
This document was created from the closed caption transcript of the October 24, 2023 City Council Special Meeting and has not been checked for completeness or accuracy of content.

A copy of the agenda for this meeting, including a summary of the action taken on each agenda item, is available online at:

<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/Assets/ScottsdaleAZ/Council/current-agendas-minutes/2023-agendas/10-24-23-special-agenda.pdf>

An unedited digital video recording of the meeting, which can be used in conjunction with the transcript, is available online at:

<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/scottsdale-video-network/Council-video-archives/2023-archives>

For ease of reference, included throughout the transcript are bracketed "time stamps" [Time: 00:00:00] that correspond to digital video recording time.

For more information about this transcript, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 480-312-2411.

CALL TO ORDER

[Time: 00:00:02]

Mayor Ortega: I call the October 24th, 2023, City Council Special Meeting to order. City Clerk Ben Lane, would you please conduct the roll call.

City Clerk Lane: Thank you, Mayor. Mayor David Ortega.

Mayor Ortega: Present.

City Clerk Lane: Vice Mayor Solange Whitehead.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Present.

City Clerk Lane: Councilmembers Tammy Caputi.

Councilwoman Caputi: Here.

City Clerk Lane: Tom Durham.

Councilmember Durham: Here.

City Clerk Lane: Barry Graham.

Councilmember Graham: Here.

City Clerk Lane: Betty Janik.

Councilwoman Janik: Here.

City Clerk Lane: Kathy Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Here.

City Clerk Lane: City Manager Jim Thompson.

City Manager Thompson: Here.

City Clerk Lane: City Attorney Sherry Scott.

City Attorney Scott: Here

City Clerk Lane: And the Clerk is present. Thank you, Mayor.

Mayor Ortega: Well, thank you. The purpose of the Special Meeting today is to hear interviews and make appointments on Boards, Commissions, and Task Forces. At this time, I will turn the meeting over to Vice Mayor Whitehead who will be chairing this portion of the meeting.

[Time: 00:00:55]

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you, Mayor. The Scottsdale City Council is responsible for establishing City policies and enacting laws in support of those policies. The Council relies on volunteer, citizen-based Boards and Commissions to research issues, and make recommendations in support of the Council's mission and goals. The information and recommendations provided by Council-appointed Advisory Boards is a valuable tool in helping Councilmembers in their deliberations. This afternoon, the City Council will be appointing Scottsdale residents interested in serving on various Boards and Commissions. I want to thank the individuals for their willingness to volunteer their time in service to this community. Following the set of interviews, we'll vote on an appointment for the Board or the Commission.

As I call your name, please approach the podium, and briefly cover the following: For the record, please state your name and address and how long you have lived in Scottsdale. Please tell us how your education, employment, or volunteer experience relates to this Board or Commission. What is the top issue facing this Board or Commission? And please limit your comments to two minutes or less. We have a timer by the screen to help you manage your time. Following each nominee's response, I will ask Councilmembers if they have any follow up questions for you.

And so with that, we are going to get started with the Building Advisory Board of Appeals which we have one opening. The Building Advisory Board of Appeals has the jurisdiction to recommend that minor variances in the electrical, plumbing, and mechanical application of the Building Code be granted and that alternative construction methods or materials be allowed. There is one vacancy and two nominees.

The nominees are Doug Arvanites and Randall Lukas. Mr. Lukas' term expired this month and is eligible for reappointment. So, why don't we have Doug come up to the podium first.

[Time: 00:03:31]

Doug Arvanites: Hello, my name is Doug Arvanites, I have lived at 7314 East Granada Road in Scottsdale. I've been a resident of Scottsdale for six years next week. And I have a bachelor's degree in marketing and economics, which has absolutely nothing to do with this position, however, I worked in the corporate world in retail for 35 years. And in that capacity, I interacted with developers and architects and store planning executives in doing various new store openings and store remodels and had to go through a lot of learning how to read floor plans, understanding the ins and outs of where you can run wires, where you can run plumbing, where you can't.

And I've also, over the course of my life, had six different homes which I've renovated extensively, some by myself. And I think I have enough working knowledge of the things that are involved in construction to be able to not be a burden to this Board. I have a great interest in the planning and design areas. I studied architecture early in my career before deciding to go in a different direction and actually thought about going to the Frank Lloyd Wright school here in Scottsdale many, many, many years ago. I have a passion for the City of Scottsdale to become the greatest city in the United States, and I think it's well on its way.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Are there any questions? Go ahead.

Councilwoman Caputi: Remind me how to pronounce your last name. I don't want to say it wrong.

Doug Arvanites: Arvanites.

Councilwoman Caputi: Arvanites, okay. Just the last question, I'm curious, the top issue facing the Board or Commission. Did you have an answer on that? I can't remember. Sorry, if I'm putting you on the spot.

Doug Arvanites: I feel like the Board, I have been reviewing the meeting minutes and also the meeting videos and I think that the Board, as it's currently comprised is overly focused on, you know how we do things now, how we've done things in the past, and not focused enough on how the world is evolving more rapidly and rapidly. And the fact that we are building buildings that will be standing for 40 to 75 years, and are we really taking the future into consideration adequately as we approve these projects.

Councilwoman Caputi: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Are there any other questions? Okay, Mr. Graham.

Councilmember Graham: Thank you, Vice Mayor. Mr. Arvanites, if you are not successful today, I hope you continue reapplying. Thank you.

Doug Arvanites: Okay, thank you.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay. You're done. Mr. Lukas.

Randall Lukas: Randall Lukas, 10386 East Ludlow Drive, Scottsdale. Came to Scottsdale in July of 2017. The history is I come from Illinois. I built numerous houses, more than 12 in Illinois, and did a few flips. When we came to Scottsdale, I bought a house, renovated it, flipped it, built a new house that we live in now, and have built two other houses in Scottsdale. So, I've used the Scottsdale permit services. I understand the services. I understand the Codes. I understand the importance of the Codes. The experience, obviously, is I have interaction with all of the contractors. Also, on the side as a part time, I do insurance inspections and the specialty is high value residential inspections. So, I do spend a lot of time in Scottsdale, in and out of houses, seeing what's code, what's not, what people do. You know, most people want a fire extinguisher, but they don't have a fire extinguisher in their house.

[Time: 00:08:03]

You see people building houses that are valued at \$7 million and this wasn't in Scottsdale because sprinkler systems are required, and you look at them and you go, oh, you don't have a sprinkler system. Well, it's not code. And as you walk out, you think to yourself, you just spent \$5 million, and you didn't spend the \$10,000 to save the house. So, a lot of it is control, and I'm not for big government. At the same time, you've got a guy who just spent \$5 million, and he wouldn't spend \$10,000 to put an instrument in there to protect it. So how you need to have some rules.

The biggest obstacles or biggest things for the Board coming up here is one thing we made as far as moving towards the future, in every discussion of a Code change, there was never the cost to the consumer or end user ever brought up. And we would say to the E.V. chargers in the garage, okay. Oh, it's only two wires. It's only two wires. It is only two wires. How many chargers are there? So as you do the research, oh, the Chevy Bolt was a 25 amp, which no insurance company will allow you to put in their garage.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Mr. Lukas, your time is up, so just wrap it up.

Randall Lukas: Okay, anyways, the insurance inspection shows the different variances of the houses. So, I thank you. And I have been on the Board for three years. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you. Are there any questions? No, there's no questions, Mr. Lukas. Okay, I will now entertain a vote for the Building Advisory Board of Appeals and each Councilmember gets to vote for one candidate. We're going to start with Councilwoman Caputi.

Councilwoman Caputi: Doug Arvanites, please.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Janik.

Councilwoman Janik: Doug Arvanites.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Randall Lukas.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Mayor Ortega.

Mayor Ortega: Doug Arvanites.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: I will vote for Doug Arvanites. Councilman Durham.

Councilmember Durham: Mr. Arvanites.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilman Graham.

Councilmember Graham: Mr. Lukas.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, so it looks like Mr. Arvanites will have the position. So, congratulations, and thanks both of you.

[Time: 00:10:38]

Next up is the Citizen's Bond Oversight Committee and there's three openings. The Citizen's Bond Oversight Committee receives reports on the City's progress in implementing the Bond Program, reviews any proposed project changes to the Program and provides comments to the City Council with respect to the Bond Program as the Committee deems appropriate. There are three vacancies and six nominees.

Robert Rogers has withdrawn his application from consideration. The nominees are Brian Coughlan, Austin Fairbanks, Rudy Fischer, Ben Hur and Mr. Hur, his term has expired and he's eligible for reappointment, Darryl Komesu, and Tami Smith. We'll start with Brian Coughlan. Please come on up.

Brian Coughlan: Thank you, my name is Brian Coughlan. I live at 9758 East Celtic Drive. Mayor Ortega, Vice Mayor Whitehead, and Councilmembers I appreciate your time today. Applying for the position for the Bond Oversight Committee member. And I think there were two questions to answer and that was why and what are my qualifications? I think the why is I have lived in Scottsdale for 15 years. Born and raised here in Arizona. My children have gone through the Scottsdale School District, so I have a vested interest in seeing Scottsdale succeed. And funding is a scarce resource, so putting funding to its highest and best use is important. My wife and I volunteered quite often in the school districts here in Scottsdale. Sitting as P.T.O. members, P.T.O. Chairs, amongst other volunteering work in the Scottsdale School District. So, we really have a vested interest here in Scottsdale for our children, for the City itself, to see it grow and prosper.

The qualifications, I think I have a strong background here. I have got over 25 years of experience in finance. I have got degrees in finance from the University of Arizona, my M.B.A. from Arizona State University. I have experience in municipal finance and municipal bond underwriting here in the State of Arizona. I'm a partner at Beacon Point Advisors. We are one of the 15 largest wealth management firms in the country that my partners and I have built. I'm also the Chair of the Macroeconomic Committee for the Firm. I spent seven years as a finance professor for the Keller Graduate School of Management where I taught managerial finance, advanced managerial finance, and securities valuation.

With the Bond Oversight Committee, it's important for someone to have a good understanding of financial analysis, financial forecasting, and budgeting. You have to have those qualifications. We are a fiduciary. We are sitting in a fiduciary responsibility. And I feel I have those strong background, those qualifications from my educational background, from my professional experience, and being a professor here in the State for seven years. I feel I make a really good committee member on the Bond Oversight Committee, and I look forward to hopefully gathering your vote. If there's any questions, I'm more than happy to field them.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Are there any questions? I see none. Okay, thank you.

Brian Coughlan: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Mr. Fairbanks.

Austin Fairbanks: Honorable Mayor and Councilmembers, good afternoon, my name is Austin Fairbanks I live at 2938 North 61st Place Scottsdale, Arizona, 85251. I lived in Scottsdale for basically my entire life, minus the time I was school, at college. I first introduced myself back in June where I explained I'm a third generation Scottsdale resident and Scottsdale homeowner and a state and local public financial professional. I believe these traits qualify me to analyze the important questions and decisions coming before the Citizen's Bond Oversight Committee. By way of re-introduction, I hold a masters in economics with an emphasis in state and local policy and public finance. Professionally I work as a lead appropriations analyst for the State Legislature, so I have a deep appreciate for state public finance laws that govern cities and bonding laws, as well as capital improvement plans or CIPs.

As I said in June, I still believe that the biggest issue facing the Citizen's Bond Oversight Committee and the Bond 2019 projects generally is inflation. And that's eating away at some of the revenues that the bond will have, and increased construction cost is a component of that as well. The solution to this problem will require careful oversight and balancing the return on investment of these projects as well as the expectations and the demands of the voters who approved these bonds. We can't change the bonds willy nilly, this is voted on by the people. I think that's something to keep in mind serving in your role and in the potential role on the Committee.

Last time I was here, I also talked about how I would prioritize the Public Safety Bond Questions, Question Three. I think that's important, and I discussed that a little bit last time, but this time I want to talk a little bit about the importance of maintaining trust in our Bond Program. I'm just going to use as an example, the recently approved Paiute Neighborhood Center Program, which will help house people. But I think it's important that in this Committee, we definitely look at making sure that the bond money is used for the bond approved part of the project and then the grants and other City funds are going to the housing component. So, we assure the public that our great City staff are doing the job that they need to do. I think that that attempted citizen led oversight will continue to lead to continued public trust in the City of Scottsdale. And I believe my technical public finance expertise, qualifies me for this role. And with that, I thank you for your service and your time and I will take any questions you may have.

[Time: 00:16:18]

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you. Any questions, comments? I see none. Thank you.

Austin Fairbanks: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Mr. Fischer.

Rudy Fischer: Mr. Mayor, City Council, thank you. Before I start, I would like to say I would like to congratulate you and I would like to say I appreciate everybody being here. I seldom have seen such public participation, except for opposition to a really ugly project. So good afternoon. My name is Rudy Fischer and I live at 10260 East White Feather Lane in North Troon, right near the Troon North Golf Course. I have a bachelor's degree from U.C. Berkeley, a master's in international business from St. Mary's College. And mid-career, while working in Silicon Valley, I went to Stanford for a couple of years and got a Certificate in Business Law and Economics. So, I understand finance and how bonds and all of that work.

I have only lived in Scottsdale for about two years now. In that time, I have completed the Scottsdale 101 Academy, the Scottsdale Water Academy, and I have gone through about seven, I think, CAP water presentations, the CAP university presentations. You have also probably seen me at a few of your meetings and I spend a lot of time watching the Development Review Board and the Bond Oversight Committee meetings because I think those things are important to making sure that we're building a good Scottsdale that we can all appreciate and love.

I have also served on Boards and Commissions in the past, whether it's an HOA or Library Board in Mountainview, Golf Links Advisory Committee, even though I'm not a golfer, and I have served on City Councils and on a Water Board for a pollution control agency, which later turned, we turned it into a water provider for the community. And we did that with bond funding and grants and a lot of other things, so I understand and appreciate the value of bonds.

I think the biggest challenge for the City right now on the Committee is to use the bond funds effectively, and to complete the projects which are key to the City of Scottsdale. And to ensure that the money is spent appropriately, so that we can prove to a sometimes skeptical public, that they are. Thank you.

[Time: 00:18:55]

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you. Any questions from anyone? None. Thank you, Mr. Fischer. Okay. It looks like Mr. Hur.

Ben Hur: Good afternoon, Mayor, Vice Mayor, Councilmembers, my name is Ben Hur. When I say that my name you are probably curious. Are you seriously Ben Hur? Yes, I have a little stories to tell you about that, but just to put it aside a little bit. So, I came to live in Scottsdale since 2007. The first time when I moved in here, I really appreciate all the environments, all the nice, clean, good environments, good neighborhood, and nice education. And since then, I have been looking for the opportunity to pay back because I feel like I benefited from all this nice neighborhood environments. How can I pay back and how can I do my duty as a citizen who lives in Scottsdale? I have a CPA. I'm a CPA partner, a partner in CPA firm who is mainly doing the audits of the municipalities, not for profit entities, and so I feel I

have knowledge and understanding about how the municipal financial reportings and the compliance works.

And I look through the opportunities on the City's website, I found the Bond Oversight Committee. I feel like I have a little bit of the opportunity to do work for the cities. So that's why I applied and then I just kind of have the positions for the first time. Back then, I didn't have this kind of interview process, so this is a little bit overwhelming. I'm hearing these nice resumes of those candidates and it's great and honor to be here.

To me, the most important thing as Committee members is communication and transparency. When the citizens voted to approve the bond issuances back then, they wanted to see the oldest nice developments just kind of help to them build this community even better. Like I just felt when I first came here. When it comes down to the Bond Oversight Committee, I know I have seen this kind of city management and the city staff did a really good job and they put together all of these things nicely, everything is great. I'm not really going to emphasize what I can do, based on my expertise. I think it's really important to deliver those nice works back to the communities. And then advertise on how well they are doing it, they establish their beliefs, trust to the cities. That's all. Thank you so much.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you. Any questions? Okay. Thank you, Mr. Hur. Okay. Mr. Komesu.

Darryl Komesu: Mr. Mayor and Councilmen, thank you for taking the time.

Mayor Ortega: Come closer to the mic.

[Time: 00:22:00]

Darryl Komesu: Oh, I'm sorry. Thank you for taking the time to listen to my achievements and qualifications. My address is 10462 East Helm Drive, so I live in McDowell Mountain Ranch, and I have been a resident for 15 years now, moving back here two years ago after I had retired early. In terms of my work experiences, I ended my career as a project manager for DirecTV in their operations group, and before that, I was a satellite engineer for most of my career.

Being a program manager really emphasizes the need to understand the critical path of any project, and I believe it's necessary to understand all the details behind the critical path, such as, you know, what's driving the project to be on schedule or potentially to get delayed, whether it's financial, staffing, materials, or so on. I think it's critical to understand that and to get ahead of the curve, so that any time an issue comes up that might delay or reduce the scope of a project, we can be on top of it. And, you know, as an engineer, we're always looking to ask a lot of questions and understand the details of the project. Why something is happening on the project, why is it behind schedule, why is it on budget. Understanding the details enough so that I feel comfortable talking about the project and communicating with the City Council about it.

I think one of the biggest issues is ensuring that communication is present between the Council and the project teams so you know in advance if there are any potential problems or issues and how we can mitigate those. In terms of practical experience, I also worked on the Budget Committee in a town called

Cannon Beach, Oregon a couple of years ago before we moved back to Scottsdale. Thank you very much.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you. Questions? No? Okay, thank you so much. Ms. Smith.

Tami Smith: Is this okay.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Yes, perfect.

Tami Smith: My name is Tami Smith, my address is 7634 East Vista Drive in Scottsdale, 85250. Before I get started on my background, and why I am applying for this position, I would like to thank Mayor Ortega, Vice Mayor Solange Whitehead, and other Councilmembers for this opportunity. My background of why I feel that I am a good fit for this particular Commission. For 18 years I worked for American Express, primarily the longest role I had there was a commercial underwriter.

[Time: 00:25:21]

That gave me exposure and experience and training in understanding financial statements, cash flow statements, budgets, of small, medium, and large corporations. I then transitioned to field sales and a sales manager. So, as I continue to excel in my role, I was promoted, promoted, promoted and it was just a fantastic experience. I am very comfortable with all terms of financial statements. My next impactful role in the corporate world is I worked for Axon Enterprises, formerly known as Taser International. My role there was to review budgets of all size of municipalities, small, medium, and large law enforcement agencies. So, I'm very comfortable with looking at budgets and understand the reason and the importance of timelines and budgets, restrictions, and so forth.

The third reason that I believe I'm qualified for this role is my husband and I for a few years owned a home building company. We built about six or seven custom homes in North Phoenix, so that makes me very comfortable in all terms of construction. I understand the bond is primarily with capital improvements and so I'm comfortable, very comfortable, with terms of construction. Beyond that, as far as my volunteer background, I am the neighborhood watch captain of my community for the last eight years. I'm also on the Budget Committee of my HOA. I was previously a board member with my HOA. So, I'm very comfortable with this type of meeting setting and following Robert's Rules of Order, so on and so forth. I will give you a little background now that I have a microphone, I am going to take the opportunity to thank the City Council. In my role as neighborhood watch captain, I scheduled time with Chief Walther. I don't think he's here. I know sometimes he attends a City Council meeting. He took the time for an hour and a half to speak with me and he complimented each and every one of you.

So, the community should know how well our police department is supported and how much, not only as a leadership organization, but the community supports them. That is absolutely paramount in all things we do for the City. So personally, thank you for that. What is important, and the issues facing this Board or Commission. I sent an email to the current members and one member responded to me very clearly what he thought was the current issues and it is complicated what is happening now with the 2019 Bonds.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Ms. Smith if you could wrap it up.

Tami Smith: Real quick. Real quick. So the important the issue, the more complicated, the more thought leadership required, is an issue that it's drawn to. So that's actually why I applied for this Commission. It's not why I'm running for it. And I would like to very much contribute to that. Any questions?

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you. Any questions? Okay, thank you very much Ms. Smith.

Tami Smith: Thank you again.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Well, you will hear me say this again and again, we have an abundance of talent in this town. I'm just grateful every day to live here and represent our constituents. So, with that, we are going to have the very difficult time of appointing our new committee members. So, I will entertain a vote for the Citizens' Bond Oversight Committee and each Councilmember can vote for three nominees and we are going to start with Councilwoman Janik.

Councilwoman Janik: Thank you. First of all, I wanted to reiterate what Vice Mayor Whitehead said, this is a wonderful group of people. I would be happy if each one of you could serve, so thank you very much. If you don't get it, the position this time, continue to reapply because you all have a lot to offer. So, with that said, I would nominate Brian Coughlan, Rudy Fischer and Ben Hur.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, Councilwoman Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Thank you. And I would reiterate the statements that Betty made for all of you. Thank you so much for applying on this. I'm going to nominate Brian Coughlan, Austin Fairbanks, and Tami Smith.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Mayor Ortega.

Mayor Ortega: Thank you. Ben Hur, Rudy Fischer, and Brian Coughlan.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: I am going to vote for Ben Hur, Rudy Fischer, and Darryl Komesu. Councilman Durham.

Councilmember Durham: I will vote for Ben Hur, Brian Coughlan, and Rudy Fischer.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: And Councilman Graham.

Councilmember Graham: Thank you, Vice Mayor. Mr. Fairbanks, Mr. Fischer, and Ms. Smith.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: And Councilwoman Caputi.

Councilwoman Caputi: Rudy Fischer, Ben Hur, Darryl Komesu.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay. Thank you. And so, we're going to give some time for, how are we doing?

Rommel Cordova: So, Mr. Coughlan, Mr. Fischer, and Mr. Hur have been appointed.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay. Congratulations to everybody and keep those names on the list.

[Time: 00:30:42]

Okay, so we are moving on to Human Relations Commission and there's two openings. The Human Relations Commission advocates and promotes all dimensions of diversity. The Commission acts as an advisory body to the Mayor, City Council, and staff to make recommendations on ways to encourage mutual respect and understanding among people, to discourage prejudice and discrimination, and to work towards cultural awareness and unity.

There are two vacancies and five nominees. Albert Monillas has withdrawn his application from consideration. The nominees are Ashley Adams, Veronica Aguilar, Kris Cano, Robin Reed, and Mr. Reed will be participating this afternoon electronically, and Shiry Sapir. So, we are going to go ahead and start with Ashley Adams.

Ashley Adams: Good afternoon, Mayor Ortega and Vice Mayor Whitehead and Councilmembers. My name is Ashley Adams. I live at 9797 East San Salvador Drive in Scottsdale. I lived here off and on for almost 33 years. The group who has been nominated to be a part of this Commission is just so very impressive, so I'm just happy to have made the cut and thank you so much for your time today.

I think this Commission is so important. Its mission speaks true to my heart, especially the part about encouraging mutual respect for others. Even though this is first time I've applied for a Commission like this, I've spent most of my life and my career in some type of a service or another. I served the beginning part of my life as a federal prosecutor and then the latter part of my life serving those who sometimes society would like to forget as a criminal defense attorney.

[Time: 00:32:48]

My mom always taught all of us kids that we should really work towards helping those who can't help themselves, and I've tried my best to live by that motto. I do believe that we learn so much if we keep an open heart and we keep an open mind. I've learned by serving the indigent, that we really shouldn't judge people until we walked in their shoes for a while and that's taken me a long way in my life. I have learned that all people have something to offer and that everybody deserves a voice and a chance. I learned especially during my time with Scottsdale leadership last year, which was a wonderful experience, that listening is such a hard skill to perfect, but it's such an important skill to have, especially in a position like this.

I believe that my background, especially my time serving with the Arizona Criminal Justice Association Legislative Committee, while I worked there, I helped draft criminal justice bills. I've also testified before the Arizona Legislature on several occasions. I think that experience would certainly aid and be a benefit to this Commission.

Especially during these hard times, with all of the unrest in the world, with the rise in hate crimes, antisemitism, anti-everything else that unfortunately we are seeing. A Commission like this is so very important to strengthen our community. The key to strengthening our community is building

relationships. And this is a great place where that can occur, this Commission, a safe place where people can have their voice.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you. Thank you so much.

Ashley Adams: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Are there any questions? No. Okay, thank you. All right, Ms. Aguilar.

Veronica Aguilar: Thank you Mayor, Vice Mayor, and Councilmembers. My name is Veronica Aguilar, I live at 525 North Miller Road. I lived here for 33 years, born and raised, so I have been here my entire life. I'm a very proud first generation Mexican American, and like I said, a Scottsdale native that has seen the City grow throughout my entire life. I'm a product of the Scottsdale Unified School District and my educational journey led me to have a bachelor's and M.B.A. from Arizona State University. My experience as a former educator has given me true unique insights on the power of an equitable and accessible education. And now in my current role as Vice President of Recruitment for Teach for America, and founder of a local Scottsdale nonprofit, Young and Empowered Women, I dedicated my life to closing the opportunity and gender gap and advocating for marginalized communities.

Now, my commitment to justice and equity does not end there. I'm actively involved in the community as the Greater Phoenix Chamber Board DEI Liaison and sit on the Big Brothers, Big Sisters Young Professionals Board. I have also spoken on various panels about equity at the United Diversity Business Summit last year, the Phoenix Suns MLK celebration weekend, and also as a cohost on Arizona PBS. And these connections have really allowed me to diversify my network and have a really strong network to bring to this Commission to further our agenda.

Now, I believe a top issue facing this Commission is to create even more generational awareness for all of our communities, marginalized, youth, LGBTQ, and we have the power to really extend our reach and bring in more diverse partners and businesses and at the same time, create incentive programs for current partners here in the valley, on equity and inclusion.

[Time: 00:36:39]

Scottsdale holds a special place in my heart being born and raised here and, of course, because my parents, my mom who is actually here today, and it's the reason why I'm driven and have a desire to be a fresh new perspective to this Commission. I know Scottsdale has so much to offer beyond the State, as well as the global community, and I'm excited to work tirelessly with you all to ensure that Scottsdale continues to be a welcoming and united place for all. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you. Any questions? No. Thank you so much. All right, Ms. Cano.

Kris Cano: All right, good afternoon, Mayor Ortega, Vice Mayor Whitehead, and Council. Thank you for the opportunity for allowing me to present today for the Human Relations Commission. For the record, my name is Kris Cano, and my address is 8713 East Arlington Road here in Scottsdale. I have been a resident of Scottsdale for 21 years. I'm excited for this opportunity because I have dedicated over two

decades of my life for public service. I was an employee here at the City of Scottsdale for 21 years. I recently retired which gives me the opportunity to serve on this Board.

Additionally, I have been very involved in volunteerism in this space. Particularly I am currently the Vice Chair of an organization called One in Ten which is an LGBTQIA+ youth organization that serves underprivileged youth in that space, providing a school, housing, social activities, as well as mentorship and career development. I'm also on the Board of the Women's Collective which is a nonprofit organization that elevates and inspires women in leadership roles. And after my class participation in Scottsdale Leadership, I'm currently serving on the Board of Directors where I have the opportunity this year to lead Diversity Day where I empower people with knowledge, skills, and abilities in the leadership space.

While I was an employee at the City of Scottsdale, I had the opportunity to volunteer on the Diversity Advisory Committee, as well as the local Hispanic Government Network. And in 2022, I had the honor of being the recipient of the Mayor's Drinkwater Award which is dedicated for those making a big impact in service to the community.

Diversity, equity, and inclusion is important for the City of Scottsdale and its residents because it enhances innovation, creativity, social cohesion, and economic growth. One of the challenges that Scottsdale faces in achieving diversity, equity, and inclusion is that Scottsdale has a lower percentage of racial and ethnic minorities, as well as marginalized communities than the national average. Giving these demographics, Scottsdale could invest education in its employees, leaders, and community members to raise awareness, foster empathy, and reduce bias.

Although the City adopted the antidiscrimination ordinance in 2021, when marginalize communities exist, effort should be made to ensure that we are truly a Scottsdale for all. As a minority living in this community and working in this community for so many years, I can attest that there is space for improvements to be made for a more sense of community, as well as ensuring equal rights. So, since I retired from 21 years of service, I'm excited for this opportunity. My hope by serving on this Board is for a more diverse, equitable, and inclusive Scottsdale and I ask that you join me in making that commitment and taking action to make it a reality. Thank you so much for your time.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you, Ms. Cano. Any questions? No. I see none. Thank you. All right, Ms. Sapir.

[Time: 00:40:40]

Shiry Sapir: I need to get used to getting old and not being able to see anymore up close. Good afternoon, Mayor Ortega, Vice Mayor Whitehead, Councilmembers. My name is Shiry Sapir, and I live at 12039 North 60th Place. A 20 plus year resident of the City of Scottsdale and a mother of three young children, and a real estate investment and construction business owner. I have been doing real estate in Scottsdale and the State for the last two decades and proud to say I received my interior design degree in 2002 and completed culinary school in 2012, both at Scottsdale Community College. I got my pilot's license at Scottsdale Airpark, so needless to say, you can't get me to want to be anywhere else but this city.

I decided to apply for this Commission because I believe it has the potential to positively impact the culture and the environment in the City, and I want to make sure we continue to lead Scottsdale in the right direction, so my children and everyone else's children get to grow in the beautiful city we all love. I believe as I read the mission statement of this Commission is that, by definition, this Commission champions inclusion and that should mean to include diverse approaches in opinions into the discussion. It is crucial that the identity of all Scottsdale residents is reflected in the decision-making process of the Council, and I know that my ability to work with people will be beneficial to achieve that goal.

As a side note, I am from Israel. Served in the Israel military and understand how to work in a complicated and intricate setting. Additionally, I'm hoping to be able to assist the City in keeping to the minimum incident of hate crimes, antisemitism prejudice, and for that matter, eliminate all hate from our city. I want a positive and loving culture for Scottsdale, and I hope you choose me today to be part of your team. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you, Ms. Sapir. Are there questions? Thank you so much. So, I went a little out of order. I apologize to Mr. Reed.

Robin Reed: That's quite all right.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, there he is. Thank you.

Robin Reed: Well, good afternoon, and number one, thank you, Mayor Ortega, always nice to see you. Thank you, Vice Mayor Whitehead and thank you members of the City Council. I would also like to thank existing Commission member Janice Shimokubo for recommending that I explore this opportunity.

[Time: 00:43:02]

My name is Robin Reed, I live at 33228 North 60th Way here in Scottsdale. I have been here at this address for two years and other than a short period of time where we lived in Norterra while my twin daughters went to school, probably in total I have lived in Scottsdale 12 of my 25 years here in Arizona. What I will share with you is that I think I come with a unique set of skills and background related to this topic.

Number one, I'm the president and C.E.O. of the Black Chamber of Arizona. That's my passion project. What I do for a living is I'm a corporate consultant and we have clients all over the world. But in my work with the Black Chamber of Arizona, one of the things that we have worked hard to do was not only encourage inclusion but also to support inclusion as an organization. So, I'm the cofounder of the Community Collaborative, alongside my partner Monica Villalobos with the Arizona Hispanic Chamber. We started by putting six marginalized chambers of commerce together to just create a collaborative, if you will. We have now expanded that to 40 organizations and that's more indicative of where I see us going in terms of a DEI organization. I speak nationally on the topic of DEI.

I have worked closely with almost every Mayor here in Maricopa County. Mayor Gallego asked me to chair her Subcommittee on Economic Development and Education for their half billion dollar bond project. Mayor Woods in Tempe asked for my consultation in attracting the Coyotes event space

although that initiative failed. I have worked well with Mayor Gilles. In fact, I traveled international with former Mayor Stanton, now Congressman, to other countries to talk about more inclusive work.

Where I think the challenges exist for the City of Scottsdale are not unlike the challenges that we are facing nationwide on the topic of DEI. The challenge with DEI is we are not embedding it in our, as we like to say, in the DNA of our organizations, of our municipalities. What we need to do with DEI is take a much broader view than we have taken in the past. We have often limited DEI to discussions on race and gender, and although that is important, it does not really cover all the areas in which DEI is relevant. So, we need to make sure that we are creating a DEI initiative that's number one sustainable, and number two addresses the myriad marginalized groups, so that everyone can feel welcomed, and I will just share this with you.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Mr. Reed. I think we're going to have to end it there but that was a lot of good information. Thank you.

Robin Reed: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you but let me see if anybody up here has any questions. Oh, he went away. Any questions for Mr. Reed?

Councilwoman Caputi: I think we lost him.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: I think we lost him, but I'm sure he's still listening in, so that's good. Okay. Once again, we are going to get to the vote here. We will entertain a vote for the Human Relations Commission and each Councilmember can vote for two nominees. So, we are going to start with Councilwoman Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Thank you. I would like to vote for Ashley Adams and Shiry Sapir.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Mayor Ortega.

Mayor Ortega: Thank you, Ashley Adams and Veronica Aguilar.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay. I'm going to vote for Ashley Adams and Mr. Reed. Councilman Durham.

Councilmember Durham: I will vote for Ashley Adams and Mr. Reed.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilman Graham.

Councilmember Graham: Thank you. Ms. Sapir and Mr. Reed.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, Councilwoman Caputi.

Councilwoman Caputi: Ashley Adams, Robin Reed.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Janik.

Councilwoman Janik: Ashley Adams and Veronica Aguilar.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay. So how did we do here? It looks like, okay so Ms. Adams and Mr. Reed, but again, I want to encourage everybody to truly keep your names in the for the next round. Thank you so much.

[Time: 00:47:47]

Judicial Appointments Advisory Board, one State Bar representative position opening. The Judicial Appointments Advisory Board, JAAB makes advisory recommendations to the City Council regarding the appointment and reappointment of full time City judges. There is one vacant State Bar representative position vacancy, and the State Bar has forwarded the names of three nominees. However, nominee RoseMarie Horvath has withdrawn her application from consideration. The remaining nominees are Michael Ruppert and Tricia Schafer, Ms. Schafer's term expired this month and is eligible for reappointment. She is unable to join us this afternoon, but she's still interested in serving on the board, so we'll have Mr. Rupert come up.

Michael Rupert: Good afternoon, Mayor Ortega, Vice Mayor Whitehead, Councilmembers. My name is Michael Rupert. I am living at 5805 North Granite Reef Road, Scottsdale, Arizona. Been a resident of Scottsdale since 2019, and I also work in Scottsdale at the law firm of Galbut Beabeau. I graduated from Arizona State University for law school and went to University of Arizona for undergrad and graduated with a double major in public management and policy and criminal justice.

During law school and before, I spent some time in various positions at the Los Angeles County District Attorney's Office, Pima County Superior Court pretrial services and the Arizona Attorney General's Office, Office for Victim Witness Services. My experience as a civil and commercial litigator and my previous experience has allowed me to be in front of the judiciary in Arizona in various different capacities, not just as an advocate for clients but also as an observer, and also being able to assist many members of the public going through tough, difficult times in their lives.

And that's allowed me to gain some insight in important qualities that members of the judiciary, I believe, should have and that can include integrity, strong moral compass, but also having the understanding that their decisions aren't just going to impact the person in front of them, but also ripples throughout that person's lives. In addition, they need to be able to make quick decisions and well-reasoned decisions. It's not an easy job by any means but it's a job that they need to do and I think the public thanks them for it.

So, they are pillars the community and to that end, the Commission here needs to be able to retain good judges, go through previous decisions that they've made and understand why those decisions have been made, but also be able to appoint new judges that are interested in joining the judiciary and serve their communities as part of that. Thank you for your time.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you. Any questions? I see none. Thank you so much. Since Ms. Schafer is not here, I will now entertain a vote for the Judicial Appointments Advisory Board and each Councilmember can vote for one nominee. So where are we at? Mayor Ortega.

Mayor Ortega: Michael Rupert.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Tricia Schafer. Councilman Durham.

Councilmember Durham: Ms. Schafer.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilman Graham.

Councilmember Graham: Ms. Schafer.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Caputi.

Councilwoman Caputi: Tricia Schafer.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Janik.

Councilwoman Janik: Michael Rupert.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Tricia Schafer.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, so it looks like Tricia Schafer will serve her second term. Thank you so much, Mr. Rupert.

[Time: 00:52:13]

Library Board, one opening. The Library Board advises the City Council on general policy relating to the programs, services, and future development of the Scottsdale Public Libraries. There is one vacancy and two nominees. Jan Dubauskas has withdrawn her application from consideration. The nominees are Sam Campana, Ms. Campana's term expired this month and is eligible for reappointment and Carrie Cox is the second nominee. Ms. Campana?

Sam Campana: Good afternoon, Mayor Ortega, Vice Mayor Whitehead, and members of the City Council. It's fun to be here. My name is Sam Campana. I've lived here for 53 years. I've been a library cardholder all of that time. I live at 4800 North 68th Street in a little compound where I had my wedding reception over 50 years ago. So, it's always been Scottsdale to me, and I love being downtown.

I have served on Boards and Commissions at the county, state, national and even international level. But I must say that serving on the Library Board these past three years with fellow members, citizens of Scottsdale has been the most rewarding of all of those that I have served on. To be at the libraries around the City and see moms with babies, and grandpas with grandchildren, and people that need not only library services but human services come in and be welcomed to our libraries. It makes me very proud. I know it makes all of you very proud, but we should really love our libraries.

We do have issues at the library, but I have to say that the biggest issue facing us right now is leadership. Because we have lost Terra Peters who took a great job, hoping to come back here one day. I just saw her in Bozeman. And then Mandy Carico was recruited away from us to Peoria. So, I will say that the current staff that we have had have really stepped up and are doing a great job. I should call a couple of them out by name. Melissa Orr and Javier, Judy, Louisa, I mean all of the library staff have really stepped up, but I will say that it is kind of a crisis of leadership right now, and I know you are looking after that. Money is always an issue. I know Mr. Thompson is going to be interviewed later and we're always asking for money from the City Council and from staff and we hope that our libraries remain a priority for you.

And there's always Friends of Library and I hope that everybody always sees when they're raising money and could be generous with them as well. So as a Commissioner, as a Board Member, I have always felt well prepared and well-focused by the staff that has done such a good job, and I appreciate that and they're always very responsive and ahead of the issues and I would really love to serve another three years, another term. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you, Ms. Campana. Any questions? I see none. All right. So, Ms. Cox?

[Time: 00:55:57]

Carrie Cox: Good afternoon. I would like to thank the City Council for this opportunity to serve on the Library Board. My name is Carrie Cox. I reside at 13326 East Sorrell Lane. I am a Scottsdale homeowner since 1995 and I was a snowbird from 95 to 2016, 2016 I became a permanent resident. I have a bachelor's degree and master's degree in education, and I taught and coached at the same high school for 35 years. My leadership includes ten years as Vice President and President of the Teachers Association. During my career, I served on many, many district committees, including the One Book, One School Reading Initiative. Our results were amazing. Reading scores increased district wide. Most of you here, or all of you here, are all old enough to answer this question, what was the first handheld device? You're correct, a book.

My love for books started from my mom's reading to me. And when she, when my parents, fought to have a library in our small town in Illinois, I was there to leaflet the community. The library came and became the center of our community. I can remember walking to school on my way to school, stopping at the library and then stopping on my way home. For me, the library opened my eyes to the world. For me, reading has inspired curiosity, imagination, thought, wonder, and intelligence. Books have lifted my disposition as a person. Helen Keller, though, said it best. More than any other time, when I hold a beloved book in my hand, may my limitations fall from me, and my spirit is free.

Today, our Scottsdale library system is outstanding. There are many children, teens, and adult programs. In today's world, I'm sure the digital books are flying off the shelves. What I see missing is the lack of hours that our buildings are open. Our buildings are open similar to bankers hours. Our community should have access to our libraries early morning, noon, and night. Secondly, we should encourage and open our libraries for our community events during the evenings. And lastly, the Scottsdale libraries need updated media equipment in their facilities.

I booked an event just recently at the library and I was asked if I had a 10-year-old computer for a PowerPoint presentation. I'm going to leave you with this quote that is just as dear to my heart, reading

has been the chief pleasure of my life. I would like to see as many children, teens and adults use our Scottsdale library. Thank you for this opportunity and your consideration.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you, Ms. Cox. Are there any questions?

Carrie Cox: Did I make that in two minutes? I'm an educator. I was like, two minutes?

Vice Mayor Whitehead: You got two and a little bit extra. Thank you. Thank you so much.

[Time: 00:59:21]

All right. Now I will entertain a vote for the Library Board and each Councilmember can vote for one nominee. And I'm going to start with myself, and I will vote to reappoint Ms. Campana. Councilman Durham? We might come back to Councilman Durham. We will come back to Councilman Durham. Oh, he's there?

Councilmember Durham: I'm sorry, Ms. Campana.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: I'm sorry? Oh, okay.

Councilmember Durham: Ms. Campana.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Oh, okay, thank you. Councilman Graham.

Councilmember Graham: Thank you, Ms. Cox.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Caputi.

Councilwoman Caputi: Sam Campana.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Janik.

Councilwoman Janik: Ms. Cox.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Ms. Cox.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Mayor Ortega.

Mayor Ortega: Ms. Campana.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay. So, are we good? Ms. Campana has been reappointed. Thank you. Okay.

The Transportation Commission has one opening. The Transportation Commission advises the City Council on matters relating to the safe and efficient movement of vehicles, transit, pedestrians, and

bicycles. The Commission provides a public forum to hear citizen complaints and requests regarding transportation matters. There is one vacancy and three nominees. The nominees are Denise Doctor, Robert Marmon, Mailen Pankiewicz. And we'll start with Ms. Doctor. Is Ms. Doctor here?

Councilmember Graham: Is there a doctor in the house?

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, well we will come back and see if she's here. Mr. Marmon?

[Time: 01:01:28]

Robert Marmon: Mr. Mayor, Ms. Vice Mayor, members of the Council, thank you very much for this opportunity. I'm Bob Marmon. I live at 9087 East Saguaro Drive, and I have been a resident since 2006. I just retired from Mayo Clinic and I'm a civil engineer and I was also an adjunct professor at ASU. The Transportation Commission is a part of a team whose goal it is to keep Scottsdale's transportation system excellent.

The team has the users of the road who are looking forward to safe conditions. You have aging in place seniors who would like some transportation for themselves. We have businesses who want their customers to come and go easily. We have developers who are still coming. We have taller and taller buildings on smaller and smaller lots which is a challenge, and we have yourselves as the final decision maker, keeping this herd moving in the right direction. It's all supplemented by the excellent staff that comes up with new plans and not afraid to try new ideas. So, I am looking forward to this challenge and participating with it. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you Mr. Marmon. Any questions? Comments? I see none. Thank you. Okay, is Ms. Pankiewicz here?

Mailen Pankiewicz: Good afternoon, Mayor, Vice Mayor, members of the Council, my name is Mailen Pankiewicz, I am a 12-year resident from south Scottsdale, living at 303 North Miller Road. As far as my education, I have a bachelor's degree in conservation, environmental science, a master's degree in urban planning and an additional master's degree in public administration with a concentration in urban management.

For the past 10 years, I have worked in the City of Phoenix in different positions related to planning and transportation, planning including high-capacity transit. And for the past four years, I have also worked as principal transportation planner in the role of pedestrian safety coordinator for the City and that role I managed a \$2 million C.I.P. for the City of Phoenix to prevent pedestrian fatalities in the City and I used crash data to analyze and recommend C.I.P. projects which I managed and advanced all 40 of them. In my current role, I work in the City of Tempe as principal planner, and I lead the Design Review Board which reviews all of the developments for City of Tempe.

In terms of issues facing Scottsdale and transportation, I have been a big proponent of transportation network that allows all of our residents of all ages and abilities to be able to participate and get outside, get healthy, get good mental health benefits, and that should go beyond recreation, but also for folks to conduct their daily living activities such as going to the grocery store and going to school. And I feel like

we could have a more family friendly transportation system that allows for those different options and also allows folks to be able to get outside and have different alternatives to their vehicles. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you. Any questions? I see none. Thank you. So now I will entertain a vote for the Transportation Commission and each Councilmember can vote for one nominee and we're going to start with Councilman Durham.

[Time: 01:05:34]

Councilmember Durham: Mr. Marmon.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilman Graham.

Councilmember Graham: Mr. Marmon.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Caputi.

Councilwoman Caputi: Denise Doctor.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Janik.

Councilwoman Janik: Mailen Pankiewicz.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Robert Marmon.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Mayor Ortega.

Mayor Ortega: Robert Marmon.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: And I'll vote for Mailen Pankiewicz. And it looks like Mr. Marmon has been appointed. Thank you. This concludes our appointment process for today.

I would like to thank all our nominees for their interest in serving on a City Board or Commission. We are fortunate to continue to receive qualified applicants for the positions on our Boards and Commissions. Even if you were not appointed today, your application will remain on file for consideration at a future date if there are additional openings.

City staff will contact the individuals appointed this evening and provide them with information on next steps regarding the appointment. The City of Scottsdale is very fortunate to have such dedicated and talented individuals who are willing and ready to serve for our city. So, I'm turning it back to the Mayor and thank you.

Mayor Ortega: Thank you. I move to adjourn the Special Meeting for the City Council. Do I have a second?

Councilwoman Janik: Second.

Mayor Ortega: All in favor, record your vote.

Councilmember Durham: Councilmember Durham votes yes.

Mayor Ortega: We are adjourned.