes. The plan is to have a total of 50 stations and 500 bikes.
- Mesa and Tempe plan to launch GRID in summer/fall 2015 when the light rail opens in downtown Mesa. Each city plans to have 250 bikes.
- Phoenix has the most sophisticated bike share system in the country because of the GPS system installed on the bikes.
- It was noted that although users are encouraged to return bikes to the stations, it is not mandatory because the bikes have an on-board locking system that work at regular bike racks.
- GRID offers a variety of sponsorship levels.
- Scottsdale staff continues to observe the implementation of this program in the neighboring cities and will update the Commission on the results of this program at a later date.

Highlights of discussion following the presentation included:

- A Commissioner inquired about providing tricycles for adults. Ms. Conklu mentioned that people in other cities have asked that tricycles should be provided. Ms. Conklu will research to find out whether Phoenix has any plans to provide tricycles in the future.
- A Commissioner asked how Scottsdale would direct people to the GRID stations since advertising on bus stops is not permitted. Ms. Conklu said that staff would have to work this out with the Planning Department if Bike Share were implemented in Scottsdale.
- SkySong is interested in bike share and has offered to host a pilot project.
- A Commissioner commented that it is important for the Commission to know the cost of implementing a bike share system in Scottsdale, and that knowing the Phoenix budget would be instructive. Ms. Conklu will research.
- Ms. Conklu noted that the cost per bike, which covers annual maintenance, has been estimated at approximately \$1,500 - \$2,000.
- A Commissioner inquired about the process to initiate bike share in Scottsdale. Mr. Basha said Phoenix has the most technologically sophisticated system in North America. They have achieved this by investigating and learning from older systems and taking advantage of the newest GPS technology.
- Scottsdale Transportation staff is observing the Phoenix system carefully and will present the Commission with a detailed implementation program when staff feels enough information has been gathered.
- With the Commission's recommendation, staff will present this program to City Council. Mr. Basha anticipates this to take place between the next 12 to 18 months.
- Expressing concern on the time it would take to apply for and receive federal funding, a Commissioner inquired whether a private entity such as SkySong could open its own program. Ms. Conklu said she did not know, but assumes

- they probably could. The Commissioner suggested that SkySong could perhaps be integrated into the Tempe and Mesa systems.
- A Commissioner asked what is being done to explore the advantages for tourists and visitors, which might generate sponsorships. Ms. Conklu said that some years ago, a different bike share company approached the City in which the SCVB was involved in initial discussions. The Tourism Advisory Task Force has discussed bike share as a long-term strategy.
 - People involved recognize that stations should be installed at some of the resorts as well as in the Airpark area.
 - A Commissioner commented that the density of southern Scottsdale is changing, which may lead to increased demand for bike share.
 - Chair Olmsted enumerated various aspects of cycling in Scottsdale today. Given that Scottsdale is competing for the gold level in the national Bike Friendly Community awards program and the Commission is concerned with the Transportation Master Plan, Chair Olmsted suggested there might be interest in establishing a small committee to examine cycling in Scottsdale. He invited anyone interested in forming an ad hoc committee by February to look at the cycling aspects of the Transportation Master Plan, commenting that this may strengthen their application to the Bike Friendly Community award. Ms. Conklu commented that staff took this approach the last time they applied for the award and that conversation could be expanded this year.
 - Chair Olmsted volunteered to direct a message to the Paths & Trails Subcommittee to consider all these ideas and come up with a vision of what they would like Scottsdale to be. It was suggested that the Subcommittee could work with Ms. Conklu to identify what she would need relative to the Bike Friendly Community gold application.

8. ADA PATHS AND TRAILS CRITERIA

Mr. Greg Davies made a presentation on the ADA design criteria for paths and trails. It was mentioned that the draft Public Right-of-Way Accessibility Guidelines (PROWAG) have been open for public comment for a couple years and are expected to be issued in 2015. Disability is broadly defined as a physical or mental impairment that substantially limits one or more major life activities. As such, approximately 20,000 Scottsdale residents have disabilities. The proposed PROWAG guidelines can be found on the U.S. Access Board website at <http://www.access-board.gov>.

Highlights of the discussion following the presentation included:

- A Commissioner commented that it may be challenging for visually impaired people to orient themselves at very large open pedestrian crossings.
- Discussion ensued about the applicability of guidelines during construction. Mr. Davies mentioned that the same guidelines apply to temporary sidewalks during construction. Mr. Basha interjected that at a previous meeting, a Commissioner had expressed concerns about the temporary paths during construction on Thomas Road. Staff found that the path was in violation of ADA guidelines and was corrected the

following week. Warning signage is posted at the last crossing location. A Commissioner advised that on the west side of Miller at Thomas, the sign is posted after the crossing. The barricades are narrower than the four feet required by ADA guidelines. Mr. Basha will ask staff to examine this promptly and correct any deficiencies.

- Overhanging objects must be no lower than 80 inches from the ground for the safety of the visually impaired. Ms. Clemann added that signs in Scottsdale are posted a minimum of seven feet (84 inches) above ground level.
- A Commissioner inquired whether planning of construction projects includes a consideration of wayfinding, opining that some of the obstacles that had been cited could be eliminated through attention at that stage. Mr. Basha said accommodation for pedestrians and cyclists is considered prior to construction and was disappointed to learn of these deficiencies.
- Staff noted that criteria for the use of truncated domes in Scottsdale are challenging and that standards have evolved. A Commissioner expressed concern in that if a curb cut is at the corner rather than having one on either side of the corner, people may become disoriented and wander into the center of an intersection. Ms. Conklu recalled a practical workshop on orientation for the visually impaired that staff attended several years ago and how challenging she had found it.

9. SCOTTSDALE ROAD AND CAMELBACK ROAD MULTIUSE PATH CROSSING

Mr. Davies made a presentation on potential pedestrian crossings at this signature intersection. He commented on recent pedestrian enhancements to the southeast corner of the intersection, which includes art on the canal bridge.

Highlights of the discussion following the presentation included:

- A Commissioner commented that a new permanent bridge would mitigate a majority of the issues at this path crossing when the development of the parcel on the northeast corner occurs. The Commissioner also commented that it is unfortunate that there is no sidewalk on the south side of Camelback Road east of the intersection. Mr. Basha pointed out that the diagonal bridge over the Arizona Canal is clearly visible and enables pedestrians to continue along Camelback Road.
- A Commissioner believes that because of the importance of the canal path, it would be desirable to have grade separated access along the canal; however, it could be challenging and expensive. Mr. Davies commented that it depends on the cost benefit analyses of the various options. The Commissioner noted that for the short term, the solution seems adequate. Mr. Davies recalled that a previous developer for the northeast corner addressed the City Council in 2008 and that plans approved included stipulations for two bridges across the Arizona Canal north Camelback Road and a ten-foot wide sidewalk on the north side of Camelback Road.
- A Commissioner suggested that since this is a very difficult problem to solve, perhaps staff could brainstorm ideas in hopes of developing some creative crossing solution to create a signature gateway to downtown. A design competition might yield a feasible solution.

10. SHEA BOULEVARD PATH UPDATE

Mr. Basha reported that an unwelcome decision regarding the multi-use path on Shea Boulevard had to be made. The project is approximately 4,000 feet long and extends from 142nd Street to Eagle Mountain Parkway. About 40 percent of the length is in Scottsdale and the rest of the path is in Fountain Hills. In one area, bolts from an existing guardrail for the safety of motor vehicles were protruding into the proposed multi-use path.

Traffic Engineer Mr. George Williams consulted with Mr. Michael Kuzel, a member of the Paths & Trails Subcommittee, who is an expert on issues pertaining to cyclists and pedestrians. Together, they found a better solution to install a median barrier at the curb lane and replace the guardrail. It was felt that by doing this, the path could then be eight feet wide with a railing on its other side. Unfortunately, this solution was more costly.

It was noted that the original estimated cost of the project was \$900,000, of which Fountain Hills' share was \$600,000. Of that total, \$400,000 was to have been partially allocated by Salt River Project to the Town of Fountain Hills. Fountain Hills did not have the funding and approached Scottsdale to pay \$400,000 in addition to the \$300,000 that represented the City's share, to be reimbursed later. However, the \$400,000 reimbursement would have to be spent by Scottsdale at some other location that is eligible for the SRP Aesthetics Funding.

The City planned to use the money to underground power lines near the intersection of McDowell Road and Miller Road. Negotiations with the Town of Fountain Hills, SRP, and the Maricopa Association of Governments resulted in Scottsdale moving forward with the project because it would benefit Scottsdale citizens and visitors.

Although everyone agreed to the proposed solution, the revised cost estimate increased to \$1.3 million, which resulted in an increase in cost to Fountain Hills. The City was still in agreement with the project and prepared to have Scottsdale staff work on the planning and grant applications, hire the contractor and design consultant, and administer the design project and construction project; however, the Town of Fountain Hills was unwilling to pay more than \$200,000.

Mr. Basha summarized that Transportation staff was faced with three options:

1. Build the original design with the bolts on the guardrail protruding into the narrower multi-use path. (This is believed to be a poor design solution.)
2. Approach SRP and ask for \$800,000 towards the project. (Staff believed it was inappropriate for Scottsdale to ask a quasi-public agency for funding that would be spent in another jurisdiction.)
3. Increase the City of Scottsdale's share of the project costs to \$1.1 million, with a reimbursement of only \$400,000.

Mr. Basha explained that none of these alternatives were acceptable. He concluded that this was very unfortunate because this project would have connected two existing multi-use path facilities.

Highlights of the discussion following the presentation included:

- A Commissioner inquired whether it would be possible to have a two-sided barrier rail rather than a concrete barrier. Ms. Conklu said this was considered, but there would be a challenge with lack of space as there were areas where an eight-foot path could not be built, which is the minimum width for a path.
- A Commissioner asked if the bolts could be modified so they would not protrude. Mr. Basha noted that the bolts are necessary to hold the guardrail in place. Ms. Conklu added that staff had looked at this project from every direction. The cost of retaining walls also added to the expense. It was stressed that there are still unknowns in the equation and that the burden would have been on the City of Scottsdale since Fountain Hills was unwilling or unable to consider any additional expense beyond \$200,000. Furthermore, it is far more difficult to control a project in a different jurisdiction which could also make the City liable for any deficiencies.
- Mr. Basha assured the Commission that staff is willing to build the multi-use path in Scottsdale and allow the Town of Fountain Hills to build a multi-use path in that community. However, this would be done without SRP Aesthetics Funding or the federal funding that was available for this as a joint project.

11. TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS/PROGRAMS UPDATE

Mr. Basha reported the following:

- The Neighborhood Traffic Management Program project continues near the intersection of Hayden and Thomas Road at Granite Reef and 86th Street. This has been in process for six years. The project has finally been completely approved and staff anticipates construction will start within the next two months.
- The Thomas Road streetscape project extending from 73rd Street to the Indian Bend Wash is under construction. Public art has been installed and construction should be complete within the next four weeks.
- The sidewalk on McDowell Road at Indian Bend Wash is being widened. Cantilevers are being added to the bridge. This is a complicated and costly process. Traffic has been restricted to one lane in each direction during construction.
- Staff is preparing the operating budget and CIP budget for the next fiscal year.
- Three trolley route improvements are being proposed to begin in April 2015; however, staff is still analyzing the operation and determining funding. The proposed trolley route improvements being focused on include the following:
 1. The Miller Road trolley route is currently at 30-minute frequency Monday thru Friday and at 60-minute frequency on weekends. Staff wants to change this to 20-minute service on weekdays and 30-minute service on weekends.

2. The Downtown trolley currently operates at 15-minute frequency on a circuitous route. Staff would like to see ten-minute service with a more direct route.
 3. Route 50 on Camelback Road extends from Phoenix to Scottsdale Community College. In Phoenix, the route operates at 20-minute frequency; in Scottsdale the frequency is 40 minutes. Staff would like to improve this route to 20-minute frequency through Scottsdale. The proposal developed by Ms. Clemann and Mr. John Kelly is for the Phoenix route to extend to Fashion Square to coordinate with trolley service from Fashion Square through the Villa Monterey subdivision on Chaparral Road to Scottsdale Community College. The estimated cost of that proposal is slightly less than \$500,000. Staff is looking for funding sources and is in discussion with the City of Phoenix and Valley Metro.
- The new traffic signal on Camelback Road between Scottsdale Road and Miller Road was activated ahead of schedule thanks to the dedicated efforts of the signal construction crew. Mr. Basha commended Mr. Todd Taylor, Principal Traffic Engineer, for the fantastic job he did in designing this challenging signal. In addition, in an effort to control traffic, Mr. Basha announced that four variable speed limit signs will be placed on Camelback Road between Scottsdale Road and Miller Road. For most of the week, the speed limit will be signed at 35 miles per hour and changed to 25 miles per hour for late night and early morning traffic on Fridays and Saturdays. Changes to the speed limit can be made to accommodate special events. Speed awareness signs will also be placed immediately beneath the variable message signs. The speed awareness signs are currently being tested and will be installed on approximately December 20th.

12. PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

13. COMMISSION IDENTIFICATION OF FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

- A Commissioner requested an update on the Hidden Hills connection to Fountain Hills.
- A Commissioner opined that the Commission needs to take a stand on the need for a high density transportation system.
- In preparation to update the Transportation Master Plan, a Commissioner suggested that each Commissioner focus on his expectations with regard to future mass transit.

14. ADJOURNMENT

With no further business to conduct, Chair Olmsted adjourned the regular meeting at 9:02 p.m.

SUBMITTED BY:

A/V Tronics, Inc. DBA AVTranz.

*Note: These are summary action meeting minutes only. A complete copy of the audio/video recording is available at <http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/transp.asp>