
This document was created from the closed caption transcript of the September 11, 2018 City Council Regular Meeting and **has not been checked for completeness or accuracy of content.**

A copy of the agenda for this meeting, including a summary of the action taken on each agenda item, is available online at:

<http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/Assets/ScottsdaleAZ/Council/current-agendas-minutes/2018-agendas/091118RegularAgenda.pdf>

An unedited digital video recording of the meeting, which can be used in conjunction with the transcript, is available online at:

<http://www.Scottsdaleaz.gov/Scottsdale-video-network/Council-video-archives/2018-archives>

For ease of reference, included throughout the transcript are bracketed "time stamps" [Time: 00:00:00] that correspond to digital video recording time.

For more information about this transcript, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 480-312-2411.

CALL TO ORDER

[Time: 00:00:15]

Mayor Lane: We are running a little bit late and I know some folks have been waiting for us. So we will move right into our regular meeting. And I'm going to go ahead and initiate it from the get-go, if the city clerk will bear with me on that. I would like to call to order, the September 11th, City Council meeting our regular meeting.

ROLL CALL

[Time: 00:00:21]

Mayor Lane: We will start with a roll call, please.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Mayor Jim Lane.

Mayor Lane: Present.

Carolyn Jagger: Vice Mayor Guy Phillips.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: Councilmembers Suzanne Klapp.

Councilwoman Klapp: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: Virginia Korte.

Councilwoman Korte: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: Kathy Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: Linda Milhaven.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: David Smith.

Councilman Smith: Present.

Carolyn Jagger: City Manager Jim Thompson.

Jim Thompson: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: City Attorney Bruce Washburn.

Bruce Washburn: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: City Treasurer Jeff Nichols.

Jeff Nichols: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: City Auditor Sharron Walker.

Sharron Walker: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: And the Clerk is present.

[Time: 00:00:47]

Mayor Lane: Thank you. A couple of items of business I would like to attend to. For those who would like to speak on any of the agenda items or Public Comment, there's a white card that the city clerk is holding up over her head to my right, immediate right if you have a need or engage on that

purpose. And there's a yellow card for any of the agenda items for written comments. You can see the clerk and the clerk's personnel there if you would like to fill out a card and speak in Public Comment or to agenda item or to give us written comments. We have Scottsdale police officers in front of us on the mezzanine if you have need for their service and the areas behind the Council dais are reserved for staff and the Council. There are facilities, restroom facilities over here to my left under that exit sign for your convenience.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

[Time: 00:01:48]

Mayor Lane: This evening, we have the Pledge of Allegiance that will be given to us, it will be presented by the Girl Scout Troop 4, and Holly Boynton. It looks like we have them here. If you could go ahead and come forward.

Girl Scout Troop 4: I pledge allegiance to the flag of the United States of America, and to the Republic for which it stands: One nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and justice for all.

Mayor Lane: You want to, it's all choreographed for us. Tell us where you go to school.

Girl Scout Troop 4: My name is Audrey Boynton. I go to Cicero Preparatory Academy and my favorite subject in school is math. Hello. My name is Alex, and my favorite subject is math, and I go to Mojave Middle School. Hello. My name is Samantha Piazza, I go to Mojave Middle School and my favorite subject in school is science. Hello, my name is, oh, gosh. Hello, my name is Mia Davis. I go to Cicero Preparatory Academy, and my favorite subject is art. Hello. My name is Giovanna Urban, I go to Mojave and my favorite subject is art. I go to Cicero Preparatory Academy and my favorite subject is math.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, ladies.

INVOCATION

Mayor Lane: And for the invocation this evening, we have Pastor Bruce Johnson, of the Scottsdale Presbyterian church. Pastor, welcome.

[Time: 00:03:59]

Pastor Bruce Johnson: Thank you, Mr. Mayor. Let us pray. Great God, we thank you for this day and we ask your blessing on the city and the City Council as they come to serve the people of this land. Lord, those who are old enough, we all in our memories go back to where we were 17 years ago when we first heard about the attacks on our city, on our country. And we pray again for those who suffered loss, grieving loss that day. We remember also how we were brought together as a people, where our differences were put aside, and we sought common good.

We thank you for the young people on that day who made the choice in the days and the years later to serve beyond themselves either through public safety, careers, or in law enforcement, medicine, teaching, and particularly for those young people who joined the armed forces of our country because of those dark days. We ask your blessings of safety on daughters and sons of our city, who are now serving as soldiers, sailors, airmen, Marines, and guardsmen. We lift up in particular, one daughter of our city, my own daughter, Air Force Pilot Captain Shelley O'Malley, and the other members of 318th Air Force Special Operations Squadron as they are about to deploy again. Be with them as they fly and keep them safe.

And Lord, because we are in a different season in our country, where division and animus reign so often, we pray for the grace for our City Councilmembers to not give into the temptation of animus and division, but, again to work for common good. To see the best in others, especially the best in those with whom they serve. And we pray this not because they are different from the rest of our citizens but because we all fall prey to that temptation all too often. Lord, give us the grace to be charitable. Lord, we ask a lot of you and we ask a lot of one another and we pray this in your great name. Amen.

Mayor Lane: Amen. Thank you, Pastor.

MAYOR'S REPORT

[Time: 00:07:05]

Mayor Lane: You know, I would just want to let the community know, certainly, that we had our own memorial events today with regard to the 17th anniversary of that tragic and horrendous terrorist attack that took 2,977 lives and unspeakable situation and circumstances. One of the things that we did today was our first responders spoke toward the people in their group that actually gave their lives. The distinction was made that the lives of the victims were taken and the lives of our first responders, fire, police, emergency service people, were given. Given up for the effort. They are all victims. They are all to be remembered.

And it's, it's something that we need not to lose sight of, that there is a lot of good in this world that was exemplified after the attack but there's a lot of evil too and unfortunately, we have to deal with both and not forget that there are certainly elements within the world that we need to stand guardian of our own country and our own people to make sure that we are taken care of, our of own public safety if you want to put it in that category of things. So I thank the pastor for his comments and prayer and for all of us to remember certainly those whose lives were taken and those that were given in that effort. So that is only sort of my Mayor's Report, I suppose of today's meeting. And we move on to the next order of business. There are no presentations.

PUBLIC COMMENT

[Time: 00:08:59]

Mayor Lane: We do have one request to speak under Public Comment and I just will describe the Public Comment so that there's no misunderstanding for future purposes. But we have Public Comment is reserved for citizens' comments regarding non-agendized items with no official Council action that will be taken on these items. Comments are limited to issues that are within the jurisdiction of the City Council. We do by virtue of issuing those particular independent elements to speak on non-agenda items, they are limited to three minutes each with a maximum of five speakers. There's no sharing of that time. And so the opportunity for Public Comment can be given also at the end of the meeting if it's needed. At this time, we have one request to speak, and it's Teri Todd. Teri, if you would like to come forward.

[Time: 00:09:52]

Teri Todd: Hello, everybody. A lot of familiar faces that have ridden in our carriages in the Parada Del Sol parade up there. My name is Teri Todd and my family owns and operates last existing stage coach wagon and carriage company in Scottsdale. We received an order to vacate Old Town by December 31st. In 2010, we had a stage coach custom built for the city of Scottsdale with the city name and the city logo on it. Scottsdale Stage Coach is the first ever to be modified to be street legal during February/March string training. We have two years left on our existing five-year contract which is reviewed annually and this year it was reviewed by Karen Churchard.

New safety concerns were reviewed after this past season on two night shifts, one of our carriages was hit by a golf cart and the other a beer bottle was thrown at one of our horses by a drunk passenger on the traveling bicycle bar. For the first time in three decades we are shutting down the night shifts and working days only until the sunset. It was shared with Ms. Churchard that we will be depending on the stage coach subsidy that has been subsidized by the city since 2004. It was made very clear to her and in other city, staff and emails that the revenue of a \$40 carriage ride is not going to survive that and minus the subsidy from the city, we will be out of business.

This is not an easy business. This is not a lucrative business. It's 16 hours a day of physical, hard work with our horses to safely stage them in Old Town. Total subsidy for the stage coach and special events is only \$12,000 a year and that goes down when we have bad weather days. In comparison, the singing cowboy holds a \$100,000, five-year contract for one horse, three hours a day, once a week. Earning half that amount operating a full-time business, I would really like an answer as to why the tourism department made the decision to pay almost double amount on the contract for one horse, three hours one day a week instead of paying half that amount on the high contract for several horses with stage coach rides, wagon rides and carriage rides and a full-time carriage service in Old Town.

In closing, our primary goal has always been to service the west most western town and keep it the western most western town to do, that we need your help. We petition that the city continue to honor the remaining two years of our contract, and if the city does decide to force us out, we will give you first right of refusal to purchase the Scottsdale stage coach that was made for the city. Any questions?

Mayor Lane: I'm sorry, Teri. This isn't an exchange. This is a non-agendized item but we have

taken your petition and we will consider.

Teri Todd: Thank you. You each have the cover letter, plus you have photos and you have the string of all the emails that went back and forth from the city. And you have the letter that we just received over the weekend asking us to vacate by December 31st. You have the Singing Cowboy sole source contract which we tried to get one and keep getting denied to do that. I just don't know what Scottsdale is going to do without Horse and Carriage. There is nobody else. There's a couple of people that I broker to when I can't get to an event. I repair all the wagon wheels. I can't just go to Walmart and get one, what is Old Town going to do?

Mayor Lane: Thank you for your information. Thank you so much. We got that. Another request to speak is Tim Cavin.

[Time: 00:14:12]

Tim Cavin: Good evening, Mayor. Good evening, Vice Mayor and City Councilmembers, people of Scottsdale. My name is Tim Cavin, I'm the president of Cavin Research Group. I'm requesting that we get a future calendar date for the city ordinance code 17-371 Paragraph G which is referring to towing and impound. We have a new technology that we have been trending on social media for the last eight months. It's a way I'm offering a way for Scottsdale to make a new revenue that has not been done before instead of traditional ways of towing and impounding. The laws that have inflected on the towing has been since 1989, adapted back in 2005, revisited in 2014, but nothing has changed. There's nothing further.

Mayor Lane: I'm sorry?

Tim Cavin: I'm just requesting that we get a hearing on 17-371 city ordinance code and paragraph G. If we can get that erased on how it says the immobilization, in fact, I will quote it right now.

Mayor Lane: This is not actually in the form of a petition to us, so we have not specifically direction on this kind of thing. But this is something that would have to be taken up with the City Manager's office at least at the initial stages to consider that.

Tim Cavin: Thank you.

Mayor Lane: All right. Thank you. All right.

CONSENT AGENDA

[Time: 00:16:11]

Mayor Lane: That completes the Public Comment, and we move on to our Consent items and they are Items 1 through 17. I have no requests from the public to speak on those. No requests from Council for any changes on those in any way. So I will accept a motion to accept it in its present form.

Councilmember Korte: I move to accept Consent Agenda Items 1 through 17.

Mayor Lane: The motion has been made to accept the Consent Agenda Items 1 to 17.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Second.

Mayor Lane: And seconded by Vice Mayor Phillips. So moved by Councilmember Korte and seconded by Vice Mayor Phillips. I think we are ready to vote. All of those in favor, aye. Those opposed with a nay. It's unanimous to Consent Agenda items 1 through 17. We have no regular Consent items. And we have no further Public Comment cards. I'm presuming that to be so.

CITIZEN PETITIONS

[Time: 00:17:14]

Mayor Lane: And we do have the citizen petition item in front of us. I might ask for a little bit of guidance on this, since we each got an individual petition to us individually. Is that just a cumulative form of the same?

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: It's all the same petition. Mayor, we had to process them. It looks like an original but I actually have the original petition.

Mayor Lane: So the original petition.....

Clerk Jagger: It has been filed with the clerk. We're good, Mayor.

Mayor Lane: Well, in our, our options here are to take no action on this petition or to take action in the form of direction to the City Manager to consider a report back to us or otherwise. Is there any action that is desired by the Council?

City Attorney Bruce Washburn: Mayor, I'm sorry. There is a third option and that is to direct that the matter be agendized at a future meeting.

Mayor Lane: Thank you very much, Mr. Washburn.

Vice Mayor Phillips: So I move that we direct the City Manager to investigate the matter and prepare a written response to the Council with a copy to the petitioner.

Councilwoman Littlefield: I will second that.

Mayor Lane: The motion then has been made and seconded to refer this to the City Manager for report back to us on that. I think we are then ready to vote. All those in favor of that, please indicate by aye. Those opposed with a nay. It's unanimous then to proceed with that motion,

directed to the City Manager. Any questions for the City Manager of the motion maker of us?

City Manager Jim Thompson: No, sir.

Mayor Lane: Thank you. And that will be the course of action with regard to that. No further Mayor or Council items. And with that, then we have completed our business. Thank you all for attending and being here with us.

ADJOURNMENT

[Time: 00:18:59]

Mayor Lane: And I would ask for a motion to adjourn.

Vice Mayor Phillips: So moved.

Mayor Lane: That was multiples there, but any case, there's a motion and a second out there. All those in favor of adjournment, please indicate by aye. We are adjourned.