
This document was created from the closed caption transcript of the September 11, 2018 City Council Special Meetings and **has not been checked for completeness or accuracy of content.**

A copy of the agenda for this meeting, including a summary of the action taken on each agenda item, is available online at:

<http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/Assets/ScottsdaleAZ/Council/current-agendas-minutes/2018-agendas/091118SpecialAgenda.pdf>

An unedited digital video recording of the meeting, which can be used in conjunction with the transcript, is available online at:

<http://www.Scottsdaleaz.gov/Scottsdale-video-network/Council-video-archives/2018-archives>

For ease of reference, included throughout the transcript are bracketed "time stamps" [Time: 00:00:00] that correspond to digital video recording time.

For more information about this transcript, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 480-312-2411.

CALL TO ORDER

[Time: 00:00:13]

Mayor Lane: Thank you very much. That was a very orderly crowd. I will go ahead and take that moment of silence to move into our Special Meeting of September 11th.

ROLL CALL

[Time: 00:00:19]

Mayor Lane: We will begin with a roll call, please.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Mayor Jim Lane.

Mayor Lane: Present.

Carolyn Jagger: Vice Mayor Guy Phillips.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: Councilmembers Suzanne Klapp.

Councilwoman Klapp: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: Virginia Korte.

Councilwoman Korte: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: Kathy Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: Linda Milhaven.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: David Smith.

Councilman Smith: Present.

Carolyn Jagger: City Manager Jim Thompson.

Jim Thompson: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: City Attorney Bruce Washburn.

Bruce Washburn: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: City Treasurer Jeff Nichols.

Jeff Nichols: Here.

Carolyn Jagger: And the Clerk is present.

[Time: 00:00:42]

Mayor Lane: Thank you. This Special Meeting is for one agenda item, the boards, commissions and task force interviews. For that purpose, I will turn it over to Vice Mayor. Vice Mayor Phillips, please.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Thank you, Mayor. This afternoon, the City Council will be appointing Scottsdale residents interested in serving on citizen advisory boards and commissions. We want to thank you for your willingness to volunteer your time in service to this community. And your time is very important. Following each set of interviews, we'll vote on the appointments for that board or commission. As I call your name, please come to the podium. We ask that you briefly cover the

following material: Please share your name, address, and how long you have lived in Scottsdale. Why do you want to serve on this board or commission? How do your experiences, whether they are educational, professional or volunteer, qualify you to serve on the commission? What do you think is the top issue facing your board or commission. Please limit your comments to three minutes or less. We have a timer by the screen to help you manage your time. Following each nominee's response, I'll ask Council members if they have any questions. We did have a lot of changes this last week. So if I mess something up, just take it with a grain of salt.

CITIZENS' BOND OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE

[Time: 00:02:08]

Vice Mayor Phillips: So we will start with the Citizens' Bond Oversight Committee. There's one opening. The Citizens' Bond Oversight Committee receives reports on the City's progress in implementing the Bond Program, reviews any proposed project changes to the program and provides comments to the City Council with respect to the bond program as the Committee deems appropriate. There is one vacancy and one nominee. The nominee is Laraine Rodgers. Is she here?

[Time: 00:02:45]

Laraine Rodgers: Good evening, Mayor Lane, Vice Mayor Phillips and Council. My name is Laraine Rogers and I live on north 75th street, and I have lived in Scottsdale. I have lived throughout Scottsdale over the last 29 years. I completed two terms on the Scottsdale Library Board and would like to continue my volunteer service to the city as a member of the Citizens' Bond Oversight Committee.

I'm very passionate about our city and I understand the importance of this city's oversight mission. I believe I could bring experience, passion and interest that are well aligned with the committee's core mission. I worked in leadership, project management and consulting assignments with a lot of responsibilities in industry, some major corporations, some medium sized and also government, including the city of Phoenix and I did some work back east too in the federal government. I served as a treasurer on the central Arizona chapter of the American Red Cross. Also I was an appointed senate confirmed two-term member of the state of Arizona's Information Technology Authorization Committee. I was appointed under two different governors of two different parties. Their commission is to review and discuss and vote on any submissions of projects that require any technology or communications, capital and operational expenses over \$1 million and that's for all phases of the project together. And so we got to do a lot of projects.

I demonstrated our commitment of volunteerism through active engagement and also what's, watching you on TV or reporting of it. And also I attended many Scottsdale events and plan to continue to do so. I was appointed to the General Plan 2035 task force and served until it was disbanded by Council. In May 2018, as I mentioned earlier, I served for six years on the Scottsdale Library Board, including two years as chair. I believe the top issue for the committee is to ensure these citizen-approved bonds are implemented per plan and review both their progress and any

proposed changes that are introduced. As a committee member, I would fully participate, including research, asking questions and participating in discussion. I would like your vote so I may contribute as a citizen advocate on the Citizens' Bond Oversight Committee. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Thank you, Ms. Rodgers. Do we have any questions? Seeing none, I guess each Councilmember is going to vote once and we will start with Councilman Smith.

Councilman Smith: I will of course vote for Laraine Rodgers and also commend her for her many, many years of service.

Councilmember Korte: Laraine Rodgers.

Mayor Lane: Laraine Rodgers.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Ms. Rodgers.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Laraine Rodgers.

Vice Mayor Phillips: And Ms. Rodgers. So Laraine, you have been appointed.

HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION

[Time: 00:06:02]

Vice Mayor Phillips: Next is the Human Relations Commission. There are two openings. The Human Relations Commission advocates and promotes all dimensions of diversity. The Commission acts as an advisory body to the Mayor, City Council and staff to make recommendations on ways to encourage mutual respect and understanding among people, to discourage prejudice and discrimination, and to work towards cultural awareness and unity. There are two vacancies and seven nominees. The nominees are Debra Behrendt, James Eaneman, Emily Hinchman, Howard Jones, Jackie Parks, and Jennifer Martin who is unable to attend, but would like to you review her application and still be considered, and Donna Reid who is also unable to attend but has submitted her response in writing and would also like to be considered. So, again, two vacancies and seven nominees. Each Councilmember can vote for two. So I will start with Debra Behrendt, is she here? Forgive me if I didn't say that right.

[Time: 00:07:07]

Debra Berendt: It's Debra Berendt like parent. I'm Debra Berendt and I'm a citizen of Scottsdale. I was born and raised in Arizona. I live at 24447 North 77th Place. I'm honored to be here. Thank you. This is the first time I have ever taken the podium, and I appreciate your willingness to listen to me. I'm a teacher. I'm a mother and I'm an advocate. Along with that, I'm a proud member of the city. And I would really like to just share with you how I would like to walk along with the commission to continue to keep our city moving forward as an equitable city and inclusive city.

Inclusivity, to me, does not just mean race or gender. It also means everyone regardless of age, ability, skin color or who they love. To be the best city, we must include everybody. It's not just all for one, but it really is a one for all. The city must continue to be inclusive in our schools, in our city, and in our community. I'm a high school teacher, and one of the reasons why I decided to venture on the commission is what I see with our youngsters and that's our future. That is who is going to be sitting in your seats in 30 or 40 years. Those are the youngsters we want to continue in our city, we want to continue. We must them, we must include them in the community. We must keep the, continue to keep the city moving forward in educating not only our students but ourselves. I know I have more time to teach, excuse me, to speak, so I could continue to teach which is what I have been doing all day. I appreciate you giving me this opportunity. I'm Debra Berendt. If you have any questions, I would like to share anything about me or my ideas. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Thank you. Does Council have any questions?

Debra Berendt: Thanks so much for your time.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Thank you. Next is James Eaneman.

[Time: 00:09:42]

James Eaneman: Mr. Mayor, Mr. Vice Mayor, members of the Council, I'm Jim Eaneman and it's my pleasure to take these few minutes to tell you a little bit about myself and my advocacy for being on this commission. I live at 1162 East Arabian Park Drive and I have lived there for 28 months after relocating from Tennessee via 60 plus years living in the San Francisco Bay area.

My story is simple and straightforward. I'm the grandson of pioneers on one side, and immigrants on the other. And with those as role models as well as my parents, the guidelines and the values that were stressed were faith, hard work, educational self-improvement, respect and concern for others and giving back to the communities which have given us so much. Throughout my life, I have attempted to give back both personally and professionally. I have a bachelor's degree with honors in economics and history from Cal State Chico. An MBA with distinction from Pepperdine University and as well, I completed the two-year advanced management program at Duke University. 32 years of my career were spent at Pacific Gas and Electric, starting out as a beginning level management trainee on probation and retiring as the manager of human resources, planning, development and diversity.

And in that capacity, the corporation under plans and initiatives that we conceived and launched, won awards from the Department of Labor for inclusion and diversity and community outreach and economic opportunity through training. Over the last 50 years, I have given more than 15,000 hours of community service on a personal basis at all levels from P.T.A.s to being a room dad, to tutoring children, the children of migrant workers in Chico to tutoring economic and disadvantaged people in the bay area. I have been, I have seen most of it in the 50 years. I have been a two-time president of the Chamber of Commerce in Berkeley and if you think that doesn't take some doing for somebody

from a utility in the people's republic, well, I would argue that it does. But we, in all of those endeavors, we came together. We found common ground. We will communicate.

We agreed on the things that we could agree on, and we agreed that there were some things that we didn't agree, but most of all, there was inclusion. There was commitment, and there was tireless effort to do the right thing. In that regard, these are the things that I would bring to this assignment if you choose to select me and I hope that you will look favorably on my candidacy. Most of all, thank you for this opportunity to talk with you.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Thank you. Does Council have any questions? Seeing none, thank you very much.

James Eaneman: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Next is Emily Hinchman.

[Time: 00:13:13]

Emily Hinchman: Good afternoon and thank you for this nomination. My name is Emily Hinchman and I live at 11457 East Bella Vista Drive. I moved here from Colorado in 1999. I want to serve on the Human Relations Commission because I feel that there's a definite need for leaders in our community to promote tolerance and understanding of all different cultures. I have been a nurse for over 15 years and a nurse practitioner since 2006. I would like to read you a quote that was posted by the president of the American Nurses Association. It reads the following: I am an ex-convict. I have AIDS. I'm a prostitute. I'm poor. I'm gay. I aborted my baby. I'm a teen mom. I'm an alcoholic. I'm a beggar. I'm a drug user. I have cancer. I have a contagious disease and the nurse said, I will take care of you. I went into nursing because my character has always been one of compassion being empathy and understanding of the human race. I advocate for all those people mentioned in the quote as well as people from many different cultures, sexualities, socioeconomic status and religions and I care for them all without prejudice or judgment.

My voluntary experience includes Phoenix action team leader for Compassion and Choices, a nonprofit trying to legalize medical aid in dying. I educate the public on this issue and lead a group of volunteers to further our cause. I have sat on subcommittees at the Arizona State Board of Nursing. And I have also just been inducted into the 33rd class of Scottsdale Leadership. Currently, there are not enough nurses in government, and I would like to take steps to change that starting here. A key issue facing the board right now is the fact that Arizona is one of more than 25 states without an antidiscrimination ordinance.

Our country today is at its height of racial and cultural conflicts. It's being driven by fear and intolerance. In 2014, Scottsdale earned 65 out of 100 points on the municipality equality index, while Phoenix, Tempe and Tucson, our most diverse municipalities earned 100. My husband and I own a small medical practice in north Scottsdale and do not feel this ordinance would hurt our business in any way. Today's leading companies want to be in cities where diversity is respected. I feel that by

exuding tolerance and compassion for our fellow residents we can celebrate diversity and embrace it, instead of fear it. I want to be a part of this human relations commission to foster opportunities for all cultures to be celebrated and unified in one great community. Thank you for your time.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Thank you. Does Council have any questions? Thank you, Emily. Next will be Howard Jones.

[Time: 00:16:36]

Howard Jones: Good afternoon. Thank you for your time. I will be as brief as possible. I am Howard Jones. I live at 8369 North Via Linda in Scottsdale. I have been a homeowner in Scottsdale since 2002. Why do I want to serve on the commission? Over the course of my life, I have received the benefits of a great many volunteers, people that have stepped for the benefits of, for example, scholarships, where people gave me a hand, a lot of people that I never met, never saw. It's time for me to pay it back. That's the reason why I want to serve on the commission.

My experiences that might benefit the commission, I'm an honors college graduate from Michigan State university, where I did my bachelor's and master's work. What brought me to Arizona originally in the '70s was to study for my Ph.D. in chemical engineering at the University of Arizona. The, so I've got two losing teams there right off the bat. At any rate, I have served on a number of commissions. I was president of the Northland Pioneer College Foundation. I was the president of the American Institute of Chemical Engineers chapter at Michigan State University and numerous other commissions that I have served on.

I'm also an author who has written, among other things, a book called "A Man on the Bench" which is dedicated to the life of a homeless schizophrenic that lived on the streets of San Diego for 20-some years with no one knowing anything about his background and it's an interesting book. I would recommend it. But it has a lot to do with diversity. I also traveled the world for many years. I'm multicultural and multilingual.

In the years I traveled the world, I tried, or I was exposed to a great many cultures for extended periods of time. I lived in Mexico on and off for a period of about three years total in my lifetime, and I also intimately familiar and lived on the Navajo reservation and can handle that language with some difficulty, but I can get by on that. What do I think the top issue facing the commission is? I think it's to promote an advocate for diversity of all kinds. Within Scottsdale and that's what their charter is and that's what I hope to be able to contribute. How would I accomplish that? I would get on the, if I were on the commission, I would probably be fairly silent for a significant period of time, while I learned and listened to the views of others and then as I evaluated my ability to contribute to the commission, become more and more proactive as time went on and hopefully accomplish something worthwhile and pay my debt to society in so doing. Thank you for your time.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Thank you. Council, any questions? Seeing none. Thank you. Jackie Parks here.

[Time: 00:19:57]

Jackie Parks: Hi. My name is Jackie Parks. I live at 608 North 73rd Place in south Scottsdale. I have lived here for a little bit over three years. My husband and I and our three children moved here from the country of Morocco. I'm originally from the East Coast. We lived in Morocco and started a business in Morocco and that's been the most important experience of my life. It taught me how to, well, really, I learned how to be a minority. I learned how to be the person that doesn't speak the language, that doesn't know the culture, and I had the, I had the opportunity to be invited in. And I think especially in this day and age, where we're quick to fear things that we don't know and we're quick to fear people that we don't know, and so we build walls instead of building bridges. And I would love the opportunity to use my imagination and creativity and the resources of this city to build more bridges, to create opportunities for people to be together, to create more opportunities to learn and to hear the stories and the experiences of people that are different from us. I think that stories change us.

Hearing the experiences and the life of someone that doesn't look like us or eats the same food as us, or has lived the same experiences as us, it changes us in ways that we need to be changed, especially in this day and age when we live in a pluralistic society. We don't live, it doesn't look, Scottsdale doesn't look the same. I wasn't living here but I know it doesn't look the same as it did even ten years ago. And instead of fighting that, I think we have the opportunity to embrace that and to, yeah, use our imaginations to, to change, to be an example to, I hope, the rest of the city, the rest of Phoenix area, and the country and the state, for what it looks like to be and inclusive, diversity that not only tolerates but invites and encourages diversity.

I have three children that go to Pueblo Elementary School and we chose Pueblo because it's a Spanish immersion school and the opportunities that they get, just learning a different culture and a different language, it's changed the way that they see people on the street. It's changed the way they see our neighbors and so I would love to have the opportunity to speak into what it, what curriculum looks like in our school and how that changes the way our kids learn about people that are different from us, how they learn about history and how history has moved us and changed us and, so, yeah. Thanks for the opportunity.

[Time: 00:22:51]

Vice Mayor Phillips: Does Council have any questions? Seeing none, thank you. I said earlier, Jennifer Martin and Donna Reid were unable to attend but think would still both like to be considered. We have two vacancies and seven nominees and each Councilmember can start twice. I will start with Councilmember Korte.

Councilmember Korte: Thank you, Vice Mayor Phillips. I vote for James Eaneman and Emily Hinchman.

Mayor Lane: My vote would be for James Eaneman and Jennifer Martin.

Councilwoman Klapp: Howard Jones and Emily Hinchman.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Emily Hinchman and Howard Jones.

Councilwoman Littlefield: James Eaneman and Howard Jones.

Vice Mayor Phillips: I will vote for James Eaneman and Emily Hinchman.

Councilman Smith: Jim Eaneman and Emily Hinchman.

Vice Mayor Phillips: So it looks like James Eaneman and Emily Hinchman. Congratulations.

HUMAN SERVICES COMMISSION

[Time: 00:24:10]

Vice Mayor Phillips: Moving on, the Human Services Commission. The Human Services Commission provides advisory recommendations to staff and the City Council on human services priorities and programs; and funding allocations for Scottsdale Cares, Community Development Block Grants, HOME, Human Services Emergency and General Funds. There are two vacancies and five nominees. The nominees are Ashley Blaine who is unable to attend, but has submitted a response in write and would like to be considered. Excuse me for this, Kanagaratnam Chinasamy, Janice Eng, Patricia Nightingale, and Andrew Song. So we'll start out with Kanagaratnam Chinasamy.

[Time: 00:25:03]

Kanagaratnam Chinasamy: I have been living in the Scottsdale area for about 18 years. I live at 16356 North Thompson Parkway. Despite living here 18 years, I have an accent. Going back, I lived in four countries in Europe, Canada, and moving here 18 years ago. I have been involved with human resources, human services through Rotary and through crisis nursery and many other N.G.O.s and I have been doing it on a freelance basis. When some of my friends on the commission and in the diversity team in Scottsdale told me a good option for me would be to serve on commission so that we can work together as a team, identify some of the key issues as far as human services are concerned, prioritize and then carry out the activities. So that is the reason that after my retirement of last year, December, I feel that I have more time now to serve on a commission and serve the city of Scottsdale.

I have been an international human resource consultant for about 30 years and I was with the Thunderbird school and I got my master's degree and I'm finishing my doctorate in human services and human behavior. I have been a member of Rotary as a past president, as a director of community services for the last 25 years. And I feel very compassionate. I feel very committed to human services because I believe the poor in our community are our trust, and we have to take care of our trust. Looking at the minutes of the last commission, I find that the areas of concern are always funding. How to get more funds because the needs are great, and the second great challenge will be allocation of these funds, as to after prioritizing.

I'm new in this area and if I'm nominated to the commission, I will be able to learn from the past members or the present members and then I will be able to contribute effectively. So I have to learn first your protocol, the procedure, the process in a commission, before I can effectively contribute. And I think that I can do that. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Thank you. Any questions, Council? Thank you very much. Next is Janice Eng.

[Time: 00:28:35]

Janice Eng: Good afternoon, Mr. Mayor, Mr. Vice Mayor and esteemed Councilmembers. My name is Janice Eng and I reside at 13051 North 145th Way in Scottsdale and I have been a resident of Arizona and Scottsdale for about eight years now. So I have to remember all the things I have to hit here. So why do I want to be on the commission? I'm completing my third year of my first term and it's taken me that long to catch on to everything. It's a very difficult commission to be on.

I don't think people really understand the amount of work that, that this entails. It's not just the budgeting, but we have to go through 50 plus proposals that are hundreds of pages long and then we have to go through a whole process of ranking those and making sure that, that we're being as transparent as possible. It's an awful lot to do, and like I said, number two and three, the reason I want to continue is I don't want to lose that knowledge base that I have gained in the past three years. I want to continue that and improve upon the processes we put into place. We have a lot of issues that we are facing and, again, what everybody is going to say with the Human Services, funding is a very big issue and we always have to be aware that we can't, it's never guaranteed that we will stay equal to what the prior funding was, let alone grow that. But we have a lot of opportunities and I have to give kudos to the Human Services group, led by director Greg Bestgen and his staff.

One of the areas that Human Services Commission can really help with is with the Scottsdale Cares program. So many people in our community are totally unaware of this program and how much a dollar really helps. So they, the department has instituted some tremendous marketing and outreach efforts and we on the commission support that and continue to feed ideas on that and try to do more outreach, because that's an area that we need to grow. With all the residents, if everybody gave a dollar, we would easily be able to double or triple the amount of dollars that we have to allocate.

On the other side, we are also instituting processes to better hold the people that have been awarded accountability. So that's pretty much it. I could be up here forever talking about it because I'm very passionate about, it but I hope you consider that and put me in there again. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Any questions? Next, okay. Thank you very much. Next Patricia Nightingale.

[Time: 00:31:41]

Patricia Nightingale: Good afternoon Mayor Lane, Vice Mayor Phillips and Councilmembers. My name is Patricia Nightingale, and I live at 13553 North 91st Way, and I have been a resident of Scottsdale now since January of 1995. And I recently retired after more than 40 years in the social services field, and so I unfortunately am not done feeling like I want to give back. So I want to continue to provide for those who are more disadvantaged and work in the social services field, but this time as a volunteer. Now that I have that luxury of being able to do that. And so I really feel like it's my time to give back as a volunteer and, in fact, I have been offered jobs and said no, but I would be more than happy to volunteer to do that for you because it's a nice feeling to do it that way.

As I said, I worked in the social services, the human services field for over 40 years. The last 20, I worked for the city of Phoenix Human Services department as a program coordinator and then as the deputy director. And so as you would imagine, you know, I'm familiar with all of the services that are provided in Scottsdale, because we had similar services in the city of Phoenix. I was a staff support person for the Human Services Commission as well as the bond committee on the years that we had bond elections. So I'm familiar with the operations of the Human Services Committee and the services that we would be providing. I think that's a big advantage as some other people have said, they will have to get up to speed with the Human Services Commission. Well, I will be able to just figure out what's different between Scottsdale and Phoenix, but move right into that.

And I have had a great career at the city of Phoenix and it gave me a lot of opportunity to sort of strengthen my analytical skills, my leadership skills and those were probably the two things that the city of Phoenix used the most from me, for my career there. As far as the most, the largest issue for the commission, you know, there's more need for services. We are seeing more first-time users of services. Yes, funding is always a problem and it's even worse and we are under greater scrutiny so nothing that I haven't already dealt with and we like many cities would need to look tell effectiveness of our money, but we also have to be, but we also have to be really creative about the partnerships and knowing the feel of social services in Phoenix, I think I could bring a lot of that to the table to help out with being creative in our funding and in our strategies for the commission. So thank you and I appreciate the opportunity to just even get to talk to you. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Any questions? Thank you very much. And Andrew Song.

[Time: 00:34:52]

Andrew Song: Hello, my name is Andrew Song, 10749 North 98th Street in Scottsdale. I have been a resident of Scottsdale for eight years. I'm always nervous at the podium. So I hate it. I just want to quickly just take just a moment to say the anniversary of 9/ 11. Could we just think what happened to our country 17 years ago. Let's see, I got to read this because I'm never prepared, as you know. So why do I want to serve on this board? I want to share a small story with you. I love cooking. I love eating. I love cooking and that all began when I was 12 years old.

So the city that I grew up in, Marin Park, California, the city recognized and the local church recognized that my family qualified for receiving this box, this box of food on a Thanksgiving because we were a needy family. I come from very humble background. And so this box of food came and my families

were all working and my sisters were helping out the work and everything else. There was no one to cook it. So I volunteered and that's how I began to learn to cook, from the stuffing box recipe. The reason for that is this box recognizes, for me, a sense of opportunity, a hope, and something for me to be encouraged with.

And I believe our commission, the Human Services Commission is just that. There are people would need help. Who don't, I'm not talking about a handout. But I'm talking about something to give them a leg up, to give them an encouragement to do something and do better. 40-some odd years later, I'm not going to give away my age, all right, but a few years later, I'm here in the most beautiful and affluent city in our country, and sometimes people need help. I think you can help that and I want to be take part of it. How do, what experience do I have? I have served in a Scottsdale Human Relations Commission. I did that for one term only, and I took a sabbatical, taking time for my family, but here I'm back. Most importantly, I'm a Realtor. I see people from the lowest socioeconomic status to the highest and I have those exposures and I can bring that to the Council and be the eyes and ears to you guys so we can bring sometimes those hard questions that you need to address and say, you know what we have to solve those problems. That's it for me.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Any questions? Okay. Thank you. So there are two vacancies and five nominees. Each Councilmember can vote twice. We will start with Mayor Lane.

Mayor Lane: My vote goes to Janice Eng and Andrew Song.

Councilwoman Klapp: Janice Eng and Andrew Song.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Janice Eng and Andrew Song.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Janice Eng and excuse me if I mispronounce this, Kana Chinasamy.

Vice Mayor Phillips: I got to say everybody is good. So I wish we could vote for everybody, but unfortunately we can't. So, again, I will vote for Janice Eng and Andrew Song.

Councilman Smith: Janice Eng and Mr. Chinasamy.

Councilmember Korte: And Janice Eng and Andrew Song.

Vice Mayor Phillips: So it looks like Janice Eng and Andrew Song. Congratulations. You have been appointed.

JUDICIAL APPOINTMENTS ADVISORY BOARD

[Time: 00:39:11]

Vice Mayor Phillips: You are onward to the Judicial Appointments Advisory Board. The Judicial Appointments Advisory Board, JAAB, makes advisory recommendations to the City Council regarding

the appointment and reappointment of full-time city judges. Special Qualifications: The JAAB will consist of two active judges, one representative from both the State Bar and the Scottsdale Bar Associations, and three citizens appointed by the City Council, who are not judges in any official capacity, nor retired judges, nor members of the State Bar of Arizona. Per Ordinance No. 3254, the Council must appoint/reappoint members who are recommended from the Scottsdale Bar Association or the Arizona Superior Court. There are two vacancies; one Scottsdale Bar Representative position and one Citizen position. We will vote separately for each position. There is one Scottsdale Bar Representative position vacancy and two nominees. The nominees are John Gilbert and Robert Gruler, Jr. So is Mr. Gilbert here?

[Time: 00:40:25]

John Gilbert: I am. Good afternoon, Mayor Lane and Vice Mayor Phillips. My name is John Gilbert.

I live at 9052 East Saguaro. I lived there for 12 years and I practiced law in Arizona for 42 years. I practiced in Scottsdale for 12 years, first with the law firm of Alvarez and Gilbert, and then last year we joined Radix Law which is in north Scottsdale. I want to serve on the board or the commission because we want to ensure that the judiciary is the best that Scottsdale has to offer. I think that I'm qualified to do that because I have been practicing law here for 42 years and have been in front of judges at every level.

And consequently, I know what a good judge is. I know what a bad judge is. I know what to look for in finding what a judge needs to be a good judge. And, you know, they say what is the most, the big issue facing the board. It's judicial temperament. Judges need to be reasonable. They need to be fair. They need to make litigants feel that they have had their day in court and they have been treated fairly. You go into court and you are always nervous to begin with. You are not in a good state. Judges, judges can make a big difference. Somebody is going to lose. Somebody is not going to feel good as they leave courtroom or the judge may split the baby and everybody feels bad. The key for the judges, the judge has to have the right temperament to make everybody feel that they are respected and they have been given their day in court, that their position has been considered and I just think that's important.

What you don't want is a dictatorial type judge, one who is above everybody and better than the rest. No, the judge has to make a decision but he has to be able to treat litigants fairly and I think I can do that because I guess I have been in front of good judges and bad judges and I know what to look for. And that's why I wanted to do this and that's why I think I'm qualified and I think that's it.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Any questions? We have a question from the Mayor?

Mayor Lane: Yes, Mr. Gilbert, just a quick question and that is it's, it's a careful area for us with regard to this board, and frankly how this City Council operates with regard to our judiciary. And so we're very, very concerned about separation of powers, certainly, but also in the sense of any judgments we make about how our judges rule. We are specifically assigned with the responsibility of the administration of the courts, the due process and proceeding with due process for, in the

fairness and in the execution of judicial duties. And I just wanted to just sort of affirm or just ask you what your feelings are about that in view of the fact that you were talking about sort of the demeanor or the sense that a judge might take in a courtroom, whether it be administrative or lend it itself to how we might pick judges on the basis of how they rule.

John Gilbert: Well, I'm not sure what you are getting there. They have to be smart and fair and know the law. Knowing the law is not enough, but you need to apply the law properly, given the facts of the situation. These are not political decisions. They need to be based on facts, based on the law, but they need to be fair and my whole point is they need to, I mean the judiciary reflects on Scottsdale. And we have bad judges, that doesn't look good. We need for them to be professional. That's the word I like it use, having integrity. Professional meaning we feel good about them and they know what they are do.

Mayor Lane: And I think you have answered the question, and when we say, fair, we're not making a determination as to what you think is fair or what somebody else thinks is the fair, we are talking about the law.

John Gilbert: Correct.

Mayor Lane: Deliverance of justice under the law.

John Gilbert: Exactly.

Mayor Lane: And professionalism is another one of them. I wanted to make that point because we have been as a community and frankly as a system challenged in our legislature and across the political board on the basis of being careful to follow that line and make sure we are not making emotional judgments and/or political judgments about how a judge may proceed in the courtroom.

John Gilbert: Agreed. They need to be mature. They need to do. You know people that aren't going to fit and aren't going to be good judges and not have the right temperament and likewise. That's the purpose of the board is to weed them out and come up with the best that we can.

Mayor Lane: Okay. Thank you.

John Gilbert: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Robert Gruler, Jr.

[Time: 00:45:55]

Robert Gruler Jr.: Hi, my name is Robert Gruler. I live in south Scottsdale. I'm eager to serve on this board because I'm a very strong advocate for an independent judiciary. Today, I am a defense lawyer. I practice full time and I started, Mr. Gilbert has a few years on me. But I got licensed in 2013 and since then I have been practicing exclusively in criminal defense. I have started at two law

firms before founding our own. Today I lead a team of five other attorneys.

I personally have appeared in hundreds of different courts throughout Arizona and met, many, many judges and seen good judges and seen bad judges. My team has represented thousands of people and, again, exclusively in criminal defense law. Now, that's a big part of what Scottsdale does on a daily basis. I appeared in Scottsdale and my team appears in Scottsdale very regularly. I think that my experience, just as a practitioner in an area that is within the purview of Scottsdale, almost exclusively would give me a wide variety of information to serve on this board.

Something that separates me from other lawyers or defense attorneys, I have a special place in my heart for a certain category of offenses. In 2016, I lost my little brother to an addiction and suicide, and since that time, my practice has shifted a bit and today we are focused more on a more holistic approach when we are dealing with people who are charged with similar offenses. So D.U.I.s and domestic issues, they usually stem from something else. The approach that my firm is taking now is not just represent an individual on the underlying offense, but let's make sure that that offense is not recommitted. Let's make sure that we never see that individual again and treat the actual underlying cause.

And I believe that that is important in our judicial system but I don't believe that that's important at the expense of biased judiciary and so that's why I go back to my original statement that I'm a believer in an independent judiciary and by that I do mean that I think it's important that a judge consider the full facts of everything that's before them and not be leaned on one way or another, whether it's by the prosecutor's office, or the defense attorney's office. And so that's why I'm asking you for your consideration to be appointed on this board. Thank you.

[Time: 00:48:38]

Vice Mayor Phillips: Any questions? Thank you very much. So we have one Scottsdale bar association representative position vacancy, and two nominees. Each Councilmember can vote once. We will start with Councilwoman Klapp.

Councilwoman Klapp: John Gilbert.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Mr. Gruler.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Robert Gruler.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Robert Gruler.

Councilman Smith: John Gilbert.

Councilmember Korte: Robert Gruler.

Mayor Lane: Robert Gruler.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Okay, Robert Gruler, you have been appointed to the Scottsdale bar representative position. There's one nominee from for Scottsdale Bar Association Representative position vacancy and two nominees. Each Councilmember can vote once. There is one Citizen position vacancy and two nominees. The nominees are Susan Galpin-Tyree. And Courtney Brimacombe and Mary Jo Barsetti have withdrawn for consideration. Susan.

[Time: 00:49:55]

Susan Galpin-Tyree: My name is Susan Galpin-Tyree I reside on East Jenan Drive. I'm employed as a legal secretary. I first stepped into this Kiva in 1987, as a participant in organizing Scottsdale's community celebration of the 200th celebration of our U.S. constitution. In 2009, I stood right here and was appointed to the Human Relations Commission. I stand here again as servant of my city to offer my time, my service, for the public good as a member of the Judicial Appointments Advisory Board.

Last May, I earned a master's degree from the Sandra Day O'Connor college of law at A.S.U. It's there I relearned constitutional law. It's there I relearned the preservation of judicial independence and that it is essential. It is there I relearned that societal mores of the day inform the law of that time. But the constant is the principle of the judicial independence. That principle was written into the constitution when it was decided that we would appoint, rather than elect our federal judges and give them lifetime tenure to remove them from the political process. The Supreme Court, particularly in chief justice Marshall's decisions, namely Marlboro vs. Madison, have judicial supremacy.

Of the Supreme Court held that the interpretation of constitutional provisions was the province of judges. Of course, neither the principle of independence nor the principle of judicial supremacy guarantees the rule of law. Case in point Dred Scott vs. Sanford. The worst decision in the history of the Supreme Court. Nonetheless, these are the underpinning of the rule of law which we cannot afford to take for granted. We have the level of integrity and ethics for whom we entrust the power of judging. If appointed, it is with these understandings that I would serve to carry out the Judicial Appointments Advisory Board understand Scottsdale revised code and under the Arizona Supreme Court's uniform rules. Thank you.

[Time: 00:52:39]

Vice Mayor Phillips: Any questions? Thank you. We have one citizen position vacancy and one nominee. We will start with Councilwoman Milhaven.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Susan Galpin-Tyree.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Susan Galpin-Tyree.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Susan Galpin-Tyree.

Councilman Smith: Susan Galpin-Tyree.

Councilmember Korte: Ms. Galpin-Tyree.

Mayor Lane: Susan Galpin-Tyree.

Councilwoman Klapp: Susan Galpin-Tyree.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Congratulations. You have been appointed to the citizen position. Okay.

TOURISM ADVISORY COMMISSION

[Time: 00:53:30]

Vice Mayor Phillips: Onward, Tourism Advisory Commission. Two openings, one tourism and one resident. The Tourism Development Commission advises the City Council on matters concerning the expenditure of revenues from the Transaction Privilege Tax on transient lodging, bed tax, designated for tourism development. Special Qualifications: As specified in the Scottsdale City Code, the Tourism Development Commission shall consist of representatives of the tourism industry in Scottsdale, including a minimum of four Scottsdale hoteliers, one member of Experience Scottsdale and a balance from elements of the tourism industry. There are two vacancies; one Hotelier position vacancy and one Industry position vacancy. We will vote separately for each position. There is one Hotelier position vacancy and one nominee. The nominee for the Hotelier position is Richard Newman. Is he here?

[Time: 00:54:29]

Richard Newman: Hi. Thank you. It is a pleasure to be here. Mr. Mayor, Vice Mayor, City Councilmembers. My name is Rich Newman. I lived at 7647 Onyx Court in Scottsdale in 1994. I first to Scottsdale in 1986 and I was quickly smitten by this charming and unique urban jewel of the southwest and I was captivated bit magic of the Sonoran Desert. This is truly my adopted home and I would most humbly be appreciative and honored to have an opportunity to give back and serve the community that has given me and my family such a wonderful life experience.

I have been the manager of the Gainey Suites, the general manager of the Gainey Suites Hotel since 2003, and I presently also serve on the board of directors for the Valley Hotel and Resort Association. Over these years, I have watched Scottsdale grow and evolve into the world-class destination that it is today. And now more than ever, one of the best places in the world that you could choose to visit and better yet to live in. As a long-time resident and independent hotel operator, I feel that I have developed a balanced perspective of how tourism impacts the community we live in.

Both in terms of its significant contribution to the local economy and how in the process of developing and promoting the cultural amenities, events and attractions that enhance the guest experience, the visitor experience, it ultimately enriches the overall quality of life in the community for all of us. That

is simply the essence and the premise of what tourism initiatives should accomplish, and it is the foundation upon which Scottsdale should continue to build and promote its brand in an increasingly competitive national and international marketplace. In doing so it should always be creative, innovative, inclusive and transparent. If we stay this course, we will surely succeed in our efforts. I thank you very much for your time and consideration. Good day.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Any questions? Thank you. So we have one vacancy and one nominee. Each Councilmember can vote once. We will start with Councilwoman Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Richard Newman.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Richard Newman.

Councilman Smith: Richard Newman.

Councilmember Korte: Richard Newman.

Mayor Lane: Richard Newman.

Councilwoman Klapp: Richard Newman.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Rich Newman.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Congratulations, you have been appointed to the hotelier position. There is one Industry position vacancy and three nominees. The nominees for the Industry position are Jeanne Alspaugh, Linda Dillenbeck, David Woods. Is Jeanne here?

[Time: 00:57:47]

Jeanne Alspaugh: Good evening Mayor Lane, and Vice Mayor Phillips, and members of the City Council. My name is Jeanne Alspaugh and I have been a resident of Scottsdale for 17 years. I reside at 7136 North Via De Allegría in the wonderful community of McCormick Ranch. I live there with my husband of 21 years and our little dog Addie. Thank you for the opportunity to support my community in another capacity.

Being part of the Parks and Recreation Commission for six years was deeply fulfilling. Being able to lead the commission one year as vice chair and two years as their chair during a very fiscally challenging time was an honor and my pleasure. Our body worked very hard to come up with fully vetted and practical solutions for our residents. Implementing special task forces to work with our partners in aquatics, baseball, softball and after-school programming participants to find viable options for all parties. Being present at any and all special events hosted by the Scottsdale Parks and Recreation Department, mixing with leaders and the citizens alike and to be visible and available to our residents.

In May of 2017, retired from my 29-year career with Grainger Industrial Supply. In October of 2015 I joined Pro Travel as a luxury travel professional. Pro travel a \$30 billion operation and we're headquarters in Manhattan, New York. I'm thrilled to be a part of a very forward-thinking organization that is very focused on the growth and the success of its employees and independent contractors alike.

I'm ready for the challenges that face our Tourism Development Commission, our cache in Scottsdale is ever changing and developing and we must be the facilitators of that change and I'm prepared to lead by example and with the community experience that I already have to draw from, the learning curve would be minimal. I look forward to working very closely with the city of Scottsdale staff, Mayor and Council and fellow commissioners to serve my community and to bring a fresh perspective to the, and to always strive to think outside the box when partnering with our community. The Tourism Development Commission faces many challenges for funding. To be able to continue to improve our guest experiences from all over the world here in Scottsdale, it is essential to the growth and the development of our community to do what is best for the commission and to support those requests any way that we can. Thank you again so much for this opportunity.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Questions? No? Thank you. Linda Dillenbeck here?

[Time: 01:00:59]

Linda Dillenbeck: Honorable Mayor Lane, Vice Mayor Phillips, and Scottsdale Councilmembers, my name is Linda Dillenbeck. I lived in Scottsdale since 1976, and I reside at 9727 North 80th Way in McCormick Ranch. I currently serve as chairperson of the TDC and would like the privilege of serving another term. What I have learned in my first three years on the commission is year one is spent understanding and being educated about the programs and the use of funds. The second and the third years are spent developing resources to find answers to make the right recommendations. Another term will put the education and the knowledge I have gained to its greatest use for the TDC.

As a city, we have many important articles that need to funding. There's the stadium, civic center mall, mega events like Super Bowl and Canal Convergence, our arts communities and museums need help. Old town needs support, as does community events. There will always be more demand for funds than there are funds available. So we can't simply recommend funding because we have in the past years. What we need to do is be diligent about making recommendations that generate a mix of bed and sales tax dollars. That's why I think my experience of the past three years will be important because we have hard choices to make ahead.

As a commission, we need to support opportunities that provide us a solid plan to deliver a return on investment, whether that is focused on generating visitor and bed tax dollars or providing unique experiences for local, the for the local community that will bring in sales tax revenue. I think we also need to require accountability so that the programs we recommend are on a sustainable path. I have been a member of the industry of tourism for 25 years. I understand the changing landscape in which we compete for visitors and I also understand how critical it is to provide experiences that are both unique and different. I think we can accomplish this by funding organizations and businesses

that develop platforms to highlight what makes our city so very special. And by encouraging those who seek funds, to come prepares with a clear plan to deliver measurable results. Because by doing so, we will ensure that the future of Scottsdale tourism delivers the experience, the quality of life, our citizens and visitors expect. I have been a salesperson for a long time and they always teach you to ask for the order. So I respectfully stand in front of today and ask you to consider granting me the privilege of serving on the tourism development commission for another term. Thank you for your consideration.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Questions? No? Thank you. David Woods.

[Time: 01:04:05]

David Woods: Good evening, Councilmembers. My name is David Woods. I live in north Scottsdale at 14976 North 100th Way near Frank Lloyd Wright and Thompson Peak. My wife Maureen and I have lived in Scottsdale for almost five years. I originally moved to the valley in 1972 and went to high school here and Arizona State. I moved back to the valley in 2007. Currently, I'm the director of pricing for a wine, beer and spirits wholesaler, Youngs Market Company of Arizona. I'm responsible for database management, market pricing and gross profit. I don't currently have any account responsibility or sales responsibility. Prior to my career in wine and spirits, I worked for an oil corporation and helped produce conventions in Las Vegas led the organization of a convention of New York City. We organized trade space, hotel arrangements, meeting space, promotion and funding. In over 22 years in my wine career, I have organized over 100 trade tastings, public tastings, food, wine events.

Have worked in wine retailers, with restaurants, as a wholesaler and with wholesalers and resorts. I previously owned my own retail wine shop and I did own a wine distributorship here in Arizona. I have been a lifelong marketer. Right now, I'm in my second year as president of the Marana home owners association and I served on the advisory board for the W.P. Carey School of Business at Arizona State University. I have a certificate under winery, finance and accounting and have taught wine, business planning marketing, accounting, for the culinary program at the Art Institute.

Why do I want to participate on this board? My industry touches nearly every business that participates in the tourism industry. Beverage alcohol often plays a key role in the profitability of these businesses and their events. My background and experience, knowledge, of consumer and industry trends and regulations would be an asset in guiding the activities in Scottsdale. I believe we need to promote responsible promotion and consumption and I would like to build visitor counts and increase visitor spending. Top issues facing the board, I think we need to maximize our facilities and assets working with promoters, businesses, to ensure viability and profitability for those ongoing events. I would like to serve on the board and appreciate your vote.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Questions? One question from the Mayor.

Mayor Lane: Mr. Woods, thank you will for being here with us and presenting yourself for service. In listening to your background and that's always an indication when we are talking about a business

environment, of course, this particular commission has in its bylaws specifically the allocation of essentially what are bed tax dollars for allocations for a number of things.

Of course, there are suggestions to this Council and this Council has the final word on that, but one of the things that you mentioned that I think may have some bearing as far as I'm concerned, is not only in the allocation of those funds, but in the determination of the use of those funds from a standpoint of, not a, well, accountability eventually, but nevertheless in the proper and efficient use of those funds and utilizing those assets you are talking about. Is that where you think, I should have probably posed that as a question. But do you see that, I don't know whether you have attended meetings or not, but do you see that as a function of that commission?

David Woods: I think it's something that has to be considered in all the decisions that affect spending. Are the tax dollars being spent in an equitable manner? Are we getting an adequate return on that investment? And I think that's one of the things that has to be considered. And along with that is the appropriateness of the promotion and is it going to drive business to the community? Is it going to drive profitability for the people in the tourism industry.

Mayor Lane: All right. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Thank you.

David Woods: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Phillips: So we have one vacancy and three nominees. Each Councilmember can vote once. I will start with Linda Dillenbeck.

Councilman Smith: Linda Dillenbeck.

Councilmember Korte: Linda Dillenbeck.

Mayor Lane: David Woods.

Councilwoman Klapp: Linda Dillenbeck.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Linda Dillenbeck.

Councilwoman Littlefield: David Woods.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Okay, Linda Dillenbeck, you have been reappointed.

NEIGHBORHOOD ADVISORY COMMISSION

[Time: 01:09:29]

Vice Mayor Phillips: So I inadvertently skipped a group. So we have to go back to the

Neighborhood Advisory Commission. The Neighborhood Advisory Commission advises and makes recommendations to the City Council on policies, plans, strategies and programs for the preservation, improvement and revitalization of Scottsdale's housing and neighborhoods. There is one vacancy and four nominees. The nominees are John Baumer, Jonathan Budwig, Kevin Maldonado, Amanda Nash. John Baumer?

[Time: 01:10:12]

John Baumer: Thank you, Mr. Mayor, Mr. Vice Mayor. My name is John Baumer and I'm a resident of Scottsdale for 26 years and I'm at 2646 North 70th Street. I want to serve on this board, excuse me, rather the commission because I believe that Scottsdale has a great many things to offer and I think that my experience working with government previously in my professional tenure, as well as in the public affairs sector as afford e mountain ability to understand how important it is to engage with the communicate and the constituents in question. As a lifelong resident of Scottsdale I have been able to see it change over the years.

I think that as we progress, and continue on a path of development, that it's important to keep Scottsdale Scottsdale, and to keep the essence of what is so important to so many people. So many people came from other places across the country and even the world and I think that's a core element of what Scottsdale is.

I have had the privilege of going to many cities, states and countries myself in my travels and seeing communities that work very well and those that don't, and I would be able to apply that to the commission and recommend to the Council and for the city as a whole what can we do best in the path of progress, but also keeping what is essentially Scottsdale and makes it very unique. We have a robust economy, a great number of citizens and I think that I would be able to bring to this commission obviously a young perspective, but a key element in continuing our progress as a city, keeping those like me, continuing to bring those from out of state and other regions and focusing on what has worked so well for us. My parents have lived in Scottsdale for over 30 years and at their current residence in Scottsdale for about 28 years. I think their small business and their family lifestyle was very appealing to come to Scottsdale and stay here. I think as we develop many technologies in the forms of transportation and communication and how we live, it's important to embrace those changes but to really keep the core elements as I have said to what makes Scottsdale so unique and the most livable city and I would like to continue that work. Thank you for the nomination and for consideration. I would be happy to answer any questions you may have.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Any questions? Okay thank you.

John Baumer: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Jonathan Budwig.

[Time: 01:13:02]

Jonathan Budwig: Thank you. Mayor Lane, Vice Mayor Phillips and Councilmembers, my name is

Jonathan Budwig. I live at 7618 North Via De Los Ninos, I live there with my wife and daughter Chloe. I moved to Scottsdale in 1992, when my parents moved here from London, England, and none of us were citizens at that time. And so I have seen Scottsdale from '92 now to 2018, and I plan to see it grow for years to come and I really, I really would like to be part of maintaining what Scottsdale is.

I think there's a focus Gilbert and Chandler, they look at what Scottsdale is doing and I think they take notes from what we do in Scottsdale and they bring them into their cities. I remember hearing people say, Gilbert is the Scottsdale of the East Valley. And I think that's kudos to all the work done by the city and the future work of what has been done by the city. I have been in business operations for 20 years, first working in restaurants and as the restaurant owner and now as a Realtor in the local community. So I'm used to working with large teams, 50, 60 people, and obviously getting 50 or 60 people to agree on one item generally doesn't work.

So I think my experience to get people to be cohesive and come up with one final answer would benefit this commission and I really think that the top facing issue, although I can't pinpoint one specific thing but it is the microscope that Scottsdale is under, whether it be the green belts, the sidewalks, you know, how we allocate certain funds and what we do to improve roads, all ever those things are important and obviously I have a few things that I feel should be attended to, specifically, but obviously you will present us with that and I have some learning to do when I hopefully can be part of this commission and I will take that opportunity to run with it. Thank you for the nomination and thank you for your consideration. I appreciate it.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Questions? Okay. Thank you. Kevin Maldonado.

[Time: 01:15:33]

Kevin Maldonado: Good afternoon, Mayor Lane, Vice Mayor Phillips. And I reside at 5863 Burnside Trail in northern Scottsdale near Scottsdale and Lone Mountain. I, I was born and raised in Arizona. I moved away after going to U of A and A.S.U., moved away to finish up at UCLA and studying economics. After, after UCLA, I ended up taking over a fashion agency, a textile agency. We expanded nationally and I ended up opening an office in New York City. So that split me from L.A. and New York City. So I lived in midtown Manhattan and downtown L.A. for the last decade. In the process, I had two young kids and started evaluating my life. Do I want to travel, I traveled three weeks out of the month internationally to cities all over the world for my customers, including Minneapolis, like Target, for example. And do I want to do this and spread among nannies and my family, or I do want to recenter and grow roots.

So the reason I would love to serve on this committee is I'm in the phase of my life where I'm trying to serve the community instead of promote my business everywhere. I want to grow the roots of the family. I went to Brophy College Prep and was taught to be a man for others. I just finished the, recently the Goldman Sachs 10,000 business initiative and emerging leaders, Small Business Administration. They also give back to the community, give back to the community. So this is my first entry to trying to give back to the community. My experience I went over.

I think the top issue right now, just from studying the previous meetings and the minutes and listening to my community specifically up north, is the major change to the General Plan, the major General Plan amendment. That, that goes inside with the major issues in general which is growth versus preservation. To me, Scottsdale is booming. Maricopa County is booming. We have to preserve what we built here. It's a beautiful community. I looked at a lot of communities where I chose to move back here and I just want to preserve the beauty of the Sonoran Desert and the way that this city operates. And my approach would be very, very similar to what the Council is doing, listening to the stakeholders and making the tough decisions. I think that's the correct approach. So I thank you for your time and consideration.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Any questions? Okay. Thank you.

Kevin Maldonado: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Phillips: So again, one vacancy and four nominees. Each Councilmember can vote once. We will start with Councilman Smith.

Councilman Smith: John Baumer.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Oh, I'm so sorry, Amanda Nash. You get extra votes for that.

Councilman Smith: I withdraw my vote.

[Time: 01:18:44]

Amanda Nash: I will make this brief so you can get on. Mayor, Vice Mayor, members of the Council, thank you for this opportunity. My name Amanda Nash. I live at 2885 North 81st Way in south Scottsdale. I moved to Scottsdale in 2006. I rented there for a few years. Loved the community and decided I was going to buy a house. That was during the housing market crash. So I saw some very, very dilapidated properties in south Scottsdale. So I have really enjoyed the opportunity to watch the community go through a revitalization. And that's the main reason I want to become part of this commission is to continue that, supporting that revitalization.

The other major reason I want to become part of this, this commission is because boards and commissions are such a vitally important part of local government. It's really how local voices are considered in the policy making process. My bachelor, my master's degree is in public administration. That's where I developed that opinion about the importance of boards and commissions and my other experience related to this position is I am a, I'm a licensed Realtor, focusing primarily in south Scottsdale. So I live and breathe the importance of what's going on in, especially in south Scottsdale but really in Scottsdale throughout the community, because I just don't work in south Scottsdale. I work throughout, really throughout the city.

I have, I'm also a downtown Scottsdale ambassador. So I'm regularly exposed to the importance of tourism. Those visitors coming by and asking me, so, where is best Mexican food restaurant? Or,

hey, can you help me find this gallery? That's, you know, those are the people that are making this community as successful as it is.

In addition to my master's in public administration, I spent eight years researching and analyzing public policy as part of my career before I was a Realtor. Therefore, I know how to analyze public policy recommendations from staff, and during that time, I also was grant management. So I have five years of grant management, which is going to be really helpful in helping with evaluating the neighborhood advancement grant program. The major issue that I think is facing the commission continues to be, one ever them is the McDowell Corridor. That revitalization activities will continue to be something that comes before both the commission and the, and the Council because Scottsdale is land locked. So how do we, how do we grow without having additional land? And I first became involved with the Scottsdale Gateway Alliance and that was, that really helped me understand where things are going. So thank you for your time and I'm happy to answer any questions.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Any questions? Okay. Thank you. So I guess I will remind us once again, there's one vacancy and four nominees. And each Councilmember can vote once, starting with Councilman Smith.

Councilman Smith: Thank you. Well, I will still vote for John Baumer. Thank you.

Councilmember Korte: Amanda Nash.

Mayor Lane: Amanda Nash.

Councilwoman Klapp: Amanda Nash.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Amanda Nash.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Kevin Maldonado.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Amanda Nash. So Amanda, congratulations, you have been appointed. Okay. Who is next?

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

[Time: 01:22:49]

Vice Mayor Phillips: Transportation commission? Yes. The Transportation Commission advises the City Council on matters relating to the safe and efficient movement of vehicles, transit, pedestrians and bicycles. The Commission provides a public forum to hear citizen complaints and requests regarding transportation matters. There is one vacancy and five nominees. Peggy Young withdrew her nomination from consideration. The nominees are John Deniston, who was unable to attend. Please review his application. He would still like to be considered. Dave Dubner, unable to attend but has submitted his response in writing and would like to be considered. Brent Gayler and Dwayne

Guthrie, unable to attend, but has submitted his response. And B. Kent Lall. It looks like Brent Gayler is here.

[Time: 01:23:48]

B. Kent Lall: Thank you, for your time. Mayor, Vice Mayor and honorable members of the vice Council. My name is Kent Lall. I reside on Turquoise Avenue in Scottsdale. I retired here after a career of teaching and research in Oregon for 34 years. I would like to contribute to developing a futuristic transportation system that's practical and acceptable to our community. I have reviewed the city's master plan and continue to keep myself aware of the issues. I would like to and believe I can contribute in guiding us to a more livable environment in our neighborhoods and the city.

I believe that my background in the field of transportation engineering through teaching, research, and practice I can contribute to the work of the commission. I have extensive experience and intelligent transportation systems, and traffic operations. I have been a pioneer in the early application of I.D.S. technologies to understand traffic behavior and use the knowledge to enhance safety in travel. I have also worked in roadway design, access management, highway capacity and level of service issues, as well as materials and construction. I have authored a book that served as text for the undergraduate/graduate students and I have 50 plus technical publications. I presented papers at technical conferences and organized technical conferences serving as the chair for some. I have been active and continue to retain membership in professional associations like the Transportation Research Board, Institute of Operation Engineers and the Medical Society of Civil Engineers. I served as chair for some of their committees. I could only serve as chair of the membership committee of the Phoenix branch of A.O.C.E. Through professional associations my experience extends to public transport, high-speed rail, public/private partnerships and citizen participation in project review process.

I can bring value to the work of commission by being a resource and help them particularly analyze the issues at hand. I would be a key resource in strategic planning of any transportation system while emphasizing public participation in the process. Even though I emphasize in the master plan it appears that the commission is struggling to grasp the value and the importance of roundabouts. I could add value to those discussions, signal coordination is another issue facing the commission as well. The commission could recommend accelerating the approach to a centralized control of intersection signals, which can go hand in hand with the demand responsive signal timing as opposed to the fixed cycle. Thank you for your consideration.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Any questions? You are B. Kent Lall, correct?

B. Kent Lall: Yes.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Thank you. Is Brent Gayler here? Mr. Gayler.

[Time: 01:27:31]

Brent Gayler: Well, good afternoon, Mayor, Vice Mayor, my name is Brent Gayler and I live at 36420 North 99th Way up in north Scottsdale. I have been a resident of there for about 15 years. Prior to that, I had many years traveling in and out. The last ten years, I have been retired from the trucking industry, and I have enjoyed every moment of it until I get out on Scottsdale Road and Pima and it's gridlocked. And it really, it has a tendency to take myself and a lot of people, particularly when you travel south and you look at the capacity of the roads, the traffic, the tourism, they are all good things. They are pluses for everybody.

But we have, we have a couple of issues. I have been in the trucking business for 30 years. I have been involved in focus groups with the city of Long Beach, the city of Vernon on how we are going to curtail traffic issues, what we are going to do about the traffic and certain rules and regulations that people have contributed. It's a, if you have been to Southern California, you can understand what it's like to drive on the freeway systems at 6:00 in the morning or 3:00 in the afternoon. And I love Scottsdale and I love everything about it, but I see problems coming.

One of the big issues is that how are we going to get our people? Everybody has a love affair with their Mercedes and their Lexus and how will we get them out of that car to use public transportation? The city has done a great job of some programs that they have right now, but because of, I would call technology issues that have been involved in the commercial transportation, tourism, you can see that in the next five, ten years, there's going to be some issues that people will not come to Scottsdale because of all these other issues.

You want to travel to the Sonoran Desert and you want to go up to the McDowell ranch, it's very difficult. In five years, we need to come up with a plan. And I feel that one of the problems that we have to deal with is to, and I'm handicapped. I live on the north end and how do I get down to Mayo Hospital? And I know that the Council has some, some programs now that probably need more funding, but I think the bottom line is that we have to get people out of their personal cars and into public transportation provided by the city of Scottsdale. Thank you for this opportunity.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Questions? Okay. Thank you. So there's one vacancy and five nominees and we will start with the Mayor.

Mayor Lane: John Denison.

Councilwoman Klapp: Kent Lall.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Mr. Lall.

Councilwoman Littlefield: David Dubner.

Vice Mayor Phillips: David Dubner.

Councilman Smith: Kent Lall.

Councilmember Korte: Kent Lall.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Okay, Mr. Kent Lall, it looks like you have been appointed. Congratulations. Thank you everybody for your patience. This concludes our interview and appointment process. I would like to thank everyone that interviewed today and I would like to note that we are pleased that we received the applicants. Your application will remain on file for consideration at a future date if there are additional vacancies. The City of Scottsdale is very lucky to have such dedicated and talented individuals who are willing and ready to serve for our City and for that, thank you to you all. I turn meeting back over tonight Mayor.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Vice Mayor. Well thank you to all the participants who have participated in this. Certainly I hope you continue in the process. It's a positive experience for those who get engaged in, but sometimes, but sometimes it's a matter of working through it. We had a lot of great candidates please consider that.

ADJOURNMENT

[Time: 01:31:47]

Mayor Lane: With that, I would ask for a motion to adjourn this Special Meeting.

Councilwoman Klapp: Move to adjourn.

Vice Mayor Phillips: Second.

Mayor Lane: Moved and seconded. All those in favor of adjourning the Special Meeting.