This document was created from the closed caption transcript of the February 12, 2013 Council Meeting and <u>has not been checked for completeness or accuracy of content</u>.

A copy of the agenda for this meeting, including a summary of the action taken on each agenda item, is available online at:

http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/Assets/Public+Website/council/Council+Documents/2013+Agendas/021 213WSSAgenda.pdf

An unedited digital video recording of the meeting, which can be used in conjunction with the transcript, is available online at: http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/citycable11/channels/council13. For ease of reference, included throughout the transcript are bracketed "time stamps" [Time: 00:00:00] that correspond to digital video recording time.

For more information about this transcript, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 480-312-2411.

CALL TO ORDER

[Time: 00:00:10]

Mayor Lane: GOOD AFTERNOON. WELCOME TO OUR WORK STUDY AND I WILL CALL TO ORDER THAT WORK STUDY THIS 12^{TH} DAY OF FEBRUARY 2013 AND I WILL START WITH A ROLL CALL PLEASE.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: MAYOR JIM LANE.

Mayor Lane: PRESENT

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: VICE MAYOR SUZANNE KLAPP.

Vice Mayor Klapp: HERE

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: COUNCILMEMBERS VIRGINIA KORTE.

Councilmember Korte: HERE

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: BOB LITTLEFIELD.

Councilman Littlefield: HERE

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: LINDA MILHAVEN.

Councilwoman Milhaven: HERE

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: GUY PHILLIPS.

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 2 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

Councilmember Phillips: HERE

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: AND DENNIS ROBBINS.

Councilman Robbins: HERE

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: ACTING CITY MANAGER DAN WORTH

Acting City Manager Dan Worth: HERE

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: CITY ATTORNEY BRUCE WASHBURN

City Attorney Bruce Washburn: HERE

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: CITY TREASURER DAVID SMITH

City Treasurer David Smith: PRESENT

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: CITY AUDITOR SHARRON WALKER

City Auditor Sharron Walker: HERE

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: AND THE CLERK IS PRESENT

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU. AS WE JUST MENTIONED THIS IS A WORK STUDY SESSION AND WE DO HAVE AVAILABLE TIME FOR A PUBLIC COMMENT BUT IT IS A LITTLE BIT DIFFERENT THAN IT IS DURING THE COURSE OF A REGULAR MEETING. WE HAVE A TOTAL OF FIFTEEN MINUTES SET ASIDE FOR A PUBLIC COMMENT AND THIS COMMENT TIME IS RESERVED FOR ITEMS ONLY ON THE AGENDA. IT WILL JUST OCCUR NOW AT THE BEGINNING OF THE WORK STUDY RATHER THAN BOTH AT THE BEGINNING AND AT THE END. IF YOU HAVE THOUGHTS YOU WOULD LIKE TO HAVE THE COUNCIL CONSIDER BUT DO NOT WISH TO SPEAK WE DO HAVE YELLOW CARDS TO WRITE DOWN THOSE COMMENTS.

ITEM 1 - BOND TASK FORCE JOINT MEETING

[Time: 00:01:37]

Mayor Lane: THE FIRST ORDER OF BUSINESS ON THIS WORK STUDY IS THE BOND TASK FORCE AND WE WILL HAVE A JOINT MEETING. WHAT I WOULD ASK IF WE COULD DO A ROLL CALL FIRST OF THE BOND TASK FORCE AND THEN WE CAN GO THROUGH INTRODUCTIONS.

Bond Task Force Chair Bill Heckman: THANK YOU MAYOR. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL ON DR. SUE SISLEY.

Sue Sisley: HERE

Bill Heckman: Teresa Quale

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 3 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

Teresa Quale: HERE

Bill Heckman: BOB KAMMERLE

Bob Kammerle: HERE

Bill Heckman: ABIGAIL HOOVER

Abigail Hoover: HERE

Bill Heckman: WAYNE ECTON

Wayne Ecton: HERE

Bill Heckman: VICE CHAIR JUDY FROST

Vice Chair Judy Frost: HERE

Bill Heckman: BILL HECKMAN HERE.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU VERY MUCH BILL. WE DO HAVE AN INDICATION THAT MR. EARLE WILL BE MAKING A PRESENTATION. IS MR. EARLE

Acting Public Works Executive Director Derek Earle: GOOD EVENING MAYOR LANE AND MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL.

Mayor Lane: DEREK, I AM SORRY. JUST SO I AM NOT MISSING THE PROTOCOL. BILL I SHOULD ASK YOU FIRST IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO MAKE SOME OPENING COMMENTS. IF THAT'S ALRIGHT DEREK.

Derek Earle: THAT'S FINE MR. CHAIR. WE HAVE ALLOWED IN THE INTRODUCTION FOR THE TASK FORCE TO MAKE AN INTRODUCTION AND MAKE A BRIEF STATEMENT. IF IT WOULD PLEASE THE MAYOR WE CAN MOVE FORWARD ON THAT BASIS AND GIVE THEM AN OPPORTUNITY.

Mayor Lane: LET'S DO THAT THEN. I DON'T HAVE ANY INDICATION OF THAT BUT THAT IS CERTAINLY SOUNDS LIKE A REASONABLE WAY TO GO. MR. HECKMAN IF YOU WOULD GO AHEAD AND START THAT INTRODUCTION.

BIII HECKMAN: MY NAME IS BILL HECKMAN. I AM A 32 YEAR RESIDENT OF SCOTTSDALE. ACTIVE IN MANY ASPECTS OF OUR COMMUNITY AS A VOLUNTEER AND IT'S BEEN A RARE PRIVILEGE TO ONCE AGAIN BE ON THIS TASK FORCE. BEING ON THE TASK FORCE IS ABOUT INVESTING IN OUR COMMUNITY AND KEEPING SCOTTSDALE A GREAT PLACE TO LIVE, WORK AND PLAY. THIS IS A VERY DEDICATED GROUP THAT I AM PRIVILEGED TO WORK WITH AND I BELIEVE WE PAIRED IT DOWN WITH ESSENTIAL PROJECTS THAT WE NEED TO MOVE FORWARD WITH. THANK YOU.

Judy Frost: JUDY FROST. FORMER CITY EMPLOYEE AND LONG TIME SCOTTSDALE RESIDENT. I HAVE BEEN INVOLVED IN EVERY BOND ELECTION ADMINISTRATION AND GENERAL OBLIGATION BONDS IN

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 4 OF 70 FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION

CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

THE CITY. I WAS THINKING BACK IN 1983 WAS THE FIRST GENERAL OBLIGATION BONDS. IT'S INTERESTING TO ME AND I HAVE A LOT OF BACKGROUND IN THAT AREA AND I SERVED ON THE TASK FORCE LAST YEAR SO I WAS MORE THAN HAPPY TO JUMP AT THE CHANCE TO DO IT AGAIN. THANK YOU.

Wayne Ecton: WAYNE ECTON. MAYOR AND CITY COUNCILMEMBERS THANK YOU FOR GIVING ME THE PRIVILEGE TO SERVE ON THE BOND TASK FORCE. LIVED IN SCOTTSDALE 16 YEARS, SERVED ON THE CITY COUNCIL FOR NINE YEARS. I WANTED TO BE ON THE FIRST ONE AND I AM HAPPY TO BE ON THE SECOND ONE. THE BACKGROUND AND UNDERSTANDING THAT I HAVE OF THE INFRASTRUCTURE AND THE NEEDS ARE AND I WAS HOPING THAT I COULD CONTRIBUTE. I THINK I HAVE.

Abigail Hoover: HI MY NAME IS ABBY HOOVER. I HAVE BEEN A RESIDENT OF SCOTTSDALE FOR TEN YEARS. I AM AN ARCHITECT AND I SERVED AS AN ALTERNATE ON THE 2012 TASK FORCE. I WAS REALLY HAPPY TO BE SELECTED THIS TIME AROUND. THIS IS MY FIRST TIME PARTICIPATING IN CITY ACTIVITIES AND I WANTED TO BECOME MORE ACTIVE IN MY COMMUNITY. THANK YOU.

Bob Kammerle: GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS BOB KAMMERLE AND I HAVE BEEN A RESIDENT OF SCOTTSDALE FOR MANY YEARS AND I ENJOY THE QUALITY OF LIFE HERE. MY WIFE AND I RAISED OUR TWO BOYS HERE AND THEY ATTENDED THE SCOTTSDALE SCHOOLS. AS A FAMILY WE ENJOYED THE DIVERSITY AND VITALITY THE CITY HAS TO OFFER. I BRING AN INTERESTING PERSPECTIVE TO THE TASK FORCE, I HAVE PREVIOUS EXPERIENCE IN LARGE SCALE INFRASTRUCTURE, SPECIAL PURPOSE DISTRICTS, AND MAINTENANCE OF THOSE DISTRICTS. I AM VERY PROUD TO LIVE IN SCOTTSDALE AND I WANT THE CITY TO CONTINUE TO BE RECOGNIZED AS A LEADING AMERICAN CITY. I BELIEVE THAT WISE AND CAREFUL REINVESTMENT IN OUR ASSETS IS VERY IMPORTANT FOR OUR PUBLIC SAFETY, QUALITY OF LIFE, AND FOR THE FUTURE BENEFIT AND MANY GENERATIONS THAT WILL FOLLOW ME. THANK YOU.

Teresa Quale: GOOD AFTERNOON. I AM TERESA KIM QUALE. I HAVE LIVED HERE FOR 50 YEARS. I GREW UP HERE, WENT TO GRADE SCHOOL, HIGH SCHOOL AND COLLEGE IN THE AREA. I HAVE BENEFITED WATCHING THE CITY GROW DURING THAT TIME PERIOD AND I RECOGNIZE THE VISION OF THE PEOPLE THAT ARE ON THE CITY COUNCIL TODAY HAD WHEN THEY DID SOME THINGS THAT WERE FUNDED BY BONDS AND I HAVE LEARNED HOW CRITICAL IT IS TO MAINTAIN THE ASSETS WE HAVE IN THE CITY SO WE CONTINUE TO BE SEEN AS ONE OF THE MOST LIVABLE CITIES TO LIVE IN. I APPRECIATE THE PRIVILEGE TO SERVE ON THE TASK FORCE.

Sue Sisley: MY NAME IS SUE SISLEY. I AM A 25 YEAR RESIDENT OF THE CITY. I WENT TO CHAPARRAL HIGH SCHOOL AND I AM NOW A PRIMARY CARE PHYSICIAN AND I WORK HERE IN OUR CITY. SCOTTSDALE HAS AFFORDED ME AND MY FAMILY AN INCREDIBLY EXCEPTIONAL QUALITY OF LIFE. I WAS HONORED TO SERVE ON THE BOND REVIEW COMMISSION FOR OUR LAST BOND ELECTION AND TO BE ABLE TO PARTICIPATE IN THIS BOND PROCESS, WE HAVE SELECTED TRULY ESSENTIAL PROJECTS THAT WILL CONTRIBUTE TO THE VIBRANCY AND ALLOW OUR CITY TO THRIVE AND I AM HONORED TO BE A PART OF THIS PROCESS.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU VERY MUCH ALL FOR YOUR PRESENCE HERE AND CERTAINLY FOR THE WORK THAT YOU HAVE DONE. SOMETIMES IN A REPEAT FASHION FROM THE LAST TIME AND I APPRECIATE

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 5 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

THE PRESENTENCE, CONNECTION AND ENGAGEMENT ON THIS SUBJECT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WITH THAT THEN WE WILL PROCEED WITH MR. EARLE.

QUESTION 1

[Time: 00:09:09]

Derek Earle: THANK YOU MAYOR LANE. I WASN'T SURE IF YOU WERE GOING TO CALL PUBLIC COMMENT IN ADVANCE OF THE PRESENTATION ON THE TASK FORCE RECOMMENDATIONS.

Mayor Lane: I APPRECIATE THE OBSERVATION BUT THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT INDICATED OR SUBMITTED.

Derek Earle: THANK YOU MAYOR. FOR THE RECORD I WAS NOT CORRECTING YOU I WAS JUST SUPPORTING WHAT YOU SUGGESTED. THANK YOU FOR THE CLARIFICATION. I APPRECIATE THE INTRODUCTION OF THE TASK FORCE. AS FAR AS THE REST OF TONIGHT WE WILL BE PROVIDING YOU WITH AN OVERVIEW OF THE PROCESS THAT BROUGHT US TO WHERE WE ARE TONIGHT. WE WILL GET SOME ASSISTANCE FROM OUR OTHER PARTICIPANTS AS WELL. WE WILL TALK ABOUT THE PUBLIC INVOLVEMENT THAT WE ENGAGED IN AND WE WILL FOCUS ON THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE TASK FORCE. FOLLOWING THAT WE WILL DISCUSS THE NEXT STEPS.

LET ME CLARIFY TO THE COUNCIL WHAT THE NEXT STEPS WE WILL BE. TONIGHT IS A WORK STUDY SESSION TO HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO RECEIVE THE RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE TASK FORCE. WE WILL BE HERE TO ANSWER QUESTIONS. DEPENDING ON THE DIRECTION FROM THE COUNCIL WE WILL BE RETURNING TO COUNCIL ON THE SECOND MEETING IN MARCH TO GIVE A MORE DETAILED PRESENTATION ABOUT THE SPECIFIC PROJECTS. SO COUNCIL CAN HAVE THE INPUT AND SUGGEST WHETHER THEY WANT TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THE BOND PROGRAM. TONIGHT IS THE INTRODUCTION TO THE PROGRAM, IN MARCH THERE WILL BE ACTIONS TO CONSIDER WHAT THE PROGRAM WILL LOOK LIKE AND WHETHER OR NOT WE CALL AN ELECTION FOR THIS FALL.

Mayor Lane: I AM SORRY MR. EARLE. THAT LAST COMMENT, WE WOULD BE DECIDED TONIGHT WHETHER TO MOVE ON TO THAT NEXT SESSION AND WHETHER TO CALL FOR THE ELECTION.

Derek Earle: IF THE DIRECTION OF COUNCIL WAS TO BRING FORWARD ACTION. YES. IT'S AGENDIZE TO GIVE DIRECTION TO COUNCIL

Mayor Lane: THERE IS NO ACTION TO BE TAKEN IN A STUDY SESSION IT WOULD BE BY CONSENSUS TO PROCEED.

Derek Earle: THAT IS CORRECT MAYOR.

Mayor Lane: ALRIGHT. THANK YOU.

Derek Earle: AS FAR AS THIS BOND TASK FORCE IS CONCERNED BEFORE I START INTO THE RESOLUTION, THIS PROCESS BEGAN IN JULY 2011 WITH THE FORMATION OF THE 2012 TASK FORCE. THAT GROUP PUT IN 600 HOURS OF VOLUNTEER TIME, TO GENERATE A RECOMMENDATION THAT

WAS BROUGHT TO COUNCIL IN MARCH 2012. IN MARCH COUNCIL CHOOSE TO DEFER THE TALK OF AN ELECTION TO THIS YEAR. IN JULY OF 2012 WE BROUGHT FORWARD RESOLUTION 9093 WHICH RESTARTED THE BOND TASK FORCE. THERE WERE FIVE PRIMARY TASKS OF THE TASK FORCE WAS CHARGED WITH. THE FIRST FOUR OF THESE ARE CONSISTENT WITH THE ORIGINAL TASK FORCE. THAT IS A FEASIBILITY REVIEW OF PROPOSED PROJECTS, RECOMMENDATIONS FOR WHAT TO INCLUDE, RANKING OF PRIORITY AND GROUPING OF PROJECTS. THE FIFTH ITEM WAS NEW TO THIS TASK FORCE. THE FIFTH GOAL IS TO SEEK PUBLIC INPUT IN THE PROCESS. WE DID THIS IN MULTIPLE AVENUES AND WE WILL GIVE YOU AN UPDATE ON PUBLIC OUTREACH AND THE RESULTS THAT WE HAVE.

YOU MET THE TASK FORCE. THEY INTRODUCED THEMSELVES. THE ONE THING WE LOOKED AT THIS PROCESS WAS STAFF INVOLVEMENT AS WELL. IT IS OUR JOB TO BRING THESE ACTIONS FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION AND OUR TEAM HAS BEEN WORKING ON THIS FOR 18 MONTHS. THE MAGNITUDE OF STAFF INVOLVEMENT, FOR EXAMPLE WITHIN CAPITAL PROJECTS DEPARTMENT WE HAD BILL PEIFER, ERIN WALSH, BILL BUTLER. THIS EFFORT WAS BROUGHT FORWARD BY DOZENS OF MEMBERS OF STAFF WORKING ACROSS DEPARTMENTAL LINES TO WORK WITH THE TASK FORCE TO PUT THIS PROGRAM TOGETHER. THE FINAL RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE TASK FORCE IS 239.9 MILLION GENERAL OBLIGATION BOND PROGRAM. IT WILL BE SPILT IN FOUR ELECTION QUESTIONS, 45 PROJECTS. WE WILL DO A RUN THROUGH OF THOSE PROJECTS IN A FEW MINUTES BUT BEFORE THAT ERIN WALSH WILL BE GIVING YOU A BRIEF OVERVIEW OF THE PROCESS AND THE PUBLIC OUTREACH OF THE TASK FORCE WORK.

[Time: 00:15:35]

Public Information Officer Erin Walsh: THANK YOU DEREK. MEMBERS OF COUNCIL AND MEMBERS OF THE TASK FORCE. AS DEREK SAID THESE ARE THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE TASK FORCE. BEFORE WE GO INTO DETAIL WE WANT TO LET YOU KNOW HOW WE GOT HERE. THE BOND TASK FORCE WORK WAS BROKEN DOWN INTO THREE PHASES. THE FIRST WAS TO REVIEW, UPDATE AND EXPAND THE WORK COMPLETED BY THE 2012 TASK FORCE. WE TOOK THOSE PROJECTS AND WE DID SOME COST ANALYSIS, REFINED THEM AND AS A RESULT OF PHASE ONE THE PROPOSED 2012 BOND PROGRAM WENT FROM 34 PROJECTS AT \$160.8 MILLION AND IT WAS REDUCED TO 32 PROJECTS FOR \$158.1 MILLION. THIS GAVE THE TASK FORCE A LAUNCH POINT. WE MOVED ON TO THE EDUCATION PROCESS AND NEW INFORMATION THAT WAS NOT AVAILABLE IN 2012. THAT'S WHEN PHASE TWO CAME IN. THE CITY TREASURER VISITED US, GAVE THE TASK FORCE AN UPDATE ON THE FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS THAT WE NEEDED AND HOW THINGS HAD CHANGED. ADDITIONALLY ALL DEPARTMENTS THAT HAD A PROPOSAL FOR NEW PROJECTS CAME FORWARD AND GAVE A PRESENTATION WHICH CONSTITUTED 19 NEW PROJECTS THAT WERE REVIEWED. MAJORITY OF WORK WAS DONE IN PHASE THREE. THE NEXT STEP WAS THE CRITERIA TO DESCRIBE THE VALUES OF THIS TASK FORCE. THEY NEEDED TO KNOW HOW THEY WERE GOING TO MOVE FORWARD AND EVALUATE PROJECTS. THE TASK FORCE CAME UP WITH THE CRITERIA USED TO EVALUATE PROJECTS AND PRIORITIZE THEM.

THESE ARE THE CRITERIA THAT THIS TASK FORCE ESTABLISHED. THE ONE THEY DEEMED MOST IMPORTANT WAS THE PROJECT MANDATED AND TO THE LEAST IMPORTANT IF THE PROJECT COULD BE INITIATED IN A THREE YEAR TIME FRAME. THEY LOOKED AT ALL PROJECTS THROUGH THE LENS OF THESE CRITERIA. NEXT WE MOVED TO RANK THE PROJECTS. THE TASK FORCE GAVE EACH PROJECT A NUMERICAL RANK BY APPLYING THE CRITERIA BASED ON ONE THROUGH TEN. IF PROJECT WAS GIVEN

A ONE THE PROJECT WAS VIEWED AS ESSENTIAL TO THE BOND PROGRAM. EACH PROJECT WAS AVERAGED TO GIVE A NUMERICAL SCORE. OUT OF THE NEW 19 PROJECTS THE TASK FORCE CONSIDERED THEY COLLECTIVELY THOUGHT THE BRIDGE SAFETY UPGRADES AND REHABILITATION PROJECT WAS THEIR TOP PRIORITY OF THE NEW PROJECTS. THE LOWEST PRIORITIES WERE THE THOMPSON PEAK PARKWAY BRIDGE AND THE DESERT DISCOVERY CENTER. NEXT WE MOVED TO THE EVALUATION STAGE TO DECIDE IF A PROJECT SHOULD BE INCLUDED OR NOT. BEFORE WE MOVED FORWARD THIS IS WHERE WE MARRIED THE 2012 PROGRAM TO THE NEW PROJECTS. THE 32 ORIGINAL PROJECTS FROM THE 2012 PROGRAM WERE BROUGHT IN AND EACH ON WAS RE-VOTED ON AND REEXAMINED TO MAKE IT INTO THE 2013 PROPOSAL. THE TASK FORCE EVALUATED 51 PROJECTS IN TOTAL. AS A RESULT THEY WERE BROKEN DOWN INTO THREE GROUPS. 45 PROJECTS WERE DEEMED TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PROGRAM, FIVE PROJECTS WERE DEFERRED AND TO TAKE NO ACTION ON THE DESERT DISCOVERY CENTER.

THE COUNCIL ASKED WE COULD PRIORITIZE THE PROJECTS. RANKINGS WERE DONE ON ITS MERIT NOT COMPARING ONE TO ANOTHER. NOW THE PROJECTS WERE BEING PRIORITIZED. THE TASK FORCED RANKED THE PROJECTS 1 THROUGH 51 BY PRIORITY. FOUR NEW PROJECTS MADE IT INTO THE TOP TWENTY. THE FINAL STEP WAS GROUPING THE PROJECTS. HOW SHOULD THEY BE PRESENTED TO THE VOTERS? THE TASK FORCE GROUPED ALL PROJECTS INTO FOUR QUESTIONS. THE FIRST BEING PARKS, LIBRARIES AND COMMUNITY FACILITIES. THE SECOND BEING PUBLIC SAFETY. THE THIRD NEIGHBORHOOD FLOOD CONTROL AND THE FOURTH TRANSPORTATION AND STREETS. THIS WAS THE LAST STEP IN THE PROCESS.

THE TASK FORCE DID EXTENSIVE PUBLIC INVOLVEMENT. THE TASK FORCE MET NINE TIMES AT FIVE DIFFERENT LOCATIONS. WE DID DO FOUR PRESS RELEASES IN THIS PROCESS. ALSO NEWS ARTICLES WERE PLACED IN VARIOUS PUBLICATIONS. CIVIC GROUPS AND HOA WERE CONTACTED AS WELL. SOCIAL MEDIA WAS USED AND A WEB PRESENCE ON SCOTTSDALEAZ.GOV. THE COMMUNITY WAS ASKED WHAT PROJECTS THEY WOULD LIKE TO INCLUDE IN THE BOND. SOCIAL MEDIA WAS USED FOR A PUBLIC CALL FOR PROJECTS TO GENERATE EIGHT COMMUNITY IDEAS. SPEAK UP SCOTTSDALE WAS LAUNCHED IN SEPTEMBER. FIVE TOPIC DISCUSSIONS WERE HOSTED IN THIS PROCESS. FINALLY WE ARE IN THE PROCESS OF COORDINATING WITH SCOTTSDALE SCHOOL DISTRICT TO SEEK ADDITIONAL RESIDENT INPUT ON THE BOND PROGRAM. I WILL TURN IT OVER TO DEREK.

[Time: 00:24:55]

Derek Earle: I WILL GO OVER THE FOUR QUESTIONS. UNDER QUESTION ONE WHICH IS PARKS, LIBRARIES, AND COMMUNITY FACILITIES THIS CONSISTS OF \$50.4 MILLION IN 10 PROJECTS. THE THREE NEW PROJECTS ADDED THIS YEAR WERE THE PINNACLE PEAK PARK IMPROVEMENTS. A WELL LOVED FACILITY HEAVILY USED PARK FACILITY FOR TRAILS AND HIKING. \$3.8 MILLION PROJECT TO BUY ADDITIONAL LAND. CIVIC CENTER WEST ENTRY IMPROVEMENTS FOR \$4.6 MILLION FOR PHYSICAL CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS TO WESTERN PORTION OF CIVIC CENTER AREA. IN ADDITIONAL THERE WOULD BE SUFFICIENT FUNDING TO LOOK AT A MASTER PLAN FOR THE ENTIRE CIVIC CENTER MALL AREA. PAIUTE COMMUNITY CENTER RENOVATIONS AT \$7.6 MILLION THIS IS THE ADDITION TO THE PAIUTE COMMUNITY CENTER TO HOUSE MEDICAL AND DENTAL CLINICS. FINALLY, SCOTTSDALE CENTER FOR THE PERFORMANCE ARTS RENOVATIONS PHASE THREE IS ONGOING WORK TO MOVE GIFT SHOP TO BE MORE OPEN TO CIVIC CENTER MALL AREA. WITH THAT I WILL TURN TO THE TASK FORCE FOR ANY COMMENTS ON QUESTION ONE.

Bill Heckman: WOULD ANYONE LIKE TO SPEAK TO ANY OF THE PROJECTS ON QUESTION ONE?

[Time: 00:28:14]

Judy Frost: THE PINNACLE PEAK PARK IMPROVEMENTS. THERE IS A VERY SMALL PARKING LOT AND EVERYONE PARKS ON THE STREET ON BOTH SIDES. THERE ARE NO SIDEWALKS. PEOPLE ARE WALKING IN THE STREETS. I VIEW THIS AS A SAFETY ISSUE RATHER THAN AN IMPROVEMENT TO THE PARK. IT IS VERY NECESSARY TO PROVIDE THE SAFETY TO OUR RESIDENTS.

Wayne Ecton: I THINK AS YOU LOOK AT THESE PROJECTS YOU HAVE TO KEEP IN MIND WHAT IS PERTINENT TO THE THOUGHT PROCESS THAT WE WENT THROUGH. EVERYBODY HAS THEIR OWN WAY OF DESCRIBING THESES: THEY ARE CRUCIAL, IMPORTANT, CRITICAL, NECESSARY AND HELPING PUBLIC SAFETY, SUSTAINABILITY, ECONOMIC VITALITY, AND TECHNOLOGY UPGRADES. DON'T TAKE THIS AS THE WORLD IS GOING TO FALL APART IF WE DON'T DO THEM, BUT YES IT WILL HAVE AN IMPACT ON SCOTTSDALE TO REMAIN A QUALITY CITY. IT PROTECTS THE HEALTH AND WELL FAIR OF ALL THE RESIDENTS AND THAT IS CRUCIAL.

BIII Heckman: ANYONE ELSE? I WILL THROW MY TWO-SENSE IN. THE LIST IS LARGER THAN LAST YEAR. THE LONGER WE WAIT THE BIGGER ITS GOING TO GET. THE TOTAL NEEDS OF THE DEPARTMENTS ARE FOUR TIMES LARGER THAN WHAT YOU ARE SEEING THIS EVENING. THE WAY TO INVEST IN YOUR COMMUNITY AND PROTECT YOUR PROPERTY VALUES IS TO DO PROJECTS THAT ARE ON THIS LIST. QUESTION ONE THE AREA OF COMMUNITY SERVICE AS PUBLIC SERVICE IS SHOWN IN THE IMPROVEMENTS NEEDED AT VISTA DEL CAMINO, THE EXPANSION OF BOTH SENIOR CENTERS AND THE PAIUTE COMMUNITY CENTER. THESE ARE GREAT PROJECTS THAT AFFECT THE QUALITY OF LIFE FOR OUR RESIDENTS. AS YOU GET INTO THE OTHER QUESTIONS YOU WILL SEE THAT EVERY ASPECT OF OUR COMMUNITY WILL BE SERVED BY THESE PROJECTS. THANK YOU.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU CHAIRMAN. WE DO HAVE SOME QUESTIONS. VICE MAYOR KLAPP.

[Time: 00:32:25]

Vice Mayor Klapp: A COUPLE OF THINGS YOU SAID MAKES ME WONDER WHEN THESE PROJECTS ARE GROUPED WHETHER YOU SAY PARKS, LIBRARIES, AND COMMUNITY FACILITIES YOU MIGHT SAY COMMUNITY SERVICES. IF YOU INDICATE TO THE VOTERS THAT THESE ARE SERVICES THAT ARE BEING PROVIDED AND NOT JUST BUILDINGS THAT'S SOMETHING TO CONSIDER. SECONDLY YOU ADDED THE CIVIC CENTER WEST ENTRY IMPROVEMENTS THAT I THINK THEY COULD BE CONSIDERED ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT OR VITALITY INSTEAD OF LUMPING TOGETHER WITH PARKS AND LIBRARIES. YOU WANT TO CONSIDER WHAT ARE THE PURPOSES FOR THESE PROJECTS, THE WAY YOU PROPOSE YOUR QUESTIONS MIGHT INDICATE THAT. THAT IS JUST A SUGGESTION.

BIII HECKMAN: THAT IS CERTAINLY SOMETHING WE LOOKED AT AND IT MAKES A LOT OF SENSE. THE KEY CRITICAL THING TO US WAS LOOKING BACK A PAST SUCCESSFUL BOND ELECTIONS. THE LAST SUCCESSFUL ONE WAS 13 YEARS AGO. BOND 2000 ALL THOSE FUNDS HAVE BEEN SPENT. MOST OF THE QUESTIONS PUT FORWARD ON THAT HAVE BEEN GROUPED SIMILARLY NOW. WE TRIED TO USE THE THEME AS WE WORDED TO QUESTION TO LOOK AT ALL ELEMENTS. THIS IS THE MODEL WE THOUGHT WAS STRONGEST AND THAT WOULD HAVE THE BEST MESSAGE TO THE VOTING PUBLIC.

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 9 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

Vice Mayor Klapp: I APPRECIATE THAT. 13 YEARS AGO THERE WAS A DIFFERENT ECONOMY. EVEN THOUGH IT WORKED 13 YEARS AGO YOU MIGHT WANT TO CONSIDER THE PLATFORM OF QUESTIONS TO TAKE INTO ACCOUNT A DIFFERENT MINDSET ABOUT THE ECONOMY AND BONDS.

Bill Heckman: WE CAN LOOK AT IT, BUT I HAVE A FEELING THAT THIS BALL IS BEING THROWN INTO YOUR DOMAIN WHERE TO TAKE IT FROM HERE. YOU HAVE THE FINAL RESPONSIBILITY FOR WHICH OF THESE ISSUES WILL BE CONSIDERED AND HOW THEY WILL BE GROUPED. THIS IS OUR BEST JUDGMENT AT THIS TIME.

Councilman Littlefield: JUST TO MAKE SURE WE ARE ALL CLEAR HERE THE QUESTION OF WHICH GROUP A PROJECT WAS IN WAS NOT A PRIORITY QUESTION BUT A FUNCTIONALITY QUESTION. THE WAY A PROJECT MADE IT INTO PARKS AND LIBRARIES AS OPPOSED TO PUBLIC SAFETY WAS NOT A QUESTION OF HOW HIGH A PRIORITY IT WAS, BUT WHAT FUNCTION IT WAS.

Bill Heckman: EACH QUESTION IS LISTED IN THE ORDER OF THEIR RANKING AS THEY FELL IN THAT PARTICULAR CATEGORY. WE DIDN'T CROSS REFERENCE OTHER GROUPS.

Councilman Littlefield: WITHIN EACH QUESTION, ITEM 1 WAS DEEMED BY THE TASK FORCE TO BE A HIGHER PRIORITY THAN 2?

Bill Heckman: THAT IS CORRECT.

[Time: 00:36:27]

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN. I HAD A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS. AND CHAIRMAN YOU ARE CORRECT THE BALL AS BEEN PASSED TO US AND HOW IT WILL BE PRESENTED WILL BE A TOPIC OF CONVERSATION WHETHER IT IS ON THE BALLOT OR THE FORM OF THE QUESTIONS. I WAS GOING TO ASK ABOUT THE PAIUTE ADDITION BUILDING. WHAT COMES TO MIND ABOUT THE BRIEFING ABOUT THE BUILDING IS CONCERNED. IT IS TO HOUSE THE NOAH EXTENSION OF THE SCOTTSDALE HEALTHCARE FACILITY FOR FREE OR MODEST COST. WE RECENTLY JUST PURCHASED THE LAND THAT THE SCHOOL IS ON AND I DIDN'T KNOW IF IT WOULD BE TO INVOLVE THAT LAND AND TEARING DOWN OF THOSE SCHOOL STRUCTURES IN ORDER TO FACILITATE THIS OR IF THIS IS SOMETHING THAT IS ADDED.

BIII HECKMAN: I WOULD DEFER TO STAFF TO ANSWER THAT. WE WERE PRESENTED WITH PLANS AND IT SHOWED SOME OF THOSE BUILDINGS ARE CRUMBLING WHETHER THEY WOULD BE COMING DOWN AND REPLACED WITH NEW BUILDINGS I WOULD PREFER IF STAFF ANSWERED THAT.

Derek Earle: MAYOR SPECIFICALLY TO YOUR QUESTION THERE IS OPEN SPACE ON THE WESTERN PORTION OF THE PROPERTY TO BE UTILIZED AND THE BUILDINGS THAT WE JUST PURCHASED FROM THE VIA DE MARIE ACADEMY CAN ALSO BE TORN DOWN IF THEY ARE UNSUITABLE FOR ANY FOR ANY USE FOR THEIR CONFIGURATION. WE WOULD HAVE TO EVALUATE THE SITE AS A WHOLE TO DETERMINE THE BEST SOLUTION FOR THE COMMUNITY AND THE CENTER. WE DON'T HAVE A SPECIFIC.

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 10 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

Mayor Lane: SO I SEE THAT IT HAS NOT YET BEEN DESIGNATED AS TO WHETHER IT WILL BE TORN DOWN AND REBUILT. THERE IS SOME INTEREST IN THOSE SCHOOL BUILDINGS.

Derek Earle: TO CLARIFY MAYOR, THIS IS MORE PROGRAMMATIC. WE HAVE DONE AN ANALYSIS OF THE NEEDS OF THE FACILITY, PER SQUARE FOOT COST, WE OWN THE LAND. SO WE EVALUATED THE COST BASED ON THE PROGRAM IN THE BUILDING ITSELF. THE SUBJECT OF A LOCATION WOULD BE SUBJECT TO A MASTER PLAN AT PAIUTE. I AM NOT SURE IF I MISSED A QUESTION YOU ASKED.

Mayor Lane: NO, BUT YOU RAISE ANOTHER ONE IN THAT CONVERSATION. YOU ARE SAYING THIS WOULD INCLUDE THE COST OF A MASTER PLAN FOR THE ENTIRE CAMPUS.

Derek Earle: YES.

Mayor Lane: MY NEXT QUESTION IS WHETHER OR NOT THIS WOULD BE THE BUILDING OF A 22,000 SQUARE FT BUILDING TO BUILD A CLINIC FOR NOAH FOR THEIR SPECIFICATIONS. IS THAT THE INTENT?

Derek Earle: NO THE INTENT IS TO BUILD A FACILITY AT THE CAPABILITY OF BRINGING IN A TENNANT THAT COULD OFFER LOW COST OR SUBSIDED MEDICAL AND DENTAL SERVICES TO THE COMMUNITY. WHETHER IT WOULD BE NOAH OR A DIFFERENT PROVIDER IT WOULD REQUIRE US TO PUT OUT AN RFP TO MEET CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS. CURRENTLY THE NOAH CLINIC MAKES SENSE THEY HAVE THE RIGHT FEDERAL CERTIFICATIONS BUT WE ARE NOT TARGETING NOAH SPECIFICALLY WE ARE TARGETING THE COMMUNITY FACILITY.

Mayor Lane: THE INTENT OF THIS IS TO BUILD A 22,000 SQ FT FACILITY THAT WOULD BE SUITABLE FOR A CLINIC.

Derek Earle: THAT IS CORRECT.

Mayor Lane: PRESUMABLY THERE WOULD BE SOME RETURN ON THAT.

Derek Earle: THAT IS CORRECT.

Mayor Lane: THE OTHER WAS THE VISTA DEL CAMINO. THERE WAS A COMMENT MADE THAT IT HASN'T BEEN REMODELED BUT WASN'T IT REMODELED THREE OR FOUR YEARS AGO?

Derek Earle: WE DID SOME UPGRADE TO THE LAKE. WE WERE HAVING SIGNIFICANT ISSUE WITH IT. IT WAS LEAKING BADLY AND WE WERE ABLE TO MAKE REPAIRS. THAT PARK ITSELF HAS NOT BEEN UPGRADED OR REPAIRED. THIS DOES NOT INCLUDE THE VISTA DEL CAMINO CENTER ITSELF THIS IS THE INDIAN BEND PARK AREA.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. COUNCILMAN ROBBINS.

[Time: 00:42:26]

Councilman Robbins: THANK YOU MAYOR. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I AM INTERESTED IN AS WE GO THROUGH THIS PROCESS IS ADDITIONAL OPERATING COSTS THAT EACH ON OF THESE FACILITIES WILL

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 11 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

ADD TO OUR GENERAL FUND IN THE FUTURE. HAVE WE PROGRAMMED THE NUMBER FOR EACH OF THESE? HOW MUCH ADDITIONAL OPERATING COSTS OR HOW MUCH SAVINGS?

BIII HECKMAN: WE ALL RECALL THE BOND 2000 WITH THE HELICOPTER THAT WAS APPROVED BY THE VOTERS BUT WE COULDN'T AFFORD TO IMPLEMENT IT BECAUSE THE OPERATIONAL COSTS WERE SO EXTENSIVE. WE WERE SENSITIVE TO THAT AND TRIED TO MAKE SURE THAT EVERY PROJECT PRESENTED TO US THAT THE DEPARTMENTS WERE AWARE OF THE OPERATING COSTS. THIS IS TOUGH TO GET THROUGH. SOME OF THESE DO HAVE SOME COSTS SAVINGS BUT BY DOING THEM IT WILL HELP AS WELL.

Councilman Robbins: OK. I APPRECIATE THAT. MR. EARLE DO WE HAVE HARD NUMBER ON EACH OF THESE?

Derek Earle: YES. WE DO HAVE THE INFORMATION ON ALL OF THESE. I DON'T HAVE IT IN THIS PRESENTATION SPECIFICALLY WE CAN GIVE YOU THOSE DETAILS AT THE COUNCIL PRESENTATION. I CAN PULL UP ON A SPECIFIC PROJECT AND HAVE STAFF GIVE YOU THAT NUMBER.

Councilman Robbins: NO. I DON'T HAVE ANYTHING SPECIFIC RIGHT NOW. I NEED TO KNOW THAT AS WE MOVE FORWARD. THANK YOU.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN. COUNCILWOMAN MILHAVEN.

Councilwoman Milhaven: THANK YOU. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS ABOUT THE PAIUTE CENTER. THE PAIUTE CENTER IS A GEM AND DOES WONDERFUL THINGS AND I SUPPORT IT. WE HAVE A COMMUNITY CENTER AND THEY PROVIDE SERVICES, MEDICAL SERVICES IS A NEED. IN THE DESCRIPTION IT SAYS TO PROVIDE SERVICES FOR THE UNDERSERVED IN MARICOPA COUNTY. THAT CAUSES ME CONCERN AS TO HOW MUCH WE ARE INVESTING TO SERVE CITIZENS OF OTHER COMMUNITIES? THESE ARE SPECIAL USE THEY ARE NOT GENERAL USE ROOMS? ARE WE REPLACING ROOMS OR EXPANDING?

Derek Earle: THIS WOULD BE SPACE THAT IS LIMITED TO MEDICAL CLINIC USE. IT IS MORE SPECIALIZED SPACE AND WOULD NOT BE GENERAL PURPOSE. AS FAR AS THE PROVISION FOR SERVING RESIDENTS IN MARICOPA COUNTY THAT IS OLD LANGUAGE FROM NOAH. I DON'T BELIEVE THAT A LOW COST MEDICAL PROVIDER WOULD REQUIRE AN ID TO SEE IF YOU ARE A CITIZEN OF SCOTTSDALE OR NOT TO RECEIVE SERVICES.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILWOMAN. WE DON'T HAVE ANY FURTHER QUESTIONS. COUNCILMAN PHILLIPS.

[Time: 00:47:14]

Councilmember Phillips: THANK YOU MAYOR. NUMBER SIX THE BALL FIELD LIGHTING REPLACEMENT. IS THAT SOMETHING YOU THINK THE TAX PAYERS SHOULD BE PAYING FOR? THAT DOESN'T SOUND LIKE SOMETHING YOU SHOULD BOND ON YOUR PROPERTY TAX FOR LIGHTS ON A BALL FIELD. I THINK THAT IS A STRANGE ONE.

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 12 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

Derek Earle: I WOULD BE GLAD TO PULL COMMUNITY SERVICES UP HERE. I THINK THE PROVISION OF LIGHTED BALL FIELDS IS COMMUNITY SERVICES THAT IS PROVIDED BY THE CITY TO THE COMMUNITY. THE FACT THAT ATHLETIC FIELDS ARE PROVIDED DURING THE DAY AND ARE ALSO PROVIDED DURING THE EVENING IS PART OF THE REASON WHY WE DO PROVIDE LIGHTING. THIS PARTICULAR PROJECT WILL INCREASE THE EFFICIENCY OF THE LIGHTING WE HAVE IN THE FIELDS. SOME OF IT IS TWENTY THIRTY YEARS OLD. THIS WILL GREATLY INCREASE THE EFFICIENCY AND REDUCE THE OPERATING COSTS. WE HAVE JOINT AGREEMENTS WITH THE SCHOOL DISTRICT TO SHARE COSTS ON FIELDS.

Councilmember Phillips: WELL MY QUESTION REALLY ISN'T IF IT IS A GOOD PROJECT OR NOT, I THINK IT IS, I AM JUST WONDERING IF THIS IS A GOOD BOND PROJECT? DOESN'T A BOND HAVE TO BE STRUCTURAL?

Derek Earle: WE JUDGE A CAPITAL PROJECT BY THE COST OF THE PROJECT, THE LONGEVITY OF THE PROJECT, AND IF IT QUALIFIES AS A CAPITAL PROJECT IT CAN QUALIFY AS A GENERAL OBLIGATION BOND. THAT DEFINITION GENERALLY, IN CITY FINANCIAL TERMS, IS AN ASSET OVER \$25,000 IN VALUE WITH A TWENTY YEAR LIFE. THAT IS WHY THIS IS CONSIDERED A CAPITAL PROJECT.

Councilmember Phillips: OK. NUMBER EIGHT CIVIC CENTER WEST ENTRY IMPROVEMENTS. IS THERE A WAY WE CAN GO BACK TO THAT AND INCLUDE THE BATHROOMS HERE THAT ARE NOT TO ADA STANDARDS? THEY ARE IN REALLY BAD SHAPE AND THEY SHOULD BE INCLUDED SOMEWHERE.

Derek Earle: THE DESCRIPTION OF THE PROJECT IS SPECIFIC TO THE MALL AREA ITSELF, HOWEVER IF THERE IS INTEREST IN THAT TYPE INFORMATION, THIS IS THE TYPE OF FEEDBACK THAT WE NEED. WE CAN BRING THAT INFORMATION BACK WHEN COUNCIL CONSIDERS THIS PACKAGE.

Councilmember Phillips: FIND A PLACE TO PUT IT. THE CIVIC CENTER SEEMED LIKED THE CLOSEST.

Derek Earle: WE CAN DO THAT AS AN OPTIONAL ADD TO THIS PARTICULAR PROJECT. WE NEED TO DO A QUICK FEASIBILITY TO UNDERSTAND THE COST OF MAKING THAT MODIFICATION. WE WILL BRING THAT INFORMATION FOR COUNCIL CONSIDERATION.

Councilmember Phillips: THANK YOU. AND THE LAST THING IS WHEN COUNCILWOMAN KLAPP SUGGESTED CHANGING THE WORD OF COMMUNITY FACILITIES TO SERVICES. I UNDERSTAND YOUR POINT BUT I THINK IT MIGHT CONFUSE THE VOTING PUBLIC BECAUSE THE SAME THING COMES ACROSS AS BONDING FOR SERVICES. INSTEAD YOU COULD SAY COMMUNITY FACILITIES FOR SERVICES.

Derek Earle: WE WILL BRING THAT FORWARD. AT THE TIME WE PRESENTED THIS THE ONLY REASON WHY STAFF SUGGESTED ALTERING THE COMMUNITY SERVICES DESCRIPTION IS BECAUSE WE HAVE A DEPARTMENT CALLED COMMUNITY SERVICES. WE DIDN'T WANT TO CREATE CONFUSION THERE. AGAIN, THIS IS COUNCIL'S DISCRETION OF HOW THEY FEEL THIS WOULD BE BEST PURPOSED TO THE RESIDENTS.

[Time: 00:51:10]

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN. MR. EARLE TO CLARIFY TODAY WE ARE RECEIVING THESE RECOMMENDATIONS. OUR NEXT MEETING WE MAY TALK ABOUT POSSIBLE ADDS AT THE NEXT

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 13 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

MEETING. AT THIS POINT IN TIME, I THINK WE ARE TALKING ABOUT THE RECOMMENDATIONS THAT WE HAVE IN FRONT OF US AND WHETHER TO ACCEPT IT AND GO FORWARD WITH THESE. WE MAY ADD TO THEM AT SOME FUTURE TIME. RIGHT NOW IT IS MORE TO THE STANDPOINT OF WHETHER TO GO FORWARD OR NOT. IS THERE MORE TO IT THAN THAT?

Derek Earle: ABSOLUTELY MAYOR. WE WILL TAKE ANY INFORMATION THAT IS PROVIDED BY COUNCIL. OUR FOCUS PRIMARILY IS ON THESE RECOMMENDATIONS TONIGHT BUT WE ARE TAKING ANY COMMENTS FROM COUNCIL ON THIS.

Mayor Lane: THE DISTINCTION I AM TRYING TO DRAW IS THAT WE ARE NOT TO TAKE ANY ACTION TO ADD OR DELETE FROM THIS POINT. IT IS A MATTER OF DISCUSSION AND GUIDANCE TO MOVE FORWARD. I JUST WANTED TO MAKE THAT POINT. THE CONVERSATION IS GOOD AND AS FAR AS THE STAFF IS CONCERNED TO MOVE FORWARD.

Derek Earle: MAYOR THE PROGRAM THAT WE BRING TO YOU IN LATE MARCH IT WILL BE THE SAME PROGRAM AND YOU WILL HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE ANY MODIFICATIONS OR CHANGES.

Mayor Lane: IT WILL BE ACTIONABLE AT THAT POINT IN TIME?

Derek Earle: CORRECT.

Mayor Lane: I HAD ONE MORE QUESTION WITH REGARD TO PAIUTE. WITH THE LAST PURCHASE WAS WITH CBDG FUNDS. WAS THE ORIGINAL PAIUTE COMPLEX PURCHASED THROUGH A BOND MEASURE?

Derek Earle: I WOULD HAVE TO DEFER TO STAFF ON THAT IF ANYONE HAS AN ANSWER TO THAT.

Acting City Manager Dan Worth: AT THE RISK OF BEING CONTRADICTED BY JUDY FROST WHO WAS PROBABLY AROUND I DON'T THINK IT WAS PURCHASED BY BOND MONEY OR CDBG FUNDS.

Mayor Lane: IF WE MOVE ON WITH THIS FACILITY WE WOULD HAVE A MIX OF BOND MONEY VERSUS CDBG FUNDS. COUNCILMAN LITTLEFIELD.

[Time: 00:54:44]

Councilman Littlefield: I WOULD LIKE TO ASK THE ESTEEMED TREASURER HOW MUCH BONDING IS TOO MUCH? INDEPENDENT OF THE WORTH OF THE INDIVIDUAL PROJECTS. IT IS \$240 MILLION HERE AT WHAT LEVEL WOULD IT BE PRUDENT TO BOND?

City Treasurer David Smith: THAT'S A VERY SUBJECTIVE QUESTION TO ANSWER. I CAN TELL YOU I HAVE MADE PRESENTATIONS TO THE BOND TASK FORCE AND THEY HAVE INCORPORATED SOME OF THAT IN THIS SUMMARY BOOK THAT INDICATE THE BURDEN THAT THIS WOULD PLACE ON THE CITIZENS IS NOT AN ONEROUS BURDEN. IT IS A REASONABLE BURDEN BUT THAT IS A SUBJECTIVE ANSWER. THE WAY WE LOOKED AT IT IS WHERE WOULD THEIR PROPERTY TAX BE IN TEN YEARS FROM NOW IF THIS WERE SUPERIMPOSED ON THE OUTSTANDING DEBT THAT WE HAVE TODAY. IN TEN YEARS THEY ARE BACK TO WHERE THEY ARE RIGHT NOW. I THINK THE BOND TASK FORCE WAS MORE PERSUADED BY THE QUESTION OF DOES THIS NEED TO BE DONE, AND IF IT DOES NEED TO BE DONE WHERE WILL WE GET

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 14 OF 70 FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION

CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

THE MONEY. SINCE WE DON'T HAVE MONEY IN THE GENERAL FUND AND WE ARE NOT ISSUING MPC BONDS, THE GENERAL OBLIGATION BOND SEEMED TO BE THE ONLY RESOURCE AVAILABLE TO US. THAT'S A LONG ANSWER AND I KNOW IT'S NOT PRECISELY TO THE QUESTION YOU ASKED.

Councilman Littlefield: IT WASN'T PRECISELY TO THE QUESTION I ASKED. I HAVE MANY THINGS AROUND MY HOUSE THAT I WOULD LIKE TO DO AND IF I CAN'T PAY FOR THEM OUT OF MY CASH FLOW THAT MEANS THAT I WOULD HAVE TO BORROW THE MONEY SOMEHOW TO DO IT. ALL OF THOSE PROJECTS ARE WORTHY BUT THERE IS ALSO THE FINANCIAL CONSIDERATION OF WHAT POINT AM I BORROWING TOO MUCH. MOVING THAT ANALOGY OVER TO HERE, CONCEDING THAT ALL OF THESE PROJECTS ARE GOOD PROJECTS, HOW MUCH BORROWING IS TOO MUCH FROM A FINANCIAL PRUDENCE POINT OF VIEW. NOT FROM A, I LIKE THIS PROJECT POINT OF VIEW. FOR INSTANCE AT WHAT POINT WOULD WE HAVE BONDED TO THE POINT WHERE IT WOULD CAUSE OUR BOND RATING TO DECLINE. THAT MAY BE ONE POTENTIAL NEGATIVE CONSEQUENCE OF THIS. YOU ARE THE ESTEEMED FINANCIAL ADVISOR SO I WOULD LIKE SOMETHING MORE ON THE POINT.

David Smith: LET ME TRY TO PUT A FINER POINT ON IT. THE KINDS OF THINGS WE LOOKED AT WITH THE COMMISSION WERE SEVERAL FOLD. WE LOOKED AT WHAT WOULD THIS BOND ISSUE DO IN TERMS OF BUMPING US UP ON THE STATE LIMITATION ON BORROWING. AS YOU KNOW THERE IS A STATE LIMITATION THAT SAY YOU CANNOT HAVE OUTSTANDING BONDS GREATER THAN 20% OF THE ASSESSED VALUE OF THE COMMUNITY. THIS IS WELL WITHIN THAT CRITERIA. WHEN I SAY WELL WITHIN, THERE IS PROBABLY THREE TIMES THE MONEY BETWEEN US AND THE CEILING. EVEN WITH THE DEPRESSED PROPERTY VALUES OF RECENT YEARS. THAT WAS ONE CONSIDERATION. IF YOU WANTED TO KNOW IF WE HAVE ANY PROBLEM WITH STATE LIMITATIONS THE ANSWER IS EMPHATICALLY NO. THE SECOND QUESTION THEY WANTED TO LOOK AT, WAS TO YOUR POINT, WHAT WOULD BE THE BOND RATING AGENCY'S REACTION TO THIS. THAT IS A FAIRLY SUBJECTIVE JUDGMENT, IT WAS MY JUDGMENT THAT THIS WOULD NOT IMPACT NEGATIVELY THE CITY'S AAA BOND RATINGS. WE REVIEWED THE CRITERIA THE BOND AGENCIES CONSIDER IN THE AAA RATING LIKE DEBT COVERAGE, ASSET VALUES WITHIN THE CITY, RELATIVE POSITION TO OTHER COMMUNITIES. IT WAS OUR JUDGMENT THAT THIS WOULD NOT IMPAIR THE AAA BOND RATING. IN POINT OF FACT THERE ARE MANY THINGS CONSIDERED BY THE BOND RATING AGENCIES BESIDES JUST DEBT COVERAGE. THEY CONSIDER MANAGEMENT, FINANCIAL POLICIES, AND THE FINANCIAL SENSE WHICH THE CITY IS RUN. SO I WENT OUT ON A LIMB AND OPINED FOR THEM THAT THE RATINGS AGENCIES WOULD LOOK FAVORABLY ON THE CITY TAKING CARE OF ITS INFRASTRUCTURE AS OPPOSED TO LETTING THE INFRASTRUCTURE DETERIORATE. THE THIRD FACTOR WAS WHAT FINANCIAL IMPACT WOULD IT HAVE ON AN INDIVIDUAL HOMEOWNER. ANY TAXES THAT YOU PAY ARE GOING TO BE PAID BY HALF THE RESIDENTIAL HOMEOWNERS AND HALF BY THE COMMERCIAL RETAIL BUSINESSES IN THE COMMUNITY. WE LOOKED AT THE COST FOR A RETAIL HOMEOWNER. THERE IS A COST. THE BOND TASK FORCE WAS PERSUADED THAT HOMEOWNERS THEMSELVES SHOULD BE PERSUADED. IT IS THEIR RESPONSIBILITY TO TAKE CARE OF THEIR COMMUNITY. THIS IS THE COMMUNITY THAT GIVES THEM THE ADDRESS THAT GIVES THEM IN WHICH THEY LIVE. THE AMOUNT OF THIS COLLECTIVELY OF THIS BOND PROPOSAL WOULD NOT BE ONEROUS OR OUT OF REASON FOR WHAT THE HOMEOWNERS HAVE TO PROTECT IN TERMS OF PROPERTY VALUE.

Councilman Littlefield: JUST SO THE FOLKS WATCHING ON TV WHO DON'T HAVE THIS PACKET IN FRONT OF THEM CAN KNOW. WHAT DID YOU CALCULATE APPROXIMATELY THAT IMPACT WOULD BE?

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 15 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

David Smith: IF THEY HAVE THIS PACKET THEY CAN LOOK AT PAGE 13. IN DOLLARS AND CENTS, THE COST WOULD BE \$32 A YEAR FOR A \$100,000 RESIDENCE. THAT IS USING THE FULL CASH VALUE. THE APPRAISED VALUE FOR THE PROPERTY. THAT 32 CENTS IS ONLY HAVE THE ENTIRE PROJECT IS PHASED IN. MR. EARLE WILL REMEMBER THAT THE TASK FORCE WILL EXPLAIN LATER THAT THE INTENT IS TO PHASE THIS IN OVER A FOUR YEAR PERIOD OF TIME. WE WOULD BE INCREMENTALLY BORROWING \$62 MILLION A YEAR IN THE DEBT SERVICE. THAT'S THE NUMBER \$32 PER \$100,000 OF VALUATION.

Councilman Littlefield: AND THAT'S ASSUMING THAT ALL \$240 MILLION WERE APPROVED AND IMPLEMENTED.

David Smith: THAT IS CORRECT.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN. COUNCILWOMAN MILHAVEN.

[Time: 01:01:57]

Councilwoman Milhaven: THANK YOU. COUNCILMAN LITTLEFIELD ASKS AND INTERESTING QUESTION OF HOW MUCH DEBT IS TOO MUCH DEBT. IT IS REALLY A QUESTION TO THE CITIZENS. THE ANALOGY THAT IF I HAVE A JOB AND I WANT TO BUY SOMETHING I HAVE TO PAY FOR IT OUT OF MY PAYCHECK I WOULD SUGGEST THAT YOU GET A SECOND JOB TO PAY THE DEBT BECAUSE I KNOW A LITTLE ABOUT FINANCE RISK AND IT'S ABOUT MATCHING YOUR REPAYMENT SOURCE TO HOW YOU WILL USE THE MONEY. OUR REPAYMENT SOURCE WOULD BE PROPERTY TAXES PAID BY THE VOTERS WHO APPROVED THE BOND. FOR MY MONEY I THINK THE SCOTTSDALE VOTERS ARE A PRETTY GOOD CREDIT RISK. I DON'T THINK THAT CREDIT RISK IS THE ISSUE HERE, IT'S WHAT KIND OF COMMUNITY DO WE WANT? DO WE WANT TO CONTINUE TO INVEST IN QUALITY? DO WE WANT TO KEEP THE QUALITY THAT WE HAVE? DO WE WANT CONTINUE TO MAKE ADDITIONAL INVESTMENTS? IT IS NOT HOW MUCH IS TOO MUCH, IT'S WHAT KIND OF COMMUNITY DO WE WANT AND WHAT ARE THE CITIZENS WILLING TO PAY FOR IT. THANK YOU.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILWOMAN. ON THIS TOPIC IT WILL ALWAYS BE SUBJECT TO THE CITIZENS VOTING ONE WAY OR THE OTHER ON THIS. TO COUNCILWOMAN MILHAVEN'S POINT, THAT'S THE POINT OF DECISION. MAJORITY VOTE RULES ON THAT. IT IS OUR JOB HERE TO EVALUATE, ALONG WITH YOUR JOB, TO EVALUATE THE PRIORITIES AND USEFULNESS OF THIS. AS PAGE 29 INDICATES WHAT IT MAY COST US TO HAVE THESE DRAWING FROM THE GENERAL FUND AS WELL. WE HAVE TO LOOK AT NOT ONLY WHAT IS OVERALL GOOD FOR THE COMMUNITY BUT ALSO HOW THESE INDIVIDUAL ITEMS PLAY A ROLE IN THAT. I THINK WE HAVE HAD YOUR INITIAL JUDGMENT ON IT AND THAT'S WHAT WE ARE LOOKING AT. WE NEED TO BE MOVING FORWARD ON IT. IF THEY ARE GOOD FOR THE COMMUNITY WE WILL PUT IT FORWARD TO THE CITIZENS TO VOTE ON. IT WILL BE THEIR DECISION TO ACCEPT IT OR NOT. IF WE COULD CONTINUE ON THE LINE OF GOING THROUGH THESE OTHERWISE WE WILL GET INTO THE PHILOSOPHICAL DISCUSSION ON THIS TOO VERY MUCH. I WILL ULTIMATELY BE MAKING SOME JUDGMENT CALLS AND TAKING SOME VOTES ON ADDS, DELETES, OR YES OR NO ON THIS. RIGHT NOW JUST EVALUATING THE INDIVIDUAL ITEMS IS WHAT WE SHOULD BE DOING. COUNCILMAN LITTLEFIELD.

[Time: 01:04:40]

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 16 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

Councilman Littlefield: THANKS FOR THE FINANCIAL ADVISE LINDA BUT I ALREADY HAVE THREE JOBS. THE CITY DOES NOT HAVE THE OPTION OF TAKING ANOTHER JOB AND I WOULD LIKE TO POINT OUT COUNCILWOMAN MILHAVEN IS CORRECT IN THE SENSE THAT THIS IS ABOUT WHAT TYPE OF CITY THE CITIZENS WANT AND WHAT THEY ARE WILLING TO PAY FOR. I THINK WE DO HAVE TO CONSIDER WHAT MESSAGE THE CITIZENS HAVE BEEN SENDING US FOR THE LAST COUPLE OF YEARS. THE MESSAGE THAT THEY HAVE BEEN SENDING US IS NOT THE OPTIMISTIC MESSAGE FOR PASSING \$240 MILLION BOND. THE LAST TWO ELECTIONS THE CITIZENS OF SCOTTSDALE TURNED DOWN OUR \$30 MILLION FLOOD CONTROL BOND IT TURNED DOWN BOTH SCOTTSDALE AND CAVE CREEK UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT AND TO TOP IT ALL OFF I GET A CALL FROM SOMEONE AT THE SCHOOL DISTRICT BOARD AND THEY SAID THEY ARE GOING TO PUT A \$200 MILLION PLUS BOND ISSUE ON THE NOVEMBER ELECTION. DOES ANYONE THINK THAT THEY PUT \$200 MILLION AND WE PUT \$240 MILLION ONE THAT BOTH ARE GOING TO PASS?

Mayor Lane: COUNCILMAN. I HEAR WHAT YOU ARE SAYING. RIGHT NOW WE ARE TYING TO EVALUATE THE RECOMMENDATIONS THAT WERE MADE BY THE TASK FORCE. THERE WILL BE AMPLE TIME FOR US TO DISCUSS THE VARIOUS COMPONENTS OF THE PHILOSOPHIES OR THE PSYCHOLOGIES OF THE VOTERS AND THE TAX PAYERS ON WHETHER OR NOT THIS HAPPENS AT ALL, IT HAPPENS IN PART, OR IT HAPPENS WITH ADDITIONAL ITEMS. THOSE ARE THINGS THAT WE WILL BE DISCUSSING AND TAKING ACTION ON. RIGHT NOW, IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO VOICE IT, JUST SAY THAT EVERY ITEM ON HERE IS NOT SOMETHING THAT IS WORTHY ON THE BALLOT IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO. THAT WOULD BE PART OF THE CONSENSUS OF NOT MOVING FORWARD ON THIS AND SEE HOW THE REST OF THE COUNCIL FEELS ABOUT IT THAT. THERE WILL BE AMPLE TIME TO DISCUSS THE WORTHINESS OF WHETHER OR NOT IT GETS ON THE BALLOT. RIGHT NOW I WOULD LIKE TO STICK TO THE EVALUATION OF THE RECOMMENDED ITEMS AND MAKING SURE WE ARE COMING TO SOME CONSENSUS ON THE WORTHINESS OF THE INDIVIDUAL ITEMS WE HAVE IN FRONT OF US. YEA OR NEA. AND THEY COULD ALL BE NEA IF YOU CHOOSE TO FEEL THAT WAY. IN ANY CASE IF WE COULD LETS PROCEED. I DON'T BELIEVE WE HAVE ANY FURTHER QUESTION ON THIS PARTICULAR ITEM.

QUESTION 2

[Time: 01:07:06]

Derek Earle: THANK YOU MAYOR. WE WILL TRY TO MOVE THROUGH THE FINAL THREE QUESTIONS FAIRLY QUICKLY. QUESTION TWO. PUBLIC SAFETY AND COURTS. THE MAJORITY OF THESE PROJECTS WERE PREVIOUS PURPOSED IN THE BOND PROGRAM. TWO NEW PROJECTS HAVE BEEN ADDED. A \$3.4 MILLION EXPANSION OF THE FIRE TRAINING FACILITY. CURRENTLY THEY ARE HOUSED IN TEMPORARY TRAILERS ON THE SITE. THIS WOULD GIVE THEM THE OPPORTUNITY TO REPLACE THOSE TRAILERS AND GIVE THEM INDOOR STORAGE OF EQUIPMENT. ITEM 12 PURCHASE OF LAND FOR FAR NORTH POLICE FACILITY. THIS WOULD ALLOW A POLICE PRESENCE IN THE FARTHEST NORTH PARTS OF THE CITY AND IMPROVE RESPONSIVENESS FOR POLICE IN THAT AREA. WITH THAT I WILL TURN TO THE TASK FORCE TO SEE IF THERE IS ANY COMMENTS ON THIS QUESTION.

Bill Heckman: WOULD ANYONE LIKE TO COMMENT? COMMISSIONER ECTON.

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 17 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

Wayne Ecton: I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE ONE COMMENT TO ANSWER COUNCILMAN ROBBINS QUESTION. PAGE 117 LISTS ALL THE OPERATING COSTS OF ALL THE PROJECTS THAT HAVE OPERATING COSTS WITH THEM. JUST TO PUT THAT ISSUE TO BED. THE OTHER THOUGHT I HAD IS AS WE TALK AND THINK ABOUT THESE PROJECTS SOME OF THEM MAY NOT BE FAMILIAR TO YOU. WHY THEY ARE NEED. I WOULD ENCOURAGE YOU TO VISIT THOSE FACILITIES AND THOSE PLACES TO GET YOUR GRASP OF HOW YOU FEEL ABOUT IT. THAT'S AN IMPORTANT THING TO DO. NOT DOING THESE PROJECTS NOW IS AN OPTION BUT IF WE WAIT TWO YEARS IT IS GOING TO COST 20% 30% MORE. SO DON'T FORGET THAT. THANK YOU.

BIII HECKMAN: ANY COMMENTS ON QUESTION TWO? I WILL THROW ONE IN. THE FIRST ITEM IS THE HIGHEST RANKED ITEM WE DID IN THE ENTIRE PROJECT OUT OF ALL FOUR QUESTIONS. WE HAVE TO BE ABLE TO COMMUNICATE AND TO COMMUNICATE NOT ONLY IN OUR SCOTTSDALE COMMUNITY BUT REGIONALLY FOR EMERGENCY PURPOSES BOTH FOR FIRE AND PUBLIC SAFETY. IT'S A SAD FACT THAT THE RADIO SYSTEM AT THE FIRE DEPARTMENT IS USING IS GOING THE BE OBSOLETE AND THE OTHER PART OF THIS IS THERE IS A FEDERAL MANDATE REQUIREMENTS TO HAVE THESE VALLEY WIDE AND REGIONAL RADIO SYSTEMS. UNFORTUNATELY WITH CURRENT FUNDING SOMETHING LIKE THIS COULD COME OUT OF THE GENERAL FUND. I THINK YOU HEARD LOUD AND CLEAR FROM TREASURER SMITH THAT THE MONEY IS NOT THERE. WE DON'T HAVE THOSE KINDS OF RESOURCES THAT WE USE TO HAVE. SPECIFICALLY A LOT OF PROJECTS THAT WE HAVE DONE SUCCESSFULLY IN THIS CITY WERE THE YEARS THAT PAYGO FUNDS IN OUR BUDGET WERE \$40 TO 50 MILLION A YEAR. TREASURER SMITH INDICATED THAT WE ARE DOWN IN THE \$1 TO 2 MILLION A YEAR IF THAT AND WE ARE HANGING ON. HOPEFULLY THINGS ARE IMPROVING BUT IT IS HIGHLY UNLIKELY WE GET BACK TO THOSE DAYS. THE BONDING IS OUR BEST TOOL TO MAINTAIN AND ENHANCE OUR COMMUNITY. WE WERE HAPPY TO HEAR THAT WE ARE VERY LOW IN OUR BONDING CAPACITY IN THE STATE TO WHAT WE ARE ALLOWED TO HAVE LITTLE OR NO IMPACT ON OUR BOND RATING. WE FELT VERY COMFORTABLE ON THE FINANCIALS IN TERMS OF THE SPECIFIC PROJECTS, DEPARTMENTS CAME TO USE WITH THEIR MOST PRESSING ISSUES AND WE CHALLENGED THEM ALL THE WAY DOWN THE LINE. THIS LISTING IS THE RESULT OF THAT. I COULDN'T IMAGE WHY WE WOULD NEED TO BUY LAND IN THE FAR NORTH FOR A POLICE FACILITY BUT WE WERE CONVINCED AS A TASK FORCE THAT DOING IT NOW WOULD SAVE US A LOT OF MONEY THAN DOING IT IN THE FUTURE. CLEARLY WE ARE GOING TO HAVE DEVELOPMENT IN THE NORTH THAT WILL REQUIRE A POLICE PRESENCE. TO HAVE FIRE DEPARTMENTS WORKING OUT OF TRAILERS WHEN WE NEED TO HAVE A FULL FUNCTIONING FACILITY IS CRAZY IN OUR COMMUNITY. THERE IS A LOT OF DETAIL THAT WENT INTO EACH OF THESE AND AS WE INDICATED EARLIER THERE IS A RANKING.

[Time: 01:12:33]

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU CHAIRMAN. I DO WANT TO RESPOND BUT THE CITY TREASURER HAS A COMMENT.

David Smith: I DON'T WANT TO CONTRADICT WHAT THE CHAIRMAN OF THE TASK FORCE HAS SAID BECAUSE IT WAS AN ELOQUENT DISCUSSION ON THE FINANCIALS. IN HIS URGENCY TO CONVEY HIS POINTS HE DID SAY THAT WE DO HAVE ONE OF THE LOWEST BOND CAPACITIES IN THE STATE. WHAT I THINK HE MEANT IS THAT WE HAVE ONE OF THE LOWEST TAX RATES FOR BOND SERVICE OF ANY COMMUNITY IN THE VALLEY. IT'S A FAIRLY DRAMATIC COMPARISON. IT'S EXTREMELY LOW IF YOU

TAKE OUT THE BONDING WE HAVE DONE FOR THE PRESERVE. TO CLARIFY THAT POINT WE HAVE A HIGH BONDING CAPACITY COUPLED WITH A LOW RATE.

Mayor Lane: FOLLOWING ON THAT POINT I UNDERSTAND WHY IT'S A HIGH PRIORITY. THE ORIGINAL OUTLAY OF \$22 MILLION FOR THIS SYSTEM THAT WE HAVE UPGRADED TO 800 MEGAHERTZ TO HAVE THE CAPABILITY FOR FIRE AND POLICE AND OTHER AGENCIES THROUGHOUT THE VALLEY IN ACCORDANCE WITH HOMELAND SECURITY IT CONTINUES TO DRAW DOWN ON GENERAL FUNDS. THIS AS YOU MENTIONED CHAIRMAN THIS IS PARTICULARLY ONEROUS BECAUSE IT WAS ANTICIPATED TO UPGRADE THE COMMUNICATION SYSTEM. ON TOP OF THAT A FEDERAL MANDATE SUBJECTS US TO A FINE THAT WOULD OUT WAY WHAT WE ARE TALKING ABOUT HERE. IT IS A PRIORITY ISSUE. I HAD A COUPLE OF OTHER QUESTIONS. ONE IS THE POLICE CIVIC CENTER JAIL CONSOLIDATION. IN THIS CONSOLIDATION BECAUSE OF THE LACK OF TRANSPORT AND THOSE ACCOMMODATIONS IN THOSE FACILITIES WE WERE GOING TO HAVE A SAVINGS AND AS I LOOK ON THE GENERAL FUND OPERATION COST VERSUS SAVINGS IT INDICATES AN ADDITION \$50,000 A YEAR IN COST. I WAS CURIOUS ABOUT THAT, I THOUGHT IT WAS GREATER EFFICIENCY THAT MIGHT HAVE REDUCED THE PERSONNEL OR OTHER COSTS ASSOCIATED WITH IT. I DON'T KNOW IF THAT WAS BROUGHT UP WITH THE COMMISSION OR NOT. THAT SURPRISED ME. MR. EARLE IS THERE ANY EXPLANATION FOR THAT. I KNOW IT IS ONLY \$50,000 A YEAR BUT I THOUGHT IT WAS GOING TO GO THE OTHER WAY.

Derek Earle: I WILL PASS IT TO BILL PEIFER TO ANSWER THAT QUESTION.

Senior Project Manager Bill Peifer: THAT IS A GOOD QUESTION. THERE IS A SAVINGS COMBINING THE TWO JAIL FACILITIES IN TERMS OF OPERATIONS. THE INCREASE IN OPERATION COSTS IS THE ADDITIONAL SQUARE FOOTAGE, ROUGHLY 4,000 SQ FT, THAT WOULD REQUIRE ADDITIONAL CLEANING AND FACILITY UPGRADES AND THAT'S THE OPERATIONAL COSTS. THERE IS A SAVINGS IN TERMS OF THE ACTUAL OPERATIONAL COSTS OVERALL BUT IT'S STILL OFFSET BY THE LARGE SQ FT THAT'S ADDED TO THE FACILITY.

Mayor Lane: THERE IS ACTUALLY A NET COST INCREASE?

Bill Peifer: YES

Mayor Lane: THE OTHER ONE THAT I WAS CONCERNED ABOUT THAT WOULD BE THE COURT REMODEL AND EXPANSION AT \$4.5 MILLION. I UNDERSTAND THAT THIS IS A PRODUCT OF A CONSULT'S REVIEW FOR 25-30 YEARS OUT OF WHAT WE MIGHT ANTICIPATE IN THE ADDITIONAL NEEDS AND REORGANIZATION OF OUR COURTS. WE CURRENTLY HAVE AN ENHANCEMENT FUND, A USER FEE, THE WAS A SUBSTANTIAL AMOUNT OF MONEY IN THERE FOR CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS ON THE BASIS OF THE USERS WHO USE OUR COURTS SYSTEM. APPROXIMATELY 65% OF PEOPLE WHO USE OUR COURTS SYSTEM ARE NOT SCOTTSDALIANS THEREFORE WE ARE PAYING FOR CRIMINALS WHO DON'T NECESSARILY LIVE HERE, WELL CRIMINALS AND INNOCENT PEOPLE TOO THAT ARE GOING THROUGH OUR COURTS SYSTEM. IN ANY CASE I WAS CONCERNED ABOUT THE FUNDS IN THAT ENHANCEMENT FUND. I UNDERSTAND THEY ARE NO BEING USED FOR PAYROLL TO GET AROUND THE BUDGET CUTS WE HAD IN THE PAST BUT THEY ARE BRINGING THEM BACK ONTO THE BUDGET THIS YEAR AND RELIEVE THIS ENHANCEMENT FUND. THAT'S A USER FEE OF \$15 PER DOCUMENT OR WHAT HAVE YOU ON A GUILTY VERDICT.

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 19 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

Dan Worth: AS I UNDERSTAND IT THERE ARE NINE POSITIONS THAT WERE FUNDED BY THE COURT ENHANCEMENT FUND SEVERAL YEARS AGO WITH THE UNDERSTANDING THAT IT WILL BE TEMPORARY AND TRANSFER THOSE POSITION BACK ONTO THE GENERAL FUND. THE COURTS FOR THE THIRD YEAR IN A ROW HAVE REQUESTED WE TRANSITION TWO OF THOSE POSITIONS BACK TO THE GENERAL FUND AT A SAVINGS FOR THE COURT ENHANCEMENT FUND JUST SHY OF \$200,000. WHICH WOULD COST \$200,000 TO THE GENERAL FUND. WE ARE LOOKING HARD TO ACCOMMODATE ALL THOSE OTHER THINGS THAT ARE ON THE PROPOSED LIST WITH THE \$400,000 WE HAVE TO PLAY WITH. THE REQUEST IS THERE, WHETHER OR NOT WE CAN FUND THAT MOVE OF THOSE POSITIONS BACK TO THE GENERAL FUND IS STILL AN OPEN QUESTION.

Mayor Lane: SINCE THERE IS A DRAW DOWN ON THAT ENHANCEMENT FUND OF \$1.2 MILLION WHERE IT IS ONLY STREAMING BACK AT \$800,000. EVEN A \$200,000 RELIEF OF THAT DRAWDOWN WOULD STILL PUT IT IN A NEGATIVE POSITION ON DRAWDOWN ON THOSE FUNDS. JUST A THOUGHT WHETHER OR NOT ANOTHER USER FUND FOR CAPITAL FUNDING REMODELING ISN'T SOMETHING WE SHOULD LOOK AT IN THE COURT SYSTEM RATHER THAN PUTTING THIS ON THE TAX PAYERS. I DON'T KNOW WHETHER THAT HAD BEEN CONSIDERED AT ALL. LAST ON THIS QUESTION THE PURCHASE OF LAND FOR THE NORTH POLICE FACILITY OF \$4.5 MILLION. ARE WE TALKING ABOUT A DISTRICT STATION? A FACILITY THAT MIRRORS MCKELLIPS?

Derek Earle: I WILL PASS IT BACK DOWN TO BILL PEIFER. AND CHIEF RODBELL IS AVAILABLE IF THERE ARE ANY SPECIFIC QUESTIONS ON THAT.

[Time: 01:20:58]

BIII Peifer: IT IS TO PURCHASE LAND APPROXIMATELY 10 ACRES. THAT LAND WOULD BE USED FOR A DISTRICT FACILITY. IT WOULDN'T BE LIKE WE HAVE IN THE SOUTH CORP YARD IT WOULD BE MORE SIMILAR TO THE PIMA JUST SOUTH OF THOMPSON PEAK PARKWAY.

Mayor Lane: I'M SORRY. IT WOULD BE SIMILAR TO THE FACILITY THAT IS JUST SOUTH OF THOMPSON PEAK PARKWAY AND PIMA?

BIII Peifer: RIGHT. THERE IS A FIRE STATION AND A POLICE DISTRICT THERE. DISTRICT FOUR.

Mayor Lane: RIGHT NOW WE ARE JUST TALKING ABOUT THE LAND.

Bill Peifer: YES.

Mayor Lane: THANKS FOR THAT CLARIFICATION. AND THANK YOU MR. PEIFER AND CHAIRMAN. COUNCILMAN PHILLIPS.

Councilmember Phillips: MAYOR YOU SAID EARLIER THAT WE ARE HERE TO EVALUATE THE RECOMMENDATIONS BY THE TASK FORCE AND I DON'T WANT TO CROSS THAT LINE SO I WOULD LIKE TO EVALUATE QUESTION 11 AND 12. I UNDERSTAND THAT YOU PEOPLE HAVE DONE AN EXCELLENT JOB AND I AM NOT QUESTIONING WHAT YOU ARE DOING. BUT HAVE YOU TALKED TO POLICE AND FIRE TO COMBINING THOSE TWO INTO ONE PURCHASE AND ONE AMOUNT FOR ONE FACILITY THAT THEY CAN BOTH SHARE. ANYBODY?

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 20 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

Derek Earle: THAT IS A POSSIBILITY ULTIMATELY TO COMBINE THESE. I BELIEVE THEY ARE IN THE SAME GENERAL VICINITY TOWARDS THE DESERT MOUNTAIN AREA THAT IS AN APPROPRIATE RECOMMENDATION FOR US TO CONSIDER.

Councilmember Phillips: THANK YOU JUST A THOUGHT

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN. COUNCILWOMAN MILHAVEN

Councilwoman Milhaven: ON THE FIRE STATIONS I KNOW IN OUR HISTORY WE HAVE BUILT SOME VERY MODEST FIRE STATIONS AND WE HAVE BUILT SOME EXTRAORDINARILY SPECTACULAR FIRE STATIONS. I KNOW IT WOULD BE DIFFICULT IN TODAY'S DOLLARS TO COMPARE THAT BUT COULD YOU SHARE WITH ME ON THE RANGE FROM MODEST TO SPECTACULAR WHAT KIND OF A FIRE STATION DO THOSE DOLLAR AMOUNT BUY US.

Derek Earle: THE ESTIMATE HERE IS SIMILAR TO FIRE STATION ONE THAT WE JUST OPENED. WE USED A SIMILAR BUDGET FOR IT. THIS WOULDN'T EQUATE TO THE LARGER FIRE STATION YOU SEE ON INDIAN SCHOOL ROAD.

Councilwoman Milhaven: IT'S NOT JUST ITS SIZE THAT DROVE ITS EXPENSE

Derek Earle: WE TARGET LEED GOLD CERTIFICATION AS PART OF THE CITY ORDINANCE IN ANY FACILITY THAT WE CONSTRUCT. THAT HAS A SMALL INCREMENT OF COST. IN THAT PARTICULAR CASE I BELIEVE FIRE STATION ONE HAD A COMMUNITY ROOM THAT COULD LEAD TO INCREASING THE SIZE OF THAT STATION.

Councilwoman Milhaven: SO IT'S NOT GOING TO LOOK LIKE THAT ONE?

Derek Earle: AS FAR AS ARCHITECTURAL TOUCHES

Councilwoman Milhaven: WELL, I MEAN IN RELATIVE SENSE I WOULD THINK WE WOULDN'T BUILD ANOTHER ONE LIKE THAT, IT'S A BEAUTIFUL BUILDING BUT WE HAD THE MONEY AT THE TIME AND WE NEED TO BE MORE PRUDENT NOW, SO I JUST WANT TO ENSURE THAT WE ARE BUILDING A FIRE HOUSE THAT IS GOING TO SERVE OUR PURPOSES AND NOT ANYTHING MORE THAN THAT. THANK YOU.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILWOMAN. COUNCILMAN LITTLEFIELD.

[Time: 01:24:35]

Councilman Littlefield: ON THE NORTH POLICE FACILITY, WHY DO WE NEED TEN ACRES? AT \$4.5 MILLION FOR TEN ACRES THAT'S \$450,000 AN ACRE THAT SEEMS LIKE A HIGH PRICE PER ACRE

Derek Earle: WE WORKED WITH THE CLIENT DEPARTMENT ON THIS. WE DON'T HAVE A BETTER HANDLE ON THE VALUE UP IN THAT AREA. WE WANT TO PROVIDE FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO BE FLEXIBLE IF WE HAVE TO BUY AN EXISTING COMMUNITY, BUY INTO A COMMERCIAL AREA, COMMERCIAL AREAS TEND TO BE EXPENSIVE. WE DON'T HAVE A SPECIFIC SITE IDENTIFIED SO WE

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 21 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

WANTED TO ALLOW FOR A SUFFICIENT BUDGET TO MAKE THAT PURCHASE. ANY BALANCE OF THIS THAT'S LEFT OVER ON THIS PROJECT WOULD BECOME PART OF THE BOND QUESTION ITSELF FOR PUBLIC SAFETY. TO ANSWER YOUR QUESTION, RESIDENTIAL LAND IS LESS EXPENSIVE COMMERCIAL LAND IS MORE EXPENSIVE AND FIRE STATIONS AND POLICE STATIONS TEND TO BE MORE COMMERCIAL LAND. THIS IS A BROAD ESTIMATE. THIS IS NOT SPECIFIC TO A SITE.

Councilman Littlefield: SO THIS IS JUST A PLACE HOLDER. YOU DON'T HAVE AN IDEA WHERE YOU WOULD ACTUALLY PUT IT.

Derek Earle: ONLY REGION. WE ARE TALKING NORTH SCOTTSDALE AREA. WE DON'T HAVE A SPECIFIC SITE FOR THIS.

Councilman Littlefield: OK

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN. I'M SORRY. I MIGHT HAVE MISSED IT BUT WHAT IS INTENDED ON TEN ACRES? THAT SEEMS LIKE A LARGE PIECE OF LAND. ANOTHER JAIL OR HOLDING AREA, SMALL COURT ROOM?

Derek Earle: I MAY WANT TO DEFER THIS TO THE CHIEF OR BILL.

BIII Peifer: THE IDEA OF THE TEN ACRES TO ALLOW SOME ABILITY TO HAVE OPEN SPACE NOT KNOWING IF WE WILL BE BUYING WITHIN A HILL SPACE NOT KNOWING THE EXACT LOCATION. IT'S A GUESS AT BEST WHETHER IT'S TEN. THE DC RANCH DISTRICT IS 4 OR 5 ACRES BUT IT IS ALSO ADJACENT TO A FIRE STATION. IT WOULD BE VERY SIMILAR TO THAT DISTRICT FACILITY THAT'S THERE. IT DOES HAVE SOME PARKING REQUIREMENTS AND FACILITY IT WOULD NOT INCLUDE A JAIL FACILITY AT THIS PROGRAMING POINT.

Mayor Lane: OK. THE BEST COMPARISON THAT WE HAVE RIGHT NOW WOULD BE COMPARABLE TO FOUR USABLE OR NEEDED ACRES? DOES THAT MEAN WE WOULD HAVE A 160,000 SQ FT BUILDING?

Bill Peifer: NO MAYOR. IT WOULD BE EQUIVALENT TO FIVE BUILDABLE ACRES. NOT KNOWING THE EXACT LOCATION OR HOW IT WILL FIT IN THE HILLSIDE RESTRICTIONS AS YOU GO FARTHER NORTH WE JUST ADDED ADDITIONAL PROPERTY TO ACCOMMODATE THAT.

Mayor Lane: THANKS FOR THE EXPLANATION AND THANK YOU COUNCILMAN LITTLEFIELD. LOOKS LIKE WE HAVE NO FURTHER QUESTIONS ON QUESTION 2.

QUESTION 3

[Time: 01:28:06]

Derek Earle: I WILL MOVE TO QUESTION 3 WHICH IS NEIGHBORHOOD FLOOD CONTROL. THE GOOD NEWS IS THERE WERE NO CHANGES ON THIS. WE DID UPDATE THE COST ON ONE OF THE PROJECTS THE GRANITE REEF WATERSHED TO REFLECT CURRENT ESTIMATES. YOU MAY RECALL ABOUT A WEEK AGO WHEN WE TALKED ABOUT THE CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM AND WE DISCUSSED SOME OF THE GENERAL FUND PROJECTS THAT ARE THERE. I BELIEVE COUNCILMAN PHILLIPS BROUGHT UP A

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 22 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

QUESTION CONCERNING SOME OF THE DRAINAGE PROJECTS. FOUR OF THESE PROJECTS ARE REFLECTED IN THE GENERAL FUND CIP AS WELL. WITH THAT I WILL THROW IT OVER TO THE CHAIRMAN IF THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS ON THIS OR COMMENTS.

BIII Heckman: ANYBODY LIKE TO COMMENT ON THEM? I WILL MAKE ONE BIG COMMENT. ONE OF THE BIG BENEFITS ESPECIALLY THE GRANITE REEF WATERSHED IT WILL BENEFIT ABOUT 1,200 PROPERTY OWNERS AND REWARD THEM WITH LOWER FLOOD INSURANCE REQUIREMENTS. ALL OF THESE ARE GOING TO HAVE A BENEFIT IN TERMS OF FLOOD CONTROL. I REALLY DON'T KNOW HOW MANY OF THESE CROSS OVER IN WHAT WAS PRESENTED IN BOND 2010 BUT THERE IS A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF MATCHING FUNDS THAT COME WITH THESE PIECES THAT ALL IN ALL ARE GOING TO BE WORTHWHILE TO PROTECT THE COMMUNITY AND BENEFIT THE RESIDENTS WITH THEIR FLOOD INSURANCE REQUIREMENT IF THEY ARE IN ONE OF THOSE FLOOD PLAIN ZONES.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU CHAIRMAN. FOR ONE POINT OF CLARIFICATION MR. EARLE I HAVE AN INDICATION THAT ITEMS 4-7 WHICH IS THE LOOP 101 DETENTION BASIN ARE ALL A PRODUCT OF REQUIREMENTS THAT WE HAVE WITH REGARDS TO OUR DRAINAGE AGREEMENTS WITH SOME THAT ARE ALREADY IN PLACE WITH MATCHING FUNDS. MAYBE I AM OFF ON A WRONG LINE ON THIS SO CORRECT ME IF I AM WRONG. IS THERE NOT SOME OPPORTUNITY TO WORK WITH THOSE MATCHING FUNDS AT THIS POINT IN TIME FOR A PRODUCT THAT WILL CREATE A HEALTHIER ENVIRONMENT AND REDUCE FLOOD INSURANCE COSTS?

Derek Earle: YES MAYOR. MOST OF THESE HAVE MATCHING FROM MARICOPA COUNTY FLOOD CONTROL DISTRICT. IN THE CASE OF GRANITE REEF WATERSHED PROJECT 1 WE ALSO HAVE A SIGNIFICANT INVESTMENT FROM THE SALT RIVER PIMA MARICOPA INDIAN COMMUNITY. THE REASON WHY THIS LOOKS LIKE A SMALL NUMBER THIS IS ACTUALLY NEARLY A \$50 MILLION PROJECT THIS REPRESENTS THE GENERAL FUND PORTION OF GRANITE REEF WATERSHED. THE BALANCE OF THIS PROJECT IS MUCH FIRMER KNOWN RELATIVE TO FLOOD CONTROL DISTRICT FUNDING AND THE INDIAN COMMUNITY. PROJECTS 3, 4, 6, 7 ARE THE PRODUCT OF OUR DEVELOPMENT AGREEMENT WITH THE STATE LAND DEPARTMENT ON CROSSROADS EASE AND THIS PROVIDE FOR REGIONAL DRAINAGE STRUCTURE FOR THAT FUTURE DEVELOPMENT AREA BOTH NORTH AND SOUTH OF THE LOOP 101. ALTHOUGH WE HAVE NOT SOUGHT MATCHING FUNDING FROM THE FLOOD CONTROL DISTRICT BECAUSE THESE ARE REGIONAL IMPROVEMENTS BUT THEY WILL BE SUITABLE FOR FLOOD DISTRICT CONTROL FUNDING. WE BELIEVE THEY WILL BE WILLING TO PARTICIPATE. IT IS NOT FAR ENOUGH IN ADVANCE TO SUBMIT TO THE FLOOD CONTROL DISTRICT FOR THEIR CAPITAL FUNDING.

Mayor Lane: SO RIGHT NOW THE \$28 MILLION ON THE SEVEN PROJECTS REALLY LEVERAGES TO A LARGER NUMBER. SOME OF IT IS QUANTIFIABLE SOME IS NOT BUT ELIGIBLE FOR APPLICATION TO THOSE FUNDS.

Derek Earle: MAYOR YOU ARE CORRECT. MOST OF THESE ARE ELIGIBLE FOR MATCHING FUNDING FORM THE FLOOD CONTROL DISTRICT. BECAUSE OF A LACK OF AVAILABLE FUNDING FROM SURROUNDING COMMUNITIES THEY HAVE BEEN MORE THAN WILLING TO NEGOTIATE VERY HIGH PARTICIPATION RATES SOMETIMES AS HIGH AS 70%. AGAIN JUST TO CLARIFY THE ONLY PROJECT THAT WE HAVE SPECIFICALLY DISCUSSED AND WE HAVE SPECIFIC COMMITMENTS ON IS THE GRANITE REF WATERSHED. WE HAVE HAD GENERAL DISCUSSIONS ON NUMBER 5 THE INDIAN BEND ROAD

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 23 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

DRAINAGE PROJECT. THEY ARE WILLING TO PARTICIPATE BUT WE HAVE TO TAKE IT ONE STEP FURTHER TO DESIGN A 30% DESIGN TO SUBMIT IT TO THE CIP FOR FLOOD CONTROL DISTRICT.

Mayor Lane: SO IT'S FAIR TO SAY THAT THIS AMOUNT LEVERAGES INTO KNOWN AMOUNTS OF MONEY THAT WOULD ALSO ADD TO THESE PROJECTS TO THE BENEFIT OF SCOTTSDALE.

Derek Earle: ABSOLUTELY

Mayor Lane: THERE IS ALSO AN ELEMENT APPLICABLE. THERE IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO APPLY FOR LEVERAGE FUNDS FROM OTHER SOURCES TO THE BENEFIT OF SCOTTSDALE.

Derek Earle: YES

Mayor Lane: THAT'S PRETTY MUCH ALL I WANTED ON THAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH ON THAT. COUNCILMAN PHILLIPS.

[Time: 01:33:30]

Councilmember Phillips: IN EVALUATING THE RECOMMENDATION MADE BY THE TASK FORCE, ON 3, 4, 6, 7 LOOKING FORWARD FOR THE COUNCIL'S OWN THOUGHT. THIS IS ON STATE TRUST LAND?

Derek Earle: THAT IS CORRECT.

Councilmember Phillips: I BELIEVE YOU SAID IN THE PAST THAT IT IS NOT NECESSARY AT THIS POINT. WE ARE NOT BEING MANDATED TO DO THIS AT THIS POINT?

Derek Earle: THAT IS CORRECT. ONE OF THESE PROJECTS IS ACTUALLY SOUTH OF THE STATE LAND PROJECTS. I DIDN'T WANT TO MISLEAD YOU. THE EAST UNION HILLS INTERCEPTOR CHANNEL IS NOT EXCLUSIVELY ONE STATE LAND. THAT DOES AFFECT PROPERTIES SOUTH OF THE LOOP 101.

Councilmember Phillips: SO 3,4, AND 7 COULD POSSIBLY BE REMOVED.

Derek Earle: 3,4, AND 7 ARE PROJECTS THAT WE HAVE OBLIGATIONS WITH THE STATE LAND DEPARTMENT BUT THEY ARE NOT IMMEDIATE AS IN THEY HAVE TO BE RESOLVED TOMORROW.

Councilmember Phillips: THANK YOU.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN. COUNCILMAN ROBBINS.

Councilman Robbins: WHAT HAPPENS IF WE APPROVE THIS AND WE APPLY FOR HELP FROM THE FLOOD CONTROL DISTRICT, SO 3, 4, 6, AND 7 ARE REGIONAL IN NATURE AND WE GET MATCHING FUNDS. WHAT HAPPENS TO THAT BONDING CAPACITY? 3,4,6 AND 7 IS ABOUT \$20 MILLION LETS SAY WE GET ANOTHER TEN FROM THE FLOOD CONTROL DISTRICT. WHAT HAPPENED TO THAT OTHER \$10 MILLION THAT THE CITIZENS HAVE AUTHORIZED DO WE SPEND IT ON SOMETHING ELSE OR DO WE NOT SPEND IT? DO WE SAVE \$10 MILLION ON THIS WHOLE BOND?

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 24 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

Derek Earle: THAT WOULD BE AT THE DIRECTION OF THE COUNCIL AT THAT POINT. A LOT OF IT DEPENDS ON HOW THE ELECTION QUESTIONS THEMSELVES ARE ACTUALLY STRUCTURED. WITH BOND 2000 WE HAD A CITIZEN'S BOND COMMITTEE THAT TRACKED THE EXPENDITURES ON A REGULAR BASIS OF BOND 2000. WHERE WE HAD PROJECTS THAT WERE LATER NO LONGER FEASIBLE OR CAME UNDER BUDGET OR HAD OTHER CHANGES THAT WERE NECESSARY THE CITIZENS BOND REVIEW COMMISSION WOULD MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE CITY COUNCIL TO REALLOCATE THOSE FUNDS WITHIN THE ORIGINAL INTENT OF THE QUESTION. FOR EXAMPLE PUBLIC SAFETY FUNDS WOULD NOT BE MOVED TO A TRANSPORTATION PROJECT. WITHIN THE ORIGINAL INTENT OF THE BOND QUESTION AND HOW IT IS PHRASED TO THE VOTERS IT IS THIS COUNCIL'S CHOICE TO MOVE THOSE FUNDS AT A LATER DATE IF THAT IS CASE. AGAIN THAT'S THE WAY THE BONDS ARE ISSUED AND THE WAY THE ELECTION QUESTIONS WERE STRUCTURED.

Councilman Robbins: WHO IS MONITORING THAT, THE WAY THE ELECTION QUESTIONS ARE STRUCTURED BECAUSE CAVE CREEK SCHOOL DISTRICT GOT INTO A PROBLEM WITH ONE OF THEIR BONDS WERE THEY ALLOCATED IT FOR SOME PURPOSE AND IT CAME UNDER BUDGET SO THEY TRIED TO REALLOCATE IT AND THEY GOT SUED BY THE GOLDWATER INSTITUTE. OBVIOUSLY I DON'T WANT THAT TO HAPPEN WITH SOMETHING THAT WE ARE DOING HERE. HOW DO WE ANTICIPATE THAT ISSUE AND AVOID THAT?

Derek Earle: COUNCIL MAY WANT TO CONSIDER AT THE TIME PERHAPS TO CONSIDER ANOTHER COMMISSION TO TRACK THE EXPENDITURES, VERY SIMILAR TO WHAT WE DID WITH BOND 2000 WHICH IS A CITIZENS BOND COMMISSION TO TRACK THOSE EXPENDITURES. AS FAR AS THE ELECTION QUESTIONS THEMSELVES ARE STRUCTURED THOSE WILL BE REVIEWED BY BOND COUNCIL SO WE ARE COMPLIANT WITH ALL STATE, LOCAL, AND FEDERAL LAWS ESPECIALLY AS FAR AS THE TAX TREATMENTS ON THE BONDS ARE CONCERNED. IT IS VERY CRITICAL THAT WE PRESERVE THE TAX EXEMPT NATURE OF THE BONDS. WE DO HAVE TO BE VERY SPECIFIC ON HOW THOSE BONDS GO ALL THE WAY THROUGH THE PROCESS FROM STRUCTURE OF QUESTIONS ALL THE WAY THROUGH HOW THEY ARE ISSUED. IT WOULD BE COUNCIL'S CHOICE AT A LATER DATE IF THEY CHOOSE TO PUT SOME TYPE OF COMMISSION TO MONITOR THE EXPENDITURES TO BE SURE WE ARE IN COMPLIANCE.

Councilman Robbins: I WILL ASK MR. WASHBURN, HE IS SUGGESTING THE WAY WE STAY IN COMPLIANCE IS WE APPOINT A CITIZENS TASK FORCE TO REVIEW OUR EXPENDITURES BUT IT WOULD SEEM LIKE WE WOULD HAVE TO MAKE SURE THE QUESTIONS ARE STRUCTURED CORRECTLY IN THE BEGINNING TO AVOID ANY PROBLEMS LATER ON. WHO IS MONITORING THAT AND HOW DO WE MAKE SURE THAT IS HAPPENING?

City Attorney Bruce Washburn: IT'S A COMBINATION OF THE STEPS TO WHICH MR. EARLE REFERRED. THE BOND COUNCIL THE WORDING OF THE QUESTIONS IN SUCH A WAY THE VOTERS APPROVE THE EXPENDITURE OF FUNDS. THE COMMITTEE OR THE TASK FORCE IS THERE TO MONITOR AND MAKE SURE THAT WE ARE IN COMPLIANCE WITH WHAT THE VOTERS APPROVED. THE CRUCIAL MATTER IS GETTING THE VOTER APPROVAL IN THE FIRST PLACE AND THEN IT IS A QUESTION IN MAKING SURE THAT WE COMPLY WITH WHAT THEY APPROVED. DOES THAT ANSWER YOUR QUESTION?

Councilman Robbins: ALMOST. IF THE QUESTIONS GO TO VOTERS THE COUNCIL'S DECISION OF WHAT THE QUESTIONS SHOULD BE IS THE BEGINNING OF THAT. WE DECIDE WHAT THE QUESTIONS ARE GOING TO SAY.

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 25 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

Bruce Washburn: YES. I WOULD ADVISE YOU TO WORK IN CLOSE CONJUNCTION WITH BOND COUNCIL TO MAKE THE WORDING COVERS WHAT YOU WANT TO ACHIEVE.

Councilman Robbins: I GUESS MY QUESTION IS THERE ARE A LOT OF PROPOSITIONS AND INITIATIVES THAT GO THROUGH THE COUNTY ELECTIONS DEPARTMENT OR THE STATE AND THEY GET CHANGED AND PEOPLE DON'T LIKE THEIR WORDING. THERE IS A LOT OF THINGS THAT HAPPEN AT THE SCHOOL BOARD LEVEL WHERE BONDS ARE RUN THROUGH THE CYCLE OF THE ELECTIONS DEPARTMENT AND THEY DON'T LIKE THE WAY THINGS ARE WORDED. THINGS FAIL BECAUSE OF THE WAY THEY ARE WORDED. DOES ANYONE HAVE ANY OVERSIGHT TO HOW WE WORD OUR BOND QUESTIONS?

Bruce Washburn: THE ULTIMATE RESPONSIBILITY AND AUTHORITY FOR THE WORDING OF THE BOND QUESTIONS LIES WITH THE COUNCIL.

Councilman Robbins: THANK YOU.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN AND THANK YOU MR. WASHBURN. MR. SMITH DID YOU WANT TO WEIGH IN ON THIS.

David Smith: ACTUALLY I WAS GOING TO HAVE LEE GUILLORY THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE WEIGH IN ON THIS. THERE IS AN ONGOING OVERSIGHT THAT WE HAVE ON THE EXPENDITURES AS WE MONITOR ON BEHALF OF THE BOND HOLDERS.

Finance Director Lee Guillory: I JUST WANTED TO CLARIFY THAT YOU DO HAVE POST ISSUANCE BOND COMPLIANCE PROCEDURES THAT YOU APPROVED OVER A YEAR AGO THAT GIVES THE RESPONSIBILITY TO THE TREASURERS OFFICE TO TRACK THESE EXPENDITURES AND MAKE SURE THAT THEY FALL WITHIN THE QUESTION AND THE CATEGORIES AS THEY WERE OUTLINED. AS IT HAS BEEN MENTIONED HERE EARLIER IT IS HOW THE QUESTION IS WORDED THAT ALLOWS YOU WHAT TYPES OF PROJECTS ARE ALLOWED TO USE THE BOND PROCEEDS BUT WE DO TRACK IT IN THE TREASURERS OFFICE.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU VERY MUCH ON THAT. LOOKS LIKE THAT IS THE LAST OF THE QUESTIONS THAT WE HAVE ON COUNCIL ON QUESTION 3.

QUESTION 4

[Time: 01:40:42]

Derek Earle: QUESTION 4 TRANSPORTATION AND STREETS. THE LARGEST QUESTION AT \$108.9 MILLION 16 PROJECTS. KNOWING THAT WE ARE GETTING LONG ON TIME I WILL NOT GO THROUGH THE SPECIFIC PROJECTS ON THIS BUT WE CAN ANSWER THOSE QUESTIONS. WITH THAT I WILL HAND IT OVER TO THE CHAIRMAN FOR ANY COMMENTS FROM THE TASK FORCE.

Bill Heckman: COMMISSIONS. COMMISSION QUALE

Teresa Quale: I JUST WANTED TO COMMENT ON THE ONE THAT I THINK GOT THE MOST ATTENTION BY THOSE OF US ON THE COMMISSION WHICH IS NUMBER 3 NORTHEAST DOWNTOWN PUBLIC

PARKING STRUCTURE. I MENTION IT BECAUSE IT HAPPENS TO BE IN THE ENTERTAINMENT DISTRICT WHICH TENDS TO GET A LOT OF PUBLICITY. THIS IS ONE OF THE PLACES I FELT THAT THE BUSINESS OWNERS PARTICULARLY THE SMALL BUSINESS OWNERS IN THE OFFICE BUILDINGS IN THAT AREA REALLY SHOWED UP AT OUR MEETING AND TALKED A GREAT LENGTH ABOUT THEIR EMPLOYEES AND THEIR VISITORS. SEEING PEOPLE MOVE OUT OF THEIR BUILDINGS BECAUSE DURING THE DAY THERE WAS NO PLACE TO PARK. THERE IS PUBLIC PARKING THAT WAS FUNDED BY THE CITY THAT WAS PUT INTO THE THREE QUADRANTS OF DOWNTOWN. THEY MADE A VERY COMPELLING ARGUMENT. THAT'S ONE THAT I WANTED TO COMMENT ON AND WHY IT'S THERE. PEOPLE LIKE YELP THAT WE HAVE IN THAT AREA THAT ARE CURRENTLY EMPLOYING PEOPLE AND THE NUMBER OF APARTMENTS THAT ARE IN THAT AREA. THE BUSINESS THAT ARE THERE ARE FEELING SQUEEZED OUT AND IF WE WANT THAT TO STAY AS A VIABLE ECONOMIC AREA FOR THE CITY. I THINK PUTTING A PARKING GARAGE THERE MAKES SENSE FOR THOSE REASONS.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU. TO THAT PARTICULAR POINT, IT DRAWS ATTENTION AND WITH THE CHANGES IN THE AREA THERE IS SOME INDICATION FOR RESPONSIBILITY FOR THOSE CHANGES IN THE PARKING SITUATION AS IT IS MORE INTENSE USE AS SOME OF THE FACILITIES THAT WERE INITIALLY RETAIL THAT WENT TO OFFICE AND MORE COMPRESSED OFFICE. IN OTHER AREAS WERE SMALL OFFICES WENT TO INTENSE RETAIL APPLICATION WITH THE BARS AND RESTAURANTS. THERE HAS ALWAYS BEEN THE SWAY BETWEEN NIGHTTIME ACTIVITIES AND DAYTIME ACTIVITIES. WHEN WE ENDED UP WITH THIS SITUATION OF A DAYTIME ISSUE IT POINTED TO SOME GOOD THINGS. SOME OF THOSE SAME FACILITIES WERE ACTIVE IN THE DAYTIME AS WELL AND COMPETITION FOR THAT PARKING SPACE. THE QUESTION THAT I HAVE I DON'T KNOW THIS MIGHT BE A CHANGE IN POLICY. WHAT WE HAVE IN DOWNTOWN FOR THE YEARS WE HAD FREE PARKING. THE REASON WE HAD FREE PARKING WAS BECAUSE THE MERCHANTS IN THE AREA BY VIRTUE OF FEES THEY PAID FOR IN LIEU PARKING. IF THEY DID NOT HAVE SPACE WITHIN THEIR PROPERTY AND THEY WANTED TO FACILITATE THE NEEDS THAT WERE REQUIRED BY THE CITY THEY NEEDED TO HAVE SUFFICIENT PARKING THEY NEEDED TO HAVE THOSE IN LIEU FEES. WE HAVE ASSEMBLED THOSE MONIES AND HAVE FINANCED AND BUILT PARKING GARAGES IN CONJUNCTION WITH ANOTHER PARTNER WHO IS BUILDING A BUILDING BUT WE PAID FOR THE PUBLIC PARKING TO BE A COMPONENT OF IT. AS FAR AS I KNOW THAT HAS BEEN OUR POLICY IN THE PAST. I CAN'T GO BACK FAR ENOUGH BUT I THINK ABOUT THE FIRST PARKING GARAGE THAT I AM AWARE OF AND THAT'S BEHIND THE CENTER FOR PERFORMING ARTS. I MEAN MODIFIED PARKING GARAGE NOT JUST PARKING LOT. I BELIEVE THAT TOO WAS FUNDED THROUGH THE MERCHANTS AND THROUGH THOSE FUNDS. BUT I DON'T KNOW THAT I DON'T KNOW WHETHER THIS IS A CHANGE OF POLICY. THAT'S THE FIRST THING. WHETHER OR NOT THE MERCHANTS, THE USERS OF THAT AREA THAT ARE DEPENDENT UPON IT, HAVE IN THE PAST PAID FOR THAT. IT IS SUGGESTED HERE TO FOR THE TAX PAYERS TO SUPPORT AND I THINK THIS IS A DEPARTURE. IF SOMEONE CAN TELL ME IF WE HAVE DONE THIS.

[Time: 01:45:00]

Dan Worth: MAYOR I CAN'T GO ALL THE WAY TO THE PARKING GARAGE THAT YOU REFERRED TO NEXT TO THE LIBRARY BUT THE LAST TWO MAJOR GARAGE STRUCTURES THAT WE BUILT BOTH WITHIN THE LAST EIGHT YEARS THAT I HAVE BEEN HERE. THE ONE BETWEEN 3^{RD} AND 5^{TH} AVENUE AND THE ONE AT 2^{ND} AND BROWN A TOTAL OF ABOUT \$10 MILLION. ABOUT 1 MILLION CAME FROM PARKING IN LIEU FEES FROM BUSINESSES ACROSS THE DOWNTOWN AREAS THAT ARE CLOSE TO THOSE GARAGES AND

AREAS THAT ARE NOT. THE BULK OF THE MONEY CAME FROM A COMBINATION FROM GENERAL FUND WHICH IS SUPPORTED BY CITIZENS ACROSS THE CITY AND TRANSPORTATION SALES TAX FUNDING.

Mayor Lane: VERY GOOD. I KNOW THAT IN CERTAIN CIRCUMSTANCES LIKE THE SOUTHBANK FACILITY WE CONTRIBUTED TO HAVE A CERTAIN NUMBER OF PUBLIC PARKING SPACES THOSE CAME FROM THE SAME FUNDS. WHAT I GUESS I HEAR YOU SAYING THAT THIS IS A LITTLE BIT OF A CHANGE OF POLICY IF IN FACT A GENERAL OBLIGATION BOND HAS NOT BEEN USED IN THE PAST. IT HAS EITHER COME FROM THE GENERAL FUND OR ANY SOURCES THAT THE TAXPAYERS ARE PAYING INTO OR THE TRANSPORTATION FUND WHICH WE KNOW HAVE BEEN SAPPED RATHER SUBSTANTIALLY I AM SURE THERE IS NOT MUCH ROOM IN THERE AT THE PRESENT TIME. OR FROM GENERAL FUNDS COMING FROM THE CIP THERE WERE EXCESS CIP FUNDS PRESUMING THERE WAS SOME ALLOCATION FROM THAT AS WELL. I AM ONLY CONCERNED THAT WE MAY BE REPRESENTING A DEPARTURE AND THAT IT IS A SUBSIDY TO AN AREA THAT HAS DONE EXCEEDINGLY WELL BUT IT HAS CREATED A SITUATION WHERE THERE IS ADDITIONAL NEED. WITH THAT THAT WAS MY ONLY QUESTION REALLY. COUNCILWOMAN KORTE.

Councilmember Korte: REGARDING THE DOWNTOWN PUBLIC PARKING HAVING FOLLOWED THE BOND TASK FORCE WORK FOR THE LAST TWO YEARS I KNOW THAT THE DOWNTOWN PUBLIC PARKING ORIGINALLY IN PHASE ONE OF THE BOND TASK FORCE LOOKED AT AS A POTENTIAL IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT BORN BY THE AREA AND CREATE AN IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT THERE. WHAT CHANGED THE BOND TASK FORCE'S MIND AND PLACED IT INTO THE BOND?

BIII Heckman: I WILL TRY TO RESPOND TO THAT. I WAS INITIALLY OF THE OPINION THAT THE BENEFICIARIES OF THE GARAGE SHOULD BE THE PRIMARY PEOPLE PAYING FOR THE GARAGE. IT ONLY MADE SENSE. WHEN I BECAME MORE KNOWLEDGEABLE ABOUT IN LIEU PARKING THAT FACT THAT THIS QUALIFIES AS A BOND PROJECT AND THE NEED IS VERY CLEAR. THE BUSINESS OWNERS DAY AND EVENING CAME FORWARD AND THEY INDICATED THAT THIS IS GOING TO SOLVE A VERY BIG PROBLEM IF NOT COMPLETELY AS LEAST SUBSTANTIALLY HELP BY PROVIDING THESE ADDITIONAL PARKING SPACES. I WENT ALONG WITHIN THE REALITY OF THE IN LIEU PARKING, THE FACT THAT IT IS A BONDABLE PROJECT AND THE NEED IS WITHOUT QUESTION IN MY MIND THAT IT WAS WORTHY OF BEING INCLUDED ON THIS PARTICULAR LIST.

Teresa Quale: I REMEMBER THAT WE WERE TOLD IT WASN'T REALISTIC TO SAY THAT IT COULD BE AN IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT. THE EXTRA NINE MILLION THAT PAID FOR SOME OF THE OTHER CAME FROM PAYGO FUNDS WHICH DON'T EXIST ANYMORE. BASED ON THE FINANCIAL PART OF IT, IT SEEMED LIKE BONDING WAS THE RIGHT WAY TO GO.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILWOMAN. COUNCILMAN PHILLIPS

[Time: 01:49:21]

Councilmember Phillips: I WILL PUT IN MY TWO SENSE WORTH TOO. QUESTION FOUR SEEMS TO BE LIKE THE MOST OBJECTIVE OF THE QUESTIONS. I DON'T UNDERSTAND THE THOUGHT PROCESS ON THIS. THINGS OF COURSE THAT I THINK ARE BETTER WOULD HAVE BEEN NUMBER ONE AND THINGS THAT YOU THOUGHT WERE NUMBER ONE I THINK WOULD HAVE BEEN NUMBER TEN. I AM HAVING A HARD TIME TRYING TO FIGURE OUT WHAT THE THOUGHT PROCESS WAS HERE OF DIFFERENT THINGS.

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 28 OF 70 FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION

CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

I WOULD RATHER HAVE THE THOMPSON PEAK PARKWAY BRIDGE AND THAT WAS THE LAST ONE. PEOPLE HAVE BEEN WAITING FOR THAT ONE FOR A LONG TIME. THE DOWNTOWN PUBLIC PARKING ALONG WITH WHAT THEY ARE TALKING ABOUT PEOPLE WILL HAVE A HARD TIME SWALLOWING THAT PUTTING THAT ON THEIR PROPERTY TAX TO PAY FOR SOMETHING THEY FEEL THAT THE CITY CREATED WITH THIS PROBLEM AND NOW THEY WANT THE PEOPLE TO PAY TO FIX IT. I AM NOT SAYING THAT WE DON'T NEED A PARKING GARAGE BUT IT MIGHT BE A HARD ONE FOR THE PUBLIC TO SWALLOW. I THINK WE WILL HAVE TO BE CAREFUL HOW WE WORD THAT ONE. MAYBE THE WAY THAT THAT IS GOING TO BE WORDED MAY INCLUDE SOMETHING ABOUT IN LIEU PARKING FEES WILL HELP PAY FOR IT SO PEOPLE DON'T FEEL LIKE WE ARE TAKING THE WHOLE BURDEN OF THIS THING. LEADING IN THAT DIRECTION. IF ANYONE CAN SPEAK TO ME ON HOW YOU CAME ACROSS THE ORDER OF THESE THINGS AS FAR AS WHICH ONE YOU THING IS BETTER. THE TRAFFIC SIGNAL CONTROLLER IS SOMETHING THAT HAS TO BE DONE. BRIDGE SAFETY UPGRADE REHABILITATION ON THOMPSON PEAK PARKWAY COULD BE INCLUDED ON IT. IT JUST DOESN'T MAKE A LOT OF SENSE TO ME.

BIII Heckman: COUNCILMAN PHILLIPS. THE ORDER IS REALLY A FUNCTION NOT WITHIN THE QUESTION BUT IT IS FROM NUMBER ONE PROJECT TO 45 AND THERE WERE FIVE THAT WERE DEFERRED AND ONE THAT WAS KICKED BACK TO YOU GUYS THE DESERT DISCOVERY CENTER. IT DIDN'T REALLY FOLLOW THAT KIND OF LOGIC. ONCE WE STRUCTURED THE QUESTIONS THEY WERE PLACED IN THE ORDER OF HOW THEY RANKED AGAINST ALL PROJECTS.

Councilmember Phillips: I THOUGHT YOU SAID EARLIER THAT IT WAS THE OTHER WAY AROUND. EACH QUESTION WAS RANKED IN THEIR ORDER TOO.

Derek Earle: YOU ARE ACTUALLY BOTH CORRECT. WHEN THE PROJECTS WERE PULLED OUT THEY INITIALLY RANKED AN ENTIRE LIST OF 46 PROJECTS FROM 1 TO 46. WHEN THEY PULLED THOSE QUESTIONS OUT THEIR RELATIVE RANKING WAS STILL PULLED IN. FOR EXAMPLE THE TRAFFIC SIGNAL CONTROLLER CABINET IT WASN'T RANKED NUMBER ONE ON THE ENTIRE LIST BUT IT WAS IN THE TOP THREE OR FOUR. YOU ARE BOTH CORRECT IN THAT IT WAS PULLED OUT OF THE MASTER LIST INTO THE QUESTIONS IN THE ORDER OF PRIORITY THAT THEY WERE IDENTIFIED AS.

Councilmember Phillips: OK. I GUESS THAT IS SOMETHING WE WILL GET TO LATER. THANK YOU.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN. I WOULD PREFER TO THINK I SUPPOSE THE LEVEL OF SUCCESS PARTICULARLY ON THE DAYTIME SIDE OF IT WOULD ADDITIONAL NEED FOR THE PARKING. I THINK THAT IS HOW WE MANAGE THE CITY THAT IS HOW THINGS HAVE TO BE DEVELOPED ONE WAY OR THE OTHER. THE BIGGEST QUESTION HERE IS WHETHER OR NOT THIS IS A CHANGE IN POLICY. I THINK THAT HAS BEEN ADDRESSED AT LEAST TO A DEGREE. THE OTHER IS I DON'T KNOW WHAT THE SPECIFIC SITUATION IS IF THERE ARE IN LIEU PARKING ACCOUNTS. I UNDERSTOOD THAT THERE WAS \$1 MILLION IN THERE AND THERE IS A REVENUE STREAM. I DON'T KNOW IF THAT HAS BEEN ASSESSED AS A STARTING POINT OR WHETHER OR NOT SOME ADDITIONAL ASSESSMENT WOULD BE CONSIDERED IN A DISTRICT FORM TO SUPPLEMENT THAT AS A REVENUE STREAM. I THINK THERE WILL ALWAYS BE SOME PUSHBACK ON THIS. MOST OF THOSE MERCHANTS IN THAT AREA HAVE ALREADY COMPLIED WITH THEIR PARKING REQUIREMENTS AND THAT'S WHERE WE GET INTO THAT MIX BUT I DON'T KNOW IF STAFF CAN GIVE US ANY KIND OF FEEL AS TO WHERE THE IN LIEU PARKING ACCOUNT IS AND IF IT IS ASSESSABLE ON SOMETHING LIKE THIS.

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 29 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

Dan Worth: THE LATEST WORD THAT I GOT WAS THAT THE BALANCE IN LIEU ACCOUNT IS \$154,000

Mayor Lane: WHAT DID THEY DO WITH THAT OTHER \$900,000?

Dan Worth: IT WENT INTO THOSE TWO PARKING GARAGES THAT I MENTIONED EARLIER.

Mayor Lane: ISN'T THERE A REVENUE STREAM AS WELL FROM THE LEASES?

Dan Worth: WE ARE ANTICIPATED \$17,000 OF REVENUE THIS YEAR. THAT IS ABOUT ONE PARKING

SPOT

Mayor Lane: IF THERE WAS A CHANGE TO GO BACK TO THE ASSESSMENT THERE WOULD BE A NEW

ASSESSMENT IN THE DISTRICT

Dan Worth: THAT REVENUE STREAM AS IT IS CURRENTLY CONSTITUTED DOESN'T DO MUCH FOR US

Mayor Lane: YET THIS IS THE ONLY AREA OTHER THAN PARKING LOTS THAT THE CITY OWNS IN THE

AREA. THIS IS THE ONLY AREA THAT DOES NOT RECEIVED A PARKING GARAGE

Dan Worth: UNLESS YOU COUNT THE PART OF PUBLIC PARKING THAT'S PART OF THE GALLERIA

Mayor Lane: OK. THANK YOU. COUNCILMAN LITTLEFIELD

[Time: 01:54:50]

Councilman Littlefield: I WOULD DISAGREE THAT THE PARKING GARAGE IS NOT AN APPROPRIATE PROJECT FOR AN IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT. IN FACT IT IS EXACTLY AN APPROPRIATE PROJECT FOR THE IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT BECAUSE THE BENEFICIARIES CAN BE SPECIFICALLY IDENTIFIED AS OPPOSED TO A GENERAL BENEFIT. WE CAN TELL WHO WOULD BENEFIT FROM THIS PARKING GARAGE. AN IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT MAKES QUITE A BIT OF SENSE HERE.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN. COUNCILMAN ROBBINS

Councilman Robbins: I WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK TO THE PARKING GARAGE AS WELL. I WAS INTERESTED IN THIS WHEN YOU FINISHED UP YOUR BOND 2000 DISCUSSION I ASKED THAT IT BE ADDED ON. I WAS PLEASED TO SEE THE HIGH RANKING. EVERYONE HAS TALKED ABOUT THE NEED AND CERTAINLY DOWNTOWN BUSINESS DURING THE DAY HAVE A STARK NEED FOR THIS. IT'S AN ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT ISSUE. IT'S A SMALL BUSINESS SURVIVAL ISSUE. AT LEAST TWO OF THE GARAGES THAT MR. WORTH HAD MENTIONED HAD BEEN PAID FOR THROUGH SALES TAXES THAT WE ALL HAVE PAID SO HERE IS WILL BE PAID FOR BY PROPERTY TAXES THAT WE ALL PAY. I THINK THEY ARE VERY SIMILAR AND THE POLICY IS A GOOD ONE AND THE OTHER THREE QUADRANTS HAVE GARAGES SO I THINK THIS IS A GREAT NEED THAT WE CAN FULFILL THROUGH THIS PROCESS. IT WOULD HELP OUT THAT AREA TREMENDOUSLY AND I AM VERY IN FAVOR OF IT.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN. COUNCILWOMAN KORTE

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 30 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

Councilmember Korte: I WOULD LIKE TO STOP PICKING ON THE PARKING GARAGE AND MOVE ON TO ITEM 9. THE LOOP 101 ACCESS IMPROVEMENTS. IT'S MORE OF A QUESTION. I KNOW THERE HAS BEEN SOME CONCERN EXPRESSED BY SOME BUSINESS OWNERS WITHIN THAT AREA AROUND IMPROVEMENTS TO THE FREEWAY AND CHANGES TO THE FREEWAY IS THAT WHAT THAT'S ABOUT?

Derek Earle: YES THIS IS ABOUT RECONFIGURATION OF THE INTERCHANGES FROM FRANK LLOYD WRIGHT TO BELL ROAD AND THE PRINCESS ROAD AREA. IT IS A NEW CONCEPT CALLED THE DIVERGENT DIAMOND INTERCHANGE.

Councilmember Korte: WAS THE BOND TASK FORCE APPROACHED BY ANY OF THE BUSINESS OWNERS IN THE AREA AND THEIR CONCERN REGARDING THIS NEW DESIGN AND LACK OF ACCESS TO THEIR BUSINESSES?

Bill Heckman: NO I THINK ADVANCING THIS PROJECT IN LIGHT OF THE TRAFFIC CONDITIONS UP THERE IS A VERY GOOD IDEA.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILWOMAN. JUST SO IT IS PERFECTLY CLEAR THAT \$11 MILLION IS THE COST TO THE CITY TO ADVANCE THEIR REGIONAL SALES TAX UNDER PROP 400 TO FUND FOR THIS IN ADVANCE. IT IS STRICTLY AN INTEREST KIND OF PAYMENT FOR THAT OPTION.

Derek Earle: THAT IS CORRECT MAYOR.

Mayor Lane: WELL WITH THAT I SEE WE DON'T HAVE ANY OTHER COMMENTS ON THE QUESTIONS.

BIII HECKMAN: ON THE TRANSPORTATION I THINK THESE ARE SOME OF THE BEST PROJECTS IN THE WHOLE PROPOSAL. I WILL TALK TO JUST A COUPLE OF THEM. THE TRAFFIC SIGNAL CONTROLLER CABINET SOUNDS VERY TECHNICAL BUT WHAT IT IS GOING TO DO IS ALLOW US TO INDIVIDUALLY CONTROL EACH OF THE 300 TRAFFIC SIGNALS IN THE CITY. WE CAN'T BUILD MORE ROADS. WE CAN'T WIDEN MORE ROADS. WE CAN MAINTAIN ROADS. IF THIS MAKES THE TRAFFIC FLOW MORE SMOOTHLY AS MANY OTHER CITIES CAN ALREADY DO. IN MY TRAVELS YOU WOULD HEAR ABOUT THE SMART TRAFFIC SIGNALS. THIS IS A WAY TO MOVE TRAFFIC THAT IS THE MOST PROACTIVE THING WE CAN DO IN THE COMMUNITY. THE QUESTION ON THE EXPIRED QUITE PAVEMENT REPLACEMENT. I AM A BIG FAN OF RUBBERIZED ASPHALT. TRAVEL ANYWHERE THAT DOESN'T HAVE IT AND THEN COME HOME. I'M IN THE CAR MOST EVERYDAY AND I TRAVEL OUR STREETS AND OUR STATE AND RUBBERIZED ASPHALT IS MAYBE THE BEST THING I HAVE SEEN TO COME DOWN THE PIKE FOR MAKING DRIVING TOLERABLE. BUT PROJECTS LIKE THIS ARE REALLY THE RIGHT KIND OF WAY FOR US TO GO TO BE EFFICIENT IN OUR USE OF OUR ROADS. AND THE OTHER ONE I AM REALLY STRONGLY IN FAVOR OF, THERE IS TWO ON YOUR INDIAN BEND WEST TRAIL AND CITYWIDE TRAIL IMPLEMENTATION. ANYBODY WHO IS AN EQUESTRIAN WHO RIDE BIKES OR HIKE OUR CITY HAS A LOT OF GREAT PATHS AND TRAILS BUT THERE IS SO MANY BROKEN CONNECTIONS AND THIS WILL GIVE US A WAY TO CREATE A UNIFORM, NON-VEHICULAR WAY TO ENJOY SCOTTSDALE. WE DON'T CURRENTLY HAVE THE ABILITY TO DO OR FUNDS TO DO WITHOUT A BOND PRESENTATION LIKE THIS. SO I REALLY THINK THERE IS A LOT OF VERY STRONG PROJECTS IN THIS PARTICULAR QUESTION, THANK YOU.

[Time: 02:00:22]

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 31 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU, CHAIRMAN. WELL, WE DON'T HAVE ANY OTHER FOLLOW-UP COMMENTS ON THIS. I DON'T KNOW.

Derek Earle: WE ARE JUST ABOUT TO CLOSE. WE MENTIONED EARLIER ABOUT THE SLIDE I THINK THE CITY TREASURER HAD TALKED ABOUT THE POTENTIAL TAX IMPACT ON THE OBLIGATION BOND PROGRAM. IT IS BEING UP TO 32 CENTS PER 100 DOLLARS ASSESSED VALUATION OR \$32 A YEAR FOR \$100,000 RESIDENCE.

I WOULD LIKE TO THROW UP A QUICK CHART HERE NOT IN THE PACKAGE. WHICH IS REALLY FOCUSED ON BEING MORE REALISTIC, HOW WOULD THE BOND TO BE ISSUED? IF YOU LOOK AT THE BLUE BAR THAT IS THE CURRENT CITY, GENERAL OBLIGATION BOND THAT IS SUPPORTED BY THE SECONDARY VALUATION OF THE CITY. THE BARS STACKED ON TOP REPRESENT HOW THE BOND ISSUANCE OR THIS BOND PROGRAM WILL MOVE FORWARD. WHAT IS KEY IS THIS GRAFT ON THE LEFT. ACTUALLY. SCALE ON THE LEFT. ACTUALLY BE AN ESTIMATED ASSESSED VALUATION OR ESTIMATED TAX RATE IMPACT. SO, IF YOU LOOK AT THIS YOU CAN SEE WE HAVE BEEN DECLINING AS WE ISSUED DEBT OVER THE LAST FEW YEARS, CLOSING OUT AND IF YOU FOLLOW THE BLUE LINE DOWN THAT IS CURRENTLY PAYING OFF THE DEBT WHICH IS IMPORTANT WHERE A CITY IS CONCERNED. WHEN YOU ADD THE IMPACT OF THE NEW BOND PROGRAM ONTO THE CURRENT EXISTING GENERAL OBLIGATION BOND DEBT IT DOES HAVE AN IMPACT. HOWEVER, WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE 32 CENTS OR \$32 ON A 100,000 DOLLAR HOUSE THAT ACTUALLY DOESN'T HIT QUITE IN THE SAME MANNER. PART OF THE REASON IS WE ISSUE THE BONDS OVER TIME WE ANTICIPATE AN ISSUANCE OVER FOUR YEARS AND AS YOU ARE ISSUING THE BONDS, AT THE SAME TIME YOU'RE STILL PAYING DOWN PREVIOUS DEBTS OF THE NET IMPACT ON TAX RATE IS NOT AS SIGNIFICANT AS IT WOULD APPEAR WHEN YOU TAKE THE BOND ISSUANCE AS A WHOLE AND LOOK ABOUT. ANY QUESTIONS BEFORE I CLOSE OUT? I WOULD BE GLAD, MAYOR?

[Time: 02:02:37]

Mayor Lane: YES. I GUESS THIS ALSO INCORPORATES THE FOUR-YEAR PHASE IN? THAT IS WHY WE SEE A LITTLE BIT OF A BUMP ON THAT. UP AND DOWN, I MEAN TO SAY. BUT, THIS IS AN INTERESTING PORTRAYAL. I CAN'T QUITE READ. I PROBABLY COULD DO THE MATH AND RUN IT OUT HERE, IF I LOOK AT THIS AND WE ARE IN A CURRENT YEAR LOOKS LIKE 2013 RUN ACROSS THAT LINE TO THE OTHER SIDE, VIRTUALLY THE SAME POSITION IN THE SECOND TO LAST COLUMN ON THE RIGHT-HAND SIDE. I DON'T KNOW WHAT YEAR THAT IS BUT.

Bill Heckman: 2020.

Mayor Lane: OKAY, SO IN APPROXIMATELY SEVEN YEARS.

Derek Earle: 12. 2013.

Mayor Lane: WHAT I AM LOOKING AT YES, 2013 FISCAL YEAR ENDED 2013 COMPARING IT TO THE LINE GOES RIGHT ACROSS TO THE SECOND ONE IN FROM THE RIGHT HAND SIDE, ESSENTIALLY EQUAL.

Derek Earle: THAT IS 2020, APPROXIMATELY SEVEN YEARS AS FAR AS 2021.

Mayor Lane: SEVEN YEARS IT WOULD EVEN OUT TO WHERE IT IS TODAY.

Derek Earle: CORRECT.

Mayor Lane: GOOD ILLUSTRATION AS FAR AS I AM CONCERNED. COUNCILWOMAN KORTE.

[Time: 02:04:05]

Councilmember Korte: I JUST WANT TO THANK STAFF AND OUR ILLUSTRIOUS BOND TASK FORCE, INCREDIBLE AMOUNT OF WORK THE LAST YEAR AND A HALF. TWO YEARS ON THIS AND I KNOW THAT THE TIME COMMITMENT THAT WAS REQUIRED BY YOU TO BRING FORWARD WHAT I THINK IS A VERY STRONG BOND PROGRAM FOR US TO CONSIDER. I BELIEVE THAT THIS BOND PROGRAM IS NOT A QUESTION OF WHETHER THIS IS WITHIN OUR MEANS OR IF WE CAN AFFORD THIS, IT IS REALLY A QUESTION OF INVESTING IN OUR COMMUNITY AND HOW COMMITTED WE ARE TO MAINTAINING SCOTTSDALE AS A PREMIER COMMUNITY AND IT IS ALL ABOUT THE QUALITY OF LIFE, ALL ABOUT PUBLIC SAFETY, MEETING THE NEEDS OF THE FUTURE GENERATIONS. SO THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE IT.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILWOMAN. COUNCILWOMAN MILHAVEN?

[Time: 02:05:11]

Councilwoman Milhaven: I HAD ONE MORE QUESTION IN THE BEGINNING OF YOUR PRESENTATION. YOU TALKED ABOUT DOING SOME OUTREACH WITH THE SCHOOL DISTRICT AND I DID NOT SEE THAT IN THE POWERPOINT WE HAVE? COULD YOU TELL ME MORE ABOUT WHAT YOU WERE THINKING AROUND THAT?

Derek Earle: YES, MAYOR, COUNCILWOMAN MILHAVEN. I APOLOGIZE THE REASON THAT WAS THE LAST ONE BECAUSE WE WERE ACTUALLY, WE RECEIVED SOME REACH OUT FROM THE SCHOOL DISTRICT A FEW DAYS AGO. THEY ARE LOOKING AT WHAT THEY ARE GOING TO DO MOVING FORWARD WITH EITHER THEIR BUDGET OVERRIDE OR BOND PROGRAM MOVING FORWARD. OF COURSE, BEING IN THE SAME SANDBOX AS US, THEY WERE INTERESTED IN WHAT THE CITY WAS DOING. THEY REACHED OUT TO US AND HAD ASKED IF WE WOULD BE INTERESTED IN COOPERATING WITH THEM AS THEY SEEK AND PUT FROM RESIDENTS OF THE COMMUNITY ON POTENTIAL BOND OR A GROUND FOR THE SCHOOL DISTRICT AND STAFF EXAMINED THE REMAINING BUDGET THAT WE HAD FROM THE COUNCIL ORIGINALLY A PERFORATED WITH THE OF THE TASK FORCE, AND FELT PARTICIPATING SCHOOL DISTRICT SURVEY RESIDENTS WOULD BE IN ALIGNMENT WITH THE ORIGINAL RESOLUTION. SO WE ARE IN DISCUSSIONS WITH THEM, WE DON'T HAVE ANY FINAL DETAILS ON HOW QUICKLY THAT WOULD HAPPEN OR HELP TO BRING INFORMATION BACK TO THE COUNCIL, AS EARLY AS THE DECISION-MAKING POINT THAT YOU WOULD HAVE TO. AT THE POINT YOU WOULD HAVE TO START MAKING DECISIONS CONCERNING THE BOND RUBBER AND SPECIFICALLY SO YOU HAVE MORE SPECIFIC INPUT FROM RESIDENTS.

Councilwoman Milhaven: SEE YOU ARE THINKING ABOUT DOING A POLL? THE CITY WILL DO A POLL IS WHAT YOU ARE SUGGESTING?

Derek Earle: AGAIN WE ARE HAVING, IN DISCUSSIONS WITH THE SCHOOL DISTRICT ON WHETHER WE WOULD PARTICIPATE WITH THEM IN THINKING THAT TYPE OF DATA.

Councilwoman Milhaven: I AM A LITTLE TORN ON THAT BECAUSE WHAT WE NEED IN TERMS OF INFRASTRUCTURE? AND I DON'T THINK THERE IS A PROBLEM ASKING A QUESTION. WE ARE ALLOWED TO ASK QUESTIONS. BUT THEN IF WE DECIDE TO PUT THE QUESTION ON THE BALLOT, THEN I THINK THE CITIZENS HAVE ON THE DIALOGUE AND TYPICALLY, A GROUP IS ASSIGNED TO SAY WE ARE FOR THE BOND AND THE GROUP SAYS WE ARE NOT FOR THE BOND AND THE POLITICAL PROCESS TAKES OVER. I AM A LITTLE BIT TORN ABOUT WHAT ROLE THE CITY SHOULD PLACE IN THE POLITICAL PROCESS. AT THE END OF THE DAY IF WE ASKED THE QUESTION AND CITIZENS TELL US NO, MAYBE THE QUESTIONS JUST LET US MAKE THE DECISION TO SAY WHETHER OR NOT WE THINK THESE ARE IMPORTANT TO OUR FUTURE AND THE CITIZENS DECIDE WHETHER OR NOT THEY WANT TO PAY FOR IT. I AM NOT SURE I NEED TO THINK MORE ABOUT THE IDEA INSTEAD OF DOING A SURVEY TO INFLUENCE POLITICAL PROCESS. THANK YOU.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILWOMAN. COUNCILMAN LITTLEFIELD?

[Time: 02:08:07]

Councilman Littlefield: WELL, I THINK THERE IS TO CUT PROBLEMS WITH THE PROPOSAL. ONE IT IS TOO BIG PROBABLY BY ABOUT. SHOULD PROBABLY BE HALF THE SIZE IT IS AND THE OTHER IS THAT COUNCILWOMAN MILHAVEN'S POINT, YES, WE ARE GOING TO BE GETTING CITIZENS THE OPPORTUNITY TO DECIDE BUT IF WE BUNDLED THESE IN EIGHT OR 10 PROJECTS I THINK WE ARE GOING TO BE. NOT ONLY IS THAT UNFAIR TO CITIZENS BECAUSE IT DIDN'T GIVE THEM THE OPPORTUNITY TO PICK AND CHOOSE WHAT THEY WANT TO AND FIND OUT WHAT THEY DON'T BUT I THINK IT ALSO PROBABLY SET THE THING UP FOR DEFEAT. SO, I WOULD SAY IF WE ARE GOING TO PUT ANYTHING ON IT OUGHT TO BE SMALLER AND MORE GRANULAR.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU, COUNCILMAN.

Councilwoman Klapp: I WANT TO SPEAK A BIT TO THE CONVERSATION YOU JUST HAD REGARDING THE SCOTTSDALE SCHOOL DISTRICT. I AM NOT TORN ON THIS, I THINK IT'S A BAD IDEA. AND, I WOULD NOT PAINT IT AS SMART FOR THE CITY TO BE LINKING UP SCHOOL DISTRICT RELATED TO THEIR BOND QUESTION. I THINK THAT HAS NOTHING TO DO, THAT IS NOT GOING TO DO WITH THE SERVICE I THINK IT DOES POLITICIZE THE PROCESS. I DON'T THINK THE CITY OUGHT TO GET INTO THE POLITICAL PROCESS AND IF WE SEND A QUESTION OUT TO THE VOTERS RIGHT NOW ABOUT HOW THEY FEEL ABOUT THIS, WITHOUT ANY PRE-EDUCATION, I CAN ALMOST BET YOU WHAT THEY ARE GOING TO SAY SO I THINK IT'S CERTAINLY NOT SOMETHING I WOULD RECOMMEND THAT THE CITY GET INVOLVED IN WITH THE SCHOOL DISTRICT. IF THEY WANT TO SEND QUESTIONS OUT TO SEE HOW VOTERS FEEL ABOUT THE BOND PROGRAM, THAT IS OKAY BUT I WOULD NOT LINK CITY OF SCOTTSDALE BECAUSE WE MIGHT BE FOREVER LINKED AND WE MIGHT WISH WE HAD NOT BEEN AND I THINK IT'S TOO POLITICAL. IS NOT APPROPRIATE AT THIS TIME I THINK.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILWOMAN. I CERTAINLY AGREE WITH THAT POSITION ON THAT ITEM. BUT I WANTED, JUST FOR THE RECORD NUMBER ONE AGAIN, SAY THANK YOU TO EVERYONE WHO HAS PARTICIPATED IN THIS PROCESS. ALL THE TIME AND EFFORT YOU PUT IN. YOU GAVE US SEVEN ADDITIONAL PAIRS OF EYES TO LOOK AT THIS IN SPITE OF ANY CONCLUSIONS WE MAY DRAW TO THE POSITIVE OR NEGATIVE, THE POSITIONS YOU HAVE TAKEN, THIS IS A VERY USEFUL PROCESS, WE VERY

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 34 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

MUCH APPRECIATE YOUR INPUT ON THIS. THE ONLY OTHER THING I WANT TO MENTION AS WELL IS WE ARE HERE REALLY 41, ONE OBJECTIVE, THAT IS AFTER OUR QUESTIONS, AFTER BEING HERE IN A JOINT SESSION, WE HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO EXCHANGE SOME CONVERSATION AND COMMENTS AND BE QUIZZICAL ABOUT HOW YOU CONCLUDE AND MAYBE HOW YOU DID OR WHAT YOUR AIMS WERE ABOUT PARTICULAR ITEMS AND WE APPRECIATE ALL THAT. BUT NOW, AS A MATTER OF CONSENSUS, I THINK I AM GETTING A CONSENSUS THAT OUR GUIDANCE TO THE COUNCIL. SORRY TO STAFF, THAT WE WANT TO PROCEED TO THE NEXT STEP ON THIS. WE WILL MAKE SOME OTHER OBJECTIVE DECISIONS ONE WAY OR THE OTHER ON THAT AND WE WILL CERTAINLY ENTER INTO A LOT OF OTHER DISCUSSIONS ON VARIOUS COMPONENTS. BUT, UNLESS THERE IS SOMEONE WHO FEELS CONTRARY TO THAT, SAY SO NOW IF I WOULD ASK SO MUCH EVEN THOUGH THIS IS NOT A BOAT BUT AT THE SAME TIME I THINK THE CONSENSUS IS TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THIS CERTAINLY SUBJECT TO A NUMBER OF THINGS THAT WE WANT TO CONTINUE TO DISCUSS. BUT EVEN THOUGH THOSE ARE SOME CONCLUDING REMARKS FOR ME I DO UNDERSTAND THERE ARE SOME OTHERS THAT HAVE OTHER COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS ON THIS. COUNCILWOMAN KORTE.

[Time: 02:11:47]

Councilmember Korte: THANK YOU, MAYOR. JUST TO ADD ON TO CONCERN AROUND THIS COLLABORATION WITH SCOTTSDALE UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT AND I THINK WE HAVE SEEN INFUSION AMONG THE VOTERS, PARTICULARLY IN THE LAST ELECTION REGARDING THE SCHOOL OVERRIDE AND PROP 204 WHATEVER THAT WAS WITH THE SALES TAX. THERE WAS CONFUSION AMONGST VOTERS THEY DID NOT KNOW WHAT THEY WERE VOTING FOR. I THINK FOR US TO LINK, IN ANY WAY, WITH A FEW IS JUST GOING TO CREATE A CONFUSION AND THAT IS THE LAST THING WE WANT TO DO.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILWOMAN. JUST FOR THE RECORD IS THAT PART OF THE RECOMMENDATION FROM THIS COMMISSION?

Derek Earle: NO. MAYOR, HOWEVER I ALSO DO SEE. MAYBE NOT CONSENSUS ON THIS POINT BUT AT LEAST MAJORITY OF COUNCIL RECOMMENDED THAT WE DON'T GO INTO THIS TYPE OF COOPERATION.

Mayor Lane: I UNDERSTAND EVEN THOUGH THAT IS NOT PART OF THE RECOMMENDATION HERE FROM THIS CONDITION. THANK YOU. COUNCILMAN PHILLIPS.

Councilman Phillips: THANK YOU, MAYOR. I WOULD LIKE TO AGREE WITH THAT I AM AFRAID THAT IF THE SCHOOL JUMPS ON OUR BACK IT'S REALLY GOING TO BE A NEGATIVE IMPACT ON OUR BOND ELECTION AND I DON'T WANT TO SEE THAT HAPPEN. I WOULD LIKE TO SAY THANK YOU TO THE BOND TASK FORCE. I THINK YOU'VE DONE AN AMAZING JOB WITH THE TIME AND THE HARD WORK YOU SPENT. IT IS JUST AMAZING TO ME AND I UNDERSTAND THERE IS NO PAY INVOLVED BUT YOU DELIVER THE GOOD OF THE CITY AND IT SHOULD BE APPLAUDED FOR THAT. COUNCILMAN I BELIEVE YOU SAID EARLIER ABOUT IF WE COULD JUST GO AROUND AND LOOK AT THE VARIOUS PROJECTS YOU WOULD SEE THE NEED AND I HAVE LOOKED AT MOST OF THEM. MOST OF THEM LOOK LIKE THE CURRENT EXPANSION PROJECT I THINK THEY ARE ALL IN DIRE NEED SO I WOULD AGREE AT THAT POINT THAT THESE THINGS ARE NEEDED AND THEN WE SHOULD ALLOW THE CITIZENS A CHANCE TO VOTE YES OR NO ON THAT. SO I AM ALL FOR GOING FORWARD WITH THE.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN. COUNCILWOMAN MILHAVEN.

Councilwoman Milhaven: THANK YOU, MAYOR. I JUST WANTED TO MAKE A LOT OF OTHER COMMENTS. FIRST THANK YOU, EVERYBODY, WHAT A WONDERFUL EXAMPLE OF INFORMED CITIZENS DEDICATING THEIR TIME TO HELP MAKE THEIR COMMUNITY A BETTER PLACE. WHAT A WONDERFUL EXAMPLE. HOW LUCKY WE ARE TO HAVE ALL OF THESE THINGS, YOUR TIME AND HELP ALL OF US BE BETTER. ONE OTHER COMMENT I JUST WANT TO SAY THAT I THINK YOU MADE THE RIGHT DECISION NOT TAKING ACTION ON THE DESERT DISCOVERY CENTER. WE HAVE BASIC NEEDS THAT NEED TO BE MET AND WHILE THE ECONOMY, WE STILL MAY BE REBOUNDING AND WE MAY HAVE DIFFERENCES OF OPINION ABOUT WHERE WE ARE, WHERE WE ARE TODAY IS ABOUT MEETING BASIC NEEDS AND WE NEED TO CONTINUE HAVE A LONG-TERM VISION ABOUT WHAT WE WANT THIS TO BE READY TO LOOK LIKE AND THE DISCOVERY CENTER ON THE TABLE AS PART OF A POTENTIAL LONG-TERM VISION AND HAVE A THOUGHTFUL PROCESS AROUND WHAT WE WANT FROM THE NICE TO HAVE, BEST WISHES AS THE DESERT DISCOVERY CENTER I PUT THAT ON BUT I AM GLAD TO SEE WE TACKLED THE NEED TO HAVE.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILWOMAN. COUNCILMAN LITTLEFIELD.

[Time: 02:15:06]

Councilman Littlefield: WELL, I DON'T THINK ANYBODY HAS ANY CONFLICT WITH THE BOND TASK FORCE, YOU GUYS DID A GOOD JOB AND I WOULD SAY WITH A FEW MINOR EXCEPTIONS WE MOSTLY AGREE WITH YOUR PRIORITIZATION. SO, THAT IS ALL GOOD STUFF BACK IN THE END, THIS IS ABOUT WHAT THE VOTERS ARE WILLING TO ACCEPT AND I DON'T ACCEPT THE IDEA THAT THE VOTERS WERE CONFUSED IN ANY OF THESE EARLIER ELECTIONS. IF YOU ARE GOING TO TAKE THAT TACK YOU MIGHT SAY VOTERS WERE CONFUSED ON ELECTING US AND I CERTAINLY WOULDN'T WANT TO THINK THAT WAS THE CASE. I THINK THE REASON VOTERS HAVE REJECTED OUR LAST BOND ELECTION AND REJECTED CAVE CREEK AND REJECTED SCOTTSDALE AND A BUNCH OF OTHER THINGS, REJECTED PROP 204, IS BECAUSE THEY WERE CONFUSED, THEY FELT THOSE THINGS EITHER WERE NOT NECESSARY, WERE EXTRAVAGANT OR A DID NOT TRUST THE VARIOUS GOVERNMENT AGENCIES TO IMPLEMENT THEM CORRECTLY. IT MAKES A BIG DIFFERENCE IN WHAT WE PUT ON THE BALLOT IT MAKES A BIG DIFFERENCE HOW WE PUT ON THE BALLOT, NOT TO GAIN PEOPLE, NOT TO STRATEGIZE AROUND VOTERS, BUT TO SAY TO VOTERS THIS IS WHAT WE BELIEVE IS NECESSARY. AND IF WE PUT TOO MUCH ON THE VOTERS WILL SAY QUITE RIGHTLY, YOU GUYS ARE FISHING. SO I THINK IT ISN'T WORK TO CUT THIS DOWN TO WHERE WE CAN WORK WITH VOTERS, LOOK THEM IN THE EYE AND SAY YOU SHOULD VOTE FOR THIS. IF WE CAN'T DO THAT IF WE CAN'T LOOK SOMEBODY IN THE EYE AND SAY I PUT THAT ON THE BALLOT BECAUSE I BELIEVE IT SHOULD PASS WHY SHOULD THEY VOTE TO GIVE US THE MONEY TO SPEND? IT IS A BIG DEAL HOW MUCH WE PUT ON HERE AND IT IS ALSO A BIG DEAL TO GIVE VOTERS THE LEVEL OF CHOICE. IF WE SAY HERE IS A 10 PROJECT PACKAGE, I KNOW THE CONVENTIONAL THINKING IS IF WE PUT SOMETHING IN THERE FOR EVERYBODY, MAYBE THEY WILL VOTE FOR. I THINK THE OPPOSITE IS TRUE. IF YOU PUT A BIG FAT PACKAGE ON PEOPLE WILL SAY I DON'T WANT ALL ABOUT. SO IF WE ARE GOING TO PUT ANYTHING ON THE BOND WE HAVE TO MAKE IT GRANULAR ENOUGH SO PEOPLE CAN SAY YES, NO, YES, NO AND THAT IS A PAIN BUT I THINK THAT IS WHAT VOTERS DESERVE, AND WE ALSO HAVE TO MAKE A CASE THAT WE ARE GOING TO SPEND THE MONEY WISELY AND IT IS NECESSARY. I THINK IT'S A BIG DEAL HOW WE PACKAGE THIS NOT TRYING TO GAME IT FROM SOME POLITICAL POINT OF VIEW BUT IN TERMS OF SAYING I BELIEVE IN THIS. IF YOU DON'T BELIEVE IN IT, THEN WHY WOULD VOTERS BELIEVING THAT?

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU, COUNCILMAN. I THINK REALLY WE'VE GOT. I WILL DEFER TO THE VICE MAYOR KLAPP HER FINAL COMMENT.

Vice Mayor Klapp: I WILL ADD MY THANKS YOU HEARD FROM EVERYBODY ELSE I DO APPRECIATE THE WORK YOU HAVE DONE OVER THESE MANY MONTHS. I WOULD HAVE TO SAY THAT I SOME WHAT AGREE WITH THE COMMENTS MADE BY COUNCILMAN LITTLEFIELD. I'M NOT SAYING I DON'T WANT THE BOND PROJECT TO GO FORWARD, BUT I AM SOMEWHAT CONCERNED ABOUT THE AMOUNT, WHETHER OR NOT THERE IS GOING TO BE ACCEPTED BY THE VOTERS FOR THE LARGE AMOUNT WE ARE GOING TO BE ASKING ON THE ENTIRE PACKAGE. I THINK BETWEEN NOW AND WHEN COUNCIL IS GOING TO MEET AGAIN, WE WILL BE CLOSER ON A FEW OF THE PROJECTS THAT ARE HERE TO MAKE A COUPLE THAT WERE RANKED PRETTY LOW AND NOT ON THE LIST, AND THEY ARE KIND OF EXPENSIVE SO IT MIGHT BE THAT A COUPLE OF THOSE THINGS THAT WERE ON YOUR RANKING OUGHT TO BE CONSIDERED AGAIN. BEFORE WE MAKE A FINAL DECISION AT LEAST THAT IS MY THOUGHT PROCESS, CONSIDER AGAIN THOSE THAT WERE ON THE COULD BE INCLUDED BUT DO NOT HAVE TO BE INCLUDED LIST YOU HAD HERE. IT MAY NOT CUT IT DOWN AND CAP AS COUNCILMAN LITTLEFIELD HAS IMPLIED, OR SAID, BUT AT LEAST I BELIEVE IT IS INCUMBENT UPON US TO CONSIDER WHETHER THERE ARE SOME THINGS ON THIS LIST THAT IF YOU RATE THEM RELATIVELY LOW, FOR THE VOTERS ARE GOING TO WRITE THEM LOW AS WELL SO I THINK WE HAVE TO HAVE SOME CONSIDERATION. THAT WILL BE THINGS I AM THINKING ABOUT THAT THE NEXT MEETING.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU VERY MUCH THANK YOU COUNCILWOMAN. COUNCILMAN ROBBINS?

[Time: 02:19:22]

Councilman Robbins: THANK YOU, MAYOR. JUST TO BE BRIEF THANK YOU. THANK YOU TO THE COMMISSION TASK FORCE YOU DID A FANTASTIC JOB AND YOU SHOULD BE APPLAUDED. THOSE OF YOU THAT WENT THROUGH TWICE, YOU GET AN EXTRA PAT ON THE BACK. I WOULD LIKE TO AGREE WITH THE VICE MAYOR, I DEFINITELY THINK WE HAVE A LOT OF NEEDS AND WE NEED TO REINVEST IN OUR COMMUNITY, IT'S VERY IMPORTANT. IT MAKES IT LIVABLE AND THAT IS WHY WE ARE HERE BECAUSE WE HAVE A HIGH QUALITY OF LIFE. I AM A LITTLE NERVOUS ABOUT BEING OVERREACHING AS WELL. SO, I WOULD BE INTERESTED IN ACTUALLY GOING UP FROM A PROJECT 46 AND SAY YEA OR NAY UP TO 45 AND KIND OF PARING DOWN A LITTLE BIT AS WELL. BECAUSE IF WE ARE GOING TO DO THIS I WANT TO DO IT RIGHT AND BE SUCCESSFUL AT IT AND I DON'T WANT TO BE VIEWED AS LOOKING FOR THINGS THAT WE DON'T NEED AND NOT THAT THEY ARE ALL NECESSARY BUT I THINK BUT I THINK YOU HAVE TO PUT A VALUE JUDGMENT ON THOSE AND THAT IS WHAT WE ARE GOING TO BE DOING. I WOULD BE INTERESTED IN THAT AS WELL. THANKS, MAYOR.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN. YOU KNOW JUST SO IT'S CLEAR, JUST BECAUSE WE ARE ACCEPTING THEM TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THIS AND I WOULD WANT THE GENERAL PUBLIC, ANYONE WATCHING TO UNDERSTAND THIS, DOESN'T MEAN THERE IS ACCEPTANCE OF EVERYTHING ON YOUR LIST. AND I BELIEVE THIS IS NOT THE END OF THE STORY. THIS IS SIMPLY A STUDY SESSION, JUST AS IT IS DESCRIBED, TO TALK AND DISCUSS THESE ISSUES AT THIS POINT IN TIME FOR US ALL TO EVALUATE EVENTUALLY AND COUNCILMAN ROBBINS COMMENTS YOUR POINT, AS WE ARE LIKELY WE WILL IN AND UP VOTING IN AN ACTION MEETING WE WILL TAKE EACH ITEM SEPARATELY. AND DECIDE AS A MAJORITY WHETHER OR NOT IT IS TO BE INCLUDED OR NOT INCLUDED. TO MY EARLIER POINT TO

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 37 OF 70 FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION

CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

YOU WHILE IT'S NEVER TO BE SEEN AS ANY KIND OF ANYTHING OTHER THAN OUR OWN ANALYSIS AND HOPEFULLY, NO ONE IS OFFENDED WITH THE. I CAN ONLY SAY AGAIN SEVEN OTHER PAIRS OF EYES REALLY IS EXCEEDINGLY HELPFUL. WE ARE STARTING AT A MORE DISTANT POINT FROM TONIGHT IF WE HAD TO GO THROUGH WHAT YOU HAVE ALREADY COMMITTED TO THE CITY AND DONE FOR US. SO, WE WILL BE MAKING THOSE DECISIONS AND THAT IS A SUBJECT OF THE REGULAR MEETING WHERE WE WILL ACTUALLY BE ACTIONABLE ITEMS BACK AT THIS POINT IN TIME I THINK, AGAIN, THIS IS A TOUCHY AREA WHERE WE TALK ABOUT CONSENSUS VERSUS A VOTE I DO BELIEVE WE HAVE CONSENSUS, THE MAJORITY, TO MOVE FORWARD. IN FACT I HAVEN'T HEARD ANYONE SAY ACTUALLY NOT TO MOVE FORWARD EVEN THOUGH THE SUBJECT IS VERY SERIOUS QUESTIONS. THE PUBLIC SHOULD KNOW, THAT DOES NOT NECESSARILY MEAN A VOTE, DEFENDED IN A BALLOT IN THIS FORM OR ANY FORM. SO WITH THAT, I THINK WE HAVE GONE AROUND A COUPLE OF TIMES AND SUM TIMES AND SUMMIT OF CLOSING I WASN'T TRYING TO RUSH THAT BUT NEVERTHELESS THANKS FOR BEING HERE TONIGHT THANK YOU AGAIN THANKS FOR YOUR INPUT, MR. EARLE THANK YOU FOR YOUR PRESENTATION AND CERTAINLY, WE WOULD LOVE TO HAVE YOU STAY IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO FOR ANY OF THE OTHER ISSUES. WE PROBABLY, WE WON'T PROBABLY BE REMOVING THE TABLE BUT IF YOU COULD TAKE REGULAR SEATS, IT WOULD BE FINE. THANK YOU SO MUCH. AND WITH THAT AS THE BOND TASK FORCE MOVES FROM THE TABLE IN FRONT OF US, WE WILL GO ONTO OUR SECOND ITEM, THE STUDY SESSION. THAT IS TOURISM AND DEVELOPMENT AND MARKETING PLAN. WE HAVE THE TOURIST DEVELOPMENT BOARD, COORDINATOR STEVE GEIOGAMAH TO LEAD OFF ON THIS.

ITEM 2 – TOURISM DEVELOPMENT AND MARKETING STRATEGIC PLAN

[Time: 02:23:08]

Tourism Development Coordinator Steve Geiogamah: GOOD EVENING MAYOR, COUNCIL MEMBERS, STEVE GEIOGAMAH BUSINESS ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT. TODAY WE ARE PRESENTING THE STRATEGIC PLAN BEFORE WE BEGIN OUR REPORT FINDINGS I WOULD LIKE TO GIVE YOU AN OVERVIEW OF OUR PRESENTATION THIS EVENING. FIRST OF ALL WE WOULD LIKE TO TALK ABOUT HOW WE HAVE GOTTEN TO THIS POINT IN REGARDS TO OUR PLAN WITH DEVELOPMENT AND WHAT WE ARE PRESENTING HERE THIS EVENING. I WOULD LIKE TO TALK ABOUT FINDING AND RECOMMENDATIONS IN A MOMENT I WILL INTRODUCE VALERI LEBLANC WITH PLACES CONSULTING. YOU WILL TALK ABOUT SOME OF THE HIGHLIGHTS OF OUR REPORT AND WHAT WE FOUND, FROM THE ANALYSIS COMPLETED. AND WE WILL TALK ABOUT PLANNED RESOURCES. IDENTIFICATION OF NUMBERS POTENTIALLY TO MOVE THE PLAN FORWARD, AND WHAT WE ARE LOOKING FOR THIS EVENING FROM THE COUNCILS DIRECTION REGARDING NEXT STEPS WHICH IS IDENTIFICATION OF LEADERSHIP TO MOVE THE PLAN FORWARD. THE FIRST STAGE OF THE PLANNING PROCESS CITY ORDINANCE 3577 WHICH REQUIRES THAT THE STAFF ALONG WITH THE TOURISM AND DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION REVIEWED THE LONG-RANGE PLANS FOR THE TOURISM AND DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM. GENERALLY THIS IS ACCOMPLISHED THROUGH A STRATEGIC PLAN. THIS IS A FIXED REPORT, THE FIRST WAS PRODUCED IN 1980 IN THE LAST WAS IN 2005. IN JULY OF 2012 THE COUNCIL REVIEWED THE CONTRACT AND PLACES CONSULTING AS WELL AS THE SCOPE OF WORK WAS PUT IN FRONT OF COUNCIL THAT NIGHT IN REGARDS OF SCOPE WITH A VERY COMPREHENSIVE SCOPE IN REGARDS TO LOOKING AT CHANGES IN THE MARKET AREA, TOURISM INDUSTRY, AS WELL AS LOOKING CRITICALLY FORWARD AND PLANNING SOME STRATEGIC GOALS AND OBJECTIVES. AND I WOULD JUST LIKE TO SAY AS WE MOVE FORWARD TO THE PATH OF THE MONTH OF DEVELOPING PLAN WE HAVE HAD QUITE A BIT OF INPUT ESPECIALLY FROM THE TOURISM INDUSTRY AND COMMUNITY AT LARGE. CITY STAFF

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 38 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

ALONG WITH PLACES CONSULTING INTERVIEWED OVER 150 MEMBERS OF THE COMMUNITY PUTTING THIS PLAN TOGETHER VERY IMPORTANT IN THE DEVELOPMENT AS WELL AS MOVING THE PLAN FORWARD. I WOULD LIKE TO SAY MANY OF THOSE INDIVIDUALS ARE HERE IN OUR AUDIENCE THIS EVENING AND SOME WILL BE PART OF OUR PRESENTATION. WE HAVE MEMBERS OF THE TOURISM AND DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION, AS WELL AS OTHER MEMBERS AND THEY WILL BE COMING UP IN JUST A MOMENT. SO, I WOULD LIKE TO AT THIS POINT INTRODUCE VALERI LEBLANC WITH PLACES CONSULTING TO TALK ABOUT THE REPORT FINDINGS.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU MR. STEVE GEIOGAMAH. VALERI.

[Time: 02:25:32]

Places Consulting Principal Consultant Valeri LeBlanc: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. IT WILL COME UP IN A MINUTE I AM TOLD THAT. I WANT TO THANK YOU ALL FOR TAKING THE TIME TO LISTEN TO THIS REPORT AND TO SEE SOME OF THE FOLKS WE HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH AND HEAR WHAT THEY HAVE TO SAY ABOUT. I ALSO WANT TO WISH YOU HAPPY MARDI GRAS, TODAY IS MARDI GRAS I AM FROM NEW ORLEANS THIS IS WHAT WE DO. YOU HAVE RECEIVED A COPY OF THE YEAR STRATEGIC PLAN FOR SCOTTSDALE. WHAT I WOULD RECOMMEND TO YOU AND TO OTHERS WHO MIGHT VIEW THIS LATER AND TRYING TO READ IT IS CONSIDERED THE FIRST TWO REPORTS, THE FIVE YEAR STRATEGIC ROADMAP AND THE IDENTITY MATRIX AND NARRATIVE FOR SCOTTSDALE. IS THE GOING FORWARD WORK. THE STATE OF THE INDUSTRY A SNAPSHOT OF WHAT WE HAVE RIGHT NOW AND THE TAPESTRY REPORT FROM GENSLER , AND INSIGHT INTO A MAJOR MARKET PIECE THAT YOU NEED TO BE ADDRESSING AND THE IDEA SOME CONVERSATIONS GIVING YOU AN UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT PEOPLE SAID GENERALLY ABOUT THE IDEAS THAT WE PRESENTED AND TALKED ABOUT IN OUR MEETING. THAT IS THE FIRST THING.

LET'S GET TO WHAT YOU SORT OF START WITH WHEN YOU LOOK AT THIS. THIS IS A HIGH OVERVIEW OF THE THINGS THAT WE FOUND AND AS PROBLEMS, NOT THAT WE SAY THIS IS A PROBLEM LET'S FIGURE OUT HOW TO ADDRESS IT, BUT RATHER THIS IS A PROBLEM AND HOW WILL THIS UNFOLD IN A FUTURE VISION. FOR THE CITY, THE FIRST AND I THINK PROBABLY THE MOST SIGNIFICANT VOICED, THOUGH NOT NECESSARILY IN THESE WORDS, WAS THE LOSS OF THE IDENTITY OF SCOTTSDALE TO THE METROPOLIS OR GENERALLY JUST LOST. AND IT WAS A HUGE FEAR AND A LOT OF WHAT PEOPLE HAVE TO SAY ABOUT WHAT THEY THOUGHT WAS GOING ON AND THEY HAVE LOTS OF IDEAS ABOUT HOW TO RECOVER IDENTITY BUT ONE OF THOSE REPORTS THAT I TALK TO YOU ABOUT THE IDENTITY MATRIX PLACE NARRATIVE FOR SCOTTSDALE IS OUR APPROACH. HOW TO ADDRESS IT AND TO MAKE SURE THAT IT GROWS. THE STRENGTHENING OF THAT GROWS. HOWEVER, IF NOTHING IS DONE, WITH REGARD TO UNDERSTANDING IDENTITY, AND DOING A BETTER JOB OF UNDERSTANDING HOW TO MAKE IT PART OF THE VISITOR EXPERIENCE AND THE CITIZENS EXPERIENCE AND UNDERSTANDING, THAN THE LOSS OF IDENTITY TO THE METROPOLIS IS INEVITABLE, THAT IS WHAT HAPPENS IN CITIES. THEY BECOME PART OF THE LARGER ORGANIZATION OF WHAT IS GOING ON. COMPLICATING THAT A LITTLE BIT IS THE IDEA OF NOT ONE PLACE, SCOTTSDALE IS THREE PLACES, SO IT COMPLICATED BUT NOT REALLY IF YOU GOT THE IDENTITY MATRIX AND CAN FIND THE WAYS TO USE THAT. ON THE TOURISM SIDE, GENERALLY, YOU RELIED A LOT ON THE MEETINGS MARKET AND VERY SUCCESSFULLY. THERE AREN'T MORE SUCCESSFUL DESTINATIONS THAN SCOTTSDALE. SCOTTSDALE IS LOOKING UP

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

THE NUMBERS, IT HAS BEEN VERY SUCCESSFUL. SO WHAT IS GOING ON WHERE THINGS SOFTENING UP? A BIG PIECE OF IT IS THE MEETINGS MARKET HAS GONE SOFT AND IT IS OUR PROFESSIONAL OPINION THOUGH NOT SHARED BY ALL THE PEOPLE IN THE TOURISM INDUSTRY, THAT IT IS NOT GOING TO RECOVER IN THE WAKE THAT PEOPLE EXPERIENCED BEFORE. AND THIS IS A MAJOR ISSUE. I SAID TO THE TOURISM DEVELOPMENT BOARD WE DID A PRESENTATION TO THEM, IF YOU ARE RIGHT THAT IT IS GOING TO TAKE A LITTLE MORE TIME AND THE MARKET IS GOING TO RECOVER, THEN THAT'S GOOD. IF I AM RIGHT, THE MEETINGS MARKET IS NOT GOING TO RECOVER YOU NEED TO DO THESE THINGS IN ORDER TO HAVE INSURANCE.

SO THAT IT'S SORT OF OUR POINT OF VIEW ON THIS. THERE IS SOME RESEARCH THAT SUGGESTED NOT ENOUGH TO DO HERE, NOT ENOUGH EXPERIENCE FOR FOLKS, AND THAT IT IS ISOLATED WITHOUT A CAR. PEOPLE DON'T GET TO KNOW THE PLACE. AND THAT THERE IS A REAL NEED TO STRENGTHEN THE CONNECTION TO THE SONORAN DESERT AND A LACK OF ATTRACTION FOR THE NEXT GENERATION THE KINDS OF THINGS THAT ENGAGE THE NEXT GENERATION AND I AM TALKING ABOUT 40 OR 35 AND UNDER IS LACKING. AND I THINK FROM OUR POINT OF VIEW ALL THOSE THINGS ARE TRUE, NONE OF THEM FATAL, TOGETHER THEY ARE SIGNIFICANT. AND SO, WHEN YOU PUT THEM ALTOGETHER WHAT I WOULD SAY IS, YOU HAVE TO BE IN A SITUATION IN WHICH YOU LOOK FORWARD WITH SOME TREPIDATION WITHOUT A PLAN LIKE THIS AND WITHOUT SUPPORT TO CHANGE THAT. BY THE WAY ONE OF THE MOST SIGNIFICANT THINGS TO THINK ABOUT WHEN YOU ARE IN TOURISM IS, THE BEST POSSIBLE THING YOU CAN HAVE SOMEONE SAY WHEN THEY LEAVE IS WHILE I DID NOT GET TO DO EVERYTHING. BECAUSE IT IS AN AUTOMATIC TRIGGER TO WANT TO COME BACK IF THEY HAD A GOOD EXPERIENCE.

AS FAR AS REVIEWING THE CURRENT PROGRAM WHICH IS A LOT OF WHAT HAPPENED OF THE SCOPE OF WORK, WE DIDN'T FIND ANY DEFICIENCIES, WE DIDN'T FIND ANY PROBLEMS, IN TERMS OF PERFORMANCE WE SAID IN OUR REPORT AS BOXING ABOVE ITS WEIGHT CLASS AND THE GALS AT THE CONVENTION AND VISITOR'S BUREAU (CVB) DIDN'T KNOW WHAT THAT MEANT SO THEY ARE TAKING ON STAFF THAT WITH LESS BUDGET ENDLESS RESOURCES AND DOING A BETTER JOB THAN SOME OF THEIR BETTER FUNDED COMPETITORS. THE CITIES PROGRAM IS FOLLOWING ALL THE STANDARDS OF BEST PRACTICES IN THE WAY THINGS SHOULD BE FUNDED. AND SO, EVERYBODY SORT OF LOOKS AROUND AND SAYS IF WE ARE DOING THE RIGHT KINDS OF THINGS WHAT IS GOING ON? SO THAT IS WHAT WE ARE GOING TO ADDRESS GOING FORWARD. AS FAR AS REVIEWING THE CURRENT PROGRAM AND THAT IS OF COURSE CALLED THE STATE OF THE INDUSTRY, WE HAD A FEW SUGGESTIONS. ONE IS, YOU HAVE A LOT OF FOCUS ON SMALLER EVENTS, WEEKEND EVENTS AND THINGS LIKE THAT. AND GET YOUR MOST SUCCESSFUL EVENT IS SPRING TRAINING WHICH IS A REGIONAL EVENT AND HAS MULTIPLE VENUES ACROSS THE REGION. WE'RE SUGGESTING THAT YOU TRY TO DEVELOP ONE, NEW OWNED ORIGINAL MULTI-WEEK EVENT MARKETABLE AND SEE HOW IT WORKS. SEE IF YOU CAN GO FORWARD WITH THAT. IF IT DOESN'T WORK IT WILL DROP BACK TO A SMALLER EVENT IF IT DOES WORK YOU MAY HAVE A MODEL FOR PICKING UP THE MORE EVENTS TIME AND EXPERIENCE THAT CAN BE SHARED ACROSS A LARGER COST SPACE AND MAYBE POSSIBLE TO STRENGTHEN THESE. WE SUGGEST YOU ADD SYNDICATED RESEARCH NOW THAT SOUNDS LIKE THERE IS SOMETHING WRONG WITH YOUR RESEARCH ACTUALLY WE HAVE NEVER SEEN ANYBODY BE ABLE TO ACHIEVE THE RESEARCH THAT YOU HAVE BY GETTING ACTUAL DATA FROM HOTELS. SO, THAT IS PRETTY UNUSUAL. WE HAVE TRIED TO DO IT OURSELVES AND HAVE NOT AND SUCCESSFUL. HOWEVER WHAT YOU HAVE A REALLY GOOD UNDERSTANDING OF THIS WHO IS HERE. AND WHAT THEY ARE DOING WHEN THEY ARE HERE BUT YOU DON'T KNOW WHO IS NOT COMING. AND WHY THEY ARE NOT

COMING OR WHERE THEY ARE CHOOSING TO GO. SO WE ARE SUGGESTING THAT YOU ADD SOME SYNDICATED RESEARCH. YOU NEED TO REALLY TAKE SERIOUSLY, AS FAR AS WE ARE CONCERNED, THE IDENTITY MATRIX AND CHARACTER OF PLACE STEP AGAINST MOST OF THE FACILITIES AND ALL LOST, TALKING ABOUT HOTELS. BUT ALSO RESTAURANTS AND OTHERS, DON'T REALLY INTERPRET THE PLACE. THEY TELL YOU ABOUT WHAT THEY HAVE TO OFFER, THEY TELL YOU ABOUT THEIR BEDS, THEY TELL YOU ABOUT THEIR DESIGN, THEY TELL YOU ABOUT OTHER THINGS, BUT ULTIMATELY, PEOPLE WILL NOT COME HERE, WELL I GUESS, AND RESORTS THEY WILL BUT LARGELY THEY DON'T TRAVEL JUST TO STAY IN A ROOM THEY TRAVEL TO EXPERIENCE A PLACE . SO, WE THINK THE DEEPENING OF THAT EXPERIENCE OF PLACE IS REALLY IMPORTANT GOING FORWARD. AND YOU ALL HAVE DONE SOMETHING THAT EVERYBODY ELSE IS TRYING TO LEARN AND THE REST OF THE COUNTRY RIGHT NOW WHICH IS TO EXTEND TOURISM AND TO SUCCESSFUL ECONOMIC DEVELOP YOU HAD PEOPLE COME, VISIT DECIDED MUNIR, BRING THEIR BUSINESSES AND GO FORWARD. BUT YOU DON'T HAVE THAT EMBEDDED IN THE NEXT-GENERATION MODEL BECAUSE YOU DON'T HAVE THE NEXT-GENERATION BUSINESSES WANT IN ENOUGH CAPACITY AND WE WILL TALK ABOUT THAT AS WE GO THROUGH THIS PRESENTATION. SO, HERE IS HOW WE APPROACH OUR WORK INTROS AND WHICH IS TO LOOK AT THE WHOLE AND TO SEE IT AS FIRST, CHARACTER OF PLACE. IT MAY BE THAT WE ACCIDENTALLY GOT THERE BECAUSE I AM FROM NEW ORLEANS AND THAT IS WHERE WE STARTED THAT WE HAVE REPLICATED THIS IN THE CARIBBEAN, EASTERN EUROPE, CANADA AND IN PHILADELPHIA PENNSYLVANIA WHERE WE SPENT AN EXPENSIVE AMOUNT OF TIME I CAN TELL YOU IT IS TEACHABLE, LEARNABLE AND DOES DEEPEN THE EXPERIENCE AND HELPS TO GET TO WHERE YOU WANT TO GO. AND I AM GOING TO ASK PAUL AND RACHEL, BUT SPEAK A LITTLE ABOUT THE CHARACTER PLACED WITH ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT LIST TOURISM.

[Time: 02:35:07]

Community and Economic Development Executive Director Paul Katsenes: MAYOR, COUNCIL, A FUNDAMENTAL GOAL IN ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT IS THE CREATION OF QUALITY JOBS. QUALITY JOBS THAT HAVE A CAREER PATH ON MULTIPLE LEVELS IN THAT JOB AT THAT COMPANY AND THOSE JOBS AND THOSE CAREER PATHS ARE CREATED BY THE POSSIBILITY OF ADDITIONAL EDUCATION SO WE END UP LOOKING FOR OR PRESENTING TO COMPANIES, OUR COMMUNITY, AS AN EDUCATED WORK FORCE SO QUALITY JOBS THEN IS A FUNDAMENTAL PRIMARY GOAL OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND IS SOMETHING THAT NEEDS TO BE DONE ON A CONTINUOUS BASIS. HAPPILY THERE IS A CONNECTION BETWEEN TOURISM AND THE CREATION OF QUALITY JOBS IN OUR COMMUNITY. SO, WHEN THOSE MILLIONS OF VISITORS THAT COME TO OUR COMMUNITY THROUGH OUR EVENTS, WHEN THEY COME BECAUSE OF THE OPEN, 520,000 PEOPLE THAT CAME BEFORE THE OPEN, AND EXPERIENCE OUR COMMUNITY OR THE 168,000 BECKHAM FOR THE GIANTS SPRING TRAINING SESSION OR THE PEOPLE THAT BRING 2400 FORCES TO THE SCOTTSDALE ARABIAN HORSE SHOW AND ALL THE PEOPLE THAT COME TO WATCH THAT, THOSE ARE PEOPLE THAT COME AND SAY, FROM OUT OF TOWN, THIS IS SUCH A BEAUTIFUL. THEY PINCH THEMSELVES AND SAY THIS IS SUCH A BEAUTIFUL PLACE, UNTIL I GOT HERE I HADN'T THOUGHT ABOUT LIVING HERE. AND LIVING HERE MAKES ME THINK ABOUT MOVING MY BUSINESS HERE. WHY CAN'T I LIVE AND WORK HERE? SO, AS OF ACTION OF THE EVENTS THAT WE OFFER OF THE COMMUNITY IT'S A VERY, VERY POWERFUL CONNECTION. TO OUR AGENDA THAT WE ARE DISPLAYING WITH YOU BUT THERE ARE PEOPLE THAT COME TO THOSE BUSINESS MEETINGS AND EACH OF YOU HAVE HAD, I PRESUME BECAUSE WE HAVE ALMOST ALL OF US HAVE HAD THIS KIND OF EXPERIENCE WHERE WE HAVE HAD SOMEONE AND THEY SAID I CAME FOR BUSINESS MEETING AND THE SECOND TO THE LAST DAY I STUCK OUT THAT BUSINESS MEETING AND I

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 41 OF 70 FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION

WENT TO CHECK ON A HOUSING PRICE AND THE BUSINESS OFFICE LEASING PRICES AND THE AIRPARK SO I COULD BRING MY COMPANY HERE AND THEY LEAVE US AT THE END OF THE BUSINESS MEETING AND A YEAR LATER THEY ARE BACK AND THEY BROUGHT THEIR BUSINESS AND THEY HAVE CREATED THE OPPORTUNITY. TO PROVIDE ADDITIONAL QUALITY JOBS. AND SO. WE HAVE THAT HERITAGE HERE THAT IS A LEGITIMATE CONNECTION OF 8 MILLION VISITORS ANNUALLY, THE RIGHT BACK INTO THIS KIND OF CONCEPT. ABSOLUTELY CONNECTED AND A LEGITIMATE FOUNDATION FOR SOMETHING WE CAN COUNT ON EACH AND EVERY YEAR. SO, AT THE END OF THIS YEAR YOU ARE GOING TO HEAR WE FINISHED A SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT THAN WHAT YOU HAVE HEARD ABOUT TOURISM IN THE PAST AND THAT IS AN ADDITIONAL EMPHASIS ON DOWNTOWN AND THE REASON WE ARE COLLECTIVELY THIS PROCESS THAT INCLUDED PROBABLY 250 PEOPLE, BROUGHT OUT A WHOLE SERIES OF EVENTS, AND AGENDAS THAT ARE LEGITIMATELY APPROPRIATE FOR US TO BE REVIEWING WITH YOU TONIGHT. ONE OF THOSE IS THE NEED TO LOOK AT DOWNTOWN. TO LOOK AT DOWNTOWN ANIMALISTIC WAY BECAUSE IT NEEDS FOCUS AND ATTENTION IT HAS BEEN BROUGHT FORWARD TO YOU IN A PARTICULAR SMALL AREA BUT WE ARE REALLY SUGGESTING TO YOU LOOKING AT DOWNTOWN IN A HOLISTIC WAY IF WE TAKE CARE OF DOWNTOWN AS THE HEART OF THE CITY, THEN THE REST OF THE CITY GAINED STRENGTH AND A VIBRANT AND HEALTHY. IF WE DON'T DO THAT AT THIS JUNCTURE, THEN WE PUT THE REST OF THE CITY AND THAT THE HEALTH THE CITY IN JEOPARDY IF THE HEART IS NOT OF THE COMMUNITY IS NOT WORKING, THEN IT HAS A RIPPLE EFFECT THROUGHOUT THE COMMUNITY AND THOSE ARE THE POINT THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO MAKE AS WE DISPLAYED THIS PLAN AND THIS SERIES OF STEPS THAT COLLECTIVELY YOU WILL BE HEARING FROM US.

[Time: 02:39:40]

CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

Scottsdale Convention and Visitor's Bureau President and CEO Rachel Sacco: GOOD EVENING MAYOR, VICE MAYOR, MEMBERS OF COUNCIL. WE'VE ALWAYS SAID IN THE CVB THAT THE SECRET WEAPON FOR ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT IS TOURISM AND I THINK THEY HAVE JUST CONFIRMED THAT SO I'M GLAD TO HEAR THAT. PLACES CONSULTING I THINK WAS HIRED BECAUSE THEY HAVE A REAL HOLISTIC APPROACH TO A STRATEGIC PLAN FOR A DESTINATION. I'M GOING TO BE THE FIRST TO TELL YOU TONIGHT THIS IS NOT REALLY A TOURISM PLAN. IF YOU HAVE READ IT YOU WILL NOTICE IT IS THE COMMUNITY PLAN. IT IS A PLAN THAT GOES WAY BEYOND JUST THE CITY AND THE CVB AS WE HAVE IN THE FOUR, FIVE PREVIOUS PLANS I HAVE BEEN PART OF. IN MY JOB AT THECVB THIS PLAN IS INCUMBENT UPON THE ENTIRE COMMUNITY, PUBLIC AND PRIVATE SECTOR COMMENT COMING TOGETHER IN ORDER FOR IT TO BE SUCCESSFUL. I THINK THAT'S REALLY EXCITING. TO TALK ABOUT THAT BEAUTIFUL TRIANGLE THERE, CIRCLES, I WILL TALK ABOUT CHARACTER PLACE WHEN VALERI TALKS ABOUT CHARACTER OF PLACE WHEN I GET. IS IF WE CAN ADDRESS OUT TO BE MOST UNIQUELY AND AUTHENTICALLY SCOTTSDALE THAT WE CAN BE. AND IN THE PLAN, IF WE ACTUALLY CAN SHORE UP SOME OF THE AREAS IN WHICH WE FEEL WE HAVE SOME OPPORTUNITIES TO TRULY MAKE THIS DESTINATION RICHER, MORE INTERESTING, FOR OUR RESIDENTS AND IT WILL ACTUALLY BECOME MORE OF A PROGRAM AND PLAN TO BRING VISITORS HERE. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE KNOW FROM OUR RESEARCH IS THAT OUR VISITORS WANT TO GO WHERE THE RESIDENTS GO. AS A MATTER OF FACT WE KNOW THAT VISITORS THAT COME TO SCOTTSDALE ARE VERY MUCH LIKE OUR RESIDENTS. THEY SHARE THE SAME VALUES; ONE OF THOSE VALUES WHICH GETS BACK TO CHARACTER PLACED IS REALLY ABOUT TWO WORDS THAT IS THE SONORAN DESERT. AT THERE ARE THINGS THAT REALLY DEFINE US, THEY ARE MADE UP IN THOSE TWO WORDS THAT REALLY MAKE US DIFFERENT IN ANYWHERE ELSE IN THE WORLD, THE SONORAN DESERT. WE HAVE DONE A GREAT JOB OF PRESERVING ABOUT ONE THIRD OF OUR ENTIRE COMMUNITY. I WOULD LIKE TO THINK THAT AS

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 42 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

WE MOVE FORWARD WILL HAVE A DIALOGUE ABOUT DOING MORE THAN JUST PRESERVING ALTHOUGH THAT IS EXTREMELY COMMENDABLE, IF THIS IS ONE OF THE MOST DIVERSE ECOSYSTEMS ON OUR PLANET, DON'T WE ALSO HAVE A RESPONSIBILITY TO INTERPRET IT? SO IF WE INTERPRET THIS CORRECTLY, AS WELL AS PRESERVE IT, THEN WHAT WE ARE DOING IS REALLY MAKING AND CREATING AN UNDERSTANDING FOR WHAT THIS ECOSYSTEM IS. WE ARE CREATING PASSIONATE STEWARDSHIP AND WE ARE ALSO CREATING INSPIRATIONAL WAYS FOR PEOPLE TO GO OUT INTO THE WORLD AND THINK ABOUT NOT JUST PRESERVING THE DESERT, BUT OTHER AREAS ON THE PLANET THAT ARE EQUALLY AS IMPORTANT. AND IT CAN START HERE IN A VERY LOCAL WAY THAT HAS GLOBAL CONSEQUENCES.

ONE OF THE THINGS TOO WHEN I THINK ABOUT WE TALK ABOUT CHARACTER OF PLACE IS REALLY SIMPLE. WHERE ARE THE QUINTESSENTIAL SPOTS THAT WE GATHER AS WE CELEBRATE, I AM TALKING ABOUT RESIDENTS RIGHT NOW, VISITORS WANT TO GO WHERE RESIDENTS GO. CAN WE HAVE MORE SHADE STRUCTURES DOWNTOWN? CAN WE ACTIVATE IN THE PRIVATE SECTOR THINGS ALONG THE CANAL, ALONG THE ARTIST STUDIOS? ARE THERE PLACES FOR US TO CELEBRATE, HAVE SMALL VENUES OR EVENTS? PLACES AGAIN THAT WOULD PUT US IN A VERY UNIQUE POSITION TO TELL A STORY. I HAVE ASKED YOU THIS QUESTION BEFORE BUT WHEN A VISITOR COMES UP TO YOU AND ME AND SAY, WHERE IS THE QUINTESSENTIAL PHOTO SPOT FOR SCOTTSDALE? YOU SAY? I AND ASKED THAT ALL THE TIME. I WILL ASK YOU IT IS A GOOD QUESTION. IF WE AS RESIDENTS DON'T KNOW IT IS MAYBE A CONVERSATION WE SHOULD HAVE AS WE TALK ABOUT CHARACTER OF PLACE. IS A DOWNTOWN? IS AT THE CIVIC CENTER PARK? IS IT OLD TOWN? IS IT THE PRESERVE AND THE GATEWAY? THAT IS A GREAT CONVERSATION TO HAVE. CHARACTER OF PLACE IS ALSO HOW WE ACTIVATE EACH AND EVERY ONE OF THE AREAS. IS ALSO HOW DO WE PROVIDE WAY-FINDING AND BANNERS, TALK ABOUT ALL THE THINGS WE HAVE HERE AND HELP RESIDENTS COME DOWN AND ENJOY THESE THINGS BECAUSE REMEMBER, VISITORS FOLLOW RESIDENTS. FOR ME I HAVE ALWAYS LEARNED THAT THE QUICKEST PLACE A TWEEN TO PEOPLE IS ALWAYS TO A STORY. AND I THINK CVB HAS DONE A GOOD JOB OF TELLING THE STORIES OF SCOTTSDALE THINK IT IS TIME FOR US AS RESIDENTS AS WELL TO START THINKING ABOUT WHAT STORIES MATTER TO US, WHAT STORIES YOU WANT CVB TO CRAFT AND TALK ABOUT. STORIES OF THE PAST, STORIES OF THE PRESENT BUT ALSO STORIES OF WHERE ARE WE GOING, WHAT MATTERS TO US. SO THE CVB ROLE IN THIS PLAN IS REALLY LESS THAN WHAT WE'VE DONE THE PAST IN TERMS OF SHORING UP OUR PROGRAM OF WORK IS REALLY MORE ABOUT SOME OF THE THINGS THAT WE DO REALLY WELL WHICH IS IN A KEEPER OF OUR BRAND. CONVENING GROUPS TO SAY WHAT MATTERS. WHAT DO WE WANT TO PRESERVE, WHAT MAKES A DIFFERENCE IN OUR FOUNDATION THAT WE WANT TO BUILD ON? ONE OF THE CONVERSATIONS WE WANT TO HAVE? ONE OF MY HOPES IS THAT AS WE DEVELOP THIS PROGRAM, THAT THIS WILL BECOME A PLACE WHERE WE ARE CONVENING GATHERINGS OF PEOPLE MAY BE LIKE THE CONFERENCE, CONFERENCES FOR INDIVIDUALS WHO WANT TO COME TO A PLACE THAT IS KNOWN FOR ITS CREATIVITY. THAT IS KNOWN FOR ITS BEAUTY. THAT IT IS KNOWN FOR ITS CULTURE. IT IS KNOWN FOR THE WAY WE CARE FOR PEOPLE, KNOWN FOR THE PLACE PEOPLE ARE PROUD TO LIVE IN AND MAYBE MOST IMPORTANTLY, IT'S NO BECAUSE AS ONE OF THE MOST DIVERSE ECOSYSTEMS ON THE PLANET, AND ALSO IT IS A PLACE OF INSPIRATION. AND THAT IS WHAT THE CVB IS GOING TO TRY TO DO ALONG WITH OUR CITY AND PRIVATE SECTOR PARTNERS AS WE PUT THIS PLAN FOURTH TWO REALLY HELP OUR COMMUNITY EMBRACED TOURISM AND HELP TOURISM EMBRACE OUR COMMUNITY. THANK YOU.

[Time: 02:45:22]

Valeri LeBlanc: THANK YOU, PAUL AND RACHEL. IT REALLY FITS IN EVERYTHING THIS PLAN THAT THEN EVERYTHING WITH EVERYTHING WE ARE GOOD AT. RACHEL IS RIGHT. EVERYTHING THAT THEY CAN DO ONE THING I KNOW ABOUT CITIES AND THEIR FUTURE IS YOU CAN'T LET ANY ASSETS GOING USED BECAUSE IF YOU DO THERE IS SOMEBODY ELSE WHO HAS A BETTER PLAN SOMEWHERE ELSE AND YOU ARE BOND. A LITTLE FRAMING FOR YOU. SIXTEEN TO 17,000 ROOMS, 57% OF THOSE ROOMS ARE IN RESORTS, 70% ARE RESORTS AND FULL-SERVICE 30% LIMITED SERVICE. 30% PLUS OTHER PAID OVER NOT ACCOMMODATION. OVERNIGHT ACCOMMODATION ONE THIRD OF THE REVENUE WHEN YOU LOOK AT BED TAX, FOR OVERNIGHT VISIT IS NOT CONSIDERED. JUST A LITTLE FRAME OF REFERENCE, THERE ARE LOTS OF WAYS TO GET YOUR HAND AROUND. HEAD AROUND TOURISM IS A RECOMMENDATION THAT YOU DON'T KEEP IT SEPARATE THAT YOU TRY TO UNDERSTAND AS PART OF A WHOLE. I KNOW YOU GET THAT BETTER THAN MOST OF YOU EVER HAD BUT THAT DOESN'T MEAN YOU NEED TO DO IT INTO BETTER AS YOU GO FORWARD AND YOUR PROFILE.

Mayor Lane: EXCUSE ME WE DO HAVE A QUESTION THAT MIGHT RELATE TO THE LAST SLIDE. COUNCILWOMAN MILHAVEN?

[Time: 02:46:22]

Councilwoman Milhaven: ONE THIRD OF THE REVENUE IS NOT REALIZED. CAN YOU EXPLAIN?

Valeri LeBlanc: NOT CONSIDERED I GUESS.

Councilwoman Milhaven: WHAT DOES THAT MEAN?

Valeri LeBlanc: WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE BED TAX NUMBERS IN THOSE KINDS OF THINGS, YOU ARE NOT TAKING INTO CONSIDERATION OTHER OVERNIGHT ACCOMMODATIONS, CONDOS, PLACES THAT PEOPLE STAY WHEN THEY ARE VISITING. AND I AM NOT TALKING ABOUT VFR WITH IS USUALLY ABOUT 30% OR 40% IN ANY MARKET, SO, IT IS NOT EASY TO DEAL WITH THAT. WHEN YOU LOOK AT YOUR REAL ESTATE TAXES IT NEEDS TO BE IN YOUR HEAD THAT SOME OF THIS IS COMING FROM TOURISM. AND THE ABILITY TO DO THIS IS THE RESULT OF TOURISM. THERE ARE MODELS AROUND THE COUNTRY BUT NOT OF THE CITY LEVEL BUT CERTAINLY NOT A SMALL CITY SO I'M NOT ADVISING THAT THERE ARE MODELS AROUND THE COUNTRY IN WHICH THEY ARE REALLY TRYING TO UNDERSTAND HOW MUCH REVENUE COMES FROM SALES TAX HOW MUCH CONTEMPLATIVE BEVERAGE THESE OTHER RELATED STUFF HOW MUCH COMES FROM SALES TAX. IT'S VERY PRODUCTIVE. TOURISM IS VERY PRODUCTIVE ECONOMICALLY. I KNOW THAT YOU KNOW THIS I'M YOU KNOW YOU'VE ENJOYED A REALLY SPECTACULAR DESTINATION AND YOU HAD A LOT OF THE FEDS AND YOU MAY BE UNDER UNDERVALUING OR NOT UNDERSTANDING ALL THE VALLEY, YOU HAVE GOTTEN FROM WHAT YOU HAVE SPENT ON TOURISM. YOUR PROFILE HAS BEEN IN HIGH-END BEATINGS AND ANTERIOR STRUCTURAL CHALLENGES. YOU KNOW ABOUT SOME OF THEM. THERE ARE FEWER MEETINGS AND THE AIG EFFECT BUT THERE ARE OTHER THINGS COMING INTO PLAY. I DON'T WISH POORLY FOR THAT MARKET SEGMENT, BUT I DON'T HAVE A LOT OF CONFIDENCE IN IT. SO, I THINK IT IS VERY LIKELY THAT THE HIGH-END MEDIA BUSINESS, PEOPLE DOING THAT IN YOUR MARKETPLACE ARE AT THE TOP OF THEIR GAME. THIS IS JUST A LITTLE PIECE ON HOW WE APPROACH THINGS. WHEN DO YOU SEEK NEW STRATEGY? WHAT IS THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN STRATEGY AND TACTICS? THE BIG CURVE AT THE BOTTOM COMING UP IS AN INDICATION, BROADLY, WHEN YOU ARE IN STRATEGY. THINGS ARE

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 44 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

GROWING. WHEN YOU KNOW YOU'RE OPERATING STRATEGY, THINGS ARE GROWING. WHEN YOU START SEEING THE DR. FORTH, UP OR DOWN, UP OR DOWN, WE DON'T SEE DECISIVE MOVES YOU ARE IN TACTICS WHICH MEANS YOU NEED TO GET BACK TO STRATEGY, AS YOU GO BACK TO STRATEGY IN OTHER RISE. IS SIMPLY HOW YOU KNOW HOW YOU ARE. YOU ARE CLEARLY HERE. CLEARLY IN TACTICS AND I AM GOING TO SUGGEST TO YOU THE REASON YOU ARE IN TACTICS IS NOT BECAUSE YOU HAVE PEOPLE WHO ARE NOT DOING THEIR JOB, THEY ARE DOING THEIR JOB, THE PROBLEM IS NEW DECISIONS NEED TO BE MADE THAT TAKE YOU BACK INTO STRATEGY. SO, THAT IS WHAT THIS CHART IS ABOUT AND IT IS REALLY A SIMPLE WAY TO LOOK AT ANYTHING, YOU HAVE A BUSINESS, IT'S A SIMPLE WAY TO UNDERSTAND IT. I AM GOING TO ASK FRED UNGER TO HELP ME PRESENT ON THIS BUT OUR VERY FIRST RECOMMENDATION IS TO IMPROVE THE DOWNTOWN EXPERIENCE. THERE ARE ABOUT 12 CONVERGING REASONS FOR THAT. BUT LET ME GIVE YOU A FEW SHORT ONES. WE BELIEVE THAT YOU NEED A DOWNTOWN REINVESTMENT PLAN. WE DON'T BELIEVE THAT YOU NEED A DOWNTOWN BEAUTIFICATION PLAN, OR A NEW ZONING PLAN OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT. FIRST, YOU NEED A DOWNTOWN REINVESTMENT PLAN. BECAUSE YOU HAVE TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THE PROPERTY OWNERS IN DOWNTOWN NOW ENJOY AND WHAT THE POSSIBILITIES ARE AND YOU HAVE TO BE ABLE TO SPEAK TO THEM ABOUT WHAT THE POSSIBILITIES ARE FOR THE FUTURE. THAT IS HOW THINGS CHANGE. OTHERWISE, YOU CAN DRIVE THROUGHOUT THE COUNTRY AND SEE WHAT HAPPENS TO DOWNTOWNS THAT DON'T GET REINVESTED. YOU NEED A PLAN THAT HAS ELEMENTS TO INTERPRET PLACE DOWNTOWN INVITING, AND INVITING SCENE THAT MAKES DOWNTOWN AND EVERYDAY PLACE FOR ANYONE. NOT JUST VISITORS WITH ANIMATION. IT DOESN'T NEED TO BE ONLY TO CERTAIN PEOPLE COULD'VE DONATED TO BE PART OF EVERYONE'S EXPERIENCE I HAVE HEARD ENOUGH STORIES THAT I KNOW THERE WAS A TIME WHEN THAT IS HOW IT WAS WHEN THEY REMEMBER A TIME THAT PEOPLE CAME DOWNTOWN THEY ENJOYED IT THEY HAD FAMILY EXPERIENCES THERE AND ALL THE REST AND I THINK THE WORK THAT IS HAPPENED WITH SOME OF THE EVENTS AND THE FACT THAT THERE IS ACTUALLY A PIECE OF RESEARCH I READ IN DOING THIS WORK THAT SUGGESTED THAT AMONG PEOPLE THAT LIVE IN SCOTTSDALE, THEY THINK OF THOSE SCOTTSDALE MALL AS THE QUINTESSENTIAL MOST WONDERFUL PART OF SCOTTSDALE.

Mayor Lane: EXCUSE ME WE HAVE A QUESTION.

[Time: 02:51:51]

Councilman Littlefield: WHEN YOU TALK ABOUT A DOWNTOWN REINVESTMENT PLAN AND CREATE A STRUCTURE FOR ONGOING FUNDING, THE BOND TASK FORCE DISCUSSION AND HAD AN OPPORTUNITY SEE THE MANY PROBLEMS WE ARE FACING, WHAT TYPE OF ID AND STRUCTURE ARE YOU TALKING ABOUT? WHERE WOULD YOU ANTICIPATE THIS MONEY COMING FROM?

[CAPTIONER STANDING BY] [Captioners Transitioning]

[Time: 02:58:09]

Fred Unger: AND IN MY BUSINESSES WE DIDN'T JUST THINK HOW CAN WE MARKET WHAT WE HAVE AND ADVERTISE WHAT WE HAVE BUT HOW CAN WE IMPROVE IT? SO WE'VE TAKEN A LOOK AT, FOR INSTANCE, MY HOTEL AND DECIDED TO INVEST IN MAKING IT A BETTER PRODUCT. HOPEFULLY THAT PRODUCT WILL BETTER COMPETE LOCALLY, NATIONALLY AND HELP POSITION US FOR IMPROVED ECONOMY. SO I COMMEND THE CITY FOR SOURCING PLACES AND INTERNATIONALLY KNOWN FIRM

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

PAGE 45 OF 70

THAT KNOWS WHAT THEY'RE TALKING ABOUT TO COME IN AND TAKE A LOOK AT SCOTTSDALE FROM ALL ADVANTAGE POINTS. I WAS ONE OF THE FIRST TO INTERVIEW AND TALK AND I WAS PART OF THE PROCESS THE WHOLE WAY. GREAT THOUGHT AND TIME WAS PUT INTO IT AND I BELIEVE THAT WE MUST TAKE A LOOK AT WHAT SCOTTSDALE IS AND NOT JUST KEEP OUR FINGERS CROSSED AND HOPE THE BUSINESS COMES OUR WAY, THAT WHAT OUR PREDECESSORS HAVE DONE COMES OUR WAY AND ALL THE GREAT THINGS THAT HAPPEN FROM PRIOR YEARS AND WE TAKE A LOOK AS WE HAVE, AND CONTINUE TO LOOK AT THAT. COME UP WITH A STRUCTURE, A ROAD MAP TO MAKE SCOTTSDALE BETTER. MANY COMMUNITIES ARE TAKING A LOOK AT WHAT THEY HAVE TO OFFER AND ARE DOING THE SAME THING. I THINK MRS. LEBLANC IS LOOKING AT IT ALL OVER. I WAS NOT INVOLVED IN ALL ASPECTS OF HER WORK BUT IN THE DOWNTOWN PORTION OF THIS I THINK WE HAVE TO LOOK AT OUR DOWNTOWN AND FEEL THAT WE DO NEED TO CONTINUE TO IMPROVE AND TO FIND A MECHANISM, LIKE I SAY, A PATH TO MAKING IT BETTER SO WE CAN POSITION OURSELVES FOR THE FUTURE. I WHOLE HEARTEDLY SUPPORT THE PROCESS. IT ISN'T A MENU. IT'S NOT STATIC. IT'S A WAY TO, PERHAPS, GET SOME CONSENSUS AND DO THE THINGS WE NEED TO DO TO STAY COMPETITIVE. IF WE DON'T DO SOMETHING LIKE I FEAR WE'LL LOSE MARKET SHARE AND THE WONDERFUL BENEFITS WE HAVE HERE. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

[Time: 02:58:00]

Valeri LeBlanc: WE'VE TALKED A LITTLE BIT ABOUT CHARACTER OF PLACE AND WE HAVE A METHOD WE USE CALLED PERVASIVE INTERPRETATION OF PLACE. WE ACTUALLY BELIEVE THAT IT SHOULD BE PART OF EVERYTHING THAT HAPPENS IN THE TOURISM INDUSTRY BUT IT SHOULD BE PART OF WHAT PEOPLE WHO LIVE IN SCOTTSDALE KNOW AND STRENGTHEN IN THEIR OWN WORK AND OWN INTEREST. SO YOU HAVE A DOCUMENT THAT TALKS ABOUT THIS IN SOME DETAIL. LET ME GO THROUGH THE FIVE THINGS WE DISCOVERED IN OUR WORK. THE LEADING QUESTION IS WHAT'S THE BEST SCOTTSDALE DAY FOR YOU? I DON'T THINK YOU CAN REALLY BE HERE WITHOUT FEELING ATTACHED TO A BIG WORLD, A BIG SENSE OF PLACE THAT'S ONE OF THE THINGS I FELT THE VERY FIRST TIME I CAME WHICH WAS ABOUT 1992 WAS THE FIRST TRIP I EVER MADE HERE. I HAD PROBABLY MADE 15 OR SO BEFORE COMING TO CONSULT. A CONSCIOUSLY CREATED CITY, THAT IS NOT SOMETHING I UNDERSTOOD AT FIRST BUT THE FIRST DAY I HEARD THE INDIAN WASH STORY AND WAS BLOWN AWAY BY IT. THAT KIND OF A PLACE YOU WANT TO HAVE IS EMBEDDED HERE. IT'S NOT SOMETHING YOU HAVE TO TAKE OUT AND WONDER IF IT CAN HAPPEN. YOU KNOW IT CAN HAPPEN. THERE ARE PROBABLY A MILLION STORIES I DON'T KNOW. WHAT ARE THOSE STORIES AND TO MAKE THEM PART OF THE CONVERSATION OF THE CITY. I THINK YOU HAVE A SPECIAL PROBLEM IN TRYING TO DO THIS BECAUSE YOU HAVE A LOT OF PEOPLE NOT FROM HERE SO THEIR INVESTMENT IN SCOTTSDALE MAY BE MORE LIMITED TO THEIR OWN CIRCLE OF WHAT THEY KNOW AND DO AND NOT KNOW TO DO. THE WELL SPRING OF HEALTH, I HAD KNOWN ABOUT PEOPLE COMING HERE WITH LUNG CONDITIONS AS PART OF THE EARLY PART BUT I GOT INTRIGUED BY SOME OF THE THINGS THAT ARE CONTINUING IN THAT FIELD AS ARE THE SPAS AND OTHER RESORTS. IN WORKING WITH THE CVB ONE OF THE MAJOR THINGS WE'VE BEEN TALKING ABOUT IS GETTING TO THE PLACE THAT PEOPLE START TO UNDERSTAND THIS IS A HEALTHY PLACE. IT'S A CONSCIOUSLY CREATED CITY AND A HEALTHY PLACE. I THINK THEY UNDERSTAND IT BECAUSE THEY KNOW ABOUT PEOPLE GOING HIKING AND DOING OUTDOOR STUFF BUT I DON'T THINK THEY KNOW HOW DEEP IT GOES. HOW IMPORTANT IS THAT TO A VISITOR? REMEMBER, THEY'RE NOT JUST A VISITOR. WE HAVE THIS MAGICAL CIRCLE THAT GOES ON OF PEOPLE COMING AND STAYING AND BRINGING BUSINESSES AND THE ECONOMIC BENEFITS OF THAT. THE BEST OF LIFE WHEN YOU THINK ABOUT THE QUALITY, I DON'T KNOW OF A

COMMUNITY THIS SIZE THAT HAS INVESTED IN THE ARTS THE WAY THIS COMMUNITY HAS. SO THE BEST IN LIFE, WHATEVER THAT IS. HOPEFULLY IT HAS TO DO WITH CONNECTIONS WITH PEOPLE THAT ARE REAL AND CONCERNED ABOUT THE PLACE WHERE THEY LIVE.

THEN ONE OF THE GUYS THAT WORKED HERE FOR A YEAR BACK IN 1999 WHO DID THIS SPECTACULAR REPORT FOR YOU, I HAD LUNCH WITH HIM IN PHILADELPHIA NOT TOO LONG AGO. I SAID BOIL IT DOWN FOR ME. I DON'T THINK HE HAS THE POSITION ANYMORE BUT HE HAD BROAD PLANNING OPPORTUNITIES. HE SAID THIS IS SCOTTSDALE, A CITY IN THE DESERT, THE DESERT IN A CITY. I THINK THAT'S RIGHT. I THINK REALLY KNOWING THAT YOU'VE GOT THIS INSIDE OUTSIDE, YOU THINK OF IT AS THE INDOOR OUTDOOR LIVING. IT'S WHERE TWO ECO SYSTEMS MEET WHERE YOU HAVE THE MOST PRODUCTIVITY. YOU HAVE SALTWATER AND FRESHWATER IN THE ESTUARIES IN LOUISIANA. THAT'S WHERE THE CREATIVITY IS. THAT HAS IMPLICATIONS FOR DEVELOPMENT. DO YOU WANT LIVE DESERT IN THE CITY? THAT'S A CONCEPT. WE TALK ABOUT THIS AND TALK ABOUT BEING ABLE TO BE MORE AWARE OF IT. YOU DON'T WRITE THIS ON A NOTE AND HAND IT TO SOMEBODY AND SAY DON'T YOU WANT TO COME BACK TO SCOTS SCALE? THEY HAVE TO FEEL IT. IT'S EMOTIONS. WE ASKED TIM, IF YOU WANT TO ACCEPT THEM, TO BE INTIMATELY INVOLVED AND MAKE THIS PLACE COME ALIVE.

[Time: 03:06:48]

Vice President and Director of Scottsdale Museum of Contemporary Art Tim Rodgers: MAYOR, COUNCIL, RECENTLY HAD THE PRIVILEGE OF ATTENDING A MEMORIAL SERVICE FOR ONE OF OUR VOLUNTEERS AT THE MUSEUM. SHE HAD BEEN A VOLUNTEER FOR OVER 12 YEARS. I HAD NEVER MET HER FAMILY. SHE GAVE US ALL TOURS AT THE MUSEUM. HER FAMILY WENT UP TO SPEAK AND THEY WERE ALL FROM CHICAGO, THEY HAD FLOWN DOWN HERE. THEY SAID WHEN HER HUSBAND HAD MOVED HERE AND SHE CAME HERE UNWILLINGLY, HE CAME FOR GOLF, THAT SHE HATED THE PLACE. SHE FELT LOST. SHE WAS IN CHICAGO, HAD FRIENDS AND FAMILY. WE HAD GREAT WEATHER AND HER HUSBAND HAD GOLF. SOMEBODY SUGGEST THAT DAY SHE GO DOWN TO THE LITTLE MUSEUM AND GET TO KNOW IT. SHE DID THAT AND THEY SAID THAT'S WHEN SHE REALIZED SHE HAD A HOME AND COULD LIVE HERE. THAT TRANSFORMED HER LIFE AND KEPT HER HERE WITH US AND BROUGHT HER FAMILY DOWN HERE TO THANK US. THAT'S THE POWER OF ART. IT'S NOT JUST ABOUT ENJOYING SOMETHING PRETTY IN THE LIVING ROOM. IT'S ABOUT CREATING COMMUNITY AND FAMILY IN CONNECTION. I THINK THAT'S WHAT WE TRY TO DO HERE BUT WE HAVE TO REMIND OURSELVES HOW EXTREMELY IMPORTANT IT IS FOR OUR VISITORS TO HAVE THAT KIND OF CONNECTION. THEY EXPECT IT HERE. THEY REALLY DEMAND IT AND WE, OF COURSE, SHOULD PROVIDE THAT TO THEM JUST LIKE WE PROVIDE REALLY GREAT GOLF COURSES. THANK YOU.

[Time: 03:08:45]

Valeri LeBlanc: WE LOST A YOUNG PARTICIPANT IN THE LATE TIME WITH FAMILY COMMITMENTS, BUT WE HAVE SOMEONE HERE WHO IS A MERCHANT DOWNTOWN TO SPEAK TO YOU ABOUT THIS ISSUE, GENERATIONAL SHIFTS. THERE IS RESEARCH IN THIS PACKET, ABOUT THE NEXT GENERATION AND WHERE SCOTTSDALE IS IN ATTRACTIVENESS AND PRESENCE OF NEXT GENERATION. I HEARD A LOT OF COMMENTS IN THE EARLY DAYS, WE TRY TO REACH OUT TO YOUNGER FOLKS, 40, 35, AND GET THEM INVOLVED BUT THEY DON'T DO IT. I DON'T KNOW, MAYBE THEY'RE NOT MATURING AS FAST AS WE DID OR OTHER THINGS. SO IT WAS IN THE BACK OF MY HEAD. I KNOW THERE HAD BEEN PROGRAMS AND ATTEMPTS TO REACH OUT. THEN I HEARD A COUPLE OF THINGS IN A COUPLE DIFFERENT

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

PAGE 47 OF 70

INTERVIEWS THAT BLEW ME AWAY. ONE OF THEM IS FROM ONE OF THE PEOPLE HIGH UP IN YELP AND I CAN'T REMEMBER THE PERSON'S NAME. SHE WAS MAKING THE CASE I EACH HEARD ALL OVER THE COUNTRY. AS WE'RE ENTERING IN TO THE NEXT WAVE OF FOLK THAT IS ARE GOING TO BE PROFESSIONALS IN EMPLOYMENT. WE'RE ENTERING A MUCH SMALLER MARKETPLACE. SO THOSE GUYS HAVE A LITTLE CHIT THEY CAN PLAY. THEY GET TO PICK SOME FOLKS FROM ALL THE BUSINESSES THAT WANT THEM. THEY'VE GOT A LITTLE POWER THERE. THE PRIMARY THING THEY USE TO RECRUIT THE PLACE. IT'S PLACE. WE, IN OUR WORK, WE TALKED ABOUT WE WANT THOSE YOUNGER VISITORS TO FEEL SCOTTSDALE HAD SOMETHING FOR THEM. THEY'RE A DIFFERENT BREED. THEY'RE INTERESTED IN DIFFERENT THINGS. A DOWNTOWN URBAN EXPERIENCE IS IMPORTANT TO THEM. WHEN I TALK TO THE MAYOR ABOUT THIS IN A BRIEFING A COUPLE OF MONTHS AGO HE SAID WHAT? I SAID IT CAN BE SCOTTSDALE STYLE BUT IT NEEDS TO BE LIVELY AND THERE NEEDS TO BE LIVE-WORK AND AN OPPORTUNITY TO STEP OUTSIDE THE OFFICE AND WALK TO THE COFFEE SHOP AND SIT OUT UNDER A TREE AND ENJOY YOURSELF. IT NEEDS TO HAVE A LOT MORE CONNECTEDNESS, A PLACE TO MAKE CONNECTIONS. WHEN WE WERE TALKING TO A RECRUITER AT YELP PLEASE I SAID YOU'RE HERE SO YOU MUST THINK SCOTTSDALE HAS SOMETHING TO OFFER. SHE SAID WE CAN BRING MORE PEOPLE HERE. I SAID WHAT ARE YOUR COMPETITORS? SHE SAID SAN FRANCISCO, CHICAGO AND AUSTIN. NOW, IN THE TECH WORLD AND IN THE GREEN WORLD AND MAYBE NOT SO MUCH IN CREATIVE COMPANIES BECAUSE THEY MAY PICK NEW YORK, LOS ANGELES, MIAMI AND NEW ORLEANS, BUT IN THOSE TWO WORLDS, THOSE ARE THE GOLD STANDARDS. THAT'S WHERE THE YOUNG PROFESSIONALS WANT TO BE. YOU COULD HAVE MORE OF THAT GOING FOR YOU IN THE FUTURE AND IT HAS THE ADDED ATTRACTION, THEY WANT TO LIVE DOWNTOWN. SHAWNA HAS A RETAIL STORE IN CHARLES SOMETHING COURT DOWNTOWN. MILLER, RIGHT. SHE HAS A RETAIL SPACE THERE, AN ART STORE AND WHAT SHE SAYS ABOUT ALL OF HER FRIENDS IS. SHE HAS A CSA PEOPLE THAT WANT TO PICK UP VEGETABLES CAN COME TO HER STOP. SHE'S VERY COMMUNITY ORIENTED. SHE SAID WHAT WE WANT MORE THAN ANYTHING ELSE IS TO LIVE AND WORK IN THE SAME PLACE, TO BE ABLE TO WORK. IF YOU'RE IN DOWNTOWN CHICAGO, I HAVE A SON THERE, THAT'S VERY MUCH THE ENVIRONMENT. THEY WALK, TAKE SOME KIND OF LIGHT TRANSPORTATION A FEW BLOCKS AND THEY'RE BACK OUT WITH THEIR FRIENDS HAVING DINNER OR WHATEVER. THERE IS AN ADDED BENEFIT TO BEING ABLE TO OFFER THAT. RESEARCH IS SHOWING MORE AND MORE BABY BOOMERS WANT TO BE IN URBAN SPACES DOWNTOWN WHERE THEY TOO CAN LIVE AND WORK AND DO THOSE THINGS.

TRANSPORTATION, I'VE ASKED RICK KIDDER TO COME DOWN AND TALK ABOUT THIS. IN THE RESEARCH, THERE ARE PRETTY SERIOUS ISSUES AROUND AIRPORT CONNECTIONS FOR YOUR VISITORS. IN TALKING ABOUT THAT, AND THE TOURISM INDUSTRY HAS TALKED ABOUT THIS FOR A WHILE, I THINK, AS SOMETHING THAT'S COME UP ON THE SURVEYS MORE THAN ONCE. IT'S DISORIENTING, IT IS VERY EXPENSIVE TO RENT A CAR AT THE AIRPORT. I CAN TELL YOU, AS A CONSULTANT HERE, THAT MOST OF THE TIMES I RENTED CARS; MY FEES WERE HIGHER THAN THE CAR. IT IS EXPENSIVE. IT TAKES ABOUT TWO HOURS TO GET YOUR LUGGAGE, REMEMBER A CAR AND GET TO A HOTEL DOWNTOWN IF THAT'S WHERE YOU'RE STAYING. IT'S SHORTER TO DO THAT IN PHILADELPHIA. THEN VISITOR TRANSPORTATION WITHIN TOWN IS COMPLICATED, ESPECIALLY WITH THE ENFORCEMENT THAT PEOPLE EXPECT ON DRINKING AND DRIVING. IT CAN LIMIT WHERE PEOPLE CAN GO, WHETHER OR NOT THEY'LL GO TO A PERFORMANCE AT THE PERFORMANCE CENTER OR GO DOWNTOWN AND DRINK AND EAT WITH THEIR FRIENDS. WHEN WE WERE TALKING ABOUT THIS IN ONE OF OUR MEETINGS AND TOURISM HAS A PROBLEM WITH GETTING EMPLOYEES TO WORK. WHEN WE STARTED TALKING ABOUT THAT RICK CAME AND SAID WE KNOW MORE ABOUT THAT THAN THAT.

[Time: 03:15:44]

Rick Kidder: I HAVE NO ANSWERS. JUST THOUGHT I'D LET YOU KNOW. AS A REPRESENTATIVE OF THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY, I WANT TO SAY I'M PLEASED TO BE A PART OF THIS PROCESS. THE CHAMBER HAS HAD A PROCESS IN THIS BECAUSE IT'S A GREAT ECONOMIC DRIVER. NOTHING IS MORE IMPORTANT THAN OUR EVOLVING TOURISM PLANNING FOR THE FUTURE SO WE CAN MAKE SURE THAT SCOTTSDALE STAYS THE COMMUNITY THAT EVERYONE WOULD ASPIRE TO BE. FOR MANY YEARS WE HAD A STRONG INTEREST IN TRANSPORTATION ISSUES. WE'RE HAPPY TO BE FART OF THE MASTER PLAN AND OTHER ISSUES AS ASSIGNED. WE WANT TO LOOK AT WHAT TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENTS COULD BE POSSIBLE AND MAKE SCOTTSDALE THE MOST DESIRABLE CITY TO VISIT. WE LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH THE CVB, CITY EXPERTS, WITH THE AIRPORTS; TO HELP ADDRESS WORKFORCE MOBILITY WITHIN THE HOSPITALITY COMMUNITY AS WELL AS ENHANCES THE OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE SCOTTSDALE MORE ACCESSIBLE. THANK YOU.

[Time: 03:17:09]

Valeri LeBlanc: IN OUR APPROACH TO TRANSPORTATION WE HAVE A FEW MORE IDEAS. PERHAPS WE SHOULD GET TO THE PLACE THAT WHERE WE'RE DRIVING VISITORS INTO A CENTRAL DOWNTOWN EXPERIENCE, FOR A TIME THAT THEY'RE HERE, PERHAPS WE CAN REMIND THEM TO GO BACK OUT INTO NATURE. UNITE SOME OF THE TRAILS DOWNTOWN. WE ALSO WERE OUT AT THE SCOTTSDALE AIRPORT AND FOUND THEM RECEPTIVE TO A MARKETING APPROACH THAT THEY THINK IS WORTH TESTING AND WE DO TOP AND THAT IS TO PROMOTE SCOTTSDALE TO PRIVATE JET OWNERS. MAYBE SOME OF THE DROP OFF WE SEE IN THE VERY HIGH END TRAVEL BUT ALSO REACHING OUT TO ASIA WHERE WE HAVE THE ONLY GROWING GOLF MARKET TO STABILIZE A LITTLE OF THE GOLF MARKET. IN DOING THAT WE HAD TWO MAJOR THINGS THAT CAME UP. ONE WAS LET'S REALLY LOOK AT THOUGHT LEADERSHIP. LET'S TRY TO TEST THINGS PEOPLE HAVE NOT DONE. WE'RE TALKING ABOUT TUNING THE OFFERING OF CONTENT AND PROMOTION TO GROUP MEETINGS. GENERALLY, GROUP MEETINGS ARE SOLD. I MEAN THE BIG THINGS THEY HAVE TO KNOW SHOW MUCH SPACE DO YOU HAVE, AVAILABILITY, HOW MANY BEDS DO YOU HAVE. ALL RIGHT, WHAT IF WE HAD SOME REALLY COOL SPEAKERS THAT WERE LOCAL THAT WE COULD HAVE OR WHAT IF WE HAD A NOVEL WAY TO FORM MEETINGS. THE FIRST TIME I CAME TO SCOTTSDALE WAS FOR A MEETING IN 1992. IT WAS FOR A CONFERENCE THAT ONLY HAPPENED TWICE. THE FIRST CONFERENCE HAD A LOT OF EXECUTIVES LIKE THE PRESIDENT OF BELL TELEPHONE AND OTHER FOLKS LIKE THAT. ALL YOU HAD TO DO WAS RAISE YOUR HAND AND PAY THE MONEY TO GO. I WAS FORTUNATE TO BE IN THAT CROWD. IT WAS A NEW THING CALLED MARKETING ON THE INTERNET IT WAS PRE WORLD WIDE WEB BUT IT WAS IN SCOTTSDALE AND THAT NEVER LEFT ME. IT FELT LIKE IT WAS PLACED RIGHT, THE RIGHT PLACE TO HAVE THE VISIONARY MEETING. PEOPLE WERE EXCHANGING CARDS AND BUSINESS PLANS. THEY DIDN'T KNOW WHAT TO DO. IF YOU THINK NOW ABOUT HOW MUCH OUR LIVES HAVE CHANGED. I WENT THE SECOND YEAR AND IT WAS RIGHT AFTER THE BROWSER WAS CENTRALLY INVENTED THAT ALLOWED THE WORLD WIDE WEB. HIS SECOND PRESENTATION WAS IN SCOTTSDALE. IT WAS A SMALL MEETING, AN INTERESTING EXPERIENCE. IT WAS MIND-BENDING. LOOKING AT THE TED CONFERENCE AND OTHER THINGS GOING ON OUT THERE, IT MAY BE POSSIBLE TO USE THE INTERNET AND NEW IDEAS AND GATHER YOUR OWN GROUPS. DON'T WAIT FOR SOME MEETING OR OTHER PEOPLE THAT MAYBE DON'T KNOW THEY WANT TO MEET TOGETHER BUT THEY LIKE THE TOPIC. THESE ARE NOT HIGH-COST EFFORTS. AND MAYBE WE WILL BE IN THE LEADERSHIP AGAIN ON HOW SOME OF THESE THINGS GET DONE.

AROUND GOLF WE TALKED ABOUT, AS I SAID, DEVELOPING RELATIONSHIPS WITH CHINA. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I UNDERSTAND IS THAT THE BUSINESS CLASS IN CHINA IS VERY INTERESTED IN GOLF AND THAT THEY DON'T HAVE ANY SKILLS OR ANY. YOU SAID THE RIGHT LANGUAGE FOR IT BUT THEY DON'T HAVE A SENSE OF AMERICAN PLAY, PLAY THROUGH THE PACE OF THINGS, THE CULTURAL ADAPTATION AND THEY WANT IT. COULD WE DEVELOP THAT? COULD WE BE THE TEACHING PLACE? COULD WE MOVE, PAUL POINTED THIS OUT, COULD WE COME HERE FOR A MEETING AND PLAY GOLF AND SAY YOU'RE PLAYING GOLF, WHY NOT HAVE A MEETING HERE? CAN WE FLIP THOSE IDEAS? YOU MIGHT BE INTERESTED TO KNOW THAT EVERYONE WAS INTERESTED IN OPERATE NG THAT PLACE. YOU TEST IT AND IF IT'S GREAT YOU KEEP GOING AND IF NOT MOVE ON. IN GENERAL I SAY THIS IS ALL ABOUT MOVING FROM A RESORT TO A DESTINATION FOCUS. YOU BEGAN WITH RESORTS. IT'S TIME TO MOVE TO THE WHOLE DESTINATION AND TO RECOGNIZE THERE IS INCREASING COMPETITION IN THE RESORT MARKET. USUALLY A LOT OF IT IS OUTSIDE THE U.S. THEY'RE MORE EXOTIC. IN A WAY, WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT IS REALLY REACHING OUT TO THE THINGS THAT ARE UNIQUE AND EXOTIC TO SCOTTSDALE. ALL THE THINGS THAT ARE FUN AND ALL THE ATTRIBUTES YOU WANT TO MAKE IT. THE LAST PIECE OF OUR PLAN IS TO MAKE SURE YOU'RE PLANNING FOR CRISIS. I KNOW A FAIR AMOUNT OF THIS, UNFORTUNATELY, AND YOU WANT TO PLAN FOR THIS IN ADVANCE. THAT INCLUDES HAVING RESERVES. WE WERE WORKING IN PHILADELPHIA WHEN 9/11 OCCURRED. THE MAYOR WAS THE KIND OF GUY WHO WENT OUT AND GOT THINGS DONE. HE PULLED OUT A NICE POT OF RESERVES. IT MEANT PHILADELPHIA HAD THE FASTEST RECOVERY THAN ANY OTHER CITY ON THE COUNTRY. THE DESERT IN THE CITY AND THE CITY IN THE DESERT. I HAVE NOT SEEN A DESTINATION AS STRONG AS THIS ONE, SO CLOSE TO THE FUTURE AND SO ABLE TO CARRY OUT A PLAN LIKE THIS. I THINK, REALLY, THE OBSTACLES, WE'VE MET THE ENEMY AND THEY ARE US. I REALLY THINK THEY ARE THE OBSTACLES. YOU HAVE WHAT YOU NEED TO ACHIEVE A SUSTAINABLE CITY AND TO BE ABLE TO DETERMINE WHAT THAT IS, NOT JUST PICK UP WHAT IS OUT THERE BUT REALLY MAKE IT THE CITY YOU WANT IT TO BE. NOT DOING ANYTHING ASSURES YOU OF THE OPPOSITE, OF ABSORPTION OF THE METROPOLIS. I'VE ENJOYED MY TIME HERE. YOU HAVE A PLAN AND A WILLING COMMUNITY AND I HOPE YOU SEE YOUR WAY THROUGH TO DOING IT.

[Time: 03:25:10]

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU VERY MUCH AND FOR A VERY COMPLETE REPORT. I HAVE A COUPLE OF COMMENTS I'D LIKE TO MAKE IF IT'S OKAY.

Valeri LeBlanc: SURE.

Mayor Lane: YOU'RE PROBABLY THE POINT PERSON. NUMBER ONE, AND THIS IS REALLY A COMMENT, I SPENT FOUR GLORIOUS YEARS IN PHILADELPHIA AND I'M NOT SURE I WANT TO EMULATE PHILADELPHIA EITHER THEIR POLITICS OR STRUCTURE BUT I DID HAVE A REAL QUESTION. WHEN YOU MADE THE COMMENT ABOUT HOW DIFFICULT IT IS TO GET TO SCOTTSDALE FROM SKY HARBOR. I'M NOT SURE WHAT YOU MAY HAVE BEEN POINTING TO BUT YOU MENTIONED THE FEES. EVERY CITY ACROSS THE COUNTRY HAS HUGE TAXES THAT THEY LOAD ONTO TRANSPORTATION. NEVERTHELESS YOU SAID SOMETHING ABOUT THE EASE AND THE TIME. MY PERSONAL EXPERIENCE IN GETTING FROM SOUTH PHILLY, THE AIRPORT TO CENTER CITY, I DON'T KNOW THAT IT WOULD NECESSARILY BE A REAL RACE BETWEEN THAT AND PHOENIX AND SCOTTSDALE. SCOTTSDALE IS A SUBURB. MORE TO THE POINT, IS THERE AN ELEMENT IN HOW THE AIRPORT OR RENTAL CAR DEALERSHIPS WORK?

Valeri LeBlanc: ALL THOSE THINGS.

Mayor Lane: OR BAGGAGE RECOVERY?

Valeri LeBlanc: ALL OF THOSE THINGS. I COULD PROBABLY SPEND 15 MINUTES ON THIS.

Mayor Lane: DON'T DO THAT.

Valeri LeBlanc: IT'S POORLY DONE. HERE ARE SOME ELEMENTS OF IT. FIRST, PHILADELPHIA IS AN EXPENSIVE CITY IN TERMS OF FEES AND ALL THE REST. IT TAKES LESS TIME FOR ME TO GET A CAR IN PHILADELPHIA AND DRIVE TO NEW HOPE WHICH IS 30 MINUTES NORTH OF THE CITY THAN IT DOES FOR ME TO GET BAGGAGE AND GO TO THE VALLEY HO. IT'S NOT THE TIME OF DAY

Mayor Lane: WAS IT THE NAVIGATION?

Valeri LeBlanc: THAT'S A FAIR QUESTION. IT'S THE LENGTH OF TIME TO GET FROM THE AIRPORT TO THE RENTAL CAR AND THEN THE PROCESS, YOU WALK A LONG WAY. NONE OF THAT WOULD BE TERRIBLE EXCEPT THAT PEOPLE DON'T EXPECT IT TO BE THAT WAY FOR SCOTTSDALE.

Mayor Lane: I DON'T WANT TO SPEND TOO MUCH TIME ON THIS, AND I APPRECIATE THE EXPLANATION TO THAT POINT, BUT IT'S JUST THAT IT'S SOMEWHAT OUTSIDE OF OUR CONTROL.

Valeri LeBlanc: NO DOUBT BUT A SHUTTLE SERVICE IS NOT.

Mayor Lane: THE OTHER THING I WAS GOING TO MENTION OR A COUPLE OF OTHER THINGS, YOU SAID WHO'S NOT COMING? THAT'S A GREAT QUESTION. I DON'T KNOW WHAT IT IS WE DO, BUT THERE ARE THINGS IN PLACE TO IDENTIFY WHO IS NOT COMING. IT'S HISTORICALLY WHO HAS COME VS. WHO MAY BE PROSPECTS NOW? THEY WARRANT A PART OF THAT QUADRANT OF FOLKS COMING TO SCOTTSDALE BUT THERE MAY BE NOW. IT'S IDENTIFYING THE TREND, AGE, DEMOGRAPHIC AND WHAT WE HAVE TO OFFER. THIS GOES TO THE NEXT POINT IF I JUST FOLLOW ONTO THAT, THAT'S COMMUNICATE THE CHARACTER OF PLACE RATHER THAN THE RESORT. I THINK THAT'S AN INHERENT ISSUE IN DEALING WITH FINE RESORTS IN SCOTTSDALE AND SURROUNDING SCOTTSDALE IN KEEPING PEOPLE ON PROPERTY. I THINK THE CVB CONTINUES TO MARKET THE PLACE VERSUS THE RESORTS.

[Time: 03:29:48]

Valeri LeBlanc: I THINK THAT'S RIGHT BUT, MAYOR, IF I COULD, WHEN WE THINK ABOUT HOW TO REALLY EMBED TOURISM AND MAKE IT WORK AND GENERATE MORE OF WHAT YOU WANT, IN OTHER WORDS, SELF SELECT THE RIGHT KIND OF TOURS, RIGHT KIND OF ENGAGEMENT, YOU CAN'T LET IT BE ABOUT THE CVB'S MARKETING. IT HAS TO BE EMBEDDED IN THE PLACE BY THE PEOPLE WHO LIVE HERE, THE SERVER AT THE CONVENIENT STORE. IT HAS TO BE THAT MUCH FOR YOU TO GET THE REAL BANG FOR THE BUCK. IF THERE IS ONE THING THAT COULD TURN THIS MARKET AROUND INSTANTLY, FIVE YEARS, THAT COULD TURN AROUND THE MARKET AND EMPOWER IT, IT WOULD BE TAKE THE DOWNTOWN EXPERIENCE AND VIEW IT WITH CHARACTER OF PLACE AND YOU'RE OFF AND RUNNING FOR THE NEXT GENERATION.

Mayor Lane: AND I THINK ELEMENTS AND COMPONENTS IN PLACE AND ACTIVITY TO THAT POINT ALREADY BUT NEVERTHELESS I HEAR WHAT YOU'RE SAYING. THAT GOES TO ANOTHER POINT AND THAT IS THE INVESTMENT IN THE DOWNTOWN AND IN THAT ELEMENT OF ATTRACTION FOR SCOTTSDALE'S DOWNTOWN. WE ALSO HAVE, IN THE EARLY STAGES, A SPECIAL REVENUE FUND BY TOURISM DOLLARS TO DO CAPITAL INFRASTRUCTURE. WE'RE CAUTIOUS ABOUT THAT. DOWNTOWN IS ONE OF THOSE PLACES AS FOR AS PROVIDE AGRICULTURE BETTER PLATFORM FOR TOURISM AND THE MARKET FOR DOWNTOWN THAT'S SOMETHING WE'VE ENTERTAINED. ONE THING, IN ADDITION THAT YOU MENTIONED, SO I THINK WE'RE IN CONCERT ON THAT, BUT YOU MENTIONED EVENTS AND WHAT THEY MEAN TO US ON THE OVER ALL. I THINK IN EVERY ASPECT OF TOURISM AND THE ECONOMIC ENGINE, WE'RE FAMILIAR AND TIGHT END WITH WHAT EVENTS MEAN TO US WHETHER IT'S BRINGING PEOPLE BACK AND THE BUSINESS BUT ALSO TO ENERGIZE THE ENTIRE BASE OF AMENITIES BE IT BARS, RESTAURANTS, HOTELS AND GOLF IS CERTAINLY PART OF THAT AS WELL, AS MANY OTHER THINGS. NOW THE IDEA OF THE PRESERVE, AS WELL AS WHAT THAT MEANS AND MAKE SURE WE HAVE THAT IN THE PLAYBOOK FOR US. IT'S INTERESTING, I WAS TALKING TO SOMEONE IN MY OFFICE YESTERDAY AND SHE'S INTIMATELY INVOLVED IN A LOT OF CITIES OF OUR SIZE AND RANGE AND SHE HAD NEVER HEARD OF THE PRESERVE. SHE'S BEEN HERE AND KNOWS THE VALLEY BUT AN IMPORTANT COMPONENT WE'RE INVESTED IN BUT TOURIST ISSUE AND ENVIRONMENTALIST INTEREST THAT WE NEED TO BE OUT AND ABOUT. DO WE REDIRECT TOWARD OLD EVENTS AND INSPIRE NEW EVENTS FOR THE FOLKS THAT HAVE NOT BEEN CUSTOMERS OR TOURISTS TO SCOTTSDALE?

Valeri LeBlanc: YOU HAVE SOME EVENTS THAT IS ARE VERY TOP SHELF EVENTS THAT PEOPLE WOULD PAY BIG MONEY FOR. THE FACT THAT THEY'RE HOMEGROWN WOULD KEEP THEM THERE. PEOPLE ASK ME ABOUT WHETHER OR NOT YOU CAN GO OUT INTO THE MARKET PLACE AND RECRUIT EVENTS. I GUESS YOU'RE GETTING READY TO WRITE A SUPER BOWL CHECK SOON AND YOU KNOW ABOUT THAT. HOME GROWN EVENTS ARE GOOD. WE GENERALLY LOOK AT EVENTS AS A WAY TO FIRM UP SOFT SEASONS. A LOT OF YOUR EVENTS ARE NOT IN SOFT SEASONS. THEY'RE IN PRIME SEASON. THEY ANIMATED THE PLACE EARLY. THE REASON WE USE THEM A LOT IS BECAUSE WE WANT TO ANIMATE SOMETHING. WE WANT TO GIVE THEM THAT ENERGIZED EXPERIENCE. THAT'S REALLY LOTS TO SEE AND DO, THE TRADE MARK AND LOTS LESS TO DO WHEN I LEAVE. IF YOU HAVE THOSE TWO THINGS GOING FOR YOU THEN YOU'RE IN HIGH COTTON AS WE SAY IN THE SOUTH.

Mayor Lane: THANKS. I APPRECIATE THOSE ANSWERS THE RESPONSE TO MY COMMENTS. WE DO HAVE A COUPLE OF OTHERS THAT WOULD LIKE TO EITHER HAVE COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS STARTING WITH COUNCILMAN LITTLEFIELD.

[Time: 03:35:02]

Councilman Littlefield: AS MUCH AS I LOVE TOURISM, THE TOURISM PLAN IS NOT THE COMMUNITY PLAN. THAT PLAN IS THE GENERAL PLAN THAT VOTERS VOTE ON. IT'S IRONIC BECAUSE WE JUST HAD A VISIONING SESSION WHERE STAKEHOLDERS SOME IN THIS ROOM, WERE WORKING WITH A CONSULTANT TO DEVELOP A COMMUNITY. THIS IS A TAIL, NOT THE DOG. WE DON'T CREATE THE COMMUNITY THAT THE TOURISM COMMUNITY WANTS, WE CREATE WHAT THE RESIDENTS WANT I'D LIKE TO MAKE THAT 100% CLEAR. I DID GET A TEXT FROM ONE OF THE PARTICIPANTS IN THE VISIONING TOWN HALL WHO POINTED OUT THAT IT WOULD'VE BEEN INTERESTING TO HAVE THIS PRESENTATION TO THAT TOWN HALL AND SEE HOW THEY WOULD'VE INTEGRATED THAT. TOO BAD

THAT DIDN'T HAPPEN. THE OTHER THING IS AS A VETERAN OF THE DOWNTOWN PARTNERSHIP WARS, WE CALLED OUR REINVESTMENT GROUP THE DOWNTOWN PARTNERSHIP BACK 10, 11, 12 YEARS AGO. ONE OF THE PROBLEMS WITH THAT THAT, BESIDES THE FACT PEOPLE COULDN'T AGREE WITH WHAT TO DO WITH THE MONEY, WE HAD TOO MANY PEOPLE TRYING TO SPEND MONEY TO MARKET A PRODUCT AS OPPOSED TO TRYING TO FIGURE OUT IF IT WAS A SUSTAINABLE PRODUCT. THERE WAS A FELLOW HERE EARLIER; HE'S A SELF APPOINTED DOWNTOWN EVANGELIST. ONE OF THE THINGS HE POINTS OUT, ONE OF THE MOST SUCCESSFUL BUSINESSES DOWNTOWN ARE THOSE THAT HAVE REINVENTED THEMSELVES. IT'S LOOKING AND FIGURING OUT WHAT WORKS. THAT'S ONE OF THE PROBLEMS I HAD WITH THE REINVESTMENT SCHEMES. FRED UNGER, LONG TIME DOWNTOWN DENNISON, WHEN HE MADE THE COMMENT ABOUT WE NEED TO DO SOME REINVENTING AND SEE WHAT WORKS, I THOUGHT WE SHOULD HAVE THOUGHT ABOUT THAT YEARS AGO. THERE HAS TO BE THOUGHT ABOUT WHAT REALLY WORKS AND WHAT IS A VIABLE BUSINESS DOWN THERE OPPOSED TO HOW MUCH MONEY WE SPEND ON ADVERTISING.

Valeri LeBlanc: I'D LIKE TO ADDRESS THAT. I'M NOT TALKING ABOUT ADVERTISING DOWNTOWN. WHAT I'M TALKING ABOUT IS DEVELOPING AN ATMOSPHERE OF ONGOING GROWTH OF MERCHANTS AND AN ATTRACTIVE PLACE FOR VISITORS. I THINK, IN THE CONVERSATIONS I'VE HAD, WHICH ARE NOT AS NUMEROUS AND I DON'T KNOW AS MANY PEOPLE OR ANYTHING ELSE, THAT THE OPPORTUNITY TO LAYOUT THE WHOLE PLAN INTRIGUED THEM AND GOT PEOPLE BEHIND IT. I DON'T ADVISE ANYTHING THAT DOESN'T GET PEOPLE BEHIND IT. I KNOW ABOUT THE GENERAL PLAN AND IT'S ABOUT WHAT KIND OF COMMUNITY YOU WANT AND HOW YOU BUILD TOURISM.

Councilman Littlefield: I WOULD SAY TO THAT, YOU NEED TO UNDERSTAND WHICH IS THE TAIL AND WHICH IS THE DOG. THAT'S ALL I AM SAYING. CERTAINLY YOU'RE CORRECT IN THAT THE ENVIRONMENT IS CHANGING. ANYBODY WHO DOESN'T KEEP UP WITH IT WILL FAIL. YOU HAVE TO UNDERSTAND THAT THIS IS A PLACE WHERE PEOPLE LIVE. IT'S THOSE FOLKS WHO GET TO DECIDE WHAT THE COMMUNITY LOOKS LIKE. EVEN THOUGH TOURISM IS AN IMPORTANT COMPONENT OF THAT, THE NUMBER ONE IS WHAT IS THE KIND OF CITY THE RESIDENTS WANT? I WOULD HOPE WE'RE NOT TRYING TO FORCE THAT DOWN PEOPLE'S THROATS. WE RECOGNIZE WE HAVE A COMMUNITY VISIONING PROCESS AND THAT'S WHERE THAT PLAN IS GOING TO COME FROM.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN. COUNCILMAN PHILLIPS.

[Time: 03:39:33]

Councilmember Phillips: THANK YOU MAYOR. I'D LIKE TO SAY THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I APPRECIATE THAT. I WANT TO HEAR FROM THE REST OF THE COUNCIL TOO. I'M INTERESTED IN HEARING WHAT THE REST OF THE COUNCIL THINKS ABOUT THIS. I'M A PROPONENT OF TOURISM. THE CVB GOES OUT TO THE REST OF THE COUNTRY AND THE WORLD AND WHAT A GREAT PLACE SCOTTSDALE IS. THE NOW IS WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT. LOOKING AT THIS OPTION AND STAFF RECOMMENDATION, I'D THINK THAT THROUGH ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT BEN MORIARITY IS INVOLVED WITH THE TOURISM PROGRAM. I WOULD THINK THAT THROUGH YOU GUYS, TAKE DIRECTION FROM CVB ON WHAT THEY'RE PROMOTING AND WHAT YOU CAN DO. I THINK THAT WOULD BE THE WAY TO GO RATHER THAN IMPLEMENT A PLAN THAT WORKS THROUGH HER AND

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 53 OF 70 FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION

CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

SEEING WHAT PEOPLE SAY WHEN THEY COME HERE. I THINK THAT'S THE TWO GROUPS THAT WOULD WORK BEST TOGETHER.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU. COUNCILMAN ROBBINS.

[Time: 03:41:02]

Councilman Robbins: THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. THAT WAS GREAT. THERE IS SO MUCH GOING ON HERE WHICH I APPRECIATE. THANK YOU FOR BRINGING UP THE OTHER SPEAKERS FROM OUR COMMUNITY. I'LL START WITH THE ORDINANCE. WE STARTED WITH WHAT THE ORDINANCE REQUIRES. A FIVE YEAR STRATEGIC PLAN FOR QUOTE, TOURISM. AND RACHEL HAS BEEN INVOLVED IN THAT AND THE CVB DOES A GREAT JOB. I THINK WE'RE LOOKING TO EXPAND TOURISM AND MAKE IT MORE OF AN ECONOMIC ENGINE THAN IT ALREADY IS. THIS IS MORE THAN MARKETING AND ADVERTISING. I AGREE THAT IT'S CREATE AGRICULTURE SENSE OF PLACE. I THINK THAT FOR US TO GROW AND GET BETTER AT WHAT WE DO. WE HAVE TO KEEP OUR EYE ON WHY PEOPLE COME HERE. THINGS CHANGE A LOT. ESPECIALLY, LIKE FRED MENTIONED, WHEN THINGS ARE BAD YOU BECOME A BETTER MANAGER. YOU HAVE TO BE MORE FOCUSED ON THE BUSINESS. I THINK THAT'S WHAT WE'RE DOING HERE AS WELL. I LIKE THAT YOU'RE MOVING US FROM RESORT TO DESTINATION FOCUS. THAT DOES BROADEN THE SCOPE AND CREATES A BIGGER FISH TO FRY, TO USE A SOUTHERN EXAMPLE. SO LET ME ASK YOU A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS. WE HAVE A DOWNTOWN PLAN. WE ADOPTED A DOWNTOWN PLAN THAT WE WORKED ON FOR A COUPLE OF YEARS. DID YOU LOOK AT THAT AND HOW DOES THAT INTEGRATE WITH WHAT YOU ARE TALKING ABOUT?

Valeri LeBlanc: WE DID. HERE IS A PROBLEM THAT YOU AND GOVERNMENT CAN'T ADDRESS. I THINK COUNCILMAN LITTLEFIELD IS GOING AROUND ONE WAY AND THE PLAN IS GOING ANOTHER AND WE'RE TRYING TO TAKE ATTACK. HERE IS THE ISSUE. YOU WANT TO RETAIN LOCAL OWNERSHIP, YOU WANT TO RETAIN LOCAL RETAIL, LOCAL MERCHANTS TO ACHIEVE THIS SCOTTSDALE URBAN EXPERIENCE. IF YOU DRY THAT OFF YOU CAN'T DO IT. YOU WANT TO ACHIEVE THAT. YOU HAVE, FROM MY UNDERSTANDING FROM A NUMBER OF PEOPLE I'VE SPOKEN WITH; YOU HAVE VERY LITTLE INVESTMENT INCENTIVES. THIS ISN'T ABOUT THE CITY. THIS IS ABOUT THE PEOPLE THAT OWN LAND, THEY INHERITED IT FROM THEIR DADDY AND IS IT WORTH INVESTING MORE IN. THIS IS WHAT HAPPENS IN CITIES. THEY LOSE DOWNTOWN TO THESE KINDS OF ISSUES. THE FIRST THING WE'RE RECOMMENDING IS AN ECONOMIC ASSESSMENT. IT HAS A BUNCH OF COMPONENTS THAT IS WE RECOMMEND THAT YOU TAKE AN ECONOMIC LOOK AT IN ORDER TO UNDERSTAND HOW TO CREATE THE INCENTIVES AND PROFILES FOR PRIVATE OWNERS OR FOR THE DECISION TO BE MADE TO SAY I DON'T REALLY WANT TO STEP UP BUT I SHOULD FIND SOMEBODY WHO DOES. START CREATING A MARKET FOR THOSE WHO WANT TO DO IT. IN ONE OF THE MEETINGS, PEOPLE RAISED THE ISSUE THAT WE DON'T WANT TO DRIVE OFF LOCAL RETAIL. THERE WAS A GAL IN THE ROOM WHO WAS A LOCAL RETAILER. SHE HAS ANOTHER 25 YEARS ON HER LEASE SO SHE'S THERE TO STAY. SHE SAID MY HUSBAND AND I WILL COMMIT TO SPEAK TO EVERY MERCHANT IN DOWNTOWN SCOTTSDALE AND TALK TO SOMEONE ABOUT WHAT THEIR ISSUES ARE AND HAVE AN APPROACH OF EVERYTHING OF WHAT COULD WORK. THAT WAY THERE COULD BE A WAY FORWARD. WHAT KIND OF THING DO YOU HAVE TO HAVE SO THAT YOU HAVE A BASELINE TO LOOK AT? EVERY PERSON THAT I TALKED TO WHO WAS IN RETAIL, AND UNFORTUNATELY WE HAVE VERY FEW RESTAURANTS RESPONDING, WE COULDN'T GET THEM TO SHOW UP AND TALK TO US MUCH. THIS IS MOSTLY ON THE RETAIL SIDE. THERE WASN'T ANYONE WHO THOUGHT THAT THEIR FUTURE LOOKED BRIGHTER THAN THEIR PAST. A

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 54 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

LOT OF PEOPLE WONDERED IF THEY'D BE IN BUSINESS IN YEARS. THAT PROFILE IS CATASTROPHIC IF IT COMES TO BARE. I DON'T PREDICT THE FUTURE BUT YOU CAN PLAN FOR IT AND YOU CAN PLAN FOR WAYS TO GET TO WHERE YOU WANT TO GO. THAT'S WHAT THE FIRST COMPONENT OF THE DOWNTOWN PLAN TALKS ABOUT IN LOOKING AT THAT.

IN SPEAKING WITH PEOPLE, THEY FELT THAT MONEY COULD BE RAISED PRIVATELY, THAT IT WOULD BE A BENEFIT TO A NUMBER OF PEOPLE OR THAT FOUNDATION OR SOME OTHER MECHANISM OF BEING ABLE TO PULL THAT MONEY TOGETHER COULD NOT LOOK AT THE CITY TO COUNCILMAN LITTLEFIELD'S POINT. IT'S NOT EXACTLY A CITY PROBLEM. A LOT OF TIME YOU GET THE PRIVATE SIDE RIGHT THEN THE CITY SIDE AND THINGS THAT GO ALONG WITH IT MAKES MORE SENSE BECAUSE YOU'RE LOOKING AT A GROWING MARKET PLACE. I DON'T MEAN TO BE SIMPLISTIC ABOUT IT BUT THAT'S WHERE YOU NEED TO GO. WE'VE SEEN IT DONE IN OTHER PLACES AND HAVE SEEN.

Councilman Robbins: I JUST WANTED TO ASK YOU, SINCE YOU'RE HERE AND YOU'VE SEEN THE VISITORS HERE WANT THE SAME THINGS THE RESIDENTS DO. THAT MAKES SENSE AND I JUST ASSUME THAT'S THE CASE BUT I GUESS WHEN I'M LOOKING FOR A PLACE TO VISIT I WANT SOMETHING NEW AND DIFFERENT.

Valeri LeBlanc: THAT'S MORE COMMON.

[Time: 03:48:20]

Councilman Robbins: IS THAT WHAT YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT WHEN YOU SAY YOU KNOW THE PEOPLE THAT ARE COMING HERE BUT NOT THE ONES THAT ARE NOT COMING HERE?

Valeri LeBlanc: I'M SAYING WE KNOW WHO IS COMING BECAUSE THAT'S RESEARCH WE HAVE. GENERALLY, I'D SAY ON THE SIDE OF THINGS, WHEN SCOTTSDALE FIRST STARTED, WHEN ARIZONA FIRST BECAME A TOURISM DESTINATION AND RAILROADS OPENED IT UP, IT WAS EXOTIC. THEY'RE LESS LIKELY TO GO TO THE SAME PLACE OVER AND OVER. WHERE YOU MADE UP IN REPEAT VISITS IN THE OLDER DAYS YOU'RE LESS LIKELY TO DO THAT. YOU WANT THEM TO BE INTERESTED IN SOMETHING NEW. THAT'S ON THE LIST.

Councilman Robbins: LASTLY, YOU TALKED ABOUT EVENTS AND ESPECIALLY BRINGING EVENTS HERE DURING THE SOFT SEASON. OBVIOUSLY WE'RE NOW IN THE MIDDLE OF SPENDING MONEY ON CLIMATE CONTROL, DID YOU LOOK AT THAT AND ENVISION WHAT THAT COULD BE TO US?

Valeri LeBlanc: WE DID. I'M NOT TALKING ABOUT BRINGING EVENTS BUT GROWING THEM, JUST BECAUSE OF THE MONEY. MAYBE IT'S STRATEGIC TO DO IT OCCASIONALLY. DO YOU KNOW WHO PAYS FOR MARDI GRAS? THE CITIZENS, THEY ALL JOIN CREWS, PUT TOGETHER THE FLOATS AND THROW THE STUFF. THE CITY HAS TO DUMP IN SAFETY AND SECURITY AND WE HOPE THEY DO A GOOD JOB BUT THE CITIZENS PAY FOR MARDI GRAS. WHEN WE LOOKED AT WEST WORLD, FIRST OF ALL THE MARKET PLACE, THE KIND OF SPACE, MEETING SPACE, THAT KIND OF GENERAL OPPORTUNITY SPACE, FOR A MEETING OR WHATEVER, IT'S OVER BUILT. A LOT OF PEOPLE HAVE SPENT MORE MONEY ON THAT AND IT'S OVER BUILT. THE VALUE DROPS WHEN YOU DO THAT. EVERYBODY GOT CAUGHT OFF GUARD. IT JUST HAPPENS. SECONDLY, THE FACILITY ITSELF, I THINK, IS A PLUS, FOR THE MARKET PLACE, TO BE ABLE TO HAVE A FACILITY OF THAT SIZE. THE THIRD THING I'D SAY IS I DON'T KNOW ANYTHING ABOUT. I'VE BEEN TO HORSE SHOWS AND THERE ARE GREAT EVENTS IF PHILADELPHIA BUT I DON'T KNOW

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 55 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

MUCH ABOUT IT. I WOULD SAY THAT ON THE WHOLE, GIVEN THE CHOICE TO EXPAND WEST WORLD AS JUST A FACILITY, AND EXPANDING WEST WORLD AS A HORSE FACILITY AND ABILITY TO BE ALTERNATIVELY ANOTHER KIND OF FACILITY, HAS GOT TO BE ANOTHER WINNING STRATEGY. YOU DON'T HAVE VERY MANY COMPETITORS IN THE HORSE MARKET ARENA. IT IS VERY LUCRATIVE MARKET. TO ME, THE MOST DIFFICULT PART IS MIXING MANAGEMENT AND SALES. THOSE ARE TWO DIFFERENT I DIDN'T UNDERSTANDS. SEE IF YOU CAN KIND A MANAGEMENT COMPANY THAT WILL BRING IN THE GOODS AND RECOGNIZE IT IF YOU GET A NATIONAL MANAGEMENT COMPANY YOU WON'T GET SCOTTSDALE SPECIFIC STUFF. IF YOU CAN FORCE AN EVENT EQUESTRIAN SALES, COMPONENTS INTO THAT MANAGEMENT COMPANY AND MAKE THEM SUPPORT IT YOU MAY BE ABLE TO GET THE BEST OF BOTH WORLDS.

Councilman Robbins: THANK YOU.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN. COUNCILWOMAN KORTE.

[Time: 03:52:58]

Councilmember Korte: THANK YOU MAYOR. GREAT PRESENTATION.

Valeri LeBlanc: THANK YOU.

Councilmember Korte: YES, IT IS A COMMUNITY PLAN AND I BELIEVE THIS IS A PLAN THAT NEEDS TO BE EMBRACED NOT ONLY BY THE TOURISM INDUSTRY BUT BY THE COMMUNITY AT LARGE AND THE CITY AND WHERE THE CVB COULD BE A THOUGHT LEADER FOR THIS, IT REALLY IS SOMETHING I THINK THE ENTIRE COMMUNITY CAN EMBRACE. I HAD THE PLEASURE OF SITTING THROUGH MUCH OF THE VISIONING PROCESS THAT A HUNDRED OF OUR CITIZENS PARTICIPATED IN THE LAST THREE DAYS AND IT'S MORE THAN SERENDIPITOUS TO HOW YOUR FINDING PARALLEL MUCH OF WHAT THIS VISIONING PROCESS PRODUCED. I'M TALKING ABOUT THE VALUE OF THE PRESERVE, THAT IS OUR SENSE OF PLACE. DOWNTOWN IT IS OUR SENSE OF PLACE AND THE NEED FOR TRANSPORTATION. WELL, I THINK IT SPEAKS TO THE AUTHENTICITY OF NOT ONLY OUR VISIONING PROCESS BUT YOUR PROCESS THAT THEY HAVE COME TOGETHER IN TWO TOTALLY DIFFERENT PATHS.

QUESTION. EMPHASIS ON DOWNTOWN, I DON'T DISAGREE. I THINK SOME OF THE BOND PROJECTS SPEAKS TO SOME OF THE DOWNTOWN NEEDS BUT YOU ALSO SPEAK OF THE DESERT. THE CITY IN THE DESERT AND THE DESERT IN THE CITY. WHERE DOES THAT PLAY INTO IT? THE INSPIRATIONAL ASPECT, WHEN YOU TALK ABOUT IT'S A POSSIBILITY OR AVENUE FOR INTERPRETATION OR EDUCATION AND INSPIRATION, I'D LIKE TO HEAR MORE OF HOW WE CONNECT WITH THAT. THAT'S MY FIRST QUESTION.

Valeri LeBlanc: GREAT. WHEN WE THINK ABOUT JUST THE VISITORS THAT ARE COMING AND COMING INTO OUR ENVIRONMENT AND IF THEY COME TO MEETINGS, WE HAVE SOME INTERESTING THOUGHTS ABOUT REALLY TRYING TO MAKE OUR MEETING ENVIRONMENT TELL THE STORY OF, I CAN'T REMEMBER THE THREE WORDS NOW. OF INSPIRATION, OF NEW IDEAS, WE IMAGINE, THAT AT SOME POINT YOU SAY TO PEOPLE THAT ARE PLANNING MEETING MEETINGS, COME TO SCOTTSDALE BECAUSE THIS ENVIRONMENT WILL INSPIRE THE BEST OF IDEAS. THE BEST OF YOUR PEOPLE WILL HAPPEN IF YOU COME TO SCOTTSDALE. WE HAD STORY AFTER STORY AFTER STORY OF PEOPLE TALKING ABOUT THAT, THE ACTUAL EXPERIENCE. IT REALLY DOES HAPPEN HERE BUT YOU HAVE TO FRAME IT. AS A SOCIETY WE'RE WAY TOO BUSY TO SEE IT AND UNDERSTAND WHAT WE HAVE RIGHT

IN FRONT OF US. SO WHAT ALL THE RESEARCH SAYS IS BEING ABLE TO STEP BACK AND BE IN A VISIONARY ENVIRONMENT, CREATES THESE IDEAS. I THINK FURTHER THAN THAT, THE IDEA OF BRINGING THE TRAIL SYSTEM DOWNTOWN IS A WAY OF TRYING TO ANCHOR ALL OF THOSE COMPONENTS OF THE PLACE. WHEN WE TALK ABOUT THE PRESERVE. I REALLY THINK THE PRESERVE AS AN ACCOMPLISHMENT IS NOTHING LIKE I'VE SEEN. THE COMMITMENT TO DOING THE PRESERVE IS AN INCREDIBLE PIECE AND WHAT I UNDERSTAND ABOUT HOWELL IT'S BEEN DONE, THE TRAILS HAVE ROCKS IN THE RIGHT PLACES, YOU HAVE 400 CITIZENS OUT GATHERING BIOLOGICAL RESEARCH RESULTS THAT ARE RETIRED ENGINEERS AND OTHER TYPES. THAT STORY OF A COMMUNITY THAT DOES THAT RESONATES THROUGHOUT THE U.S. IF NOT THE WORLD. THOSE ARE THE ISSUES PEOPLE WANT TO UNDERSTAND. I THINK IT'S FAIR TO SAY IT'S HARD TO UNDERSTAND HOW TO MAKE THE COUNTRY BETTER. HOW DO WE GET WHERE WE WANT TO GET AND DO THAT? I DON'T THINK IT'S HARD TO UNDERSTAND WHEN YOU LOOK AT SCOTTSDALE BECAUSE THEY DECIDE HOW TO MAKE THE PLACE BETTER. THAT STORY RESONATES IN THE COMMUNITY AND IT'S A HUGE DRAW. IT'S ESPECIALLY WHERE THEY WANT TO BE. SOME OF THE STRATEGIES IN THIS SUGGEST THAT YOU START REALLY PULL TOGETHER ALL THE ACCOMPLISHMENTS. ONE DAY I HAD A LITTLE TIME BETWEEN LUNCH AND THE NEXT MEETING AND I WENT OVER TO TALK TO THE PEOPLE ABOUT HOW YOU'RE DOING ENVIRONMENTAL REGULATIONS AND THEY SAID IT'S MORE INCENTIVES, MORE SUPPORT, MORE INTEREST AND I THOUGHT WOW. THAT'S WHERE PEOPLE WANT TO BE. THE MORE YOU PULL THE STORY TOGETHER AND START TELLING THEM, THE MORE THE PRESERVE IS THE CROWN JEWEL. CERTAINLY THE SUPPORT FOR ALL THE COMPONENTS THAT IS THE PRESERVE WANTS TO PUT IN PLACE. I THINK, FROM ALL THE PLACES I'VE WORKED THAT YOU'RE THREE HALF STEPS FROM WHERE YOU COULD SEE THE BENEFITS OF WHAT YOU'VE ACHIEVED CIVICALLY. GET INTO THE MARKET PLACE OF IDEAS AND MONEY, BOTH OF THOSE THINGS.

Councilmember Korte: THANK YOU FOR THAT FOLLOW-UP QUESTION. DO YOU SEE THE WHOLE CONCEPT OF THE DDC AS A PART OF THAT DOWN THE ROAD?

Valeri LeBlanc: OBVIOUSLY I'VE HAD A LOT OF CONVERSATIONS WITH PEOPLE INVOLVED IN IT AND I THINK THE PROGRAM THEY'VE PUT IN PLACE HAS NOT MET ITS DECIDING POINT, WHERE THEY ARE, SOMETHING IS MISSING. WHAT I THINK IS NOT QUITE RIGHT IS THE STORY I JUST TOLD YOU. THE OTHER THING I TOLD YOU THAT THE BUILDING PROGRAM THAT I'VE READ ABOUT IS ABOUT A TOURISM ATTRACTION. I REALLY BELIEVE IN THE CONTEXT OF WHAT I'M SUGGESTING HERE AND MY COLLEAGUES AGREE, THAT IT'S BIGGER THAN THAT. IT'S MORE ABOUT THE PLACE, MORE ABOUT THE RESEARCH, MORE ABOUT ACTIVATING THIS KIND OF COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT AND GIVING PEOPLE ACCESS TO THAT AND UNDERSTANDING THE DESERT AT THE SAME TIME. WHAT I SAID TO SOME OF THE PEOPLE WHO WERE REAL ADVOCATES FOR THE BUILDING BEFORE THE STEPS CAME UP WAS GET THE PROGRAM RIGHT. GET THE RESEARCH PROGRAM RIGHT AND THE BIG VISION OUT THERE FIRST AND THEN YOU'LL KNOW EXACTLY WHAT'S GOING TO BE.

Councilmember Korte: THE LAST QUESTION, YOU TALKED ABOUT TRANSPORTATION ISSUES, RENTAL CAR ISSUES FROM THE AIRPORT. LET'S TAKE THAT A STEP OUTSIDE OF THE RENTAL CAR INDUSTRY. WHAT IS TODAY'S VISITORS LOOKING FOR TRYING TO GET FROM POINT A TO POINT B.

Valeri LeBlanc: THAT'S A MAJOR VACATION THING. I THINK CARS CAN'T BE THE ONLY OPTION. YOU HAVE TO HAVE MORE CHOICES FOR TRANSPORTATION FOR VISITORS. A LOT OF PEOPLE COMING FROM CITIES ARE MORE USED TO OTHER KINDS OF TRANSPORTATION. THE FIRST THING I'D SAY IS

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 57 OF 70 FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION

CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

MORE CHOICES, MORE OPTIONS AND THE ABILITY TO DO IT. SECOND IS THAT YOU NEED AN ORIENTATION EXPERIENCE. YOU'VE GOT PEOPLE THAT COME HERE AND THEY GO THROUGH THIS WHOLE PROCESS AND THEY GET ON THE INTERSTATE AND THEY SEE THE BROWN HILLS AND DON'T KNOW WHAT TO THINK. THEY DON'T UNDERSTAND WHAT IS RICH ABOUT IT AND INTERESTING ABOUT IT. THE ARRIVAL EXPERIENCE IS IMPORTANT. THAT'S WHY I THINK IF YOU FIND A WAY TO THINK ABOUT THE ARRIVAL EXPERIENCE DIFFERENTLY AND INTERPRETING ALONG THE WAY YOU'LL BE BETTER OFF.

Councilmember Korte: THANK YOU.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILWOMAN. VICE MAYOR KLAPP.

[Time: 04:02:51]

Vice Mayor Klapp: THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR REPORT. I THINK YOU IDENTIFICATION OF DOWNTOWN, THE PLACE WE NEED TO FOCUS ON IS SPOT ON IN THE CITY OF SCOTTSDALE. CALLING IT ARIZONA CENTRAL IS A BROAD VIEW BUT A GOOD ONE. THERE IS NOT REALLY OTHER DOWNTOWNS IN THE VALLEY THAT PEOPLE WANT TO GO TO. WE ACTUALLY HAVE THE BEGINNINGS OF A REALLY ATTRACTIVE DOWNTOWN FOR VISITORS. I THINK FOLKS SEE MORE ON EVENTS THERE AND EVEN IN TALKING ABOUT TOURISTS, WE HAVE TO REMEMBER OUR RESIDENTS AS WELL. WELL, RESIDENTS HAVE A LOT OF PEOPLE WHO VISIT THEM BUT THE RESIDENTS DON'T TAKE THEIR VISITORS DOWNTOWN. THEY TAKE THEM OTHER PLACES. SO I THINK WE HAVE TO REMEMBER THAT IF WE ENTICE THE RESIDENTS TO GO DOWN THERE THEY'LL TAKE THE VISITORS DOWN THERE. ONE THING THAT STRUCK ME AND I THINK I HAD A BRIEFING ON THIS, IT MAY NOT BE THE ANSWER, YOU TALKED A LITTLE ABOUT TRANSPORTATION, PEOPLE GO TO A RESORT AND THEY WANT TO GO TO THE DESERT SO THEY TAKE A PINK JEEP TOUR TO THE DESERT. WHY COULDN'T THEY TAKE A PINK JEEP TOUR TO DOWNTOWN? WHY DOES THE JEEP ALWAYS HAVE TO GO INTO THE DESERT. IF THEY COULD GET IN ONE AND DO A DOWNTOWN TOUR AND GET DROPPED OFF AND DO THE DESERT, THAT'S DIFFERENT. IT'S NOT RIDING A TROLLEY OR A BUS, BUT IT'S MORE OF A DESERT EXPERIENCE SINCE WE'RE A DESERT CITY. ALSO, IN THINKING ABOUT TRYING TO ENTICE PEOPLE AT THE AIRPORT, WHY COULDN'T WE HAVE A PINK JEEP AT THE AIRPORT WITH A BIG SCOTTSDALE ARROW ON IT, DON'T FORGET TO COME TO SCOTTSDALE WHEN YOU ARRIVE AT SKY HARBOR. IT GOT ME TO THINKING A LOT AND I APPRECIATE THAT. IT'S THE THINGS WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT IN BRINGING PEOPLE DOWNTOWN. YOU ALSO MENTIONED WITH RETAILERS AND PROBLEMS THAT YOU FOUND, AND IT CONCERNS ME AS A RETAILER MYSELF, THAT WHEN PEOPLE START THINKING THEY'RE GOING TO HANG ON FOR THREE MORE YEARS THEN THEY DON'T TAKE CARE OF THEIR BUSINESSES. THEY PUT OUT GOING OUT OF BUSINESS SCIENCE AND WE HAVE SOME OF THAT GOING ON DOWNTOWN. IT CONCERNS ME. ONE OF THE PEOPLE THAT WAS HERE AT THE MEETING THAT SENT A CARD TO US SAID SOMETHING THAT REALLY IS TRUE. HE SAID THE EXPERIENCE THAT SOME VISITORS HAVE IN DOWNTOWN IS THEY FEEL IT'S A TOURISTS TRAP BECAUSE THEY GO TO THE SHOPS THAT SALE THE SAME THING. IT DOESN'T GIVE THEM A GOOD FEELING OF DOWNTOWN. I THINK YOU HIT UPON A GOOD IDEA GETTING OWNERS TO THINK MORE ABOUT WHAT THEY SHOULD DO WITH THEIR PROPERTY. THE CITY CAN GET INTO A CONVERSATION WITH THEM ABOUT THAT. I DON'T HAVE A QUESTION BUT WANT TO SAY I THINK WHAT YOU'VE IDENTIFIED IS A GOOD FIRST STEP FOR US. I THINK WE NEED TO TAKE THIS FURTHER AND INVESTIGATE WHAT WE CAN DO TO FOCUS MORE ON DOWNTOWN AND HOW IT CAN BE AN ATTRACTION FOR TOURISTS AND FOR LOCAL PEOPLE. I THINK LOCAL PEOPLE ALSO WOULD COME

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 58 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION **CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT**

DOWNTOWN IF, MAYBE WE CAN PUT THEM IN A PINK JEEP. THEY DON'T WANT TO DRIVE THEIR CAR OR DON'T WANT TO PARK.

Valeri LeBlanc: OR DON'T SEE AS WELL AT NIGHT AS THEY USE TO.

Vice Mayor Klapp: THERE IS NO WAY TO GET DOWNTOWN OTHER THAN GET IN A CAR. MAYBE THERE HAS TO BE MORE OF THAT THOUGHT PROCESS IN MAKING IT A PLEASANT EXPERIENCE IN BRINGING IT DOWN IN GROUPS SO THEY CAN GET FAMILIAR WITH DOWNTOWN. OVER ALL, I DON'T HAVE A QUESTION OTHER THAN TO SAY I THINK THAT THE THOUGHT PROCESS THAT WENT INTO THIS DISCUSSION THAT YOU HAD WITH ALL THE VARIOUS STAKEHOLDER SOCIAL SECURITY A GOOD ONE AND I HOPE WE CAN TAKE IT TO ANOTHER LEVEL AND IMPLEMENT THINGS AND DEVELOP A LOCAL EVENT THAT WILL BRING PEOPLE IN AND REASONS WHY WE NEED WE NEED TO BRING BOTH TOURISTS AND LOCALS DOWNTOWN. THANK YOU FOR WHAT YOU'VE GIVEN US TO THINK ABOUT.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU VICE MAYOR. COUNCILMAN PHILLIPS.

[Time: 04:08:17]

Councilman Phillips: THANK YOU MAYOR. A COUPLE MORE POINTS TO BRING UP. I BELIEVE WE USED TO HAVE TROLLEY TOURS. I THINK THAT'S A GREAT IDEA. I LEARNED A LOT MYSELF FROM DOING THAT.

Valeri LeBlanc: I UNDERSTAND THERE ARE STILL TROLLEYS IN THE HIGH SEASON.

Councilman Phillips: YOU SAID SOMETHING ABOUT SOMETHING WE SHOULD OWN. WE USE TO HAVE THAT AND THAT WAS THE PARADA DEL SOL. WE HAD A MONTH LONG EVENT THAT KIND OF DIED. I WOULD LOVE TO SEE THAT RETURN.

Valeri LeBlanc: I THINK SO TOO. I THINK THAT'S RIGHT. YOUR INSTINCTS ARE RIGHT ABOUT THAT.

Councilman Phillips: YOU ALSO SAID CITIZEN PARTICIPATION. I THINK THE CITIZENS OF SCOTTSDALE ARE CLAMORING TO PARTICIPATE. THEY WANT TO DO SOMETHING AND WE'RE NOT GIVING THEM ANYTHING TO DO. EVEN WITH THE PARADE THEY CAN BUILD FLOATS. WE HAD THE AMBASSADOR PROGRAM. THAT WAS A GREAT WAY FOR PEOPLE TO COME UP AND SAY WHERE SHOULD I GO. I THINK DOWNTOWN HAS TO REINVENT ITSELF. I THINK WE SHOULD MOVE FORWARD WITH THIS IDEA.

Valeri LeBlanc: THANK YOU.

Mayor Lane: WELL, WE HAVE NO FURTHER QUESTIONS AND I APPRECIATE THE PRESENTATION AND ALL THE PARTICIPATION.

Valeri LeBlanc: I DO TOO, THANK YOU.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU VALERIE.

[Time: 04:10:05]

Steve Geiogamah: THAT CONCLUDES OUR PRESENTATION. WE HAVE ONE REQUESTED DIRECTION FROM COUNCIL THIS EVENING. WE HAVE FOUR OPTIONS FOR CONSIDERATION. WE'D LIKE COUNCIL TO LOOK AT STEPS IN IDENTIFYING LEADERSHIP GROUP IN CARRYING THROUGH THE PLAN. EITHER BY ESTABLISHING A LEADERSHIP GROUP OR COMMITTEE WHICH COULD CARRY FORWARD THE VISION OF THE PLAN THAT HAS BEEN OUTLINED THIS EVENING, POTENTIALLY IDENTIFY A MANAGER, EXPAND THE EFFORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT AND ONE OPTION IS HAVING PLACES OR ANOTHER CONSULTANT WORKING WITH CITY STAFF. THESE ARE FOUR OPTIONS THAT WE'RE LOOKING FOR COUNCIL DIRECTION TO CARRY FORWARD ON THE NEXT STEP. ONCE WE IDENTIFY THIS WE'LL COME BACK IN 60 DAYS WITH THE PRIORITIZATION OF THE PLAN, BUDGET NUMBERS, LOOKING AT SOURCES OF FUNDING, PETITIONING PRIVATE AND PUBLIC TO MOVE THE PLAN FORWARD. SO THAT CONCLUDES OUR PRESENTATION OTHER THAN THE DIRECTION. THANK YOU FOR THAT.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. YEAH, NOW AGAIN, THIS IS A NON-ACTION ITEM BUT IS CONSENSUS OF OPINION.

Councilwoman Milhaven: I THINK I'M THE ONLY ONE THAT HAS NOT SPOKEN ON THIS. THANK YOU FOR THAT GREAT REPORT. IN TERMS OF MY POINT OF VIEW ON THESE, WE NEED TO MOVE FORWARD AND WE NEED A GROUP TO CHAMPION THIS BUT WE NEED TO UNDERSTAND HOW IT RELATES TO THE GENERAL PLAN. I THINK WE ALL AGREE THAT WE WANT DOWNTOWN WITH SHOP OWNERS WHO ARE SUCCESSFUL AND IT'S A PLACE WE WANT TO GO AND TOURISTS TOO BUT WE NEED TO MAKE SURE IT'S COORDINATED WITH ALL THE OTHER EFFORTS. VALERIE, YOU DID A NICE JOB. YOU HAVE PRODUCT DEVELOPMENT, MARKETING AND ADVERTISING. THIS IS REALLY CHALLENGING US TO SAY WHAT'S THE PRODUCT AND THE RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT. YOU NEED TO BE IN THE FUTURE. IT'S A GREAT, WE'VE ALWAYS KNOWN TOURISM IN THE COMMUNITY HAVE INTERTWINED AND THIS IS CHALLENGING US TO LOOK A DIFFERENT WAY. SO YES, BUT WE HAVE A LOT MORE WORK TO DO AROUND THE SCOPE OF WHAT THE GROUP IS GOING TO DO. PROJECT MANAGER, LET'S KEEP WAKING DOWN THE ROAD AND SEE WHERE THAT TAKES US. I'M FINE TO CONTINUE DOWN THIS ROAD JUST MORE DETAIL. THIS IS A WORK PLAN, NOT A FINAL PLAN. LET'S KEEP GOING.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILWOMAN. VICE MAYOR KLAPP.

Vice Mayor Klapp: WHEN YOU PUT THESE FOUR POINTS UP THERE ARE WE SUPPOSE TO GIVE YOU DIRECTION ON ONE OF THEM OR ARE YOU SAYING THESE ARE VARIOUS LEVELS TO TAKE?

Steve Geiogamah: WE'RE LOOKING FOR LIKE LEADERSHIP GROUP OR PROJECT MANAGER OR A COMBINATION WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE CONSULTING. THERE ARE OPTIONS AVAILABLE.

Vice Mayor Klapp: I'D SEE IT IN HAVING PLACES CONSULTING, WORK ON NEXT STEPS. AT SOME POINT WE'D PROBABLY NEED A PROJECT MANAGER BUT I THINK WE DON'T NEED THAT UNTIL THERE IS MORE WORK DONE. I SAY HAVE CONSULTING WORK WITH THE STAFF ON THIS.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU VICE MAYOR. COUNCILMAN PHILLIPS.

Councilmember Phillips: MY RECOMMENDATION IS I'D LIKE TO IDENTIFY THE PROJECT MANAGER. YOU WANT TO ESTABLISH A LEADERSHIP GROUP THAT COULD MAYBE INCLUDE RESIDENTS. YOU USE THAT

FOR THE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT SO YOU REALLY USE ALL THREE. THEN HAVE THEM WORKING ON A DIMINISHING LEVEL UNTIL WE CAN TAKE OVER. I'D LIKE TO SEE US CONTINUE WORKING WITH THE CVB SO WHAT WE DO COINCIDES WITH WHAT THEY DO.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN. COUNCILMAN LITTLEFIELD.

[Time: 04:14:50]

Councilman Littlefield: WE HAVE A TOURISM DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION, WHY WOULD THEY NOT BE THE LEADERSHIP GROUP WHO ARE CUSTODIANS OF THE VISION?

Steve Geiogamah: THEY ARE INVOLVED IN THE PLAN. THERE ARE OPTIONAL ELEMENTS TO THE PLAN REGARDING THE REPORT AND THE RESEARCH. THE TOURIST DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION WILL BE INVOLVED IN THE PLAN ITSELF. WE'RE LOOKING AT POTENTIALLY A BROADER SCOPE, LIKE MAYBE THE RESIDENTS AS WELL, BECAUSE OF THE SCOPE OF THE PLAN ITSELF. WE FELT THAT POTENTIALLY A WIDER GROUP OF THE COMMISSION WOULD BE INVOLVED, THEY'D BE INVOLVED.

Councilman Littlefield: I WOULD BE OPPOSED IN HAVING THE CITY TAKE THE LEAD ON THIS. WE'RE NOT TOURISM PEOPLE. WE'RE EITHER BUREAUCRATS OR POLITICIANS. THIS IS A TOURISM EFFORT THEN I THINK IT'S LEAD BY THE TOURISM COMMUNITY. WE HAVE CVB. I WOULD GUESS THAT WE DON'T WANT TO ADD MORE BUREAUCRACY, MAYBE YOU WANT A WIDER PARTICIPATION. SAME THING WITH PROJECT MANAGER. THAT FUNCTION SHOULD BE PERFORMED BY THE PEOPLE IN THE TOURISM COMMUNITY, NOT US. I DON'T KNOW WHY WE HAVE A EXPAND THE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT OFFICE. I CAN'T SEE WHAT WE'D HAVE TO DO DIFFERENT THERE. THEY'RE RESPONSIBLE FOR THAT. AS FAR SPENDING MORE MONEY ON A CONSULTANT, I THINK THE WORK THE CONSULTANT DID IS EXCELLENT AND ILLUMINATING TO ME. I DON'T KNOW WHY WE'D WANT TO SPEND ANYMORE MONEY. I THINK WE HAVE THE INFORMATION WE NEED.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN. I WOULD FAVOR THE FIRST BULLET POINT AND THAT IS TO ESTABLISHING A LEADERSHIP GROUP OR COMMITTEE WHO IS THE CUSTODIANS OF THE VISION. I THINK THIS COUNCIL COULD BE RESPONSIBLE FOR OF CERTAIN CRITERIA. STAKEHOLDERS WOULD THEN BE INVESTED A BIT AND ALSO CARRYING THIS FORWARD WITH THAT INVESTMENT. I THINK THAT THAT'S THE BEST WAY TO GO. THE REST OF THEM, I THINK THEY HAVE VALIDITY. I THINK THE OFFICE WILL BE A LIAISON IN ANY CASE. IF WE GET TO THE POINT OF A PROJECT MANAGER, IT COULD BE FROM THIS GROUP. THERE IS A CONSENSUS THAT IT'S A GOOD REPORT AND HAS VALUABLE INFORMATION FOR US TO SET IN MOTION. THOSE FOLKS WHO ARE INVESTED TO A DEGREE THERE IS THE IDEA OF HAVING CITIZENS INVOLVED BUT I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE HAVE PEOPLE WITH SOMEWHAT OF A STAKEHOLDERS STATUS IN ACTUALLY EXECUTING THESE THINGS WITH THE COMMUNITY. WE CAN DO IT INDIVIDUALLY. MEMBERS OF THIS COUNCIL CAN DECIDE. SETTING UP A TASK FORCE IS SOMETHING WE WOULD TYPICALLY DO. THAT WOULD BE THE MOST USEFUL AND MOST DIRECT WAY TO MOVE FORWARD ON IT. COUNCILMAN ROBBINS.

[Time: 04:19:17]

Councilman Robbins: THANK YOU MAYOR. I THINK I'M IN LINE WITH YOUR THINKING ON THIS IN HAVING A LEADERSHIP GROUP ESTABLISHED TO MARSHALL THIS THING ALONG AND PUSH IT IN ALL THE DIRECTIONS. IT WOULD HAVE PART OF THE TOURISM COMMUNITY BUT ALSO BIGGER THAN

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 61 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

THAT, DOWNTOWN AND PARTS OF THE COMMUNITY INVOLVED. THE OTHER THREE BULLETS, WE MAY WEAVE THAT THROUGH ONCE THE COMMITTEE GETS GOING AND DECIDES THEY NEED HELP WITH THE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT. LEADERSHIP GROUP WOULD BE MY SUGGESTION.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN. COUNCILWOMAN KORTE.

Councilmember Korte. THANK YOU MAYOR. WE FIRST START WITH A LEADERSHIP GROUP AND THAT LEADERSHIP GROUP NEEDS TO CONSIST, MY OPINION, PERHAPS CONSIST OF STAKEHOLDERS FROM DOWNTOWN TO THE PRESERVATION COMMUNITY TO RESIDENTS TO THE TOURISM COMMUNITY AND ALSO, I BELIEVE, THERE MUST BE CITY COUNCIL REPRESENTATION ON THERE. I THINK THIS IS A REALLY IMPORTANT PLAN, A REALLY IMPORTANT VISION. THAT PARALLELS AND INTERTWINES WITH THE GENERAL PLAN AS LEAD BY THE CITY. I THINK THIS IS IMPORTANT WORK TO BE LEAD BY THE CITY. THAT'S ALL I HAVE.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILWOMAN. I THINK WE'VE GOT A CONSENSUS BUT MAYBE STEVE YOU COULD SAY SO. I BELIEVE SOME FORM OF THE FIRST BULLET POINT IS WHAT I BELIEVE THE MAJORITY ARE IN LINE WITH. WE MAY HAVE TO WORK OUT DETAILS OF HOW TO STRUCTURE THAT BUT THIS POINT IN TIME IS HOW WE WANT TO BE GOING.

Steve Geiogamah: WE'LL PROCEED IN THAT DIRECTION AND BRING SOMETHING BACK IN 60 DAYS. WE'LL ALSO BRING IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PLAN AND BUDGET.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU. THANK YOU FOR ALL THE PARTICIPANTS IN THAT AND ALL THE INPUT WE RECEIVED.

ITEM 3 – CITY MANAGER RECRUITMENT

[Time: 04:21:46]

Mayor Lane: THE NEXT ITEM ON THE WORK STUDY AGENDA IS WORK CITY MANAGER RECRUITMENT PROGRAM THAT WE'RE ABOUT TO EMBARK UPON FOR THE CITY MANAGER'S POSITION. WE HAVE BERNADETTE LA MAZZA.

Human Resources Manager Bernadette La Mazza: GOOD EVENING MAYOR AND MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL. WE'RE HERE TONIGHT TO TALK TO YOU ABOUT WHAT IT IS WE NEED TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THE CITY MANAGER RECRUITMENT. BEFORE I GET STARTED THIS EVENING I'D LIKE TO INTRODUCE COLIN BEANZIGER FROM BEANZIGER AND ASSOCIATES. HE'S THE INDIVIDUAL WHOSE COMPANY WAS AWARDED THE CONTRACT TO DO THE RECRUITMENT. HE'S GOING TO GIVE YOU A BASIC OVERVIEW OF THE RECRUITMENT PROCESS. AS WE GO FORWARD WE'LL GET MORE INTO THE DETAILS ON THE SPECIFIC PIECES.

[Time: 04:23:22]

Colin Beanziger: GOOD EVENING, COLIN BEANZIGER. WE THOUGHT PERHAPS THE EASIEST THING TO DO IS START WITH AN OVERVIEW OF WHAT WE NORMALLY DO. I'VE SEEN A NUMBER OF QUESTIONS COME FROM THE COUNCIL. I'LL TRY TO DO THIS FAIRLY QUICKLY BECAUSE I KNOW YOU'VE BEEN HERE

A LONG TIME ALREADY BUT I THINK THAT WILL ANSWER A WILL THE OF YOUR QUESTIONS. THIS IS KIND OF OUR TYPICAL APPROACH. WHAT I WOULD SAY TO YOU IS THIS IS YOUR APPROACH. IF THERE IS VARIATIONS THAT YOU THINK WOULD BE HELPFUL TO YOU TO GET THE KIND OF INFORMATION YOU NEED TO MAKE THE BEST DECISION THEN PLEASE BRING THEM UP AND WE'LL DISCUSS THEM AND INCORPORATE THEM IF THAT'S THE WILL OF THE BODY.

THE FIRST THING IS FOR ME TO COME TO SCOTTSDALE AND TALK TO YOU WHICH IS WHAT WE'RE DOING TONIGHT. I TALKED TO THE MAYOR AND COUNCILMAN LITTLEFIELD. I'D LIKE TO TALK TO ALL OF YOU. IT'S IMPORTANT FOR ME TO GET TO KNOW YOU A LITTLE BIT. WHEN I START RECRUITING CANDIDATES I NEED TO KNOW WHAT YOU WANT AND I NEED TO HAVE A FEEL FOR YOU. THE GOOD CANDIDATES WILL SAY WHAT ARE THEY LIKE? WHAT'S IMPORTANT TO THEM? THAT ONE-ON-ONE CONVERSATION CAN BE HELPFUL TO ME. I UNDERSTAND SOME OF YOU ARE PART-TIME AND SOME OF YOU TRAVEL. IF I CAN HAVE A FEW MINUTES OF YOUR TIME, THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL.

THE SECOND STEP IS TO DRAFT THE BROCHURE AND FINALIZE IT. THERE ARE MODIFICATIONS WE WANT TO MAKE TO IT. GIVING YOU A SAMPLE BROCHURE, THE KIND OF THING WE NORMALLY DO, THE ASSISTANT CITY MANAGER IS KIND OF IRRELEVANT BUT THIS IS WHAT WE FIND IS USEFUL TO REACH OUT TO CANDIDATES. OUR GOAL IS TO SALE CANDIDATES ON THE CITY. TELL THEM WHAT A GREAT PLACE SCOTTSDALE IS. THE FIRST TWO PRESENTATIONS HAVE GIVEN A GREAT FEEL OF WHAT YOU HAVE TO OFFER. THIS IS THE BROCHURE. ONCE THAT'S DONE WE'LL GO OUT. THIS IS NOT NECESSARILY SEQUENTIAL. I'VE TALKED TO CANDIDATES I THINK WOULD BE GOOD FOR SCOTTSDALE. ONE OF THE THINGS I'D LIKE TO MENTION TO YOU NOW IS THERE ARE ABOUT 180 CITIES IN THE UNITED STATES WITH THE CITY MANAGER FORM OF GOVERNMENT THAT HAVE POPULATIONS OVER A HUNDRED THOUSAND. SO THE MARKET PLACE IS A GOOD NEWS BAD NEWS STORY. THE MARKET PLACE IS RELATIVELY SMALL SO WE CAN REACH OUT TO THOSE CANDIDATES. FOR A CITY LIKE SCOTTSDALE YOU LOOK AT SOMEBODY WHO HAS BEEN MANAGER OR ASSISTANT IN A CITY OF OVER A HUNDRED THOUSAND. THAT'S THE GOOD NEWS. THE BAD NEWS IS THE MARKET PLACE IS RELATIVELY SMALL. THERE ARE PROBABLY 400 TO 600 POSSIBLE CANDIDATES. FOR ONE REASON OR ANOTHER THERE ARE NOT GOING TO BE A WILL THE OF WELL QUALIFIED PEOPLE WHO ARE GOING TO WANT TO MOVE. IT'S A RELATIVELY SMALL NUMBER OF PEOPLE WE'LL BE LOOKING AT. WE HAVE A LIST OF THOSE PEOPLE THAT WE DEVELOPED OVER THE LAST MONTH. WE'LL REACH OUT TO THEM. WE DO ADVERTISE. WE USE CITY COUNCIL MANAGEMENT NEWS LETTER. WE HAVE AN E-MAIL LIST OF OUR OWN THAT HAS ABOUT 78,000 MEMBERS. THERE ARE POPULATIONS WITH A CITY MANAGEMENT GOVERNMENT AND THAT LIST IS COMPLETE. IF I SEND THIS TO ALL 7300 THEY MAY NOT BE QUALIFIED OR THINK SCOTTSDALE IS THE BEST PLACE FOR THEM BUT THEY MAY HAVE FRIENDS THAT ARE QUALIFIED. AS I'VE SAID I TALK TODAY A NUMBER OF PEOPLE, I HAD THREE PEOPLE OR FOUR PEOPLE THAT I COULD THINK OF THAT ARE POSSIBLE CANDIDATES. WE'LL GO FIND SOME MORE. THE DEADLINE WILL PASS FOR SUBMITTING APPLICATIONS. WE USE A RELATIVELY SOFT DEADLINE. YOU HAVE TO HAVE A DEADLINE OR PEOPLE WON'T APPLY. IF SOMEONE COMES IN TWO OR THREE DAYS LATE I WON'T SAY YOU MISSED THE DEADLINE. WE'LL LOOK AT THE CANDIDATE AND SEE IF THEY'RE A GOOD FIT.

[Time 04:29:12]

THE FIRST STEP AFTER WE LOOK AT THE RESUMES. FIRST OF ALL I'LL GO THROUGH THE RESUMES MYSELF AND I I'LL PICK OUT 10 TO 12 CANDIDATES THAT ARE STRONG AND THEN I'M GOING TO CALL

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

PAGE 63 OF 70

THEM ON THE PHONE AND TALK TO THEM. THE QUESTIONS I ASK ARE RELATIVELY SIMPLE. WHAT IS YOUR MANAGEMENT STYLE? WHAT IS YOUR BIGGEST ACHIEVEMENT? YOUR BIGGEST FAILURE? WHY ARE YOU INTERESTED IN SCOTTSDALE? WHAT I FOUND IS, BY GETTING THE ANSWERS TO THOSE QUESTIONS, I CAN DO A GOOD ASSESSMENT OF WHETHER OR NOT THAT PERSON IS A GOOD MANAGER OR NOT. IT'S A SKILL I HAVE DEVELOPED OVER THE YEARS. I CALL IT THE COLIN TEST. IF THEY PASS THE COLIN TEST THEN WE PUT THEM THROUGH OUR BACKGROUND CHECK. THAT INVOLVES GETTING AN EXTENSIVE LIST OF REFERENCES FROM THE CANDIDATE WE TELL THEM WHO WE WANT TO TALK TO. WE DON'T ASK FOR THEIR FIVE BEST FRIENDS, THEIR ELECTED OFFICIALS, PAST ELECTED OFFICIALS, THE CHAMBER OF COMMERCE DIRECTOR, THE CITY ATTORNEY, THE EXTERNAL AUDITOR. WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THEY KNOW HOW TO MANAGE THE MONEY. IT WILL BE SOME COMMUNITY ACTIVISTS, SOME PEERS, SOME NEWSPAPER REPORTERS, HUMAN RESOURCE DIRECTOR AND SO FORTH. OUR GOAL IS TO TALK TO AT LEAST EIGHT REFERENCES AND AS MANY AS TWELVE. AS A PRACTICAL MATTER NOT EVERYONE IS GOING TO RETURN YOUR CALL, SOME WILL BE OUT OF TOWN. WE HAVE FOUND THAT IF WE CAN GET TO EIGHT PEOPLE WE HAVE A GOOD IDEA OF WHO THE CANDIDATE IS AND IF THERE IS SOMETHING WE NEED TO KNOW ABOUT THEM THAT MAY BE UNPLEASANT ABOUT A CANDIDATE SOMEBODY IN THAT GROUP WILL LET US KNOW. WE DO EXTENSIVE INTERNET CHECKS. WE DO BACKGROUND CHECKS CRIMINAL AT THE COUNTY STATE AND FEDERAL LEVEL. CIVIL RECORDS CHECKS AND THE COUNTY AND FEDERAL LEVEL. WE DO BANKRUPTCY, CREDIT, DMV AND SO FORTH. WE VERIFY EDUCATION AND EMPLOYMENT FOR THE LAST FIFTEEN YEARS. THE RESULT OF THAT IS A REPORT ON EACH CANDIDATE.

I STOPPED KILLING TREES AND I TRY TO TRANSMIT THIS ELECTRONICALLY THESE DAYS. THIS IS AN EXAMPLE OF A REPORT THAT WE PUT TOGETHER FOR A COMMUNITY EMPLOYER. EVERYTHING IN FLORIDA IS A PUBLIC RECORD SO ANYONE WHO WANTS TO LOOK AT IT CAN LOOK AT IT. THAT IS EIGHT CANDIDATES AND THAT IS THE BACKGROUND INFORMATION. A LOT OF THAT IS THE INTERNET AND YOU CAN SKIP RIGHT THROUGH IT BUT THERE IS SOME VERY GOOD INFORMATION ON THE REFERENCES. WE DO PROVIDE THE NAME OF WHO WE TALK TO, HOW THEY KNOW THE CANDIDATE AND THEIR TELEPHONE NUMBER. IF YOU SEE SOMETHING IN THE REFERENCE THAT YOU WANT TO FOLLOW UP ON YOU CAN CALL THAT INDIVIDUAL OR YOU CAN CALL US AND WE WILL FOLLOW UP ON IT. AT THAT POINT I WILL NARROW THE FIELD DOWN TO FIVE CANDIDATES AND I WILL MAKE THAT RECOMMENDATION TO YOU TO INTERVIEW THOSE FIVE CANDIDATES. IF YOU LIKE I CAN GIVE YOU THE TOP EIGHT.

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 64 OF 70 FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION

CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

ONE. THOSE ONE-ON-ONE INTERVIEWS GIVE YOU THE OPPORTUNITY TO TEST THE CHEMISTRY. ARE YOU COMFORTABLE WITH THIS PERSON? YOU CAN ASK THE QUESTIONS THAT YOU WANT TO ASK. SOMETIMES WHEN YOU ARE IN THE FULL COUNCIL MEETING YOUR TIME IS LIMITED AND YOU CAN'T ASK ALL THE QUESTIONS YOU WANT TO ASK. THOSE ONE-ON-ONES TYPICALLY LAST THIRTY TO FORTY MINUTES. THE LAST VENUE IS THE CITY COUNCIL MEETING. YOU CAN DO IT IN EXECUTIVE SESSION OR IN OPEN SESSION. THE POINT IS THE CANDIDATE STANDS IN FRONT OF YOU AND ANSWERS QUESTIONS. WHEN YOU ARE DONE IF YOU DO THE WHOLE PROCESS, YOU SEE THEM IN A SOCIAL SETTING, YOU SEE THEM ONE-ON-ONE YOU HAVE TESTED THE CHEMISTRY AND YOU HAVE HAD THE COUNCIL MEETING SESSION. I CAN'T EMPHASIS ENOUGH THE CHEMISTRY. WHAT IS GOING TO MAKE OR BREAK YOUR MANAGER IS IF YOUR CANDIDATE HAS GOOD CHEMISTRY WITH YOU, WITH YOUR STAFF AND WITH YOUR COMMUNITY. YOU WILL FIND THAT THE VERY BEST MANAGERS, YOU WILL HAVE GOOD CHEMISTRY WITH THEM AFTER THE NEXT ELECTION WHOEVER IS ON THE DIAS WILL HAVE GOOD CHEMISTRY WITH THEM. THE BEST MANGERS KNOW HOW TO WORK WITH PEOPLE. WHEN YOU ARE DONE WE USUALLY RECOMMEND THAT YOU TAKE A COUPLE OF DAYS AND COME BACK AS A BODY AND DECIDE WHO YOU WANT TO HAVE AS YOUR MANAGER. TYPICALLY THAT IS DONE IN EXECUTIVE SESSION. THAT'S IT IN A NUTSHELL AND WE CAN HELP YOU NEGOTIATE A CONTRACT IF YOU LIKE. WE HAVE A MODEL THAT WE USE. YOU MAY HAVE ONE THAT YOUR PREFER AND YOU MAY PREFER TO HAVE THE CITY ATTORNEY DO IT. WE ARE AVAILABLE IF YOU WANT US TO HELP. THAT'S IT IN A NUT SHELL IN TERMS OF HOW WE DO IT.

[Time 04:36:22]

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COLIN. I APPRECIATE THAT OUTLINE. I HAVE ONE QUESTION OR A COMMENT. I SUPPOSE IT MIGHT TAKE ON BOTH FORMS. AFTER HAVE LOOKED EARLIER AT YOUR BROCHURE AND THE WAY YOU HAVE THAT LAID OUT. I UNDERSTAND THAT IT IS NOT PART OF YOUR CONTRACT TO WORK WITH THAT BROCHURE BUT I THINK THIS KIND OF COMMUNICATION TO PROSPECTIVE CITY MANAGER CANDIDATES IS SO CRITICALLY IMPORTANT THAT WE GIVE AS BROAD A STROKE. IT'S AN IMPORTANT DECISION FOR ANY ONE OF THOSE CANDIDATES BUT IT IS ALSO IMPORTANT FOR US TO MAKE SURE THAT ANY CANDIDATE IS FULLY AWARE. TO BE ABLE TO ESTABLISH THAT CHEMISTRY EVEN THOUGH I AM SURE THAT A HIGHLY SKILLED MANAGER WILL BE ABLE TO HAVE THAT CHEMISTRY AND HAVE THAT ABILITY TO WORK WITH PEOPLE. TO HAVE A GENERAL OVERALL AND EXTENSIVE UNDERSTANDING OF THE HISTORY AND OF THE POPULATION, THE DEMOGRAPHICS, THE INDUSTRY, THE IMPORTANT POINTS THAT DRIVE US, OUR ENVIRONMENT AS WE HAVE CREATED FOR THE PRESERVE AND OUR GENERAL POPULATIONS INTEREST IN MAINTAINING A FIRST CLASS COMMUNITY WITH AN UNDERSTANDING OF WHERE OUR CONSTITUENCY IS, WHERE THEY COME FROM, AVERAGE AGE AND THOSE THINGS. SO IT COMES DOWN TO A COMMENT FIRST THE QUESTION IS NEXT. I DON'T KNOW WHETHER IT IS POSSIBLE IF IT IS PART OF THE CONTRACT IF YOU WOULD OFFER EARLIER AND I THINK YOU DID THAT YOU WOULD WORK WITH US ON SOME OF THAT I THINK THAT WOULD BE VERY BENEFICIAL. THIS IS NOT SAYING ANYTHING AGAINST THE FORMAT WE HAVE USED IN THE PAST BUT IT IS NOT QUITE AS COMPREHENSIVE AS WHAT I SEE HERE WITH THIS. I THINK IT IS A CRITICAL POINT OF COMMUNICATION WITH POTENTIAL CANDIDATES.

Colin Baenziger: WE WOULD BE HAPPY TO DO IT. THEORETICALLY IT IS NOT IN THE CONTRACT BUT WE WILL DO IT ANYWAY AND JUST INCLUDE IT IN THE CONTRACT AND WE DON'T HAVE TO WORRY ABOUT ANY DETAILS LIKE THAT. IF THAT'S WHAT THE COUNCIL WANTS TO DO.

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 65 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

Mayor Lane: DOES ANYBODY TAKE EXCEPTION WITH THAT? THIS IS A STUDY SESSION SO THAT WAS JUST CONSENSUS OF OPINION. COUNCILMAN PHILLIPS.

Councilman Phillips: I WAS CURIOUS ABOUT THAT TOO. IF WE ARE GOING TO SEND THIS OUT YOU WOULD LOVE TO SEE THIS ABOUT SCOTTSDALE AND LIKE THE MAYOR SAID WE WANT THEM TO HAVE AN IDEA ABOUT SCOTTSDALE OUR HISTORY AND WHAT DRIVES US. THEN THE QUESTION COME UP WHO IS MAKING THIS BOOK? IF YOU MAKE THE BOOK DO WE APPROVE IT AND HOW DOES THAT GO ABOUT? YOU MIGHT SAY I DON'T AGREE HERE WHAT HE SAID ABOUT SCOTTSDALE.

Colin Baenziger: IT WILL PROBABLY ADD A WEEK TO WHAT WE ARE DOING ON THE SCHEDULE. THE ANSWER IS I WILL WRITE IT AND I WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK EACH OF YOU BECAUSE THAT WOULD HELP ME GET THE FULL PICTURE. OR AS MANY AS POSSIBLE I UNDERSTAND THAT NOT EVERYONE MAY BE ABLE TO. I WILL WRITE IT AND WHEN I AM DONE I WILL SEND THE TEXT OVER AND IN THE MEANTIME WE WILL GET SOME PICTURES AND YOU ALL CAN HAVE AT IT. WHAT I NORMALLY DO IS HAVE YOU FEED THE COMMENTS BACK TO ME AND I WILL INCORPORATE THEM BACK INTO BROCHURE. TYPICALLY THERE IS NOT A LOT OF DISAGREEMENT IT IS JUST WORD SMITHING AND SOMEBODY MAY NOT LIKE MY CHOICE OF WORDS ON SOME ITEMS. WE CAN FIX THOSE EASILY. ONCE I HAVE EVERYBODY'S COMMENTS WE WILL PUT THEM ALL IN THE MIX AND SEND THEM BACK OUT TO YOU TO TAKE ANOTHER LOOK. AS SOON AS WE ARE DONE WITH THAT WE WILL GET IT OUT AND GO.

Councilman Phillips: THAT WILL BE THE FUN PART. THANK YOU

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN. COUNCILWOMAN MILHAVEN

[Time 04:40:56]

Councilwoman Milhaven: AS WE KNOW WE HAVE A UNIQUE ORGANIZATIONAL STRUCTURE. TWO YEARS AGO WE ADOPTED SOME CHARTER AMENDMENT CHANGES WHERE THE CITY TREASURER IS A CHARTER OFFICER RUNNING A SEPARATE ORGANIZATION. WHILE WE JUST LEARNED UNIQUE IN THE TOURISM COMMUNITY IS A BENEFIT. I AM CONCERNED THAT IN THAT UNIQUE IN THE SEARCH FOR A CITY MANAGER MAY CAUSE SOME CONCERNS BECAUSE ANYTHING THAT IS DIFFERENT AND NOT FAMILIAR SOME MAY SAY I DON'T WANT TO GO THERE. I THINK THIS IS AN OPPORTUNITY. WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT WE ARE REALLY CLEAR ABOUT HOW THIS ORGANIZATION WORKS AND WHAT THE CITY MANAGER'S ROLE IS. I SAW THIS AS AN OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO REVISIT THE CHARTER TO SAY ARE WE OPERATING AS WE HOPED WE WOULD AS THE CHARTER AMENDMENT INTENDED. TO REVISIT AND MAKE SURE THE ORGANIZATIONAL CHART WAS PERFECTLY CLEAR. WHAT IS IN HERE IS PRETTY VAGUE AND WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT THE CANDIDATE IS CLEAR IN MAKING THEIR DECISION THAT WE WOULD BE ATTRACTED TO THEM BY THE CLARITY BUT ALSO SET EXPECTATIONS SO WHEN THEY GET HERE THEY DON'T SAY THIS ISN'T WHAT I THOUGHT IT WAS. I WOULD LIKE US TO REVISIT THE ORGANIZATIONAL CHART IN A LOT MORE DETAIL TO SAY THAT WE ARE COMFORTABLE TO SAY THE DEPARTMENTS THAT REPORT TO THE CITY MANAGER VERSUS THE TREASURER VERSUS ANY OTHER CHARTER OFFICERS ARE SET UP TO SUPPORT THAT. I WILL GIVE A SPECIFIC EXAMPLE OF SOMETHING THAT I WOULD LIKE MY COLLEGES TO CONSIDER. WE TALK ABOUT THE BUDGET AS BEING THE CITY MANAGER'S BUDGET BUT YET THE BUDGET DIRECTOR REPORTS TO THE CITY TREASURER. IT DESERVES SOME CONSIDERATION AS TO WHETHER OR NOT THE BUDGET OFFICE SHOULD REPORT TO THE CITY MANAGER SO THE CITY MANAGER CANDIDATE WOULD HAVE THE CLARITY TO SAY YES IT IS

THEIR BUDGET. I ALSO THINK THERE IS OPPORTUNITY TO REVISIT THE CHARTER OFFICERS JOB DESCRIPTIONS TO MAKE SURE THAT THOSE ARE REALLY CLEAR ABOUT WHAT THEIR ROLE IS. IN MY OPINION IT REQUIRES A DISCUSSION. AT THE END OF THE DAY THE CITY MANAGER IS THE ULTIMATE DECISION MAKER AND THE OTHER CHARTER OFFICERS ARE ADVISORS TO THE CITY MANAGER. THE CITY MANAGER IS LEFT HOLDING THE BAG. HE IS ACCOUNTABLE FOR ALL OF THE DECISIONS AND THE OTHER CHARTER OFFICERS ARE THERE IN AN ADVISORY CAPACITY. REVIEWING THE ORGANIZATIONAL CHART AND BEING CLEAR ABOUT WHAT DOES AND DOESN'T REPORT TO THE CITY MANGER AND BEING PERFECTLY CLEAR ABOUT WHAT OUR EXPECTATIONS IS ABOUT HOW THE CHARTER OFFICERS WORK TOGETHER WILL BE REALLY IMPORTANT TO MAKE THE CANDIDATES FEEL MORE COMFORTABLE TO WHAT'S A UNIQUE ORGANIZATIONAL STRUCTURE AND MAKE SURE THAT WHEN THEY GET HERE THEY ARE PERFECTLY CLEAR ABOUT WHAT ARE EXPECTATIONS WERE SO I WOULD LIKE US TO HAVE THAT CONVERSATION.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILWOMAN MILHAVEN. COUNCILMAN LITTLEFIELD

[Time 04:44:10]

Councilman Littlefield: WHEN YOU SAID THERE IS NOT MUCH DISAGREEMENT MY FIRST THOUGHT WAS YOU'RE NOT FROM AROUND HERE ARE YOU. IN FACT WE JUST HAD A LITTLE EXAMPLE OF THAT, COUNCILWOMAN MILHAVEN AND I AND SOME OTHER MEMBERS OF THIS COUNCIL DISAGREE VEHEMENTLY ABOUT THE ROLE OF THE CHARTER OFFICERS. I WOULD COMPLETELY DISAGREE WITH HER ASSERTION THAT THE OTHER CHARTER OFFICERS ARE ADVISORS TO THE CITY MANAGER. IN FACT THE OTHER CHARTER OFFICERS ARE ADVISORS TO US AND NOT TO THE CITY MANAGER. THEY ARE COEQUALS TO THE CITY MANAGER DESPITE THE FACT THAT THEY HAVE SMALLER STAFF. PLUS IN FACT THEY THEN THEY ALSO MANAGER THEIR OWN AREAS. I WOULD CERTAINLY NOT THINK OF THE CITY ATTORNEY MERELY AS AN ADVISOR TO THE CITY MANAGER. IM GUESSING THE CITY TREASURER CERTAINLY DOESN'T SEE HIS ROLE THAT WAY. I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO POINT OUT THAT THE ROLE OF THE CITY MANAGER WAS IN FACT APPROVED BY THE VOTERS. I WILL AGREE WITH COUNCILWOMAN MILHAVEN ON ONE THING. YOU DEFINITELY MAKE THESE DISAGREEMENTS CLEAR TO POTENTIAL CANDIDATE. HEAVEN FORBID THAT THEY SHOW UP AND FIND OUT ABOUT THIS AFTERWARDS.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN. I THINK THE MAIN THING IS HERE IS WE NEED TO MAKE IT VERY CLEAR AS TO HOW OUR GOVERNANCE IS SET UP IN ACCORDANCE WITH OUR CHARTER. REVISITING ANYTHING IN THE CHARTER WITH THE GENERAL POPULATION IS NOT SOMETHING WE DO OUTSIDE OF THE REALM. WE DO NEED TO MAKE IT VERY CLEAR THAT WE HAVE SIX CHARTER OFFICERS WHO ARE HIRED, FIRED, EVALUATED AND COMPENSATED BY THE COUNCIL. THEY DO WORK AS A TEAM UNDER THE CITY MANAGER'S GUIDANCE AS A CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER AND MAYBE WE NEED TO MAKE THAT PERFECTLY CLEAR. BUT THEY DO RESPOND DIRECTLY TO THE COUNCIL AS WELL FOR PROFESSIONAL ADVISE BUT WE DO NEED TO MAKE THAT CLEAR THERE ISN'T ANY DOUBT ABOUT IT.

Colin Beanziger: IF I COULD JUST SAY ONE THING WITH RESPECT TO YOUR ROLES. IT IS UNUSUAL FOR A CITY BUT IT IS NOT THAT RARE. JANESVILLE FLORIDA IS ONE OF MY CLIENTS AND THEIR STRUCTURE IS VERY SIMILAR. I THINK THAT THE FINANCE DEPARTMENT IS UNDER THE CITY MANGER BUT OTHERWISE IT IS THE SAME. IN FLORIDA THE COUNTIES ARE ALL SET UP IN VERY MUCH THE SAME WAY AS YOU ARE WITH ONE EXCEPTION IS THAT USUALLY THE BUDGET OFFICE IS USUALLY UNDER THE CITY MANAGER BUT THE TREASURER IS A DIFFERENT FUNCTION IT IS ACTUALLY THE CLERK OF THE

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 67 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

COURT. THE BOTTOM LINE IS A GOOD CITY MANAGER, YOU NEED TO MAKE IT CLEAR HOW IT WORKS, BUT A GOOD CITY MANAGER IS GOING TO BE ABLE TO DEAL WITH IT. DOWN THE ROAD YOU MAY DECIDE TO CHANGE IT AGAIN. FOR RIGHT NOW WE HAVE TO GO WITH WHAT'S IN THE CHARTER.

Mayor Lane: OK. COUNCILWOMAN KORTE

Councilmember Korte: I BELIEVE THAT COUNCILMEMBER MILHAVEN BRINGS UP A GOOD POINT WHETHER THIS IS THE TIME TO DISCUSS A RESTRUCTURE VERSUS A BUDGET DIRECTOR REPORTING TO THE CITY MANAGER VERSUS CITY TREASURER. I SEE IT AS A POTENTIAL PROBLEM IN ATTRACTING A GOOD CITY MANAGER IN THAT ANY CEO OF AN ORGANIZATION THAT DOES NOT HAVE OVERSIGHT OF ITS CFO I THINK IS AN ISSUE. I THINK THAT IS WHAT WE HAVE HERE. BACK TO COUNCILMEMBER MILHAVEN'S COMMENTS AT SOME POINT I WOULD LIKE SO DISCUSSION AROUND THAT WHETHER THAT IS SOONER OR A LITTLE BIT LATER I AM NOT SURE.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU. COUNCILWOMAN MILHAVEN

[Time 04:48:11]

Councilwoman Milhaven: I JUST WANT TO CLARIFY. I WAS NOT SUGGESTING THAT WE REVISIT THE CHARTER AND THAT'S THE WAY THE CITIZENS DECIDED THAT WE SHOULD BE ORGANIZED AND I AM NOT CHALLENGING THAT WHAT I SAYING IS THAT WE TAKE THE CHARTER AND SAY PRACTICALLY EVERYDAY HOW DO WE MAKE THAT WORK AND HOW ARE WE MAKING THAT WORK THE MOST EFFICIENTLY AND EFFECTIVELY FOR THE CITY FOR THE CITIZENS AND FOR A CITY MANAGER TO BE SUCCESSFUL IN THEIR ROLE. I AM NOT CHALLENGING THE CHARTER.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILWOMAN. LOOKS LIKE THAT IS ABOUT IT AS FAR AS THE INPUT ON IT. I THINK WE ARE IN AGREEMENT THAT WE WILL MOVE FORWARD WITH THE PROGRAM THAT YOU LINED OUT WITH THE ONLY EXCEPTIONS WE MAY HAVE INCLUDED IN IT. WE HAVE A LATE CALL FOR A QUESTION OR A COMMENT BUT JUST TO FINISH MY SENTENCE ON IN THAT IS RIGHT NOW THAT WE WILL WORK TOGETHER WITH COLIN AS FAR AS THE DESCRIPTION IN THE BROCHURE ALONG WITH THE DESCRIPTION OF GOVERNANCE. VICE MAYOR KLAPP.

Vice Mayor Klapp: I JUST WANTED TO ADD THAT I DID LIKE SUGGESTION OF A RECEPTION. I THINK THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL FOR THE COMMUNITY TO MEET THE POTENTIAL CANDIDATES. IT WOULD BE HELPFUL AS YOU SUGGESTED TO SEE THEM IN A SOCIAL SETTING PRIOR TO DOING ANY INTERVIEWING. MY EXPERIENCE IN PRIVATE COMPANIES IS YOU OFTEN BRING THE CANDIDATES IN AND HAVE DINNER WITH THEM THE NIGHT BEFORE TO GATHER AND YOU GET A FEEL FOR THEIR PERSONALITIES OVER A DINNER, WELL WE WOULD DO THIS IN A RECEPTION FASHION AND TO BRING IN SOME COMMUNITY PEOPLE WOULD BE GREAT. I ALSO LIKE THE IDEA OF HAVING THE ONE-ON-ONE SESSIONS. WE DID NOT DO THAT IN THE PAST BUT I THINK IT WOULD BE HELPFUL FOR EACH OF US TO GET OUR OWN ASSESSMENT OF A CANDIDATE BEFORE WE ACTUALLY DO INTERVIEWING IN THE COUNCIL MEETING. I THINK THOSE WERE GOOD OPTIONS. I DON'T KNOW HOW THE REST OF THE COUNCIL FEELS ABOUT IT BUT I LIKE THE IDEA.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU VICE MAYOR. COUNCILWOMAN KORTE

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

PAGE 68 OF 70

Councilmember Korte: I WANTED TO THANK MS. LA MAZZA FOR THIS ORGANIZATIONAL CHART. I THINK IT REFLECTS BETTER OUR CHARTER BASED ORGANIZATION SO THANK YOU FOR THAT.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILWOMAN. COUNCILMAN LITTLEFIELD

Councilman Littlefield: SO ARE YOU THINKING YOU UNDER BID THIS JOB? NEVER MIND.

Mayor Lane: ASIDE FROM THAT AND MY PREMATURE TRYING TO CLOSE THIS OUT. I THINK AT THIS TIME WE ARE SETTLED ON THOSE CHANGES WE TALKED ABOUT ON THE CONTRACT THAT ARE ACCEPTABLE TO COLIN AND WE WILL MOVE FORWARD. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE PRESENTATION. THANK YOU FOR SAYING WITH US THIS EVENING.

[Time 04:51:16]

Bernadette La Mazza: ACTUALLY I HAVE A FEW ITEMS THAT I NEED TO HAVE A DECISION ON IF YOU DON'T MIND. I WILL TRY TO GO QUICKLY SO WE CAN GET OUT OF HERE. IT DOES TOUCH ON WHAT COLIN HAD INDICATED I JUST NEED TO HAVE A LITTLE BIT OF FINALIZATION ON IT SO WE CAN GO AHEAD AND MOVE FORWARD. THIS IS JUST THE TENTATIVE TIMELINE SO CONSIDERING WHAT WE ARE GOING TO DO IN TERMS OF WORKING WITH COLIN ON THE BROCHURE. WE ARE GOING TO BE GATHERING SOME ADDITIONAL COMMENTS TONIGHT FROM YOU THAT WE ARE GOING TO BE INCORPORATING SO WE WILL BE ADDING ABOUT A WEEK TO THIS DEPENDING ON HOW LONG IT TAKES. ONCE WE ARE READY TO GO AHEAD AND POST THE POSITION WHICH WILL BE A WEEK FROM THAT FEBRUARY 19TH DATE HYPOTHETICALLY. WE WILL KEEP IT OPEN FOR A MONTH. THE FIRST WEEK OF APRIL WILL BE THE TIME THAT COLIN AND HIS CREW WILL GO THROUGH AND START SCREENING THE APPLICATIONS. THEY WILL LET US KNOW HOW MANY APPLICANTS THEY HAVE. I NEEDED CLARIFICATION. IS COUNCIL OKAY WITH COLIN BRINGING FORTH THE TOP FIVE FINALISTS OR TEN FINALISTS AND HAVING A SUBCOMMITTEE REVIEW THOSE TEN AND WHITTLE THEM DOWN TO FIVE. WHAT IS THE PREFERENCE OF COUNCIL OF THE FINALIST CANDIDATES?

Mayor Lane: AS FAR AS I AM CONCERNED IN THE PAST WE HAVE HAD AS FEW AS THREE FINALISTS. FIVE ADDS A BIT OF TIME TO THE WHOLE PROCESS. I AM NOT ADVERSE TO FIVE BUT NO MORE THAN FIVE IN THE FINALIST CATEGORY. THERE ARE SOME OTHER COMMENTS ON THAT AS WELL. COUNCILMAN LITTLEFIELD

Councilman Littlefield: I WOULD SAY HAVING BEEN ON THE LAST SEARCH COMMITTEE WITH MAYOR LANE AND THEN COUNCILMAN MCCULLAGH IF WE HAD FIVE FULLY QUALIFIED CANDIDATES I WOULD BE THRILLED. THAT WOULD BE AMAZING. I THINK THE MAYOR IS RIGHT TEN IS TOO MANY. I THINK THREE TO FIVE, AND THEN WE WILL LET THEM INTERVIEW WITH US AND SEE HOW THEY LIKE IT.

Mayor Lane: THANK YOU COUNCILMAN. COUNCILWOMAN KORTE

Councilmember Korte: IN REFERENCE TO THE SEARCH COMMITTEE. MAYOR AND STAFF I AM NOT SURE WHAT THE PROCESS IS. ARE WE GOING TO CREATE A SUBCOMMITTEE OF COUNCIL TO OVERSEE THIS PROCESS? I NEED SOME HELP HERE.

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 69 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

Mayor Lane: IN THE PAST WE HAVE NOT HIRED A SEARCH CONSULTANT. WE HAVE PUT TOGETHER A SEPARATE SUBCOMMITTEE WITH THE COUNCIL. IN THIS CASE THAT IS NOT PART OF THE PROCESS. IT WASN'T PART OF THE PROCESS BEFORE BUT WE WERE TRYING TO TRIM COSTS AND WE ENDED UP WITH A SUBCOMMITTEE AS BOB REFERRED TO TAKE THE PLACE OF TRIMMING DOWN EIGHT TO TEN CANDIDATES DOWN TO THREE THAT WE WENT TO THE COUNCIL WITH. IN THIS CASE WE WOULD NOT.

Councilman Littlefield: HAVING BEEN PART OF THAT I WOULD AGREE WITH THE MAYOR. YOUR JOB IS TO BRING THAT TO THE ENTIRE COUNCIL. I WOULD NOT SUGGEST THAT WE HAVE A SUBSET OF THAT. BRING THEM TO US ALL.

Mayor Lane: OKAY. NOW I KNOW I TRIED TO CLOSE THIS OUT A COUPLE OF TIMES.

[Time 04:55:00]

Bernadette La Mazza: I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE ARE ON TRACK AND WE GET WHAT WE NEED.

Mayor Lane: WE HAVE A CONSENSUS ON THE FIRST ONE.

Bernadette La Mazza: YES. I HEARD A CONSENSUS ON COLIN BRINGING BACK THE TOP FIVE CANDIDATES. AS YOU TALKED ABOUT EARLIER WE NEED TO CLARIFY THE ROLE OF THE CITY MANAGER. WHEN EVER I MET WITH EVERYONE WE WENT THROUGH INFORMATION ABOUT THE CHARACTERISTICS OF A CITY MANAGER. I ALSO PULLED FROM THE NEWSPAPER ABOUT WHAT YOU ALL HAD INDICATED THAT YOU WERE INTERESTED IN FOR A CITY MANGER. ONE OF THE KEY ITEMS THAT WAS MISSING IN THE BROCHURE ARE THE OPPORTUNITIES AND CHALLENGES FACING THE CITY MANGER. THAT WOULD BE SOMETHING THAT COLIN AND HIS CREW WOULD BE ABLE TO OBTAIN. WHENEVER HE TALKS TO YOU ON A ONE-ON-ONE BASIS SO WE WOULD BE INCORPORATING THAT INTO THE BROCHURE. I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT THAT WAS CLEAR. WHOEVER IT IS THAT IS INTERESTED WOULD BE ABLE TO SEE THE CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES THAT SCOTTSDALE IS FACING.

Mayor Lane: I AM SORRY. COUNCILWOMAN KORTE MIGHT HAVE A QUESTION ON THAT.

Councilmember Korte: I AM SORRY I DO. ARE YOU LOOKING FOR ADDITIONAL QUALITIES IN THE IDEAL CANDIDATE FROM US TONIGHT? THAT WAS SOME OF THE CONVERSATION I KNOW.

Bernadette La Mazza: IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO HAVE A DISCUSSION ON THAT WE ARE OPEN TO IT. I HAVE THE INFORMATION THAT I GOT WHEN I MET WITH YOU. I PULLED THE INFORMATION THAT I GOT FROM THE NEWSPAPER BUT I WOULD BE MORE THAN HAPPY TO ANY ADDITIONAL INFORMATION.

Councilmember Korte: WHEN THIS BROCHURE'S DRAFT IS COMPLETED IT IS GOING TO COME BACK TO US AND WE WILL BE ABLE TO ADD SOME COMMENTS.

Colin Baenziger: WHAT I WOULD SUGGEST, BERNADETTE HAS DONE A GREAT JOB GATHERING THAT INFORMATION AND SHE CAN GIVE IT TO ME AND I WILL WRITE IT AND PUT IT ALL TOGETHER IN AN

CITY OF SCOTTSDALE PAGE 70 OF 70

FEBRUARY 12, 2013 COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION CLOSED CAPTION TRANSCRIPT

IDEAL CANDIDATE SECTION AND THEN IT WILL COME BACK TO YOU. IN THE INTEREST IN TIME, I WILL BE TALKING TO ALL OF YOU ANYWAY, WE WILL PUT IT ALL TOGETHER AND YOU CAN COMMENT ON IT RATHER THAN SPENDING ANOTHER HOUR TALKING ABOUT AN IDEAL CANDIDATE RIGHT NOW.

Councilmember Korte: THANK YOU.

Bernadette La Mazza: I JUST WANTED TO CLARIFY, I DIDN'T HEAR A FULL CONSENSUS BUT I DID HEAR THE SUGGESTION ABOUT THE ONE-ON-ONES AND THE RECEPTION SOUNDED LIKE A GOOD IDEA.

Mayor Lane: THE ONLY THING ABOUT THAT AND IT IS JUST FOR CONSIDERATION IF WE END UP WITH FIVE CANDIDATES, ONE-ON-ONES FOR EACH OF THEM AND EACH OF US WILL BE QUITE A TASK. JUST A CONSIDERATION. I THINK IT IS A GOOD IDEA MYSELF BUT I KNOW THAT IT CAN BECOME A BURDEN.

Colin Baenziger: IF I MIGHT JUST CHIME IN. WHAT WE NORMALLY DO IS TRY TO DO THIS ON A FRIDAY AND SATURDAY. THERE WILL BE SOME EVENTS LIKE A TOUR OF THE CITY FOR THE CANDIDATES THAT YOU DON'T NEED TO BE AT. THE RECEPTION IS USUALLY ON A FRIDAY EVENING. WE DO THE ONE-ON-ONES SATURDAY MORNING. THE COUNCIL MEETING VENUE SATURDAY EVENING AND THEN YOU ARE DONE. THE IMPORTANT THING WOULD BE TO SETTLE ON DATES FAIRLY SOON. WE WANT TO DO THAT SO THE CANDIDATES CAN SET TIME ASIDE AND SO YOU CAN PLAN AHEAD AS WELL. IF SOMETHING COMES UP AT THE LAST MINUTE WE CAN TALK ABOUT CHANGING DATES OR SOMETIMES WE HAVE HAD COUNCILMEMBERS DO TELEPHONE INTERVIEWS. HAVE THE CANDIDATES COME IN A DAY OR TWO EARLY. WE WILL WORK WITH YOU TO MAKE IT BECAUSE IT IS VERY IMPORTANT THAT ALL OF YOU PARTICIPATE IN THIS.

Bernadette La Mazza: IF I MAY ON THAT NOTE WE HAVE TYPICALLY HELD INTERVIEWS JUST PRIOR TO A REGULARLY SCHEDULED COUNCIL MEETING. WHAT WE ARE ANTICIPATING IS HAVING THE INTERVIEWS IN MID MAY. WE DO HAVE COUNCIL MEETINGS ON THE 14TH, THAT IS THE TENTATIVE ADOPTION OF THE BUDGET AND WE HAVE THE OPTION OF THE 21ST AND THE 28TH. THAT WAS THE TIMELINE THAT WE WERE LOOKING AT. IF COUNCIL DESIRES TO HAVE THE INTERVIEWS ON A SEPARATE DATE WE CAN WORK WITH YOU AND THE CITY CLERK TO GET THOSE TIME FRAMES AHEAD OF TIME. JUST AS AN ADDITIONAL NOTE, WHENEVER THE INTERVIEW IS DONE IN ORDER TO MAKE THE SELECTION PROCESS AND THE DISCUSSION OF SALARY COMES UP WE ARE CURRENTLY WORKING ON EXECUTIVE COMPENSATION FOR ALL OF THE EXECUTIVES. WE WILL HAVE A PACKAGE TOGETHER THAT SHOWS YOU COMPARABLE OF OTHER CITY MANAGERS OF SIMILARLY SIZED CITIES SO YOU CAN USE THAT AS YOUR GUIDELINE. DEFINITELY THAT IS ALL THAT I HAVE FOR THE PRESENTATION. IF YOU HAVE ANY OTHER QUESTIONS I AM HAPPY TO ANSWER THEM.

Mayor Lane: I THINK WE ARE CLEAN. NOBODY DARE. WE ARE COMPLETE WITH BUSINESS. I HAVE A MOTION WE ADJOURN. SECOND. ALL IN FAVOR OF ADJOURNMENT INDICATE BY AYE. WE ARE ADJOURNED. THANKS VERY MUCH EVERYONE.

MAYOR AND COUNCIL ITEMS – NONE

ADJOURNMENT - 9:08 P.M.