



**SUMMARIZED MINUTES**

**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE  
TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION  
REGULAR MEETING**

**THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 20, 2014**

**KIVA – CITY HALL  
3939 N. DRINKWATER BOULEVARD  
SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA 85251**

**CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Olmsted called the regular meeting of the Scottsdale Transportation Commission to order at 6:03 p.m.

1. **ROLL CALL**

**PRESENT:** Steven Olmsted, Chair  
Paul Holley, Vice Chair  
Gary Bretz, Commissioner  
Barry Graham, Commissioner  
Steven Rosenberg, Commissioner  
Robert Stickles, Commissioner  
Matthew Wright, Commissioner

**STAFF:** Rose Arballo, Transportation Commission Coordinator  
John Bartlett, Traffic Engineer  
Paul Basha, Transportation Director  
Walt Brodzinski, Right of Way Supervisor  
Madeline Clemann, Transportation Planning and Transportation  
Operations Manager  
Jim Ford, Deputy Chief – Scottsdale Fire Department  
Phillip Kercher, Principal Traffic Engineer  
Ratna Koropella, Principal Transit Planner  
George Williams, Senior Traffic Engineer  
Dan Worth, Executive Director, Public Works

## **2. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES**

- Study Session of the Transportation Commission – October 16, 2014
- Regular Meeting of the Transportation Commission – October 16,, 2014

**COMMISSIONER STICKLES MOVED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING AND STUDY SESSION OF OCTOBER 16, 2014 AS PRESENTED. COMMISSIONER WRIGHT SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A VOTE OF SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0).**

## **3. PUBLIC COMMENT**

There were no public comments.

## **4. RAINSTORM RESPONSE**

Public Works Executive Director Mr. Dan Worth discussed the City's response to the three significant storms on August 19, September 8, and September 28, showing many photos to illustrate his presentation.

On August 19, almost 3.5 inches of rain fell in northern Scottsdale in six hours, which is a 100-year event. On September 8, some areas of Scottsdale received significant rainfall, as did neighboring areas that drain into the City. Over three inches of rain fell at McKellips and Indian Bend Wash in six hours. This is considered a 500-year occurrence. The water flow across McKellips Road reached almost 6,000 cubic feet per second, the biggest flow recorded by the flow meter. It was noted that Indian Bend Wash is engineered to handle up to 16,000 cubic feet per second. Hayden Road is engineered as a weir so that water can cross from west to east to stay in the floodplain and it performed exactly as it was supposed to.

Mr. Worth described the City's emergency response, steps taken following the storms, and damage remediation. A cross-departmental City emergency response team includes staff from the Streets Department, Facilities, Community Services, and Parks and Recreation. Team members are put on call whenever extreme weather is forecast. The team knows which roads will flood first in different areas of the City, and the material and equipment are stored close by so road closures can be implemented quickly.

Mr. Worth noted that the September 27-28 event was a windstorm, so the damage was different. One-hundred (100) calls were received in two hours for blocked roadways on September 27. In the preceding year, there had been a total of 142 calls.

After the storms were over, Public Works crews worked to clear sediment and debris from the roadways. Dust must be cleared from roadways within 24 hours to comply with County regulations. The crews worked overtime for three weeks to clear and remove debris from the arterial roadways and residential streets. Mr. Worth noted that crews were still dealing with the aftermath of the August 19 storm when the September 8 storm occurred.

Mr. Worth discussed the cost of staff overtime following these events. He noted that the volume of solid waste increased because of uprooted trees and fallen limbs. Solid waste crews have been working overtime since late August and are still in catch-up mode. Longer term damage repair will continue and staff is attempting to ensure that some of the damage will not recur in the future. For example, the flowing water flipped over the curb on the east side of Hayden Road into Camelback Park and the ensuing erosion exposed the irrigation pipe in the park. While structurally safe, this has to be repaired and the new curb will be armored to avoid a repeat. The repair expenses are estimated at \$300,000 to \$400,000, which are not in the budget.

Highlights of the discussion following the presentation included:

- The McKellips Road bridge over Indian Bend Wash closed on September 8. Although the flow was well below the maximum that the channel is designed for, the closure was a precaution until the structural integrity of the bridge could be verified.
- Mr. Worth indicated that staff makes a conscious effort to derive lessons from the events. Every member of the Emergency Response Team is working on a voluntary basis, although they are paid for being on call and responding. Their regular team meetings are held on their lunch hour. After the storms, the Team examined how to improve the response for the future. He noted that equipment operators worked extensive hours for several weeks. This indicates a need for more cross-training and need to establish a backup roster of staff who have previously operated heavy equipment.
- Staff at the Maricopa County Flood Control District are looking at the long-term implications of climate change; however, on a year-over-year basis, Mr. Worth said things are not changing as dramatically as one might think.
- Mr. Worth elaborated on techniques that can be used to reinforce the embankment at Hayden Road and Camelback Park to protect the trees.
- Mr. Worth said staff may defer some projects in this year's budget to pay for the work in connection with the storms. The dedicated transportation fund has an available budget and staff is working on a request to City Council to use some of the unreserved fund balance. In the past, storm damage was in each year's budget. In order to balance the budget, this line item was cut during the recession with the recognition that they might have to use contingency spending authority for future storm damage.
- A Commissioner clarified that storm expenses may be paid from either the Public Works or the Transportation budget. He recalled discussions about budget cutbacks during the recession. The Commissioner also stressed that when staff is evaluating new projects, it is important to consider drainage hotspots and vegetation management, and that the Transportation Master Plan could address development impacts on watersheds.

## **5. NEIGHBORHOOD TRAFFIC MANAGEMENT PROGRAM (NTMP) UPDATE**

Mr. John Bartlett provided an update on the Neighborhood Traffic Management Program. In 2014, eight requests were received for the education component of the program. Four of the requests have now moved to the enforcement component with the help of the Police Department.

One project has been qualified to be involved in the engineering portion of the program at Via de Lago between Via de Ventura and McCormick Parkway. Any traffic calming project would likely also include 73rd Place, because it would otherwise be a convenient alternative route for drivers wanting to avoid Via de Lago. A neighborhood meeting will be scheduled soon.

Mr. Bartlett noted that the engineering portion of the project on Cattletrack Road from Lincoln Drive to McDonald Drive is complete.

Cholla Street between Hayden Road and 84th Street was approved by the Commission and is in the final design stages.

Two projects are ready for construction:

- Granite Reef Road between Osborn Road and Thomas Road
- 86th Street between Earll Drive and Thomas Road

Traffic Engineering staff is working diligently with the Stormwater Department to resolve the issues regarding drainage on 86th Street.

Mr. Bartlett displayed information about average reductions in each speed category for the last eight traffic calming projects. He noted that the intent is to reduce excessive speed but that, coincidentally, traffic volume also decreased by an average of 28 percent.

The budget for traffic calming currently stands at \$476,730, of which \$227,000 was carried over from previous years and \$250,000 was approved in July. Projects approved but not yet constructed are estimated to cost \$285,000. Staff is requesting an additional \$250,000 in the next fiscal year.

Chair Olmsted recalled that the Commission had requested updates on traffic calming projects about a year ago. At the time they felt that perhaps the quality work being done by staff was going unrecognized and that it was important to understand the value of the projects the Commission was being asked to approve. The ultimate goal is to reach consensus and find solutions.

## **6. NEIGHBORHOOD TRAFFIC MANAGEMENT PROGRAM (NTMP) PROJECT REQUESTS**

Mr. Bartlett presented the projects below for the Commission's approval.

- Cattletrack Road – Lincoln Drive to McDonald Drive

Mr. Bartlett described the progress of this project thus far. It met all criteria for neighborhood traffic calming, except that 50 percent of the frontage does not have direct driveway access. The Transportation Commission granted an exception to this requirement at the request of the residents.

The total cost of the project is approximately \$115,000. A petition signed by 78.3 percent of the residents is in favor of the project. At the public outreach meeting, residents were generally in favor of the project, but had concerns about maintaining the rural character of Cattletrack Road. An outside design consultant will be hired to help preserve the rural, historic character of the road. The completed design will be presented at a later public outreach meeting.

Mr. Bartlett noted that Fire Chief Jim Ford was in attendance, as well as residents who initiated this project.

Highlights of the discussion following the presentation included:

- Transportation Director Mr. Paul Basha confirmed that the residents do not want curbs or sidewalks. This area was settled in the 1930's and 40's, before the City was incorporated.
- Mr. Bartlett confirmed that the Fire Department supports the design of this project.
- Chair Olmsted thanked staff and residents for finding solutions to areas of concern and encouraged others to bring neighborhood traffic issues to the Commission.

**COMMISSIONER BRETZ MADE A MOTION TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF THE CATTLETRACK ROAD NEIGHBORHOOD TRAFFIC MANAGEMENT PROJECT. COMMISSIONER GRAHAM SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0).**

- 84th Street – Stagecoach Pass Road to Blackwater Road

Mr. Bartlett presented the proposed neighborhood traffic management project on 84th Street between Black Mountain Road and Hawknest Road.

He noted that the developer of Sierra Highlands stipulated to contribute to complete 84th Street south to Black Mountain Road. Existing residents expressed concern on potential speeding along 84th Street and the potential for cut-through traffic to leave Pima Road and use 84th Street. City Council approved the development in September with a stipulation to implement traffic calming on 84th Street.

At a public outreach meeting in October, residents again expressed concerns about potential cut-through traffic, the proposed 30 miles per hour speed limit, and requested

alternative traffic calming options. Traffic Engineering is investigating both short-term and long-term solutions to concerns regarding Black Mountain Road.

Mr. Bartlett discussed design considerations and parameters. The proposal is to use speed tables. Since the developer was stipulated to pay half the cost of the traffic calming devices up to an amount of \$35,000, staff is working with the developer so that traffic calming devices will be built as the developer builds their portion of 84th Street. The speed tables north of Sierra Highlands will be constructed soon after by the City. The estimated cost to the City is \$45,000.

Chair Olmsted opened public commentary.

- **Ms. Anne Hilton** thanked staff for their work with residents. She requested that the speed limit be set at 25 miles per hour.
- **Ms. Lynne Sullivan**, a resident of Sandflower, displayed aerial views of that community to illustrate concerns regarding access to the neighborhood. Black Mountain Road is narrow and, in certain places, has no shoulder. She described a number of accidents in the area and emphasized that any study of existing traffic patterns is not representative of how traffic will flow once 84th Street is completed.
- **Ms. Beva Drakulovic**, a resident of the Cortona subdivision, argued that portions of 84th Street are so narrow that two vehicles cannot pass each other. She noted that Black Mountain Road drops 40 feet near 84th Street and that more is needed for traffic safety. This is a neighborhood with many young families. She expressed concern on construction traffic. She urged that the stretch of 84th Street to Westland should be completed.
- **Ms. Catherine Wendt**, who lives in the Cortona subdivision, thanked staff for the notices they had received advising them of public outreach meetings. She expressed concerns about Black Mountain Road and agreed that the speed limit for 84th Street should be 25 miles per hour. She also expressed concerns about construction traffic.
- **Mr. Chris Asterino**, a resident of Cortona, said the real concern is Black Mountain Road west of 84th Street, as it is not designed for the existing volume of traffic. He suggested not allowing drivers to turn west from 84th Street onto Black Mountain Road to get to Scottsdale Road.

Mr. Bartlett noted that staff has heard residents' concerns regarding Black Mountain Road; however, this traffic calming plan is tied with the Sierra Highlands development in which the developer will complete 84th Street and the frontage on Black Mountain Road. Staff is working on some interim measures to address concerns on Black Mountain Road. The department will also be looking at longer term solutions involving capital improvements.

Chair Olmsted undertook to agendaize discussion on Black Mountain Road for a future meeting, to include requesting that staff look at a possible future capital improvement project.

Mr. Phillip Kercher, Principal Traffic Engineer, confirmed that the main concern expressed by residents was the 30 mile per hour speed limit on 84<sup>th</sup> Street. He clarified that this higher speed limit will only apply to the completed sections of the road.

A discussion about the timeline for completing 84th Street and installing the traffic calming devices ensued.

A citizen asked when the Commission would be discussing improvements to Black Mountain Road. Mr. Basha said this would be agendaized for February or March 2015. It was also asked whether construction traffic could be prohibited from driving west of 84th Street on Black Mountain Road. Mr. Basha said they could.

A Commissioner suggested it would be more efficient to have the developer construct all of the traffic calming devices on 84th Street. Mr. Basha said the City cannot pay a private developer to construct the two devices on the portion of the street for which the City is responsible.

Chair Olmsted mentioned that since the 84th Street project will take a while, the Commission may hear an update towards the summer of 2015.

**VICE CHAIR HOLLEY MADE A MOTION TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF THE 84TH STREET TRAFFIC CALMING PROJECT AS PROPOSED. COMMISSIONER BRETZ SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0).**

## **7. HIGH CAPACITY TRANSIT STUDY**

Transportation Planning and Transportation Operations Manager Ms. Madeline Clemann presented the proposed High Capacity Transit (HCT) Tier 2 study. She explained that the Tier 1 study is a first look at the best route or corridor and evaluates the different transportation modes. A Tier 2 study is more specific and aims to arrive at the locally preferred alternative.

The preferred corridor is Scottsdale Road from the Tempe border north to the new park-and-ride lot. Modes of transportation considered include light rail, bus rapid transit and streetcars. Ms. Clemann discussed the advantages and disadvantages of the various technologies. In 2011, Scottsdale and Tempe embarked on an alternative analysis study which recommended bus rapid transit (BRT). Due to a lack of operating funds, neither of the City Councils nor Valley Metro adopted the recommendations of the study.

In the past year, staff has concluded that BRT is not appropriate until Scottsdale's east-west route ridership is increased. The only way to improve east-west ridership is to increase the frequency of bus service.

Principal Transit Planner Ms. Ratna Koropella presented the latest information gathered on the demographics regarding the age and income level of transit riders, whether they could make their trip without transit, and where and when they are traveling. She noted that millennials aged 18 to 34 are less car dependent and cited using their ride time to socialize. Making apps that provide real-time transit information and Wi-Fi on buses and at stations would also be attractive to millennials.

Ms. Koropella noted that Scottsdale has nothing planned for high capacity transit before 2025 and is lagging behind other Valley cities. Advance planning is needed to obtain federal funding.

The proposed Tier 2 study will conduct further analysis from the previous Tier 1 study and will also evaluate technologies (i.e., electric, solar powered, and battery operated vehicles) that will not disrupt traffic and produce less pollution. The study will also examine millennials' preferences and review studies done since 1996 on the Scottsdale Road corridor. The study will consider travel demand forecasting, trip attractors and generators. Computer modeling will enable them to test different scenarios.

Highlights of the discussion following the presentation included:

- A Commissioner suggested finding out whether millennials have a preference between local bus and BRT. Ms. Koropella said they want to understand the reasons for younger riders' transit preferences. The LINK is categorized as BRT light because it does not run on a dedicated guideway. The Commissioner expressed that since the LINK route is currently operating, it should have been included on the route map shown. He opined that there is already enough ridership on Scottsdale Road to justify the service. Current ridership on Scottsdale Road is probably higher now than ridership on Country Club and Chandler Boulevard had been when LINK was established. Ms. Koropella agreed. The Commissioner said adding BRT might attract additional riders because it is a different transit option. Ms. Clemann undertook to take this into consideration. The BRT decision is up to the City, not Valley Metro.
- A Commissioner commented that BRT is similar to service in many South American cities that run on dedicated guideways and are as fast as LRT. He recalled the previous Transportation Master Plan and how the Tier 2 Study was described, saying that this seems to be Tier 1B as it appears to be rehashing what they have already discussed. Ms. Clemann said staff provided a broad overview of the processes they went through to arrive at their intentions for the Tier 2 Study.
- Mr. Basha clarified that Tier 1 and Tier 2 are EPA terms that do not really directly apply to any transportation or transit analysis. They are used in transportation relative to environmental impact analysis. He agreed that staff will be revisiting the Tier 1 analysis to explore technologies, locations, and routes. The 2008 Tier 1 Study for the Transportation Master Plan was very narrowly focused. The upcoming study will consider newly developed technologies and explore other routes and termination points north of Chaparral Boulevard. The Commissioner commented that the 2008 plan was fine and it is not necessary to expand and rehash it.



- A Commissioner opined that east-west ridership cannot be built until a north-south transit alternative is available.
- A Commissioner indicated that although millennials will make up the bulk of the workforce, the senior demographic is growing and increasing numbers of them will become dependent on transit. He urged that seniors should be studied, even if they are currently still driving.
- Mr. Basha said the study will examine future ridership. Demographics will be studied to determine where new transit service would be used.
- A Commissioner inquired what will happen once the Tier 2 Study is completed. Mr. Basha said a Tier 2 Study is expensive and staff would hire a consultant. It determines the impacts to adjacent neighborhoods, the environment, and other ramifications of construction. He added that BRT, LRT, and modern streetcars cost approximately \$30 million to \$200 million per mile. If the City were to decide today that they wanted one of these systems in Scottsdale, the soonest it could occur is in the late 2030's. At this point, the City does not have a consensus. It will take five to ten years to come to a decision and before a system could be implemented. The reason to revisit this topic is to consider other less expensive technologies that could be implemented in the next five to ten years.
- A Commissioner said that while the 2008 study was worthwhile, the new proposed study can provide much more information.
- A Commissioner suggested calling this a supplemental Tier 1 Study, as the Tier 2 title is confusing.
- Chair Olmsted requested that the Transportation Commission report from April 2012 be included in next month's packet. There is clearly an opportunity to revisit this issue as there is now much more data than previously. He opined that the City does not seem to pick a direction with regard to the debate on LRT, BRT, and other multimodal transit options. He stated it is important that the City participate in the broader activities brought forth by the Commission on different modes of use, given the needs of young people and public demand. It is important to commit to a direction, understanding that many of the concrete steps and decisions are in fact years away.
- It is felt that the LINK service should be considered in Scottsdale because it can be added at lower cost since no right-of-way has to be acquired.
- A Commissioner mentioned mentioned that the Loop 101 should be marked as a transit corridor for the future. He concurred with Chair Olmsted that at some point, a decision has to be made as to what direction should be considered.

## **8. SUPER BOWL 2015**

Right-of-Way Supervisor Mr. Walt Brodzinski presented the planning for Super Bowl 2015. Staff has received 29 event applications, of which 7 have been fully approved. Eleven (11) applications are pending approval. A few applications have been denied, while some applications do not require a permit. Mr. Brodzinski displayed an updated map reflecting venues of currently approved events. He noted that no major streets are impacted. Mr. Brodzinski listed a few of the bigger events planned for Scottsdale.

Staff is working with the Public Information Office on developing and publicizing an information phone number for updated event and transportation information.

Highlights of the discussion following the presentation included:

- A Commissioner noted that the Airport is anticipating 130 departures on the Sunday following the game and at least 200 departures on Monday. He perceives that this will create severe constraints on traffic flow for the Airport's fixed base operators. Parking of personal and rental vehicles will also be of particular concern. He inquired about traffic and parking management in that vicinity.
- Mr. Brodzinski mentioned that there have been no specific conversations about parking. He acknowledged that parking is limited, although outlying parking is available on private property that is not under City control. The Traffic Management Center will be watching the Airport/Airpark area more intently than at the 2008 Super Bowl. Mr. Brodzinski acknowledged it will be challenging as there will also be non-Airport related traffic in the area. One private event is being planned in Hangar 1.
- A Commissioner inquired whether trolley service could be provided from the park-and-ride to the golf tournament. Mr. Basha mentioned that the Day Tripper will run to the golf tournament and that a stop could be added at the Thunderbird Park-and-Ride lot.

## **9. COLLISION MITIGATION CASE STUDIES**

Mr. George Williams, Principal Traffic Engineer, gave a presentation about traffic safety and the traffic safety review done by staff every two years. Mitigation measures can range from adjusting traffic signal phasing or having vegetation trimmed to capital improvements.

Highlights of the discussion following the presentation included:

- A Commissioner inquired about the economic impact in terms of reduction in property damage, personal injuries, and emergency response. Mr. Williams stated that staff has some idea of projects where MAG funding is involved. For projects done entirely by the City, typically no analysis is done. Most of staffs' time is spent responding to requests and making improvements to enhance safety, which does not involve major expenses. Mr. Williams acknowledged that staff could do a better job of documenting the impact of their improvements.
- A Commissioner stated it is evident that staff is proactive and an economic analysis could make a compelling case for their budget.
- Chair Olmsted said the Commission appreciates these updates. He asked Mr. Williams if there are any projects that are not on the CIP list. Mr. Williams replied that he feels everything is covered.
- Chair Olmsted asked whether the funding staff is able to use on an immediate basis is set up in the budget. Mr. Williams stated that intersection mobility enhancement funds are used most often to address traffic safety, since most collisions occur at intersections. Chair Olmsted suggested that if staff needs more funding, they should advise the Commission.

**CHAIR OLMSTED MOVED TO TABLE THE REMAINING AGENDA ITEMS TO THE NEXT MEETING. COMMISSIONER STICKLES SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0).**

**10. PATHS & TRAILS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT**

Tabled.

**11. TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS/PROGRAMS UPDATE**

Tabled.

**12. PUBLIC COMMENT**

None.

**13. COMMISSION IDENTIFICATION OF FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

None.

**14. ADJOURNMENT**

With no further business to conduct, Chair Olmsted adjourned the regular meeting at 8:54 p.m.

SUBMITTED BY:

A/V Tronics, Inc. DBA AVTranz.

**\*Note: These are summary action meeting minutes only. A complete copy of the audio/video recording is available at <http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/transp.asp>**