



**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING**

SUMMARIZED MINUTES

Monday, May 10, 2021

Meeting Held Electronically

PRESENT: Janice Shimokubo, Chair
Emily Hinchman, Vice Chair
James Eaneman
Marty Day
Hannellie Mendoza
Stuart Rhoden
Lawdan Shojaee

STAFF: Sharon Cini
Kelly Corsette
Bill Hylan

Call to Order/Roll Call

Chair Shimokubo called the meeting to order at 5:00 p.m. Chair noted that the meeting is hybrid with some commissioners at the design studio and some on Zoom.

Members present as listed above.

Public Comment

No public comments were submitted.

1. Approval of minutes from the April 12, 2021 meeting

Chair Shimokubo called for additions/corrections to the minutes. Typographical and content corrections were made.

COMMISSIONER RHODEN MOVED TO APPROVE THE APRIL 12, 2021 HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES AS AMENDED. COMMISSIONER DAY SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0) BY ROLL CALL VOTE. CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS EANEMAN, DAY, MENDOZA, RHODEN AND SHOJAE VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

2. Presentation, discussion and possible recommendation(s) regarding the adopted anti-discrimination ordinance

Chair Shimokubo commented that this is a landmark, historic action taken at the City Council meeting on April 20th, 2021. She thanked City Council for unanimous adoption of the ordinance. She acknowledged the efforts of partners, residents, business and organizations for their support of the ordinance and commended staff for its work in developing the draft ordinance. Finally, she thanked the Commission for its commitment to resurrect the ordinance.

Ms. Cini thanked Chair and the Commission for their support. Next steps include developing a rollout plan for the ordinance, which will have Scottsdale joining more than 225 cities across the United States, who will be providing equal protection. Internal policy, Administrative Regulation AR 333, is being modified with a planned training curriculum. Staff will be trained on the procedures to handle discrimination complaints. Final adoption of the ordinance is slated for May 20th.

3. Update, discussion and possible recommendations(s) regarding anti-Asian hate crimes

Ms. Cini read the Mayor's proclamation for Asian American/Pacific Islander Heritage Month into the record. Chair Shimokubo said this relates to the April meeting, wherein Jason Wong attended and discussed a letter he had written to Governor Ducey. The Commission had agreed to bring the item back this month for any further discussion. They had also previously discussed including anti-Asian hate crimes in Town Hall discussions and it was agreed that this discussion would take place under the Town Hall agenda item.

4. Presentation, discussion and possible recommendations regarding Commission ideas to include in the City's 70th Anniversary Celebration

Chair Shimokubo noted that the actual date of the 70th Anniversary is June 25, 2021. Kelly Corsette provided an overview of the City's planned events, including:

- Historical presentation at Civic Center Library on June 23, 2021 at 2 p.m. with telecast
- 70th Anniversary Legacy Quest Event in Old Town on Friday, June 25th

In response to a question from Commissioner Day, Mr. Corsette confirmed that preregistration is requested for both events.

Chair Shimokubo inquired which department is leading the coordination. Mr. Corsette stated that the Mayor's Office is a prime driver. The library is working on its presentation. The Old Town tourism office is assisting with putting together the Legacy Quest. The Office of Communication and Citizen Service has stepped into a primary coordinating and publicity role. He confirmed that Commission suggestions or ideas should be forwarded to him for consideration. Chair Shimokubo commented that in 2019, the Commission submitted information for a Scottsdale coffee table book, which included information on design of the cowboy logo and of the Chinese family that opened a grocery store in Old Town (currently the J. Chew Mexican Import Company). Perhaps social media could be used to introduce these interesting facts of diversity to Scottsdale residents. Also suggested was the idea of having local cultural bands play at different libraries in the evening. Mr. Corsette said he would not be able to provide an answer on feasibility at this time.

Commissioner Rhoden suggested having ethnic food trucks in parking lots of libraries, Civic Center parking lot or other appropriate venue. Vice Chair Hinchman inquired about the possibility of Commission representation via volunteering or being present in Commission T-shirts. Mr. Corsette commented that having food trucks involves coordination of a bigger event, which is a logistical challenge. Summers are also typically a time of lower outdoor event participation. The 75th Anniversary will likely be an even larger event and ideas are already being explored for that celebration. There will be opportunity for the Commission to have visibility at the Legacy Quest and library presentation, if desired.

In response to a question from Chair Shimokubo, Mr. Corsette said it would be acceptable for Commissioner Shojaee to work with staff on sharing historical facts via social media. Chair Shimokubo added that the Commission will work with Ms. Cini regarding Commission participation in the planned events.

5. Presentation, discussion, and possible recommendation(s) regarding the Commission's Strategic Plan and 2021 activities and updates

A. Town Hall Sessions

- April 28th, Town Hall summary and feedback

Ms. Cini reviewed the survey results. Of 15 responses, 5 rated the event as excellent, 4 very good and 6 good. Most said they were likely to attend future events. Most were likely to recommend the event to others. In response to the question of what was most liked about the event, responses included: Listening to everyone's experiences and comments; videos being shown; the speaker; the flow of mixed media and pictures; enjoyed hearing from other participants, Dr. Martin's conversation style; openness, honesty, kindness, acceptance and tolerance; good balance of reality; great topics with diversity of voices encouraged to share experiences and stories; open discussion gave participants an opportunity to provide their perspectives. Least liked aspects include: Could not see the other participants and discussion was difficult through video chat; dialogue was one-sided; those with different views were uncomfortable to share; interaction was challenging; conversations on the African-American community were only focused on racism or social injustice and there was much more that could have been discussed. Suggestions for improvement include: Have an event focused on how to be an ally; specific calls to action for involvement; facilitate small discussions in breakout rooms;

have an event where people can learn about African-American culture, music, art, food and traditions.

- Future Town Hall dates and topics

Commissioners were invited to provide input and comments:

- Hold a Town Hall and then learn more about the culture afterwards
- Some participants want to see each other, and some prefer anonymity
- Flow and idea of acceptance is paramount
- Aim for another datapoint at the end of summer
- Decide on a group of multiple topics together or a singular topic of focus
- The ability for people to express their experiences with discrimination holds educational value for those listening, however, hearing other perspectives would also be helpful, so that the two sides can learn from each other
- As polling data is anonymous, there may be opportunities to push the boundaries of some questions to achieve candid responses
- Having a follow-up list of resources and videos for participants would be helpful
- There is a pool of potential participants on the “other side,” including the three who spoke against the ADO on April 20th
- As indicated through City Council, there were people with varying degrees of reservation, who may be willing to participate in a Town Hall
- It would be feasible to identify people from the “other side,” including professionals and those willing to have an objective discussion
- The data does not make sense, considering the City’s population, the fact that 50 attended and 15 responded to the survey. This does not paint an accurate picture of who was present and who was in which side. Although there was feedback, this was not a successful event.
- It would be helpful to have a larger number of residents of Scottsdale, educated or not, to participate. That is the only way to have a true pulse on what people are feeling.
- Drawing out the perspective from the other side is a valuable learning opportunity.
- Having a panel comprised of each perspective would be a way to attract attendance and would help participants feel comfortable enough to speak.

Chair Shimokubo stated that the Commission had previously discussed what it envisioned for the Town Halls, which was to be a coming together of residents with multiple points of view. Perhaps the anticipation of having hundreds of participants was unrealistic. She asked whether Commissioners would like to continue with them. Commissioner Eaneman commented that the Commission had also discussed sharing its findings with City Council and he posed the question of whether the Commission should do so now or wait. Chair Shimokubo thanked Commissioner Eaneman for the reminder, noting that the Commission is an advisory body to City Council and as such, should be sharing its findings. She invited the Commission to provide input as to the timing for providing advice to City Council. There was consensus to provide the input to City Council. Chair Shimokubo suggested that Commissioners Shojaee and Rhoden provide a draft for review at the next meeting.

Chair Shimokubo stated that the Commission had previously discussed having a regular cadence of Town Halls at some regular interval. She asked whether this is still the thinking among Commissioners and that if this is not realistic, there should be further discussion. Commissioner Rhoden commented that if they slow down, they will lose momentum. There are opportunities to reach out to school districts, senior centers and other entities in order to bring more participants in. He recommended doing the update for the June meeting and something in August or September. There will be opportunities to have multiple topics, including the antidiscrimination ordinance.

Ms. Cini provided some datapoints, including having 44 people sign in who stayed signed in throughout. In the previous Town Hall, many signed in and signed out within 15 minutes. Overall, there were 110 registrations. Since the broadcast, there have been 179 views.

- Ideas to incorporate into future Town Halls

Commissioner Mendoza discussed the suggestion for the 21-day challenge as a habit-building racial equity challenge. The goal is to build habits that promote diversity and inclusion. However, in order to build good habits, rather than a 21-day challenge, it would be a one-year challenge. Activities would include volunteering and cultural events. Commissioner Rhoden suggested a form of incentivization (T-shirt or lunch with the Mayor) to encourage participation. Commissioner Shojaee said Commissioner Mendoza's suggestion is a fantastic idea. It would be great to start this as a New Year's resolution in January. It could also be incorporated into the various cultural activities that already take place in the City. Commissioner Rhoden suggested utilizing a passport-type incentive, where participants receive stamps at various events. Specified amounts of stamps or points could be redeemed for an award. Commissioner Shojaee stated that she wanted to eliminate the need for an electronic passport app. It might be easier to simply electronically check in at an event.

CHAIR SHIMOKUBO MOVED TO PURSUE THE IDEA OF THE ONE-YEAR CHALLENGE.

Ms. Cini stated that there was a similar event in January, the Regional Unity Art Walk, and she asked which Commissioners participated. She noted that the use of hashtags at the event were encouragement for people to visit certain spots or participate in certain activities as part of Martin Luther King Month. Vice Chair Hinchman liked Commissioner Shojaee's suggestion to start in January. Timing is important and most people may not be ready to fully engage at this time. Ms. Mendoza added that there was a time constraint, and many were not available during the limited time of the January activity. If participants have an understanding that a program is a one-year event, they will clearly understand what they are signing up for.

Chair Shimokubo restated her motion.

CHAIR SHIMOKUBO MOVED TO HAVE COMMISSIONER MENDOZA FORMULATE A PROPOSAL FOR A ONE-YEAR CHALLENGE AND BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMISSION, FOR TIMING AND FEASIBILITY CONSIDERATION. VICE CHAIR HINCHMAN DAY SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0) BY ROLL CALL VOTE. CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS EANEMAN, DAY, MENDOZA, RHODEN AND SHOJAE VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

B. Marketing messaging – An overview of a social media campaign and calendar

There were no updates.

C. Enhanced Commissioner Involvement with Scottsdale Independent article highlighting the HRS and its members

Vice Chair Hinchman stated that Melissa should have reached out to Commissioners. Commissioners should respond via phone or email. The plan is to place the article online in early June and that it will be printed in the June edition of the Scottsdale Independent.

D. Identify important trends in Scottsdale through possible focus groups

Commissioner Mendoza reported that the proposal has been submitted to staff. It is currently being reviewed and an update is pending. Ms. Cini said there are no updates that this time. There is currently discussion concerning funding of the \$27,000 proposal. Mr. Corsette stated that staff will have a more complete update at the next meeting. This item was not submitted for the budget and staff will need to explore potential options. In response to a question from Commissioner Mendoza, Mr. Corsette confirmed that a nonprofit sponsorship could be used for funding, if available.

E. Develop City relationships in Q2, 2021, Chair and Vice-Chair meeting with new Chief of Scottsdale Police Department

Chair Shimokubo stated that the meeting will occur on May 27th, 2021 and there will be a report will be given at a future meeting. The Commission has reached out to the library regarding the potential for discussing ideas from earlier this year. The Commission will also attempt to get together with the Human Services Commission one more time.

6. Updates, discussion and possible recommendation(s) to staff regarding recent and upcoming diversity and inclusion related activities and incidents impacting the City of Scottsdale

- Scottsdale Juneteenth Celebration/Generation BLK, Saturday, June 19, 2021

Ms. Cini stated that there have been no reports for the quarter. The Office of Diversity and Inclusion is collaborating with a community-based organization called Generation BLK. The event will take place at McCormick Stillman Railroad Park. Generation BLK will coordinate its own volunteering.

7. Identification of Future Agenda Items

Chair Shimokubo stated that the June meeting will be electronic, due to ongoing work in the building. Ms. Cini added that July will be a break and the following meeting will occur in August.

Chair Shimokubo noted standing agenda items, including ADO, 70th Anniversary and strategic items.

Commissioner Rhoden stated that he has an agenda item in regard to the ADO and the homeless ordinance, in terms of how these reconcile with each other.

Chair Shimokubo suggested having a land acknowledgement as a future agenda item. A draft can be developed for Commission approval.

Adjournment

COMMISSIONER EANEMAN MOVED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING. COMMISSIONER RHODEN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0) BY ROLL CALL VOTE. CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS EANEMAN, DAY, MENDOZA, RHODEN AND SHOJAEV VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved and seconded, the meeting adjourned at 6:37 p.m.

Recorded and Transcribed by eScribers, LLC.