
This document was created from the closed caption transcript of the October 6, 2020 City Council Work Study and **has not been checked for completeness or accuracy of content.**

A copy of the agenda for this meeting, including a summary of the action taken on each agenda item, is available online at:

<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/Assets/ScottsdaleAZ/Council/current-agendas-minutes/2020-agendas/10-06-20-work-study-agenda.pdf>

An unedited digital video recording of the meeting, which can be used in conjunction with the transcript, is available online at:

<http://www.Scottsdaleaz.gov/Scottsdale-video-network/Council-video-archives/2020-archives>

For ease of reference, included throughout the transcript are bracketed "time stamps" [Time: 00:00:00] that correspond to digital video recording time.

For more information about this transcript, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 480-312-2411.

CALL TO ORDER

[Time: 00:00:04]

Mayor Lane: I would like to call to order our October 6th, 2020, city council work study session. It's approximately 4:00 and I would ask that the City Clerk, Carolyn Jagger please conduct a roll call.

ROLL CALL

[Time: 00:00:15]

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Mayor Jim Lane.

Mayor Lane: Present.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Vice Mayor Solange Whitehead.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Present.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Councilmembers Suzanne Klapp.
Councilwoman Klapp: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Virginia Korte.

Councilmember Korte: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Kathy Littlefield. Absent.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Linda Milhaven.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Guy Phillips.

Councilman Phillips: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: City Manager Jim Thompson.

City Manager Jim Thompson: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: City Attorney Sherry Scott.

City Attorney Sherry Scott: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Acting City Treasurer Judy Doyle.

Acting City Treasurer Judy Doyle: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: City Auditor Sharron Walker.

City Auditor Sharron Walker: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: And the Clerk is present. And Councilwoman Littlefield is here, Mayor.

ITEM 1 – COVID-19 AND FACE COVERING REQUIREMENTS AT STATE AND COUNTY LEVELS

[Time: 00:01:12]

Mayor Lane: Okay. Thank you. Okay. Our work study session that we have here starting right now, provides a less formal setting for the Mayor and the council to discuss specific topics with each other and city staff, and provide staff an opportunity to receive direction from the council.

We're asking the councilmembers to please raise a flag. I have a broken screen here.

So I'm going to be relegated as far as votes are concerned here but also once you go to speak, you want to speak, you have a nice little flag there -- actually, it's interesting. It's in a permanently raised position, but you are supposed to raise it when you want to speak. Okay.

Yes. Very good. Thank you for that clarification. So raise that flag that's on your desk when you would like to speak and once finished, please just lower your flag and reraise it if you wish to comment further.

Our first and only item on this work study is a COVID-19 and face covering requirements at state and county levels and for that, I will turn that over to our city manager, Jim Thompson. Mr. Thompson.

[Time: 00:02:24]

City Manager Jim Thompson: Good evening, Mr. Mayor, members of council. What we are going to do this evening, we have a few speakers. We will walk through a slide presentation and just kind of walk us through where we have been and where we are at today, in particular. Obviously, stop us anywhere along the way. We have three speakers from staff and two outside speakers and we'll keep it as short as we possibly can, but I think it's important we cover all the current science involved and all the different agencies we worked with and where we are at. In particular, I think first slide we show is important as well. I will turn it over to Assistant City Manager Brent Stockwell at this time.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Mr. Thompson. Mr. Stockwell, before –

Assistant City Manager Brent Stockwell: [Garbled audio] Through the information that we provided, and then highlight on two key things and then Assistant City Manager Bill Murphy will take it over from there. Let me just first walk you through the information we have.

[Time: 00:03:30]

Mayor Lane: And Mr. Stockwell -- Mr. Stockwell, for just -- pardon me for interrupting you, but I just want to make a quick little observation as far as today's work study is concerned before we proceed and at the motion of the Councilwoman Whitehead, we certainly put together a bunch of information in order to clarify and make sure that the citizens and everyone is aware of exactly the kinds of coverage and the kind of protocols and safety protocols and mandates and/or executive orders and or things that this the process here in Scottsdale and still not only enforceable, but still in active. So this is as much an effort to educate as it is anything else, as far as all of those things that are in progress for us right now. So with that -- process for us right now. So with that in mind, we would like the general public to be aware of so they can put they are minds at ease as it relates to the safety protocols that we are adhering to and have here in the private sector as well. With that, I'm sorry for that interruption, Mr. Stockwell, but if you would go ahead and proceed.

[Time: 00:04:42]

Assistant City Manager Brent Stockwell: Thank you, Mayor. So, you know as noted, on September 22nd, the council requested a work study session item for staff to provide information about what's in place in the state and county levels, what's covered and provides additional data that would help the city council in responding to residents. We have -- in the packet, we covered county and state face covering regulation and authorization. There's a section on public health recommendations and requirements

and then also a section on Scottsdale's communication and response.

And we talked first about that county face covering regulation. So the county Board of Supervisors adopted regulations requiring face coverings on June 19th, and they amended those on June 26th. That full regulations are in your packet. It applies to all of Maricopa County, of which Scottsdale are in. There are 27 cities and towns in Maricopa County and Scottsdale is about 6% of the county's population of almost 4.5 million residents. Next slide.

The county website summarized the regulations as follows. And you can see that on the screen. Basically, people older than 6 have to wear masks in enclosed covered spaces. Adults with children between 2 and 5 must make a reasonable effort to make them wear masks inside, enclosed public spaces. If you are on public transportation, you have to wear one. If you are staff working in public spaces you have to wear one and then there are some exemptions. They don't apply in your home, or restaurant patrons when they are eating or drinking. Or people walking or exercising outside, as long as they maintain 6-foot distance and they don't apply in your personal space.

Similar to the state requirements, they have the philosophy where you educate people first, and the officers will promote best public health practices but then if someone refuses to put a face covering on and doesn't fall under one of those exemptions they can face a fine. Next slide. -- they can face a fine. Next slide.

This authority came from the governor's executive order 2020-40 that was issued on June 17th and that notes -- it's noted on the screen. And so that's the parameters under which a city or a county could adopt policies to require the wearing of face coverings in public to mitigate the spread of COVID-19. Now, before we go further, I wanted to highlight a couple of other things that are in the packet information that you have you also have information -- and we can pull this up on the screen at any point in time and talk through any of these, but what we have done, we have gone and quoted directly from official government level, from the Centers for Disease Control, the Arizona Department of Health services and the guidance and the requires that they implemented for high-risk businesses, such as gyms, fitness centers, theaters, bars, water parks and tubing operators.

So the state has also issued that guidance and that's based on several levels of community spread, which I think Troy is going to talk about later, and we can certainly go over if you want. The county has also issued public health guidance. The county also has a website that tracks cases, hospitalizations, deaths, any of that information. We can pull that up if you want. The county also has a website that is helpful for providing information for reopening schools and drills down to the ZIP code level, but also at the city level.

We shared with you what that trend looked like over time there. And then we have also provided information about how Scottsdale has communicated to the public and the city employees, the police department response, the fire department response during this period of time, and the procedures that we have impacting staff and facilities and also the program that the city offered to reimburse businesses for personal protective equipment purchases such as masks. So I wanted to just highlight that at the beginning and then the next presenter is Assistant City Manager Bill Murphy.

[Time: 00:09:17]

Assistant City Manager Bill Murphy: Thank you, Brent. Next slide, please. Can you go back one there, Kelly. Good evening, Mayor and members of the council. Next slide then. I think we -- okay.

So just to start off with when we first started -- this pandemic started back in March and April, we were concerned about the P.P.E. that would be out there and available for us at the time. So we wanted to make sure that all the employees were covered. So the city had purchased over 12,000 masks for all the employees. These were the samples here in front of you. And the lower right is the one that we have just put together to -- that are at public places at this point. We had a youth program that we were offering at the parks and so we put together 2600 masks for those summer programs that we were using those and then here in September, the light blue in the bottom right corner is the purchase that we have. And those are situated for people who need masks that are at our community centers, at the libraries. So that if someone comes in and needs one, they are available to them. And Cigna has also provided us over 2200 masks this is as well for the employees. Next slide, please.

So the information that we have been trying to promote, everyone continually has been to mask up. And so if we start from left to right here, this sign is similar to what we put out. This is at the sports complex or the soccer complex. These are also attached in frames at various fields we have as far as reserve for adult softball or kickball or even the little league groups that are out there. The second one here is you can see it says "Attention Arizona Bike Week Attendees". We have that Bike Week will be at WestWorld beginning tomorrow through Saturday with the -- their guideline of masking up.

Again, this is a Healthy Scottsdale starts with you. We also have put together signage again with the promotion of healthy Scottsdale. This is as you enter into the restrooms that we have in our facilities, in the parks to remind everybody to follow good hygiene. And finally, we have hand sanitizer at the far right here. Those are situated at each of our restrooms where we have some of the facilities as you enter some of the facilities, they have those. So we put those around the city. We initially started to rent some at the start of the pandemic when things started, and since then we have now purchased these and these are refilled on a continual basis. Next slide, please.

So parts of recreation, all the masks available for all of our staff and public are mandatory in all of our facilities and that's posted and continually reminded by our staff. We have started our class sizes at the senior centers again with room sizing and distancing. So we are really spreading those out, and any of the classes that we have are definitely keeping well over 6 feet between each other. The city facilities staff put together a lot of health barriers around customer counters as you come into the buildings. We also have stickers on the floor, so that if there's more than one person that's coming to the counter, they provide the 6-foot clearance. We have been providing checks -- temperature checks and we did that throughout our summer camp. We have also been doing it at any facilities where you might be coming into any of our parks and recreation facilities.

The return to play protocol in place, masking up, these are some things that I think you received some emails from me on. We had started the program, and have now gone into more competitive competition, but what we are asking is for in the tournaments, anybody not playing has a mask,

whether sitting on the sidelines and we added the hand sanitizer stations around our playgrounds and restrooms. Next slide, please.

So the protocol and the McDowell Sonoran Preserve and Pinnacle Peak, when we set these up initially, we have 6-foot spots marked out at the trail heads but we installed these a-frame. The masks are mandatory for all of our staff. The masks are provided to the public if they are required at the trail heads. We have signs throughout adhering to the protocol, and any guidance that we can provide to the public, we have been able to do that with our staff at each of those facilities. Next slide, please.

So WestWorld has been very busy and we continue to keep a lot of events going on, but we have -- we have the areas that we are controlled and in containment of where those producers are having the activities. Attendees cannot gather in any large groups. We have put the burden open the producers to continually remind those that are in the groups but our staff as well is working in WestWorld are making the rounds as well to talk to people about that as well. The masks must be worn at all times for the attendees and the staff in the building, except, obviously if they are having something to snack on, where they might be in the Equidome. Public announcement, the protocol, it's for reminders with the producers working at the city and we continually on our signage have been reminding everybody about the federal CDC, Arizona health department and the city of Scottsdale protocols as well. And our signage is throughout the entire facilities as well.

We have also high touch areas like the restrooms and the handles and things. We have our cleaning and disinfecting protocol that's in place and our staff is in a continual movement to do that. We have also done that in some of the other buildings throughout the city. And then providing any health barriers we also completed those at our feed store and the concession areas and R.V. areas. Next slide, please.

The library, we have a protocol that our video is on the website, masks are asked to be worn at all times. We have clear consistent messages throughout all the branches. We have been doing the drive thru since early April, and again, as those dropoffs happen, our staff are wearing masks to go back and forth and converse with anybody through the windows. We're keeping social distancing with any of the patrons visiting the libraries. We have had patrons who came to the library and maybe forgotten their mask, we have been able to offer that throughout the time that we have been open, and we are continually monitoring those branches and keeping them -- everyone wearing masks as we go through it and we have regarded messages that may on the sound system, again, reminding everyone of the social distancing and face coverings. Next slide, please.

So in human services, again, masks are mandatory for all of our staff. We have signage both inside and outside the facilities. We have only one entrance to our facility right now for the senior centers and that is really just so we can host some classes, but any of our staff outside providing some of the food drops are all required to have masks as they are interacting with any of those patrons that come by and we are loading some of the items in the back of their trunks. We are doing temperature checks at the senior center right now. We have the sanitizing stations in place and regular updates with their staff, meeting continually with all of our recreation part-time staff as well. And we have got public information replays on our video monitors within the centers, and we're continuing to educate our staff

and users alike about the safety and the protocol that we expect here in the city. So with that, go to the next slide.

I would like to introduce to you Troy Lutrick, our Emergency Management Manager. So Troy, if you want to take it away. Thank you.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Bill. Troy?

[Time: 00:17:58]

Emergency Management Manager Troy Lutrick: Thank you, Mr. Murphy, and good evening, Mayor and councilmembers. Thanks for having me. I wanted to give -- start with a little bit of an historical overview so we understand where we started and kind of where we have been and where we are headed. As we know, CDC ruled the coronavirus a novel virus, novel, literally means that it's new, unknown. They don't know the effects of this and we are all aware of that.

On March 2nd, I went to Chief Shannon and suggested that we institute the all hazards and I finished a briefing with A.S.U., and as you remember they had patient number one at the state. It was an A.S.U. student. I received that briefing. Likely we will be impacting here in Scottsdale at some point. And so we formed an all hazards management team. It involved public safety as we were gaining more information. Coincidentally, the very next day, we were notified by county public health that patient number two had been transported by Scottsdale fire department paramedics through days previous on Friday night and so we were instantly in the game.

March 5th, we expanded that incident management team include other city departments that included -- that had public works, risks safety, transportation, eventually economic development, planning department, all of those other organizations to make sure that we were well represented across the entire city. As you remember, June 17th, Governor Ducey issues a permit, the local ordinance tore a local mask permissions. The next day, Mayor Lane issued a mask proclamation for city of Scottsdale. And then the following day Maricopa County board of directors also issued their mask regulation. So in the matter of three days, we had all essentially gotten on the same page.

We continue to hold incident management team meetings weekly. They are held every other Tuesday at this point. They had been much more frequent in the beginning, but at this point, we feel every other Tuesday is adequate for the sharing of information and planning. We also started the recovery branch process very early and on the next slide, I will show you kind of where that -- why that process occurs. Recovery starts as soon as we start the response phase and so in -- I think the late March, early April, we established a recovery branch and we continue to hold those meetings on the opposing weeks, every other Wednesday. Next slide, please.

So this cycle on the left side that I mentioned to you, we're always in the preparedness phase, training, education, et cetera. Once we had patient number two here in Scottsdale that instantly put us in the response phase, and very shortly after that, we started talking about recovery and planning for -- for that and that continues as we go. We're actually now transitioning into the mitigation phase, in

addition to the other phases as we talk about vaccination, and that would be a mitigation for avoidance of future COVID cases here in Scottsdale. The graphic you see on the right is a FEMA chart that's called the planning p. At the bottom of it, the bottom of the stem of p is where the incident began. That would be March 2nd in our case, and then we start making notifications. We move up the stem there and then we get into the circular action around the p and then we do that on a regular basis, a series of meetings and notifications as we go through our planning process to be prepared going forward. Next slide, please.

Many of you have probably seen this. I believe I sent it out. This is our incident management team organization chart. As you can see, it's a very broad cross-section of city departments and leadership and decision makers and folks that we need to have a common operating picture for our COVID response and recovery and mitigation fees. And so that is our current org chart and we have been in operation now for 217 days straight. Next slide, please. Okay.

This is a slide from Maricopa County Public Health. Some have probably seen something similar. What this is depicting here -- and I know the numbers are almost impossible to read, is that very peaked curve, the dark purple is positive cases that have been recognized in the system. And as you can see, the first date on this goes all the way back to April 12th and the stay at home order was lifted on May 15th and we have a subsequent, very climb in the number of cases and impacts and the documented line, this the trend line and this is the average across these. And then luckily in the late July, we had a very steep decline. We continue on that decline, down to the bottom and last date was October 4th.

As you see in the red box, we are seeing some vacillation of those cases. That's expected. We'll keep a close eye on that. The light purple in the middle is the patients seen in the emergency department. As you can see, that also kind of spiked up as appropriate, and that trended down and remains relatively flat at this point. And then the other light pink at the bottom is actually positive admissions. So if you were seen in the emergency department or transferred in from another facility, and you were admitted, then those would be the cases of admission of COVID. Next slide, please. Okay.

Similar, on this chart, this is actually talking about hospital resources. And the blue line at the top is medical surgical beds. That's a step or two below an I.C.U. bed. The -- the curve there mimics exactly what we saw in the positive patients. The red line on this chart is adult I.C.U. for COVID-19 cases, and obviously that's come down also since July, and then the green line at the bottom is ventilators in use for COVID patients. Next slide, please. Okay.

The next couple of slides will be about our vaccine preparedness. We have assembled a task force that is very specifically looking at the options of vaccine -- vaccination, both for our employees and at some point for the general public. This information changes very frequently, as we get new directives from the federal government, it guesses passed down to us and this information is actually very fresh, just the last couple of days. Essentially, what we expect with the vaccine, it would divide it into three phases.

Phase one is divided in two groups. That first phase, you see on the third bullet point there is for

healthcare. So doctors, nurses, staff that work in a hospitals, urgent cares, medical care facilities, things like that will be offered first round of vaccine once it's made available. And inside of that group is also our Scottsdale fire department, fire and fire and E.M.S. So our E.M.T.s and paramedics that are out there making direct contact with patients.

Phase one b involves other essential workers and we're in the process of trying to get as much -- to get as much information we can to see how many doses we might get, and when they will arrive. How they will arrive. They are logistically because they need to keep in very cold temperatures and that's a short window of a few hours to give the vaccination. And so everybody is working through those logistics as we speak. Next slide, please.

Phase two and three includes once we have large numbers of doses available, we'll vaccinate -- they will vaccinate the critical populations that could include care facilities and -- and folks that are sensitive to -- to being ill with other disease process. And then general population, which will come in phase three and that's assuming that the vaccine is widely available to give to all of the general population. So at this point, those are the three phases of vaccine delivery or vaccine administration information that they have given to us. We have the task force specifically focused on this information, and we are working hand in hand with Honor Health and I believe you have some input from them in just a few minutes. Next slide, please.

At this point, I talked with the fire department medical director and the city medical director and Dr. Matthew Nichols and Dr. Casey Solon and these are some of the things that they will thought were relative to the conversation. Flu and COVID symptoms are very similar and they are nearly impossible to tell the difference, without -- with any confidence, without actually testing for both. When you go into an urgent care or medical facility and you are complaining of symptoms that would fall on either of those symptomatology lists for flu or COVID. They are likely going to test you for flu first. There's a flu A and B that gets done to go. And then if those symptoms are negative and your symptoms are appropriate, then they will also do a COVID test. It's very difficult to tell those apart just by somebody describing what their symptoms are.

Next, both are respiratory transmissible. And so both are through respiratory droplet and spread. Anything you can do to reduce that transmission by respiratory is effective and helpful. And the third is just for some perspective. Typically 40% of the population will get an influenza vaccine annually. We are anticipating that number will be up this year. Hopefully a significant amount so we can at least decrease one of the concerns that are out in the public as we go into flu season now, but 40% is the typical number of people that get the vaccine annually. Next slide, please. Okay.

Herd immunity and I ran this also by our two medical directors, and essentially, there are two ways to get to herd immunity in a community. Mass vaccination, which means either we have given enough vaccines that 70 to 90% of the population has been vaccinated and has been effective and/or 70 to 90% of people contribute COVID, survive the disease and build a natural immunity with their own antibodies. If you were to do the math across the nation, that's approximately 220 million people to get to that 70% rate. So herd immunity is definitely a conceivable concept, but at 70% of the population, that can be challenging considering that 40% of the population gets the influenza vaccine at this point. Next slide,

please. Okay.

This snapshot off of the CDC website actually came out yesterday and I will bring your attention to the -- essentially the second bullet point. This kind of spread is referred to as airborne transmission, as an important way that infections like tuberculosis, measles and chickenpox are spread. So this was newly posted open the CDC website as of yesterday. It was a revision from something that was posted a couple of weeks ago and they have -- they have now put this out and we certainly all remember the fears of tuberculosis. Measles is still something that is in our community now and chickenpox is relatively less these days, but still present. So I want to bring your attention to that. Next slide, please. Okay.

This will be my last slide and then I will introduce our guest speaker. There are terms out there that are somewhat helpful, but they take a little bit of an explanation. If you are wearing a mask, like you see on the left, the young lady, that's called source protection, protecting people around you from coughs, sneezes and exhalation of respiratory droplets. And picture on the right is an n95 mask. That's defined as a medical respirator and it protects both the wearer to some degree from receiving transmissions from other people that may be sick. A lot of times you will see this in the healthcare personnel, the fire rein the E.M.S. wear this on each call and they protect the wearer to some degree. But they also protect everyone else if that person happens to be asymptomatic and infectious, potentially spreading. That's my last slide, I believe and I think there's a closing slide and then I would like to -- if you can switch to that closing slide.

And I would like to introduce Dr. Stephanie Jackson. She has joined us from Honor Health. We're very happy to be in partnership with them and working with them, and she's here to kind of explain what they're seeing across the Honor Health system and give you some insight to their experiences also. Dr. Jackson, are you there?

Dr. Stephanie Jackson: Yes, thank you. Can you hear me?

Emergency Management Manger Troy Lutrick: Yes. We can hear you very well.

Mayor Lane: Yes, Dr. Jackson thank you.

[Time: 00:33:27]

Dr. Stephanie Jackson: Thank you, Mayor and city councilmembers for giving me the opportunity to share some of the concerns we have as a health system. I serve as the chief medical and quality officer at Honor Health and also lead the infection control division. As you know, Honor Health has six hospitals. Three of which are located here in Scottsdale and since the pandemic began, we cared for over 2300 COVID positive patients. Over 17,000 outpatient encounters related to COVID and while we're able to return many of those patients safely home to their families, over 400 of those patients did not survive.

Our caregivers experienced very difficult conditions at the COVID surge. At our peak, we had about 400

patients in the hospitals with COVID in early July. Who were very grateful that two weeks after the mask mandate was put in place in Arizona. We know from studies published in health affairs that mask mandates have led to the decline of COVID rates and 15 states and the District of Columbia. We know that the mask mandates prevented about 450,000 cases of COVID already.

Today I speak with you with some urgency. We are seeing that cases and hospital volumes are again on the rise. At Honor Health, we have seen an increased number of hospital cases, as well as urgent care cases over the last four days and the percent of positive tests are increasing again. As we feel, it's absolutely critical that we tip to mandate mask wearing, practice social distancing and really deliver a consistent message, not only from all levels of government but from all levels of businesses and our health system. The public is very easy I confused by all of the inconsistent messaging and really the massive information and it's critical that we speak with one voice, stay on the same message and support and enforce masking. Masks creates a physical barrier and prevents the droplets from spreading as far into the surrounding air as they normally would.

Honor Health would ask that the city of Scottsdale strongly ask that you wear face masks, particularly as we know we have the possibility of a vaccine on the horizon. We know that the extreme forms of social distancing just aren't sustainable in a complete lockdown would really devastate the economy. Universal masking will compliment the social distance and slowing down the pandemic and importantly, it will allow businesses to remain open and prevent overwhelming the health system so that we can be available to our community to care for all. Other routine serious illnesses including heart attacks, stroke, cancer, surgeries and motor vehicle accidents that require I.C.U. care. Thank you.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Dr. Jackson for the information.

Emergency Management Manager Troy Lutrick: Thank you, Dr. Jackson, that's the end of my presentation and I will turn it back over to you, Mayor and Mr. Thompson.

Mayor Lane: Very good. Mr. Thompson, if you want to proceed.

City Manager Jim Thompson: Mr. Mayor, members of council, that's our presentation this evening. So right now, we will entertain any questions that the Mayor and the council may have or any discussion you desire. Thank you.

[Time: 00:37:09]

Mayor Lane: Okay. Thank you, Mr. Thompson. One thing that I thought was something that we probably didn't point out as clearly as it probably should have been, is that in the interim since the beginning of surge, the changes that have taken place at the state level with regard to certain protocols that are submitted and thus authorized for opening up businesses specifically tied to the increase in infection rate, that being the bars, the gyms and some of the other organizations that fell into that category, theaters and such and has led to a far more protected environment, in those particular areas that as I he is -- I said really lent an awful lot to the surge. They couldn't actually operate in that environment, given the services and the environment that they sell to the public. I think that's an

important component, because it really did add immensely to the use of masks aside from the mandate.

And the other is that certainly we still do have a mask mandate here in Scottsdale. And it's a countywide mandate and it has a consistent authority of the county and we also stand to enforce on it as well. It's a very important point, and I think people as they become -- to maintain a safe environment that, we probably have a far safer environment now than we did certainly at the time of the surge. That's easy, but even be given where we were with regard to our individual businesses. And just today, we had a meeting to make sure that there's some consistency with the state program now to actually provide for the same types of protocol requirements for our resorts and our hoteliers and their operations.

So it's become another important enforceable component that is completely aside from some of the things we do here in the city. We have a similar standard that we set for ourselves as the city manager specifically stated and that is when the proclamation was originally issued, the authority was given by way of my proclamation on that, to the city manager for all of our -- our venues. We had a point in time took it upon ourselves to try to help our entertainment -- not our entertainment, but our resort industry to make sure that they were providing a healthy environment. They also came to us asking specifically because they wanted to make sure that they were in a position to attract the tourists back to town.

Certainly that's a valuable thing for not only them but our entire community. We wanted to have a consistent program that would be fair and equal for everyone as far as the implementation is concerned, and that this was scalable as we -- things improve or as they may unimprove that you could scale back and become safer and that is actually the program that the state has instituted with the support and the authority in enforcement of the DLLC and the county health department as far as that is concerned. All important components when you think about authority to enforce.

Nobody wants to be heavy handed on this, but it's had a very, very positive impact in some of the ability to stay open, to be open, but to have to adjust their operations in order to become safe, particularly at a point of crisis, which this surge is different, and that's why the constitution of mask mandate at that time was so important. We had to stop it immediately, and that's the nature of an emergency proclamation. And so we did. I think it had the desired effect and it gave time for the state and the county to come around to some of these protocols that were necessary and you continue to work forward.

So the only element I really wanted to make sure was clear is that we bought some time. We actually managed through the process in a very good way to everybody's satisfaction and maybe other cities are considering too, a standardization within the county. Remembering the county was designated hotspot, we were identified as a hotspot because of our gem district. We were on -- entertainment district. We are on the news nearly every night and we became a focal point before the county did too to make sure we were moving in the right direction and force it down as quickly as possible. So I think it's all been very successful and where we are now is in a very good place and it's a credit to certainly the city staff and city manager and his team, absolutely not only working to keep the city whole and our city employees safe, which they have done very, very well and frankly, we are a critical function.

So it's critically important that we keep our personnel safe and on the job. It's absolutely necessary that they are on the job. All the essential services, the 51 critical infrastructure and their services are all in that same situation, inclusive of a lot of additional and different industries. So kudos to the city manager and his staff on what they were able to do.

And when upon request when the -- pardon me again, but nevertheless, when the hospitality industry came to us and asked for some standardization so they could actually promote and move forward with having people come and come confidentially that we created one of the safest environments. One the major investments on some of the money used from CARES Act with regard to making our environment safer, were things that the city manager actually put into play in some of our venues to enhance those airborne droplets whether it's U.V. or other means of disinfecting the air and circulation issues. All of those things are very, very positive not only for our tourists but also our residents. And so it's a good situation. I think probably one of the best situations, I think in the valley for any city that's actually complying and frankly enforcing. I think one of the biggest question areas for every business and frankly for everyone is how do we enforce some of these things?

Which is another thing we have done in turning over some of this to the business owners for their responsibility and if, in fact, they have the right to deny someone in if it will be threatening to their employees and/or their customers and frankly something that they need to comply with, they can call upon us for a number of things, inclusive of trespass. We run a polity of educating and warning but then making sure that we come back and, intact make sure that there is compliance -- otherwise and we have done it. We have forced people to shut down and suspension of licenses and such and so those are major components when you are dealing with people.

Again, the city manager, myself, none of us here want to be heavy handed who are trying to make their livelihood but we want them to maintain their livelihood and be safe. It's important for all of us. So I think that you are doing a great job and I think really our interaction with the public through the federal government and through the state government and through the county government and through ourselves is a coordinated and consistent plan and a think it served us very well. Yes, Councilwoman Whitehead.

[Time: 00:46:11]

Vice Mayor Whitehead: I think if anyone wants to know if government is fast or effective, I would point you to the chart on page 15. That chart really makes me smile. So that is the chart where within two weeks, where Scottsdale led the way with Mayor Lane's decision to mandate the masks and we see this precipitous drop. These are lives that are were saved and I think that Scottsdale led the way. I think the county followed and by having the county followed we just -- like I said we did save a lot of lives and I'm just deeply grateful for that.

I also want to thank the staff because we're in a disruptive year and there's a lot of fear. There's a lot of misinformation about jail time and information that's wrong. So staff has done a great job reaching out to the public and as I think all of us have tried to do, just clarify what is and what was the mandate and

what the mandate didn't include. I appreciate staff. I want to thank, Honor Health, S.U.S.D., and I think this has really shown we're one community and we need to communicate and share each other's data and each other's experiences.

You know, I thought it would be so interesting back to the same chart. Thank you, Kelly, for putting it up on the screen. The big drop. I think it would be so fascinating to have the economic activity during that same period because what I think we would see is a steep incline of economic activity during that period because we were able to reopen our businesses and we were able to maintain a new normal and I think that's a success of our government and it's one we should acknowledge and celebrate.

So the decision to move the mask mandate vote was two weeks ago and I stand by that, but I do want to have continued updates so that we are looking at this data week by week. I hope that staff will give that to us.

[Time: 00:49:05]

I do have a couple of questions having to do with how we promote the county mandate. The residents are not worried about the participants while they are in the venue the WestWorld, for instance the question is how do those people -- how do we convince those people when they are out in our communicates and in our restaurants and grocery stores to wear the mask. How do we make sure that they know about the county mask mandate? I guess that's a question for the city manager. That's question one.

City Manager Jim Thompson: Mayor, members of council, vice Mayor Whitehead. I think we walk through a number of displays and we are ensuring that any of those functions that occur in the city, and those gathering of greater than 50, if's a permitting process that they go through currently and then we go through the protocol associated with that and make sure they have proper posting and all the standards in place and in particular, in our own facilities, I think that we would go further and we are requiring certain levels of security to ensure compliance. We kind of talked about that, but at the private venues as such, we are. When we get calls or issues or we know they have event, they have to go through a permit if it's greater than 50. Is it a gym? Is it a bar? Is it a restaurant? Is it a restaurant that serves food? Or is a bar that does not serve food? There's different standards for all of those and protocols in fact, when it's busy, we have been going out on every one of those nights and visiting those facilities and doing a welfare check and making sure that everything is in order and compliance. Again, we continue to do that.

As far as getting the word out associated with the county mask, we have done multiple press releases and multiple platforms and we will continue to do that. As long as it's in place, we will continue to enforce and we will continue to advise that it's in place. And we are as noted by the map, we are part of Maricopa County and our entire area. And as long as that exists and as we understand today, there's no interest at the county level to lift that mandate and so we continue to operate under that map date.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: Let -- mandate. Let me more specific. There's a lot of signage about what they do while they are at the venue, would it be possible to provide some educational material that when

they leave the venue that they are under a county mandate, just so that our residents who have health conditions feel like they can go to the grocery store.

City Manager Jim Thompson: We will be happy to do that. We will look at our potential that like many events we have, that we provide information or data about the community and so forth and we can include that accordingly.

Vice Mayor Whitehead: And the other question, there are a lot of state executive orders and I wonder if we can just get a summary of those executive orders what they entail at some point in time. We get so many questions from so many people but other than that, I mean, I just want to thank everybody for having this presentation. I think it makes everybody pro con, in the middle, a lot more informed and I think it was very helpful and I want to thank you for having the work study session. Thanks.

Mayor Lane: Thank you Councilwoman Whitehead. Yes, Councilwoman Milhaven.

[Time: 00:52:31]

Councilwoman Milhaven: I too would like to thank the staff for a great presentation, as well as for all the great work that they have done over the last several months to keep themselves and the citizens of Scottsdale safe. I think we can be very proud and Mayor, I'm very grateful too that when the governor allowed the cities to mandate masks that you jumped right on it. I was very pleased about that. It is no surprised that I wished we would have kept the mandate in place a little bit longer, in order to avoid any confusion, and I have not changed my mind and I don't think my colleagues have either. So I won't belabor that point here.

I want to make some comments to respond to the many emails that we have gotten from people for the mask mandate, a local mask mandate and for those who are very angry about a mask mandate. And so what I would like to say is no one wants to believe where we are today. It's absolutely unimaginable and every day I think it's even more unimaginable that on the day before. The president said -- I think he said, don't let coronavirus dominate your life and I agree and I would want to reiterate that, but as you are willing and able to get out, given all the protections in place, I hope the people will do so with masks.

It's very clear tonight that the county still has a mask requirement. Even though we don't have a local mandate, we are still required to wear masks and so as you get out and about, as you are willing and able, please, please, wear your mask. We heard from Honor Health but we heard from banner health and Mayo Clinic and the CDC and the Surgeon General that masks help.

Now I know we have gotten folks who cited other medical sources who say masks don't help. My grandmother told me I should always err on the side of caution. I think rather than argue whose source is right, I think it's best to try to keep everybody safe and err on the side of caution. We have also gotten comments about it being government overreach to mandate masks. I couldn't disagree more. We have a responsibility as your electeds to look out for public health and we have lots of calls and

ordinances about how fast you can drive down the street and where you can dump your trash and what you can and can't do when you walk your dog in public places. It's all in the interest of public health. Now certainly public sentiment comes into play. Marijuana was okay, and now it's not legal, and medical legal, and now we have something on the ballot to make recreational marijuana legal.

Certainly the public has a voice in that and that's when they vote and so for folks who disagree that this is something we should do, then people who agree with us can vote for us next time, or if you disagree, you vote for somebody else but I absolutely believe it's our responsibility as elected officials, you were asking us to make decisions for the greater good. I think we all used our best judgment and we follow our conscience to do the about. Thing and if at the end of the day, the folks disagree with us, you can speak with your vote.

And I would like to put all that aside and recognize that because these are difficult times during difficult times we find out what we are made of. So do we find our best selves or do we let the stress get the better of us and we become our less than best selves? So we got many, many angry emails but there's also a lot of people who are just as strongly who are frightened.

Yesterday I had a conversation with a store cashier through her tears she told me I have two young children at home. She said, I wear my mask and they put a shield up between me and my customers. I wash my hands regularly. I keep my distance, I wipe down my work station but I am so fearful that I'm going to bring this horrible thing home to my babies. She went on to say – she said, I'm afraid anyway, but what makes it worse is when customers argue with me about wearing a mask and insist that they don't need to wear a mask.

And for folks who may be angry about wearing a masks. Maybe we could find our better selves and find some compassion and do our best to remember that there are a lot of people out there who are frightened and the masks are required but for -- we can come together and be more compassionate, kinder community and look out for each other. Please wear your masks, not just because county requires it but because we are kind and compassion people would are looking out for each other. Thank you.

[Time: 00:57:30]

Mayor Lane: If I could add a little something to what you just said, I don't think there's anyone here in this room, anyone in this room at all or in this building that doesn't have a great sympathy for the people who are fearful. This was brought upon us with 4.2 million people dead by July. That is nevertheless the number we are looking at is also very, very striking and fearful, but it's unfortunate how much we play on people's fears and that's the difficulty with it. The other is constantly reminding each other how much we need to respect each other. I think all of this disrespect is prevalent. That means others, protection of others, as well as yourself. So I'm with you with regard to those sentiments, absolutely.

And these are tragic and it's like the old TV show, and no one in the room is probably old enough to remember, but New York City, there's 8 million stories and there's 8 million different kinds of ideas

going in this that city with a population of 8 million. And there's no process that we will ever employ is going foolproof. There will be people who are irritated and difficult with it and those people have to be forced into a situation, but at the same time, I think the vast majority of the people still have respect for themselves and other people, and that's snag we need to continue to emphasize. There are the mandates and the protocols and all manner of things that can be enforced physically, but I would much rather be able to and I think we can improve our numbers and improve compliance by giving people respect and pleading and frankly responding to their -- the better heart of those people. Hopefully they respond appropriately.

So, I mean, there's an awful lot and I almost hate to say it as I use the word. My mother used to always say, hate is a very, very strong word but this seems to be an awful lot of hate and we need to somehow diffuse that as best we possibly can. And a lot of mistrust. So your flag?

Councilwoman Klapp: May I speak?

Mayor Lane: Yes, Councilwoman Klapp.

[Time: 01:00:23]

Councilwoman Klapp: I want to acknowledge the many, many people that are actually wearing masks that I see.

Mayor Lane: Yes.

Councilwoman Klapp: And there are those, even before the mandate and after the mandate would don't want to wear masks and have told store owners that. This has not changed since the mandate was taken away by the Mayor. I have gone to grocery stores and have gone to my doctor's office and went to the dentist to have my teeth cleaned and I went to the gym when it reopened. Everybody is wearing masks. I see nobody in any of those establishments that I'm going to refusing to wear masks. Now, maybe they stopped at the door and had an argument with somebody because I think that happens.

I used to run a retail business and I can tell you for sure that the customers will argue with you about everything. Not just masks but everything is and the business owners do have the right to ask those people to leave this if he need to ask them to leave. I want to thank the many thousands of business owners in this city that are running their businesses with a sign in the window that they have no wear a mask. They are controlling that with their clientele.

And I feel good about as the Mayor said where we are today and there is only one other note that I would make about something that was said before about government overreach. And this is the emails I get. People tell me they can live with a mask mandate as placed by the Mayor or the proclamation, agreed to all of us unanimously but when it comes to an ordinance, a law that's where they draw the line and they say it's government overreach. So the mandate sun with thing but when we are considering putting a law on with certain very specific requirements and penalties, that's where many

of the people that have written me have said we don't want it and we are all still wearing masks.

I thank the people who are wearing masks. I think there are a lot of compassionate people. I think there's a lot of people who understand that they should wear masks. The people who are refusing at the door to not wear them are in the minority. So I believe overall that I have seen some pretty good attitudes in the city of Scottsdale and I thank people for respecting their fellow citizens and wearing masks not only to protect themselves but to protect others. Thank you for that.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Councilwoman Klapp. As long as it's official. Yes. Councilwoman Littlefield.

[Time: 01:03:21]

Councilmember Littlefield: Thank you, Mayor. I would like to take a moment and thank everyone for your emails, all of our citizens. They were talking about what we were supposed to do. There was a great deal of confusion among our citizens and I think that this tonight -- this presentation has been a very good venue to good -- get some true answers out to the citizens of Scottsdale so they know where we are now and what is and is not required. So I thank you very much from this. I thank Jim Thompson our city managers for putting this on and for the staff for the mentions that they have done.

As the Mayor commented his proclamation was never meant to be a permanent thing but to help us deal with the original COVID crisis, which it did. But whether it's opened or closed, the proclamation doesn't change the fact that the county regulations are still in effect in Maricopa County. We are obligated to wear masks in public and condition six feet of other. The Mayor's proclamation and the county mandate were very, very similar and ran hand in hand. So nothing much has changed since we had the proclamation. I want to make that clear to everyone. We are under the same rule, it just comes from a different source.

We all read the emails by our citizens which shows a great deal of concern and confusion and we as a council, I believe at this point in time we don't need to do much of anything to change what we have. Many people don't understand that they need to obey county regulations. They need to obey the county regulations. They are law in Maricopa County and that's basically one the reasons that I agreed to this work study session. We are under that mandate, regulation, whatever you want to call it. So I have to tell you, I have talked to a great number of people. I have had a lot of discussions with a lot of people and I believe that another regulation or mandate or proclamation is called for or required or would help in any way. We have a legal regulation in place. The county's. It's almost identical to what we have about. And they do the no plan on closing it any time soon, in fact, they just voted this last week to keep it in place. So it's there, people and it's going to be there for a while.

Also know that many cities in Maricopa County are closing their individual mandates just as Scottsdale has done, which will make the county ruling uniform throughout the entire county and I think that is a very good thing a very important thing because people will be able to travel from one city to another throughout the county and know that the rules are the same. They don't vary and there's no confusion about that. I think that's really important.

As I said at the last council meeting, I don't support a city mask ordinance. An ordinance as Councilwoman Klapp said is a rule of law and I don't believe it's necessary. I agree with our citizens that it's overreach. Right now we are covered. We have a rule and we need to abide by it. They are the law. I urge you to obey the county regulations. It is the law of the land at the moment in all of Maricopa County. It needs to be adhered to and obeyed. Thank you.

[Time: 01:07:36]

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Councilwoman Littlefield. If we have no other questions, I would just say again to all the presenters and to staff, all the way throughout the city for what you have done here for the city and all of your interactions in the private sector. So thank you very much for all of that. And I would say to the public, know that we do have a mask mandate that was reiterated by Councilwoman Littlefield. And so it's law. It's an emergency law, an emergency condition. So we'll follow through on that. And I would just ask that all of our citizens consider what is really important for them and for our community. And their civic responsibilities here as well. Respect each other. And we'll see ourselves through this many a much better form and much per frame of mind. With, that you have some instruction that I understand?

City Manager Jim Thompson: Yes, sir, Mr. Mayor.

ADJOURNMENT

[Time: 01:08:40]

Mayor Lane: Thank you very much. Well, that completes then our item on the special meeting -- I'm sorry not the special meeting, but the work study and I would then ask for some motion to adjourn.

Councilmembers: Move to adjourn. Second.

Mayor Lane: The motion has been made and seconded. All of those in favor of adjournment, please indicate by aye. We are adjourned. And I think we are just a little over time as far as our 5:00 meeting. And unless there's any objection, I'm going to go ahead and --

[Off microphone comment]

Mayor Lane: Then we'll take a five-minute break to facilitate that.