



**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE  
NEIGHBORHOOD ADVISORY COMMISSION  
REGULAR MEETING  
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 27, 2021**

**MEETING HELD ELECTRONICALLY**

**PRESENT:** Rachel Putman, Chair  
Amanda Nash, Vice Chair  
Jonathan Budwig, Commissioner  
William James, Commissioner  
Louise Lamb, Commissioner  
Carol Miraldi, Commissioner  
Michael Wills, Commissioner

**STAFF:** Adam Yaron, Project Coordination Liaison  
Brandon McMahon, Associate Planner  
Dave Bennett, Public Works Department Director

**Call to Order/Roll Call**

The meeting of the Neighborhood Advisory Commission was called to order at 5:00 p.m. A formal roll call was conducted, confirming members present as stated above.

**Public Comment**

No comments were submitted.

**1. Approve Draft Summary Meeting Minutes November 17, 2020**

Chair Putman called for comments/corrections.

COMMISSIONER JAMES MOVED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE NOVEMBER 17, 2020, MEETING AS PRESENTED. COMMISSIONER WILLS SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0) WITH CHAIR PUTMAN, VICE CHAIR NASH, COMMISSIONERS BUDWIG, JAMES, LAMB, MIRALDI AND WILLS VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

## **2. Neighborhood Advisory Commission 2020 Annual Report**

Mr. Yaron stated that each board or commission provides an annual report to City Council consisting of activities and accomplishments for the year. Commissioners are free to submit supplemental comments for incorporation into the report prior to submission to City Council.

COMMISSIONER MIRALDI MOVED TO APPROVE THE NEIGHBORHOOD ADVISORY COMMISSION 2020 ANNUAL REPORT AS PRESENTED. COMMISSIONER WILLS SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0) WITH CHAIR PUTMAN, VICE CHAIR NASH, COMMISSIONERS BUDWIG, JAMES, LAMB, MIRALDI AND WILLS VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

## **3. Neighborhood Advisory Commission Annual Bylaw Review**

Mr. Yaron presented the Bylaws for review and approval. No corrections were made.

COMMISSIONER MIRALDI MOVED TO APPROVE THE NEIGHBORHOOD ADVISORY COMMISSION BYLAWS AS PRESENTED. COMMISSIONER NASH SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0) WITH CHAIR PUTMAN, VICE CHAIR NASH, COMMISSIONERS BUDWIG, JAMES, LAMB, MIRALDI AND WILLS VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

## **4. 2021 Election of Officers**

Mr. Yaron provided the bylaws relating to election of officers. Vice Chair Nash nominated Rachel Putman as Chair. Vice Chair Nash nominated William James as Vice Chair.

COMMISSIONER WILLS MOVED TO APPROVE THE NOMINEES AS PRESENTED. COMMISSIONER MIRALDI SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0) WITH CHAIR PUTMAN, VICE CHAIR NASH, COMMISSIONERS BUDWIG, JAMES, LAMB, MIRALDI AND WILLS VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

## **5. Solid Waste: "Alley to Curbside" Community Initiative**

Dave Bennett, Public Works Department Director, stated that the City is moving away from containerized alley collection. Solid waste is one of three enterprise funds in the City. Revenues are generated from user fees, as opposed to General Fund or tax dollars. Each week, the City provides containerized trash and recycling collection to over 83,000 customers. Also provided is monthly brush and bulk pickup. The monthly rate to customers is \$21.47, an increase from the \$15.96 rate five years ago. Costs impacting rate increases include maintenance and repair and disposal. Specifically, the lifting mechanism for a 300 gallon container as opposed to a 90 gallon container takes quite a toll on equipment. The strain

often causes hydraulic hoses to fail. Also resulting is metal fatigue, which leads to cracks and other failures.

Each year, several City trucks suffer major damage while traveling alleys for refuse pickup. Resulting repairs cost the City \$50,000 annually. Curbside collection will be effective in stabilizing disposal costs. Currently, if curbside customers need additional container space, they are able to purchase an additional container and pay an additional service fee. At this time, alley customers who have a full bin simply place items in the next available bin. Transitioning to curbside pickup will assist in recovering these additional costs.

Having large trucks negotiating alleys presents a significant safety risk. In addition, in 2007, the EPA introduced new emissions standards, which caused vehicle manufacturers to introduce exhaust control measures, which increase engine base and widen frame rails. This impacts the turning radius. Moving to curbside pickup, higher capacity trucks with a more efficient wheelbase will allow them to increase carriage weight from 7.2 tons to 8.5 tons. The transition is a four-year plan. Brush and bulk collection will continue in the alleys. Customer outreach methods were reviewed.

Mr. Yaron stated that one public comment was received from Lisa Sampson, which was provided to staff and the Commission prior to the meeting.

Commissioner Nash noted that there have been recent fires in garbage trucks and asked about the potential for the transition to reduce this risk. Mr. Bennett acknowledged that it will not prevent fires. Load fires are the most common fires in the industry, result from combustible items being placed in receptacles.

Commissioner Nash asked about plans for alley maintenance, noting that if people are not regularly going to the alley with trash, they may be less aware of weed growth or maintenance needs. Mr. Bennett said there is a seven-year alley maintenance plan. There will be a focus on code enforcement in terms of notifying residents of weed growth. He encouraged residents to inspect their alleys and mitigate for weed control.

Commissioner Nash noted that the Commission previously chose to provide funding for alleyway maintenance on an alley that was not being maintained. Mr. Yaron said this area along 70th Street that received grant funding did not have trash pickup, nor did they provide bulk pickup in that section. This stretch of alley for which funding was provided is an anomaly, with an inverted ditch that carries stormwater through the area. With respect to property maintenance within alleys, Chapter 18 of the City Code remains in place and requires property owners to maintain public right-of-way to the center line, including alleys.

Commissioner Wills commented that he was initially in support of the comments of Ms. Sampson, however seeing the report by Mr. Bennett clarifies and explains the situation quite well. Mr. Bennett stated that the City endeavors to do a better job of communication on these issues to neighborhoods in-line for the transition process. He will work with the public outreach manager toward this goal.

In response to a question from Commissioner Lamb, Mr. Bennett stated that the brush pickup trucks are not the same as the trash pickup trucks. Brush trucks have a 20 yard capacity with a shorter wheelbase and shorter length. Having been a former resident of an alley neighborhood, Commissioner Lamb stated that while she understood maintenance was a requirement of the resident, she is unaware of any neighbor ever receiving a notice from the City to clean up unmaintained areas. She asked whether the neighborhoods could continue to have alley service if properly maintained by residents. Mr. Bennett restated the reasons for the City's transition, including maintenance, turn radius, wear and tear on the vehicle, lift cylinders, packer cylinders, uncontrolled dumping, illegal dumping. Commissioner Lamb commented that trash stored in garages can become unpleasantly odorous in warm months.

Commissioner Nash commented that vacation rentals in her neighborhood are placing significant amounts of trash in alley containers to the point of overflow. She asked whether the transition has the potential to mitigate this issue, including a requirement that such homes would have to pay for two containers to accommodate their trash levels. Mr. Bennett confirmed that the transition to curbside will ease this issue. Residential trash is to be placed in a container with a closed lid.

Commissioner Nash asked whether the City has considered a third container for compostable materials. Mr. Bennett said the City has looked at this possibility. Mesa offers this service and Phoenix is currently conducting a pilot program. Challenges include having enough cans utilized to justify the cost of the truck and staff.

Commissioner Budwig asked about the potential for a hybrid program, with smaller 90 gallon cans in the alleyway. Mr. Bennett stated that this system presents the same challenges, including illegal dumping, wide turn radius and damage to trucks.

Chair Putman referred to the bulk pick up remaining in the alley and noted that many residents do not wait for monthly pick up times (some being unaware of the pick-up schedule) and questioned whether bulk item congestion in alleys would continue to be a problem. Mr. Bennett stated that the public works executive director is asking staff to take a look at this issue. As the transition is underway, impacts will be reviewed and addressed as necessary.

Chair Putman commented that many southern Scottsdale homes do not include garages. Those that do have them are not air conditioned. This is combined with the issue of a significant roof rat problem. She asked whether the City is prepared for such circumstances. Mr. Bennett said he understands the concern, however, there are ways to mitigate roof rat issues, such as bagging and tying garbage and keeping the lid closed. There is likelihood that the transition will help with rat problems, as the current alley system invites infestation with open lids and trash strewn across the ground.

Commissioner Nash suggested that neighborhood outreach materials include suggestions for residents in terms of creative ways to enclose or hide their refuse bins.

Vice Chair James commented that the public comment addresses homes in historic neighborhoods. It poses the question of whether a requirement to have the bins in the front of a home rather than in the alleyway conforms to public code for historic neighborhoods. Mr. Bennett said there is no public code that prevents historic neighborhoods from storing refuse cans in the front of the home. The homes already have recycling bins stored in the front of their homes.

Commissioner Nash requested that a copy of the presentation be provided to Commissioners.

## **6. 2019/20 Spirit Awards Program Nominations**

Brandon McMahon, Associate Planner, provided a brief background of the program. Due to lack of nominations in September of 2019, the Commission extended the timeline until March 1st of 2020. At that time, the 2019 program was put on hold due to the unforeseen circumstances of COVID. It was originally scheduled to be delivered at the regular NAC meeting in June 2020. Thus the 2019 program was essentially frozen until the September 2020 meeting, where the Commission decided that nominees would carry over and follow the 2020 program timeline. Nominees were to be deliberated at this meeting to either be awarded separately or as a joint award. Outreach efforts paid off, with 2019 nominations doubling from 2018. Of the 28 nominations, 19 were for individual residents and 8 for an organization or business. For 2020, staff received 17 nominations, 5 being individual and 12 for an organization or business.

The 2019 nominees were reviewed:

Gerd Wuestemann	Marilyn Perkins
Rebecca Frink	James E. Bourassa
Hank Carmean	Nancy A Philippi Ochser
Louise Lamb	Warner Lewis III
Natalee Esposito	Todd Newton
Patricia Kieran (Trish)	Scottsdale Bike Co.
Nancy Lane	JoyridesAZ
Ralph Rossborough & Ron Shoemaker	Scottsdale Historical Society
Judy Levye	First Christian Church
Terry Erickson	Wayne Dale
Lisa Randall	Scottsdale Together Overcoming Prejudice
Renee Higgs	DC Ranch
Chris Birkett	Pinnacle Peak Ace Hardware & Paint
Christie Lee Kinchen	McDowell Sonoran Conservancy

Mr. McMahon stated the 2020 award workplan mimicked 2019, with one category and two recipients. The same boundaries and methodology were employed. The timeline included a go live date of September 25th. The Spirit webpage was updated and included and explained what was being done for both the 2019 and 2020 programs. The outreach methods carried over, with the addition of notification in Scottsdale utility mailers in October and November of 2020 as well as the Scottsdale North News and the Scottsdale Standard. Staff created a postcard about the program, which was distributed at the 2020 G.A.I.N. event.

The 2020 nominees were reviewed:

Nancy Ochser - Cherry On Top Yogurt  
Desperados Trail Scouts  
D.C. Ranch  
Paula Jacqueline Cakes & Pastries  
Coronado Foundation for the Future  
Parada del Sol Parade Committee  
Scottsdale Historical Museum  
Siena Arte Portraiture Bob & Connie Zimmerlich  
Scottsdale Community Partners  
Pinnacle Peak Ace Hardware & Paint  
Scottsdale Elks Lodge #2147  
Mountain View Little League  
Rad Masinelli  
Dana Close  
Lisa Randall  
Sherrie Poinsett  
Bronze Cowboy (Keith Stamets)

Commissioner Wills commented that based on the number of nominees, there are is no reason to combine them and make only one award. There are clearly sufficient nominees to have separate awards for each year. There was consensus on this statement. Commissioners proceeded to deliberate on the nominations. Chair Putman suggested removing Chris Birkett, as he has been a previous winner. Commissioner Miraldi nominated McDowell Mountain Conservancy, as they have 650 volunteers, having contributed 64,500 hours.

After further deliberations, Commissioner Nash nominated First Christian Church.

Deliberations continued and the criteria were reviewed. Commissioners discussed the potential for delaying the vote to allow further review, however Mr. Yaron reviewed the timeline for presentation to City Council in March, which would make it difficult to finalize decisions at a later time.

Commissioner Nash noted that First Christian Church has been volunteering through Operation Fix-It for ten years. The group contributes 180 annual service hours per year. There was consensus to support the nomination.

Deliberations continued for the 2019 individual nomination. Vice Chair James nominated Marilyn Perkins for her role as City ambassador. Commissioners concurred.

Mr. Yaron reviewed the organization nominations, McDowell Sonoran Conservancy and First Christian Church and asked for a show of hands for each. Based on consensus, First Christian Church was the winner. Marilyn Perkins was the consensus winner for the individual nomination.

Deliberations for 2020 commenced. Commissioner Lamb nominated Dana Close. Chair Putman nominated Sherrie Poinsett. Commissioner Budwig nominated Bronze Cowboy (Keith Stamets) and the Parada Del Sol Committee. Based on a

show of hands, the winning nominations were Parada Del Sol Committee and Dana Close. Chait Putman nominated Scottsdale Community Partners. Commissioner James nominated Desperados Trail Scouts. Based on a show of hands, Parada Del Sol Committee and Dana Close received the highest votes and received the nominations.

In summary, the following awards were chosen by consensus:

- 2019: First Christian Church & Marilyn Perkins
- 2020: Parada Del Sol Committee & Dana Close

COMMISSIONER NASH MOVED TO APPROVE THE AWARDS AS PRESENTED. COMMISSIONER BUDWIG SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0) WITH CHAIR PUTMAN, VICE CHAIR JAMES, COMMISSIONERS BUDWIG, LAMB, MIRALDI, NASH AND WILLS VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

Discussion ensued as to who would be responsible for representing the Commission at the City Council's March 2, 2021 meeting. After discussion, a nomination was made.

VICE CHAIR JAMES NOMINATED CHAIR PUTMAN AND COMMISSIONER WILLS TO REPRESENT THE COMMISSION AT THE CITY COUNCIL MARCH 2, 2021 MEETING, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0) WITH CHAIR PUTMAN, VICE CHAIR JAMES, COMMISSIONERS BUDWIG, LAMB, MIRALDI, NASH AND WILLS VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

## **7. Identification of Future Agenda Items**

Mr. Yaron stated that at the last meeting, there was a request by Commissioner Miraldi to agendize discussion regarding the neighborhood enhancement grant funding and this will likely be presented in March.

## **8. Staff Updates**

Mr. Yaron stated that a General Plan update will be given in February.

## **9. Adjournment**

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved by Commissioner Nash and seconded by Commissioner Miraldi, the meeting adjourned at 6:43 p.m.

AYES: Chair Putman, Vice Chair James, Commissioners Budwig, Lamb, Miraldi, Nash and Wills

NAYS: None