



**SCOTTSDALE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION  
COMMUNITY DESIGN STUDIO  
7506 E. INDIAN SCHOOL ROAD  
SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA  
Thursday, May 4, 2023**

**\*SUMMARIZED MEETING MINUTES \***

**PRESENT:**

Linda Davis, Chair  
Peter Hosmer, Vice Chair  
Ben Brosseau, Commissioner  
Brin Sherrin, Commissioner

**ABSENT:**

Rose Smith, Commissioner  
Courtney Lage, Commissioner

**STAFF:**

Jesús Murillo  
Jason McWilliams  
Adam Yaron

**CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Davis called the meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission to order at 6:01 PM.

**ROLL CALL**

A formal roll call was conducted confirming members present as stated above.

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

HPC received zero (0) request to speak cards for non-agendized items:

\* Note: These are summary action minutes only. A complete copy of the meeting audio is available on the Historic Preservation Commission website at:

<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/historic-preservation-commission>

## **ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT**

Identify supplemental information, if any, related to the May 4, 2023, Historic Preservation Commission agenda items, and other correspondence.

- **ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT PROVIDED BY JESÚS MURILLO:**
- **MR. MURILLO INFORMED THE HPC OF: PREVIOUS OUTREACH FOR THE OASIS MOBILE HOME PARK COMMUNITY AND HISTORIC DESIGNATION FOR THE COMMUNITY IS DETERMINED BY COUNTY AND STATE AND INFORMED THE COMMISSION OF THE HISTORY OF THE COMMUNITY.**
- **HPC PROVIDED COMMENTS REGARDING: THE HISTORY OF THE COMMUNITY AND ITS SIGNIFICANCE.**
- **INFORMED ALL THE COMMISSIONERS ABOUT THE JUNE RETREAT AND COMMISSION MEETING AND INFORMED ALL THE COMMISSIONERS ABOUT THE ITEMS THAT WILL BE DISCUSSED THROUGHOUT THE YEAR.**

## **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES**

1. Approval of the April 4, 2023, Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes.
  - **VICE CHAIR HOSMER MOVED TO APPROVE THE APRIL 4, 2023, HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES WITH CORRECTIONS, 2ND BY CHAIR DAVIS.**
  - **MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY IN FAVOR BY CHAIR DAVIS, VICE CHAIR HOSMER, COMMISSIONER BROSSAU, COMMISSIONER SHERRIN WITH AN AYE VOTE OF SIX (4) TO ZERO (0).**

## **REGULAR AGENDA ITEM**

2. City Hall Historic Preservation (3-ZN-2023)

Request by City of Scottsdale for approval of a zoning district map amendment (3-ZN-2023) from Downtown Civic Center, Type 2, Planned Block Development, Downtown Overlay (D/DCC-2 PBD DO) to Downtown Civic Center, Type 2, Planned Block Development, Downtown Overlay, Historic Property district (D/DCC-2 PBD DO HP) and (21-HP-2023) determining the historic significance of City Hall as a Scottsdale Landmark, develop a Historical Significance Report, and establish a Historic Preservation Plan and Design Guidelines on +/- .65 acres of a +/- 8.54 acre site.

  - **ADAM YARON PRESENTED IN FRONT OF THE COMMISSION, ON BEHALF OF STAFF, REGARDING THE RECOMMENDATION AND REQUEST FOR CITY HALL TO BE DESIGNATED AS A LANDMARK WITH HISTORIC PRESERVATION ZONING.**
  - **STAFF INFORMED THE HPC OF: THE APPLICATION OF THE ZONING REQUEST, BACKGROUND OF THE PROPERTY AND RESEARCH, THE FINDINGS FROM THE LOGAN SIMPSON**

\* Note: These are summary action minutes only. A complete copy of the meeting audio is available on the Historic Preservation Commission website at:

<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/historic-preservation-commission>

**DESIGN REPORT, BACKGROUND AND DEFINITION OF A HISTORIC RESOURCE AND A LANDMARK, THE DEFINING FEATURES OF THE DESIGN ON THE INTERIOR AND EXTERIOR OF THE PROPERTY, RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PRESERVATION, AND THE PROJECT SCHEDULE AND RECOMMENDATION FOR CASE.**

- **THE HPC PROVIDED COMMENTS REGARDING: SUPPORT OF THE CITY HALL HISTORIC PRESERVATION DESIGNATION WITH NOTED CONCERNS OF HOW CHANGES TO CHARACTER CAN OCCUR AND AFFECT A SITE'S UNIQUENESS OVER TIME. THE HPC EXPRESSED A DESIRE THAT IF THE CITY HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO IMPROVE THE VISIBILITY TO CITY HALL IT WOULD BE TO ADDRESS THE IMPACT OF THE CIVIC CENTER LIBRARY PARKING STRUCTURE OBSTRUCTING THE VIEW OF THE BUILDING FROM DRINKWATER BOULEVARD. FINALLY, THE HPC ASKED ABOUT THE POSSIBLE SIGNIFICANCE OF THE FOUNTAINS ON THE WEST SIDE OF CITY HALL AND WHETHER OR NOT THEY WERE INCLUDED IN THE PROPOSAL.**
- **STAFF RESPONDED TO THE HPC NOTING THE PURPOSE OF THE PRESERVATION PLAN IN ITS EFFORT TO MAINTAIN THE CHARACTER DEFINING ELEMENTS OF THE BUILDING AND EXPLAINED THAT THE FOUNTAINS WERE FOUND TO NO LONGER HAVE HISTORICAL SIGNIFICANCE BASED ON THE RECENT REMODEL OF THE CIVIC CENTER – WHICH REDUCED THE SIZE OF THE SOUTHERN FOUNTAIN AT THE WESTERN ENTRANCE OF CITY HALL.**
- **VICE CHAIR HOSMER MOTIONED TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL TO PLANNING COMMISSION AND CITY COUNCIL OF THE FOLLOWING:**
- **A ZONING DISTRICT MAP AMENDMENT (CASE 3-ZN-2023) FOR SCOTTSDALE CITY HALL LOCATED AT 3939 NORTH DRINKWATER BOULEVARD, CHANGING THE ZONING FROM DOWNTOWN/DOWNTOWN CIVIC CENTER TYPE 2 PLANNED BLOCK DEVELOPMENT DOWNTOWN OVERLAY (D/DCC-2 PBD DO) TO DOWNTOWN/DOWNTOWN CIVIC CENTER TYPE 2 PLANNED BLOCK DEVELOPMENT DOWNTOWN OVERLAY HISTORIC PROPERTY (D/DCC-2 PBD DO HP) ON +/- .65 ACRES OF A +/- 8.54 ACRE SITE CONSISTENT WITH THE SCOTTSDALE GENERAL PLAN 2035 AND OLD TOWN SCOTTSDALE CHARACTER AREA PLAN;**
- **DESIGNATING SCOTTSDALE CITY HALL AS A SCOTTSDALE LANDMARK (CASE 21-HP-2023) FINDING UNIQUENESS AND EXCEPTIONAL SIGNIFICANCE OF CITY HALL AS A HISTORIC RESOURCE, AS PER SECTIONS 6.113.A.3, 6.113.A.5, 6.113.B.1, 6.113.B.5, 6.113.B.7, AND 6.113.B.8 OF THE CITY'S ZONING ORDINANCE; AND**
- **DIRECT STAFF TO PROCESS THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION**

\* Note: These are summary action minutes only. A complete copy of the meeting audio is available on the Historic Preservation Commission website at:

<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/historic-preservation-commission>

**PLAN AND GUIDELINES FOR SCOTTSDALE CITY HALL (CASE 21-HP-2023) CONSISTENT WITH SECTIONS 6.118.F. AND 6.119.B. OF THE CITY'S ZONING ORDINANCE.**

**CHAIR DAVIS SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED FOUR (4) TO ZERO (0) WITH CHAIR DAVIS, VICE CHAIR HOSMER, COMMISSIONER BROSEAU, COMMISSIONER SHERRIN VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE.**

3. City Hall Historic Preservation (21-HP-2023)

Request by City of Scottsdale for an approval to designate Scottsdale City Hall as a Scottsdale Landmark on +/- .65 acres of a +/- 8.54 acre site, with existing Downtown Civic Center, Type 2, Planned Block Development, Downtown Overlay (D/DCC-2 PBD DO) zoning designation to be rezoned with case 3-ZN-2023, to Downtown Civic Center, Type 2, Planned Block Development, Downtown Overlay, Historic Property district (D/DCC-2 PBD DO HP) zoning designation and approve the Historic Preservation Plan and Guidelines for Scottsdale City Hall.

- **ADAM YARON PRESENTED IN FRONT OF THE COMMISSION, ON BEHALF OF STAFF, REGARDING THE RECOMMENDATION AND REQUEST FOR CITY HALL TO BE DESIGNATED AS A LANDMARK WITH HISTORIC PRESERVATION ZONING.**
- **STAFF INFORMED THE HPC OF: THE APPLICATION OF THE ZONING REQUEST, BACKGROUND OF THE PROPERTY AND RESEARCH, THE FINDINGS FROM THE LOGAN SIMPSON DESIGN REPORT, BACKGROUND AND DEFINITION OF A HISTORIC RESOURCE AND A LANDMARK, THE DEFINING FEATURES OF THE DESIGN ON THE INTERIOR AND EXTERIOR OF THE PROPERTY, RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PRESERVATION, AND THE PROJECT SCHEDULE AND RECOMMENDATION FOR CASE.**
- **THE HPC PROVIDED COMMENTS REGARDING: SUPPORT OF THE CITY HALL HISTORIC PRESERVATION DESIGNATION WITH NOTED CONCERNS OF HOW CHANGES TO CHARACTER CAN OCCUR AND AFFECT A SITES UNIQUENESS OVER TIME. THE HPC EXPRESSED A DESIRE THAT IF THE CITY HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO IMPROVE THE VISIBILITY TO CITY HALL IT WOULD BE TO ADDRESS THE IMPACT OF THE CIVIC CENTER LIBRARY PARKING STRUCTURE OBSTRUCTING THE VIEW OF THE BUILDING FROM DRINKWATER BOULEVARD. FINALLY, THE HPC ASKED ABOUT THE POSSIBLE SIGNIFICANCE OF THE FOUNTAINS ON THE WEST SIDE OF CITY HALL AND WHETHER OR NOT THEY WERE INCLUDED IN THE PROPOSAL.**
- **STAFF RESPONDED TO THE HPC NOTING THE PURPOSE OF THE PRESERVATION PLAN IN ITS EFFORT TO MAINTAIN THE CHARACTER DEFINING ELEMENTS OF THE BUILDING AND**

\* Note: These are summary action minutes only. A complete copy of the meeting audio is available on the Historic Preservation Commission website at:

<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/historic-preservation-commission>

**EXPLAINED THAT THE FOUNTAINS WERE FOUND TO NO LONGER HAVE HISTORICAL SIGNIFICANCE BASED ON THE RECENT REMODEL OF THE CIVIC CENTER – WHICH REDUCED THE SIZE OF THE SOUTHERN FOUNTAIN AT THE WESTERN ENTRANCE OF CITY HALL.**

- **VICE CHAIR HOSMER MOTIONED TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL TO PLANNING COMMISSION AND CITY COUNCIL OF THE FOLLOWING:**
- **A ZONING DISTRICT MAP AMENDMENT (CASE 3-ZN-2023) FOR SCOTTSDALE CITY HALL LOCATED AT 3939 NORTH DRINKWATER BOULEVARD, CHANGING THE ZONING FROM DOWNTOWN/DOWNTOWN CIVIC CENTER TYPE 2 PLANNED BLOCK DEVELOPMENT DOWNTOWN OVERLAY (D/DCC-2 PBD DO) TO DOWNTOWN/DOWNTOWN CIVIC CENTER TYPE 2 PLANNED BLOCK DEVELOPMENT DOWNTOWN OVERLAY HISTORIC PROPERTY (D/DCC-2 PBD DO HP) ON +/- .65 ACRES OF A +/- 8.54 ACRE SITE CONSISTENT WITH THE SCOTTSDALE GENERAL PLAN 2035 AND OLD TOWN SCOTTSDALE CHARACTER AREA PLAN;**
- **DESIGNATING SCOTTSDALE CITY HALL AS A SCOTTSDALE LANDMARK (CASE 21-HP-2023) FINDING UNIQUENESS AND EXCEPTIONAL SIGNIFICANCE OF CITY HALL AS A HISTORIC RESOURCE, AS PER SECTIONS 6.113.A.3, 6.113.A.5, 6.113.B.1, 6.113.B.5, 6.113.B.7, AND 6.113.B.8 OF THE CITY'S ZONING ORDINANCE; AND**
- **DIRECT STAFF TO PROCESS THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION PLAN AND GUIDELINES FOR SCOTTSDALE CITY HALL (CASE 21-HP-2023) CONSISTENT WITH SECTIONS 6.118.F. AND 6.119.B. OF THE CITY'S ZONING ORDINANCE.**

**CHAIR DAVIS SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED FOUR (4) TO ZERO (0) WITH CHAIR DAVIS, VICE CHAIR HOSMER, COMMISSIONER BROSEAU, COMMISSIONER SHERRIN VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE.**

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

With no further business to discuss, the regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission adjourned at 6:41 PM.

\* Note: These are summary action minutes only. A complete copy of the meeting audio is available on the Historic Preservation Commission website at: