



**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING**

SUMMARIZED MINUTES

Monday, April 12, 2021

Meeting Held Electronically

PRESENT: Janice Shimokubo, Chair
Emily Hinchman, Vice Chair
James Eaneman (left at 5:10 p.m.)
Marty Day
Hannellie Mendoza
Stuart Rhoden

ABSENT: Lawdan Shojaee

STAFF: Sharon Cini
Kelly Corsette
Brent Stockwell
Rob Millar

GUESTS: David Ortega, Mayor
Peter Palmer, Chair VAC
Jason Wong, ACEL

Call to Order/Roll Call

Chair Shimokubo called the meeting to order at 5:00 p.m.

Members present as listed above.

Public Comment

No public comments were submitted.

1. Approval of minutes from the March 8, 2021 meeting

VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN MOVED TO APPROVE THE MARCH 8, 2021 HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES. COMMISSIONER DAY SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SIX (6) TO ZERO (0) BY ROLL CALL VOTE. CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS EANEMAN, DAY, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

2. Presentation, discussion and possible recommendation(s) to staff or City Council regarding AAPI hate crimes and a letter to Governor Doug Ducey

Chair Shimokubo thanked Mayor Ortega for his statement of solidarity to the Asian American/Pacific Islander (AAPI) community, issued on March 30, 2021.

Jason Wong, president of Asian Corporate Entrepreneur Leaders, spoke about a letter the organization sent to Governor Ducey regarding the recent hate crimes against the Asian community. Over 100 local businesses and organizations signed the letter. The goal of the letter is to encourage the Governor to take mitigative action and to prosecute offenders to the fullest extent of the law. They are awaiting a response from the Governor's office. Mr. Wong said that the Human Relations Commission can help the cause by encouraging citizens and organizations to join the cause against Asian hate crimes.

Commissioners discussed the possibility of including Asian hate crimes as an educational element for the Town Hall series, possibly during May since it is Asian American Pacific Islander month.

Mayor Dave Ortega said that the City of Scottsdale will be celebrating its 70th anniversary in June. He suggested that the topic of Asian hate crimes be integrated into the month-long celebration.

3. Presentation, discussion and possible recommendation(s) to City Council regarding the anti-discrimination ordinance

Chair Shimokubo introduced Pete Palmer Chair of the Veterans Advisory Commission (VAC) and invited him to discuss the VAC's updated recommendation.

Mr. Palmer said that during the VAC's March meeting, they were presented with the idea of adding veterans to the anti-discrimination ordinance. At that time, they felt that if veterans were to be included, all areas of the military should be called out individually. They made a recommendation, but also asked for additional information regarding the purpose of the anti-discrimination ordinance. Upon further review, the VAC determined that there has not been any discrimination against veterans in Scottsdale. If in the future discrimination arises, the VAC will reconsider whether or not there is a need for veterans to be included in the ordinance.

Chair Shimokubo clarified at their April 7, 2021 meeting that the VAC made a formal recommendation not to include any military classes in the anti-discrimination ordinance. City Council will be presented with two options during their April 20, 2021 meeting, Option A, which has all the protected classes without U.S. military service and Option B, which includes all protected classes, plus U.S. military service.

VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN MOVED TO RECOMMEND ANTI-DISCRIMINATION ORDINANCE, OPTION A TO CITY COUNCIL. CHAIR SHIMOKUBO SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0) BY ROLL CALL VOTE. CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS DAY, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES. COMMISSIONER EANEMAN WAS NOT PRESENT.

4. Discussion and possible recommendations regarding dates, times, topics, and formats for future community Town Halls

Chair Shimokubo reviewed suggestions for the topics for discussion during the Wednesday, April 28, 2021 lunchtime virtual Town Hall. Modifications to the content, including Asian hate crimes, will be discussed with moderator Dr. Joel Martin during the preparation meeting scheduled for April 15th. The title will remain "Riots, Racism, and Reconciliation."

Commissioner Mendoza asked that Ms. Cini share the 21-Day Racial Equity Challenge with Commissioners.

Ms. Cini presented the graphics to be used in the marketing materials for remaining town hall sessions.

5. Presentation, discussion, and possible recommendation(s) regarding the Commission's Strategic Plan and 2021 activities and updates

- Marketing messaging – Update

Ms. Cini said that for the month of April, marketing efforts will focus on Western Week and the American Indian Festival, and on Celebrating Diversity Month. A draft narrative has been prepared on hate crimes and discrimination in support of the Asian American community. A short video about the Mayor's Committee on Employment of People with Disabilities and students receiving scholarships will be released on April 19th via the Office of Diversity Facebook page. Ms. Cini noted that thanks in part to Gila River Indian Community's gaming grant, \$10,000 in scholarships were given out this year. A news release regarding the ADO will be released following the City Council meeting.

Commissioner Rhoden suggested including Earth Day in the marketing. Ms. Cini said that she will find out what the City is planning for Earth Day.

- Enhanced Commissioner Involvement – Update

Vice-Chair Hinchman said that Melissa from the Scottsdale Independent is interested in writing a feature article on the Human Relations Commission for publication in the next few weeks. Commissioners agreed to release their contact information to the reporter.

- Identify important trends in Scottsdale – Update

Commissioner Mendoza reviewed the National Community Survey 2020 trends. She said that based on the fact that diversity and inclusion was identified as the least important factor, she and Commissioner Day dug deeper into the data and the demographics of respondents. Based

on findings, they made an action plan to conduct focus groups among the various demographics with the objective of determining the underlying reasons for significant variations and help determine improvements for future survey questions. Feedback from focus groups can be used for policy amendments and implementation of programs and strategies.

Commissioners were given an opportunity to make comments. Commissioner Rhoden suggested identifying citizens who have not responded to the survey and separate respondents by ethnicity or social class as opposed to race. Ms. Cini will report next month on the budgetary requirements associated with conducting focus groups.

- City relationships – Update and possible recommendation for support for the draft Economic Development strategic plan

Chair Shimokubo said that on March 23, 2021, they held a meeting with Experience Scottsdale about their diversity group. Dialogue between the HRC and Experience Scottsdale regarding diversity issues will be ongoing.

Chair Shimokubo said that on March 22, 2021, she, Commissioner Eaneman and Ms. Cini met with Scottsdale Economic Development Office about the Economic Development strategic plan, which includes diversity and inclusion throughout the document. She asked that the Commission consider making a formal recommendation supporting the plan.

Rob Millar gave a short presentation on the proposed Scottsdale Economic Development strategic plan, which is scheduled to go before City Council on April 20, 2021. He said that he looks forward to working with the HRC once discussions begin with the business community and talking about initiatives.

CHAIR SHIMOKUBO MOVED TO AUTHORIZE THE CHAIR TO SEND A LETTER TO CITY COUNCIL SUPPORTING THE DRAFT ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT STRATEGIC PLAN. COMMISSIONER RHODEN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0) BY ROLL CALL VOTE. CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS DAY, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES. COMMISSIONER EANEMAN WAS NOT PRESENT.

6. Updates, discussion and possible recommendation(s) to staff regarding recent and upcoming diversity and inclusion related activities and incidents impacting the city of Scottsdale

- Regional Unity Walk 2021 – Discuss potential planning; request input from HRC

Ms. Cini said that discussions are underway regarding the 2022 Regional Unity Walk and Festival and whether to plan for an in-person event or a virtual event. She noted that the in-person event costs approximately \$14,000 and the virtual event was approximately \$500. Consideration is being given to having cities other than Tempe host the event, which could mean holding the event in a different city each year or another city, such as Scottsdale, taking over the full responsibility.

Commissioners discussed the benefit of Scottsdale hosting the event and showcasing Scottsdale.

- Scottsdale Leadership's Inclusion Initiatives Day – April 9, 2021

Ms. Cini said that on April 9 she spoke at the Scottsdale Leadership Inclusion Initiatives Day, which is an event dedicated to enhancing awareness and knowledge and thinking about different aspects of diversity. Her presentation included a review of what the Office of Diversity does, the Human Relations Commission's efforts, and the National Community Survey trends.

7. Identification of Future Agenda Items

Commissioners discussed the option for holding future meetings in a hybrid format. Participants would have the option of attending in person or through the Zoom format.

COMMISSIONER RHODEN MOVED TO SCHEDULE THE MAY 10, 2021 MEETING AS A HYBRID MEETING. VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS DAY, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES. COMMISSIONER EANEMAN WAS NOT PRESENT.

Adjournment

CHAIR SHIMOKUBO MOVED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING. THERE WAS NO SECOND GIVEN TO THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS DAY, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES. COMMISSIONER EANEMAN WAS NOT PRESENT.

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved and seconded, the meeting adjourned at 6:56 p.m.

Recorded and Transcribed by eScribers, LLC.