
This document was created from the closed caption transcript of the May 6, 2024 City Council Regular Meeting and has not been checked for completeness or accuracy of content.

A copy of the agenda for this meeting, including a summary of the action taken on each agenda item, is available online at:

<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/Assets/ScottsdaleAZ/Council/current-agendas-minutes/2024-agendas/05-06-24-regular-agenda.pdf>

An unedited digital video recording of the meeting, which can be used in conjunction with the transcript, is available online at:

<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/scottsdale-video-network/Council-video-archives/2024-archives>

For ease of reference, included throughout the transcript are bracketed “time stamps” [Time: 00:00:00] that correspond to digital video recording time.

For more information about this transcript, please contact the City Clerk’s Office at 480-312-2411.

CALL TO ORDER

[Time: 00:00:02]

Mayor Ortega: Hello, everyone. I call the May 6, 2024 City Council Regular Meeting to order. City Clerk Ben Lane, please conduct the roll call.

ROLL CALL

[Time: 00:00:10]

Ben Lane: Thank you, Mayor. Mayor David Ortega.

Mayor Ortega: Present.

Ben Lane: Vice Mayor Solange Whitehead.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Here.

Ben Lane: Councilmembers Tammy Caputi.

Councilwoman Caputi: Here.

Ben Lane: Tom Durham.

Councilmember Durham: Here.

Ben Lane: Barry Graham.

Councilmember Graham: Here.

Ben Lane: Betty Janik.

Councilwoman Janik: Here.

Ben Lane: And Kathy Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Here

Ben Lane: City Manager Jim Thompson.

Jim Thompson: Here

Ben Lane: City Attorney Sherry Scott.

Sherry Scott: Here.

Ben Lane: City Treasurer Sonia Andrews.

Sonia Andrews: Here.

Ben Lane: And the Clerk is present. Thank you, Mayor.

Mayor Ortega: Excellent. We have Sergeant Sean Ryan as well as Detective Dustin Patrick and Firefighter Cody Taylor, should anyone need assistance. Also just want to point out that the restrooms are up the ramp and through that opening to my left. We will begin with the Pledge of Allegiance, Councilmember Tom Durham please.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

[Time: 00:00:56]

Councilmember Durham: I pledge allegiance to the flag of the United States of America, and to the republic for which it stands: one nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and justice for all.

MAYOR'S REPORT

[Time: 00:01:22]

Mayor Ortega: Okay. At this time, I want to draw our attention to the ongoing wars in foreign countries as they fight to protect their democracy and freedom. I also ask that we think of the safety of our

military service personnel. So, I'd ask that you join me in a moment of silent reflection for these war-torn countries.

Thank you. Next, we have a Sustainability Award. Scottsdale reinstated our Sustainability Program, Recognition Program. And I have a proclamation for a group known as Our City. We have several members here that are listening on to this. Whereas Scottsdale is committed to responsible stewardship of the natural and built environments; and whereas the City recently relaunched its Sustainable Scottsdale Award Program to celebrate outstanding contributions to sustainability and environmental stewardship within the Scottsdale community; and whereas Our City has been collecting food waste from Scottsdale residents and businesses for 10 years and has diverted millions of pounds of food waste from landfills to be used in local farming; and whereas they collect food waste from residents and businesses to produce compost on their own farm and offer local organic produce to Scottsdale doorsteps with curbside delivery. Our City is working to double the number of residential customers in Scottsdale this year, and has partnered with the city departments to create sustainable events, therefore, I David D. Ortega, the 12th Mayor of Scottsdale, do declare the 2024 Sustainable Scottsdale Awardee to be Our City and thank all the applicants to the Program for their sustainable efforts. Let's give them a hand.

CITY MANAGER'S REPORT

[Time: 00:05:52]

Mayor Ortega: Well, next we will have the City Manager's Report, therefore Jim Thompson will provide us some information.

Jim Thompson: Thank you, Mr. Mayor, members of Council, we have a short video for you this evening.

Fast Five Video: Hi, I'm Public Affairs Specialist Stephanie Hirata with five fast things happening around the city you need to know. Starting us off at number five, celebrate Indian Bend Wash with free community events. The Indian Bend Wash flood control project transformed a serious flooding hazard into a world-renowned network of parks, lakes, paths, and golf courses traversing through the heart of Scottsdale. The Indian Bend Wash Greenbelt spans 11 miles and is considered one of the top urban green spaces in Arizona. Its creation demonstrates the city's commitment to environmental conservation and creating recreational opportunities for residents. Join the celebration to experience the history and beauty of the Indian Bend Wash through family friendly events. Don't miss out on the Paws in the Park dog event at Chaparral Dog Park and an exciting Dive in Movie at El Dorado Aquatic Center. Get all the details at scottsdaleaz.gov and search Indian Bend Wash events.

Coming in at number four get ready Scottsdale, this month our Transportation and Streets Department is kicking off their yearly road shoulder maintenance cycle. Street operations crews maintain more than over 100 miles of road shoulders throughout the city. Eight-man crews operate a variety of heavy equipment in the work area including motor graders, front end loaders, side and end dump trucks, kick brooms, water trucks, road rollers and traffic control arrow trucks. Their tasks include clearing overgrown vegetation from the sides of roads, improving driver visibility and ensuring bicycle lanes are free from obstruction. This trimming also forms a natural fire break a safe 12 feet from the road. They also back fill deteriorated and washed-out shoulder edges. A common result of standard roadway wear

and tear and storm damage. To ensure a smooth and safe surface for vehicles, crews diligently grade the shoulder slope. Transportation and Streets would like to remind everyone that safety is our top priority, both for our road users and our hardworking crews. We urge everyone to exercise caution when driving near construction zones and to adhere to posted directional signs.

Next up at number three, save the date, Scottsdale's annual community Juneteenth celebration is next month. Come and enjoy delicious food, uplifting music, family friendly entertainment and so much more. This free and vibrant event promises a day filled with indoor and outdoor activities from 2:00 to 7:00 p.m. on Saturday June 15th at the Scottsdale Center for the Performing Arts. Learn more at scottsdaleaz.gov and search Juneteenth.

At number two, have you heard the exciting news? Scottsdale is making several upgrades to McCormick Stillman Railroad Park. The new features include an indoor train themed play structure and splash pad which will make the park even more popular during the hot summer months. Construction is expected to take about a year to complete. The splash pad approved as part of the 2019 bond election has been the most requested enhancement over the past several years as identified during the parks' master planning process. The indoor play structure is being purchased by the Scottsdale Railroad and Mechanical Society, the Park's non-profit partner. McCormick Stillman Railroad Park is Scottsdale's signature park and generates approximately \$2.5 million in revenue annually. Learn more at scottsdaleaz.gov and search railroad park improvements.

Wrapping things up at number one, a great big congratulations to the City's 2024 Sustainable Scottsdale Award Winner, Our City. Our City has been collecting food waste from Scottsdale residents and businesses for more than a decade. Diverting millions of pounds of food waste from landfills to be used in local farming. They collect food waste from residents and businesses to produce compost on their farm, which means they can grow produce without the use of chemicals or pesticides. In addition, they offer local organic produce to Scottsdale's doorstep with their full circle curbside delivery. Mayor Ortega recognized Our City at the City's Earth Fest Event at Cactus Park in April. Once again, congratulations and thank you for your sustainable efforts. And that's Scottsdale's Fast Five for May. Thanks for watching.

Mayor Ortega: Thank you. These presentations are amazing. And Stephanie Hirata has moved on. So, that was her last presentation to us. She is staying in the area; we have asked her to stay in contact and auditions are underway for that position.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

[Time: 00:10:39]

Now, during tonight's meeting, the Council may make a motion to recess into Executive Session to obtain legal advice on any applicable item on the agenda. If authorized by the Council, the Executive Session will be held immediately and will not be open to the public. The public meeting would then resume following the Executive Session. Also, per our Council Rules of Procedure, citizens attending City Council meetings shall observe the same rules of order and decorum applicable to members of the Council and city staff. Unauthorized remarks or demonstrations from the audience will not be tolerated and could result in removal from the meeting also helps us keep the meeting move smoothly.

PUBLIC COMMENT

[Time: 00:11:30]

Next, we move on to public comment. Public comment is an opportunity that's reserved for Scottsdale citizens, business owners, and/or property owners to comment on non-agendized items that are within the Council's jurisdiction. Advocacy for or against a candidate or ballot measure during the Council Meeting is not allowed pursuant to state law and is therefore not deemed to be within the Council's jurisdiction. No official Council action can be taken on these items and speakers are limited to three minutes to address the Council. If you wish to speak on a non-agendized item of course you would check with the Clerk. And at this point, you have three minutes please come forward and mention your name. I therefore open public comment and I show Stephen Casares.

[Time: 00:12:47]

Stephen Casares: Hello, good evening, sir, Council, staff, citizens. I'd like to make a very brief positive comment, and a simple measure of thanks to the Scottsdale Police Department and to the Scottsdale Fire Department, our EMS and our first responders. I recently had a conversation with a small business owner, a fellow citizen, and she inspired me to speak candidly and simply with a simple message of thanks. I speak for myself, she speaks for herself, I'm sure we have a grateful citizenry here for our Scottsdale Police Department and Fire Department. I understand personally the long hours and risks from a similar profession, working swing shifts, being first on the scene can be traumatizing. The last-minute texts that you receive, having fun with the rookies, and who's on deck for next hosting the BBQ, and the gym competition, and my favorite, the fist pounds at the end of a shift or the end of watch. So, my message is simple, thanks for what you do to keep us safe and make us actually safe. Thank you.

MINUTES

[Time: 00:14:07]

Mayor Ortega: Thank you. We would now close public comment, moving on to the minutes. Next, we have approval of the minutes, and I request a motion to approve Regular Meeting and Work Study Session Minutes of March 19th, 2024. Do I have a second?

Councilwoman Janik: Second

Councilwoman Littlefield: Second.

Mayor Ortega: Thank you, we have a motion and a second, please record your vote. Thank you, that's unanimous.

CONSENT AGENDA

[Time: 00:14:36]

Mayor Ortega: Next we have Consent Agenda Items 1 through 12 and there's been a request to move Item 11. Item 11 to Regular Agenda, therefore, that will be heard after the Consent action is taken. That Item 11 pertains to ordinance changes for short term rentals. Is there any other discussion or request? Okay. Seeing none, at this point I open public comment regarding any Consent Agenda Items. Seeing none, therefore I close Public Comment. I'm open for a motion regarding the Consent Agenda Items, excluding, 1 through 12 excluding Number 11.

Councilwoman Janik: So moved.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Second.

Mayor Ortega: Motion and a second, please record your vote. Okay, thank you, that was unanimous.

REGULAR AGENDA – ITEM 11

[Time: 00:15:41]

Mayor Ortega: Next we will move on to the Regular Agenda Items. We will have a full presentation on Item Number 11, and we have also Item Number 13 on Regular Agenda. so, coming forth is Assistant City Manager, Brent Stockwell. Hello, thanks for being here.

Brent Stockwell: Good evening, Mayor, and Council. As you mentioned, my name is Brent Stockwell, I'm one of your Assistant City Managers. And tonight's presentation is actually going to be given to you by Will Brooks, one of our Management Associates to the City Manager. You may remember him from last November during the Work Study Session where we presented these items. So, Will, come up.

[Time: 00:16:34]

Will Brooks: Good evening, Mayor Ortega, and members of the City Council. My name is Will Brooks and I'm a Management Associate to the City Manager and have been working with our short-term rental team to present these ordinance amendments to you this evening. We received feedback from the City Council at the November 2023 Work Study Session and have been working to finalize all the language. We continue to be careful, to be compliant with state laws and all ordinance changes are necessary to protect public health and safety. We also have considered enforceability as a key concern of these ordinance amendments. There are three proposed changes for the Council to consider tonight. The first is to add promoters as a responsible party for causing nuisance parties or unlawful gatherings. The second is to prohibit minors from renting STRs. While the major online hosting platforms already have this language on their platforms, this ensures that our ordinance language is comprehensive.

Lastly, the proposed language gives the police authority to remove nonresidents from a property after a nuisance party is declared based on the preponderance of evidence, and the officer has determined that the nuisance party or unlawful gathering is a threat to the public peace, health, safety, or general welfare. After a nuisance party is declared, police can issue a written notice and ask all nonresidents to leave the property for a period of eight hours. In addition, we also gained, we also asked for public feedback in March. We received 2,175 responses through Pollco and 92% strongly agree or agree that we are moving in the right direction with these ordinance changes. In addition, we looked at the

resource impacts. There are very little minimal staffing and workload impacts. And also, there are no current budget impacts with passing these ordinance amendments. With all this considered, staff recommend adoption of these proposed amendments. Thank you.

Mayor Ortega: Thank you. At this point I would open public comment. And that's the purpose for people to come forward and speak on this posted item. Seeing none, therefore, I will close public comment. We will now go to Council comments. I have Councilwoman Janik, Councilmember Durham, and then Vice Mayor Whitehead. Councilwoman Janik.

[Time: 00:19:09]

Councilwoman Janik: Thank you, Mayor. I want to thank Council and staff for doing all they can to work with the community to make sure that we have appropriate behavior at our short-term rentals, and it is within the confines of the law. So, it has taken several months, I believe you said Will, thank you for your presentation, that we started in November. It is not easy to change or to adjust all the ordinances and guidelines. And I have to give a big shout out to Brent Stockwell because he has undertaken this massive task, and he's been at it for quite some time. Over three years I believe. So, thank you for all you've done. And I want the citizens to know that we are listening to them. I routinely get complaints about short-term rental behavior. I think this is a very, very big step in the right direction to make sure that everything is appropriate when we have short term rentals in our community, knowing that we are one of the top in the country for the number of short-term rentals for our population. So again, this is a big step, it is more work than most people would think. And I want to thank everybody for putting that time and effort in.

And with that, I would like to make a motion to adopt ordinance number 4626, amending Scottsdale revised code chapter 18, public nuisance and property maintenance article XIII, by amending section 18-122 definitions, amending section 18-131, unlawful for promoter to advertise, permit, or organize a nuisance party or unlawful gathering, unlawful for a promoter to advertise a special event at a residence within the city without having first obtained a special event permit. Civil penalties, adding section 18-132, Scottsdale police officer authority to order persons to leave a nuisance party or unruly gathering, notice and penalty for failure to leave or entry after notice. And adding section 18-133 of the remedies relating to nuisance parties and unlawful gatherings. And number two, adopt ordinance number 4627 amending Scottsdale revised code, chapter 18, public nuisance and property maintenance article IX by adding section 18-178 rental of vacation rentals and short-term rentals by juveniles is prohibited. Penalty.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Second.

Mayor Ortega: Thank you, we have a motion and a second. Next, I see Councilmember Durham and then Vice Mayor can speak to her second.

[Time: 00:21:56]

Councilmember Durham: Thank you, Mayor. I agree with Councilwoman Janik that these are very good, very good revisions to the ordinance, which will give our police more power to regulate these types of problems. I agree we get probably more email about this than almost any other subject. I have one

question about it, it said that in section 18-132, it said this section gives Scottsdale Police authority to ask non-residents to leave. And does that mean the term non-residents, does that mean non-residents of the short-term rental?

Will Brooks: Correct.

Councilmember Durham: Does that need to be clarified because it seems a little confusing. We normally use the term resident as a person who lives in Scottsdale.

Will Brooks: Thank you, Mayor Ortega, members of the City Council, Councilmember Durham, this would apply to all residential properties, not just short-term rentals. So that is probably why that language is there.

Councilmember Durham: It just seems there's a little ambiguity there. I think I understand what the intent was certainly.

Mayor Ortega: Let me call on the City Attorney Santaella.

[Time: 00:23:26]

Luis Santaella: Mayor, members of the City Council, I don't think there is ambiguity. The statute of the nuisance party ordinance is not limited to short term vacation rentals, it applies to all occupancies, long-term, short-term, and owner occupied. So, the term basically of nonresidents, means people that are not residing there. So, under the ordinance, the way it works, if the police officer finds by a preponderance of the evidence that there's a nuisance party or unlawful gathering and it's a threat to the general welfare, peace, quiet, et cetera. He or she can declare a nuisance party, post it with a door, and order people that are not living there, nonresidents, to leave. They don't have the authority to order people that are actually living there, technically the people that, and there's a presumption in the ordinance if you look further, more than six people are presumed not to be residents, because as you know, under our zoning code, we define a single family to be six adults and their dependent children. So, I don't believe there's ambiguity, it applies to all occupancies, and I think that it can be enforced.

Councilmember Durham: All right, thank you.

Mayor Ortega: Vice Mayor Whitehead, Councilmember Graham after.

[Time: 00:24:48]

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you, Mayor. And I agree with my colleagues, so I want to thank Assistant City Manager Brent Stockwell, also very importantly the legal team under Deputy City Attorney Luis Santaella. And I do have a question, or I have a comment, because our ordinances, which we keep tweaking, and we are leading in the state on how to best control what was pretty much an unregulated industry and make it so it's less disruptive and still serves its purpose. So, this is yet another attempt by the city of Scottsdale to lead the charge in a way that we allow for good actors, but we reign in some of the bad actors. And I realize that these particular tweaks are for all residences, not just short-term rental residences, but still, that's where we seem to be having the problem. But I do want to point out

that on the enforcement side, we have really stepped up as well, and I think this will give us more opportunities for enforcement. One of the ways that we've helped enforce our rules is, and perhaps the Deputy City Attorney can speak to this, is how we collect the fines for noncompliance. Can you speak to that?

Luis Santaella: Thank you, Mayor, and members of the Council. One of the programs that we started as a pilot program, is to start for those owners of short-term vacation rentals that do not pay their fines, we're starting to lien their properties in order to gain compliance. And we're hoping that will be an added tool. That's only when they default and do not pay their fines and it's related to the owners.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: So again, we have our police unit dedicated to short-term rentals and we have staff being very creative to find ways to make it easy for our short-term rental operators to comply, and if nothing else to incentivize them to do so. So, thank you, I'm very supportive of these changes. Thank you, Mayor.

Mayor Ortega: Councilmember Graham.

[Time: 00:27:19]

Councilmember Graham: Thank you, Mayor. Will, good presentation. This, I wish we could go further. I'm happy what we're doing tonight, and I support these changes. Just a few small questions. The promoters, it doesn't, it just says that somebody that's associated with promoting a party. I mean, what if people are texting? I mean what if people are texting and promoting a party after they got an invite or something? Don't you become a promoter then at that point?

Will Brooks: Thank you, Mayor Ortega, members of the City Council, Councilmember Graham, I'm going to refer to Deputy City Attorney Luis Santaella for definitions of the promoter.

Councilmember Graham: Okay.

Luis Santaella: Mayor, members of the Council.

Councilmember Graham: I guess my question. Did you struggle with this definition? Was this difficult? Because it seems like promoter could be?

Luis Santaella: No, sir. And it's defined as a person who contracts for or arranges with the owner, or other responsible person to provide activity or event with or without compensation who's responsible or directly organizes the presentation of the activities or events. I don't believe that the example that you gave of someone texting saying, there's a party at First and Main would apply. There's also exemptions in the definition to cover political events and charitable events. And being a promoter in itself is not illegal in any shape or form.

Councilmember Graham: Right.

Luis Santaella: It's just adding to the types of people that can be held responsible if there's an unlawful gathering or nuisance party. There's also a prohibition for promoters to advertise something that would

require a special event permit. So, no ordinance is perfect. If for some reason down the road we need to tweak it, we'll certainly bring it back to this Council. But in my legal opinion, I think we're on solid grounds.

Councilmember Graham: And then, so if the promoter they've contracted with, has nothing to do with the party, they were not at the party. They were just used. What kind of enforcement steps do you contemplate the City could pursue?

Luis Santaella: It's really going to depend on the totality of the circumstances. So if, depending on, and in the ordinance, there's a provision that if prima facie evidence of if you're advertising that can help hold you responsible. So, it's going to depend. We'd have to look at it on a case-by-case basis. So, it's possible maybe a promoter won't be held responsible for a particular event. But then again, they may very well be based on the facts.

Councilmember Graham: So, it's kind of a warning shot though for third parties, you may farm out you're promoting to some event promotion entity, and they need to be aware that in Scottsdale, there could be consequences for that?

Luis Santaella: I think, Councilmember that's a fair assessment.

[Time: 00:30:29]

Councilmember Graham: Okay. And then, prohibiting minors from renting STRs, did we, so that's below the age of 18. Did we consider disallowing that between 18 to 21?

Luis Santaella: No and here's the reason. Juveniles, people under 18 are prohibited from entering contracts anyway. Technically it was unlawful for someone that's under 18 to rent an STR. We didn't have any mechanism to enforce it. In terms of people between 18 and 21, I don't think we'd have the authority to do that, because of constitutional provisions about the right to contract.

Councilmember Graham: The concern I've heard is that 18 to 21, they could, you rent it, that's where underaged drinking can occur. It wasn't an option when any of us were kids, so, and we see this kind of, you know a little, I see it in my own neighborhood. I'm the only one up here that lives in 51, so I'm surrounded by these. And I'm constantly, you should talk to my wife, I'm complaining to her about STRs, noisy STRs all the time.

Luis Santaella: And Councilmember Graham and members of the Council, Mayor, I understand the problem, we just don't think we would have the authority to ban people between 18 and 20. Keep in mind that if you had a party where under aged drinking is going on, by definition, that's an unlawful gathering, and the police would have the ability to shut that party down and take enforcement action.

Councilmember Graham: And then, my last question is, for the police authority to remove non-residents. So they, the police happen upon a house that's you know a nuisance party, and so there's preponderance of evidence at that point, do they ask them to leave or is it a they shall leave?

Luis Santaella: It would be an order to leave.

Councilmember Graham: It would be an order, okay, very good. Well, appreciate all the work that staff has done on this. Kind of wish we could go further. I will say, as an aside, that the some of the safeguards we're putting in place as a city, for the registrations, you know, just this weekend I had an STR on my street that was putting bags of trash on the street before the trash. And I just went on the website, got the number to that STR registered, called them, zipped on over, because they don't want a report called on them. So, some of these mechanisms and tools that we're putting in place are working. It's not perfect like you said, Luis, but I'm in support and I'm pleased about this. Thank you for answering those questions. Will, thank you for your presentation. And Brent Stockwell thank you for the work we know we've done on this. Thank you, Mayor.

[Time: 00:33:28]

Mayor Ortega: Very good. I have some comments and then we have Councilwoman Littlefield. So, it's been a struggle because short-term rentals disrupted our neighborhoods, our pathways, parking is a problem, continues to be a problem. And this is, the next step that we can take. However, I think we should be aware that as we speak the Arizona Legislature is considering two bills, one House Bill 2720 and the other one is a Senate Bill, which would double, double the number of short-term rentals in Scottsdale. It has to do with accessory dwelling unit, and their Bill as it's coming forward, I believe Wednesday, would allow an accessory building, basically a second house on the property to be marketed as a short-term rental. So, we already have over 4,000 of these and that would permit them, wrongly in my opinion, to have a second advertisement for a second dwelling unit. And that would really be a buster for our neighborhoods.

It's intolerable that they're actually moving forward with that. Just as an example, some cities have different allowances. City of Phoenix allows accessory dwelling units. They took action to make it legal and so forth in the City of Phoenix, but they also stipulated that those accessory dwelling units would not be short-term rentals. And here the Legislature is pounding on Phoenix as well as us, by saying, "Oh, no, they can be overnighters. They can be weekenders. And they can be advertised as such as a separate unit." That means there could be two different occupants on, at those same property. Which in Scottsdale's case, who knows. It would be a question of an enforcement at door number one or door number two, or whoever's fighting over the pool that night. So, it's definitely a destructive, it's an ill-tempered piece of legislation that's coming forward, and it's really wrong for the entire Valley. They've said, "Well, if your city's over 75,000 it applies to you, and not to others." That's still not workable for us. So, it's a very dangerous situation that the Legislature is proposing.

Their bill also says that the accessory building would not be required to have fire sprinklers. Okay. Now, that's our code here in Scottsdale, so they're trying to preempt us even on a safety issue. So, you got that combined with common space and so forth. And we're trying to do our best to make sure that we can get the perpetrators when there might be a promoter on Unit A, and a different promoter on Unit B, or cross mixing and all that hassle. That's totally irresponsible on the Legislator agenda, and our Council stands against that, but it is pending. So just to give you an idea how destructive that could be, it would literally double the number of STRs. Next, and so of course, I'm in support of this measure, and I'll move on to Councilwoman Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Thank you, Mayor. I was just going to thank both of you for the work you've done and for your entire department for the good things that you have put together over the last

couple years regarding STRs. It's been phenomenal, but also, your work isn't done yet, according to what the Mayor has just said, it's just beginning. So, you got a whole other set of them coming up the pike. So, congratulations, and good luck. Wait to hear what you have to say on all of those things because the Mayor is correct, it's coming through the Legislature. Thank you.

Mayor Ortega: Thank you. And I would expect the Governor would veto something like that, but we'll find out. At this point I see no other requests to speak, so please record your vote. Okay, we are unanimous. Thank you very much.

REGULAR AGENDA - ITEM 13

Mayor Ortega: Next we're moving on to Item Number 13. Item Number 13 pertains to a public hearing on the Community Development Block Grant. That's the CDBG Program Fiscal Year 2024/25 Annual Action Plan and the allocation of CDBG and HOME Investment Partnership funds. Hello, Mary Witkofski, the Community Assistant Manager.

[Time: 00:38:56]

Mary Witkofski: Good evening, Mayor, members of the Council, tonight I come before you to talk a little bit about our Annual Action Plan. So, I thought I'd kind of take a step back as every year I've come before you for the last several years, is just kind of dive right into the numbers. Instead, I thought we'd take a step back and talk a little bit about what the Annual Action Plan is, and how we got to where we got. So, an Annual Action Plan helps Scottsdale meet the goals that are currently outlined in our Consolidated Action Plan. Our top three goals identified by that Plan are affordable housing, public facilities and infrastructure, and public services. Fiscal year 24/25 Annual Action Plan is the fifth year of our Consolidated Action Plan. It is funded by the annual allocation of our Community Development Block Grant and HOME Investment Partnership funds.

So, what is Community Development Block Grant? They help, these funds help to develop viable urban communities by providing decent housing, a suitable living environment and expanding economic opportunities through three national objectives. The three national objectives are listed up on the board, and the number one that the city of Scottsdale utilizes is benefits to our low and moderate income persons. So, what can we use our funding for? We can use it for a number of activities. We can use it for public services which we will talk to you about tonight with our nonprofit funding, our housing rehabilitation programs, acquisition of real property, economic development activities, planning and administration, and then improvements to public facilities. As you see on the slide, this is actually Apache Park, which was recently renovated this year, with CDBG funds.

HOME Investment Partnership Program is designated specifically to create affordable housing for low-income households. Some things that we can use our HOME Investment Partnership Program funds for are acquisition and rehabilitation of property, grants, direct loans, loan guarantees, rental assistance, also known as tenant-based rental assistance and security deposits. So, what is required of our office through our Annual Action Plan process? We're required to hold two public hearings. We had a public hearing, you'll see on the timeline next, we're also required to do a 30-day public comment period which actually closes today, and we must draft out those lists of proposed activities and a plan. This is our timeline, so we began actually the planning phase in November, in our office. We had our first

public hearing, one of the public hearings has to start prior to the draft of the Annual Action Plan. So, we did garner public input through our Human Services Commission. Then we worked through our nonprofit funding program and then we stand before you tonight and we have our public comment period on our draft plan closes. All programs will take effect as of July 1st, 2025, pending the final allocation from HUD.

[Time: 00:42:00]

So, how do we get our allocation from HUD? Housing and Urban Development determines the amount of each of our annual funding by a statutory formula using these several measures listed on the board. On average, the city of Scottsdale receives about \$1.1 million. How do we get our HOME allocation? The city of Scottsdale is currently a member of the Maricopa County Home Consortium, and they determine the funding based on the following. They take all of the total consortium members which includes, and I'm going to list a few, not all of them, the city of Glendale, Goodyear, Peoria, Surprise, Tempe, Gilbert, and Chandler are a few of them. They add everyone's CDBG allocation up to total and then divide it by the number of consortium members. And so, our actual percentage of total funding is about 8%.

Program income, our program income is gross income generated directly from CDBG funded activities. We have one CDBG funded activity here in the city of Scottsdale, and that is the Paiute Neighborhood Center. We receive rental income through buildings 4 and 5. And that funding is then returned to the City's CDBG line of credit and expended on eligible activities such as administration and staff. We also have revolving loan program income or revolving loan income. This is generated income, but is handled much differently than the program income we must establish a revolving loan and it has to go back into the original programs that it was received from. So, our specific one is, we have a Green Housing Rehabilitation Program. When an applicant is approved, they receive a loan from our office as opposed to a grant. After we've completed it, the city does put a lien on their property. If they continue residing in the home after three years of residing in that home, we forgive 50% of the loan. And should they choose to sell it after that period, the lien the 50% is paid back to the city. And that is how we generate revolving income. Our second revolving loan belongs to Bellevue properties, this is the first time we're recognizing this. So, as we gain rental income, a percentage of that funding comes back into Bellevue properties for maintenance and ongoing repairs.

So, tonight, I come before you with regards to fiscal year 2025. You can see that we're receiving about \$1.1 million, and again this is a tentative number, we have not officially received our allocation from HUD yet at this point. These numbers are subject to change. We're estimating approximately \$56,000 in program income, this is specifically from the Paiute Neighborhood Center, and then we're reprogramming funds of approximately \$379,000 with a total funding available of approximately \$1.5. You'll see the award recommendations below, leaving us a balance of \$1,962 that is currently unallocated that we'll bring before you in fiscal year 25/26. So, our current recommendations for funding through our draft plan is \$307,000 directly to public services, where they'll serve victims of domestic violence, seniors, youth, mental health, disabled, and homeless. We also have our nonpublic services, which is our housing rehabilitation programs at \$857,000. And then our nonpublic services facility improvements at \$200,000 and our program administration at \$232,000.

So, HOME Investment Partnership this year we're receiving an estimated \$355,614. Proposing to utilize it for continued tenant-based rental assistance for our elderly population, aged 62 and older who are below 30% or below the area median income. And more than 50% cost burdened. Our current program for tenant-based rental assistance did roll out on November 6 of 2023. We currently have six seniors who are stably housed after being displaced, we have one pending eligibility, and we are looking for eight additional applicants to be able to meet their needs. A formal IGA with regards to this \$355,000 will be coming to Council in the fall.

So, as part of our requirements, we are required to receive comments from the public, and this year we utilized Speak Up Scottsdale. During the initial planning phase, we did a poll, and a discussion questionnaire on Speak Up Scottsdale on proposed activities which was conducted February 8 to March 9. And then once we drafted the actual Plan, we posted that on Speak Up Scottsdale as well, and received comments from April 5 to today. The top priorities or the top themes from both of those avenues came back as seeking funding to our nonprofit agencies, helping qualified homeowners with emergency repairs, rental housing acquisition for low moderate-income families, and tenant-based rental assistance. These were the standard themes across the board. So, tonight's action request is to adopt Resolution 13099. That concludes my presentation.

Mayor Ortega: Thank you. At this point I will open public comment. I see there's one request to speak, Neal Shearer. Please come forward.

PUBLIC COMMENT

[Time: 00:47:50]

Neal Shearer: Honorable Mayor and Council, I'm Neal Shearer, long time Scottsdale resident and member of the Human Services Commission, and I'm here tonight to fully support the resolution before you. I'd like to begin by thanking the folks that were involved in bringing this forward this evening, and that includes the staff, Mary and Chad Beougher in particular, and others who worked on this at the staff level. And then, my colleagues on the Human Services Commission who really worked extensively to bring this item forward. These funds totaling nearly \$2 million will do much good to help low- and moderate-income residents, address a number of challenges. And Mary spoke to those. I want to reiterate some of them because I think they're really important to highlight. Helping elderly and disabled residents with rental assistance to keep them in their homes. Providing home modifications for disabled residents and home improvements such as roof replacements and air conditioners in the summer heat.

I just did sort of a back of the envelope calculation and my estimate is over the years we've helped over 2,000 homeowners with these types of home improvements. So, we have not only helped individuals, we've enhanced the housing stock in sections of Scottsdale that qualify for these funds. We are helping by securing emergency and transitional housing for residents who don't have shelter. We are providing crisis counseling and case management for victims of abuse and trauma. And the additional caseworker at the senior center will help to address the growing number of seniors who struggle with loneliness and isolation. As you know, all of this is federal funding.

And for years, the city of Scottsdale has been extremely successful, by acquiring federal funds such as the block grant funds and the HOME funds and other grants to do wonderful things in our community. It's become increasingly difficult for staff to secure grants to support basic human services as was evidenced when we lost out on two grants, one from the state, and one from the county most recently. It may not be a popular sentiment, but the city is approaching a time where more General Fund dollars may need to be invested in order to sustain basic human services for Scottsdale seniors and other residents who are experiencing life changing hardships. I wanted to bring this funding concern forward to your attention because I know you care about human services, and you recognize that our outstanding services programs and facilities routinely enhance the quality of life for our residents. And because how a community helps those less fortunate is one of the measures of the greatness of a community. Thank you.

Mayor Ortega: Thank you, at this point we will close public comment. Again, this is a public hearing on the Community Development Block Grant. At this point, I will move on to any questions. Vice Mayor Whitehead and then Councilmember Graham.

[Time: 00:51:29]

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thanks Mayor and thank you Mary for getting back up to the podium. I just wanted to comment that actually our public speaker Mr. Shearer mentioned a lot of these points. We take grants which are our tax dollars that flow through the federal government and back to our community. And what a difference we're making here in this community. I'm very impressed that the priorities that we have shown up here on the dais are aligned with the public feedback we got on the priorities. You know, we definitely have a compassionate community. But we all know that we have to address these issues, if we don't want homelessness, and we do have to make sure to catch those, especially what we're seeing in the senior community, catch them before they fall into it, because it's helpful. On the rental assistance program, you mentioned there's six seniors already on that program, one pending, and there's funding for just eight additional?

Mary Witkofski: Mayor Ortega, members of the Council, at this point, we're taking in additional depending on what the annual cost per person we may be able to take on additional ones past that eight. But on average, we're spending between \$15,000 to \$18,000 a year per person.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, so, so \$15,000 a year?

Mary Witkofski: \$15,000 to \$18,000 per person. For the rental subsidy, the elderly are still paying 30%, we're paying 70%.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, that's good to know. And these are, we're doing this rental assistance because these landlords are not accepting the vouchers, is that that's a separate program?

Mary Witkofski: Mayor Ortega, members of the Council, they actually are accepting the vouchers. These are seniors who were just priced out of their current homes and are now being displaced due to the increasing cost of rent.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, so the voucher is paying probably that 30%? Or? Because we're paying 70%.

Mary Witkofski: We pay 70%, and then the resident pays 30%.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay.

Mary Witkofski: The tenant based rental assistance program, operates directly in alignment with the housing choice voucher, they just have different terminologies, but it is the same exact program.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, but the funding is different?

Mary Witkofski: Funding is different, but we use the same program rules.

[Time: 00:54:08]

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, got it. Okay, well, that's great. Just out of curiosity, how would someone apply to be part of this? Because obviously, I know people who might be interested.

Mary Witkofski: Mayor Ortega, members of Council, all referrals must go through Granite Reef or Via Linda Senior Center. We have a letter of agreement with the senior centers to accept all referrals and submit the applications. Without a referral from a social worker at one of those centers, you're not eligible. So, it is mandatory. And the senior resident the who receives the assistance is required to have quarterly case management meetings as part of the program eligibility.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, great. Another question, and I don't want to blindside you, I meant to email you ahead of time. But we had a presentation from the County about the state program that retrofits houses to reduce utility bills. Do you know and that state funding flows through the county to us, and that helps lower utility bills and also, as Mr. Schearer said, upgrades the housing stock. Do you have any information if we've been able to tap that? If you don't, I will follow up with you afterwards.

Mary Witkofski: Mr. Mayor, members of the Council, in terms of the utility assistance, that would filter through Vista Del Camino, and outside of my per view. With regards to the retrofit when we can't do certain programs, we do make referrals directly to the county, or actually, through the Department of Housing, because the funding goes through the housing, and then they have a contract with, oh, gosh, I cannot think what it's called right now, I know it's called SAL, but I don't remember what the acronym stands for, so I'd be happy to get back to you on that.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Yeah, I'll follow up with you. And thank you again, I'm obviously very supportive of this. In fact, I'll just while I have the floor I'll motion, let's see if I can get back to it. I'll let the others speak. Thank you.

Mayor Ortega: Okay. Did you want to make a motion? Please do.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: I'm happy to. Here we go. Well, a motion to adopt Resolution 13099 to approve the fiscal year 24/25 Annual Action Plan.

Councilwoman Janik: Second.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Second

Councilmember Durham: Second.

Mayor Ortega: Okay. Next, we have Councilmember Graham and then Councilmember Durham can speak to his second and then we have Councilwoman Janik.

[Time: 00:56:40]

Councilmember Graham: Thank you, Mayor. Thank you, Mary, for your presentation. The HOME Investment Partnership Program, you said there's six participants right now?

Mary Witkofski: Mr. Mayor, members of the Council, correct.

Councilmember Graham: Where are they from, are they from Scottsdale?

Mary Witkofski: Mr. Mayor, members of the Council, they are required to be Scottsdale residents in order to be assisted.

Councilmember Graham: Very good. And so, do we cut a check to them, and they pay the landlord? Or do we cut a check to the landlord directly?

Mary Witkofski: Mr. Mayor, members of the Council, we pay the landlord directly.

Councilmember Graham: The Green Assistance Program, is that, do you guys more focus on power conservation or water conservation? If I'm understanding that correctly? I was just curious, a couple projects, because I know we spent some money on that.

Mary Witkofski: Mr. Mayor, members of the Council, I'm actually going to defer to Chad Beougher who oversees that program in the audience to come up and talk about that.

Councilmember Graham: Do you think he's willing?

Mary Witkofski: He's willing.

[Time: 00:57:48]

Chad Beougher: Mayor, members of the Council, the Green Rehab Program focuses on energy conservation through multiple things. Energy efficient air conditioners, we do a home performance evaluation on every single home. Oh, excuse me, which involves checking air ducts, insulation, breathability of the home, how tight is the house, what type of windows, and through that evaluation we write a scope of work.

Councilmember Graham: Okay, so I'm hearing power conservation.

Chad Beougher: Energy conservation, power conservation, excuse me. And also, we look at building code violations as well.

Councilmember Graham: Very good. How many participants did you help? I guess, not to put you on the spot, but like we're finishing fiscal 24. How many projects have you done this year?

Chad Beougher: Mayor, members of the Council, we have completed three or two projects this fiscal year.

Councilmember Graham: Okay, so there was like ductwork or a new air conditioner?

Chad Beougher: A full rehab. That's anything throughout the house. So, we can do flooring, bathrooms, carpet, but the intent is to get the home energy certified with a Green Building Program that we have here at city of Scottsdale.

Councilmember Graham: Very good, thank you, Chad.

Chad Beougher: Thank you.

Councilmember Graham: And I just had one more question about reprogramming. I don't know if that's Chad's domain. Okay, Mary that's you right? Can you, that's not really like a word we use in everyday conversation. Can you sort of interpret that so we can understand that?

Mary Witkofski: Mayor Ortega, members of the Commission, reprogrammed funds are unspent funds from the prior years allocation to be reprogrammed to eligible CDBG activities.

[Time: 00:59:45]

Councilmember Graham: And so, I guess what I hear when you say that is that we received money, but we didn't spend it last year. So, is that because of a lack of applicants or was it just a lack of staff? We had plenty of applicants? Or maybe we chose to encumber it to certain programs that weren't as used as we thought they might be?

Mary Witkofski: Mayor Ortega, members of the Council, we did award all of the program funding last year, however, some nonprofits that we give funding to don't necessarily spend all of it, because we do hold them accountable for every cent spent as we report back to the federal government or projects had a change, and we needed to reallocate it for a future purpose.

Councilmember Graham: So, when you give money to the nonprofits, is that kind of like legally is that like a donor restriction?

Mary Witkofski: Mr. Mayor, members of the Council, they enter into a grant sub recipient agreement with the city of Scottsdale.

Councilmember Graham: Okay, and so, and that reprogramming, that's kind of a year to year, that's pretty common, from a year-to-year basis, is that correct?

Mary Witkofski: Mayor Ortega, members of the Commission, it can be common, or it has been common over the past three years, since we've come before you, since I've been here.

Councilmember Graham: Okay, thank you, Mary. Thanks, Chad for coming up. Mayor, thank you.

Mayor Ortega: Okay, I will now go to Councilmember Durham who made the second and then Councilwoman Janik. Did you have any comments?

[Time: 01:01:25]

Councilmember Durham: I didn't put in, but I will say a few words. All of this money obviously comes with strings attached, and the strings are that we've got to use this money to help people, and that's what we're doing with it. And so, I think this proves once again, there's nothing wrong with us taking money with strings attached from the state or from the federal government when we use it for these purposes. And I also thought it was interesting that the way we've used these funds are very much aligned with community support and community input. There are certain people who can't tell the difference between Scottsdale and San Francisco. I won't mention their names, but I think this shows that we do these things the Scottsdale way. As you've explained tonight, there are a lot of services that go along with this. These are the people being housed in these projects are not illegal immigrants, they're not drug addicts, they're not alcoholics, many of them are elderly who have been priced out of their homes, and that's the reality of the homeless situation, or at least a significant part of it in Scottsdale. So, we're using this money for good, for practical purposes. It's being run well, and it's being run with good oversight. So, it's, all of this is a great program, and we should all be proud of it. Thank you.

Mayor Ortega: Okay. Councilwoman Janik and then myself.

Councilmember Janik: Thank you, Mayor. Thank you, Mary, very nice presentation. Neal mentioned that in the future we may have to tap into the General Fund to meet some of the demands. Is this because the demands are going up and or that the money flowing to us is going down? Could you talk about that just briefly.

Mary Witkofski: Mayor Ortega, members of the Council, I can answer it briefly, and then I think I do need to defer to the Human Services Director. But the funding coming in is going down.

Councilwoman Janik: Okay. Thank You.

Mayor Ortega: Okay, so my comments are, first of all, thank you to the Human Services Commission. All of these line items have been vetted. All of the programs have been, are conforming. And there are two attachments, basically our action tonight is to forward on the application to HUD. And it is in good form, it's been vetted by, in detail by the Commission, and it includes the nonprofit partners, people that the distributed funds go forward, we are performance driven. Several of these include Homeward Bound, Family Promise of Greater Phoenix. Of course, the Ability 360, New Leaf, and Chrysalis Shelter. So, these end up being as follow-up contracts for performance, so there is no give-away, they are providing performance according to their contract, and we're monitoring that. So, it's a very beneficial

relationship, conducted with a very high accountability. I see Councilwoman Caputi, and then I think we're near a vote on this.

[Time: 01:04:52]

Councilmember Caputi: Just really quick, Mr. Shearer made the comment about having helped thousands of people over the years and I want to reiterate that a lot of these topics seem very trendy, but this is what we do in Scottsdale, we take care of the people who are vulnerable, we have been doing it for many years, and we don't do anything just sort of on a whim. Right? I actually wrote down in my notes, Consolidated Action Plan, we have plans for everything. We have a General Plan, and all the sub plans underneath it, and we have very specific goals up here as a Council. And as we roll out our action plans it matches our goals and what the community wants us to do. And so again, this to me is just kind of a no-brainer, right? It matches our goals; it matches what our community is looking from us and it shouldn't be the least bit controversial. This, again, this is the good stuff we do here in Scottsdale. This is what makes us an amazing city, so very happy to support this program, thank you.

Mayor Ortega: Okay, we have a motion and a second. Please record your vote. Thank you. We are unanimous.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Mayor Ortega: Next item on the agenda is public comment. Public comments is the second opportunity for citizens of Scottsdale, business owners, or property owners to come forward. I am told there are no requests for the second opportunity for public comment, therefore, I will close public comment.

CITIZEN PETITIONS

Mayor Ortega: Moving on to citizen petitions as per our charter. Citizens may present a petition to the Clerk's Office, and I'm told there's no request for a citizen's petition, therefore, that matter is closed.

MAYOR AND COUNCIL ITEMS – ITEM 15

[Time: 01:06:37]

Mayor Ortega: We are next coming to the Mayor and Council Items. There were two requests, the first one of course came to request, to agendize the review of the zoning ordinance's minor development application approval and appeal process at future Council Work Study Session. This agenda was amended on April 30th to note the removal of this item at the request of Councilwoman Janik. So, it did come forward for today, but it's been removed, so accordingly, I'm noting that, and Item Number 15 is gone.

MAYOR AND COUNCIL ITEMS – ITEM 16

Mayor Ortega: Finally, we will turn to the nominating portion of the meeting regarding boards, commissions, and task force nominations. I will turn the meeting over to Vice Mayor Whitehead, who will be chairing this portion of the meeting.

[Time: 01:07:35]

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you, Mayor. This evening, the City Council will be nominating Scottsdale residents interested in serving on citizen advisory boards, commissions, and committees. The Scottsdale City Council is responsible for establishing city policies and enacting laws in support of those policies. The Council relies on volunteer, citizen-based boards and commissions to research issues and make recommendations in support of the Council's mission and goals. The information and recommendations provided by Council-appointed advisory boards is a valuable tool in helping Councilmembers in their deliberations. Appointments for these positions will be made at a Special City Council Meeting on May 14th. As we begin our process this evening, I'd like to remind my colleagues that an applicant only needs to receive one nomination in order to advance to interview before the Council. When I call on you, if your chosen applicant or applicants have already been nominated by a Councilmember, please state "no additional" and we'll move on in the process. Thank you, and let's get started.

[Time: 01:08:52]

First up, is the Board of Adjustment and there's two openings. The Board of Adjustment is a quasi-judicial body that hears variance requests, appeals of the Zoning Administrator's interpretation decisions, and decides on administrative decisions or zoning requirements, which create unnecessary hardships in the development of property because of exceptional or extraordinary conditions. The terms for Michael Gonzalez and Ryan Wagner expire in May. Michael Gonzalez is ineligible for reappointment. Ryan Wagner is eligible; however, he did not submit an application. There are two vacancies and four applicants. The applicants are Carlos Gantchoff, Paul Garry, Randy Griffin, and Jay Leopold. We'll start with Councilwoman Caputi.

Councilwoman Caputi: Carlos Gantchoff and Randy Griffin.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Janik?

Councilwoman Janik: Paul Garry, no additional.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: No additional.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Mayor Ortega.

Mayor Ortega: No additional.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: No additional. Councilmember Durham.

Councilmember Durham: No additional.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilmember Graham.

Councilmember Graham: Mr. Leopold.

[Time: 01:10:13]

Vice Mayor Whitehead: The Citizens' Bond Oversight Committee has one opening. The Citizens' Bond Oversight Committee receives reports on the city's progress in implementing the bond program, reviews any proposed project changes to the program, and provides comments to the City Council with respect to the bond program as the Committee deems appropriate. Janice Eng resigned from the committee in February. There is one vacancy and five applicants. The applicants are April Holland, Darryl Komesu, Britta McKee, Robert Simmons, and Tami Smith. And we'll start with Councilwoman Janik.

Councilwoman Janik: Darryl Komesu.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: April Holland, Britta McKee.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: There's only one opening.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Oh, I'm sorry, April Holland.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, thank you. Mayor Ortega?

Mayor Ortega: No additional.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: No additional. Councilmember Durham.

Councilmember Durham: Robert Simmons.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilmember Graham.

Councilmember Graham: Ms. Smith.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: And Councilwoman Caputi.

Councilwoman Caputi: No additional.

[Time: 01:11:20]

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Environmental Advisory Commission. The Environmental Advisory Commission provides guidance on the prioritization of future environmental activities and recommends environmental policies to the City Council. Special qualifications, as specified in the Scottsdale City Code, the membership of the Board shall reflect both scientific and non-scientific interests. Natalie Chrisman Lazarr's term expires in May and is ineligible for reappointment. There is one vacancy and

four applicants. The applicants are Scott Newell, Nathan Nutter, Alexandra Sellers, and Judah Waxelbaum. And we'll start with Councilwoman Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Scott Newell.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Yeah, one opening. Mayor Ortega.

Mayor Ortega: No additional.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Nathan Nutter. Councilmember Durham.

Councilmember Durham: Judah Waxelbaum.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilmember Graham.

Councilmember Graham: No additional. And you're going, I like the pace you're going. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Oh, you're welcome. Councilwoman Caputi.

Councilwoman Caputi: Alexandra Sellers.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: And Councilwoman Janik.

Councilwoman Janik: No additional.

[Time: 01:12:26]

Vice Mayor Whitehead: All right, Historic Preservation Commission. The Historic Preservation Commission oversees the development and management of Scottsdale's Historic Preservation Program. Special qualifications, as outlined in the Scottsdale City Code, each member shall have demonstrated special interest, knowledge, or experience in at least one of the following building construction, history, architectural history, real estate, historic preservation law, or other historic preservation related field. Linda Davis's term expires in May and is ineligible for reappointment. There is one vacancy and three applicants. And the applicants are Kat Djordjevic, I definitely messed that up, Mark Estes, and Brandon Fadden. Mayor, let's start with you.

Mayor Ortega: Mark Estes.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: No Additional. Councilmember Durham.

Councilmember Durham: Kat Djordjevic.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Good job. Councilmember Graham.

Councilmember Graham: Mr. Fadden.

[Time: 01:13:28]

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, onward. Human Relations Commission. The Human Relations Commission advocates and promotes all dimensions of diversity. The Commission acts as an advisory body to the Mayor, City Council, and staff to make recommendations on ways to encourage mutual respect and understanding among people, to discourage prejudice and discrimination, and to work towards cultural awareness and unity. James Eaneman and Matthew Keen resigned from the Commission in February. Robin Reed passed away unexpectedly earlier this year, resulting in a third vacancy. There are three vacancies and seven applicants. The applicants are Veronica Aguilar, Muhammad Babur, Kris Cano, Demarco Cason, Jeannie Mckenna, James Somerville, and Sara Yaron. I'm going to begin with me. And there's three, I'm going to nominate Veronica Aguilar, Sarah Yaron, and Kris Cano. Councilmember Durham.

Councilmember Durham: Muhammad Babur and Demarco Cason.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, so do we have?

Councilmember Graham: No additional, but if I can just say prayers for Mr. Reed and his family and that was a touching tribute that the Mayor gave to Mr. Reed and his family.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Yeah, thank you.

Councilwoman Caputi: No additional.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay. Councilwoman Janik.

Councilmember Janik: Jeannie Mckenna.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: I think we got everybody. Did we? Are we missing one? Councilwoman Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: James Somerville. James Somerville.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, James.

Mayor Ortega: Okay, no additional.

[Time: 01:15:20]

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, Human Services Advisory Commission. The Human Services Advisory Commission provides advisory recommendations to staff and the City Council on human services priorities and programs, and funding allocations for Scottsdale Cares, community development block grants, HOME, human services emergency and general funds. Roger Lurie's term expires in May. He is eligible for reappointment and has submitted his application. There is one vacancy and three applicants. And the applicants are Lee Cooley, Roger Lurie, and Ralph Da Costa Nunes. And we'll start with Councilmember Durham.

Councilmember Durham: Roger Lurie.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilmember Graham.

Councilmember Graham: Mr. Da Costa Nunes.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: And Councilwoman Caputi.

Councilwoman Caputi: Lee Cooley.

[Time: 01:16:24]

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, oh okay, this is a big one. The Library Board. Yeah, we are, and we can nominate all of them. All right, the Library Board advises the City Council on general policy relating to the programs, services, and future development of the Scottsdale public libraries. Janet, oh my gosh today's names are not doing me well, Smigielski's? Her term expires and she is ineligible for reappointment. Thank you, Janet, for your service. There is one vacancy and 21 applicants. And those applicants are Dawn Abel, Sue Bolduc, Suzanna Gutierrez Colby, Carrie Cox, Lula Dae, Tiffany Ellington, Jennifer Fabiano, Casidy Ferneding, Marcy Kostewa, Kathy Lane, Linda Leblang, Don McCormick, Vernon Noronha, Roselyn O'Connell, Dana Rakinic, Martha Rockwell, Janice Shimokubo, Alice Stambaugh, Grace Stombres, John Wanat, and Kimberly Winter. Okay, we're going to start with Councilmember Graham, and you have one opening there.

Councilmember Graham: Yeah, I don't think we can get them all actually. I will go with Miss Cox.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you. Councilwoman Caputi.

Councilwoman Caputi: Janice Shimokubo.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Janik.

Councilwoman Janik: Suzanna Colby.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Dawn Abel.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Mayor Ortega.

Mayor Ortega: Kathy Lane.

Rommel Cordova: Hold on just a second, you guys are going just a little too fast.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, let's go back to Councilwoman Janik. Is that where we're at?

Rommel Cordova: Councilwoman Janik, you had Miss Colby.

Councilwoman Janik: Correct.

Rommel Cordova: Councilwoman Littlefield?

Councilwoman Littlefield: Dawn Abel.

Rommel Cordova: Thank you. Mayor?

Mayor Ortega: Kathy Lane.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, so I'm going to go ahead and nominate Roselyn O'Connell.
Councilmember Durham?

Councilmember Durham: No additional.

[Time: 01:18:35]

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, thank you. The Lost Trust Board. There is currently one opening available on the Loss Trust Fund Board, however, we did not receive any applications for consideration. The current opening will be included in the next cycle of board and commission appointments. So, let's move on to the McDowell Sonoran Preserve Commission. The McDowell Sonoran Preserve Commission provides citizen oversight for acquisition, preservation, management and stewardship of the McDowell Mountain and related Sonoran Desert for the benefit of this and future generations. The terms for Kerry Olsson and Jeffrey Smith expire in May. Both are eligible for reappointment, however, only Kerry Olsson submitted an application for consideration. There are two vacancies and nine applicants. The applicants are Nicholas Hartmann, Pruitt Layton, Steven Lichtblau, Kerry Olsson, Michael Pomarico, Elizabeth Reich, Ryan Rybarczyk, Reid Scofield, and Kevin Walsh. And we'll start with Councilwoman Caputi.

Councilmember Caputi: Kerry Olsson and I'm not going to even bother trying but, Ryan R. I can't say that.

Councilwoman Janik: No additional.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Michael Pomarico.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, Mayor?

Mayor Ortega: No additional.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: No additional. Councilmember Graham.

Councilmember Graham: No additional.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Oh, Councilmember Durham.

Councilmember Durham: No additional.

[Time: 01:20:17]

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, I'm just going a little too fast. All right, Neighborhood Advisory Commission. The Neighborhood Advisory Commission advises and makes recommendations to the City Council on policies, plans, strategies, and programs for the preservation, improvement, and revitalization of Scottsdale's housing neighborhoods. Bridget Schwartz Manock's term expires in May. She is eligible for reappointment, and she has submitted an application for consideration. There is one vacancy and six applicants. And the applicants are Lawrence Beer, David Creed, Sandra Dunn, Katherine Erwin, Susan Rogge-Adyniec, and Bridget Schwartz-Manock. And we'll start with Councilwoman Janik.

Councilwoman Janik: Bridget Schwartz-Manock.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: No additional.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Mayor?

Mayor Ortega: No additional.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: No additional. Councilmember Durham.

Councilmember Durham: No additional.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilmember Graham.

Councilmember Graham: David Creed.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: And Councilwoman Caputi.

Councilwoman Caputi: No additional.

Councilmember Graham: Actually, can I withdraw that?

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Sure, withdrawn.

Councilmember Graham: Withdrawn. Rommel, I can withdraw that right? Sorry, Mr. Creed.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: That's okay, we'll get him next time.

Councilmember Graham: Yeah.

[Time: 01:21:29]

Vice Mayor Whitehead: All right, okay, Parks and Recreation Commission. The Parks and Recreation Commission advises the City Council on the acquisitions of lands and facilities for use as parks or recreation centers, and on the operation, use, care, and maintenance of these parks and recreation areas. Teresa Kim Quale's term expires in May. She is eligible for reappointment and has submitted an application for consideration. There is one vacancy and 16 applicants. The applicants are Jamie Alford, Sondra Barr, Frank Bertone, Riley Casey, Daniel Cheetham, Alison Ford, Tiffany House, Evan Judge, Heather Lynn Moos, Sukura McLawson, Kim Ollerhead, Nicole Pawenski, Teresa Kim Quale, Rob Scott, Dennis Soeffner, and George Weinbaum. And with that, we're going to start with Councilwoman Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Teresa Kim Quale.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Mayor?

Mayor Ortega: No additional.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: No additional, Councilmember Durham.

Councilmember Durham: No additional.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilmember Graham.

Councilmember Graham: Yes, I'd like to nominate Miss Alford.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: And Councilwoman Caputi.

Councilmember Caputi: No additional.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Littlefield, sorry, Janik.

Councilmember Janik: No additional.

[Time: 01:23:01]

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay. The Planning Commission. The Planning Commission holds public meetings and makes recommendations to the City Council on all matters relating to the creation of zoning districts, the enforcement of zoning regulations, amendments to all zoning ordinances and any other planning and zoning use. Terms for Barney Gonzales and Christian Serena expire in May. Barney Gonzales is eligible for reappointment and has submitted an application for consideration. Christian Serena is ineligible for reappointment. There are two vacancies and nine applicants. The applicants are Doug Craig, Barney Gonzales, Jon Griffin, Ryan Hilbun, Pamela Iacovo, Michal Ann Joyner, Cindy Person, Jay Rawson, and Larry Robinson, Jr. And we're going to start with the Mayor.

Mayor Ortega: Barney Gonzales, yes, and Michal Joyner.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Thank you, Mayor, Pamela Iacovo and no additional.

Councilmember Durham: Two? Doug Craig and no additional.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilmember Graham.

Councilmember Graham: No additional. Thank you, Barney, for your service. I was going to nominate you, but you're already nominated.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Okay, Councilwoman Caputi.

Councilmember Caputi: I have no additional.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Janik.

Councilmember Janik: No additional.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Councilwoman Littlefield.

Councilmember Littlefield: No additional.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: All right. And this concludes our nomination process this evening. Individuals nominated will be contacted by city staff with additional information. I would like to take this opportunity to sincerely thank all who applied to serve on a citizen advisory board or commission. Even if you were not nominated, your application will remain on file for one year for consideration at a future date if there are additional vacancies. So, with that, I'm turning back to the Mayor, and thank you.

ADJOURNMENT

[Time: 01:25:11]

Mayor Ortega: I move we adjourn. Do I hear a second?

Councilmember Graham: Second.

Mayor Ortega: Please record your vote.

Councilmember Graham: That was very efficient.

Councilmember Durham: Yeah, you were fast.

Councilmember Graham: That was your last one.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Oh, is it?

Councilmember Durham: Yeah.

Mayor Ortega: Thank you, we are adjourned.