
This document was created from the closed caption transcript of the December 3, 2019 City Council Regular Meeting and has not been checked for completeness or accuracy of content.

A copy of the agenda for this meeting, including a summary of the action taken on each agenda item, is available online at:

<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/Assets/ScottsdaleAZ/Council/current-agendas-minutes/2019-agendas/12-03-19-regular-agenda.pdf>

An unedited digital video recording of the meeting, which can be used in conjunction with the transcript, is available online at:

<http://www.Scottsdaleaz.gov/Scottsdale-video-network/Council-video-archives/2019-archives>

For ease of reference, included throughout the transcript are bracketed "time stamps" [Time: 00:00:00] that correspond to digital video recording time.

For more information about this transcript, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 480-312-2411.

CALL TO ORDER

[Time: 00:00:03]

Mayor Lane: Good afternoon everyone. Nice to have you here with us. I would like to call our December 3, 2019, City Council Meeting. It is a regular meeting.

ROLL CALL

[Time: 00:00:14]

Mayor Lane: Let's start with the roll call, please.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Mayor Jim Lane.

Mayor Lane: Present.

Carolyn Jagger: Vice Mayor Kathy Littlefield.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Present.

Carolyn Jagger: Councilmembers Suzanne Klapp.

Councilwoman Klapp: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: Virginia Korte.

Councilmember Korte: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: Linda Milhaven.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: Guy Phillips.

Councilman Phillips: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: And Solange Whitehead.

Councilwoman Whitehead: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: City Manager Jim Thompson.

Jim Thompson: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: City Attorney Sherry Scott.

Sherry Scott: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: City Treasurer Jeff Nichols.

Jeff Nichols: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: City Auditor Sharron Walker.

Sharon Walker: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: And the clerk is present.

[Time: 00:00:45]

Mayor Lane: Thank you and I have a couple of items of business that I would like to share with you. We have a white card that the Clerk is holding up here over my right. If you have need or would like to have the cards to speak on the subject, she can give you that and take care of you there. The yellow cards, which is she now holding up over her head are request for written comment on any of the agenda items. The speaker cards are in the process of Public Comment or agenda items. We have police officers and Ned from the Scottsdale Fire Department is here to assist you. I think that we have our fire department personnel directly in front of me. There are restrooms on the south side of the Kiva here on my left. If you have difficulty hearing our meeting, we have headsets available and you can check with the Clerks and they can assist you with that.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

[Time: 00:02:02]

Mayor Lane: Starting off our meeting, we are going to start off with the Pledge of Allegiance and the Scottsdale Police Cadets are here to lead us. If you could please rise.

Scottsdale Police Cadets: I pledge allegiance to the Flag of the United States of America, and to the Republic for which it stands, one Nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and justice for all.

Mayor Lane: Thank you. If you would like, please introduce yourselves and tell us what made you interested in the police cadets.

Scottsdale Police Cadets: My name is Sarah and I joined the cadets to see what options the police force had to offer. My name is Fatima. I'm a junior. The reason why I joined the cadets was to get a better understanding of what law enforcement brings. Hi, my name is Jenny. I'm a sophomore at Paradise Community College. My name is Justin and I joined to learn more about the community and get involved with law enforcement. I joined the program to volunteer more within my community. My name is Chris. I'm a freshman at Park University in Gilbert. I joined the program to learn what it is like to be a police officer and help me pursue my career as a police officer. I would like to thank the City Council for having us out here today and leading you guys in the pledge. Thank you.

Mayor Lane: All right, thank you.

INVOCATION

[Time: 00:04:32]

Mayor Lane: For our invocation this evening, we have Reverend Cathy Patterson from the Fountain of Life Church. Nice to see you.

Pastor Cathy Patterson: Let us bow our heads. Dear Father God, we come this evening in the afterglow of the Thanksgiving season. Grateful for having the opportunity to live in this wonderful community. Grateful to have a Mayor and members of the City Council who give readily of their gifts to better this community. We ask now, as we consider the items that are before the Council tonight, that we come together, debate vigorously, but leave united. This is our prayer this evening. Amen.

Mayor Lane: Amen. Thank you, Pastor. I have no presentations.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Mayor Lane: Tonight's meeting, we do have, and we have no Public Comment, but this would be time for Public Comment as reserved for citizen comments regarding non-agendized items with no official action take on these items. Since we have no cards right now, there is no further need for announcement on that. There is another opportunity at the end of the meeting if requested.

ITEM 1 – GENTRY ON THE GREEN GENERAL PLAN AMENDMENT AND REZONING (3-GP-2019 AND 11-ZN-2019)

[Time: 00:06:07]

Mayor Lane: We have one agenda item and it is the Gentry on the Green General Plan Amendment and rezoning. 3GP-2019 and 11-ZN-2019. Adam Yaron is our presenter.

[Time: 00:06:34]

Project Coordination Liaison Adam Yaron: Good evening, Council. I will be presenting on the Gentry on the Green General Plan Amendment and Rezoning. Tonight's presentation is going to include the major General Plan amendment criteria and process. The 2019 major amendment request, the zoning district map amendment request, and the major General Plan amendment and zoning timeline. The context aerial here presents the subject site located at the southwest corner of North Hayden Road and East Camelback Road. It's bound on its east property line the Greenbelt, and the west property line of Parkway Avenue and the southern boundary being the Glenrosa alignment. Here is a more detailed context aerial. The major amendment criteria for Scottsdale, an amendment to Scottsdale's General Plan is defined as a major amendment if it meets any of the one following three criteria. One, a change in land use category; two, area of change; three, character area criteria; and four, the water/wastewater infrastructure criteria.

This year's amendment is triggered by the change in land use category. The applicant's requesting the change from urban neighborhoods Group C to Group E which notates the mixed-use land use designation. So where it's indicated on our land use matrix yes is why we have this as a major General Plan Amendment. Additionally there's the area of change criteria given the site's location and any amendment requesting a change in land use designation greater than ten acres or more is defined as a major amendment. So, the major amendment process and it was heard at City Council in the same year as it was submitted. The applicant's subject site is 41.5 acres in size. So the major amendment process, it's heard at City Council the same year as it was submitted. The submittal deadline for this year's amendment was May 17th and it is to be heard at this tonight's City Council hearing on December 3rd. It requires an additional remote hearing of the Planning Commission for public input as well as requires a 2/3 majority vote of City Council.

This shows the subject site. The applicant's request being the existing General Plan land use designation of urban neighborhoods on the left side of the screen before you and the applicant's request to amend the land use designation to mixed-use neighborhoods shown on the right. The applicant proposes as a means to implement the requested change in land use designation, a multiphase mixed-use development comprising of both residential and non-residential uses. In phase one the applicant is proposing roughly 1200 units as part of their phase one development with supporting retail and non-residential uses. That concludes staff's long-range planning overview and Bryan will be here to present the zoning application.

Mayor Lane: Thank you.

[Time: 00:09:51]

Senior Planner Bryan Cluff: Good evening, Mayor Lane and members of the Council. I'm going to be giving an overview of the General Plan zoning request, which consists of a zoning request and amendment of the General Plan containing 156,000 square feet of commercial area on the 4½-acre site. There is specific criteria that the Council uses to evaluate the request. This criteria is detailed specifically in your reports tonight. Briefly, it is geared towards revitalization complying with the goals and policies of our General Plan area plans and when the densities and uses are not permitted under the current district and it also looks at adjacent properties and structure needs. It requires frontage on a major, minor arterial collector.

This is the map over our R-5 District and the surrounding districts are the R-5 District with exception to the east. This is the proposed zoning map showing the zoning district with our overlay district, as well. It is a mixed-use development on the 41½ acres phase one totally 26½ acres and just under 15 acres. The ratio that is allowed is a .8 ratio and being proposed as a .7. Density is capped per the proposed development plan. In this case, 45 dwelling units as proposed. The parking required for the phase one portion of the development is 1,059 spaces and the applicant is providing 2,355 spaces, plus the additional parking spaces on 78th Street.

This is the proposed open space plan. It identifies the open space areas more specifically within Phase 1, which is to the east of 78th Street. This plan shows a minimum of 26% of the site area to be dedicated to open space of the site area and a minimum of 30% of open space provided. A couple other things to note and the large open space plan and in this line of the development here and provides connection to the Indian bend wash area and the bike pavilion is going to be located in this area here. It is provided an eight foot detach from the street and it is provided in the structured parking in these areas here, which are above grade structures, which will be surrounded by the proposed apartment buildings. There is an additional surface lot which is intended for guest parking for any of the guest services that are within the establishment. This building here is a building height plan and you can see on the Phase 1 side, the taller portions of the building at 48-feet are identified with the light blue color. And the portion along Camelback and 78th Street and 78-feet shown in the purple. And phase two is approximately 15 acres of the total 41½ acre development on the west side of 78th Street.

[Time: 00:14:30]

This phase of the development is likely to be ten or more years out in the future and accommodation of 150,000 square feet of non-residential space. The same development standards that apply to Phase 1, which include building height, setbacks, step backs and land uses are also applicable to Phase 2, which will create the framework with which Phase 2 will develop in the future. There are some standards that are being requested to be amended along with the application. There are four requested amended standards. The first one is a development area and the applicant is requesting to amend to 41½ acres to accommodate the proposed development. And the next has to do with the building setbacks on Camelback and 78th Street. This is the proposed request for setback amendment and the first proposed is Camelback requesting from 34-feet to 30-feet to accommodate a small portion of the site near a deceleration lane and a bus bay. On 78th Street, the request from 25-feet down to ten-feet on 78th Street to accommodate reconfiguration and additional on-street parking on that side of 78th Street.

To look at closer, this is the 78th Street amendment they are requesting. The portion is shown here, and it identifies the angled parking spaces and the proposed 8-foot-wide sidewalk and the building location. This is the tightest point here that would be down to ten-feet. And the next section, shows another condition where the building is setback 19-feet. There are a couple of pinch points along 78th Street and the building comes in and out and the setback is substantially longer than ten-feet. This area here that is identified with the black line is the portion of the site that accommodates the deceleration and bus bay here because the bus bay is setback from curb.

The summary of public outreach as the case is moving forward. On April 8th and 9th, the meeting was on the 12th. The City notifications went out in newspapers and ads. We have received substantial Public Comment and both in support and opposition. I believe they have been left on the dais for you. There is a schedule moving through the process and this is highlighting the hearings that were conducted moving forward that Adam briefly mentioned that brings us to tonight for City Council action. That concludes staff's presentation and I would be happy to answer any questions and the applicant is also here.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Bryan. I think that we may get back to you with questions for staff, but we will go ahead with the applicant's presentation.

[Time: 00:18:45]

Applicant Representative John Berry: Mayor and members of the Council, before I start, I wanted to say it was nice to see Cathy Patterson. I served on the board of Scottsdale Arts with Cathy and it was nice to see her back in the Kiva. As Reverend Patterson noted, we just celebrated Thanksgiving and in Scottsdale we have much to be thankful for. One of the things that we are very thankful for is the Indian Bend Wash. And let's also be thankful for the leadership that brought us Indian Bend Wash. It's the result of strong leadership by Councilmember Billie Gentry and Councilmember Bill Walton that we have the Indian Bend Wash. This is why we celebrate Bill Walton and Billie Gentry with the name of our project Gentry on the Green and the Walton Bicycle Pavilion. The left here is what the feds proposed which was 170-foot wide, 23-foot deep pride of the core which they built in Los Angeles at the time. Billie and Bill stepped up and led the effort with the City of Scottsdale to create the Indian Bend Wash. Their leadership in creating this resulted in a massive reinvestment in transformation in the areas around the Indian Bend Wash and our site was no exception.

Forty-seven years ago, this is our site, Hayden Road is off to the right. This is our site, both at this location and this location. You can barely see the Scottsdale Shadow apartments at 7 stories over there. forty-seven years ago, this was the height of luxury living along the Indian Bend Wash. Today, this is neither a point of pride for residents, or a selfie spot for visitors who are going along the Indian Bend Wash. Forty-seven years later, we can do better. We are here tonight because we think that we are doing much better. With Gentry on the Green, we celebrate and embrace the Indian Bend Wash. This is a project that has more open space than required. 10% is required. We are doing 36% of open space. Of that open space, 33% of the site is public open space. Open to the public. It is not just about the amount of open space; it is about the quality of open space.

We have the Paseo and it is 250-foot wide and its length is anywhere from 700-feet to the end of our property if you include the Indian Bend Wash, it is up to 900-feet into Hayden Road. That Paseo as we

call it will be adorned with a voluntary contribution from Public Art, and speaking of Public Art, a voluntary contribution of Public Art not required of almost \$1.3 million in that publicly accessible Paseo. It is going to be by the Walton Bicycle Pavilion. This will be the gateway to the Indian Bend Wash. This is going to be the gateway. It is a place that will be visible from Hayden and something that people will talk about in terms of architecture. It's a place for people to rent bikes. It will be a major boom for bicycle tourism. This is the selfie spot along the Indian Bend Wash.

Forty-seven years later, what else are we doing differently with this project? Let's take a look at some of the edges. Our visitors and residents are going to experience Gentry on the Green along Camelback Road or the Indian Bend Wash. So what are they going to experience compared with what's there today. There is 31% open space along Camelback Road. Our open space will have 43% open space. That's a 39% increase in open space, but it is not just about the percentage or the amount, it is about the quality of that open space. Back in the 70s, this is walled off and this open space is interior for the benefit of the residents.

What are we doing today, 47 years later? Smart growth and along Camelback Road, there are no walls. Every one of these ground units on the ground floor opens up to the area. It is not walled off. There are going to be no 4-story units along Camelback Road. What about our southern edge? We have folks and residences to the south of the property. This is the current condition, a 70-foot setback from the building to their property line. What will ours be? 135-feet, almost doubling that setback. What about the all-important Indian Bend Wash? Currently, behind that gorgeous wall that you saw with the pallet for graffiti that has been painted over, there's 36% open space. What are we proposing? I want you to understand this. 71% open space on our property, that doesn't include the open space that the City owns on Indian Bend Wash which we will be re-landscaping and be responsible for irrigating and maintaining. So this becomes part of that open space not included in our percentages. The quality of the open space is going to be amazing with views of the Paseo 900 feet away with Public Art and with the Walton pavilion and all of these units again, no walls that open up to that open space.

[Time: 00:24:49]

Now, Mayor and members of the Council, in conclusion, we know change is difficult. When the Indian Bend Wash was built, that was a significant change. In fact, the property that we are talking about today used to be a series of small family farms. That was a major change for the community back in the day. Gentry on the Green is also a change. We are asking for an additional level of height above the height already approved on the current property and yes, we are asking for more residential on the property. And the question for you, as in all of these cases, is do the public benefits justify the requested change? That's a decision for you.

Let me run through some of these community benefits. Bicycle tourism, an untapped source of bed tax and sales tax for our community. We have talked to Experience Scottsdale and they are pleased with this new emphasis on public tourism. Providing connections throughout our community. People who are pedestrians and bicyclists, including a very important connection between Old Town and the Indian Bend Wash. Revitalization of this area. In Phase 1 alone, a \$375 million investment, leveraging our already taxpayer investment in the Indian Bend Wash. I noted that we are going to beautify and improve the Indian Bend Wash. We have a resident relocation plan that is going to be the first in the City of Scottsdale. You have no requirement for the relocation for the residents of Scottsdale. We have

put together a relocation plan that is unmatched in the city's history. It will be greater than any effort at any time in the city, and we are very, very proud of that effort.

In terms of Public Art. Voluntary Public Art of over \$1.27 million. Parking, we are substantially over parked. Project open space, 10% required, 36% provided. Public open space, is it behind a wall for the benefit of the residents that live there? No. The public open space is 0% required and 33%. In terms of sustainability, the tops of the parking garages are going to be covered in solar, over 2 acres of solar. Over 50% of our sidewalks will be shaded and new city revenue on an annual basis of \$1,800,00.

Your DRB and Planning Commission unanimously recommended to you support for this project. My first project was the Mayo Clinic in 1984 and it was controversial. And there was lots of opposition believe it or not to put in the Mayo Clinic, and on the Council at that time, serving her last term was Billie Gentry, and I had the privilege of working with Billie. And it really is fulfilling for me to be able to honor her contribution to the community in so many ways by calling this "Gentry on the Green." I would like to think if she were still alive and here today, with that earnest look, she would look you in the eye and after seeing this list of community benefits, she would say to us, well done. Carry on. I'm happy to answer any questions. Thank you.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Mr. Berry. We do have some requests from comments from the audience here. So, we may be back to you if there is any follow up to any of that and certainly, any questions from the Council. I will start with Bill Crawford and following him will be Carole Cohen.

[Time: 00:29:03]

Bill Crawford: Greetings, Mayor and Council. My name is Bill Crawford. As you know, I live in Downtown Scottsdale and have a business in Downtown Scottsdale. Going on 22 years. I looked at this project and thought this couldn't possibly have any opposition at all and then, I wondered why it wasn't on the Consent Agenda? Taking on two tired apartment complexes that are not going to get any better over time. They are going to get worse. We know what happens when apartment complexes start to degrade, and you can't get the rent that everybody else is getting and the domino effect is not good.

We have a developer here that is going to bring the two aging properties together and bring Indian Bend Wash well into the future. People will be using this and enjoying the benefits of this after we're long gone. And one of the trends nationally is walkable, solar-powered transportation. This community is the poster child for that. It is the future. Taking this Indian Bend Wash that is uninviting and opening up the space and putting retail and a bike pavilion and one of the many amenities that is going to be enjoyed is exactly what we are hoping for tourism and for Scottsdale in the future. The tourists are coming to Scottsdale for many different reasons and they are coming for a totally different experience. Enjoying bikes and the pathway is huge. It is going to embellish this amenity that we have citywide and you are going to see a spike in bike tourism because of it.

I would like to thank the developer for putting this project together and I would like to thank the staff for working with the developer and making this a cohesive win-win for both the City and the community, which you don't often see especially with a cherished Indian Bend Wash. And I would like to thank the Council. It seems like the last few times that we have had projects come before you, this Council has done the right thing. You are looking at the future and not looking down to the ground for

our immediate needs, you are looking forward to the future and I applaud you for doing that. It is awesome. Thank you for your time.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Mr. Crawford. Carole Cohen. Followed by Alex McLaren.

[Time: 00:32:18]

Carole Cohen: Good evening, Council and all attendees. I hadn't really planned on being here. It appears that I might be the only one living at Scottsdale Shadows who has an interest in this project. I'm from Chicago. I have lived through Mayor Daleys and the rest of the Mayors there. I applaud builders. I came from that. In the past 15 years in Scottsdale all I have seen is development, although at a much slower pace. Lots of us personally and developers lost a lot of money in 2008. I'm glad that all the parcels that have sat here so long are being developed by those who stashed tons of money and are able to do this.

However, I'm glad this man who has had the Gentry property and the covenant whatever it's called down the street and the restaurateur from Chicago that has already torn up Camelback and the dental office or law office and next to the W. That's four working projects on Camelback and it is sickening. I talked to the people who represent this project when they came to our Scottsdale Shadows. The access and the egress for this project are disgusting. We only have one access and egress for the 834 units. And then, consider what you've got with the entertainment district. I just sat on a trial for disorderly conduct and drunkenness in your courts. A girl pulled down her pants and peed in the bushes in the entertainment district and they let that girl go. And another girl, working at one of the hotels coming west on Camelback and didn't cause an accident, but this first girl did to cause another disorderly conduct.

I'm concerned that the laws and ordinances are going to change to allow more liquor down Camelback eastward. I don't see the buildings across the street of me. I hate to say what this man said, yes, they are declining, but the owner keeps them up. They on some days happen to look better than where I live. I feel terrible for having to tear that down and displace all of the people. Another concern that I have was that it was stated that this was going to be done in ten phases. I know in Chicago you have to have a lot of money to back ten phases. I don't know what kind of money this property owner has, but a 10-year phase can go down and under and we are going to be sitting with dead-end property there.....

Mayor Lane: Your time is expired.

Carole Cohen: Sorry, is there any way after this I can speak?

Mayor Lane: No.

Carole Cohen: Solange, I hope you're listening to this. I know you are the only one that is against a lot of this development. Maybe it's time to look at it seriously.

Mayor Lane: Thank you. Alex McLaren followed by Crystal Wehby.

[Time: 00:36:10]

Alex McLaren: Good evening, members of the Council. I'm here to support the General Plan Amendment and the Zoning. I think it is a good revitalization of the area in conformance of the Scottsdale character plan. It includes commercial, which is on the ground floor of the building. I think there are four buildings in Phase 1. And the buildings surround the parking structure, I think is a good idea because it hides the parking structures. And having the commercial on the ground floor I think is highly advantageous. I think that the major advantage for me and a lot of people is going to be the Indian Bend Wash connection. I live a mile away from the project. I use the Indian Bend Wash trail a lot. And going by there and having the opportunity to stop at the pavilion will be really advantageous.

And also, I think that the exhibits which showed the open space and how it is going to be open to the Indian Bend Wash and Camelback Road are also significant. Also, the Public Art that is going to be restored in the Paseo and it runs into the project and connects to the Indian Bend Wash Pavilion. There is also two areas north and south of the pavilion, which are going to be very pleasant for people who are on the bike path. I looked at the economic impact study that was part of the package prepared by Mr. Pollack and there is an initial construction impact benefit to the City and also, the benefits that will arise from the sales tax that is generated by the project, as well. Also, I'd like to comment that this is a paean to Billie Gentry and Bill Walton as the leaders of developing the Indian Bend Wash. So, I strongly support the project. Thank you.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Mr. McLaren. Crystal Wehby.

[Time: 00:38:55]

Crystal Wehby: Hi, my name is Crystal Wehby. I'm the owner of the Bike Emporium. I'm impressed with a private entity that's willing to forego building more apartment buildings in lieu of a public bike pavilion. Something that has access to residents, the public, visitors. In my facility alone I rent out so many bikes, especially now in this season. I'm constantly asked if there is any shade, is there a safe place or anything for us to do? This will provide this for them as well as what's on the Greenbelt now. Sometimes people want to stop, this is going to have maps in the pavilion area. It is such a benefit; I can't express it. In the last month alone, I have collected over 75 signatures in full support of this. I barely start telling them what it is, and they are like, yes, yes, we love the idea. Again, full support. Thank you, very much.

Mayor Lane: Thank you. Next is Giovanni Mangone.

[Time: 00:40:28]

Giovanni Mangone: I'm from Phoenix. Major and Councilmembers, thank you.

Mayor Lane: If you could please, talk into the microphone.

Giovanni Mangone: I was going to talk about what I have talked about in the past with the benefit of the Greenbelt having this facility in its central point as opposed to the anchor ends that it has now. There is amenities to the north and when you get to Tempe and nothing in the middle. That has been covered ad nauseam and we have all seen the benefit of that. Another benefit they are talking about is the open space along the Paseo and the artwork that we are going to see and the revitalization visually,

as well as the environment they will create.

I hear opposition to the project as it's going to catalyze some of the debauchery that you get along Old Town, but I fail to see how a project of this prominence is going to do something like that. These are going to be very nice units, they're probably going to be spendy to rent there. I don't see how someone who is going to want to live in a place like that is going to tolerate that. Especially, when the grounds they are on are so open and available and nice. I can't see this as being a black eye for Scottsdale. I see it as an asset along the Green Belt, which is obvious to all of us. In addition, a vibrant space to live in. Something to bolster the image of Scottsdale, which is already very good. Thank you.

Mayor Lane: Thank you. Doris Redlin.

[Time: 00:42:34]

Doris Redlin: City Council and staff, I'm privileged to be here tonight to say that I really like living at the Visconti apartments. I've lived there since May of 2013. It's a very safe place to live. No, it is not trash, the apartment management, Gray Star takes great measurements to keep the apartments and property in good shape. I don't see that deteriorating. If you want to develop something, why don't you do it on Heatherbrae or Glenrosa. That's really an eyesore there, I think you could do something there. In Scottsdale we have a lot of apartments already. I know down on McDowell and Thomas there has been a lot of construction. This is going to add a lot of traffic to the area. We already have kind of a bicycle depot on Osborn and Thomas. My husband and I ride down the Greenbelt pathway and we really enjoy it. We have full access because we walk around the property. There is already quite a wash connection. There's parks. There's lakes along the Greenbelt pathway, which is public space.

I have a real problem with making a residential community public. A residential community, it seems to me should be separate from public space and we are integrating everything. I wouldn't pay megabucks to continue to live there if it is going to be public with all of the public people coming in there and the traffic. I think this project could be scaled down into public and keep a residential community residential and safe. And I like the safety of the Visconti. I would like to see this redone and do something on Heatherbrae Avenue and Glenrosa, a real eyesore there. Any eyesore, it's right there on Heatherbrae and Glenrosa. Thank you for your consideration.

Mayor Lane: Thank you Ms. Redlin. Tracy Lendyok.

[Time: 00:45:13]

Tracy Lendyok: You said my name right, thank you. I live at Visconti and I have lived there 17 years, and this is the third meeting that I have come to and I don't want to be homeless. I like where I live. I have lived there for a long time. There's people, Dorothy has lived there for 35 years, Nina has lived there for 25 years, Sheila has lived there for 20 plus years, and it is not an eyesore or disgusting place, but thank you for calling my home that, Mr. Berry. Yeah, he's smiling about it. It's people's homes, there's over 1500 apartments and over 2000 people's lives probably more that are going to be affected by this. There is no relocation plan. I was called into the office. I was told after the first meeting, the owners told me, you are going to be sad because you are going to be homeless. How would you react to that?

I walk the sidewalks constantly and I get run over by bicyclists who never utilize over 25 miles of bicycle lanes already. And what is going to happen when Mother Nature unleashes in the Indian Bend Wash and rolls all down south. The water has not receded from last week's rain. They never mentioned what they are going to do. They just have a picture of green grass. I don't want to sound angry or bitter. I love Scottsdale. I want to live here, and die here. There's so much retail that sits empty at the Fashion Square and Old Town. I walked there are spaces closed up. Why do you keep putting more and more until what you have is filled up? I don't understand it. Why destroy three apartment communities that have just been redone to the tune of \$3 million and the pool has been redone and they are going get almost \$3,000 for the apartments they are charging there. I just hope you don't vote for it because I don't want to be homeless. Thank you.

Mayor Lane: Thank you. Next is Trudy Hays.

[Time: 00:47:55]

Trudy Hays: I live at 7531 East Kalil Circle in Scottsdale. I'm here to talk about and speak in support of Gentry on the Green. I grew up in Scottsdale. I've lived in Scottsdale almost my entire life. I have been involved in the art world in Scottsdale for over 30 years. First, as a gallery director and I'm very proud to serve as Executive Director of Scottsdale Artists School. We have been located in Old Town, Scottsdale and have been there for almost 40 years. Scottsdale Artist School is dedicated to the enrichment of the entire community. We are working hard to do our part to support arts in Scottsdale.

It is extremely rare that a developer chooses voluntarily to set aside \$1.3 million for Public Art as ColRich is doing for Gentry on the Green. This is going to bolster Scottsdale's reputation as an internationally known arts destination. A very high percentage of our students and instructors are from out-of-state. We are going to be able to guide them to Gentry on the Green as a place to visit. Along with the other artworks on the Paseo, our visitors can attend exhibits and take art classes and it would be a beautiful space for painters along the Indian Bend Wash along Hayden. So, the possibilities are really exciting. I would hope that Gentry on the Green will create a new arts anchor and pathway leading to downtown. So, I would encourage you to please vote in support of Gentry on the Green and the historical role of the arts in Scottsdale. Thank you.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Ms. Hays. Next is Gabrielle Klobucar.

[Time: 00:50:44]

Gabrielle Klobucar: Good evening. My name is Gabby Klobucar and I live at 1301 North Scottsdale Road. You may have received a number of support letters regarding the Gentry on the Green project. I have them here today. There are 160 plus letters in support of this issue. I'm submitting those tonight for the record. As a proud South Scottsdale resident that lives near the Indian Bend Wash, I would like to express my support for the project. I'm excited for the energy that it will bring to the area. It is dedicated to creating inviting open space that can be used for community events, relaxation, picnics and events for all Scottsdalians to enjoy. As a young professional, I support events that reinvigorate the area that makes it enjoyable for all ages and I look forward to it being in my neighborhood. Thank you very much.

Mayor Lane: Thank you. Next is Mary Turner.

[Time: 00:52:16]

Mary Turner: Thank you, Mayor and members of the Council. My name is Mary Turner and you have received a number of letters in support of Gentry on the Green and one of them being the director of [Indiscernible] and one from Scottsdale Shadows and wasn't able to be here tonight but wanted his letter to be read into the record. Gentry on the Green is one of those projects. Living across the street in Scottsdale Shadows and having seen the architectural renderings, the development will contribute to the area. One of the amenities living in Scottsdale Shadows is our golf course. The Gentry on the Green will widen the landscape. It will utilize and re-energize the area. Providing public spaces and it is not only available for Gentry on the Green residents, but those in the area. It is going to be completed in phases, which usually means less disruption for the neighbors overall. Egress and ingress into Scottsdale Shadows daily as do many daily. Gentry on the Green will be a wonderful addition to the Scottsdale area. Thank you very much.

Mayor Lane: Thank you. Next is Jason Alexander.

[Time: 00:54:11]

Jason Alexander: Jason Alexander, 9976 East Jasmine Drive. I live biking. I have rode the Greenbelt end to end dozens of times. Going from WestWorld all the way down to Tempe and the Greenbelt is the core of all of that. The Greenbelt is like the greatest hits going through Scottsdale. Practically every mile there is something interesting and something cool to look at. This is going to add to that excitement. Not just for the Paseo, but the entire landscaping that it is going to provide is going to replace an area where, as the pictures show is not that exciting. You are going to have this retail element bringing activity and interest to the Greenbelt. I love what the bike emporium folks have proposed, and it is going to add an element of commerce and retail to the Greenbelt and add to our tourism experience. There are other things to like about this project other than my narrow aspect on biking. Cars are cool in the suburbs and walkability is great when it is dense. When the two conflict is obviously, where we have problems. I love this idea of moving towards a less car centric lifestyle.

Most folks in Scottsdale say that you can't live in a two-adult family without a car. That's a car bias in our car driven city. You can absolutely get through our City if you are into biking. There are several grocery stores within a mile of this location. You can do your shopping, go to your dentist without a car. This is one of the best that I have ever seen in my short experience and one that others have said they have ever seen. When voicing opposition to this months ago speaks highly to how thorough they have approached this situation. It is always unfortunate when residents are going to be disrupted, but they have provided a relocation package to make it as less disruptable. Thank you.

Mayor Lane: Thank you. I believe it is Andrea Forman.

[Time: 00:57:25]

Andrea Forman: My name is Andrea Forman and I'm a property owner. I was part of the design team that created the artwork along the Pima Highway in North Scottsdale. A large development such as

what is before you today. The Greenbelt has always been popular with our residents and this project allows them to double down on their enjoyment and linger for a while, especially, in the summer months. Its location is great to downtown to the west and the baseball to the south and the great outdoors to the north. And along the way in all directions are the City's art projects. Placed along the Greenbelt, this project is beautifully situated to add to that. And I have to say this is a good location for that kind of innovative project. I urge you to support it.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Ms. Foreman. That concludes the public testimony. I invite Mr. Berry to come back and respond to the items if he needs to.

[Time: 00:59:02]

John Berry: Thank you. I think that the reason that you don't see more people here from Scottsdale Shadows, which is a very well-organized group is because we have held numerous meetings and you have a letter of support for the project. We have worked very closely with the residents of Scottsdale Shadows. I can assure Tracy that she will not be homeless for a long while and certainly, not because of us. I want to go through our relocation plan, and I think that it is important.

My partners here are from Southern California and this is not new for them and they have compassion. The community is familiar with some recent experiences in southern Scottsdale that involved the displacement of residents that lived in a trailer park and the community rallied around them to help with the private sector. And again, I have to stress, this will be 10 to 15 years away most likely before there is a need for that type of relocation. Let me go through our relocation plan and I'm not aware of any plan like this that has ever been brought to the City Council. Maybe this is going to be, there are going to be quarterly updates to the tenants as to what is going on. There is going to be a minimum 1-year notice to the residents before the construction phases. Residents have priority selection of comparable units and the other residential projects that are available on-site.

As one phase is built, they have the opportunity to move to another comparable unit that is built at the time. They can move from phase to phase if they wish. Negotiated discounts. They are going to provide staff assistance and coordination for day of moving and moving extensions for long-term properties for residents that show need. They are going to provide those moving extensions and the properties in the area of this 40 acres that we are talking about and they can move to other properties owned by ColRich and assist with the moving and get them in comparable units. I can note that these comparable units have comparable units of what exists today. This has never been done in the City of Scottsdale. This is provided to bring certainty and peace of mind to folks who are living in that community. Mayor and members of the Council, I'm happy to answer any additional questions. Thank you.

Mayor Lane: Yes, we have additional questions. I'm going to start with Vice Mayor Littlefield.

[Time: 01:02:49]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: As you know, I'm happy with this project. I think that it is an excellent location for the City of Scottsdale. And I did have some questions and one you just answered and what the relocation plan was going to be because I wouldn't want to displace 2,000 homes and put those people

out on the street. It would be unacceptable. Who is maintaining this open space? Is it an HOA or maintenance company that you are going to hire? Who is going to be maintaining it?

John Berry: It is going to be a maintenance management company that is responsible for the maintenance of all of the open space. I would note that we are responsible for all of the maintenance of the City owned property along Indian Bend Wash. If you drive by and see the property that is owned and maintained by Scottsdale Shadows versus the property that is owned and maintained by us is noticeable. Again, that's on our dime and you are going to see it in the stipulations. It is very specifically called out.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: All right. Thank you, very much. Also, one of the speakers noted there is only one access point, entry and exit. Is that okay with the police and fire for this many people and large of space?

John Berry: The short answer is yes. We wouldn't have gotten to any hearing, review board or Planning Commission to be before you without being properly vetted for the safety concerns. And when we get into the development phase, they are going to have to go through the review process and it is going to be reviewed again. The City of Scottsdale is known for their strength in their reviews of ensuring public safety and life safety systems. So, yes.

>>[Time: 01:05:06]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: And finally, I wanted to ask you, what is your price target for these apartments and condos on a monthly basis? If I wanted to go rent a one bedroom apartment, how much would I be paying per month?

John Berry: Would you give me just a moment?

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Yeah.

John Berry: I'm assuming there will be two of you in the apartment?

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Sure, I'll bring him along.

John Berry: My client has informed me it is approximately 1,500 to \$1,800 a month for a one bedroom unit. We would be happy to put you on the list if that's something that you are interested in?

Vice Mayor Littlefield: My question is if you will allow pets?

John Berry: I see a wagging of the tail and the answer to that is yes.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Thank you very much.

Mayor Lane: Councilmember Korte.

[Time: 01:06:43]

Councilmember Korte: Thank you, Mayor. I'm confused on how many phases. Is it phase one, phase ten? Help me understand this.

John Berry: Councilmember Korte, there will be two overall phases, which staff presented to you. So, there will be two phases as identified in your staff report. We anticipate that the first phase is going to take approximately 10 years to build out. If you can anticipate recession and pay rates, we would be happy to accept that.

Councilmember Korte: And I'm going to, and I'm assuming that your commitment to 30% open space pertains to both phases?

John Berry: Mayor Lane, Councilmember Korte, the answer to that is yes. All of the heights, setbacks, minimum setbacks are in the open space. It is going to be a seamless transition on the open spacious and the setbacks and the very important esthetic elements for the community.

Councilmember Korte: Which speaks to that Paseo drive or that Paseo open space and the Public Art. Can you talk more about what that is about? And who is going to administer the public art? I assume that the \$1.3 million is going to be reinvested into the Paseo area, but could you talk about that more?

John Berry: Mayor Lane, Councilmember Korte, the answer is no. The reason why my answer is no is because I have no style at all, hence my outfit. I would say Betty can answer that better than I could.

[Time: 01:09:06]

Applicant Representative Betty Drake: I'm Betty Drake and I have lived at that same location for over 32 years now. I have been a resident and sat on the City Council like you, as well as the DR Board, and the Public Art board, and every other committee there is. I have been working on the public transportation and Public Art and everything that we can do to make cities special places. Everything from San Juan to Puerto Rico. I was really excited to work on this project because the ColRich folks really get it and what makes the City and a development really tick and fit in and be beneficial to the whole community. The open space in the Paseo is 160% bigger than that on Scottsdale Waterfront. It is going to be a whole series of experiences.

You know, this can truly become the gateway to the Greenbelt. It will be a trailhead at the end. A tourist destination, as people have said. It is going to be a place to splash and where adults can dip their toes in the water, in addition to kids doing so. There is a great opportunity for artist involvement in a lot of the water features that we are thinking about. And then, you get down to the end, the bike pavilion, the Walton Pavilion now, it is going to be our connection to the art. This is going to be a huge step to connecting old town to Indian Bend Wash.

There are going to be bike rentals and Experience Scottsdale is going to have a place there. There is going to be art of course and exhibits about the history of Indian Bend Wash and the history of Scottsdale and a place where a lot of things can happen. And hopefully, restrooms, coffee, and ice cream. On the north side of this is what we are calling the grove of the great lawn where you can have a picnic in the summer and the lights around the canal. On the south is a very large lawn that people have

talked about for everyone to enjoy and for events. So, this is a major new downtown open space and paid for entirely by the developers and really worthy by the art, biking, and quality of life that is embedded in Scottsdale's DNA. So, it has been a pleasure and a privilege to work on it. And I will turn it back to Mr. Berry.

Councilmember Korte: Thank you, Ms. Drake. I think that gives not only me, but members of the public a feel for the thoughtful process that has gone into this project. I tip my hat to the ColRich group. I liked it from the very beginning, and I like it a lot more now because of the amenities and the rich components that have been brought into this as not only a sense of place and a great place to live, but a community benefit. You know, what a great combination that is. With that, I would like to make the motion to adopt Resolution No. 11650, Ordinance 4431, Resolution No. 11653 and Resolution No. 11651.

Councilman Phillips: Second.

Mayor Lane: The motion has been made by Councilwoman Korte and seconded by Councilmember Phillips. Councilmember Phillips, would you like to speak to it?

Councilman Phillips: I think it is a great project and going to be loved and a great part of our City. Thank you very much.

Mayor Lane: Councilwoman Klapp, would you have some comment?

[Time: 01:14:10]

Councilwoman Klapp: Yes, I think it is a great project too. And I love the emphasis on bike tourism that is involved in this project. You have read in the paper or on the Internet in the past couple of days that Scottsdale has been called a gold level city now. I'm hoping this project is going to make us a platinum level city. And the emphasis on bike tourism is something that we need to toot our horn about. And we have talked, as Betty said, a number of times of tying the downtown to the Greenbelt. There was a discussion a couple of years ago about having a major bike event in Scottsdale. I think that it was presented by one of the task force. I think this would be a great place to kick that off and have a large event in Scottsdale tying together. In particular, there is the bike race up north that could be tied to this. There is so many things that we could do that has the bike orientation to it.

I wanted to note that I like the idea of no walls around the project. In working on a project down in South Scottsdale a few years ago, we were hearing from the neighbors there they like South Scottsdale because it doesn't have walls and they don't like North Scottsdale because of the walls. It gives a large neighborhood feel with no walls and I think that with something of this size is a nice diversion, instead of walling everything in. And let's open it up to the community. It is a great idea and I fully support it. So, I will be voting for the project.

Mayor Lane: Thank you. I certainly will be supporting it. I think it is one of those projects where ColRich has gone above and beyond and any slight concern that I have had in regard to the project has been answered here or at a previous meeting before tonight. I'm amazed with ColRich and the example they have set here. To me, this is almost extraordinary and an appointment to or consideration of almost

every aspect of those things that we try to work and consider in regard to the Greenbelt and incorporating into its use.

It wasn't that many years ago, we talked about how most of the development on the Greenbelt had its back towards the Greenbelt. This is not front or back and it is entirely open and not walled off in any shape or form, which has been a conscious consideration of how we were going to be able to continue to improve, not only the quality of the Greenbelt, but also the use of it. And of course, now with the art that is voluntarily contributed on the site too and the openness and indicative of what we are trying to have in Downtown Scottsdale. For the most part all of that 36% of open space is available to the public. I just want to congratulate ColRich on bringing this forward and the entire team for putting it together. Thank you very much for that. I certainly will be voting for it. I think that anyone who has hesitation for it is going to find it a great asset for the City. All those in favor, please indicate by 'aye" and register your votes. It is unanimous. Thank everyone for participating pro and con in this process. I want to thank Mr. Berry, the developer and the owners. So, thank you very much.

John Berry: Thank you all very much.

Mayor Lane: Well, that was the one and only Item that we had on our agenda for tonight and took us a little while but worthy of good discussion.

ADJOURNMENT

[Time: 01:19:17]

Mayor Lane: No more Public Comment or Mayor or Council items, and with that, I would ask for a motion to adjourn.

Councilwoman Klapp: Move to adjourn.

Councilmember Korte: Second.

Mayor Lane: Motion has been made and seconded. All those in favor, please indicate by 'aye" and register your votes. We are adjourned.