SUMMARIZED MINUTES

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
SPECIAL MEETING

THURSDAY, MAY 5, 2011

KIVA – CITY HALL
3939 N. DRINKWATER BOULEVARD
SCOTTSDALE, AZ 85251

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Weiss called the Special Meeting of the Scottsdale Transportation Commission to order at 6:04 p.m.

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Josh Weiss, Chair
Terry Gruver, Vice Chair
William Howard, Commissioner
Steven Olmsted, Commissioner
Paul Ward, Commissioner

ABSENT: Carleton Cole, Commissioner
Donald Maxwell, Commissioner

STAFF: Dave Meinhart, Transportation Director
Rose Arballo, Transportation Commission Coordinator
Madeline Clemann, Transit Supervisor
Annie DeChance, Public Information Coordinator
Teresa Huish, Principal Transportation Planner
Reed Kempton, Principal Transportation Planner
Dan Worth, Executive Director – Public Works

2. Approval of Meeting Minutes

- Study Session of the Transportation Commission – April 13, 2011
- Regular Meeting of the Transportation Commission – April 13, 2011

COMMISSIONER HOWARD MOVED TO APPROVE THE STUDY SESSION AND REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF APRIL 13, 2011. VICE CHAIR GRUVER SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0).

3. Public Comment

No public comment was received.

4. Operating Budget Reduction Proposals

The purpose of tonight's meeting is to continue deliberations to review and take action on changes to the draft Fiscal Year 2011/12 Transportation Fund operating budget that address shortfalls in the State's Highway User Revenue Fund in the amount of approximately $2.6 million.

Mr. Meinhart gave an overview on how the State budget that was approved by the legislature on April 6th resulted in a reduction of Scottsdale's share of Highway User Revenue funds. He also provided a summary of the Transportation Commission's direction to staff at the April 13th Commission meeting that identified specific items focusing on revenue adjustments; personnel-related items; refined transit service options relative to Routes 81, 511, 170, and 72; possible adjustment in the qualifying age for voluntary senior non-ADA Paratransit from 65 to 70 years; matching of adjoining service levels by adjusting weekend frequencies of the Neighborhood Trolley; and possible consideration of other budget reduction options for street operations and transit service. With regards to the refined transit service options, Mr. Meinhart presented detailed information on the route alignment changes and/or transit efficiencies to include hours of operation and frequencies for Routes 81, 511, 170, and 72.

Mr. Meinhart explained that as a result of the State's new budget and as of the April 13th Commission meeting, a new item has been added to the list of possible recommended reductions, which is to include $27,000 of retirement contribution savings due to a change in the employee contribution rate to 53%. In addition, based on positive, updated information on forecasted transit contract costs for FY 12, we will be able to save $250,000 without impacting service.

With the Commission's guidance provided at the April 13th meeting and with the current financial information available, staff developed a refined list of three different options for consideration by the Commission. Mr. Meinhart reviewed each individual line item within each of the three options that contain total amounts for potential reductions to the Transportation Fund Operating Budget, recommended revenue adjustments/operating savings as agreed at

the April 13th Commission meeting, and CIP savings. He pointed out that Option 1 reflects using approximately 1/3 of the estimated $2 million in CIP savings to make up for the amount of transit service reductions; Option 2 would use about 1/2 of CIP savings; and Option 3 would use about 2/3 of CIP savings. (See Attachment A.)

Mr. Meinhart mentioned that the same summaries of information provided to the Commission have also been passed to the Budget Review Commission, and they have expressed no concerns to this proposal. Also, as far as public input received since the last Commission meeting on April 13th, only one comment was received indicating support for no transit service reductions.

Chair Weiss opened the floor for public comment and no comment was received.

Chair Weiss commented that although the last Commission meeting on April 13th was unfortunately not televised, most of the items discussed tonight were reviewed at the last meeting (specifically using options of the CIP fund and maintenance of roadways with regards to the overlay and slurry seal) and continued into tonight's review as a way to try to limit reductions as much as possible to narrow down the options, and to provide additional options for the Commission to consider at this meeting.

Vice Chair Gruver commented she is sensitive to making any transit cuts due to the fact that transit is not something that is implemented and immediately productive and efficient. She believes it takes time to build up efficiency and productivity on a route. When transit service is cut, it affects the entire system and can take years to build it back up.

After discussion and addressing of Commissioner's concerns on:

- the one-time impact to cities and counties, specifically the $1.55 million one-year reduction to help state fund Arizona's Department of Public Safety and Motor Vehicle Division;
- amount of savings for CIP Advance Planning;
- amount of savings, and particular change and impacts in service for Route 81 in Option 1;
- amount of carryover used from CIP savings;
- making transit service cuts now versus two to three years from now;
- staff proposal to not recommend any changes to the eligibility age for the non-ADA Paratransit program;

the Transportation Commission agreed and recommended the proposed Fiscal Year 12 budget reductions as shown on Attachment B.

COMMISSIONER HOWARD MOVED TO RECOMMEND THE USE OF 1/2 OF THE CIP SAVINGS TO MAKE UP MORE THAN$900,000 IN TRANSIT REDUCTIONS. COMMISSIONER OLMSTED SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0).

COMMISSIONER WARD MOTIONED TO MOVE FORWARD WITH A MIX OF COST REDUCTIONS, REVENUE SOURCES, AND USE OF OPERATING AND CIP SAVINGS FROM OPTION 1 AND OPTION 2. (REFERENCE ATTACHMENT B.) COMMISSIONER HOWARD SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0).

Mr. Meinhart stated that any Commission input and recommendations will be provided to the Budget Commission for their review and discussion at the May 10th and May 17th budget meetings.

5. Public Comment

No public comment was received.

6. Identification of Future Agenda Items

None.

7. Adjournment

With no further business to discuss, Chair Weiss adjourned the Special Meeting at 7:25 p.m.

SUBMITTED BY:

Rose Arballo
Transportation Coordinator

***NOTE: These are summary action meeting minutes only. A complete copy of the audio/video recording is available at http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/Transp.asp**

Reduction Item/Proposal	Option 1 (1/3 of CIP Savings)	Option 2 (1/2 of CIP Savings)	Option 3 (2/3 of CIP Savings)
Reduce transit contracts budget due to updated FY 12 rates	250,000	250,000	250,000
Eliminate pool vehicles	10,000	10,000	10,000
CIP Advance Planning	200,000	100,000	
Neighborhood Trolley - Weekend service at 30 min.	170,000	170,000	
Route 72 - Eliminate trips before 5:00 a.m.	63,000	63,000	
Route 81 - Revise route in Airpark to use Raintree Dr.		152,000	152,000
Route 81 - Eliminate trips before 5:00 a.m. (using Raintree)		74,000	74,000
Route 81 - Use Raintree Dr.; 5:00 a.m.-11:00 p.m., revise frequency to 30 minutes all day	384,000		
Route 511 (Airpark Express) - Revise route to use Raintree/Thunderbird corridor	13,000	13,000	13,000
Route 170 (Frank Lloyd Wright) - Weekend service at 60 min.	45,000		
Potential Reductions to Transportation Fund Operating Budget	**1,135,000**	**832,000**	**499,000**
Recommended Revenue Adjustments/Operating Savings (4/13/11)	**791,000**	**791,000**	**791,000**
CIP Savings	**674,000**	**977,000**	**1,310,000**
Total Reductions and City Revenues	***2,600,000***	***2,600,000***	***2,600,000***

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE

ATTACHMENT A

Transportation Commission Recommendations for Further FY 12 Budget Reductions

Reduction Item/Proposal	Trans. Comm. 5/5/11
Reduce transit contracts budget due to updated FY 12 rates	250,000
Eliminate pool vehicles	10,000
CIP Advance Planning	200,000
Route 72 - Eliminate trips before 5:00 a.m.	63,000
Route 81 - Use Raintree Dr.; 5:00 a.m.-11:00 p.m., revise frequency to 30 minutes all day	384,000
Route 511 (Airpark Express) - Revise route to use Raintree/Thunderbird corridor	13,000
Transportation Fund Operations Reduction Total	**920,000**
Additional revenue sources:	
CIP for Pavement Overlay staff (1.5 FTE)	134,000
Employee retirement contribution increase	27,000
Sponsorhips/Advertising on Trolleys	50,000
Solid Waste Fund for alleys	80,000
FY 11 operating savings	500,000
CIP Savings	889,000
Transportation Revenues Total	**1,680,000**
Total Reductions and City Revenues	**2,600,000**

ATTACHMENT B

as of 5/6/11