
This document was created from the closed caption transcript of the October 2, 2018 City Council Regular Meeting and **has not been checked for completeness or accuracy of content.**

A copy of the agenda for this meeting, including a summary of the action taken on each agenda item, is available online at:

<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/Assets/ScottsdaleAZ/Council/current-agendas-minutes/2018-agendas/100218RegularAgenda.pdf>

An unedited digital video recording of the meeting, which can be used in conjunction with the transcript, is available online at:

<http://www.Scottsdaleaz.gov/Scottsdale-video-network/Council-video-archives/2018-archives>

For ease of reference, included throughout the transcript are bracketed "time stamps" [Time: 00:00:00] that correspond to digital video recording time.

For more information about this transcript, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 480-312-2411.

CALL TO ORDER

[Time: 00:00:08]

Mayor Lane: So this is a very order and disciplined crowd. It's undoubtedly with your leadership here. Thank you. Well, in any case, I would like to welcome you all to our October 2nd Regular Meeting, Regular Council Meeting. It's approximately 5:00. I would like to call this meeting to order.

ROLL CALL

[Time: 00:00:17]

Mayor Lane: I will start with a roll call, please.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Mayor Jim Lane.

Mayor Lane: Present.

Carolyn Jagger: Vice Mayor Guy Phillips.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: Councilmembers Suzanne Klapp.

Councilmember Klapp: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: Virginia Korte.

Councilwoman Korte: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: Kathy Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: Linda Milhaven.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: David Smith.

Councilman Smith: Present.

Carolyn Jagger: City Manager Jim Thompson.

Jim Thompson: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: City Attorney Bruce Washburn.

Bruce Washburn: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: City Treasurer Jeff Nichols.

Jeff Nichols: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: City Auditor Sharron Walker.

Sharron Walker: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: And the Clerk is present.

[Time: 00:00:39]

Mayor Lane: Thank you. A couple of items of business we have. We have anyone who would like to speak on any of the, for Public Comment or any of the agenda items, that's the white card being held up over the head of our city clerk there. And if you would like to give us some written

comments on any of the agenda items that's the yellow card that she's holding over her head. We will read them through the course of the proceedings. We have Scottsdale police officers Jason Glenn and Dustin Patrick are here to assist. They are straight here in front of me on the mezzanine there. They are here if you have need of their assistance. In the areas around the Council dais I ask that they are reserved for staff and Council only, but we do have facilities over here on my left-hand side. The restrooms are under the exit sign right there.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

[Time: 00:01:40]

Mayor Lane: Today we have Troop 454 with co-leaders Jane and Heather, yes, they are still back there. If you come up to the microphone and if you are able, please stand for the Pledge of Allegiance. And lead us in the pledge.

Troop 454: I pledge allegiance to the flag of the United States of America, and to the Republic for which it stands: One nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and justice for all. Red, white, blue, we love you!

Mayor Lane: Very good, ladies. If you would, please, just turn that microphone around. You have done so and just introduce yourself and tell us what school you go to and what your favorite subject.

My name is Caitlin. I go, I'm in fourth grade. I go to Noah Webster. My favorite subject is science and math. My name is Kali. I go to Pueblo elementary school and I like soccer and math. My name is Allie, I'm in the fourth grade. I go to Pueblo elementary and I like soccer and reading. My name is Isabel, I'm in fourth grade. I go to Pueblo elementary and my favorite subject is reading and science. My name is Kali and I go to Pueblo elementary. I'm in fourth grade and I like science. My name is Alexa, and I go, I'm in fourth grade. I go to Pueblo elementary school and my favorite subject is math. Hi, my name is Izzy Finlay, I'm in fourth grade and I go to Polo elementary school and my favorite sport is soccer. Hi, my name is Luna Rivera. I'm in fourth grade. My school is Pueblo elementary and my favorite thing to do is gymnastics. Hi, my name is Ember Dowell, I go to Kiva elementary school and I like math and dance. Hello, my name is Maria Caruso. I go to Pueblo elementary school and I'm in fourth grade. My favorite subject is art. My name is Alyssa, and my favorite subject is, I mean, my grade is fourth grade, and my favorite subject is math. I'm Sophia Fisher and I'm in the fourth grade. I go to Pueblo elementary and I like reading and theater. Hi, I'm Dylan Saunders. I go to Pueblo elementary school and my favorite thing to do is soccer. I'm Addison. I go to k-8 and I'm in the fourth grade and I like to play kickball. I'm Alexandra Lagodis and I'm in fourth grade. I go to Pueblo elementary school and my favorite subject is science. My name is Mira Garcia. I'm in the fourth grade. I go to Pueblo elementary school and my favorite subject is art. My name is Haley Graziano, and I'm in fourth grade at Pueblo elementary school and my favorite subject is science, art, and reading. Hello, my name is Annabelle. I'm in fourth grade and I'm nine years old and my favorite subject is science. I'm Haley Berg. I go to Pueblo elementary and my favorite thing to do is play with my dog. My name is Zoey Phillips. My favorite activity is playing guitar.

Mayor Lane: Very nice, ladies. Thank you very much for being here with us.

INVOCATION

[Time: 00:05:55]

Mayor Lane: This afternoon, we have the invocation from Pastor David Joynt from the Valley Presbyterian Church.

Pastor David Joynt: Thank you. Let's take a moment to pray. We thank you for the love and the energy that the children from this Girl Scout troop have brought to us, and the inspiration. We pray for safety for those on our roads who are traveling. The roads made slick and dangerous because of the weather. We thank you for those in our city would respond to accidents and incidents, to fires and to floods, and we ask your blessing on the nonprofits and the churches and the temples who bring shelter. We have to thank you that the rain is rare here in this sunny state of ours. You provided for us ancestors who engineered canals to bring waters from the Rockies to make this desert bloom. We have to thank you for those who maintain them. We know without your grace, no human life is possible. No true human life and no civilization is sure. And so today we ask you for the gift of that grace, in the decisions and the deliberations and debates of today. Be present with your grace. We ask this in your name and all God's people said, Amen.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Pastor.

MAYOR'S REPORT

[Time: 00:07:16]

Mayor Lane: Thursday marks the beginning of the 50th anniversary of our City Hall. You will hear more about that. Next week, we will have a special celebration of the architect of this great building, Bennie Gonzales. So let's set the stage with this proclamation. We're talking about the very building we are standing in. Thank you, girls.

Proclamation reads whereas Bennie Gonzales, a native of Arizona, merged modernism with special attention to the unique conditions of the Sonoran desert, creating nearly 300 buildings; and whereas, in 1958, after post-graduate work at A.S.U. and becoming one of the first Mexican-Americans officially registered as an architect in Arizona, Bennie opened his office in Scottsdale; and whereas in, 1968, Bennie left an impactful and lasting mark on the city of Scottsdale through his design of City Hall and the Civic Center library. Inviting accessible buildings reflecting of the culture, and the climate, and were recognized for excellence in architecture and winners of three architects' awards; and whereas, Bennie went on to create many beautiful public buildings, public spaces, resorts, homes and commercial buildings that are still revered and his inspiring designs left a compelling legacy.

I Jim Lane, do hereby proclaim, October 11th, 2018 as Bennie Gonzales Day and Scottsdale and I invite

our entire community to celebrate his best work as unsurpassed desert architects with the charisma and the style that Scottsdale has become known for. Here it is. Bennie Gonzales!

PRESENTATIONS/INFORMATION UPDATES

[Time: 00:09:21]

Mayor Lane: And moving right along in the same direction we have a presentation to celebrate '68, that is the year 1968, and Kelly Corsette, our public affairs director and Joan Fudala, our community historian.

[Time: 00:09:40]

Public Affairs Director Kelly Corsette: Thank you, Mr. Mayor, and members of the City Council. As the Mayor indicated, the year 1968 wasn't just a Watershed moment for the U.S., it also launched the evolution of modern Scottsdale because that's the year that Scottsdale's City Hall and Civic Center opens that would grow to become the Civic Center Mall. We are hosting a series of events, programs, exhibitions and celebrations, much of which reflect the original community celebration that was held back in 1968. So in a few minutes, I will talk a little bit more about some of those and encourage you to attend, but first it's my honor to introduce Joan Fudala who will take us back 50 years into the evolution ever City Hall and the Civic Center library.

[Time: 00:10:34]

Joan Fudala: Thanks, Kelly, Mayor, and fellow citizens. Before the party starts, it's interesting to hear the back story to realize what it is that we are celebrating. It's like your birthday party when the parents dragged out the family album and reminded you what you looked like as a baby. This is what we looked like 50 years ago. It created the Civic Center between citizens and their city. So let's STEP back even further.

In 1964, Mayor Bill Clayton invited almost 400 residents to participate in the STEP Program, that's the Scottsdale Town Enrichment Program, and they were, their task was to draw up a wish list and then a way to accomplish the things that we needed most in the city, as far as infrastructure and amenities. There were seven committees that were formed and one of those committees focused on developing a Civic Center and this was from scratch, centrally located Civic Center.

Why did we really need a Civic Center? Well, believe me, you wouldn't have been happy 50 or more years ago when all the traveling you had to do in between old worn out buildings. After incorporation, the town Council either met in each other's homes or a few businesses and I'm told they had a few meetings in bars. Then fortunately, a year after incorporation, the rural fire company, Second Street and Brown, loaned the town a building in the fire station and we met there for city, for several years and we had two or three employees. So that was fine. When we got bigger, we moved into the Little Red Schoolhouse, and that became Town Hall from '55 to the early '60s. Well, once again, we outgrew that. And we split.

And we had the city staff and the second floor of the triangle building at Scottsdale Road and Indian School and then the City Council meetings were held in the city courtroom building, which was a new building, which was right next door to the Little Red Schoolhouse. So, again, a lot of traveling around if you were on the Council, city staff, or you were petitioning the city for something.

Same thing happened with the library. We started out in the back room of the farmer's bank in the '20s and then when the bank closed in the '30s, we didn't have a library for a while. Then thanks to some volunteers, in about 1955, we started the library again and the old Adobe house and when I say old, it dated back to 1897, and it was falling apart. I mean, crumbling! Fortunately then when the town hall moved out of the Little Red Schoolhouse, the library moved in. But that wasn't necessarily good news either, because the basement flooded when we had rain like on a day like today, and it was so small that half of the books had to stay in storage because there wasn't enough shelf space. So the STEP committee recommended that, that right off the bat, in January of 1965 that we get busy creating a Civic Center.

[Time: 00:14:12]

They got the city to commission an architect and 20 citizens along with the city, looked at 35 wonderful proposals and the leading candidate, as the Mayor mentioned earlier was Bennie Gonzales, Arizona architect extraordinaire and he had quite the project. He was supposed to build, design not only City Hall and the library but also the grounds around it, and a park-like setting about 14 acres. And also design all of the furnishings for the interiors. Well, that was fine and good in 1965 but how the heck will we pay for it? Well, from deciding that we were going to have a City Hall and a Civic Center library in January of '65, believe it or not, it was a bond issue already by September of '65.

Probably a little bit too quick because they really hadn't had a chance to tell everybody about why we needed a Civic Center. So unfortunately it was voted down the first try, but only by about 180 some votes. So with another year to communicate why we needed a Civic Center, the following September in September '66, voters approved by a two-to-one margin, \$2.4 million to build the Civic Center. This wasn't just for construction. This was also to acquire the land and this particular site was then a neighborhood, and so they had to buy parcels for this entire area from private homeowners.

Groundbreaking took place in September of 1968, and while the building was raised, the buildings, the library and the City Hall were raised from the ground, another citizen committee, an adjunct of the Fine Art Commission, went about getting renowned art pieces that would adorn the walls in both City Hall and the library. And I'm also happy to say, and I'm sorry that the Girl Scouts left because this was a wonderful drive among all the school children to collect coins for the youth fountain, which is just outside between here and One Civic Center and that was a wonderful effort as well.

It all culminated in the next week, when we had some things that were, oh, so 1960s. There was a paint in. There were concerts, including a folk concert featuring Dolan Ellis who will also be performing this year. We had fashion shows and on October 11th, 1968, Mayor Bud Tims and a band of mariachis, leads a procession of citizens from Valley Ho down Main Street and ended up here in City

Hall for a celebration of the new City Hall. Unfortunately, there were some delays in getting the carpeting installed at the library and so that didn't open until November 26th but, again, we relied on the youth of the town and the Boy Scouts and members of the DeMolay helped to move 100,000 books into the new library. Once again, don't we have great youth in Scottsdale. It wasn't all seriousness and it's not all about people.

There were a couple of animal stories. The first person to cause a controversy in the City Hall, was George Fretz the Planning Director, a fabulous guy. He was a hunter, he installed over in the Planning Department, over there, his favorite elk head. And as soon as that went up on the wall, the Fine Arts Commission had an emergency session and deemed from then on, there would be no objects taxidermy allowed in City Hall or the library. The other occurrence that involved animals happened a few years later when the Hash Knife Pony Express did a little diversion in their route from the Holbrooke to the Scottsdale post office. They rode their horses up the stairs to say hello to Herb Drinkwater. Of course one other animal pair, if you will, were Winnie and Pooh, the beloved swans who used to live in the pond outside.

We almost lost the Little Red Schoolhouse as we moved ahead into the City Hall and the library. Once the library moved out, they were scheduled to tear it down but one of the very first City Council meetings after we moved in, in the fall of 1968 was the presentation of citizen petitions organized by the brand-new Scottsdale Historical Society to save the Little Red Schoolhouse. As I end, I must say that little did Mayor Bud Tims know when he took occupancy of the Mayor's office in of course of 1968, that 50 years later, there would be a guy who was a senior at Seton hall prep in South Orange, New Jersey, that was just chomping at the bit to take his place. Anybody recognize that person there? And I'm allowed to say that because I'm the same age and I was in high school at the same time too. That's the back story. I hope you join us for the fun and the commemorations of what the citizens and the city of Scottsdale accomplished to create our wonderful Civic Center. Thank you.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Joan.

[Time: 00:20:33]

Kelly Corsette: Thanks, Joan. Mr. Mayor, members of the Council, I guess that wraps up our presentation. I would encourage everybody to visit Scottsdaleaz.gov and search Celebrate '68 to find the full menu of activities, which begin on Thursday when Joan hosts a panel called "Turning Point, How 1968 Shaped Scottsdale and its Residents" and we have a number of events that leads up to the big free family festival at City Hall on Main Street and Valley Ho on Saturday, October 13th. So search Celebrate '68 and join us for all the fun. Thank you.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Kelly. I appreciate that too. I look forward to the celebration.

PUBLIC COMMENT

[Time: 00:21:20]

Mayor Lane: Next order of business is our Public Comment. And Public Comment is reserved for citizen comments regarding non-agendized items with no official Council action taken on these items. Comments are limited to issues within the jurisdiction of the City Council. Speakers are limited to three minutes each, with a maximum of five speakers. There will be another opportunity for Public Comment at the end of the meeting. We have three requests to speak for Public Comment. We start with Pat Shaler.

[Time: 00:21:56]

Pat Shaler: Thank you, Mr. Mayor and members of Council. My name is Pat Shaler. My address is of record. In fact, it's written down on the citizens petition that's been presented to you. In celebrating 50 years, I want to tell you, I just returned from my 50th high school reunion. So 1968 was a banner year!

We are presenting a citizen's petition on gift clause violation. The basis foundation for this petition, which has been provided to the city clerk, is your approval of Resolution 11120, that you adopted on May 22nd of 2018. On that date, you approved sponsored team lane rental short course of \$3 per hour and sponsored team lane rental long course of \$5 per hour. We are going to present evidence to you that at that point in time, the city was well aware that there was a market rate of \$12 per hour. We believe that in signing that clause, you have undercut money that the city could otherwise benefit from.

I will also draw your attention to the citizens petition when you receive it, to the information that is provided on the back. There's some facts and figures and some additional information. Coach Joe Zemaitis will provide the details. I wanted to give you the personal touch. I have swam with coach Joe's master's program for 14 years. When I started, I could do a quarter, maybe a half a mile at 5:30 in the morning and I would leave by 6:00 or 6:15 and I worked my way up that with the leader of coach Joe, I swam Alcatraz and I did seven starts and have completed six swims. I got pulled out on one. I have swam a handful of times under the bridge, Golden Gate Bridge from the southwest corner to the northeast corner, up in Marin County.

There are several of us in Joe's program. We were swimming at the JCC. He was unable to keep his team there because they wanted to start their own team. So those of us who are able to are driving 30 miles to Moon Valley Country Club. Should we be able, as an adjunct of the swim club to return to Scottsdale, I know that our numbers will probably triple. But 10, 15 years ago, Joe started swim Neptune from scratch. About three or four years later, a young 7-year-old boy approached Joe and said he wanted to be the youngest person to swim Alcatraz to the marine bay there. After about seven or eight months of hard work, that hit national news. Braxton swam that. The rest of Joe's kids at that time said, hey, Joe, coach Joe, we want to do it too.

As a result, for about ten years now, Joe has led a group of roughly 100 swimmers, I think some have joined us from Southern California and we spend two days over in the San Francisco Bay, exceeding our limitations. This is the kind of motivator he is. This is the kind of enthusiasm that he brings and I have seen him work with his kids. The goal, is it really three minutes? The goal of all of us is that

every child in Scottsdale have access to an affordable swim program. If we have room for 20 sports teams to work in our parks, we certainly, and play, we certainly have room for more than one swim club to practice in the city of Scottsdale. The numbers were presented to you. There was a letter delivered to City Hall for each of you. I have emailed that letter to some of you.

The rest of you didn't get it because of my impaired email abilities. And we respectfully request that you approve a motion to direct the city manager to meet with Neptune swimming foundation, investigate the issues brought to light in the citizens petition, and prepare a written response to the Council with a copy of the petition and then hopefully we can see more of new master's group.

Mayor Lane: I did let you go on for quite a bit longer. That's my own slip up. But in any case, that's quite all right. I should have called it to an end a little earlier. Next is Joe Zemaitis. Is that it? Sorry, Joe. Help me out with that. You need to say it for me.

[Time: 00:27:29]

Joe Zemaitis: Sure. It's Joe Zemaitis and my address is 13825 North 56th Street in Scottsdale. So our swim club has been trying to work with the city of Scottsdale for nearly a decade now to share use of the aquatics facilities. My family moved to Scottsdale when I was 10 and this has been home ever since. I personally coached hundreds of Scottsdale residents, including Pat in our master's program but hundreds of kids age 5 to 18, to help them achieve greatness in the sport of swimming and love it. And we currently have nearly 100 Scottsdale residents on our team. There were 20 teams that share use of the Scottsdale sports fields but only one competitive youth sports team has ever been permitted access to the city's four aquatic centers.

Over a year ago, an attorney reached out to the city on our behalf, to raise the issue of the gift clause. The city's essentially been providing a subsidy, both monetary and availability means to a private organization, to the exclusion ever all other users. At a rate that's currently 25% of what our team bid. In a response over a year ago, Mr. Washburn said this would be resolved by doing an RFP and that our organization would not be discriminated against for bringing the issue forward. When the RFP was released, our bid was \$285,000 more per year than the other bid. Over the life of the contract, this represents approximately \$1.2 million or about \$1,000 per day of practice. Despite this, our club charges Scottsdale swim families approximately 20% less in dues than they are currently paying.

The city initially considered the other claim had won the RFP when a mathematical error attributed pricing was acknowledged by the city, the valuation committee scored our bid the highest. Rather than award us the contract, they canceled the RFP, and the gift clause question unresolved. All I'm asking for is for fairness and transparency in the process. I requested that Council act on the citizen's petition that will be presented and approve and so we can find a fair and equitable arrangement that will benefit the swimmers, the citizens and the taxpayers of Scottsdale. This has been a complicated and convoluted process with a lot of moving pieces. I'm not asking for you to come down on the side of one group or another, simply to get more information from staff to address the possible conflicts with the current procedure and the gift clause of the Arizona constitution and Scottsdale's city charter.

Thank you.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Mr. Zemaitis. And last is George Cavalliere.

[Time: 00:30:42]

George Cavalliere: Hi, I'm George Cavalliere from the Cavalliere Blacksmith Shop. I was standing up here a few months ago, complaining about a builder next to us leaving asbestos everywhere. I tried to get some city people to come and look. Nobody has been there. The only people that came was asbestos abatement company that I paid for and they did come up with a positive test. During the construction Taylor Morrison, who bought property from us and tore down old buildings with the asbestos, and built right next to us, during the construction they tore my electric out and promised to pay for it. They never did. The sewer they tore out, never fixed that.

They tore over 200 feet of fence down on the front of my property, way away from where they were working because it was chain link and when they pulled, it pulled the whole fence out, 200 feet of that. They don't fix. That I have been trying to get some kind of help with this, and I don't see that it's happening. I have been held up on building a restaurant that would help my family and our block down in Scottsdale because the blacksmith shop does not make money. We need to have other businesses in there making money so the blacksmith shop can stay there.

The last thing in the world I want to do is move the shop, but it's the only way I can sell the property. I have to sell the property now because I don't trust I can open a business in Scottsdale anymore. I see how corrupt it is. And, you know, it's the last thing I wanted to do was move this old family business and, you know, I finally got a place to move it. It doesn't look like anybody in Scottsdale cares about it anymore or our family. My grandfather was the 17th citizen and this is how we are treated. This company with all of this money is coming in and taking heritage and your blacksmith shop, you know? It's the last thing I want to do. I don't want to leave Scottsdale. I want to work in that shop.

You know, I will keep it open and for the demonstrations that I do for the city, and then after that, I will go. But I guess that's what everybody wants. I have had almost nobody even call me or come ask me what can be done. I went on the city website and it said, if I go get a demolition permit which I'm doing and I hate that, then the city is supposed to help me try to find funding.

It says that right on the website, but when I went to the city to, and asked, you know, how do I get started to try to find funding? What can we do? You know? I guess I want to do something right away, but nobody calls me or, so, you know, I told the chief of police a while back, that I wouldn't bother him again. He's come up to my house and walked the wash the way you did, Mayor. And it's just, I don't know what you guys plan on me to do when they did that to us. Was I supposed to lay down and take it.

Mayor Lane: George, I'm sorry the time has expired. We will certainly.... I didn't mean it that way.

George Cavalliere: I won't bother you again. I just take my stuff from Scottsdale and I will leave.

Mayor Lane: Mr. Cavalliere, in case you are interested we will, and this is not a dialogue, but we will have someone contact you. We will try to this time. That completes the Public Comments.

MINUTES

[Time: 00:35:38]

Mayor Lane: And now we move to the approval of the Special Meeting Minutes of September 11th, 2018, or Regular Meeting Minutes of September 11th, 2018. I ask for a motion to approve these minutes.

Vice Mayor Phillips: So moved.

Councilmember Korte: Second.

Mayor Lane: The motion has been made by the Vice Mayor. The Vice Mayor and seconded by Councilwoman Korte. Then we are ready to vote. All those in favor please indicate by aye, those opposed with a nay. Aye. Minutes are accepted. Thank you very much.

CONSENT AGENDA

[Time: 00:36:20]

Mayor Lane: Moving on to Consent items, 1 through 7. I have no requests from the public for, or notes items 1 through 7, unless there are requests from the Council, I would ask for a motion to approve the Consent items 1 through 7.

Councilmember Korte: Mayor, I would like to make a motion to approve Consent Agenda items 1 through 7.

Councilmember Littlefield: Second.

Mayor Lane: The motion has been made by Councilwoman Korte and seconded by Councilwoman Littlefield. All of those in favor of Consent items 1 through 7, please indicate by aye and register your vote. And nay if you oppose. Aye. A little slow on the button, Vice Mayor or, it's unanimous then on the Consent items 1 through 7.

REGULAR AGENDA

ITEM 8 - FOREST WATERSHEDS MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING

[Time: 00:37:20]

Mayor Lane: Moving on, we are on to the next item, and it is a Regular Agenda item number 8, and this is the forest Watershed memorandum of understanding and the presenter is Brian Biesemeyer, the Water Resources Director. Mr. Biesemeyer, welcome.

[Time: 00:37:31]

Water Resources Director Brian Biesemeyer: Thank you. I'm here to talk about the Forest Watershed Health Initiative through Northern Arizona Forest Fund that the city participates in. As you recall three years ago, Council approved this initiative, and I'm here today for three reasons. First to kind of report to you about the initiative, about the program and how it works, update you on our investment in the projects and then finally ask for approval to extend this program for another three years.

The Salt River Project Watershed includes the Verde and Salt Rivers and it involves our water supplies and roughly it is the, the Salt River project is the second largest surface water supplier and we get 25% of our water from the Salt River Project. The Salt River Project Watershed, again is the Verde and the Salt Rivers and it includes four forests, those are the Tonto, Kaibab, Apache-Sitgreaves and I knew I would leave one out. And that would be the Coconino. The problem we have is really unhealthy forest. And the picture at the left is the decades old picture where you can see a healthy forest, with a lot of space in between the trees and little undergrowth under there.

In those situations, when fire occurs, which is natural for our forest area, the fire can spread underneath the trees, burn through and leave the trees undamaged. The Ponderosa pine has evolved in these extreme conditions and thrives when the undergrowth is, is, as you see a healthy forest. On the right is a more recent picture in which you can see an unhealthy forest. It doesn't look that way. It looks nice and green. The issue is the undergrowth and when a fire strikes in that area, the undergrowth is so thick and the trees are so close together that the fire reaches the canopy and destroyed everything in its path.

Since 2002, we have lost over 2 million-acre of our forest in the four forest areas to wildfires. The impact is not only to the burned areas but to Scottsdale itself. Erosion occurs as a result of the wildfires, creating a lot ever sediment and silt and fire debris that ends up in the Watershed and ultimately in the canals and ultimately we need to treat that water to provide to our citizens. You can see in the bottom right of the picture is under the list of turbidity are three samples of water taken from the Verde River. The far left one is what normally occurs and the two right ones are after a fire event in the Verde River.

Turbidity is a measure of how basically how much debris and sediment in is in the water and you can see the extreme amounts of sediment from. What it translates to us is higher costs. So we have higher costs to treat the water. One impact is increased carbon loading, carbon from the soot that is remaining after a forest fire. We have to treat that. As we treat that, we create a disinfection byproduct which is formed in combination with the carbon. And we employ more capital to take out

that sediments that are seen in the water and the sediments cause us to replace our equipment at much higher rates.

We believe our partnership has been a success with Northern, with the National Forest Foundation. We participate with four other cities and a number of industrial partners to combine our funds to help create healthy forest. Now, no single, forests are huge, no single initiative is going to comprise it. Everything that the forest needs, but this is a healthy start. It works through funding restoration projects, again in the Salt and the Verde Rivers. The three areas for our fire risk reduction which is forest thinning and water replenishment and those projects help us get more water from the Watershed because we restore the natural Watershed area, the actual runoff is shown to be increased by these restorative projects. And then reduced erosion and sediment which I mentioned earlier, which are significant cost to us. The projects through 2016 through 2018 that we started are listed there. And I would like to ask Rebecca Davidson who is the director of the Southern Rockies field Program to come forward and given a more detailed presentation on each of these projects and how they have worked so far. Rebecca?

[Time: 00:43:17]

National Forest Foundation's Rebecca Davidson: Thank you. I really am excited to be here tonight Mr. Mayor and Councilmembers. Before I start, I also just wanted to say how grateful the National Forest Foundation is for the partnership with the city of Scottsdale. Your support for our landscape efforts really help amplify the scope and the scale of the Watershed improvement we can do across all forests and we are adding another forest as well and that the Prescott national forest.

So the projects I'm talking to you about tonight are the ones that Mr. Biesemeyer mentioned that Scottsdale has specifically helped support and again amplify efforts around. Oops. So the first project, I will try not to have the echo. The first project I want to talk to you today about is on the Salt River Watershed. It's the Sierra Ancha trails are erosion control. It's located on the Tonto National Forest, northeast of Roosevelt Lake. And so the drainage areas in this project go right into the Salt River as well as directly into Roosevelt Lake.

In 2016, in this wilderness, the Sierra Ancha, had the Juniper fire. It burned about 30,000 acres across this landscape and the results of that were as Brian mentioned earlier, eradication of much of the vegetation. And so now when it rains, the downstream effects are erosion and sedimentation directly into the Salt and into Roosevelt Lakes. So the trail system in this area ends up acting as a conduit for that sediment. And so we are working on about 46 miles of trail to help improve the drainage and the runoff every time it rains to remove the sediment and minimize the impacts to the Salt River project. We completed about 16 miles this year and have a little more work to do this year.

We haven't measured the benefits of this work yet because we are sort of mid-project, but on a similar project also on the Salt, also on West Pinto Creek, we estimate that we reduce sediment into the Salt River by 17 tons annually. We expect to see similar results from this project but again, we will do those estimates and we will get some on-the-ground measurement next year when the project is complete. Okay.

So the next project I want to talk about is the Oak Creek erosion control project. It is near Sedona in the Coconino National Forest and this is a highly used and well-loved road called Schnebly Hill? So it's an amazing place and this road, if you have traveled it recently, is a pretty hard-core Jeep trail. But used to be able to drive this road from Flagstaff to Sedona in a two-wheel drive vehicle. It's eroded away over time and similar to the trail project this road acts as a conduit for sediment every time it rains and it flows directly into Oak Creek. And so the work we did here was on a six-mile stretch of the road to benefit the drainage system, and minimize the erosion. And we estimate here that we have reduced sedimentation into Oak Creek by an estimated 14 tons annually.

We're really excited about this project as well because it represents a pretty complex set of issues that we were able to work together as a team with the forest service, a local contractor who helped resolve some design issues for us, and we also worked with CenturyLink because they had did, they have a buried cable optic line that runs the length of the road and we had to be very careful when we were doing the roadwork, not to impact that line. So in partnership, this project represents a win/win across the board for so many different purposes and benefits.

[Time: 00:48:04]

So this next project was Red Flats Restoration. And this is on the Verde, on the Prescott National Forest. It's about 10 miles northwest of Cottonwood, Arizona. And this project represents an important revegetation effort based on some significant impacts from erosion and juniper tree encroachment into the meadow area, really impacting the way that the meadow is supposed to function hydrologically. So what we did here is address a number of Watershed issues, starting with the juniper tree encroachment issues. We received trees on approximately 100 acres. We treated a number of noxious weed and invasive plants and we implemented erosion control measures and gully stabilization activities that ultimately reduced the soil and sediment movement directly into the Verde River. And so this is one of those projects where we can get the work done relatively quickly, but we don't quite understand the benefits for several years to come. So we are watching what happens in this meadow.

Now we are doing some monitoring but the idea here is that as we see native vegetation returning to the area, this will be a proxy. It will help us understand how that meadow is functioning and really an indicator of water replenishment and storage in the system. So the last set of projects that I want to talk about today are at the very upper portion of the Verde Watershed. This is on the Bill Williams mountain, and these projects represent the forest thinning work that we're also looking at in the upper part of the forests across the Salt and Verde Watersheds. So we have been working in this area. It is a very overstocked forest. It's very thick and super, super at risk for catastrophic fire events. And subsequently post fire flooding, largely in the monsoon time period.

What we're, what we have seen in predictive studies is that if this mountain burns and then floods, the town of Williams will be directly impacted. And so the flooding is predicted to move right into the town of Williams, into the center part of the town, impacting houses and businesses as well as directly the surface water reservoirs that they depend on. And so in addition to the Watershed benefits of

this work, we're also looking at partnered efforts with the town as well as with Coconino County.

And so in 2017, we have completed work in Upper Hell Canyon and that was largely mechanical treatment with some hand thinning. And this year we are working to complete several hundred acres of thinning in twin springs and that represents hand thinning. So where we do hand thinning, it's really areas that are very hard to reach and requires a little bit more effort. So steep sloped thinning that mechanical equipment can't get to, as well as where there's restrictions from wildlife. So, for instance, Mexican Spotted Owl and Northern Grass Hawk. And we are trying to leverage efforts across the landscape by addressing projects that couldn't otherwise be funded through, for instance, commercial thinning operations. So we're paying for the hard-to-reach, hard-to-access more expensive acres and opening up a pathway for timber operators to come in and do the work on the flatter ground. So I will hand it back over to Brian. Thanks.

[Time: 00:52:14]

Brian Biesemeyer: So in summary, we believe the direct benefits of being proactive in this helped the city, help the forest and ultimately are a gain for everybody involved it. Lowers our treatment cost and the reliability of our water supply and minimizes the risk of the additional cost that we encounter. And with that, pending your questions, that concludes my briefing and my final ask, I will get it out here, is for approval for another three years at \$50,000 per year.

Mayor Lane: Understand. Thank you, Mr. Biesemeyer. Thank you, Rebecca, as well. Yes, we have some questions, starting with Vice Mayor Phillips.

Vice Mayor Phillips: I have no questions. I think this is a no brainer. I ask that we adopt Resolution 11239.

Councilmember Littlefield: Second.

Mayor Lane: The motion has been made and second. The motion was made by Vice Mayor and seconded by Councilwoman Littlefield. Would you like to speak toward it?

Councilmember Littlefield: No thank you, Mayor.

Mayor Lane: Councilmember Korte, would you like to speak?

Councilmember Korte: Thank you, Mayor. Northern Arizona Fund, what is that? Is that a nonprofit? Is that a collaborative group? Is it a formal organization?

Brian Biesemeyer: It's a fund specifically set up by the National Forest Foundation as a separate fund to provide this work. I can let Rebecca answer it in more specifics.

Rebecca Davidson: That's correct, it's a little confusing because the National Forest Foundation is the congressionally chartered nonprofit, the official partner to the U.S. Forest Service. And so that's the

entity that I work for. The Northern Arizona Forest Fund is really the program of work in which we administer a set of funds that we collect from our partners and then we implement projects on the ground specifically for Watershed restoration across the salt and the Verde River Watersheds. And so the Fund is the program of work and as the National Forest Foundation, we administer that fund.

Councilmember Korte: Thank you.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Councilwoman. Councilman Smith.

Councilman Smith: How many years have we been participating in this program.

Brian Biesemeyer: Since 2016, three years.

Councilman Smith: Has our contribution always been at the same level.

Brian Biesemeyer: It started out at \$120,000, and this is just continuing \$50,000 for three years.

Councilman Smith: Is the, I guess maybe this is, how is our number determined versus other cities or whatever?

Brian Biesemeyer: Our number was initially determined what we thought we could contribute initially, as well as the size of contributions from other cities and like cities, initially Phoenix started out with \$200,000. Ours was \$50,000. And it was something we could, it fit into the budget, worked with the Northern Arizona Forest Fund to feel like we were contributing but obviously it's, you know, it's a budgetary constraint.

Councilman Smith: It certainly sounds like a worthwhile program that we will embrace the benefits from. I endorse the program and I will support this for sure. Thank you.

[Time: 00:55:56]

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Councilman. Let me just say that we obviously have been doing this for three years. This is extension of another three years on a similar program. It is vitally important. And I think we have seen the benefit of it in the safety of our forest and the quality of our runoff as things have improved. Bit by bit, but everyone STEP and participation by cities like ourselves and city of Glendale and Peoria and Mesa and Phoenix, have been essential in getting this work off the ground and funded and it is our Watershed and it is the Watershed areas. It's their communities as well.

There are things that have been translated to the betterment of our forest as well just from the standpoint of these wildfires can actually get so intense as to glassify the soil and neutralize the soil. And so all of this is a very important measure. This is more on our federal lands and other actions being taken place by other agencies and we may or may not participate in, but nevertheless, to take care of the some of the private and state lands that are equally important in this effort. It's been a long time in coming, but I think we all understand and agree that it is vitally important that we take

care of our forests, not only for our water supply but also from the standpoint of just our overall environment.

So this is, I think, a great effort and as Brian mentioned it is a matter of budget, but we also strongly considered the fact that there is a mitigation of costs that we would incur if we did not take these actions and either the reduction of water availability but most assuredly the quality of it. And if you don't know, and I frankly don't have the exact numbers but it literally costs us millions of additional dollars in order to try to work this water through that has been polluted with fire debris and carbon elements. So it's a major, I have to say, it's a small price to pay for some of the offsetting benefits that we would have and we hope to see as we continue the program but thank you very much, Brian and Rebecca for your work in the area and certainly I support the measure as well, strongly. And with that, I would, oh, we have, yes, we have a motion and a second. We are then ready to vote. All of those in favor, please indicate by aye. Aye. It's unanimous then. So we have completed our Regular Agenda items. Excuse me. We have no, I have no Public Comments. No additional Public Comments.

CITIZEN PETITIONS

[Time: 00:58:49]

Mayor Lane: We do have the citizen petition that was presented by Pat Shaler earlier. So I would ask if there's a motion to take action and ask the city manager to take action and report back to us.

Councilwoman Klapp: I will be happy to make a motion. I move that we defer this item for the city manager and have him bring back a report to the City Council.

Councilmember Littlefield: I will second that.

Mayor Lane: The motion has been made by Councilwoman Klapp and seconded by Councilwoman Littlefield. There is not really a discussion on this but Councilman Smith, do you have.....

Councilman Smith: Thank you, Mayor. If I may, I would like to make maybe an alternate motion and this is to direct the City Manager to agendaize the petition for further discussion.

Mayor Lane: Okay. That's an alternate motion. Motion fails for lack of a second. We can go back to the original motion. I think we are now ready to vote on that. So all of those in favor please indicate by aye. Those opposed with a nay. Aye. The motion is unanimous. So it will be as directed. The City Manager acknowledged that direction. All right.

MAYOR AND COUNCIL

ITEM 10 - BOARDS, COMMISSIONS AND TASK FORCE NOMINATIONS

[Time: 01:00:23]

Mayor Lane: And next order of business is we have, Item 10 is our Boards, Commissions and Task Force Nominations. So this is just simply for the nominations and so for that purpose, I will turn it over to the Vice Mayor. Vice Mayor?

[Time: 01:00:41]

Vice Mayor Phillips: Thank you, Mayor. Okay. This evening, the City Council will be nominating Scottsdale residents interested in serving on citizen advisory boards and commissions. The seven boards and commissions with current vacancies include Building Advisory Board of Appeals, Environmental Quality Advisory Board, Human Services Commission, Loss Trust Fund Board, McDowell Sonoran Preserve Commission, Parks and Recreation Commission, and the Paths & Trails Subcommittee. The Scottsdale City Council is responsible for establishing City policies and enacting laws in support of those policies. The Council relies on volunteer, citizen-based boards and commissions to research issues and make recommendations in support of the Council's mission and goals. The information and recommendations provided by Council-appointed advisory boards is a valuable tool in helping Councilmembers in their deliberations. Individuals nominated will be interviewed at a Special City Council meeting on Tuesday, October 16th, with appointments following each set of interviews. So let's get started. Okay.

BUILDING ADVISORY BOARD OF APPEALS

[Time: 01:01:49]

Vice Mayor Phillips: I believe the first one is the Building Advisory Board of Appeals. There's one opening. The Building Advisory Board of Appeals has the jurisdiction to recommend that minor variances in the electrical, plumbing and mechanical application of the Building Code be granted and that alternative construction methods or materials be allowed. Ed Peaser's term expired on September 21, 2018. He is eligible for reappointment and has submitted an application for consideration. There is one vacancy and one applicant. The applicant is Ed Peaser. I will now entertain nominations for the Building Advisory Board of Appeals. Starting with myself, I will nominate Ed Peaser. Okay.

ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ADVISORY BOARD

[Time: 01:02:33]

Vice Mayor Phillips: Moving onto the Environmental Quality Advisory Board. There's two openings. The Environmental Quality Advisory Board provides guidance on the prioritization of future environmental activities and recommends environmental policies to the City Council. There are special qualifications as specified in the Scottsdale city code. The membership of the Board shall reflect both scientific and non-scientific interests. Dane Englert's term expires on October 13, 2018, and is eligible for reappointment but did not submit an application. Steve Schlosser's term expired on September 21. He is eligible for reappointment and submitted an application for consideration.

There are two vacancies and six applicants. The applicants are David Abranovic, Walter Cuculic, Stephanie Foote, Jann-Michael Greenburg, Steven Schlosser, Adam Wasserman. I will now entertain nominations for the Environmental Quality Advisory Board. Each Councilmember can nominate two applicants. So we'll start with Councilmember Smith.

Councilman Smith: I nominate Steve Schlosser and David Abranovic.

Councilmember Korte: Stephanie Foote and Jann-Michael Greenburg.

Mayor Lane: David Abranovic and Stephanie Foote.

Councilwoman Klapp: Walter Cuculic and Adam Wasserman.

Councilmember Milhaven: No additional.

Vice Mayor Phillips: That's everybody, right?

Councilmember Littlefield: Abranovic and Schlosser.

Vice Mayor Phillips: So I believe everybody has been nominated? Is it an issue? Issue? No, just some phone ringing, I guess.

HUMAN SERVICES COMMISSION

[Time: 01:04:32]

Vice Mayor Phillips: Human Services Commission. The Human Services Commission provides advisory recommendations to staff and the City Council on Human Services priorities and programs. Marty Day's term expired September 21, 2018. She is not eligible for reappointment. There is one vacancy and five applicants. The applicants are Ashley Blaine, Kana Chinasamy, Victoria Kauzlarich, Patricia Nightingale, Julie Ochser. I will now entertain nominations for the Human Services Commission. Each Councilmember can nominate one applicant and we start with Councilwoman Korte.

Councilmember Korte: Ashley Blaine.

Mayor Lane: Patricia Nightingale.

Councilwoman Klapp: Kana Chinasamy.

Councilmember Milhaven: No additional.

Councilmember Littlefield: No additional.

Vice Mayor Phillips: I have no additional.

Councilman Smith: No additional.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Okay. Thank you. Moving on.

LOSS TRUST FUND BOARD

[Time: 01:05:26]

Vice Mayor Phillips: Loss Trust Fund Board. There's one opening. The Loss Trust Fund Board is responsible for recommendations to the City Council regarding the administration of the Loss Trust Fund. We currently have no applications on file. So we'll move on to the next board.

MCDOWELL SONORAN PRESERVE COMMISSION

[Time: 01:05:43]

Vice Mayor Phillips: The next board is the McDowell Sonoran Preserve Commission. The McDowell Sonoran Preserve Commission provides citizen oversight for acquisition, preservation, management and stewardship of the McDowell Mountain and related Sonoran Desert for the benefit of this and future generations. Cynthia Wenstrom's term expires on October 17, 2018. She is eligible for reappointment and has submitted an application for consideration. There is one vacancy and 12 applicants. The applicants are Ann Adams, Joseph Blankenship, James Bloch, Alisse Caton, Debra Doss, Mark Hackbarth, Michael Mayer, Laura McFarland, Constance Moll, Andrea Davis, Brian Munson, Cynthia Wenstrom. I will now entertain nominations for the McDowell Sonoran Preserve Commission. Each Councilmember can nominate one applicant. I start with the Mayor.

Mayor Lane: Mark Hackbarth.

Councilwoman Klapp: Cynthia Wenstrom.

Councilmember Milhaven: Andrea Davis.

Councilmember Littlefield: James Bloch.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Okay. I have Debra Doss.

Councilman Smith: No further.

Councilmember Korte: Constance Moll.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Thank you.

PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION

[Time: 01:07:03]

Vice Mayor Phillips: Next is Parks and Recreation Commission. There's one opening. The Parks and Recreation Commission advises the City Council on the operation, use, care and maintenance of parks and recreation areas. Virginia Harris' term expired on September 21, and is not eligible for reappointment. There are one vacancy and three applicants. The applicants are Alexandra Albert, Brianna Olmos, Victor Zafra. I will now entertain nominations for the Parks and Recreation Commission. Each Councilmember can nominate one applicant. Starting with Councilmember Klapp.

Councilwoman Klapp: Alexandra Albert.

Councilmember Milhaven: No additional.

Councilmember Littlefield: Victor Zafra.

Vice Mayor Phillips: And I have no additional.

Councilman Smith: No additional.

Councilmember Korte: No additional.

Mayor Lane: Brianna Olmos.

PATHS AND TRAILS SUBCOMMITTEE

[Time: 01:08:10]

Vice Mayor Phillips: Thank you. Next is the Paths and Trails Subcommittee. There's one opening. The Paths & Trails Subcommittee advises the Transportation Commission and provides a public forum for issues surrounding paths and trails. **SPECIAL QUALIFICATIONS:** The subcommittee shall consist of five members: Two Transportation Commissioners, one Parks and Recreation Commissioner, and two non-commission members. Non-commission members are appointed by the City Council for terms of three years with a maximum of two terms. Jenna Warner resigned on August 16. She represented a Non-Commission member position. There is one vacancy and 11 applicants. The applicants are Jeff Andreasen, Candice Carroll, Kyle Davis, Ryan Dick, Justin Driscoll, Gretchen Evans, Sierra Fung, Jeff Ittel, Nicholas Mazur, Kelli Moss, Peggy Young, I will now entertain nominations for the Pas and trails subcommittee. Each Councilmember with nominate one member. Starting with Councilwoman Milhaven.

Councilmember Milhaven: Peggy Young.

Councilmember Littlefield: Kyle Davis.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Okay, I will have Justice Driscoll.

Councilman Smith: Candice Carroll.

Councilmember Korte: No additional.

Mayor Lane: Ryan Dick.

Councilwoman Klapp: Gretchen Evans.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Okay. Thank you. This concludes our nomination process. City staff will contact those who were nominated and provide them with additional information about the interview process. I would like to take this opportunity to sincerely thank all who applied to serve on a citizen advisory board or commission. Even if you were not nominated, your application will remain on file for one year for consideration at a future date, if there are additional vacancies. Thank you very much. And we turn it back over to the Mayor.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Vice Mayor. Good meeting. With that, it completes our business for this evening. I would like to thank everyone who participated here, and the Council for their participation as well. Thanks, everyone. Have a nice evening.

ADJOURNMENT

[Time: 01:10:07]

Mayor Lane: Oh, we are adjourned.

Councilwoman Klapp: I make a motion to adjourn.

Councilmember Korte: Second.