



DRAFT SUMMARIZED MINUTES

**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
PROTECT AND PRESERVE SCOTTSDALE TASK FORCE
REGULAR MEETING**

**4:00 p.m. Monday, August 30, 2023
Community Design Studio
7506 E. Indian School Road
Scottsdale, Arizona 85251**

CALL TO ORDER

The regular meeting of the Scottsdale Protect and Preserve Task Force was called to order at 4:01 p.m.

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Cynthia Wenstrom, Chair
Raoul Zubia, Vice Chair
Carla
James Eaneman
Nicholas Hartmann
Jace McKeighan
Daniel Schweiker
Mark Winkleman (Virtual)
John Zikias (Virtual)

STAFF: Kelly Corsette, Communications and Public Affairs Director
Joy Racine, Community Involvement Manager
Brent Stockwell, Assistant City Manager
Sonia Andrews, City Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer
Nick Molinari, Parks and Recreation Director
Kroy Ekblaw, Executive Assistant Strategic Projects
Ben Lane, City Clerk
Sherry Scott, City Attorney
Gina Kirklin, Finance Director

GUESTS: Sara LaBatt, EMC Research
Sianna Ziegler, EMC Research

PUBLIC COMMENT

Susan Wheeler provided comments related to Agenda Item 2. She discussed her time serving on the Parks Commission and Preserve Commission in the past. She urged the Task Force to keep their focus as a single issue for the Parks and open spaces, as the citizens historically support any parks-related election issues. The Arts department is free to confer with the Parks department regarding installation of public art in the parks, but this should be handled separately from the bond question.

David Smith provided comments regarding Agenda Item 4. He advised the Task force to focus on their mission, which is to identify unfunded needs in public spaces and for public safety. There is broad community support for arts and culture and Scottsdale is losing its edge in this area, as there is no dedicated source of funding for arts and culture. He urged the Task Force to consider broader funding rather than merely the maintenance of 155 pieces of public art.

Former Mayor Mary Manross talked about her experience with ballot initiatives at the local and state level. It is clear that the Task Force's mission was to address open spaces. Adding other elements such as arts will result in a loss of credibility for the election. The ballot question should be very simple and direct.

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Request approval of minutes of the August 14, 2023, Regular Task Force Meeting.

Task Force Action: Discussion and action

Chair Wenstrom called for corrections to the minutes. Member Carla, Member Zikias and Chair Wenstrom made corrections.

VICE CHAIR ZUBIA MOVED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF AUGUST 14, 2023 AS AMENDED. MEMBER EANEMAN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 9-0 WITH CHAIR WENSTROM, VICE CHAIR ZUBIA AND MEMBERS CARLA, EANEMAN, HARTMANN, MCKEIGHAN, SCHWEIKER, WINKLEMAN AND ZIKIAS VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

2. UPDATE ON POSSIBLE CITIZEN SURVEY IDENTIFIED IN APPROVED WORK PLAN

Kelly Corsette, Communications and Public Affairs Director, with the assistance of other city staff, will provide an update on staff's continuing work to prepare for a possible citizen survey as identified in the City Council adopted work plan.

Task Force Action: Information, discussion, and possible recommendations to staff

Sara LaBatt, EMC Research, provided an overview of the proposed random representative sample survey process. The survey goals include understanding community priorities and opinions and providing the City with independent and reliable data. Potential topics include general mood; ratings of City services; fiscal management; citizen priorities; tax attitudes; sensitivity; perceived need; demographics. The proposed structure utilizes a multimodal methodology combining online and telephone interviewing comprised of an estimated 400 responses. The margin of error will be plus or minus 4.9 percent. A process overview was provided. Brief clarifying questions were answered.

In response to a question from Member Carla, Kelly Corsette, Communications and Public Affairs Director, confirmed that the Task Force will have an opportunity to review the final survey questions before the survey is performed. It is important that the questions are not made available publicly prior to the survey process, so as not to spoil the sample. Ms. LaBatt provided a general review of the potential timeline, which involves a few weeks to gather information regarding desired questions, drafting a questionnaire, followed by approximately one to two weeks for revision and discussion prior to finalization. Once finalized, there is an approximately two-week process for programming in preparation for data collection and then actual data collection. Approximately one week after data collection the initial results are available, followed by a draft report approximately one week later. In total, the process is expected to take eight to nine weeks.

Chair Wenstrom asked for confirmation of the modalities. Ms. LaBatt stated that email, text messages and phone calls are used to contact survey respondents. Demographics influence the level of responses for each modality. For example, senior citizens are more likely to respond to a phone call than email or text. There was brief discussion on a motion to have staff proceed with the survey.

MEMBER CARLA MOVED TO DIRECT STAFF TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THE COMMUNITY SURVEY. MEMBER EANEMAN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 9-0 WITH CHAIR WENSTROM, VICE CHAIR ZUBIA AND MEMBERS CARLA, EANEMAN, HARTMANN, MCKEIGHAN, SCHWEIKER, WINKLEMAN AND ZIKIAS VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

3. SALES TAXES - STRATEGIES FOR UNFUNDED NEEDS

Staff removed this item for future discussion.

4. TASK FOR WORK STUDY SESSION

The work study session provides an opportunity for Task Force members to discuss topics and information previously presented to the Task Force along with the Task Force's potential recommendations to the Council. The Task Force will have an in-depth discussion and may provide additional direction to staff. As part of this item, but without limitation, Chair Wenstrom, with the assistance of Vice Chair Zubia, will lead the Task Force members in discussion of the following topic related to the Task Force Work Plan.

- 4.1 Discussion and possible action on the Protect and Preserve Scottsdale Task Force presentation and message to be given at the September 5th City Council work study.

Task Force Action: Information and discussion, and possible recommendations to staff

Chair Wenstrom introduced the item, stating that it is intended for discussion on the Task Force presentation and message to be given at the September 5th City Council Work Study Session.

Member Carla asked that the Task Force reconsider adding arts in its presentation and recommendation to City Council. Retaining the arts does not result in an additional voting base, because the majority of arts supporters already support the Preserve and parks. Including the arts will result in a very active and vocal opposition base. Council has already received numerous calls from residents who do not want arts to be included. Member Hartmann agreed, noting that

while he was initially convinced that outdoor public art sculptures should be included, he has since been otherwise convinced. Including arts might dilute the desired message and may endanger the success of the question to voters. Member McKeighan added that Scottsdale Arts is not a City entity but an outside entity with whom the City contracts. Member Schweiker stated that his interest involves preservation of public art existing in open spaces. Tax revenue in Scottsdale will soon be taking a hit and preservation of public art will rank low on the priority list. Ninety-five percent of public art exists in the public right-of-way, which is part of the open space. Vice Chair Zubia agreed with Member Schweiker in the application of funding just for restoration and maintenance of art in open spaces.

Member Zikias shared that he had spoken with members of Council over the last week and does not believe there is support for including arts. He referred to the Scottsdale Arts contract with the City and that they are responsible for conservation of City artwork. He stated that the contract requires Scottsdale Arts to submit a ten-year conservation analysis and budget on an annual basis. He mentioned that the contract also includes a clause stating that Scottsdale Arts is to increase reliance on outside funding to 67 percent of total revenues. Member Zikias concluded that providing Protect and Preserve tax funding would contradict the intent of the contract Council authorized with Scottsdale Arts. Member Zikias also stated that a concerning detail in the November 2020 City Council report was that over half the budget goes to administrative staff. Mr. Stockwell offered a factual correction. The 67 percent language that Member Zikias referred to specifically calls out public art, conservation, and restoration of public art as not applicable to that percentage. Scottsdale Arts are required to increase the amount of earned and contributed revenue, however, it specifically does not include public art or conservation of public art in that calculation. These are dedicated and restricted revenues for managing and maintaining the City's public art collection.

Member Eaneman commented on the difficulty with the issue, as most members agree with both sides. Based on Task Force discussions and a review of the documents that guide the Task Force's work, Council has provided a narrow focus and direction. The data also demonstrates that there is insufficient support to fund all items. He expressed support for Member Carla's suggestion of a narrower focus. Member Winkleman concurred with leaving out the arts for the time being. Chair Wenstrom referred to Scottsdale Arts' 2020 income, with the majority of funding coming via its contract with the City. Council is free to direct the Task Force to include the Arts, if they wish to do so.

Chair Wenstrom requested a motion to allow Vice Chair Zubia to join her in presenting to City Council on September 5th.

MEMBER EANEMAN MOVED THAT VICE CHAIR ZUBIA AND CHAIR WENSTROM MAKE A JOINT PRESENTATION AT THE CITY COUNCIL WORK STUDY SESSION ON SEPTEMBER 5, 2023. MEMBER SCHWEIKER SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 9-0 WITH CHAIR WENSTROM, VICE CHAIR ZUBIA AND MEMBERS CARLA, EANEMAN, HARTMANN, MCKEIGHAN, SCHWEIKER, WINKLEMAN AND ZIKIAS VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

Chair Wenstrom and Vice Chair Zubia took turns reviewing the presentation slides with titles and topics as follows:

- Slide 1: Protect and Preserve Scottsdale Task Force Update to Council September 5, 2023

Member Hartmann requested use of his full name, Nicholas.

- Slide 2: Protect and Preserve Scottsdale Task Force Members
- Slide 3: Background
- Slide 4: Renewing 0.2 Percent Tax or Below the 0.2 Percent Does not Increase Total Tax Rate
- Slide 5: Creation of the Task Force
- Slide 6: Task Force Mission
- Slide 7: Council Adopted Work Plan

Chair Wenstrom noted that the process is currently in Phase 3: Develop financial strategy and community survey.

Vice Chair Zubia asked for clarification on Phase 1: Preliminary Survey, inquiring as to what this entails. Chair Wenstrom stated that the Task Force chose not to complete that phase and instead, are combining it with Phase 3.

- Slide 8: 14 Meetings Held to Date to Study Unfunded Needs
- Slide 9: Restore Indian Bend Wash and Aging Parks

Member Zikias suggested that the slides include the fact that Task Force Members took field trips to observe conditions firsthand.

- Slide 10: Erosion and Deterioration of Aging Parks

There was discussion to clarify how much was accomplished via Bond 2019 and what needs remain unfunded. Sonia Andrews, City Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer, commented that this and the next slide have been revised to clarify erosion issues that were not addressed by Bond 2019. Nick Molinari, Parks and Recreation Director, added that in the Bond 2019 package, there was \$23.5 million to repair the lakes and the irrigation in the Indian Bend Wash specifically for Vista del Camino and Eldorado Park. There was also approximately \$10 million approved in the current 2023/24 budget for the lakes and irrigation project to cover any cost escalations for projects funded through the 2019 bond.

- Slide 11: Parks Unfunded Needs

Chair Wenstrom continued the review of slides.

- Slide 12: Protect & Preserve McDowell Mountains

Member Carla corrected “McDowell Mountains” to “McDowell Sonoran Preserve.”

- Slide 13: Preserve Dedicated Funding Needed
- Slide 14: Prioritize Fire Mitigation

Member Carla suggested clarifying “Medical exams” as “Firefighter medical exams.”

- Slide 15: Healthy Forest Initiative Grant Chemical Treatments; Proposed Fire Mitigation Treatments

Ms. Andrews commented that grants can only be used once for any particular area. The City is responsible for any ongoing maintenance for any previously funded areas.

In response to a question from Member Zikias, Kroy Ekblaw, Executive Assistant Strategic Projects, stated that Council is regularly apprised via reports, studies and surveys regarding the Preserve in terms of invasive species, fire mitigation and a variety of other relevant details. In addition, the Preserve Commission is provided in-depth reports on no less than a yearly basis.

- Slide 16: Enhance Park and Preserve Security
- Slide 17: Other Unfunded Needs Presented
 - Public Art in Open Spaces
 - Westworld

There was brief discussion regarding the need for a motion on the removal from the presentation of the slide on public art in open spaces.

MEMBER CARLA MOVED TO REMOVE PUBLIC ART IN OPEN SPACES FROM THE PRESENTATION. MEMBER MCKEIGHAN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 7-2 WITH CHAIR WENSTROM, AND MEMBERS CARLA, EANEMAN, HARTMANN, MCKEIGHAN, WINKLEMAN AND ZIKIAS VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH VICE CHAIR ZUBIA AND MEMBER SCHWEIKER DISSENTING.

Member Hartmann posed the question of whether the Task Force runs the same risk with WestWorld as it might have with funding public art in open spaces in terms of diluting the message of preservation and protection. Member Carla said she does not believe WestWorld faces the same challenges, as there is not an existing anti-WestWorld mindset as there is with the arts. WestWorld is the City’s largest park, fits the category of open space and has serious existing drainage needs. Funding is healthy for the north, as it includes the Preserve and for the south, as it includes Indian Bend Wash. WestWorld provides a focus for the central portion of the City. Member McKeighan agreed and suggested that it be presented to Council as a request for guidance from them on whether they wish consideration for funding for WestWorld. Member Hartmann commented that WestWorld needs a rebranding, such as WestWorld Park, WestWorld Complex or the WestWorld District. Vice Chair Zubia and Member Zikias agreed that WestWorld is appropriate to include. Chair Wenstrom commented that she associates WestWorld with a venue as opposed to a park and that it would be interesting to know the public’s view on this.

- Slide 18: Summary of Unfunded Needs Presented
- Slide 19: Estimated Key Dates

Discussion ensued regarding dates for providing potential ballot language to Council. Benjamin Lane, City Clerk, recommended providing it by April, 2024, which would allow adequate time for Council consideration. Sherry Scott, City Attorney, clarified that the date of May 2024 on the slide is intended to be the final deadline, in that the language must be provided to City Council by no later than May 2024. The Task Force is always free to set an earlier goal. After discussion, it was agreed that the estimated date for the Task Force to make its initial recommendation to Council, including possible ballot language, will be January 2024 with Council consideration of possible ballot language to take place between February 2024 and May 2024.

- Slide 20: Questions: Directions for Task Force

MEMBER SCHWEIKER MOVED TO ACCEPT THE SLIDES AS AMENDED. MEMBER EANEMAN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 9-0 WITH CHAIR WENSTROM, VICE CHAIR ZUBIA AND MEMBERS CARLA, EANEMAN, HARTMANN, MCKEIGHAN, SCHWEIKER, WINKLEMAN AND ZIKIAS VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

5. IDENTIFICATION OF POSSIBLE FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

The Task Force may request proposed topics for future agendas, but the Task Force may not discuss, deliberate, or take legal action on any matter in the “Identification of Possible Future Agenda Items” unless the specific matter is properly noticed for legal action.

Additionally, the following previously requested items may be placed on a future agenda:

- Review of draft language proposed by Task Force Members

Task Force Action: Information and discussion, and possible recommendations to staff

The following items were identified:

- Discussion of any changes/adjustments to the Task Force tasks and/or schedule as a result of feedback from the presentation to Council
- Ordinance versus fiscal policy discussion

6. ADJOURNMENT

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved by Vice Chair Zubia and seconded by Member Schweiker, the meeting adjourned at 5:52 p.m.

AYES: Chair Wenstrom, Vice Chair Zubia, Members Carla, Eaneman, Hartmann, McKeighan Schweiker, Winkleman and Zikias.

NAYS: None

SUBMITTED BY:

eScribers, LLC